

Meredith McKinney thesis

Formatting difficulties

The following PDF version of Meredith McKinney's thesis contains print peculiarities caused by problems in electronic conversion from old computer platforms and non-standard fonts.

- Faint dotted lines appear below each line of print.
These disappear, however, when a page is printed.
- Some punctuation translates incorrectly, for example:
 - Inverted commas:
'...here as "The Tale of Saigyō", and...'
appears as
'...here as əThe Tale of Saigyō , and...'
 - Apostrophes:
'...background to the Tale's development...'
appears as
'...background to the Taleʒs development...'

A thesis
submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy of
The Australian National University

A Study of
Saigyō monogatari

VOLUME I

Meredith McKinney

April 2002

Acknowledgements

My thanks go first to Dr. Royall Tyler, who has helped keep me on track in every way throughout the writing of this thesis.

I also wish to thank the many friends who helped and supported me during the early stages of this study in Japan, and later in Australia. In particular, I am deeply grateful to Inui Chizuko, who guided me through my early reading of the Tale, and who helped me to read and transcribe the original manuscript of *Saigyō Hōshi shūka*. My gratitude also goes to Professor Sakai Nobuo, who tirelessly answered questions and sought out articles for me after I returned to Australia.

I wish to thank Professor Kuwabara Hiroshi and Tonami Chizuko for generously sparing time to meet and discuss their studies of *Saigyō monogatari* with me, and for directing me to other studies of the work.

Thanks are also due to Bruce Willoughby, whose publication of my translation of the Shōhōbon version of *Saigyō monogatari*⁸⁹ encouraged me to believe that the Tale was worthy of further study.

Finally, I would like to dedicate this study to the memory of Takizawa Yoshitaka, who first introduced me to the delights of reading classical Japanese literature, and who continued to provide the inspiration for my further studies. His untimely death in 1999 occurred as I sat in the manuscript room of Tenri Library, and coincided to the hour with the moving experience of first taking into my hands the precious scroll of *Saigyō Hōshi shūka*, which unlocked so many secrets for me.

⁸⁹ *The Tale of Saigyō: a Medieval Tale of the Poet-Priest Saigyō*, Michigan Papers in Japanese Studies no. 25, Center for Japanese Studies, The University of Michigan, 1998.

Abstract

Many questions surround the anonymous medieval work known as *Saigyō monogatari* (translated here as ‘The Tale of Saigyō’, and for simplicity generally referred to as ‘the Tale’). When was it first created? By whom, and for what intended audience? By what process did it proliferate into the many variant texts that have come down to us? How many other variants may once have existed? What is the relationship between the existing variants, and which can be considered the earliest? Might this be the ‘original text’, or is it too a reworking of some now lost original text?

In the last forty years, these questions have been taken up by a number of scholars, but to date there has been no full-length study that takes into account the wide range of variant texts and attempts in any systematic way to analyze them in a search for answers. The present study seeks to fill this gap. I compare 11 texts, consisting of representatives from all the main variant categories and including all the texts which are known to be, or which seem to me to be, early forms. Detailed textual comparison can be found in Appendix 1.

Part I introduces the background to the Tale’s development, and the variant texts. In Part II, I translate the variant known as Bunmeibon. Many scholars have either claimed or simply assumed that Bunmeibon is a close version of the Tale’s original form. I take issue with this belief, and one of the aims of this study is to pursue the question of the relationship of the B text line (of which Bunmeibon is representative) with the A text line, which has generally been regarded as the secondary or ‘abridged’ line, with the purpose of establishing that it is rather the A line that retains traces of the original text and of the impulses that led to the Tale’s original formation.

The detailed comments which follow each section of the Bunmeibon translation are intended both to place it within the context of the other ten variants and draw out their possible relationships, and to examine other issues that the section

raises in relation to the Tale as a whole. Most of these issues hinge on the question of how Saigyō is depicted. I trace the volatile shifts that occur between the two poles of Saigyō as poet and Saigyō as religious practitioner, how the Tale does and does not attempt to merge the two, and what forms this double Saigyō image takes as the Tale progresses, both inter- and intra-textually.

This question is fundamentally linked with the above question of relationship between the text lines. The scholars who focus their study on Bunmeibon largely assume that the main focus of the Tale is religious in intent. I hope to show that the Tale's fundamental form in all variants does not reflect this, that much of the religious material found in Bunmeibon and the other B texts is the result of interpolation and reworking, and that it is the early A texts' more literary focus that contains the likely key to the original impulses behind the Tale's formation.

Part III draws together the results of my investigation, and situates the Tale within the wider context of the *kyōgen kigo* debate.

Note

In my use of Japanese in the text, I have generally followed accepted usage in giving the reading in italicized roman script together with the Japanese script where the word first appears.

In my discussions of textual variations, where questions can often hinge on the choice of Japanese characters, I have chosen to give the Japanese script without transcribing its pronunciation except where clarity seems to require it. I do, however, transcribe the poems.

Texts commonly referred to are sometimes abbreviated as follows:

SKS: *Sankashū*

SKKS: *Shinkokinshū*

HSS: *Hosshinshū*

SJS: *Senjūshō*

SIZ: *Saigyō isshōgaizōshi*

SHS: *Saigyō Hōshi shūka*

SSS: *Saigyō Shōninshū*

Table of Contents

VOLUME 1

PART I INTRODUCTORY DISCUSSION

Introduction		1
Section 1	Textual Influences	
1.1	<i>Saigyō monogatari</i> as utamonogatari	5
1.2	Sources for the Tale: literary sources	
	<i>Shinkokin wakashū</i>	11
	Saigyō poetry collections: <i>Sankashū</i>	13
	Other Saigyō poetry collections	17
	The poetic anthology form	18
1.3	Sources for the Tale: religious sources	
	General	19
	<i>Hosshinshū</i>	24
	<i>Hōbutsushū</i>	26
	<i>Shasekishū</i>	27
	<i>Wakan rōeishū</i>	28
	<i>Senjūshō</i>	29
	Religious sources: conclusion	30
1.4	Sources for the Tale: conclusion	33
Section 2	Kyōgen kigo	
2.1	Kyōgen kigo: theory and development	36
2.2	Kyōgen kigo in Saigyō's poetry	44
Section 3	Saigyō and his Tale	

3.1	Saigyō's life	55
3.2	Saigyō becomes legend	58

Section 4 The Texts

4.1	The texts: introduction	70
4.2	Texts and categories	74

PART II BUNMEIBON TRANSLATION AND COMMENTS

1	Introducing Norikiyo (poems 1-3)	91
2	3 Spring poems (poems 4-6)	97
3	Fusumae poems (poems 7-16)	100
4	Honours are showered on him	105
5	Noriyasu's death (poems 17-19)	107
6	He decides to leave the world (poems 20-23)	111
7	He kicks his daughter, and takes the tonsure (poems 24-27)	115
8	Meditations on transience (poems 28-29)	121
9	Year's end and plum blossom poems (poems 30-36)	125
10	Repentance and setting off	130
11	To Yoshino (poem 37)	133
12	At Yoshino (poems 38-41)	135
13	He sets off on the Kumano route (poems 42-44)	138
14	Dream at Senri, and to Nachi (poem 45)	142
15	Into Ōmine (poems 46-54)	149
16	Out from Ōmine, 3 poems in the foothills (poems 55-57)	156
17	Parting from Sōnanbō and his companions (poems 58-59)	159
18	To Sumiyoshi and back through Naniwa no Tsu (poems 60-62)	163
19	Return to the capital, and flower-viewing (poems 63-66)	165
20	He glimpses his daughter (poem 67)	168

21	He and Saijū go begging (poems 68-69)	173
22	Moon poems for the abbot of Ninnaji (poems 70-79)	178
23	Exchange with Ninsei (poems 80-81)	183
24	He sets off for Ise (poem 82)	185
25	Ise's origins (poem 83)	187
26	2 poems at Ise (poems 84-85)	190
27	Futami (poems 86-87)	192
28	Poems on Ise's blossoms (poems 88-92)	194
29	Poems of departure (poems 93-94)	197
30	Tenryū crossing (poem 95)	199
31	Saya no Nakayama and beyond (poems 96-99)	204
32	Travelling further east (poems 100-106)	206
33	The hermit of Musashino (poems 107-109)	210
34	Shirakawa barrier gate and beyond (poems 110-113)	218
35	Sanekata's grave (poems 114-115)	221
36	To Hiraizumi — love poems (poems 116-121)	224
37	He turns towards home (poems 122-129)	228
38	Return to the ruined capital (poems 130-136)	232
39	Visiting people in the capital (poems 137-141)	239
40	He returns to the mountains (poems 142-144)	242
41	Back to the capital — 7 poems (poems 145-151)	244
42	Poetic exchanges in the capital (poems 152-161)	248
43	6 love poems for the newly retired emperor (poems 162-167)	253
44	To Kamo Shrine and away (poems 168-171)	255
45	Poems at Mt. Ogura (poems 172-174)	258
46	Exchange of poems with the courtesan of Eguchi (poems 175-176)	261
47	Poems on Sutoku's exile (Tennōji) (poems 177-182)	264
48	He visits Sutoku's remains in Sanuki (poems 183-186)	268

49	Return to the capital and meeting with his daughter	273
50	She parts from Renzeidono (poem 187)	279
51	Her <i>shukke</i> (poems 188-190)	282
52	He retires to Ōhara (poems 191-196)	287
53	Toba's funeral (poems 197-199)	290
54	Saigyō contemplates his life (poem 200)	294
55	His <i>ōjō</i>	300
56	The <i>ōjō</i> of his wife and daughter	305
57	He is mourned	310

PART III FINAL DISCUSSION

Section 1 The Texts

1.1	The texts: general conclusions	316
1.2	The texts: key textual problems	319
	Saigyō's wife	320
	The companion theme	323
	Evidence of textual development	327
1.3	Textual relations	334

Section 2 The themes

2.1	The themes: general conclusions	339
2.2	The themes: key thematic problems	
	Suki	343
	Strong/weak in the setsuwa episodes	345
	The companion theme	348
	Aware	351

Section 3	Conclusion	356
------------------	-------------------	-----

VOLUME 2

Appendix I	Text Comparisons	1
Appendix II	Shōhōbon Translation	88
Appendix III	Transcription of Saigyō Hōshi shūka	134
Bibliography		144