

**Human-Centred Evaluation of
Broadband Telehealth for Tertiary
Outpatient Consultations: A Case Study
Approach**

A thesis submitted for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

of

The Australian National University

Duncan Roderick Stevenson

Declaration

Except where otherwise indicated this thesis is my own original work.

Duncan Stevenson
2nd February 2010

Table of Contents

Declaration	i
Table of Contents	iii
Preface	vii
Research context and research colleagues	vii
Motivation for this work	vii
Note on gender of participants	viii
Publications arising from this research work	viii
Acknowledgements	viii
Abstract	xi
1 Introduction	3
1.1 Overview	3
1.2 Motivation	3
1.3 Case-study-based approach	5
1.4 Structure of this thesis	9
1.5 Acknowledgement of colleagues' work	9
1.6 Summary of results	10
2 Literature	13
2.1 Summary	13
2.2 Broadband telehealth	14
2.3 Conventional telehealth	16
2.4 Evaluating human-computer interaction	18
2.5 Evaluation of telehealth systems	19
2.6 Computer supported cooperative work	22
2.6.1 Media Spaces – video based telecollaboration	22
2.6.2 Collaborative work and health applications	28
3 Methodology	33
3.1 Overview	33
3.2 Case-study approach	33
3.3 Media Spaces	34
3.4 Grounded Theory approach	35
3.5 Action Research	38
3.6 Participant-focused evaluation	40
3.7 Human Research Ethics Committees	41
3.7.1 Laboratory experiments at CSIRO	42
3.7.2 Pilot trial at the Royal Children's Hospital, Melbourne	42
3.7.3 Presence of researchers in the clinical setting	44
4 Case study: Remote surgical training	47
4.1 Purpose and background	47
4.2 Method	48
4.3 Results	50

4.4	Discussion	54
4.5	Contributions to this thesis	56
5	Laboratory studies framework	57
5.1	Introduction	57
5.2	Three laboratory studies	60
5.3	Summary	61
6	Case study: Video and audio communication	63
6.1	Purpose	63
6.2	Method	63
6.3	Results	69
6.4	Discussion	72
6.5	Conclusions	75
7	Case study: User interface for remote guidance	77
7.1	Purpose	77
7.2	Method	77
7.3	Results	86
7.4	Discussion	89
7.5	Conclusion	90
8	Case study: Collaborative guidance	91
8.1	Purpose	91
8.2	Method	91
8.3	Results	94
8.4	Discussion	98
8.5	Conclusions	100
9	Telehealth system for outpatient consultations	103
9.1	System requirements and review	103
9.2	System description	104
9.3	Summary	108
10	Case study: Training and process change	109
10.1	Purpose	109
10.2	Method	109
10.3	Results	111
10.3.1	Working with clinical partners	112
10.3.2	Adapting clinical practice to the telehealth system	113
10.3.3	Adapting the telehealth system	114
10.3.4	Observations during the trial	115
10.4	Discussion	116
10.5	Conclusion	117
11	Case study: Pilot trial - interviews and questionnaires	119
11.1	Purpose	119
11.2	Method	119
11.3	Results	122
11.3.1	Demographic data	122
11.3.2	Patients and families	122
11.3.3	Surgeons	125

11.3.4	Assistants	129
11.4	Discussion	132
11.5	Conclusion	136
12	Case study: Pilot trial: video and audio recordings	139
12.1	Purpose	139
12.2	Method	140
12.3	Results	141
12.3.1	Structure of the telehealth consultation	141
12.3.2	Structure of the face-to-face consultation	142
12.3.3	Timing and frequency of the consultations	143
12.3.4	Use of the fixed video/audio subsystems	144
12.3.5	Spatial awareness	145
12.3.6	Privacy	145
12.3.7	Use of the pen and tablet subsystem	146
12.3.8	Use of the cameras	147
12.3.9	Use of the laser drawing/pointing tool	148
12.3.10	The treatment plan	148
12.3.11	Good news, bad news and difficult questions	149
12.3.12	Collaboration between surgeon and assistant	150
12.3.13	Patients' and families' prior experience	151
12.4	Discussion	151
12.4.1	Bounded trial in the application setting	151
12.4.2	Prior experience of the participants	153
12.4.3	Design of the trial	154
12.4.4	Participants' use of the connected space	154
12.4.5	Participants' use of the technology	155
12.5	Conclusion	155
13	Reflections	159
13.1	Human-centred evaluation	159
13.2	Laboratory studies during system development	160
13.3	Pilot and early-stage trials	161
13.4	Evaluating tertiary-level outpatient telehealth	165
13.5	Multiple perspectives	169
13.6	Context, scope and priorities	170
14	Conclusion and future work	173
14.1	Overview	173
14.2	Major results	173
14.3	Future work	176
	Glossary of terms and abbreviations	179
	Appendix A: Questionnaires used in the hospital trial	181
	Appendix B: Consultation times – duration and frequency	187
	Bibliography	189

Preface

Research context and research colleagues

In parallel to being enrolled as a full-time student, reading for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy, at the Australian National University (ANU), I was employed by the Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO) in its Information and Communications Technologies (ICT) Centre. I had permission from my CSIRO ICT Centre Director to use the results and intellectual property from my work at CSIRO towards my degree and corresponding approval from the ANU to be enrolled as a full-time doctoral student. The team in which I worked came under the umbrella of a six-year funded project from the then Australian Department of Communications, Information Technology and the Arts as part of its “Building on Information Technology Strengths” Program.

This project, called the Centre for Networking Technologies for the Information Economy (CeNTIE), established a gigabit per second research network across Australia and developed a range of experiments and demonstration applications to showcase the use of broadband Internet under appropriate Quality-of-Service regimes (Wilson and Percival 2002). The project was managed through a series of activities and milestones. The milestones were typically reported as demonstrations of completed work to an appropriate industrial or academic audience. My team focused on developing, deploying and evaluating telehealth applications for a range of telehealth situations.

The emphasis of our work was to engage with application partners for each of our case studies. Our case studies, therefore, had a basis in the real world of application requirements. Our field trials and evaluations were done in real-world contexts, appropriately constrained to meet the realities of our working prototypes. This application emphasis enabled us to concentrate on the technical issues of developing and deploying our work and on the human issues of real-world requirements and access to actual application participants in our trials and evaluations.

Motivation for this work

Although the projects conducted under CeNTIE funding all had strong industrial linkages, the milestone-based management model limited our scope for fully reporting on our work. Two aspects, in particular, were inadequately represented. Firstly, the importance of using a real-world setting to demonstrate the results of any particular project was not adequately explored or discussed. Secondly, the evaluations of the projects tended to be primarily at the technical or implementation level rather than at the level of engagement by people who would use the application in their everyday working environment. The research activity described in this thesis, undertaken during the second 3-year funding phase of CeNTIE, provided an opportunity for me to focus on these two aspects as a core part of my project work with CSIRO.

Note on gender of participants

In this thesis I have used the term “he or she” and equivalents where reference is made to an abstract person. Where reference is made to specific people I have used the appropriate gender of the pronoun. For example, in planning for a surgeon to use our telehealth system I use “he or she”. In referring to any of the five male surgeons who took part in our trial I use “he”. This emphasises the individual nature of their responses to the trial and its evaluation.

Publications arising from this research work

Material from this research work has been published in three conference papers; all were double-blind reviewed with multiple reviewers:

1. Stevenson, D (2006) Evaluating an In-Vivo Surgical Training Demonstration over Broadband Internet, presented at the Australasian Computer-Human Interaction Conference, OZCHI 2006, in Sydney. This paper presented an evaluation of a preliminary case study which explored the use of an international advanced-broadband link to demonstrate a surgical training master class constructed around live 3D video of the surgery.
2. Stevenson, D, J Li, J, Smith and M Hutchins (2008) A Collaborative Guidance Case Study, presented at the Ninth Australasian User Interface Conference, AUIC 2008, in Wollongong. This paper presented a laboratory study conducted to assess the way in which our implementation of remote guidance technologies supported the collaborative tasks identified as representative of aspects of remote examination of child patients.
3. Stevenson, D (2008) Training and Process Change: A Collaborative Telehealth Case Study, presented at the Australasian Computer-Human Interaction Conference, OZCHI 2008, in Cairns. This paper presented observations from the training sessions conducted for clinical staff prior to the major telehealth study of this thesis.

Two journal papers have been written and submitted:

1. Wilson, Stevenson and Cregan Telehealth trials on advanced broadband networks, to Telemedicine and e-Health and accepted for publication with revisions.
2. Stevenson, Hutchins and Smith Human-Centred Evaluation for Broadband Tertiary Outpatient Telehealth: A Case Study, to The International Journal for Human-Computer Interaction, special issue on evaluation in healthcare.

Acknowledgements

Firstly I acknowledge and thank the members of my supervisory panel, Professor Tom Gedeon, Associate Professor Henry Gardner (both in the School of Computer Science, ANU) and Dr Cécile Paris (CSIRO ICT Centre).

The research work that supports this thesis was done in the context of my employment at the CSIRO ICT Centre and later as a Visiting Scientist, and I thank my CSIRO ICT Centre Director, Dr Alex Zelinsky, for his support. The funding for this work came from the CSIRO ICT Centre and the Australian Government through the Advanced

Networks Program of the then Department of Communications, Information Technology and the Arts.

As is typical in CSIRO, I worked with a team of highly skilled and dedicated scientists. I acknowledge and thank them for their collegiate approach:

In the Canberra laboratory: Chris Gunn, Matthew Hutchins, Jocelyn Smith, Doug Palmer, Matt Adcock, Alexander Krumpholz and Ken Taylor

In the Sydney laboratory: Susan Hansen, Jane Li, Laurie Wilson, Tony Adriaansen, Alex Krumm-Heller, Keith Bengston, Bob Shields, Dean Economou, Leila Alem and Rosemary Hollowell.

Under the combination of CeNTIE and ICT Centre funding we had an unparalleled opportunity, not normally available to doctoral students and academics, to develop advanced ICT research prototypes and to deploy them in realistic application settings. In Section 1.5 I specifically acknowledge where the work of my colleagues overlaps with the work presented herein.

The case studies presented in this thesis were conducted with many external participants. The preliminary case study was conducted in collaboration with the Stanford University Medical Media and Information Technologies (SUMMIT) group (Dr Parvati Dev, Prof. LeRoy Heinrichs, Robert Cheng, Margaret Krebs, Dr Pat Youngblood), with Stanford University Hospital (Dr Camran Nezhat and colleagues) and with Nepean Hospital (Dr Pat Cregan and colleagues). Funding for the SUMMIT group in the USA was partly supported by the National Library of Medicine, contract number N01-LM-3-3512.

The three laboratory case studies were conducted with volunteer participants from our work, university and local communities. I thank them for their willingness to be involved. I also thank the secretary of the CSIRO Human Research Ethics Committee (HREC), Caroline Bull, for her assistance in preparing our HREC applications.

Many people at the Royal Children's Hospital, Melbourne, contributed to the success of the telehealth pilot trial that we conducted there: John Meara, Leo Donnan and Andrew Greensmith championed the project, Annette Da Costa helped us prepare the Ethics Committee application and Michelle Vu project managed the hospital's role in the trial. The surgeons who took part were Andrew Greensmith, Abhay Khot, Chris Harris, Chris Coombs and Michael Johnson. Hospital staff members who took the roles of clinic assistant and who managed recruitment of patients for the trial were Kylie Pollard, Cheryl Dingey, Meredith Cadwallader, Derek Neoh, Derek Carr, Lachlan Currie, Aaron Cook and Rodrigo Teixeira.

I acknowledge and thank the patients and their families who took part in the trial and who were willing to share their experiences with the research team.

At home, my wife Caroline and my three children have provided warmth, support and encouragement during my enrolment as a student at the ANU.

Abstract

Outpatient consultations form a large part of the healthcare of patients at tertiary hospitals, both as a precursor to in-patient treatment and for the management of on-going health conditions or long-term rehabilitation and monitoring after treatment. These outpatient consultations are generally conducted at the hospitals, most often located in large cities. Patients who live outside these cities face extensive travel to attend these consultations, placing a burden on themselves and on their families or carers. An ability of a tertiary hospital to deliver outpatient consultations in a telehealth mode to regional or remote locations closer to the patients' homes would potentially relieve much of this burden of travel.

Tertiary healthcare is highly complex. It can involve multiple clinicians, can require long time periods for its completion and often includes the patients and their families in the management of the healthcare situation. Outpatient consultations typically involve high levels of interpersonal discussion supported by access to data about the patient. Telehealth methods of delivering these outpatient consultations will be very demanding on the network connection between hospital and remote telehealth nodes. The next generation of Internet or intranet, often referred to as "broadband", will have the capacity to deliver multiple high-quality, low-latency video streams and to provide shared access to large data sets. The prospective match of the capabilities of broadband networks and the needs of tertiary-level telehealth opens the possibility of effective, tertiary-level outpatient consultations in a telehealth mode of delivery.

In this thesis I use a case-study-based approach to evaluate the development and pilot trial of a broadband telehealth system in a tertiary paediatric context. I use the data from these case studies to explore the way that a human-centred approach can be used to evaluate outpatient telehealth trials at a tertiary level of healthcare. My results show that human-centred evaluation for this level of telehealth must take a broad approach; that the telehealth activities must take place in a realistic setting; that qualitative and quantitative responses from participants must be complemented by observational data; that data must be gathered from all the participants; and that their competence to give meaningful responses must be recognised and their multiple, and possibly differing, points of view must be taken into account. Finally, my results show that the researchers must take into account the wider clinical and hospital contexts and in particular the participants' view of these contexts, when interpreting evaluation data.

My overall prediction is that telehealth applications for tertiary-level outpatient consultations will have important, transient phases in their development, and that a human-centred evaluation approach is the appropriate way to evaluate telehealth applications during these phases. These transient phases are not reported in conventional telehealth literature but my analysis of my case studies suggests that they are central to this class of tertiary level telehealth delivery.