



ORAL TRADITION

Transmissions and Transitions in Indian Oral Traditions

Volume 29, Number 2

October, 2015



ORAL TRADITION

Volume 29

October 2015

Number 2

Founding Editor

John Miles Foley (†)

Editor

John Zemke

Co-Managing Editors

Justin Arft

Katy Chenoweth

Editorial Assistants

Rebecca Benson

Elise Broaddus

Christopher Dobbs

Emilee Howland-Davis

Ruth Knezevich

IT Manager

Mark Jarvis

Please direct inquiries to:
Center for Studies in Oral Tradition
University of Missouri
21 Parker Hall
Columbia, MO 65211 USA
+573.882.9720 (ph)
+573.884.0291 (fax)
journal@oraltradition.org

E-ISSN: 1542-4308

Each contribution copyright © 2015 by its author. All rights reserved.

The editors and the publisher assume no responsibility for statements of fact or opinion by the authors.

Oral Tradition (<http://journal.oraltradition.org>) seeks to provide a comparative and interdisciplinary focus for studies in oral tradition and related fields by publishing research and scholarship on the creation, transmission, and interpretation of all forms of oral traditional expression. In addition to essays treating certifiably oral traditions, *OT* presents investigations of the relationships between oral and written traditions, as well as brief accounts of important fieldwork, and occasional transcriptions and translations of oral texts. In addition, issues will include the annual Albert Lord and Milman Parry Lecture on Oral Tradition. Submissions should follow the list-of-reference format (http://journal.oraltradition.org/files/misc/oral_tradition_formatting_guide.pdf) and may be sent via e-mail (journal@oraltradition.org); all quotations of primary materials must be made in the original language(s) with following English translations. If appropriate, please describe any supporting materials that could be used to illustrate the article, such as photographs, audio recordings, or video recordings. *Oral Tradition* publishes such materials online in an eCompanion designed to supplement the texts of articles. Most contributions will be reviewed by at least one specialist reader and one generalist reader before a final decision is reached.

Oral Tradition appears twice per year, in March and October. The current issue and all back issues from 1986 onward are available open-access and free-of-charge at <http://journal.oraltradition.org>.

EDITORIAL BOARD

Mark C. Amodio

*Vassar College
Old and Middle English*

Robert Culley (†)

*McGill University
Biblical Studies*

Patricia Arant

*Brown University
Russian*

Thomas DuBois

*University of Wisconsin
Scandinavian*

Samuel Armistead (†)

*University of California/Davis
Hispanic, Comparative*

Casey Dué

*University of Houston
Ancient Greek*

Richard Bauman

*Indiana University
Folklore, Theory*

Joseph J. Duggan

*Univ. of Cal./Berkeley
French, Spanish, Comparative*

Dan Ben-Amos

*University of Pennsylvania
Folklore*

Alan Dundes (†)

*Univ. of Cal./Berkeley
Folklore*

Mark Bender

*Ohio State University
Chinese*

Mark W. Edwards

*Stanford University
Ancient Greek*

Mary Ellen Brown

*Indiana University
Folklore, Balladry*

David Elmer

*Harvard University
South Slavic, Ancient Greek*

Jonathan Burgess

*University of Toronto
Ancient Greek*

Larry Evers

*University of Arizona
American Indian Literature*

Chogjin

*Chinese Academy
of Social Sciences
Mongolian, Chinese*

Ruth Finnegan

*Open University
African, South Pacific*

Bridget Connelly

*University of Cal./Berkeley
Arabic*

Joxerra Garzía

*University of the Basque Country
Basque*

Robert P. Creed

*Univ. of Mass./Amherst
Old English, Comparative*

Andrew Gerstle

*University of London
Japanese Theater,
Performance Literature*

Terry Gunnell
University of Iceland
Old Norse, Drama

Thomas Hale
Penn. State University
African

Lee Haring
Brooklyn College, CUNY
African

Joseph Harris
Harvard University
Old Norse

Lauri Harvilahti
Finnish Literature Society
Russian, Finnish, Altai

Holly Hearon
Christian Theological Seminary
New Testament

Lauri Honko (†)
Turku University
Comparative Epic

Dell Hymes (†)
University of Virginia
Native American, Linguistics

Bonnie Irwin
Eastern Illinois University
Comparative Medieval Arabic

Martin Jaffee
Hebrew Bible
Univ. of Washington

Minna Skafta Jensen
Odense University
Ancient Greek, Latin

Werner Kelber
Rice University
Biblical Studies

Françoise Létoublon
Université Stendahl
Ancient Greek

Victor Mair
University of Pennsylvania
Chinese

Peter Middleton
University of Southampton
Contemporary Poetry
Performance

Nada Milošević-Djordjević
University of Belgrade
South Slavic

Stephen Mitchell
Harvard University
Scandinavian

Gregory Nagy
Harvard University
Ancient Greek, Sanskrit,
Comparative

Joseph Falaky Nagy
Univ. of Cal./Los Angeles
Old Irish

Susan Niditch
Amherst College
Hebrew Bible

Walter J. Ong (†)
St. Louis University
Hermeneutics of orality and
literacy

Tom Pettitt
University of Southern Denmark
Folklore, early Literature

Shelly Fenno Quinn
Ohio State University
Japanese

Burton Raffel

*Univ. of Southwestern
Louisiana
Translation*

Karl Reichl

*Universität Bonn
Turkic, Old and Middle English*

John Roberts

*Ohio State University
African-American*

Joel Sherzer

*University of Texas/Austin
Native American, Anthropology*

Joseph Sobol

*East Tennessee State University
Storytelling*

Timothy Tangherlini

*University of California-Los
Angeles
Scandinavian Studies*

Dennis Tedlock

*SUNY/Buffalo
Native American*

J. Barre Toelken

*Utah State University
Folklore, Native American*

Ronald J. Turner

*Univ. of Missouri/Columbia
Storytelling*

Andrew Wiget

*University of New Mexico
Native American*

Paulu Zedda

*Università di Cagliari
Sardinian*

This page is intentionally left blank.

Transmissions and Transitions in Indian Oral Traditions

Kirin Narayan, *Special Editor*

This page is intentionally left blank.

Contents

<i>Editor's Column</i>	165
Kirin Narayan <i>Transmissions and Transitions in Indian Oral Traditions: An Introduction</i>	167
Joyce Burkhalter Flueckiger <i>"Who am I . . . what significance do I have?" Shifting Rituals, Receding Narratives, and Potential Change of the Goddess' Identity in Gangamma Traditions of South India</i>	171
Peter Friedlander <i>Kabīr: Oral to Manuscript Transitions</i>	187
Ann Grodzins Gold <i>Waiting for Moonrise: Fasting, Storytelling, and Marriage in Provincial Rajasthan</i>	203
Kirin Narayan <i>The Social Life of Transcriptions: Interactions around Women's Songs in Kangra</i>	225
Leela Prasad <i>Cordelia's Salt: Interspatial Reading of Indic Filial-Love Stories</i>	245
Mahesh Sharma <i>Ritual, Performance, and Transmission: The Gaddi Shepherds of Himachal Himalayas</i>	271
<i>About the Authors</i>	291

This page is intentionally left blank.

Editor's Column

Eighteen years ago, *Oral Tradition* 12.1 offered an octet of essays concerned with South Asian women's oral traditions. More recently, I broached the topic of another issue devoted to Indic cultures' verbal arts with several senior scholars; their enthusiasm encouraged me to canvass for a guest editor. Good fortune brought aboard Kirin Narayan, who graciously acceded to my plea for the necessary expertise to assemble this issue. Kirin has patiently and cheerfully steered the enterprise forward until now, when, "the boat has arrived on the other shore."

Kirin's work completing this volume implies acknowledging others whose contributions merit the gratitude of readers of *Oral Tradition*. A signal debt is owed the colleagues who share their expertise and sensibility making referrals and serving as readers. On their advice authors are prompted to elucidate the obscure and invited to consider otherwise unrecognized connections. The readers' judgments and sure guidance regarding submissions smooth the editor's pathway. Generalist and specialist readers are the journal's heroes.

Three of the essays presented here address the effects on ritual verbal traditions wrought by tectonic societal shifts: Joyce Burkhalter Flueckiger explores innovations in the worship of the village goddess Gangamma in the village of Triupati, South India; Ann Grodzins Gold analyzes storytelling and women's ritual fasting in Rajasthan, North India; and, finally, Mahesh Sharma studies changes in *Nauala*, a ritual sacrifice offering made to Shiva by the formerly transhumant Gaddis of Himachal Pradesh, North India, and through it charts dislocations and relocations of identity. The remaining essays explore ramifications of written versions of traditional verbal arts: Peter Friedlander characterizes how multiple manuscript and print traditions of the songs of the poet saint Kabīr (ca. 1400-50) reveal contexts in which those songs flourished as oral traditions; Kirin Narayan offers a reflection and meditation how transcribing, and transcriptions of, women's songs in Kangra, North India; constitute cultural and personal transactions as well as talismans of longstanding relationships; and, finally, Leela Prasad presents a comparative inter- and extra-textual study of Shakespeare's *King Lear* and Indic filial-love folktales keyed to the concept of "interspace." She concludes that though each strand of the tale type essays a different answer to questions of "self," both affirm that "self" resolves as a symbiotic sovereign.

A housekeeping detail needs mentioning. Though *Oral Tradition* 29.1 bears a March 2014 date it was published online only some six months later. In consultation with this university's serials librarian, in order to synchronize the journal with 2015, volume 29.2 bears a publication date of October 2015, making its arrival a few months premature. Finally, I encourage you to share your research about the world's traditional verbal arts with us. Submissions pass through a double-blind referee process and a decision is generally reported within a trimester of receipt. Published articles are seen by some 20,000 readers in 200 countries and territories.

John Zemke
Editor, *Oral Tradition*

This page is intentionally left blank.

Transmissions and Transitions in Indian Oral Traditions: An Introduction

Kirin Narayan

To assemble a group is to invite conversation. The essays that come together in this special issue of *Oral Tradition* all arrive bearing insights cultivated through extended engagements with very different settings. Settling into this shared space, the essays speak resonantly to each other. They cluster around shared themes, circulate in paired dialogues, and also stand back to offer the others distinctive perspectives.

Many special issues that this journal has hosted first emerged from a conference where participants met face-to-face and heard each other's ideas. This set of contributors assembles together for the first time with the journal's publication. I imagine that my fellow authors will be just as intrigued as I have been to learn what others have written, and to contemplate these six essays as a sociable group. I use this introductory space to offer notes on conversations that I perceive; a discerning reader will no doubt pick up on others.

But first I need to establish the wider setting of the vast diversity of Indian oral traditions that stretches beyond these contributions, and indeed stretches beyond the boundaries of modern India into the Indian diaspora. The work of these six scholars cannot possibly convey the many regions, languages, religions, and genres of traditional performance that contribute to India's cultural vibrancy. The many planes of differentiation within India offer the dynamic for variation set into motion when oral traditions move between regions. Power differentials also shed light on the standardization that occurs when dominant groups dictate tastes. Such dominance is variously embodied in the authoritative clout of Brahmanical or *puranic* Hindu texts and practices, the prestige of middle class values, and the mesmerizing power and spread of technological mediation. Especially since the liberalization of the Indian economy in 1991 and the growth of a vast middle class, oral traditions have been revalued through a middle-class lens—some traditions embraced with nostalgia, others discarded as outmoded. The push towards greater literacy in formally recognized languages over sometimes unwritten dialects has also meant that non-literate forms of knowledge carried in regional dialects can be seen as quaint and irrelevant. That approximately half of the population of about 1.28 billion is age 26 or younger means that traditions associated with the vanished life worlds of elders can be less captivating than contemporary cultural forms centered around youth's concerns and carried by film, television, and the internet. The hard-won knowledge of lower caste specialists in ritual and oral tradition, as well as the informally communicated oral traditions of the poor, the nonliterate and

the old, can seem detached from the goals of getting ahead amid increasing urbanization, industrialization, and the spread of technology.

In terms of region, these essays mostly present oral traditions from sites in north India, in a big band stretching from Rajasthan towards Bengal—with the exception of Flueckiger's fieldwork location in Andhra Pradesh and Prasad's use of a story from Karnataka. The essays' cultural resonances also extend beyond India with Prasad's counterpoint between Shakespeare and Indian folktales and Friedlander's description of how Kabir song traditions have been recast in the West. With languages, the group tilts towards Hindi and North Indian languages—with Flueckiger, working in Telugu, offering the exception. At the same time, the medium of English used to convey the authors' thoughts about oral traditions and to discuss preexisting translations and scholarly literature is a reminder of the ways that the English language has since colonial times onwards become an aspect of Indian orality. In terms of religion, the contributions offer insights into the practices associated with Hinduism whether in localized variation or in pan-Indian standardization, though Friedlander's account of the diverse audiences for Kabir illustrates how Kabir also belongs to Muslim and Sikh communities and is even appropriated by mystical Christianity. And in terms of folklore genres, the essays offer examples of myths, legends, folktales, songs and proverb.

The essays at first glance fall into two groups: those that highlight oral traditions in the context of ritual life (Flueckiger, Gold, Sharma) and those that focus on the mutual constitution of oral traditions and written texts and the generative space between (Friedlander, Narayan, Prasad). Flueckiger, Gold, and Sharma speak of shifts in ritual practices and a standardization associated with pan-Indian versions shaped by with *puranic* traditions, mass media, and the ascent of middle-class values. Friedlander, Narayan, and Prasad describe moments in the making of texts—whether collections of songs attributed to Kabir, an anthropologist's sheaf of transcriptions, or a new edition of King Lear emerging in interplay with Indian folktales around the same filial-love theme. Yet the songs described by Friedlander and Narayan connect with ritual too, whether for collective worship or to celebrate life-cycle events. That Prasad's essay does not address ritual is an important reminder that though many performances of oral traditions are associated with group rituals in India, oral traditions may also be exchanged as an aspect of face-to-face interactions.

The essays can also be paired as conversational partners, in shifting formations with each juxtaposition bringing particular aspects of Indian oral traditions and their transformations into focus. For example, highlighting deities, these essays describe rituals and stories around goddesses (Flueckiger, Gold); vernacular sung mythologies of Shiva (Narayan, Sharma); and songs as well as stories that acknowledge a formless divinity as the maker of fates (Friedlander, Prasad). Looking towards identity, the essays reflect on radical transformation and dislocation from the very core of self-definition (Flueckiger, Sharma); the importance of kinship relations in sustaining selves (Gold, Prasad); and how the very act of transcribing oral traditions into written collections is tied to community making (Friedlander, Narayan).

Each essay also offers distinctive insights. Since all the assembled abstracts are just a click away, I will not attempt to summarize but rather try to identify the central contribution that I found most illuminating and that might be of value to scholars working outside India as a region. I line these up in alphabetical order. Focusing on the Goddess Gangamma, Flueckiger

shows how ritual and narrative mutually constitute each other, sometimes running parallel, sometimes intersecting, and how with ritual transformed and narrative corpus marginalized, the very identity of a Goddess shifts. Looking to collections of Kabir's songs, Friedlander points to how the diverse collections of oral traditions attributed to the same author carry clues to values of the communities for whom they were first written down. Drawing on over three decades of fieldwork, Gold pairs two ritual fasts that women undertake for their own auspicious married state and a husband's well-being to show how, amid changing hopes for marriage and trends towards standardization, this ritual action continues to create a reassuring sense of continuity. Presenting her work with Kangra women's songs, Narayan argues for the value of reflecting on the practice of transcription and the interactions generated around the material artifacts when moving oral tradition into written form. Prasad, a folklorist, brought her own interest in Indian folktales to conversations with her father, a Shakespeare specialist, as they worked through his new edition of *King Lear*, and from these exchanges Prasad offers the concept of an interspace that starts with difference, encompassing intertext and intersubjectivity. Focusing on the Nuala performances of the Gaddi shepherds—once a sacred space of trance enhanced by the performances of ritual specialists, now an occasion for drunken revelry with recorded music—Sharma shows how focusing on one ritual through time can provide a prism on folklore, social change, and dislocated selfhood.

I am honored to participate in this lively gathering and to learn so much from my colleagues. I welcome all readers who now join us from across the world, bringing to these essays their own interests and expertise.

The Australian National University

This page is intentionally left blank.