
THESES SIS/LIBRARY
R.G. MENZIES LIBRARY BUILDING NO:2
THE AUSTRALIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY
CANBERRA ACT 0200 AUSTRALIA

TELEPHONE: +61 2 6125 4631
FACSIMILE: +61 2 6125 4063
EMAIL: library.theses@anu.edu.au

USE OF THESES

This copy is supplied for purposes
of private study and research only.
Passages from the thesis may not be
copied or closely paraphrased without the
written consent of the author.

**Desire Bound: formation of a Malay minority
agency in Singapore**

Yasuko Hassall Kobayashi
May 2006

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy of the Australian National
University

Acknowledgements

I would like to convey my gratitude towards those people who supported me profoundly during my PhD project.

Firstly, I would like to convey my gratitude to my supervisor, Dr Ian Proudfoot. He has been patient with my development and given me the time I need for my thoughts to ripen. Numerous exchanges with him about my work have helped me tremendously to ponder on ideas and arguments, and to improve the quality of them. Without his supervision, I could not have done my PhD thesis.

I would like to convey my gratitude to Professor Virginia Hooker. As a member of my panel, she always encouraged me with her warm support.

I also would like to convey my gratitude to Professor Tessa Morris-Suzuki. Despite the fact that I was not under her official supervision, she has been very supportive to my project. I cannot thank her more for her generosity. Although Tessa herself is a specialist of Japan, her theoretical interests and intriguing perspectives are always so stimulating for me. In this sense, I have learned tremendously from her.

I also would like to thank Professor Tomoharu Shirota at University of Tokyo. He has been guiding me since I was an undergraduate student in Japan. He has been listening to me, criticising me, and frequently encouraging me to pursue my real intellectual interests and the paths in life that feel right. Without his understanding, profound kindness, and guidance, I would not have come here to Australia to pursue my PhD.

I also would like to thank Dr Gregory Clancey at the National University of Singapore. Working with him as his research assistant made me aware of what I am genuinely interested in and what I would like to ponder on more, both academically and personally.

As my great PhD mate, I would like to thank Kohei Kawabata. He has just finished his PhD and gone back to Japan. During my PhD time, his friendship has had a

tremendous impact on forming my ideas. As a fellow academic, his ideas and perspectives are always stimulating and get me so excited. Even our conversations about everyday topics over a cup of tea or coffee often turned into explorations of interesting ideas. He is a person who can form his academic interests from where he really stands and attempts to convey messages to the world. His way of approaching his thesis made me reconsider why I am writing my own one and showed me fresh notions of being an academic. Without his friendship, my thesis might be something very different.

I would like to thank my parents-in-laws. They have been supportive and shown their understanding about me. Their love and concern for me was a motivation for me to keep going.

Finally, I would like to thank my partner, Tim. He has been walking side by side with me as a partner and soul mate, when it shines and rains. He always lets me be who I am. I cannot thank him enough for walking with me.

Contents

| | |
|---|----|
| Declaration | i |
| Acknowledgements | ii |
| Contents | iv |
| Abbreviations | ix |
| Introduction | 1 |
| Chapter 1 Background | 4 |
| 1.1 Junction between the Malays in Singapore and myself | 4 |
| 1.2 An included yet differentiated community | 7 |
| 1.3 Theoretical framework | 11 |
| 1.3.1 Nationalism | 11 |
| 1.3.1.1 Modernism | 13 |
| 1.3.1.2 Ethno-symbolism | 19 |
| 1.3.2 Ethnicity | 21 |
| 1.3.3 Ways to grasp the complexity of agency/subject | 23 |
| 1.3.3.1 “Double Writing” | 24 |
| 1.3.3.2 Žižek’s subject | 28 |
| 1.3.3.3 Relevance of examining psychological agency within the context of Singapore society | 30 |
| 1.4 The location of this study within the literature on ethnic issues in Singapore | 34 |
| 1.4.1 Studies of ethnicity in Singapore | 34 |
| 1.4.2 Studies on Malays in Singapore | 36 |
| 1.5 Data sources and methodology | 38 |
| 1.5.1 Use of <i>Berita Harian/Berita Minggu</i> | 38 |
| 1.5.2 Additional information about quoted sources | 41 |

| | |
|---|----|
| Chapter 2 Fundamental Choice: Meritocracy or Special Rights | 43 |
| 2.1 Governance of meritocracy in Singapore | 43 |
| 2.1.1 The mechanisms of government by meritocracy | 45 |
| 2.1.2 Managing 'losers' within meritocracy | 48 |
| 2.2 Emerging ideology for Malays: bumiputra or meritocracy? | 50 |
| 2.2.1 Origin of bumiputra rights | 51 |
| 2.2.2 The Singapore government's stance on Malays: pre-independence | 51 |
| 2.2.3 The government's stance on Malays: post-independence | 52 |
| 2.2.4 Continuing debate on the position of Malays | 54 |
| 2.2.5 Argument at the meetings of the Constitutional Commission | 56 |
| 2.2.5.1 First meeting of the Constitutional Commission | 56 |
| 2.2.5.2 Second meeting of the Constitutional Commission | 59 |
| 2.2.5.3 The position of Malays under the constitution | 62 |
| 2.3 Controlling Malays under meritocracy: early steps | 63 |
| 2.3.1 Problematizing Malays: the speeches of S. Rajaratnam | 65 |
| 2.4 Conclusion | 71 |
| Chapter 3 Malays Setting Goals for Malays | 73 |
| 3.1 The way for Malays to follow | 74 |
| 3.1.1 The wonderful PAP post-independent government | 75 |
| 3.1.2 'Seize the Day' | 82 |
| 3.1.3 Can you do it? | 85 |
| 3.2 Malay organizations and meritocracy | 87 |
| 3.2.1 Efforts to maintain Malay as a language of education | 87 |
| 3.2.2 Efforts by Malay/Muslim organisations to set up scholarships. | 91 |
| 3.3 Setting the targets to be achieved | 93 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 3.3.1 The formation of the Central Council of Malay Cultural Organizations, Singapore | 95 |
| 3.3.2 Towards the 1970 seminar | 96 |
| 3.3.2.1. <i>Preliminary forum</i> | 98 |
| 3.4 The 1970 seminar: ‘Malay participation in the national development of Singapore’ | 99 |
| 3.5 Conclusion | 104 |
| Chapter 4 Implanting “Change Attitudes” | 106 |
| 4.1 The stance of the government towards Malays in the 1970s | 107 |
| 4.2 Change Attitudes | 108 |
| 4.3 Campaign of “Change Attitudes” | 111 |
| 4.3.1 The 1971 forums | 111 |
| 4.3.2 The 1972 forums | 119 |
| 4.4 The endless attempt | 123 |
| 4.5 Consuming and reproducing ‘Change Attitudes’ | 126 |
| 4.6 Conclusion | 131 |
| Chapter 5 “Change attitudes” in Action: the Issues of Education and Women in the 1970s | 133 |
| 5.1. “Change Attitudes” in Education | 133 |
| 5.1.1 Background: Significance of education in Singapore | 134 |
| 5.1.2 Malay stream education: an inferior system | 137 |
| 5.1.3 “Change the education system”: Malay proposals | 144 |
| 5.2 “Change Attitudes” for Malay Women in the 1970s | 150 |
| 5.2.1 The location of women in the context of Singapore in the 1970s | 151 |
| 5.2.2. Opening speech at the seminar “Malay Women’s participation in the development of Singapore society” | 155 |
| 5.2.3 Performance of “Change Attitudes” for Malay women | 159 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 5.2.3.1 Family Planning | 159 |
| 5.2.3.2 Becoming working women | 165 |
| 5.2.3.3 Guiding children academically | 172 |
| 5.3 Conclusion | 177 |
| Chapter 6 Changed Attitudes: the Foundation of Mendaki – Council on Education for Muslim Children | 179 |
| 6.1 State attitudes to ethnicity in the 1980s | 180 |
| 6.2 New state targets set for Singaporeans | 182 |
| 6.3 Speeches by ministers about Malays in 1980 | 184 |
| 6.4 “Total Approach” – a Malay response to state criticisms of underachievement | 189 |
| 6.4.1 Naturalised “change attitudes” | 190 |
| 6.4.2 Response of the Malay leaders | 192 |
| 6.4.2.1 Symposium on problems of Malay education in July 1981 | 193 |
| 6.4.2.2 Lee Kuan Yew’s 1981 National Day rally speech | 195 |
| 6.4.2.3 The establishment of Mendaki | 196 |
| 6.4.3 The Mendaki Conference: May 1982 | 198 |
| 6.4.3.1 Lee’s opening speech at the Mendaki 3 day conference | 198 |
| 6.4.3.2 The unveiling of Mendaki and its ‘Total Approach’ | 202 |
| 6.4.4 Winning the hearts of Malays | 205 |
| 6.5 Conclusion | 208 |
| Chapter 7 ‘Change Attitudes’ into the 21st Century: the Case of a Volunteer Organization | 210 |
| 7.1 Where Indonesian domestic workers are located | 212 |
| 7.2 The gaze of Malays at Indonesian domestic workers | 216 |
| 7.3 The scheme of An-Nisaa | 221 |
| 7.4 Conclusion | 225 |

| | |
|-------------------|-----|
| Conclusion | 227 |
| References | 233 |

Abbreviations ¹

| | |
|-----------------------------|--|
| CMIO | Chinese, Malay, Indian, and Others |
| DPMS | Dewan Perniagaan dan Perusahaan Melayu Singapura Singapore Malay Chamber of Commerce and Industry |
| Jamiyah | Muslim Missionary Society, Singapore |
| KGMS | Kesatuan Guru-Guru Melayu Singapura Singapore Malay Teachers' Union |
| LBKM | Lembaga Biasiswa Kenangan Maulud Prophet Muhammad's Birthday Memorial Scholarship Fund Board |
| Majlis Pusat | Majlis Pusat Pertubuhan-Pertubuhan Budaya Melayu Singapura Central Council of Malay Cultural Organizations, Singapore |
| MENDAKI (Mendaki) | Majlis Pendidikan Anak-Anak Islam Council on Education for Muslim Children ² |
| (Persatuan) Muhammadiyah | Muhammadiyah Association |
| MUIS | Islamic Religious Council of Singapore Majlis Ugama Islam Singapura |
| 4PM | Persatuan Persuratan Pemuda-Pemudi Melayu Malay Youth Literary Association |
| PAP | People's Action Party |
| PERTAPIS | Persatuan Taman Pengajian Islam Singapura Islamic Theological Association of Singapore |
| PERGAS | Persatuan Guru-Guru Agama Singapura Singapore Religious Teachers Association |
| PKMS | Pertubuhan Kebangsaan Melayu Singapura Singapore Malay National Organization |

¹ Nearly all abbreviations in this table are from the source Hussin Mutalib, Hashimah Johari, Rokiah Mentol, Zaleha Othman, Zaleha Tamby, compilers & eds., *Singapore Malay/Muslim Community 1819-1994: a bibliography*, Singapore: Centre for Advanced Studies, National University of Singapore, 1995.

² This was the name in 1982 when Mendaki was founded. See, Mendaki, *Making the Difference: 10 years of MENDAKI*, Singapore: Yayasan Mendaki, 1992, p8

| | |
|--------------|--|
| PPIS | Persatuan Pemudi Islam Singapura Young Women Muslim Association |
| Taman Bacaan | Singapore Malay Youth Library Association |
| UMNO | United Malays National Organization |