This is the published version published as:

David Nash

Hot and cold over clockwise


Pacific Linguistics Series C-110

The Author holds copyright over the article

This is a copy of an article published in Pacific Linguistics Series C-110
Pacific Linguistics is issued through the Linguistic Circle of Canberra and consists of four series:

SERIES A: Occasional Papers
SERIES B: Monographs
SERIES C: Books
SERIES D: Special Publications

FOUNDOING EDITOR: S.A. Wurm
EDITORIAL BOARD: K.A. Adelaar, T.E. Dutton, A.K. Pawley, M.D. Ross, D.T. Tryon

EDITORIAL ADVISERS:

B.W. Border
University of Hawaii
David Bradley
La Trobe University
Michael O. Cynx
Monash University
S.H. Elton
University of Hawaii
K.J. Franklin
Summer Institute of Linguistics
W.G. Glover
Summer Institute of Linguistics
G.W. Grace
University of Hawaii
M.A.K. Halliday
University of Sydney
E. Haugen
Harvard University
A. Hockett
Summer Institute of Linguistics
L.A. Hercus
Australian National University
John Lynch
University of the South Pacific
K.A. McIlhnan
Summer Institute of Linguistics
H.P. McSaughan
University of Hawaii
P. Milibauhu
University of Adelaide
G.N. O'Grady
University of Victoria, B.C.
K.J. Pike
Summer Institute of Linguistics
E.C. Polotsk
University of Texas
Gillian Saskoff
University of Pennsylvania
W.A.L. Seahol
University of Leiden
B.K. Tung
City Polytechnic of Hong Kong
H.M. Uhlenbeek
University of Leiden
J.W.M. Verhoeven
The Hague, The Netherlands
C.L. Voorhoeve
University of Leiden

All correspondence concerning Pacific Linguistics, including orders and subscriptions, should be addressed to:

PACIFIC LINGUISTICS
Department of Linguistics
Research School of Pacific Studies
The Australian National University
Canberra ACT 0200

Copyright © The Authors
Copyedited by Joan Binnie with the assistance of Janet Enard and Pam Rosser
Maps for papers by M. Ross, M. Spelk, M. Walsh drawn by Theo Baumann
Printed by ANU Printing Service

First Published 1992
Typset by Jeanette Coombes with the assistance of Ling Matsui and Suo Tye

The editors are indebted to the Australian National University for assistance in the production of this series.

This publication was made possible by an initial grant from the Hunter Douglas Fund.
No royalties are paid on this or any other Pacific Linguistics publication.

ISSN 0078-7558
ISBN 0 85883 3400 6
HOT AND COLD OVER CLOCKWISE

DAVID NASH

1. INTRODUCTION

In March 1983, when I was living at Yandumurra, a centre for the Warpiri people of Central Australia, I wrote a note to Don Laycock upon reading his article on ‘podism’, a term he coined for Northern Hemisphere chauvinism.

Among the passages which I had noticed was:

Australian aboriginals have a preference for sunrise - Australian anticlockwise - motion, and a large number of tribesmen in Papua New Guinea dance circularly, back and forth. There would seem to be an MA thesis in this. (Laycock 1982:3)

In response to my asking for him to elaborate on the Aboriginal preference for sunrise motion, Don replied that his observation “just comes from years of (desultory) discussion of the subject with anthropologists plus my own observation of dancing in ethnographic films. I would find it hard to document convincingly, but I think it is so.”

The setting for the above observation was Don’s detection of a lingering Northern Hemisphere viewpoints in Australian dictionaries.

Both the Macquarie Dictionary (MD) and Chambers Twentieth Century Dictionary (CTCD) give ‘anticlockwise’ as a second meaning of withershin/withershins. As the word is good Anglo-Saxon for ‘against the direction of...

---

1 One expected Don Laycock and his thoughts (one could not encourage the former without the latter) to cross one’s path in unexpected ways. I recall him advocating the abbreviation ‘LSAoc’ in the August 1977 meeting of the (then) ALS (Australian Linguistic Society) in Melbourne, partly on the ground that ‘ALS’ is on the sticker affixed to motor vehicles of Australian registration ‘...in other juridications. I chanced on one of his pieces in the British magazine Games and Puzzles (“Five Hands”, v. 2, 1979:33-44) when I found a copy at the Tenterfield Creek dump. I attended a talk he gave on pronom system/typology (‘Abbreviated Pronoun Systems’) at MET in 1979 - stumping from one outrageous example to the next, setting on the top of a desk, with his things in his black brief case. Another memorable talk was one on the ‘Languages of Olugpa’ on 18 May 1984 at the Australian Academy of the Humanities.

For discussion of the topic of this paper I am grateful to Harold Koch and David Wilkins. My work was partially supported by grant A8903251 from the Australian Research Council.

2 Don added hopefully ‘I bet Brough Smyth or someone like that has something to say about it’. I have looked through Brough Smyth’s 1873 compilation and have not yet noticed any mention of clockwise or anti-clockwise.

3 Language engineering has tackled a Boralisation that Don did not mention, for which see the Encyclopedia Britannica (1975, VII:4) entry for Moon, compass directions on.

Tom Dutton, Malcolm Ross and Darrell Tryon, eds. The language game: papers in memory of Donald C. Laycock, 391-297.


© David Nash
the sun"), it is clear that the direction is clockwise in the Southern Hemisphere. It is even possible to object that our use of 'clockwise' is pedantic, since the only reason that clocks and watches go clockwise is that they follow the direction of the sun. The Native Hemisphere sundial. Southern Hemisphere watches should go 'anticlockwise' and equatorial watches should go back and forth. (Laycock 1982:2)

This article is my reflections on the 'clockwise' concept in Aboriginal Australia, inspired by the above. I relate 'clockwise' to handedness, and in turn find a dearth of Australian evidence linking handedness with cardinal directions or spirals.

2. CLOCKWISE

Due, in his letter to me, made a fruitful suggestion as to how I might learn Warlpiri expressions for 'clockwise': "try relating it to handedness. Europeans say 'circle to the left' when they mean 'anticlockwise' — i.e. with the left hand towards the centre of the circle — conversely, 'circle to the right' is 'clockwise'.”

In response to my enquiries as to how to express in Warlpiri a particular direction of rotation, such as for a key or a door handle or a knob, Kurdi Japangkara Granites suggested the terms jampupurdangii and jangarnipurdangii, formed respectively on the terms jampa 'left hand, left', and jangarni 'right hand, right, correct'. These terms I confirmed subsequently, although I hasten to add that there is much about them (and -purdangii and its related suffixes) that I do not understand.  

Warlpiri here is using expressions familiar to us from English, as we may give someone an instruction to turn a knob or tap, say, 'to the left' or 'to the right'. In practice, though, Warlpiri commonly expresses such directionality through reference to cardinal directions. For instance, one Warlpiri on the roof of a vehicle might call out to the driver that he should turn the fuel tap to the auxiliary fuel tank, by saying: Kakarrara-purdangii ma-ata! Kakarrara-purdangii east-wards get-Imperative east-wards Turn it to the east! To the east!

The salience of cardinal directions for speakers of Aboriginal languages is often remarked on. For the Warlpiri it is nicely illustrated in Paddy Patrick Janagalii’s conversational definition (June 1987) of the Warlpiri noun and preverb ngurlinyarli ‘sideways, on the side’:

Ngurlinyarlii, ngurlinyangka ngumana jarda ngurlinyipurdangii, ramarrapurdangii, ngurlinyangka kakarrapurdangii miyanu kurirrapurdangii, muru pururrara yuurrarijipurdangii, muru wiriyarra karurrapurdangii, jurrwakarrapurdangii. Ngurlinyangka ngurlinyarlii ngumana jarda miyanuipurdangii iwangu, pururrapurdangii iwangu – ngurlinyarlii.

4Then Leonard, a name now avoided (Kumanjii).
5Note, however, what are the differences in meaning, and the historical relationships, between the restricted -purdangii (on cardinal) and -purdangii (on body-part terms) and the corresponding general Allatuy -kurra, -kurra, and Perifatellite -waia, -warawara or Locative -egha – -ka case suffixes? The term jampupurdangii occurs a number of times in the machine-readable Warlpiri text collection, but jangarnipurdangii does not, though it is a well-formed word. Swartz (1989) includes the term jangarnipurdangii ‘right hand’.
Ngartingarli; that is when someone lies on their side, on their ribs, to the east, the stomach to the south, and the back to the north, and the two feet to the west. It is ngartingarli when someone lies neither on their stomach nor on their back but ngartingarli.

Certain spatial terminology varies between relative and absolute from language to language. Thus when we English speakers would typically use an observer-dependent expression like ‘to the left’, Warlpiri speakers would typically use a more observer-independent expression like ‘to the east’.6 What I had learnt, with Don Laycock’s prompting, is that Warlpiri also has available the observer-dependent expression jampupurndjii.

But more can be observed. The Warlpiri expressions like ‘to the NE/S/W’ are situation dependent in a way that expressions like ‘to the left/right’ are not, as the example with the fuel tap shows. The Warlpiri cardinal-based translation of English ‘Turn it to the left/anti-clockwise’ will vary with the congeal, depending on the heading of the referent (the vehicle). Through the (relatively recent) rise of the term ‘clockwise’ (and ‘anti-’ and ‘counterclockwise’), English has a means of expression which is independent of the orientation of both observer and referent.7

Given the Aboriginal preference for cardinal directions, I was not surprised when a search I made of dozens of Australian language vocabularies failed to turn up any terms glossed as ‘clockwise’, or any lexicalisation of rotational directionality. In addition, Kendon (1988: 116-118) concludes from his broad study of Australian manual languages that generally ‘handedness is not usually relied upon as a form of linguistic contrast’. My tentative conclusion is that while ‘There would seem to be an MA thesis in this’ (as Don said) we lack the evidence to say that ‘Australian aboriginals have a preference for sunrise – Australian anticlockwise – motion’.

3. CARDINAL DIRECTIONS

We know examples of how observer-centred terms such as ‘left’ and ‘right’ can take on observer-independent senses. Winer (1985:583) observes:

Typically, a convention was established that a point of reference should remain stable. Thus, the left-hand side of a boat was always determined in relation to its bow. ‘Left’ and ‘right’ in a house of parliament have been fixed as seen from the Chair.

Apparently such a shift is seen in some etymologies:

Podism is even embedded into Northern Hemisphere languages. In Semitic languages, and in Welsh, the word for ‘right’ is often related to the word for ‘south’ – because, in their homelands, when one faces the rising sun in the east the sun at noon will be on one’s right hand. (Laycock 1982:3)

---

6I am indebted to Patrick McConvell for some discussion of this point.
7And, paxt Laycock (1982), of the hemisphere in which the term is used!
The majority of [Indo-European] words for the main points of the compass are based either on the position of the sun at a given time of day...or on one's orientation, which among the IE-speaking peoples was usually facing the sunrise ("in front"="east...") (Beck 1949:870-873).

There is the correlation that Indic tradition establishes between 'right' and 'left' and cardinal points. First among the directions of the compass was the point of sunrise, the east; the natural direction to follow from there was the course of the sun. Facing east, absolute 'south' and person-related 'right' referred to the same reality; the same applied, as long as the basic orientation was retained, to 'north' and 'left'. To go from right to left in a natural way was to move clockwise; even in our western tradition, the same pattern is observed to this day – to move withershins, that is, counterclockwise, is considered unlucky by some. (Winter 1985:588)

The question arises then for, say, Australian Aborigiinal languages: are there any markedness relations among cardinal terms? In particular, can cardinal direction terms be related to terms for 'left' and 'right' and, if so, what is the cultural basis for the relationship?

The best discussion published so far is probably that of Tindale (1974:45-48), who noticed polyphony relating:

'south' : 'cold'
'east' : 'down', 'sunlight'
'east' : 'moon', 'sun'

The suggestion is that the cardinal terms are derived from the terms in the right column, as "It seems evident that terms can become independent of sun orientation". One can propose that meanings tend to change in the reverse direction, so that a term for 'sun' or 'moon' for instance is unlikely to be derived from a term for 'east' (or any other cardinal).

There are of course conceptual associations, south of the Tropic of Capricorn at least, of 'sun side' with 'north', and 'shade side' with 'south' (said of Uluru, for instance: Harney 1970:7). In addition to the etymologies above noted by Tindale, there may be others evidencing the conceptual alignment:

| north : south |
| sun : shade |
| hot : cold |
| up : down$^9$ |

We can add, from the Warlpiri, an association of "north" and "south" with the two socio-centric parsimony terms (Laughren 1982:76). Von Brandenstein (1982) is a compilation of much relevant information which would help an investigation into whether these associations play an etymological role in cardinal direction terminology.

3) Tindale documented what are presumably several historical shifts of a quarter-circle (right-angle) of the compass direction terms in various parts of Australia. He shows that some of the shifts are clockwise ('east' becoming 'south') as in Jawar (Yawuru), and some

$^9$Note that the common English association of 'up' with 'south' (and 'down' with 'south') is, in this account, unmarked for an Australian but not for a Boranal. As Tindale (1974:49) warns, there are other Australian associations of 'up': 'down', including 'coastal': 'island'.
are anticlockwise as in Njamal (Yamal). To this can be added the clockwise rotation of terms found in Lower Arrernte and Anmatyerre (J.G. Brench, pers. comm.).

(2) The Mudburra (central NT) cardinal stems:9

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>kirrawarra</td>
<td>north</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>karrwarrra</td>
<td>east</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>karlarrra</td>
<td>west</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lurlarra</td>
<td>south</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

have the same initial consonant and final syllable, and occur as two pairs differing only in the first vowel.10 There is a correlation with the common phonesthetic vowel grading i - a - u, in that only one of the four terms has a i/, viz. 'north', and only one has a u/, viz. 'south'. This pleasing pattern suggests that 'north' is proximate in opposition to distal 'south'. Whether or not one would expect this phonesthetic dimension to be found in other Mudburra stems in the same domain, it appears not to:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>kankarra</td>
<td>upstream</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kanmpara</td>
<td>downstream</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kanbulu</td>
<td>up, on top</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kanjju</td>
<td>under</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When comparing vocabularies of the central Northern Territory, it is noticeable that the term for 'north' shows more variation from language to language than the other three cardinals. Within Warlpiri, on the other hand, it is the term for 'south' which alone shows dialectal variation kularra - kulitjra, and which has an irregular derived form, kurlarninyarru 'across the south' – see Laughren (1978).

(3) Wilkins (1989) reports on word-association tests, in which six Arrernte speakers tended to have a bias for clockwise associations, viz. East given for North, South given for East, West given for South, and North given for West (in the course of a 120-item word association test administered in Arrernte).

(4) The reverse tendency was noted by Wilkins (1986). The arrangement of cards for telling stories, in a text elicitation experiment Wilkins conducted, showed a strong anticlockwise bias, for which he posits several explanations.

(5) An Aboriginal association of cardinal directions with unknown linguistic implications is in burial orientations in the Murray River area (Pardoe 1989:14-18 and references cited there). "It appears that normative orientations of burials were [best] to the southwest and secondarily to east-northeast."

4. SPIRAL

There is another concept which has potential 'handedness' or rotational directionalities, namely that of 'spiral'. We can distinguish a left-hand and right-hand spiral, just as there are right-hand and left-hand screw threads. I shall use 'clockwise' of a right-hand spiral, that is, one which is the locus of point moving clockwise with increasing radius; conversely, 'anti-clockwise' for a left-hand spiral.

9 The terms are taken from notes made by Patrick McConnell. See Nuth (1984).

10 Terms similar to the second pair, 'west' and 'south', but not the first pair, occur in Warlpiri and Warlpiri, to the south of Mudburra.
The spiral occurs in some Aboriginal art. Davidson (1937:106-107) notes that "it seems true that the aborigines do not distinguish between concentric circles and spirals", a generalisation not overworn since he wrote. Munn (1986:1973:138) founded of Warlpiri sacred designs that "Men treat the two forms - the concentric circles and the spiral - as equivalent, and freely alternate them in usage." The numerous spirals reproduced in Munn (1973) are clockwise and there are only two or three anticlockwise spirals among the many spirals in Munn's collection of men's pencil drawings (N. Munn, pers. comm.). Holmes (1972:8-9) reproduces a bark painting containing a clockwise spiral and two anticlockwise spirals. Mountford (1976: Colour; Plate 12) incorporates three anticlockwise spirals, and Plate 9 shows a man drawing a clockwise spiral in the sand.

Spirals of both orientations occur, but I have not found a discussion of spiral handedness in what commentary I have read on Aboriginal visual art. The goal of balance and symmetry would counterpose a design or motion of one handedness with that of the other. My conclusion on the basis of the slim evidence is that it is futile to implicate any pan-Aboriginal preference for one particular rotational direction (anticlockwise or clockwise).

Curiously, the English term 'spiral' applies not only to a two-dimensional, planar, spiral, but also to a three-dimensional screw shape or 'helix' (as in a 'spiral staircase', 'spiral drive'). The planar spiral and the helix are different geometrically, but have in common the property that the shape is 'circular', but when traced mentally it doesn't link up with itself. A similar concept is 'coil'. A Warlpiri man made an explicit mapping between a helix and concentric circles in a diagram reproduced in Munn (1973:203, Fig.6b); the diagram can equally well link a helix and a spiral.

Warlpiri has a noun wirridi 'spiral; whirlwind, willy-willy'. Compare the noun waru 'curved, concentric circles', a term which I suspect includes planar spirals.

REFERENCES


I am grateful to Lise Taylor for guidance to a number of these references, and exonerate him from any responsibility for the suggestions I make based on them.

Davidson was most interested in whether spirals could be shown to be an older motif than concentric circles, and cites Spencer and Gillen (1899:653) on the same point. Walsh (1988:68,152,169) mentions three examples of a spiral, in all of which the spiral is a rare variant of concentric circles. I have seen spirals in rock engravings in other locations north and north-east of Alice Springs. I would hazard that there is a correlation, that the more ephemeral drawings (sand drawing, as papes) have a higher ratio of spirals to concentric circles than the less ephemeral (e.g. rock art); a spiral is a quicker way of achieving the look of concentric circles. (This applies to the more abstract drawings; where the spiral is a clear picture of a coiled snake, for instance, the option of concentric circles is not available.)

John von Suamer pointed out a compound instance of this out of some we watched a men's ceremonial performance during the Waramanga land claim hearing. 1985.


