This article was downloaded by: [Australian National University Library]

On: 1 June 2010

Access details: Access Details: [subscription number 907447645]

Publisher Routledge

Informa Ltd Registered in England and Wales Registered Number: 1072954 Registered office: Mortimer House, 37-41 Mortimer Street, London W1T 3JH, UK

The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology

Publication details, including instructions for authors and subscription information:

<http://www.informaworld.com/smpp/title~content=t713689832>

Book Reviews

Susanna Price^a; Brooke McDonald-Wilmsen^b; Ute Eickelkamp^c; Kabita Chakraborty^d; Arianne Gaetano^e; Christine Winter^f; Paul Wolfram^g

^a Department of Anthropology, The Australian National University, ^b Refugee Health Research Centre, La Trobe University, ^c Charles Darwin University, ^d Australian Research Centre in Sex, Health and Society, La Trobe University, ^e Lund University Centre for East and Southeast Asian Studies, ^f Division of Pacific and Asian History, Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies, The Australian National University, ^g Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand

To cite this Article Price, Susanna , McDonald-Wilmsen, Brooke , Eickelkamp, Ute , Chakraborty, Kabita , Gaetano, Arianne , Winter, Christine and Wolfram, Paul(2009) 'Book Reviews', The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology, 10: 4, 364 — 381

To link to this Article: DOI: 10.1080/14442210903281469

URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14442210903281469>

PLEASE SCROLL DOWN FOR ARTICLE

Full terms and conditions of use: <http://www.informaworld.com/terms-and-conditions-of-access.pdf>

This article may be used for research, teaching and private study purposes. Any substantial or systematic reproduction, re-distribution, re-selling, loan or sub-licensing, systematic supply or distribution in any form to anyone is expressly forbidden.

The publisher does not give any warranty express or implied or make any representation that the contents will be complete or accurate or up to date. The accuracy of any instructions, formulae and drug doses should be independently verified with primary sources. The publisher shall not be liable for any loss, actions, claims, proceedings, demand or costs or damages whatsoever or howsoever caused arising directly or indirectly in connection with or arising out of the use of this material.

Book Reviews

Development and Dispossession: The Crisis of Forced Displacement and Resettlement

ANTHONY OLIVER-SMITH (Ed.)

Santa Fe, New Mexico, School for Advanced Research, Advanced Seminar Series, 2009
344 pp., 5 figures, references, index, ISBN: 978-1-934691-08-3, US\$34.95 (paper)

The twelve chapters of this volume were originally presented at a seminar at the School for Advanced Research in Santa Fe, New Mexico, in 2005. The authors all consider aspects of a central dilemma. Although dominant development models justify, on behalf of the greater public interest, certain investments that transform social and physical environments, those people ‘in the way’ must disproportionately bear the costs. This raises questions on the awkward intersection between project investments and the democratic rights of local people. Whose rights are more important: those who expect to benefit from projects or those who will be displaced by them?

In the Introduction, anthropologist Anthony Oliver-Smith claims a central role for anthropologists in the study of displacement and resettlement arising from development projects. Anthropology, in his view, is the foundation discipline in studies in this field, because anthropologists in the mid-twentieth century were among the first to recognise, document and work towards mitigating the serious impoverishment and human rights violations among people displaced.

Thayer Scudder, whose research on resettlement has spanned more than 50 years, focuses on the potential for building social and cultural theory. He identifies four dimensions of development-forced displacement and resettlement that should underpin theory building, namely (a) the resulting increased rate of social change in some behaviour patterns, institutions and belief systems; (b) the involuntary nature of resettlement, in which there is no going back; (c) that resettlement is a by-product of a different development initiative and therefore generally suffers from second-rate planning, inadequate consultation and insufficient financing; and (d) it is difficult to achieve an equitable outcome in addressing displacement given the wide-ranging impacts on the lives of those affected. In Scudder’s analysis, the displacement and resettlement processes have exacerbated the risks of landlessness, increased morbidity and mortality, marginalisation and social disarticulation.

Michael Cernea (Chapter 3) focuses on the critical need for sufficient financing through benefit sharing to ensure resettlement with development. He highlights the dismal outcomes for those displaced, resulting from chronic underfinancing, and focuses on flaws in the compensation principle that forms the basis of most national laws on land acquisition for development purposes.

Chris de Wet approaches development as 'riddled with tensions and contradictions, particularly around issues of power and inequality' (p. 78). De Wet tackles the ethical questions posed by development-forced displacement, suggesting that imposed change also challenges people's value systems. Forced resettlement casts people into a wider set of structures and relationships, as well as into accelerated socioeconomic change, which loosens cultural anchors, limits choices and increases conflict. Although development projects promote human wellbeing, simultaneously they may inflict huge costs on those they displace. Decision makers have to trade off competing notions of good against each other—there is no possibility of a 'win-win' outcome. De Wet concludes that if forced displacement is unavoidable in the interests of the public good, then those displaced should be resettled as well as possible.

The next three chapters deal with diverse issues that arise with reservoir construction, urban displacement and conservation projects. Adverse health effects of development-forced displacement through construction-related risks to health and safety of the original inhabitants for a reservoir project are examined by Satish Kedia in Chapter 5. Those displaced suffered mental anguish and a sense of weakened connection with sacred ancestors, gods and spirits. In Chapter 6, Dolores Koenig focuses on displacement of urban poor, arguing that they have been neglected in resettlement policies and guidelines. Programmes restoring their incomes are rarely sufficient for the purpose due to inadequate understanding of the particular dynamics of urban livelihoods. Oliver-Smith contends that conservation can become a development strategy in discourses on sustainable development. Because indigenous peoples inhabit many biodiversity 'hot spots', they may be forced out in the name of conservation, even though logging, mining, exploration and commercial agriculture may be responsible for far greater environmental destruction. Although new approaches, based on a more nuanced understanding of human–environment relationships, emphasise comanagement of conservation projects with local populations, he argues that such approaches still tend to be top-down 'with participation limited to a passive reception of information or occasional employment for individuals' (p. 161).

The growing role of transnational advocacy through non-governmental organisations and other social groups engaged in developing better policies and accountability mechanisms is highlighted by William Fisher. Forms of transnational politics offer benefits, but also pose dangers for local people. People threatened with displacement are increasingly forced to develop new alliances and politics to resist or mitigate the likely negative impacts. The advocacy alliances

change the information environment to influence policy and to alter power relationships. However, engaging in political activities can be difficult to sustain and may have unintended effects on displaced people. This may cause tension between advocates' desires for democratic participation and the need for efficiency and effectiveness in improving policy outcomes. For Fisher, changing policies and laws require an understanding of transnational political processes.

Chapter 9, by Dana Clark, reviews recent recommendations to adopt a rights and risks approach to development planning by the World Commission on Dams and the principle of free, prior informed consent promoted by the Extractive Industries Review. Neither of these recommendations has been adopted by financiers and the International Finance Corporation has endorsed the use of force by the state to benefit private sector investment. In Chapter 10, Barbara Johnston presents a Guatemalan case in which the rights of those displaced are increasingly under siege and human rights complaints are cast as threats against the state.

Anthropologists Ted Downing and Carmen Garcia-Downing (Chapter 11) highlight the neglected psycho-social-cultural impoverishment of displacement, asking why it has been so difficult to address these issues. The authors seek to understand the irreversible loss of culture and the dynamics that result in 'a new social poverty ... in lives wrecked, social relationships realigned, social and economic assets lost, leaders toppled, people (particularly the elderly) growing ill and dying prematurely, and the diminished capacity of a society to withstand non-project-related threats' (p. 227).

Finally, anthropologist Gregory Button presents a field report of conditions in Houston in the aftermath of Hurricane Katrina. This provides an interesting comparison and contrast between displacement caused by disaster and development-forced displacement. Although the immediate causes may differ, the challenges of reconstruction share similar features.

These contributions, mostly by anthropologists, demonstrate the diversity of approaches in research around displacement and resettlement arising from development projects. Should large-scale, displacement-intensive investments be revered as symbols of national pride and potent modernisation? Or are they to be viewed as 'tombstones for lost ecosystems, peoples, and societies' (p. 164)? It is no surprise to find these contributors recognising the risks for those displaced and advocating for their better treatment. This rich cross-section of anthropological contributions is closely informed by decades of interaction between anthropological researchers with policy makers, planners and civil society.

SUSANNA PRICE

*Department of Anthropology
The Australian National University*

© 2009 Susanna Price

Can Compensation Prevent Impoverishment? Reforming Resettlement Through Investments and Benefit-Sharing

MICHAEL M. CERNEA & HARI MOHAN MATHUR (Eds)

New Delhi, Oxford University Press, 2008

xxviii + 441 pp., illustrated, 1 map, bibliography, index, ISBN: 978-0-1956-8713-2, £22.99 (hardback)

Cernea and Mathur have brought together seventeen leading thinkers from a variety of disciplines to answer the question: can compensation prevent impoverishment? Together, they provide an alternative approach to the theory and practice that shape the outcomes of involuntary resettlement: to become more equitable, compensation must be supplemented by investments in development.

Michael Cernea sets the scene and begins by acknowledging the progression in resettlement policy and practice since the 1980s, but is frustrated by continued failure of resettlements. The paradox is that many projects aimed at alleviating poverty are instead causing impoverishment. He notes flaws in conventional approaches to resettlement based on compensation and identifies methodological bottlenecks to reforming resettlement.

Part I of the book explores theoretical issues defining compensation for displacement in order to identify where resettlement projects are going wrong and establishes the basis for discussion as to how things can, and sometimes do, go right. Chapter 2, also by Cernea, argues that compensation alone is insufficient in theory and practice to restore and improve livelihoods. He outlines the defective economic evaluation and budgeting procedures typically associated with resettlement before launching the essential premise of this book—the case for investment—by using empirical case studies.

Chapter 3 by the late David W. Pearce and Timothy Swanson examines an appropriate methodology for the economic evaluation of projects incorporating involuntary displacements. Like Cernea, Pearce and Swanson critique the compensation principle and call for a rights-based approach to large project evaluations based on what affected people are willing to accept, rather than what the proponent is willing to pay for their displacement. Chapter 4, by Herman E. Daly, questions the fundamental principles of economics that couch involuntary resettlement as an ‘externality’ and suggests that this can be redressed by giving ‘oustees’ the right of refusal of compensation. Daly suggests that the economic vision should be recast and calls for distributive justice and, in particular, for the inclusion of the displaced in the distribution of specific benefits linked to investment projects.

Ravi Kanbur critiques the benchmark concept in economics—‘Pareto improvement’—that a project should make at least one person better off and no one worse off. He observes that under this principle none of projects reviewed in this book would have gone ahead and redistribution from the rich to the poor would be prevented. Kanbur stresses the need to depart from the Pareto criterion by using

distributionally sensitive weights to evaluate the gains and losses of a project. He calls for specific compensation mechanisms and generalised safety nets to reduce tensions between protecting the vulnerable and supporting projects that produce aggregate net benefits.

Part II examines policy and legal frameworks for compensation. Susanna Price outlines important initiatives undertaken by the Asian Development Bank (ADB) to address the gap between the organisational policy of the ADB, national regulations and legislation underpinning involuntary resettlement. A range of important national-level gains are described, as well as important implications for the ADB's own operations. The next two chapters focus on India. Walter Fernandes reviews compensation in national policy, particularly the frailties that generate marginalisation. He raises key issues concerning legal title and calls for compensation to be calculated at replacement value of livelihoods lost (not just the market value of individual assets), as well as for the quantification of psychological, cultural and social losses. Ramanathan (Chapter 8) explores the concept of eminent domain and its application. The role of protest and related progress in resettlement policy in India is considered.

Part III explores the empirical evidence for the limits of compensation. In Chapter 9, Jayewardene explores whether a satisfactory outcome for resettlement can be achieved without fundamental structural changes in legal and regulatory frameworks, processes, attitudes and agency. (The answer is an unequivocal 'no'.) Sri Lanka is provided as an example of good national resettlement policy. In Chapter 10, Mathur provides a case study of how a project extended beyond the basic minimum by attempting to restore livelihoods can go horribly wrong, as with the Coal India Limited mining project funded by the World Bank. Chapter 11, by Frances J. Seymour, explores displacement caused by conservation projects to inform the reconsideration of the appropriateness of involuntary displacement as a conservation tool in light of increased attention to the rights of affected communities and poverty-reduction objectives.

The final section of this book is perhaps the most anticipated—by now the reader is earnestly awaiting a solution that will address the considerable wrongs in current approaches to involuntary resettlement. Égré, Roquet and Durocher review examples of benefit-sharing activities around the developed and developing world that have been applied to hydropower projects. They describe the economic and ethical principles in benefit sharing, evaluate the processes and practicalities in implementation and make a preliminary attempt to evaluate outcomes. However, this chapter falls short of expectations. Readers would have benefited from clearer application of the authors' fourfold evaluation criteria to the case studies addressed. Chapter 13, by Nakayama and Furuyashiki, offers a key contribution in its presentation of the Jintu-Gawa Dam case, a project that included an innovative rent scheme.

Barry P. Trembath, a hydropower engineer at the World Bank, provides the most significant contribution to this volume. The author explores benefit sharing through the redistribution of rents—the surplus return (earnings or profit) that some factors of production generate when they vary in quality and limited in supply. Types of rent

sharing with affected communities are identified using examples from Norway, China, Lao PDR, South America and Canada: post-resettlement assistance, tax sharing, royalty sharing, equity sharing with power producers and retroactive rent sharing. Tentative conclusions are drawn concerning rent sharing models and concrete examples of how affected people have shared in the gains of hydropower projects are significant to the central tenet of this book.

The final chapter by Susan Tamondong asks the question: can improved resettlement reduce poverty? The affirmative answer is qualified with the proviso that the resettlement is transformed into an opportunity for development from the outset. Given that this book is exploring a reform of resettlement through investments and benefit sharing, one ponders whether the aim of reducing poverty undermines the more ambitious promise of equitable results and rewarding development through resettlement. Importantly, the chapter presents cases of successful resettlement, albeit comparably small in scale, and identifies some key success factors.

Cernea and Mathur's book is a comprehensive and significant contribution to understanding the practice of involuntary resettlement and the field of development studies. Although an additional chapter teasing out the future directions for policy makers and resettlement practitioners would have been beneficial, the book should feature prominently on the desks of policy makers and practitioners around the world to encourage them to think differently about how they approach resettlement planning and design.

BROOKE McDONALD-WILMSEN

Refugee Health Research Centre

La Trobe University

© 2009 Brooke McDonald-Wilmsen

Anthropology and Child Development: A Cross-Cultural Reader

ROBERT A. LEVINE & REBECCA S. NEW (Eds)

Malden, MA, Blackwell Publishing, 2008

viii-x + 324 pp., epilogue, bibliography, index, ISBN: 978-0-631-22976-6, US\$39.95 (paper)

This reader in the Blackwell Anthologies in Social and Cultural Anthropology is a timely introduction to the anthropology of childhood that will serve students, teachers and researchers as an excellent guide through this expanding field. The editors, Robert Levine and Rebecca New, both long-established scholars in education and anthropology, have selected high-quality and accessible contributions that portray both the history of Anglophone research on infancy and childhood across cultures and the multiple disciplines that need to be garnered if child development is to be fully understood. This is the principal aim of the collection, to advance child development as a science in its own right. The editors argue that what is required is a

cross-cultural and interdisciplinary perspective that allows for the formulation of a universal theory of human childhood applicable to the entire species (p. 5).

The twenty-four chapters cover a range of social science methodologies and interdisciplinary approaches. A brief introduction to the volume emphasises the ethnographic fact of the cultural variety of childhood ecologies, of ideas about the child and normal development and of child-rearing practices. Major findings from cross-cultural research are usefully summarised: all societies studied recognise a life stage of childhood and emergent capacities; most children across time and place do not attend school, but participate in a range of productive activities; developmental pathways are culturally constituted; parenting reflects cultural norms; and children are active participants in social interactions (p. 3).

The following chapters are organised chronologically into four parts, each with a separate informative introduction. Part I presents excerpts from 'classic' texts from the foundational period of the anthropology of childhood in five chapters that offer noteworthy ethnographic field observations, methodological insights and concepts that inspired later work. Early ethnographic contributions stand out through their authors' gifts as writers, their wealth of empirical and theoretical knowledge, analytical acumen and psychological insight, and the absence of scientific methodology.

Part II, comprising eight chapters, opens with a theoretical discussion of the comparative study of parenting that is not especially helpful in relation to the chapters that follow. These offer captivating ethnographic accounts, some explicitly comparative, others dealing in-depth with one society. Three chapters concern infant care in hunter-gatherer societies in Africa: Melvin Konner (the !Kung), Edward Tronick, Gilda Morelli and Steve Winn (the Efe) and Barry Hewlett (the Aka). They make for an interesting comparison in terms of the cultural differences and the methodology used (quantitative psychosocial surveys combined with natural observation).

The section concludes with Melford Spiro's study of life in a Kibbutz crèche, along with two highly interesting comparative chapters, one addressing talking and playing with babies in England and Holland, the other mother-infant attachment in 1970s Germany. As a psychoanalytically oriented anthropologist and a German mother of infant twins, I found the observations in the latter chapter (by Robert LeVine and Karin Norman) extremely moving. Their research explores the question of whether enculturation begins in infancy (in terms of social distance learnt through attachment styles). They answer in the positive while exposing aspects of established terminology as morally charged (e.g. 'secure' versus 'insecure' attachment).

Part III comprises six chapters on early childhood (ages 2–5 years), which, as the editors note in their introduction, was only conceptualised as a developmental stage in the twentieth century (inspired by the naturalistic observations of Piaget, Chomsky and Vygotsky). Four chapters address communication. Patricia Clancy shows how the indirect communicative style of the Japanese is enculturated through mother-child interaction. Compared with American children, young Japanese receive little verbal input from their mothers, even though they spend more time together. As an Aboriginalist, I was struck by the brief excerpt from Sara Harkness and Charles

Super's 'Why African children are so hard to test', which could inspire further research with Australian Aboriginal children—not for improving test situations, but in order to understand better the children's behaviour in any intercultural context (school included). African (Kipsigis) children have learnt to remain silent when in the presence of older or higher-status people out of respect and obedience and, like their Japanese counterparts, receive little verbal input from their mothers.

The other two language-related chapters open a view into how cultural values and orientations shape narrative style at home and among peers. Peggy Miller and colleagues present an informative comparison between the way in which transgression is talked about in American and Taiwanese homes (the contrast could not be starker). Corsaro and Rizzo present a detailed sociolinguistic ethnography concerning the cultural shape of children's conversations in Italy. This contribution conveys children's own views and practices more than any other in this collection through the presentation and analysis of lengthy dialogues between three male friends.

The remaining two chapters in Part III come from Rebecca New and Jean Brigg. New's focus is on cultural views of play and its place in the extended family life of a small Italian town. In my estimation, Brigg's chapter is in a league of its own. The conceptual mastery, writing skill and deep knowledge of Canadian Inuit family life shown by this now veteran ethnographer and psychological anthropologist are all evident in this piece on autonomy and aggression in 3-year-old Utku children of Baffin Island.

The five chapters in Part IV turn towards middle and late childhood, when work and play assume a new balance. Barbara Rogoff and colleagues report some general conclusions based on a survey of ethnographic reports in the Human Relations Area Files from fifty cultures. Thomas Weisner and Ronald Gallimore explore non-institutionalised forms of caretaking children by children. This chapter has many noteworthy findings and is a strong reminder that the institutionalisation of the child in facilities of professional care and education is a recent phenomenon with a number of disadvantages. The chapter by John and Beatrice Whiting presents a small section from their comprehensive Six Cultures Study on children's social behaviour, conducted in the early 1950s, and whose research team included one of the editors, Robert LeVine. This quantitatively substantiated comparative study was seen as facilitating the identification of transculturally valid links between variables, as well as culturally unique correlations. Although acknowledging its historical significance, my own view is that the Six Cultures Study is methodologically overblown and remains problematic (largely as a result of its 'scientism'). In the final chapter, Martha Wenger uses on-the-spot observations to assess how much time Giriama boys and girls in Kenya spend pursuing a range of activities and in whose company. Wenger's overall mapping of the children's social ecology is informative, despite some shortcomings in data and in her application of psychoanalytical theory regarding gender separation. Her attention to universals (e.g. children's preference for same-sex playmates) makes this a fitting end to a book that seeks to identify just such phenomenon.

I found this volume's good balance between studies of Western and non-Western societies, as well as of large-scale industrialised and small kinship societies, especially positive. However, a number of omissions must be mentioned that cannot be justified by lack of space alone. There is no consideration of children's art or drawing (which Mead used as a field technique) and the collection appears heavily weighted towards American research, having nothing on Australia and very little on the Pacific Islands. Not one of the studies addresses issues of historical transformation or the effects of colonialism, discrimination and marginalisation. Finally, it would have been useful if the editors could have offered a tentative conclusion, one that drew on a critical assessment of the diverse methodologies presented and included a fuller formulation of a contemporary theory of child development. But, all in all, the collection is a fine achievement and forms a valuable resource for those working with children in multicultural settings and for parents interested in viewing their own roles from different perspectives.

UTE EICKELKAMP

Charles Darwin University

© 2009 Ute Eickelkamp

Domestic Goddesses: Maternity, Globalization and Middle-Class Identity in Contemporary India

HENRIKE DONNER

Aldershot, Ashgate, 2008

ix + 230 pp., maps, figures, glossary, bibliography, index, ISBN: 978-0-7546-4942-7, \$89.96 (hardback)

Henrike Donner's *Domestic Goddesses: Maternity, Globalization and Middle-Class Identity in Contemporary India* is a detailed ethnography exploring kinship, motherhood and the changing lives of women and their families in a rapidly modernising Calcutta, India. The book is rich with intimate details of women's social worlds and presents the complex intersections between class, gender and neoliberal reforms on middle-class womanhood. Based on fieldwork conducted over a 10-year period in mainly urban middle-class neighbourhoods (although a particular neighbourhood seems to dominate the text), the author reveals fascinating generational shifts in kinship. Throughout the book, the reader is privy to the politics of the family and the author clearly presents and analyses the way neoliberal agendas shape and challenge the life worlds of women and, indeed, the Indian middle-class as a whole.

The book consists of a comprehensive introduction, a dense literature and theoretical overview of womanhood, class and a changing India, detailed chapters on women's everyday experiences of love and romance, childbirth, mothering and education, changes of the body and a short conclusion. Of these chapters, those

addressing birthing practices and mothering and education are exceptional in content and analysis.

The chapter *On Love, Marriage and Intimacy* depicts the tensions between love, arranged marriage and love marriages in a modernising India and contextualises these frictions within a larger joint family system. Although discourses of individually styled love are ever-present in Indian popular culture and more commonplace in public spaces, Donner correctly reminds us 'that even in urbanized arenas ambivalent attitudes towards love-marriages prevail and that, while they have become more common, self-chosen unions are not the norm' (p. 81). In this environment, choosing one's own marriage can still be viewed negatively, but the author shows that 'where couples fall in love with someone from the same caste, community and religious background they are...neither marginalized or [sic] forced to elope' (p. 88) as they were a generation ago. Within arranged unions, Donner shows us that contemporary families are likely to leave the final decision of marriage with the couple, revealing a shift in the agency of young people. Most marriages are expected to exist—and still do—within the context of the joint family and Donner thoughtfully portrays the challenging early years of marriage, where women are expected to 'adjust' to their new family. Although the concept of 'love' could be explored in more detail to include more information on how middle-class love is performed (such as through rituals of courtship), the chapter reveals that marriage is an important 'site for displaying belonging within South Asian modernity' (p. 66); it is within this institution that middle-class identity is written and performed.

In *The Place of Birth*, Donner explores the lived experiences of pregnant women in the home and the tensions between the joint family and the natal family during this time. The chapter investigates how the medicalisation of childbirth, especially the Caesarean section, has provided a space for women and their families to enact their class, while helping women negate the traditional pain and shame of vaginal births. The author carefully details how the increased medical interference of birthing practices is rewriting young women's traditional birthing experiences and relationships. Donner reveals that although a woman's relationship with a private hospital can undermine her natal family's expectation of caring for their daughter as custom, a medical birth allows a young husband's earning power and a family's class status to be displayed. As in the previous chapter, Donner focuses on the impact of the place of birth on the joint family system, making strong ties between a young mother's agency, work and labour expectations, middle-class values and neoliberal reformation within the family. Her access to the most intimate spaces of young women's lives, and her compelling analysis of the changing face of women and birthing in a changing nation, makes this one of the strongest chapters of the book.

The links between schooling and parenting are examined in the chapter *Education and the Making of Middle-Class Mothers*, where Donner demonstrates how mothers and female teachers transcend 'the division between the home and the school and negotiate liberalization through children's education' (p. 153). In so doing, the author

fills a significant gap in knowledge concerning middle-class education and parenting expectations and comprehensively moves away from the dominant discourses of education in relation to family planning. Donner thoughtfully explains the tensions families and mothers experience when educating their children, pointing to uncertainties about the diminishing 'link between education, employment and the state ... [and] an expression of their belief in the promise of new opportunities which they see as the future of post-liberalization India' (p. 127). Throughout the chapter, Donner details how female children, mothers and grandmothers have witnessed a significant shift in responsibilities and expectations in a market-driven Calcutta, where a 'good' private, English-medium education is now understood to be the only acceptable schooling option for children. The chapter also addresses the rise in private preschool education, a space that acts as a platform for middle-class parenting values. The personal experiences of the author throughout this chapter create a rich and thorough depiction of the changing face of middle-class experiences and expectations of children's education.

In the chapter *Motherhood, Food and the Body*, Donner investigates how food is used by middle-class women to 'adjust' to postliberal India and discusses how women's bodies have become a 'prime site of middle-classness' (p. 161). Specifically, the author argues that 'new vegetarianism' is used by middle-class mothers to control their sexual urges and to signal 'that the reproductive phase of their lives was over after the birth of a single child' (p. 172). Donner also shows how by not consuming certain foods, mealtime becomes a mode of resistance for young women within a joint family household. When used by young married women, vegetarianism can be seen as disruptive and an individualistic sign of rebellion; when young girls purposefully abstain from fish, they turn their 'own dietary preferences into an individualist gesture' (p. 175). Donner acknowledges that study into food practices of the Bengali middle class is a work in progress and the chapter is an important introduction into this burgeoning area of study.

There is a dearth of scholarly research on middle-class motherhoods and changing kinship experiences in India due, as Donner correctly points out, to the traditional academic preoccupation with the Indian state and nationalism. *Domestic Goddesses* fills a substantial knowledge gap in relation to the everyday lives of middle-class women and how kinship is changing in a globalising nation. The text is rich in experience and consistently reminds us of the importance of the domestic sphere in producing and reproducing the Indian middle-class in a globalising world.

KABITA CHAKRABORTY

*Australian Research Centre in Sex, Health and Society
La Trobe University*

© 2009 Kabita Chakraborty

New Masters, New Servants: Migration, Development, and Women Workers in China

YAN HAIRONG

Durham, Duke University Press, 2008

x + 314 pp., bibliography, index, ISBN: 978-0-8223-4304-2, US\$23.95 (paper)

This intellectually stimulating and finely crafted ethnography of domestic service in China engages with much broader concerns with the condition of postsocialism and its modes of governmentality. It is firmly grounded in qualitative research among migrant women domestic workers, performed in the late 1990s in Anhui province—well-known as a source for domestic workers in the past and present—and in Beijing, as well as interviews with urban employers, labour recruiters, employment agencies and government officials. It incorporates close readings of (Chinese) short stories and novellas, songs and poems, print illustrations (including a fascinating analysis of the paperback's cover art), television drama, official rhetoric, media reportage and journalism, as well as selective oral interviews and written testimonies (essays, diary entries, letters to the author) from migrant women domestic workers. It displays versatility and breadth of scholarship, drawing upon an array of critical thought—Marxism, subaltern studies, postcolonialism, feminism, poststructuralism and psychoanalysis—to illuminate how domestic service, materially and metaphorically, figures in the creation of new subjects, modes of subjectification and governance and subjectivity that are the hallmark, and the bedrock, of postsocialist China's embrace of development ideology and neoliberal capitalism. Yan probes these diverse texts with these analytical tools to reveal the discursive space wherein migrant women workers are interpellated as new subjects through 'keywords' or discursive powers—of development, modernity, *suzhi* (quality), human capital, self-development and consumer citizenship. Migrant women workers must and do express their subjectivities on these terms and through these interpretive frameworks. Yet, because much of their lived experience confounds dominant discourse, it cannot be articulated effectively. Existing amid contradiction, migrant women workers are inherently incomplete and unstable subjects. However, Yan hints, their experience is a latent well-spring of resistance to master discourses that may inspire collective political consciousness if recalled and re-articulated through the language of the socialist past.

The introduction establishes the master–servant asymmetry, characteristic of even contemporary domestic service, as a metaphor for social inequality in China that, in turn, stems from postsocialist restructuring of society and economy in accord with transnational capitalism. Chapter 1 asserts that young women from China's countryside who desire to partake of a culture of modernity have no choice but to migrate to the cities, because remaining in the rural areas is a symbolic death. Those who migrated from Anhui villages in the post-Mao era are shown to hold very different

understandings of countryside and city, gender, migration and labour than their counterparts from the Maoist period. Connotations of words shift with changing structural relationships between agriculture and industry, private and public and rural and urban, if not production and reproduction. The literal and figurative emaciation of the rural by development policies and discourses leaves rural youth in a pitiable position outside modernity unless they sell their labour to urban industry and service, and still they will not be recognised as fully human. Chapter 2 provides a historical explanation for the separation and hierarchical revaluation of mental and manual labour, the redomestication of women and the changing meaning of domesticity in the postsocialist reordering of society and economy. Together, these engender middle-class (urban) demands for commodified forms of domestic service and normative expectations of domestic workers, especially that they be 'blank slates'—fresh from the countryside, easily groomed to anticipate their employer's every need and grateful for the employer's 'generous' pedagogical training on how to be a proper employee—who accepts her subordinate class (and gender) status. This ideal form of sociality ruled only by market logic requires that migrant women's subjectivities and desires be somehow harnessed to its achievement. Chapter 3 focuses on the nebulous concept of *suzhi* (quality): a new human value, a social and subjective form of (*pace* Marx) 'surplus value' accrued by rural migrant women workers in exchange for their labour, which 'marks a sense and sensibility of the self's value in a market economy' (p. 113). Pervasive *suzhi* discourse elides material poverty with cultural insufficiency and neatly posits 'development' as the only means to advance individuals and society (an interpretation less critical of global capitalism and neoliberal governance may regard *suzhi* as social capital or social remittances). Thus, materialist analytics of class and labour exploitation are replaced under postsocialist transformations by *suzhi* abstraction. Chapter 4 investigates the tension of migrant women workers' dual participation in production and consumption. For themselves and their households, they work in order to earn money to spend and consume in order to appear, and be recognised, as modern and therefore of worth. Yet, they cannot escape their class—and gender—subordinate position, which marks them as objects for consumption and brings them ridicule as consumers of poor taste. Chapter 5 demonstrates how the domestic service labour recruitment process disciplines migrant women workers in spirit and body, in collusion with employers and state cadres, and, in turn, how the discursive power of 'self-development' is internalised by migrant women workers as a technique of self-making. The resulting 'good' quality domestic worker who knows her place (i.e. class position) invariably suffers 'social schizophrenia' (p. 213) because the labour relationship entails exploitation. Finally, Chapter 6 considers the impossibility of return and prospects for migrant women workers' political consciousness. Even as recent state policies have started to address the uneven development that has negatively affected rural areas, and although China's countryside has been inexorably altered by migration and remittances, many migrants are unwilling to return. Yan's interviewees bemoan the loss of rural community and sense of home, and moreover no longer identify with their former, rural selves. Yan finds the pro-urbanisation stance of so many migrant workers

problematic, because it is in tune with liberal economists' calls for a unified labour market and compounds rural poverty by encouraging brain drain. Yan also cautions that the migrants' rights discourse is aligned with this neoliberal paradigm and is therefore insufficient to address the fundamental concerns of class. The book ends on a hopeful note in the voice of a migrant woman worker who unfashionably and insistently draws upon that alternative discourse to identify and articulate collective suffering in class terms.

Some readers may be disoriented by the unconventional organisation of the book, which includes a subdivided chapter and three intermezzos that are integrated into the main text with varying degrees of success. A few discussions (e.g. of *suku*) are recurrent, perhaps reflecting that two chapters were previously published as articles, but repetition also reinforces important points. This provocative and challenging book will be a must-read for advanced undergraduates and postgraduates in anthropology, Asian Studies, cultural studies and critical theory, as well as for scholars seeking a thought-provoking account of the metamorphosis of labour, class and subjectivity concomitant with postsocialism in China.

ARIANNE GAETANO

Lund University Centre for East and Southeast Asian Studies

© 2009 Arianne Gaetano

Anthropology's Global Histories. The Ethnographic Frontier in German New Guinea, 1870–1935

RAINER F. BUSCHMANN

Honolulu, University of Hawai'i Press, 2009

x + 234 pp., illustrated, bibliography, index, ISBN: 978-0-8248-3184-4, US\$55.00 (cloth)

Despite its title, the core period this volume investigates is from the beginning of the *Voelkerkunde* Museum in Berlin in 1886 to the end of the German colonial empire in 1921. Based on a PhD dissertation, this is a diligently researched volume. Many of the archival collections consulted in Germany were seriously damaged during World War II and it takes a tenacious and meticulous researcher to excavate the stories and developments that form the core of this study. The publishers allowed detailed footnotes, the bibliography is extensive and the short index is solid.

The introduction is a key shortcoming. In seeking to contextualise the study, both as part of global history and within an interdisciplinary dialogue between anthropology and history, it is overly ambitious and so wide ranging as to be unhelpful. The otherwise clear and concise language of the author makes way for grand statements that hinder understanding. I would recommend reading a chapter by Andre Gingrich (2005) as an alternative introduction, and then enjoy an otherwise fascinating volume.

Chapter 1 is a more specific introduction into the beginnings of the Berlin *Voelkerkunde* Museum and the theoretical ideas of its first director, Adolf Bastian, in the context of the foundation of the German nation and its colonial empire. The Berlin Museum established a monopoly over the collection and distribution of colonial artefacts that was to be challenged by other German museums. Chapter 2 narrates the growing interest of German firms in the value (in terms of both money and prestige) of artefacts and Felix von Luschan's attempts, as head of the African and Oceanic division, to create a countertrend of collecting, one that included descriptions of artefacts (e.g. origin, manufacture and cultural practises). Buschmann's meta-argument about influences between the colonial frontier and the metropole is established in convincing detail. However, in the process of analysing the politics of collecting artefacts the author understates von Luschan's interest in human measurements and human remains. Eliding this obsession, shared with contemporary colleagues across Europe, risks sanitising the history of colonial collecting and blunting debates about collecting and ethnographic purposes.

Chapter 3 shows how German museums in Stuttgart, Hamburg, Cologne and Leipzig by-passed, subverted and challenged the Berlin monopoly. Buschmann argues that von Luschan's response was to move from secondary collecting (by local agents as middle men) to primary collecting. His ethnographic training of navy personnel and sending out of trained ethnographers on specialised expeditions introduced important innovations, which, Buschmann argues, helped prepare the way for modern anthropological methods. Chapter 4 follows the restructuring of German colonialism in the wake of the Herero uprising and analyses attempts by the colonial office, in particular Solf, to place colonial artefacts under its own control. Solf's attempt to take over the monopoly of the Berlin Museum, and thus control and unify the anthropological museum community, was interrupted by the outbreak of World War I. The museums, in turn, tried to take advantage of the colonial office's new agenda of 'scientific colonialism' by securing support and funding for expeditions to German New Guinea and the Pacific.

Chapter 5 follows the main collecting expeditions to New Guinea and traces the influence of the colonial administration on their practices and methodology. Albert Hahl, Governor from 1902, tried to enlist the expeditions for research the administration could use. His desire to find remedies against depopulation and to understand local customs and the 'native mind' led him to encourage census taking and linguistic studies, especially in New Ireland. Buschmann argues that Hahl's push for a new ethnography was particularly successful with Richard Thurnwald and would have led to a radical new direction of German anthropology (had untimely deaths and World War I not delayed or prevented publications). Buschmann stretches his argument that Thurnwald's research was an early Malinowskian-type fieldwork into a speculation on the possible development of German anthropology away from a *Sonderweg* (which is Gingrich's argument) in the direction of Anglo-American anthropology. This involves a big claim for the influence of the colonial periphery on ethnography and one that needs to be debated much further, especially because

Buschmann's focus on museum-based ethnography leaves university developments out of his considerations.

Chapter 6 promises an investigation of indigenous reactions. In methodological terms alone this is outside the scope of what this volume can expect to deliver. Rather, the chapter tells us more about European observations of changing artefact production in Wuvulu, Aua and New Ireland and the impact of these changes on German ethnography. Chapter 7 tracks the impact of the end of the German colonial empire after World War I. Buschmann argues that in the wake of the German colonial empire a 'postcolonial imagination' developed that influenced ethnography. The monographs compiled based on prior research and German colonial collections were coloured by the purpose to establish German colonial accomplishments and counter criticism of German rule.

The conclusion tends to suffer from the same general problems as the introduction and incorporates a number of factual inaccuracies. To give one example, Hubert Murray was not administering Papua and New Guinea. The latter was a C Mandate of the League of Nations. Its administrators were Brigadier General Evan Wisdom, Brigadier General Thomas Griffith, followed by Brigadier General (Sir) Walter Ramsay McNicoll; thus, E. W. P. Chinnery was never employed or supported by Murray as government anthropologist. Nonetheless, I see the book as a must for historians and anthropologists interested in Pacific colonial history.

Reference

- Gingrich, A. (2005) 'From the nationalistic birth of *Volkskunde* to the establishment of academic diffusionism: Branching off from the international mainstream', in *One Discipline, Four Ways: British, German, French and American Anthropology*, eds F. Barth, A. Gingrich, R. Parkin & S. Silverman, University of Chicago Press, Chicago, pp. 76–93.

CHRISTINE WINTER

*Division of Pacific and Asian History, Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies
The Australian National University*

© 2009 Christine Winter

Global Indigenous Media: Cultures, Poetics, and Politics

PAMELA WILSON & MICHELLE STEWART (Eds)

Durham, NC, Duke University Press, 2008

376 pp., 30 illustrations, 1 table, bibliography, index, ISBN: 978-0-8223-4291-5, \$24.95 (paper); ISBN: 978-0-8223-4308-0, \$89.95 (cloth)

Global Indigenous Media: Cultures, Poetics, and Politics is a remarkably eclectic and timely group of essays that are presented and arranged into a fascinating collection with a thorough and insightful introduction by the editors Wilson and Stewart. This book will be of significance to ethnographers and anthropologists with interests in

the scholarship and practice of indigenous media, visual anthropology, communications and media studies, as well as indigenous artistic practice and production, to name only some of the fields on which this collection touches.

Global Indigenous Media takes an interdisciplinary approach to exploring a wide range of media, from radio to cinema and beyond to the vast and unknown expanses of the information superhighway. The essays in this collection discuss the aesthetics and style of modern media formats, the purpose and power of these formats, issues of identity, tradition and cultural preservation, together with a broader and more global look at the meaning and potential of new technologies, as well as how they are used and impact upon indigenous peoples.

The book is arranged into four parts with an introductory essay acting as a preface to the entire collection. Part I, *From Poetics to Politics: Indigenous Media Aesthetics and Style*, contains four essays that cover indigenous video production in Latin America, Maori cinema in New Zealand, Inuit video production and archiving, and native American animation. The essays in this section, like those throughout the book, are generally well structured and argued. In this first section, Juan Francisco Salazar and Amalia Cordova introduce the reader to the ideas of 'imperfect media', a form of media production that is not concerned with broadcast production values and conventional Hollywood narratives and, as the authors state, 'whose locally based embedded aesthetics and concern for making political and cultural interventions may contribute to the theorization of a politically emancipatory form of citizens' media' (p. 55). Although Salazar and Cordova's essay draws specific reference to Latin America, it also provides the background for many of the essays that follow in the book. Among the other chapters in Part I, *Cache: Provisions and Productions in Contemporary Igloodik Video* stands out as a work of scholarship that practices what it preaches. This essay is written by and represents the ideas of the Cache Collective as a group. The chapter explores how members of the community of Igloodik have developed their own prolific video practice. This practice includes provisions for the storage or 'caching' of video narratives, artistic expressions, cultural aesthetics and interpretive practices to allow them to be re-accessed 'as mnemonic records of place deeply rooted in community' (p. 77). Overall, this first section provides an excellent introduction to the scope and diversity of indigenous media, its range and the variety of aesthetic approaches.

Part II, *Indigenous Activism, Advocacy and Empowerment Through Media*, shows the power that media forms can provide to deify the nation state in Burma (Myanmar) and simultaneously define identity. In her chapter *Transistor Resistors*, Kathleen Buddle explains the power of radio broadcasting as a tool of postcolonial resistance among First Nations women of Canada. The other essays in this section highlight the efficacy of radio and video as tools of opposition and self-definition during civil conflict for indigenous peoples in Colombia and among Zapatistas in Mexico.

The final two sections of the book examine *Cultural Identity, Preservation and Community-Building Through Media*, with essays that span indigenous media in Wales, Russia, Sweden, Finland and Mexico. Part IV, *New Technologies, Timeless*

Knowledges: Digital and Interactive Media, considers how media technologies have been used by indigenous communities in Brazil and among Australian Aboriginal communities. The final essay in the section *Rethinking the Digital Age* by Faye Ginsburg completes the book with a thoughtful and in-depth look at what modern media forms offer to indigenous people, their potential and possible perils.

The editors of this volume have done well to arrange this diverse collection of essays into the logical and readable structure that allows the chapters to resonate with one another. As mentioned above, the editors begin the collection with an introductory essay. The introduction, entitled *Indigeneity and Indigenous Media on the Global Stage*, shows the depth of the authors' understanding of the field. The introduction serves to identify the major thematic material of this area of scholarship and the challenges faced when trying to come to study and define slippery and difficult terms such as 'indigenous media'. The introduction also places the book in a historical perspective because the authors consider the way that media forms have been used historically as a tool to colonise indigenous minds, romanticise indigenous populations and force assimilation, through to more modern and positive perspectives on how indigenous populations can use media to directly address the politics of identity and representation 'by engaging and challenging the dominant political forms at both national and international levels' (p. 5).

In summation, this book is an excellent collection of essays that will be of interest to those who work with, practice or study media production and reception among indigenous communities. My only reservation concerning *Global Indigenous Media* is that it may have included a DVD or even an associated website to provide and host some of the fascinating examples discussed in the book. Such a provision would have perhaps enhanced its communication potential and provided examples, templates and even inspiration for scholars and indigenous practitioners.

PAUL WOLFFRAM

Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand.

© 2009 Paul Wolfram