Meredith McKinney thesis

Formatting difficulties

The following PDF version of Meredith McKinney’s thesis contains print peculiarities caused by problems in electronic conversion from old computer platforms and non-standard fonts.

- Faint dotted lines appear below each line of print. These disappear, however, when a page is printed.

- Some punctuation translates incorrectly, for example:
  
  - Inverted commas:
    ‘…here as “The Tale of Saigyō”, and…’ appears as
    ‘…here as 졸The Tale of Saigyō , and…’

  - Apostrophes:
    ‘…background to the Tale’s development…’ appears as
    ‘…background to the Tale’s development…’
A thesis
submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy of
The Australian National University

A Study of
*Saigyō monogatari*

*VOLUME I*

Meredith McKinney
April 2002
Acknowledgements

My thanks go first to Dr. Royall Tyler, who has helped keep me on track in every way throughout the writing of this thesis.

I also wish to thank the many friends who helped and supported me during the early stages of this study in Japan, and later in Australia. In particular, I am deeply grateful to Inui Chizuko, who guided me through my early reading of the Tale, and who helped me to read and transcribe the original manuscript of Saigyō Hōshi shūka. My gratitude also goes to Professor Sakai Nobuo, who tirelessly answered questions and sought out articles for me after I returned to Australia.

I wish to thank Professor Kuwabara Hiroshi and Tonami Chizuko for generously sparing time to meet and discuss their studies of Saigyō monogatari with me, and for directing me to other studies of the work.

Thanks are also due to Bruce Willoughby, whose publication of my translation of the Shōhōbon version of Saigyō monogatari9 encouraged me to believe that the Tale was worthy of further study.

Finally, I would like to dedicate this study to the memory of Takizawa Yoshitaka, who first introduced me to the delights of reading classical Japanese literature, and who continued to provide the inspiration for my further studies. His untimely death in 1999 occurred as I sat in the manuscript room of Tenri Library, and coincided to the hour with the moving experience of first taking into my hands the precious scroll of Saigyō Hōshi shūka, which unlocked so many secrets for me.

Abstract

Many questions surround the anonymous medieval work known as *Saigyō monogatari* (translated here as *The Tale of Saigyō*, and for simplicity generally referred to as *the Tale*). When was it first created? By whom, and for what intended audience? By what process did it proliferate into the many variant texts that have come down to us? How many other variants may once have existed? What is the relationship between the existing variants, and which can be considered the earliest? Might this be the *original text*, or is it too a reworking of some now lost original text?

In the last forty years, these questions have been taken up by a number of scholars, but to date there has been no full-length study that takes into account the wide range of variant texts and attempts in any systematic way to analyze them in a search for answers. The present study seeks to fill this gap. I compare 11 texts, consisting of representatives from all the main variant categories and including all the texts which are known to be, or which seem to me to be, early forms. Detailed textual comparison can be found in Appendix 1.

Part I introduces the background to the Tale's development, and the variant texts. In Part II, I translate the variant known as Bunmeibon. Many scholars have either claimed or simply assumed that Bunmeibon is a close version of the Tale's original form. I take issue with this belief, and one of the aims of this study is to pursue the question of the relationship of the B text line (of which Bunmeibon is representative) with the A text line, which has generally been regarded as the secondary or *abridged* line, with the purpose of establishing that it is rather the A line that retains traces of the original text and of the impulses that led to the Tale's original formation.

The detailed comments which follow each section of the Bunmeibon translation are intended both to place it within the context of the other ten variants and draw out their possible relationships, and to examine other issues that the section
raises in relation to the Tale as a whole. Most of these issues hinge on the question of how Saigyō is depicted. I trace the volatile shifts that occur between the two poles of Saigyō as poet and Saigyō as religious practitioner, how the Tale does and does not attempt to merge the two, and what forms this double Saigyō image takes as the Tale progresses, both inter- and intra-textually.

This question is fundamentally linked with the above question of relationship between the text lines. The scholars who focus their study on Bunmeibon largely assume that the main focus of the Tale is religious in intent. I hope to show that the Tale's fundamental form in all variants does not reflect this, that much of the religious material found in Bunmeibon and the other B texts is the result of interpolation and reworking, and that it is the early A texts' more literary focus that contains the likely key to the original impulses behind the Tale's formation.

Part III draws together the results of my investigation, and situates the Tale within the wider context of the kyōgen kigo debate.
Note

In my use of Japanese in the text, I have generally followed accepted usage in giving the reading in italicized roman script together with the Japanese script where the word first appears.

In my discussions of textual variations, where questions can often hinge on the choice of Japanese characters, I have chosen to give the Japanese script without transcribing its pronunciation except where clarity seems to require it. I do, however, transcribe the poems.

Texts commonly referred to are sometimes abbreviated as follows:

SKS:  Sankashū
SKKS: Shinkokinshū
HSS:  Hosshinshū
SJS:  Senjūshō
SIZ:  Saigyō isshōgaizōshi
SHS:  Saigyō Hōshi shūka
SSS:  Saigyō Shōninshū
# Table of Contents

**VOLUME I**

## PART I  INTRODUCTORY DISCUSSION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Introduction</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Section 1</strong></td>
<td><strong>Textual Influences</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td><em>Saigyō monogatari</em> as utamonogatari</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Sources for the Tale: literary sources</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Shinkokin wakashū</em></td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Saigyō</em> poetry collections: <em>Sankashū</em></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other <em>Saigyō</em> poetry collections</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The poetic anthology form</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Sources for the Tale: religious sources</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>General</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Hosshinshū</em></td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Hōbutsushū</em></td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Shasekishū</em></td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Wakan rōeishū</em></td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Senjūshō</em></td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Religious sources: conclusion</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>Sources for the Tale: conclusion</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Section 2  Kyōgen kigo

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Kyōgen kigo: theory and development</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Kyōgen kigo in <em>Saigyō</em>’s poetry</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Section 3  Saigyō and his Tale
3.1 Saigyö's life  55
3.2 Saigyö becomes legend  58

**Section 4**  
**The Texts**

4.1 The texts: introduction  70
4.2 Texts and categories  74

**PART II**  
**BUNMEIBON TRANSLATION AND COMMENTS**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introducing Norikiyo (poems 1-3)  91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3 Spring poems (poems 4-6)  97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Fusumae poems (poems 7-16)  100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Honours are showered on him  105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Noriyasu’s death (poems 17-19)  107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>He decides to leave the world (poems 20-23)  111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>He kicks his daughter, and takes the tonsure (poems 24-27)  115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Meditations on transience (poems 28-29)  121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Year’s end and plum blossom poems (poems 30-36)  125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Repentence and setting off  130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>To Yoshino (poem 37)  133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>At Yoshino (poems 38-41)  135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>He sets off on the Kumano route (poems 42-44)  138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Dream at Senri, and to Nachi (poem 45)  142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Into Ömine (poems 46-54)  149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Out from Ömine, 3 poems in the foothills (poems 55-57)  156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Parting from Sönanbö and his companions (poems 58-59)  159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>To Sumiyoshi and back through Naniwa no Tsu (poems 6-62)  163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Return to the capital, and flower-viewing (poems 63-66)  165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>He glimpses his daughter (poem 67)  168</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
21 He and Saijū go begging (poems 68-69) 173
22 Moon poems for the abbot of Ninnaji (poems 70-79) 178
23 Exchange with Ninsei (poems 80-81) 183
24 He sets off for Ise (poem 82) 185
25 Ise’s origins (poem 83) 187
26 2 poems at Ise (poems 84-85) 190
27 Futami (poems 86-87) 192
28 Poems on Ise’s blossoms (poems 88-92) 194
29 Poems of departure (poems 93-94) 197
30 Tenryū crossing (poem 95) 199
31 Saya no Nakayama and beyond (poems 96-99) 204
32 Travelling further east (poems 100-106) 206
33 The hermit of Musashino (poems 107-109) 210
34 Shirakawa barrier gate and beyond (poems 110-113) 218
35 Sanekata’s grave (poems 114-115) 221
36 To Hiraizumi — love poems (poems 116-121) 224
37 He turns towards home (poems 122-129) 228
38 Return to the ruined capital (poems 130-136) 232
39 Visiting people in the capital (poems 137-141) 239
40 He returns to the mountains (poems 142-144) 242
41 Back to the capital — 7 poems (poems 145-151) 244
42 Poetic exchanges in the capital (poems 152-161) 248
43 6 love poems for the newly retired emperor (poems 162-167) 253
44 To Kamo Shrine and away (poems 168-171) 255
45 Poems at Mt. Ogura (poems 172-174) 258
46 Exchange of poems with the courtesan of Eguchi (poems 175-176) 261
47 Poems on Sutoku’s exile (Tennōji) (poems 177-182) 264
48 He visits Sutoku’s remains in Sanuki (poems 183-186) 268
49 Return to the capital and meeting with his daughter  
50 She parts from Renzeidono (poem 187)  
51 Her shukke (poems 188-190)  
52 He retires to Ōhara (poems 191-196)  
53 Toba’s funeral (poems 197-199)  
54 Saigyō contemplates his life (poem 200)  
55 His ōjō  
56 The ōjō of his wife and daughter  
57 He is mourned 

PART III  FINAL DISCUSSION

Section 1  The Texts
1.1 The texts: general conclusions  
1.2 The texts: key textual problems
  Saigyō’s wife  
  The companion theme  
  Evidence of textual development  
1.3 Textual relations 

Section 2  The themes
2.1 The themes: general conclusions  
2.2 The themes: key thematic problems
  Suki  
  Strong/weak in the setsuwa episodes  
  The companion theme  
  Aware 

Section 3  Conclusion
VOLUME 2

Appendix I  Text Comparisons  1

Appendix II  Shōhōbon Translation  88

Appendix III  Transcription of Saigyō Hōshi shūka  134

Bibliography  144