

Giant Planets and Variable Stars in Globular Clusters

David Thomas Frederick Weldrake

A thesis submitted for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

of **The Australian National University**



Research School of Astronomy & Astrophysics

January 2005

For my Parents, who have been there since day one...

Disclaimer

The work described in this thesis is that of the candidate alone, with the exception of the Colour Magnitude Diagram dataset, which was obtained by K.Freeman and M.Doherty.

David T F Weldrake
21st January 2005

Acknowledgments

Firstly, I wish to thank my main thesis supervisor, Prof. Penny Sackett, for her unfailing support and encouragement over the last three years. Despite difficulty, she always found time for continued progress to be made.

I would also like to thank my second supervisor Prof. Ken Freeman; and thesis advisor Dr. Terry Bridges for their many contributions.

My thanks go out to the Mount Stromlo students; their sense of community have made my time at Stromlo very enjoyable. Craig, Brad, Laura, Josh, Paul, Ewan and Erwin: thank you for the great times.

I would like to thank Matt. His companionship over the last three years have made my time in Canberra some of the best of my life.

Finally, I wish to thank my parents, for their continued support, and my late Grandmother; for the little blue refractor.

Abstract

Over the last decade, 135 extrasolar planets have been discovered, the vast majority found by ongoing radial velocity searches. Of the stars sampled in these searches, $\sim 1\%$ have ‘Hot Jupiter’ planets associated with them. Having masses equivalent to Jupiter yet orbital periods of only a few days, this new class of planet is clearly unlike anything in our Solar System.

Hot Jupiters present us with an intriguing prospect. If the orientation of the planetary orbit is close to edge-on, the planet will periodically transit across the face of its star, resulting in a small drop in brightness. This transit phenomenon has been successfully used for planet detection over the last couple of years, allowing determination of the planetary radius and accurate mass estimates when coupled with radial velocity observations.

To aid understanding of the effect stellar environment plays on Hot Jupiter formation and survivability, this thesis presents the results of a wide-field search for transiting Hot Jupiters in the globular cluster 47 Tucanae. This cluster presents many thousands of stars in a moderate field of view and provides the perfect target for a search of this nature. One previous transit search has been made in the central core of 47 Tuc; using the HST for 8.3 continuous days, Gilliland et.al (2000) expected 17 transits yet found none. This null result suggests that either system metallicity or stellar density may be inhibiting Hot Jupiter formation or survivability in the cluster.

This thesis presents a search for transits with a field of view 250 times larger than the HST search and samples the uncrowded outer halo of the cluster (previously unsampled for transits), providing important constraints on the effect of environment on Hot Jupiter formation. If planets are found, then stellar density would seem responsible for the Gilliland et.al (2000) core null result. If no planets are found to a significant level, the survey would provide strong evidence that system metallicity is the dominant factor. Using the ANU 40" (1m) telescope at Siding Spring Observatory, a 30.4 night observing run was executed and photometry was derived via differential imaging. The dataset numbers 109,000 cluster (and field) stars for photometric analysis, of which 22,000 are suitable for the transit search. With a custom-written transit detection algorithm and extensive Monte Carlo simulations to model the dataset, seven planets should be detectable if the occurrence rate of Hot Jupiters is the same in the cluster as in the Solar Neighbourhood.

Despite a detailed search, no transit signatures were identified. This result strongly indicates that the low metallicity of the cluster is the dominant factor inhibiting planet formation in 47 Tuc. Current results in the Solar Neighbourhood show that planet frequency is strongly biased towards stars of high metallicity.

This thesis shows that the metallicity trend is likely a universal phenomenon, not only limited to the immediate Solar Neighbourhood and raises questions of whether planets were much rarer in the earlier Universe.

As a side result of the search, 100 variable stars were identified in the field, 69 of which are new discoveries. Subsequent analysis reveals a strong period segregation among the cluster eclipsing binaries, indicating previously unobserved dynamical effects in the cluster. Distance estimates for both 47 Tuc and the SMC are in agreement with previously published values and an independent identification of the binary period-colour relation was observed. Two binaries seem to have low-luminosity companions worthy of followup and one variable is likely a star in the early phases of planetary nebula formation. All of the results presented in this thesis have been published in three separately refereed research papers.

Contents

Disclaimer	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Abstract	v
List of Figures	xi
List of Tables	xv
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Extrasolar Planet Trends	3
1.2.1 Metallicity	3
1.2.2 Orbital Eccentricity	6
1.3 Methods of Planetary Detection	8
1.3.1 Radial Velocity	8
1.3.2 Transit Photometry	9
1.3.3 Microlensing	18
1.4 Current Transit Searches	19
1.5 Globular Clusters as Laboratories of Planet Formation	21
1.5.1 47 Tucanae	25
1.5.2 The HST 47 Tuc Transit Search	26
1.6 Main Thesis Aims and General Overview	27
2 Observations and Data Reduction	29
2.1 Introduction	29
2.1.1 Dataset Aims	30
2.2 Telescope and Detector	31

2.2.1	Filter and Exposure Times	33
2.3	Expected Results	34
2.4	Observations	35
2.4.1	Dataset Properties	37
2.5	Image Reduction	38
2.6	Cluster Colour Magnitude Diagram	42
2.6.1	Calibration	43
2.6.2	Astrometry	47
2.7	Chapter Summary	49
3	Photometry	51
3.1	Introduction	51
3.2	Photometric Methods	53
3.2.1	Aperture Photometry	53
3.2.2	PSF Photometry	54
3.2.3	Difference Imaging	55
3.3	Application to the Dataset	57
3.3.1	Main Pipeline Steps	59
3.3.2	Resulting Photometric Accuracy	62
3.4	The Variable Star Detection Method	67
3.5	Chapter Summary	69
4	Variable Stars in the 47 Tuc field	73
4.1	Introduction	73
4.2	Catalogue Presentation and Comparisons	76
4.3	Eclipsing Binaries	82
4.3.1	Eclipsing Binary Period Segregation	86
4.3.2	Eclipsing Binary Period-Colour Relation	88
4.3.3	Cluster Membership and 47 Tuc Distance Determination	90
4.4	RR Lyraes	92
4.4.1	RR Lyrae Populations and Densities	93
4.4.2	Small Magellanic Cloud Distance Determination	95

4.5	Long Period Variables	99
4.6	Other Variables	101
4.7	Chapter Summary	103
5	Transit Detection Algorithm	105
5.1	Introduction	105
5.2	General Method for Transit Detection	107
5.2.1	Model Creation and Detection Statistic	108
5.2.2	Application to the 47 Tuc Dataset	111
5.3	Detection Criteria in the Presence of Noise	115
5.3.1	Detection Criteria for the 47 Tuc Dataset	119
5.4	Transit Recoverability and False Detection Rates	120
5.4.1	Applied to the 47 Tuc dataset	121
5.5	Summary and Implications for 47 Tuc	125
6	Hot Jupiter Transit Results	127
6.1	Transit Expectations: Depths and Duration in 47 Tuc	127
6.2	Expected Number of Hot Jupiter Detections	130
6.3	A Null Result	133
6.3.1	Systematic Detections	134
6.4	Interpretation: the Metallicity Connection	136
6.4.1	Generalised Null Significance	138
6.5	Chapter Summary and Result Implications	139
7	Thesis Overview and Future Work	141
7.1	General Thesis Overview	141
7.1.1	Main Thesis Aims	142
7.2	Observations and Photometry	143
7.2.1	Difference Imaging	144
7.2.2	Colour Magnitude Diagram	144
7.3	Detection Algorithms	145
7.3.1	Lomb-Scargle Periodogram	145

7.3.2	Matched Filter Algorithm	145
7.4	Variable Stars	146
7.5	Hot Jupiter Transits	147
7.5.1	A Null Result: The Metallicity Connection	147
7.6	Future Work	148
A Finder Charts		149
REFERENCES		170

List of Figures

1.1	The radial velocity observations of 51-Pegasi	3
1.2	The apparent metallicity dependence on planet formation	4
1.3	A comparison of metallicities between planet-bearing host stars and field dwarfs	5
1.4	The observed extrasolar planet semi-major-axis-eccentricity trend.	7
1.5	A schematic planetary transit	10
1.6	The variation of observed host star colour during a planetary transit	12
1.7	The transit of HD209458b	13
1.8	The transit of OGLE-TR-56b	14
1.9	The transits of OGLE-TR-113b and OGLE-TR-132b	15
1.10	The geometrical transit probability	16
1.11	The microlensing discovery of OGLE 2003-BLG-235	18
1.12	A colour image of 47 Tucanae	22
1.13	The expected planet recoverability in the HST 47 Tuc transit search	26
2.1	The CCD layout of WFI	32
2.2	The location of 47 Tuc in the WFI field	36
2.3	The seeing distribution of the 47 Tuc dataset	37
2.4	The seeing of the dataset vs MJD	38
2.5	A sample bias frame used in the image reduction procedure	40
2.6	An sample twilight flatfield frame	41
2.7	A sample dark frame	42
2.8	Calibration of the Colour-Magnitude Diagram in V	44
2.9	Calibration of the Colour-Magnitude Diagram in $V - I$	45

2.10	CMD calibration with comparison data	46
2.11	The magnitude limits of the CMD dataset	47
2.12	The calibrated CMD dataset for 47 Tucanae	48
2.13	The derived astrometry for the 47 Tuc field	49
3.1	The splitting of the WFI CCDs into sections and subsections for photometric analysis	58
3.2	An example subsection frame	59
3.3	An example template frame	61
3.4	An example subtracted frame	62
3.5	Photometric precision of the four outer CCDs	64
3.6	Photometric precision of the four inner CCDs	65
3.7	An example raw variable star lightcurve	67
3.8	An example power spectrum	69
3.9	The resulting Phase-wrapped variable star	70
4.1	Variable star amplitude comparison	76
4.2	Variable star detection limit	80
4.3	Variable Classification	81
4.4	Phase-wrapped EcB lightcurves	83
4.5	EcB lightcurves continued	84
4.6	EcB lightcurves continued	85
4.7	V78 and V93 lightcurves	86
4.8	Eclipsing binary radial distribution	87
4.9	Period-colour relationship	88
4.10	47 Tuc distance modulus	91
4.11	Phase-wrapped RR-Lyrae lightcurves	92
4.12	RR Lyr lightcurves continued	93
4.13	RR Lyr lightcurves continued	94
4.14	RR Lyr lightcurves continued	95
4.15	RR Lyr period distribution	96
4.16	RR Lyr Period-Luminosity diagram	97

4.17	V86 Blahzko Effect	99
4.18	Phase-wrapped LPV lightcurves	100
4.19	LPV lightcurves continued	101
4.20	Phase-wrapped miscellaneous variable lightcurves	103
5.1	An example model transit with complete temporal coverage	109
5.2	A model transit with the actual dataset temporal coverage	112
5.3	A model transit with dataset photometric quality	113
5.4	A model transit with the correct phase-wrap	114
5.5	A model transit associated with a star of bad photometric quality	115
5.6	A phase-wrapped model transit of bad quality	116
5.7	The detection significance of the algorithm	117
5.8	The general output of the detection algorithm	118
5.9	The transit recoverability for stars with ≤ 0.02 mag rms photometry	122
5.10	The transit recoverability for stars with 0.02–0.04 mag rms photometry	123
5.11	Weighted mean transit recoverability	124
5.12	False detection histogram	125
6.1	The expected depth and duration of planetary transits in 47 Tucanae involving main sequence stars.	129
6.2	The number of expected Hot Jupiter planets detectable in the dataset	132
6.3	The highest significance detection in the transit search	134
6.4	A typical systematic transit detection	135
6.5	The generalised null result, for a variety of Hot Jupiter occurrence rates	138
A.1	Variable Star Finder Charts	150

List of Tables

2.1	CCD central equatorial coordinates	35
4.1	Table of all detected variable stars	78
4.2	Variable stars table continued	79
4.3	Table of EcB	89
4.4	Table of RR Lyraes	98
4.5	Table of LPVs	102
6.1	The parameters of 47 Tuc stars suitable for the transit search . .	128
6.2	The expected number of detectable Hot Jupiter planets in the dataset	133

