Torres Strait Islanders and Autonomy: a Borderline Case

William Stewart Arthur

July 2005

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy of the Australian National University
Declaration

Unless otherwise stated, the ideas and the approaches utilised and explained in this thesis are mine alone.

William Stewart Arthur
Acknowledgments

In wish to thank all of the Torres Strait Islanders I have known and worked with both in Torres Strait and on the Australian mainland. In particular I thank Victor McGrath and Josephine David-Petero of Torres Strait, and Maureen Newie of Cairns all of whom worked with me on earlier research that I have drawn on for this thesis.

Thanks to my supervisor Dr Peter Larmour and to my advisor Professor Nicolas Peterson for their constructive and positive comments on my work.
Abstract

During 1996 and 1997 an Australian parliamentary committee conducted an inquiry into greater autonomy for Torres Strait Islanders, but by 2000 the future of the issue seemed unclear. This thesis explores what the notion of autonomy has meant for Torres Strait and for Torres Strait Islanders in the past, and what it might mean in the future. The thesis uses material from the period before European contact to just after the end of the parliamentary inquiry.

Several analytical tools were utilised to explore the concept of autonomy. Major among these to propose and then analyse the relationship between autonomy’s economic and political components. The thesis also introduces the paired concepts of negative and positive autonomy to provide a counterpoint to ideas of welfare colonialism. Cross cutting these economic and political elements is a consideration of both regional and corporate forms of autonomy. The thesis argues that it is necessary to consider the factors which people can use to legitimise a case for autonomy and these are identified and discussed.

Although previous research and historical material are utilised, unique parts of the thesis include an analysis of: the formal submissions and hearings associated with the parliamentary inquiry; the Torres Strait’s location between Australia and Papua New Guinea; and the Strait’s small-island make-up. In this latter regard, comparisons are made with models and examples of autonomy found in small island states and territories in the Pacific.

The findings include that we must consider two groups of Torres Strait Islanders, those in Torres Strait and those on mainland Australia. Whereas those in the Strait have been able to legitimise a case for a form of autonomy those on the mainland have not. Islanders in the Strait have achieved a degree of regional autonomy; those on the mainland are unable to make a case to be part of this regional autonomy, or to achieve a form of corporate autonomy. The status of Islanders in the Strait is influenced by several factors including
the Strait’s location on the border with Papua New Guinea, the associated Treaty with that country, and the nature and the accessibility of the in-shore fishery. A major finding however is that although Islanders have achieved a degree of regional political autonomy, which may be progressed yet further, they have been unable to embrace non-Indigenous people within this. Their present aspiration for regional political autonomy therefore is limited to one that would apply only to Indigenous-specific affairs. This stands in some conflict with their aspiration for regional economic autonomy which would include their control over the entire regional fishery which they presently share with non-Islanders.

Though Islanders have achieved some degree of political autonomy, they depend on substantial government financial transfers to the region. Despite this they have also achieved some economic autonomy, particularly through being involved in the region’s fishery. Juxtaposing negative and positive autonomy with political and economic autonomy shows that a dependence on government economic transfers does not preclude gains in political autonomy. This can be contrasted with the notion of welfare colonialism.
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Declaration</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 1. Approaching Indigenous autonomy</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approaches to autonomy</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> Negotiation and Legitimation</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> To whom might autonomy apply?</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate autonomy (for a people)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional autonomy (for a place)</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> Regional autonomy applying to Indigenous people</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> Regional autonomy applying to all of the people in a region</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political considerations</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural considerations</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic considerations</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative and positive autonomy</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodology and terminology</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 2. Torres Strait: the setting</strong></td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The physical environment</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> South of the seabed jurisdiction line</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> North of the seabed jurisdiction line</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The territorial situation</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Society</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> The Inner islands</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> The Outer Islands</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> The Cape Islander communities</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> Papua New Guinea</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islander culture</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal political structures</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> The ICC</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> The TSRA</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> The Queensland Government</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> The Commonwealth Government</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> The Torres Strait Protected Zone Joint Authority: a shared political body</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A socioeconomic outline</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Torres Strait Islanders on the Australian Mainland (Mainlanders)</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 3. Models and examples of autonomy</strong></td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colonisation and decolonisation</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy and settler states</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> Canada</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td> New Zealand</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Island states</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Papua New Guinea  57
Nauru  59
Free association  62
Cook Islands  63
Federated States of Micronesia (FSM)  64
The Marshall Islands  66
Island territories  67
Tokelau  68
American Samoa  69
New Caledonia  70
Australia’s external territories  72
Norfolk Island  74
Christmas Island  76
Cocos (Keeling) Islands  78
Conclusions  81
The models  82
The themes  84

Chapter 4. Losing and regaining autonomy?  89
Pre contact  89
1860s, and laissez faire  92
1870 to 1900, missionaries and government  94
1900 to WWII, striking for autonomy  97
1950s to 1960s, post-war migration  103
1970s and the border issue  105
1980s, a new economy?  108
The governments  118
Conclusions  123
Political autonomy?  123
Cultural autonomy?  124
Economic autonomy?  125

Chapter 5. Making the region: culture, the border and the Treaty  128
Regions and autonomy  128
Connecting to the region  129
Demography  129
Culture  130
Christianity  133
Islands and archipelagoes  134
Borders and borderlanders  135
The Torres Strait Treaty  136
Free movement provisions  139
Conclusions  146

Chapter 6. The Inquiry: Torres Strait  148
Political autonomy: Indigenous views  149
Autonomy as sovereign independence  149
Autonomy as self-government  153
Competing units in political regional autonomy  155
Island versus region  155
Sub-region versus region  157
Culture in regional autonomy  159
Accommodating other Indigenous groups  
The Kaurareg  
Aboriginal people on the ‘Cape’  
The PNG element  
Inter-Indigenous corporate autonomy: Aborigines  
Cultural legitimisers  
Political autonomy: Government views  
The Commonwealth Government  
The Queensland Government  
Mainstream local government  
Economic autonomy  
Control of funding  
Control of resources  
Autonomy and socioeconomic status  
Conclusions  
Political autonomy  
Economic autonomy  

Chapter 7. The Inquiry: the mainland  
The mainland policy environment  
Regional autonomy  
A say in Torres Strait  
Fiscal access  
The political and cultural case  
The view from the homelands  
Migrant status?  
Corporate autonomy  
Autonomy from ATSIC  
The political or economic case?  
Autonomy within ATSIC?  
The cultural case  
The demographic case  
The rights case  
Autonomy in non-ATSIC Indigenous affairs  
The ‘other’ view  
Economic autonomy  
Political and economic autonomy  
Conclusions  

Chapter 8. Conclusions  
Homelanders  
Political autonomy  
Economic autonomy  
Mainlanders  
Legitimisers  
Negative and positive autonomy  

Appendices  
A: Glossary of terms and abbreviations used  
B: A note on the population data for Torres Strait Islanders  
C: Some ancestral origins  
D: The Inquiry structure
References cited 246

Tables

Table 1.1 Analytical framework 21
Table 2.1 Population of Torres Strait, 1996 30
Table 2.2 Estimated value of commercial fisheries, 1990 and 1995 38
Table 3.1 Islands in the Pacific and Indian Oceans, 2004 53
Table 3.2 Examples of governing structures, Pacific island states, 2002 57
Table 3.3 Examples of governing structures, Pacific islands in free association, 2004 62
Table 3.4 Examples of governing structures of island territories, 2003 67
Table 4.1 The Torres Strait Light Infantry (TSLI), 1945 102
Table 4.2 Islander catches by island, 1989 (tonnes) 113
Table 4.3 Value of fisheries, and involvement, late 1980s 120
Table 5.1 Languages spoken, 1994 131
Table 5.2 Cultural attachments, 1994 132
Table 5.3 Attended cultural activities in last 12 months, 1994 132
Table 5.4 The format of the JAC 139
Table 6.1 Example of proposed sub-regions 157
Table 6.2 Indicative major Commonwealth and Queensland Government funding to Torres Strait, 1999 (millions of dollars) 185
Table 6.3 Occupational status of those employed, Torres Strait, 1996 186
Table 6.4 Educational status, Torres Strait, 1996 186
Table 6.5 TSRA employment profile, 2002-03 187
Table 6.6 Apparent prioritisation of fisheries under the Treaty 187
Table 6.7 Islander representation in fisheries management, 2003 188
Table 6.8 Estimated value of fisheries and percentage of catch, 1995 191
Table 6.9 Indicators of socioeconomic status, Torres Strait, 1996 192
Table 6.10 Potential for expansion of the fishery 195
Table 7.1 Distribution of Torres Strait Islanders, outside Torres Strait, 1996 202
Table 7.2 Cultural characteristics of Islanders, Queensland, 1994 205
Table 7.3 Approaches by Mainlander organisations for funding, 1997 220
Table 7.4 Socioeconomic status on the mainland, 1996 221
Table 7.5 Islander socioeconomic status: Torres Strait, mainland Australia, 1996 221
Table 7.6 Mainlander parity with non-Indigenous people, 1996 222
Table A.1 Distribution of Torres Strait Islanders in States/Territories of Australia, 1996 242
Table C.1 Part-ancestral origins of a selection of Torres Strait island populations 244

Maps facing page
Map 1.1 The Indigenous population by ATSIC region, 1996 10
Map 1.2 ATSIC program resources, dollars per capita by ATSIC region, 1999-2000 12
Map 2.1 Torres Strait region 25
Map 2.2 Lines of jurisdiction agreed under the Torres Strait Treaty 27
Map 2.3 The TSRA (Torres Strait) region 35
Map 4.1 Fisheries distribution 112
Map 6.1 Approximate area under native title application, 2001 190
Map 7.1 Distribution of Islander population, 2001 202
Map 7.2 Islanders and Aboriginal people by ATSIC regions, 1996 215

Figures
Fig. 4.1 Shell boats in Torres Strait, 1840s–1970s 96
Fig. 4.2 Model lugger, Thursday Island, late 1990s 104
Fig. 4.3 Distribution of Torres Strait Islanders, 1880-1996 104
Fig. 5.1 The Torres Strait Islander flag 132
Fig. 5.2 Shirt with Dari design, 2002 133
Fig. 5.3 St. Pauls church, Moa Island, 1990 133
Fig. 5.4 Outside Saibai Island church, 1990 133
Fig. 5.5 PNG canoe visiting a northern island for trade, 1990 141
Fig. 5.6 PNG residents receiving Australian citizenship on a northern island, 1990 143
Fig. 5.7 Quarantine card installed in seat-pockets of flights between Torres Strait and mainland 146
Fig. 6.1 An example of an island banner, c. 1990s 156
Fig. 6.2 A window decoration on Thursday Island embracing unity and diversity, 2002 156
Fig. 7.1 The ninth national workshop banner 204