1	Submission to Nature Ecology and Evolution as a Comment
2	
3	Recent Australian wildfires made worse by logging and associated forest management
4	
5	David Lindenmayer <sup>1*</sup> , Robert M. Kooyman <sup>2</sup> , Chris Taylor <sup>1</sup> , Michelle Ward <sup>3</sup> , and James E.M
6	Watson <sup>3,4</sup>
7	
8	<sup>1</sup> Fenner School of Environment and Society, The Australian National University, Canberra,
9	Australian Capital Territory 2601, Australia
10	<sup>2</sup> Department of Biological Sciences, Macquarie University, Sydney, New South Wales 2109,
11	Australia
12	<sup>3</sup> Centre for Biodiversity and Conservation Science, School of Biological Sciences, The
13	University of Queensland, Brisbane, Queensland 4072, Australia
14	<sup>4</sup> Wildlife Conservation Society, Global Conservation Program, 2300 Southern Boulevard,
15	Bronx, New York, NY 10460, U.S.A.
16	
17	

The recent fires in southern Australia were unprecedented in scale and severity and 20 21 much commentary has rightly focused on the role climate change played in 22 exacerbating the risk of fire. Here, we argue policy makers also must recognize that 23 historical and contemporary logging of Australian forests also had a profound effect on 24 these fire's severity, fire frequency, and other key aspects of fire regimes. 25 More than 5.8 million hectares of Australia burned between September 2019 and January 26 2020<sup>1</sup>, with several million hectares more burned in subsequent months. Discussions among 27 land managers, politicians, policy makers, and scientists have now focused on the origins and 28 behavior of the wildfires to try to ensure they do not happen again. Not unreasonably, much of this discussion has centered around the role of human-forced climate change<sup>2</sup>, and the 29 30 associated prolonged drought and extreme weather conditions as major drivers of these recent 31 conflagrations. It is clear that discussions about links between climate change and fire are warranted and should galvanize action to halt climate change<sup>3</sup>. 32 33 However, the contribution of land management, and especially forestry practices, to wildfires 34 has often been neglected in these discussions. This is an oversight given that land 35 management is well within the control of Australians (unlike global action to abate climate 36 change) and that there is an extensive body of science available to decision-makers. Some 37 parts of the forest industry are now calling for increased logging within both the burnt and unburnt forest estates<sup>4</sup>. Here we provide a summary of recent scientific evidence of the 38 39 impacts of forestry on these fires and discuss strategies to limit future catastrophic conflagrations. 40

\_

## 41 Forest logging and fire

42 Since European settlement, Australian forests have had a long history of land use change. 43 While the full extent of forest loss and degradation is unknown, some estimates show that at 44 least 30% of eucalypt open forest and 30% of rainforest have been lost due to logging and agriculture<sup>5</sup>. Most of this loss occurred in the latter half of the 19<sup>th</sup> century. More recently, 45 46 industry reports show that between 1996 and 2018, 161 million cubic meters of native forest 47 was logged by the forestry industry across Australia<sup>6</sup>. Logging operations have had severe 48 impacts on biodiversity; 181 forest-dependent species listed as threatened with extinction are directly affected by loss of habitat specifically due to logging<sup>7</sup>. However, this figure is an 49 50 underestimate, due to the complexities of listing endangered species in Australia<sup>8</sup>. In addition 51 to the direct impacts of tree felling on species at logging sites, activities associated with 52 production like road construction further fragment already disturbed landscapes – with corresponding negative impacts on biodiversity<sup>9</sup>. For example, in the damp forest ecological 53 vegetation class in the Central Highlands of Victoria, the average distance from logged wood 54 55 production forests to undisturbed forest is just 71 m relative to 1700 m in protected areas of the same vegetation type<sup>10</sup>. This difference will be further magnified under plans for 56 continued logging over the coming 5-10 years<sup>10</sup>. 57

Beyond the direct and immediate impacts on biodiversity of disturbance and proximity to disturbed forest, there is compelling evidence that Australia's historical and contemporary logging regimes have made many Australian forests more fire prone and contributed to increased fire severity<sup>11</sup> and flammability<sup>12</sup>. At a site level, logging and other silvicultural treatments leave large amounts of debris (up to 450 tonnes per hectare) (Fig. 1)<sup>13</sup>. This addition of fuel close to ground level increases the severity of subsequent wildfire<sup>11</sup>. Other major logging-generated changes in forest composition and stand architecture, such as the

65 creation of extensive areas of young even-aged stands characterized by densely stocked trees 66 of short stature and a paucity of mesic elements such as tree ferns and rainforest life forms, can influence fire dynamics<sup>11</sup> and patterns of spatial contagion in wildfires<sup>14</sup>. For example, 67 68 fires spreading from logged areas have burnt into adjacent old growth eucalypts and rainforests dominated by ancient Gondwanan lineages<sup>15</sup>. The former have either never burned 69 70 since establishment or are subject to extremely rare fires (e.g. every 300-500 years), and the 71 latter have never burned, with fire only at the rainforest edges at intervals of ~ 1000 years<sup>16</sup>. 72 Extensive areas of logged and regenerated forest have burned repeatedly in the past 25 years 73 (Fig. 2). Of the ~1 million hectares burnt in the 2019-2020 bushfire season across East 74 Gippsland (in north-east Victoria), ~ 36% had burnt previously at least once since 1995.

75 Current understanding of the ecology of forests such as those dominated by the damp

recological vegetation classes suggests they should burn no more than once every 50-150

<sup>77</sup> years<sup>17</sup>. Repeated fires in these and other ecosystems can lead to tree species failing to

resprout<sup>18</sup>, seed production and germination failure, and the death of young trees, triggering

79 potential ecosystem  $collapse^{14}$ .

## 80 Appropriate land management response post-fire is now needed

It is important that policy makers acknowledge that climate change effects fire weather and is making fires worse across Australia<sup>3</sup>. Policy makers also must recognize that land management such as logging operations also have profound effects on fire severity, fire frequency, and other key aspects of fire regimes. Efforts to prepare for wildfires therefore require a response not only to climate change but also to historic and current land management.

87 There are solutions to reduce the risks of further catastrophic fire seasons in the future. First 88 is the removal of logging from areas where it adds significantly to fuel loads and creates 89 forest structures that increase fire severity and risks to human safety. In particular, logging of 90 moist forests must not occur near human settlements. Second, it is essential that landscape 91 scale impacts of forest fragmentation are reduced; this demands proactive restoration of some 92 previously logged forests to build resilience to future fire events. There is also a need to 93 protect remaining undisturbed or lightly disturbed areas as these are important fire refugia for many species, including arboreal marsupials and birds<sup>19</sup>. In the event of wildfires, land 94 managers must avoid practices such as post-fire ("salvage") logging that can impair recovery 95 and make regenerating forests more prone to further fires<sup>20</sup>. Finally, there is a need to 96 97 restructure forest industries so that wood production is focused on exotic tree plantations. 98 This is important to maintain employment in the forestry sector and at the same time, limit 99 impacts on the native forest estate, including through a reduction in logging-generated fire 100 proneness in forest ecosystems.

101 Now is the time for policy makers to recognize and account for the critical values of intact 102 native forests because they are where fire severity is lowest, species persistence during fires is greatest, and rates of recovery after fires are highest<sup>20</sup>. Forests not degraded by logging, 103 104 together with the biota they support, are more resilient than degraded forests to pre-fire 105 conditions such as higher temperatures and short-term climatic anomalies (for example, droughts)<sup>21</sup>. Intact forests are critical not just in terms of fire resilience, but also in their role 106 107 in mitigating climate change, maintaining hydrological cycles and other key ecosystem 108 processes, and providing habitat for a wide range of flora and fauna<sup>9</sup>. Australians must 109 therefore work to de-fragment the forest estate through policies that facilitate the expansion 110 of old growth forest, as these actions can help reduce the patterns of extensive spatial 111 contagion of mega-fires.

## 112 **References**

113	1	Boer, M.M., Resco de Dios, V. & Bradstock, R.A. Nat. Clim. Change 10, 171-172
114		(2020).
115	2	Phillips, N. & Nogrady, B. Nature 577, 610-612 (2020).
116	3	Jones, M.W. et al. Climate change increases risk of wildfires. ScienceBrief Review,
117		2020).
118	4	AFPA. Using fire and machines to better fire-proof our country towns. (Australian
119		Forest Products Association, 2020).
120	5	Commonwealth of Australia. Australian Native Vegetation Assessment 2001.
121		(Commonwealth of Australia, Canberra, 2001).
122	6	Department of Agriculture and Water Resources. Australia's State of the Forests
123		Report 2018. (Commonwealth of Australia, Canberra, Australia, 2018).
124	7	Kearney, S.G. et al. Pac. Conserv. Biol. 14, 231-244 (2019).
125	8	Walsh, J.C. et al. Oryx 47, 134-143 (2012).
126	9	Watson, J.E. et al. Nature Ecol. Evol. 2, 599-610 (2018).
127	10	Taylor, C. & Lindenmayer, D.B. Austral Ecol., https://doi.org/10.1111/aec.12863
128		(2020).
129	11	Taylor, C., McCarthy, M.A. & Lindenmayer, D.B. Conserv. Lett. 7, 355-370 (2014).
130	12	Zylstra, P. Austral Ecol. 43, 578-591 (2018).

131	13	Raison, J. & Squire, R.O. Forest management in Australia: Implications for carbon	
132		budgets. (Australian Greenhouse Office, Canberra, 2008).	
133	14	Lindenmayer, D.B. et al. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 108, 15887-15891 (2011).	
134	15	Kooyman, R.M. et al. Am. J. Bot. 101, 2121-2135 (2014).	
135	16	Turner, J. Aust. Forestry 47, 79-83 (1984).	
136	17	McCarthy, M.A., Gill, A.M. & Lindenmayer, D.B. Forest Ecol. Manage. 124, 193-	
137		203 (1999).	
138	18	Fairman, T.A., Bennett, L.T. & Nitschke, C.R. J. Environ. Manage. 231, 59-65	
139		(2019).	
140	19	Berry, L. et al. Aust. Mammal. 37, 39-45 (2015).	
141	20	Lindenmayer, D.B. et al. Forest Ecol. Manage. 454, 117656 (2019).	
142	21	Betts, M.G. et al. Divers. Distrib. 24, 439-447 (2017).	
143	Author Contributions		
144	All authors contributed equally.		
145	Competing Interests		
146	There are no competing interests to declare.		
147			
148	Figur	e legends	

**Figure 1. Fires within logged areas of native forests.** South-east Australian fires (red)

- 150 within native forests (green) and previously logged areas ('logging areas' (black). The first
- two images (left to right) are of the aftermath of logging in East Gippsland, the third image is
- 152 of the debris remaining after logging in eucalypt forests in central Victoria, the fourth image
- 153 is of burned Brush Box (Lophostemon confertus) within the world heritage Gondwana
- 154 Rainforest (an ecosystem that has evolved in the complete absence of fire). Logging areas are
- derived from publicly available data from Forestry Corporation of NSW and VicForests, both
- 156 of which underestimate the full extent of historic logging.
- 157 Figure 2. Fires within East Gippsland. Analyses of wildfires in East Gippsland, north-
- eastern Victoria between 1995 -2020 showing that of the ~1 million hectares burnt in the
- 2019-2020 bushfire season across East Gippsland (in north-east Victoria), ~ 36% had burnt
  previously at least once since 1995.
- 161
- 162

163

164





## Bushfires 2019-2020 Logging areas Native forests

