EXEGESIS

Photographs and place

James STEELE

February 2014

Exegesis documenting practice-led research for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy of The Australian National University
STATEMENT OF ORIGINAL WORK

The work contained in this exegesis has not been previously submitted for assessment at any other higher education institution. It contains no material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made.

James STEELE
7 February 2014
Acknowledgments

First and foremost, credit must be given to my friend and colleague Helene Walsh, who first suggested that I study for my PhD with Photography and Media Arts in the School of Art at the Australian National University.

My supervisors Denise Ferris and Martyn Jolly, my advisor Tim Brook, and graduate coordinators Patsy Hely, Nigel Lendon and Helen Ennis, have all contributed positively and cheerfully along the way. My thanks to them all for giving me the opportunity to be engaged in what has been a rewarding, challenging and enriching journey.

Robert Fitzgerald has also been a great friend, listener, advisor, contributor and supporter all through. Danny Munnerley, Matt Bacon, Michelle McAuley and Mel Munnerley have also listened, shared and otherwise contributed to my work. Paul Krix helped me realise a significant work, Flickring Earth, and Ruth Mirams’ encouragement for the work was much appreciated. Matthew Gordon-Clark from State Records of South Australia, and Françoise Barr from the Northern Territory Archives Service helped me to find some helpful, original sources that revealed some of the tales that I explored.

I also acknowledge the contributions from my colleagues in the Graduate Program in the School of Art, particularly Lee Grant, Ursula Fredrick, Kevin Miller, Robert Guth, Clem Baker Finch, Maya Haviland, Kate Murphy, Lisa Clunie, Carolyn Young, Kaoru Alfonso, and Brian Jones. Emilka Radlinka and her Skype reading group were also a great help and support. Ursula Fredrick’s tenacity and perseverance in converting my 20/20/20 presentation into a refereed journal article in the Journal of Australian Studies, co-written with Martyn Jolly, deserves special mention, and my sincerest appreciation. Lizzy Standley’s help realizing my ideas for an exhibition exploring Foelsche’s Capture of Ah Kim in a 3D model was also invaluable and for which I am most grateful.

Judith and David MacDougall, Graham Scully, Fiona Hooton, Tim Smith, Denis Goodrum, Kylie Message, Janet Smith and Philip Jones all deserve a mention and thanks for their support. Thanks also to Stephen Brand for suffering the forced marches to isolated places and freezing nights camping in the Kosciuszko National Park, and to my family, Patricia, Alice and Grace, for their support and encouragement.
# Table of contents

Acknowledgments .......................................................................................................................... 3  
Table of contents ............................................................................................................................ 4  
List of illustrations ............................................................................................................................ 6  
Abstract ........................................................................................................................................ 7  
Introduction ..................................................................................................................................... 8  
Place .............................................................................................................................................. 9  
  Geographic Location ....................................................................................................................... 9  
  Material Form ................................................................................................................................. 9  
  Investment With Meaning and Value .............................................................................................. 10  
Place and photography ..................................................................................................................... 10  
  Geographic location and photographs ............................................................................................ 11  
  Material form and photographs ..................................................................................................... 12  
  Meaning and value and photographic representation ..................................................................... 12  
  Metadata ....................................................................................................................................... 13  
Rephotography ................................................................................................................................ 15  
Works ............................................................................................................................................ 18  
  Warrumbungle – Changes ................................................................................................................ 18  
  Orroral Valley – Embedded ............................................................................................................ 19  
  Lake Mackenzie – ‘Sublime’ panorama ......................................................................................... 20  
Kosciuszko Hut Geospatial pilot project – Geographic location ...................................................... 21  
Kosciuszko Huts – Rephotography ................................................................................................... 22  
  Coolamine Homestead ................................................................................................................... 24  
  Whites River Hut ............................................................................................................................ 26  
  Pockets Hut .................................................................................................................................. 28  
  Cascade Hut ................................................................................................................................... 30  
  Old Currango ............................................................................................................................... 32  
Lake Mungo – Collective impressions ............................................................................................... 33  
Flickring Earth – An overwhelming flood of images ......................................................................... 34  
Cronulla Street – Past and present .................................................................................................... 39  
Conclusion ....................................................................................................................................... 49  
Bibliography .................................................................................................................................... 51  
APPENDIX – Cronulla Street exhibition .......................................................................................... 1  
  The Photographs ........................................................................................................................... 2  
  The Palimpsests ............................................................................................................................. 2  
  List of Photographs ....................................................................................................................... 3
List of Palimpsests

Photographs

Palimpsests
List of illustrations

Fig. 1. Screenshot of Warrumbungle. Composite work combining Google Earth, Panoramio photographs (own and public), topographic map and GPS track. James Steele 2007-2012 ................................................................. 18

Fig. 2. Orroral Valley Embedded. Screenshot of Google Earth construction. James Steele 2009 ................................................................. 20

Fig. 3. Lake Mackenzie. Composite panorama constructed from seven individual photographs. 19 April 2010/12 May 2010. James Steele 2010 ................................................................. 21

Fig. 4. Portrait of the Southwell Family at Coolamine Homestead, Snowy Mountains, ca. 1909. Anon. (nla.pic-vn4278494) ................................. 24

Fig. 5. Coolamine Homestead. James Steele 2009 ................................................................. 24

Fig. 6. Whites River Hut and slopes leading up to the Rolling Grounds, ca. 1930s. George Day (nla.pic-vn4235951) ................................................................. 26

Fig. 7. Whites River Hut. James Steele 2009 ................................................................. 26

Fig. 8. Pockets Hut – work party, reconstruction. Klaus Hueneke 1984 (nla.pic-vn3094744) ................................................................. 28

Fig. 9. Pockets Hut. James Steele 2010 ................................................................. 28

Fig. 10. Cascade hut in the 1940s, during a tour of inspection of the high country. Anon. 194- (nla.pic-vn3092623) ................................................................. 30

Fig. 11. Cascade Hut. James Steele 2010 ................................................................. 30

Fig. 12. Old Currango on the Currangorambla Plain in 1978. Klaus Hueneke 1978 (nla.pic-vn3092669) ................................................................. 32

Fig. 13. Old Currango. James Steele 2010 ................................................................. 32

Fig. 14. Lake Mungo from Red Top Lookout, Mungo National Park, James Steele 2009 ................................................................. 33

Fig. 15. Concept for Flickring Earth running on the video wall at INSPIRE. James Steele 2012 ................................................................. 38

Fig. 16. Flickring Earth on the video wall at INSPIRE, September 2012. James Steele 2012 ................................................................. 39

Fig. 17. Cronulla, showing assumed locations of original images (orange markers) and 2011 GPS track (blue line). Screen capture. Google Earth 2011 ................................................................. 41

Fig. 18. Cronulla Street Exhibition September 2012. James Steele 2012 ................................................................. 43

Fig. 19. Cronulla Street Exhibition. Grace Steele 2012 ................................................................. 44
Abstract

My research interest for my studio practice is how photographs document and represent place. Place helps to define who we are. Place informs us about our past and about the foundations of our community and our culture. Whether a viewer has been there or not, photographs help to define place because they provide evidence for what is there, what was there, and what happened there over time. A photograph documents place by providing a trace of what was in front of the lens when the shutter was opened. Like any document, to understand what it represents a photograph has to be interpreted.

In my creative practice I have used photography to explore how to document and represent places that resonate with me. Through a series of projects covering, among others, bushwalking in wilderness areas, conservation of huts in the Kosciuszko National Park, and rephotography of a suburban Sydney shopping strip, I have investigated how geographic location can be reliably associated with photographs; how photographs document and represent the material form of place; and considered how people interpret the meaning and value of place through photographs.

The approaches explored here provide insights into how photographs, on their own, combined with other photographs, and associated with other information, can be used to document and represent important places – from the past, now and in the future – in our community for ourselves and for future generations. By codifying and sharing evidence of place we can support its conservation and management in ways that will benefit the whole community.
Introduction

In the lead up to the 1983 Australian Federal election, an advertisement appeared in The Sydney Morning Herald, featuring a photograph taken by Peter Dombrovskis on the Franklin River in Tasmania. The photograph – Morning Mist, Rock Island Bend – and the accompanying title – “Could you vote for a party that will destroy this?” – are credited by some with winning the election for the Labor Party. Rock Island Bend is a beautiful image of a unique place that most viewers will never visit, but it stands as a metaphor for wild and mysterious places anywhere that need to be conserved for our own and future generations.

In my own work Warrumbungle I documented a walk in a national park that has since been devastated by fire. Combined with a topographic map and the terrain model that form part of the work, the photographs evoke the meaning and value of wild places and the natural environment through the viewer’s aesthetic response to what they see in them.

A series of TRI-X negatives, taken for an unfinished assignment in 1973 to develop a plan to turn a suburban street into a pedestrian mall and lying undiscovered for almost 40 years, provided the basis for a rephotography project realised in my exhibition, Cronulla Street, Summer. 1973-2011. The exhibition shows how photographs can document and represent the dynamic nature of Australian suburban community life over the intervening years.

These three examples illustrate the objective of my creative practice to explore how photographs document and represent place by highlighting geographic location, material form, and how photographs can convey meaning and represent the values of wild places, cultural heritage, and the conservation of our environment.

Place

Thomas Gieryn’s three “necessary and sufficient features” for place are geographic location; physicality or material form; and investment with meaning and value or meaningfulness. Place is a space, a physical environment defined by its location, position, or name, and the resonances of the events and activities that happened there over time.

Place is an interpretation: it will vary depending on who defines it. Being there – actually or virtually – is only one factor that can help someone understand place. Resonance may or may not be obvious to people physically there or looking at a photograph of the place. Material objects like buildings, monuments, or interpretive signs; or the physical environment itself – the sights, the smells, and the sounds – can suggest place. Evidence of past or present human activity adds to an understanding of place, as do guides or books that enrich knowledge and understanding. Resonance is based on prior knowledge, emotions, feelings, and cultural understanding. These are the things that viewers bring to their relationship with a photograph that give the photograph its ability to communicate the meaning and value of the place it represents.

Geographic Location

Geographic location is expressed as a point or an area in space defined by its coordinates or its boundaries. It is said to exist somewhere. It is otherwise without form and has the potential to contain objects, people and activities. Space is where place happens. A location within space can be defined by a set of coordinates – -35.0553°, 151.1515° – or defined as a region. It can have a name – “Cronulla, New South Wales” – that designates its geographic location.

Material Form

As well as being a point or an area in space, place must have material form: a natural environment like the bush, the beach, mountains or the sea with trees and sand and rocks and water; or a built environment like a suburban shopping strip with shops, cafés, apartment buildings and roads. “[Place] is a compilation of things or objects at some particular spot in the universe.”

---

5 Ibid., 465.
Investment With Meaning and Value

A geographic location is not a place without investment with meaning and value. Yi-Fu Tuan says of space that “[w]hat begins as undifferentiated space becomes place as we get to know it better and endow it with value.”\(^6\) Gieryn says that:

> Places are doubly constructed: most are built or in some way physically carved out. They are also interpreted, narrated, perceived, felt, understood, and imagined.\(^7\) A spot in the universe, with a gathering of physical stuff there, becomes a place only when it ensconces history or utopia, danger or security, identity or memory. In spite of its relatively enduring and imposing materiality, the meaning or value of the same place is labile – flexible in the hands of different people or cultures, malleable over time, and inevitably contested.\(^8\)

**Place and photography**

A photograph can provide evidence of Gieryn’s three features of place. Geographic location can be identified through the viewer’s knowledge of a place, or through metadata or algorithmic techniques like Google Image Search that can be used to identify the name or the coordinates of the subject of a photograph. Material form is reflected in the photograph itself as an indexical trace of the physicality of the place. Investment with meaning and value is established through what people say about the photograph and by the responses viewers have to the photograph when they see it. Photographs offer a mechanism for documenting and representing place by providing viewers with a trace of the enduring features at a physical location, or by offering an interpretation of an event or an activity or reflections of people or transient objects that were once there, but are now finished or dead or gone. Photographs can be used to document the dynamic nature of place, by providing viewers with images from different times and of different events that help them to understand the resonances that invest a place with meaning and value.

In his 1996 essay *Truth and Landscape*, Robert Adams says that:

> Landscape pictures can offer us... three verities – geography, autobiography, and metaphor. Geography is, if taken alone, sometimes boring, autobiography is frequently trivial, and metaphor can be dubious. But taken together, as in the best work of people like Alfred Stieglitz and Edward Weston, the three kings of information strengthen each other and reinforce what we all work to keep intact – an affection for life.\(^9\)

---


\(^8\) Gieryn, “A Space for Place in Sociology,” 465.

Adams' geography is a combination of geographic location and material form that describes the layout or physical features of a particular space in the world - where it is and what is there. Photographs document the material form of these things: the viewer has to interpret what they represent, or what they mean, based on the viewer's own stories - their autobiography. The photographer provides the metaphor - a trace of the real that is symbolic of what the subject represents to the photographer as they interpret it through their photography.

**Geographic location and photographs**

Determining location through digital location metadata first drew me to explore location and photographs. When the United States Government created the Global Positioning System (GPS) in 1983, only the US military could access it accurately because of limitations placed on the system to prevent its effective use for other purposes. In 2000 this 'selective availability' was turned off: now anyone with a small handheld device could use the system to determine their location with accuracy, which opened up a whole range of geographic location-based applications for people and corporations around the world. Soon drivers, emergency services workers, tourists, hikers, and photographers could rely on cheap, handheld GPS devices to provide them with accurate data on where they were, and where they had been at a specific time. Identifying geographic location and incorporating the information in a digital photograph became a straightforward technical process. Since digital cameras record the time a photograph was created, computer programs could now match the location data from a track log saved in a GPS device - carried with the camera - with the time the digital photograph was made, which allows the program to determine where the camera was when the photograph was taken. The program can then merge the location information as metadata into the digital photograph's electronic file. Other programs and web services can read this location data and display the photograph on a computer screen combined with maps, or arranged in three-dimensional space relative to other photographs taken at the same place or nearby. These methods of display provide viewers with new perspectives that dissolve the traditional frame around a photograph and allow them to experience a place unfettered from the restrictions of time and the boundaries of the single image.

---

Just fourteen years after selective availability was turned off, most smartphones contain digital cameras and GPS receivers that automatically ‘geotag’ photographs taken with them. These geotagged photographs can be uploaded onto social networking sites like Flickr and Panoramio and shared in an instant with the world’s online community.12

Material form and photographs
While fakery and deception go back to photography’s early years and continue today with manipulation made even simpler by the digitalisation of photography,13 viewers generally accept that what they see in a photograph did exist in front of the lens when it was made. According to Roland Barthes, “in Photography I can never deny that the thing has been there”.14 This belief in the indexical relationship between the photograph and the reality it seeks to portray, as proposed by many authors since photography’s early years, allows photographs to be accepted as evidence of the material form of a place, showing what was physically there at the time of exposure.15

Meaning and value and photographic representation
A single photograph like Rock Island Bend can be a powerful witness to the meaning and social value of place. Discussing Space and Representation, Liz Wells says that,

The pictorial offers more than graphic representation. It articulates subjective memory and cultural currencies not only in relation to literal readings of images but also in terms of emotive effects. ... the geographic imaginary conjured up is complex.16

When looking at Peter Dombrovskis’ photograph Rock Island Bend in the context where the existence of the place is threatened by a state government proposing to flood it behind a dam, we are drawn to consider the value of wilderness areas generally, their importance in our community, and our power as individuals to have an impact on the preservation of the place through our democratic right to vote. Encountering the photograph in a newspaper advertisement during an election campaign where conservation issues were

14 Roland Barthes, Camera Lucida: Reflections on Photography (Hill and Wang, 1982), 76.
15 See my dissertation for a more detailed discussion of truth and photography: James Steele, “Photography and Our Connection with Our Culture, History and Identity (PhD Dissertation)” (Australian National University, 2014).
16 Wells, Land Matters, 4.
being hotly debated orients the viewer to see what was to them an unknown, hidden and undiscovered place represented within a wider socio-political context where conservation values are being challenged by development pressures.

In *The Poetics of Space*, Gaston Bachelard says his investigations "... seek to determine the human value of the sorts of space that may be grasped, that may be defended against adverse forces, the space we love." Through photography, I have investigated how the meaning and value invested in place can be communicated to viewers. My works express my love of places that I have experienced and show how others can use geographic location, material form, and investment with meaning and value as features to support their own documentation and representation of places that are significant to them.

Bachelard calls love of place 'topophilia'. According to Wells, Bachelard explores topophilia "in relation to human desire for the comfort of familiar spaces, wondering at the subjective processes whereby certain spaces – or images of such spaces – come to reassure." My photographs of wilderness areas that I have experienced first-hand reassure me that these places exist and are protected for me and for others to enjoy now and in the future. Photographs from Cronulla in 1973 give me comfort in seeing images that represent familiar places from my past, and reassure my feelings of identity.

**Metadata**

Metadata – data about data – is key to associating geographic location with a photograph, and can be necessary in communicating to the viewer the meaning and value of what it represents. Metadata is information about the photograph that can come from words written about it and attached to or surrounding the physical print in some way, or digital data embedded in the file of a digital photograph – like the time and date the photograph was taken, or where the camera was at the time. A label, caption, description, or conversation about the image gives the viewer some meta context or narrative that helps to explain the image to them – to help them understand better the meaning of a single frame and the value of the subject it represents. "Will not the caption become the most important component of the shot?" asks Benjamin in 1931. Edwards explains that "[o]utside the museum, we rarely encounter photographs as a pure, or self-contained, form. Invariably, in actual use photographic images are combined with language and some...

---

18 Ibid.
other technology.”\textsuperscript{21} As the image is framed by the limits of the print or screen, so its meaning is also framed by the words and other metadata surrounding it.

Metadata can be used to gather similar photographs together: text searches can gather photographs that use the same words to describe them, or photographs taken at the same time could be matched by using time and date information embedded in digital photographs. Landscape photographer John Pfahl says:

\begin{quote}
Some people think that the camera steals their soul. Places, I am convinced, are affected in the opposite way. The more they are photographed (or drawn or painted) the more soul they seem to accumulate.\textsuperscript{22}
\end{quote}

Using location data, multiple shots of the same place can be gathered together, giving a ‘metaview’ of a place from multiple perspectives that reveal more of its soul.

In \textit{Generating a new sense of place in the age of the metaview} – an article co-written with my supervisor Martyn Jolly during my candidature – the emerging technologies afforded by the internet that allow multiple views of the same location or object to be used to create metaviews were explored.\textsuperscript{23} In particular, we referenced the work of Noah Snavely and his colleagues; Blaise Agüera; David Crandall and his colleagues at Cornell University; and the work done at the University of Washington, Microsoft and AutoDesk in creating tools that allow photographs of the same place or object to be combined together in new, three-dimensional views, and demonstrated examples of how the wealth of photographs on the internet could be used to create new, navigable experiences that allowed the creation of a new sense of place.\textsuperscript{24}

\begin{quotation}


\textsuperscript{23} Steele and Jolly, “Generating a New Sense of Place in the Age of the Metaview.”

\end{quotation}
Rephotography

Time is an important element of the meaning and value of place. It takes time for events to unfold that will define place. It takes time for people to experience and to know a place. Rephotography – where photographs of the same scene are taken years apart – can be used to highlight the changes in material form in a geographic location over time: to document what has changed there and what impact natural or human activity may have had on the place. The original photograph and its rephotographed pair communicate a transition from one point in time to another, or to several other times in the case of Mark Klett’s *Third Views, Second Sights: A Rephotographic Survey of the American West.* Klett identified a number of historical photographs taken in the American West in the latter part of the nineteenth century, located where they were taken, and rephotographed the scenes. He twice visited over one hundred sites pictured in the historic photographs he had found and rephotographed the scenes as close as possible to the original views. *Third Views* explores how to make time an element of an art that is usually seen as extracting the decisive or frozen moment. According to Klett, “I think the pictures ask us to become aware of the extraordinary qualities of our own distinct moment in time. But it is a realization that a particular future is not guaranteed by the flow of time in any given direction.”

Rephotography has a long history going back to the nineteenth century. According to AE Harrison, as early as 1894 the International Congress of Geologists at Zürich encouraged systematic observations of glacier variations using photographs to compare images of the same glaciers over a number of years. He cites Henry Fielding Reid from 1895, who described the methods recommended, which included photography from marked stations.

Rephotography has its roots in landscape photography, especially documenting the changes wrought on the landscape over time by natural forces and human activity. Mark

---

26 Ibid.
27 Mark Klett, *After the Ruins, 1906 and 2006: Rephotographing the San Francisco Earthquake and Fire* (Berkeley [u.a.]: Univ. of California Press, 2006), cover.
Klett and his colleagues popularized landscape rephotography with his series of books and exhibitions featuring rephotography of the American West. There is also a growing tradition of rephotographing people, represented by the work of Peter Feldstein in his book and exhibition *The Boston Project*. More recently, Argentinian artist Irina Werning has created a couple of exhibitions, *Back to the Future* and *Back to the Future 2 2011*, for which she rephotographed portraits of people taken originally when they were much younger — copying the original photograph as closely as possible, down to location, clothes, props and expressions. Rephotographing people years apart reveals other changes — changes brought about by, one imagines looking at the pairs of images, experience, circumstances and aging.

In April 2009 the University of Plymouth hosted a conference called *Framing Time and Place: Repeats & Returns in Photography*. The Conference presentations gave views of rephotography that covered a range of perspectives from history, art, policy, landscape and social change. Mark Klett spoke at the conference, along with British, European, and other American speakers who presented their work. Australian Donna Brett presented a paper on her research, documenting place in post-war Germany. According to the Conference Program, she was to report on “how repeat, serial and rephotography of place reveal the urban landscape as uncanny and alienating, spaces that although intrinsically linked to the histories of sites, simultaneously display the banality of everydayness.”

Nick Stone is a photographer from Norwich in the United Kingdom who has undertaken a major project rephotographing images from the Second World War when Norwich was bombed. His *Blitz Ghost* project merges the old photographs with rephotographed images of the sites as they are today. Stone credits Sergey Larenkov’s beautifully-crafted images

---

30 Mark Klett (Editor), *Third Views, Second Sights: A Rephotographic Survey of the American West*.  
34 Ibid., 10.  

*Photographs and place*
combining old views from the Second World War in Russia with the same locations today as contributing to the inspiration for his own work.36

Architectural photographer John Gollings first photographed the architecture, signs and symbols of leisure in Surfers Paradise in 1973. He went back 40 years later, in 2013, and rephotographed the same views for his exhibition Learning from Surfers Paradise: A Rephotography Project 1973-2013. The exhibition notice notes "[t]he contrasts between then and now are startling, revealing the extraordinary rate of change on the Gold Coast."37

The Australian Centre for Photography hosted an exhibition by Rowan Conroy of his rephotography of images of ancient Greek sites originally taken 100 years ago by Professor William Woodhouse. Conroy displayed the original images beside his own rephotographed views to invite "the viewer to compare the changes and continuity of the objects in built landscape and environment." 38


Works

I use photographs and metadata to provide information about the geographic location and the material form of places, and to give testimony to the meaning and value of the places recorded. Through sharing these works I hope to communicate to viewers the worth of these places so that they can be recognised as important foundations of our culture. Following are some of the works and activities from my studio practice over the period of my research.

Warrumbungle – Changes

Warrumbungle combines photographs with other information to provide viewers with expanded opportunities for understanding place. The work helped me to develop the techniques needed to determine the geographic location where a photograph was taken. It also shows how to combine various photographs of the same place together with a topographic map and explores how to embed the lot into a presentation system: Google Earth. The photographs, the map and Google Earth's satellite imagery and terrain model document the material form of the place, so the viewer can understand what meaning and value is invested in it.39

Fig. 1. Screenshot of Warrumbungle. Composite work combining Google Earth, Panoramio photographs (own and public), topographic map and GPS track. James Steele 2007-2012

39 Steele, “Grand High Tops.”
Normally such wild areas do not seem to change very much over time, but in January 2013 a major bushfire devastated the Warrumbungle National Park, including the area covered in this work. Eventually the area will regenerate, but in the meantime the work documents the park before the fire, recalling something of what was lost. Warrumbungle is a dynamic work, so any geocoded photographs of the area taken after the fire and included in Google Earth’s Photo layer will appear in it, documenting the recovery that will come over the next generation as the bush regrows. The work is a memento mori – a documentary reminder of a treasure now lost.

The fire has changed the material form of the place: the vegetation is gone or is a ghost of what it was before the fire. The landform remains: recognisable where it was previously visible, revealed in a different material form where it is now exposed beneath the layer of vegetation and boardwalks that were removed by the fire. The place now has an added layer of meaning: an event – the fire – becoming another resonance that defines it and highlights its importance as a special place in our community: one that we value more through its immediate loss. Place is dynamic in this sense: the physical location may stay the same, but the material form and the meaning and value change over time as events unfold there. Place is also a personal or subjective idea: for me, I grieve for the loss of a special place in our environment, and hope the work will provide evidence for what it once was, and will be again in the future.

**Orroral Valley – Embedded**

Another work – Orroral Valley – demonstrates the embedding of digital photographs in Google Earth’s terrain model. The particular digital photograph was captured six years after bushfires had devastated the area, and shows remnants of vegetation killed by the fires, along with some regrowth. The same technique can be used with the Warrumbungle photographs to show the place before the fire there.

‘Embedded’ suggests that the terrain model and the photograph are one, so the use of the word is aspirational rather than descriptive. Recent advances in augmented reality techniques suggest that in the not-too-distant future a visitor will be able to experience photographs previously taken by other people at the same location. In the case of the

Orroral Valley image, viewers in the future would be able to compare my post-bushfire scene with later regrowth. In Warrumbungle, they could see my photographs of the area before the fire.

Fig. 2. Orroral Valley Embedded. Screenshot of Google Earth construction. James Steele 2009

Lake Mackenzie – ‘Sublime’ panorama

While on a walk along the Routeburn Track in New Zealand, I explored techniques to capture the broad sweep of the vistas that opened up to visitors along the way – traces of the material form of the places there that would represent their majesty. Lake Mackenzie was produced from seven individual images taken from the same spot and programmatically stitched together to create a single view. It shows how composite images can be used to give a sense of this remote and beautiful place with detail and a broader sweep that would difficult to create with individual images.
Lake Mackenzie offers the viewer a traditional impression of the sublime landscape through the grandeur of the place as it is represented in the work. For me, it evokes memories of the experience; the hard work to get to the spot where I stood and experienced the place first-hand. I see works like this not as 'eco-porn' but as documents that can contribute to the recording of what was there when I was there, to be compared with records contributed by other people of what was there before, and what will be there in the future. I do appreciate it when viewers see my images and respond positively to their aesthetics. Any traditional aesthetic appeal they do have will open them up for those viewers with a more conventional understanding of reading landscape through images.

From my perspective, any wider community appeal that comes from 'sublime' images that represent the grandeur of a place is more likely to have a positive impact on the general understanding of the value of wild places and the need for their protection. Rod Giblett disagrees, questioning the role that representing the natural environment has on promoting "environmental sustainability". I hope others will see this record of a remote place and understand its value as a place worth preserving in its natural state.

Kosciuszko Hut Geospatial pilot project – Geographic location

I worked with the National Library of Australia to show how geographic location metadata could be added to some objects within the Library’s collections. As an object, a photograph can have a geographic location associated with it that adds to our understanding of its

---

43 See Rod Giblett and Juha Tolonen, Photography and Landscape (Bristol: Intellect, 2012), 63 ff for a discussion of "sublime" in landscape imaging.
meaning and value as a cultural object. The *Kosciuszko Hut Geospatial Pilot Project* sought to add location metadata to records of photographs of huts in the Kosciuszko National Park.  

When the Kosciuszko National Park was declared, there was no policy to preserve the huts, and evidence of European settlement was being removed. Under pressure from the Kosciuszko Huts Association (KHA) in the 1970s, the New South Wales National Parks and Wildlife Service (NPWS) agreed that the huts represented a significant part of Australia’s cultural heritage, and began working with the KHA to preserve what previously they had been destroying. Now the NPWS has an active program to preserve these relics of Australia’s past.

Using the names of the huts in the title or description in catalogue entries for photographs of the huts in the Library’s collection, I provided the geographic location of around 60 sites. The project demonstrated the value of geographic location as metadata for photographs within national collections.

**Kosciuszko Huts – Rephotography**

The photographs in the National Library’s collection show the material form of the huts as they were when the photographs were taken, but it turned out that the material forms of the huts that exist in the same locations today are different – in some cases radically different. Some of the huts have been completely rebuilt after being destroyed by fires, or after falling down due to neglect or their age. After spending some time working with the KHA and the Library on photographs of the huts, I embarked on a project to rephotograph some of the historic images that I thought provided interesting perspectives on the huts; the activities that led to them being built; and the history that sees some of the original structures apparently still in existence today.

46 According to the Project Plan, the Kosciuszko Hut Geospatial Pilot Project “... will provide geospatial coordinates for records related to alpine huts in the Kosciusko area. A collaborative project between the Kosciusko Hut Association (KHA), James Steele (ANU Post graduate student) and Picture Australia.” Fiona Hooton, “KHA Project Plan: Kosciuszko Hut Geospatial Pilot Project” (Picture Australia, National Library of Australia, 26 February 2009).


48 The locations for 48 of the sites were verified using at least two data sources, including location data supplied by David Scott from Heritage Tasmania; from the KHA itself; from Google Earth; and from electronic versions of 1:25k topographic maps from the NSW Department of Lands.

49 The KHA Newsletter documents many of the rebuilding efforts of the NPWS and the KHA. See, for example, Megan Bowden, “New Pretty Plain Hut Now Has Walls and a Roof!,” *Kosciuszko Huts Association Newsletter*, Summer 2009, 4.

Many of the huts were in isolated areas of the Park and it proved difficult to get to them. When I did get there it was a challenge to rephotograph the original historical photographs precisely. Sometimes elements like trees and fences evident in the original photographs no longer existed or had changed significantly, like the fences in Klaus Hueneke’s *Coolamine in 1977*; sometimes the rebuilt huts look quite different to the ones in the old photographs – see the photographs of Cascades Hut (below), for example.

Rephotography is a complex process that is not as simple as finding the spot where the original photographer stood and then snapping away. Equipment differs; lens height is sometimes difficult to determine; perspective can be influenced by a number of factors like the focal length and type of the lens, and the format of the camera; filters and exposure settings can change the look of the image; use of colour or black and white, and processing techniques: all of these things influence the print and complicate the rephotography. Of course physical changes in the environment also have an impact on rephotography. In some sense that is the point of it: to provide a means of comparison between the subject of the original photograph and how the same scene appears at the instance of the rephotograph. Seasons change; the weather varies; the time of day may be different; vegetation grows, dies, or is burnt; land use changes; buildings are built, extended, destroyed or decay; activity within the frame moves on, or is replaced by other activities.

I had to abandon the project when I tore the cartilage in my knee and was no longer able to walk in to the huts. Some of the historic photographs I did rephotograph are detailed below, showing how geographic location, material form, and investment with meaning and value can be captured in photography.

---

Coolamine Homestead has been largely rebuilt, from original materials found on the site or from new materials when no original materials remained. Comparing the two photos, the rebuilt Homestead is not the Homestead as it was in 1909. Fences are gone, perhaps the buildings are in slightly different places, and the building style is quite different: for example, the chimney on a hut on the right has been rebuilt in a different style. The roof line on the building on the left is different as well. How much of this is due to maintenance or the reconstruction, and how much to the different positions of the photographers,

different camera technologies, lenses, and so on, is difficult to tell. Bellows, common in 1909, would allow much greater flexibility in framing and composition than is possible with a standard lens even on a high end digital camera today.

While rephotographing *Southwell Family at Coolamine Homestead*, I discovered through an interpretative sign at the Homestead that the photograph in the Library’s collection was not a photograph of the Southwell Family, but more probably shows the Taylor family. While the error was probably a simple cataloguing mistake, I was concerned that some historical images in national collections might not be what they appeared to be, and began investigating how viewers perceive the meaning of photographs, particularly in the context of viewing them and their surrounding information – like the titles and descriptions in the online catalogue of what should be an authoritative source: the National Library of Australia. The subsequent investigations led to my dissertation, *Photography and our connection with our culture, history and identity*, where, along with some more traditional research techniques, I used the increasing access provided by the internet and online resources to uncover different meanings for four historical Australian photographs that question how photographs, on their own and with the limited cataloguing information available, can be used to establish connections with our past.
Whites River Hut

Fig. 6. Whites River Hut and slopes leading up to the Rolling Grounds, ca. 1930s. George Day (nla.pic-vn4235951)

Fig. 7. Whites River Hut. James Steele 2009
To rephotograph *Whites River Hut*, in 2009 I hiked in 9 km with a print of the image, and thought I had found the spot where the original photograph was taken. I was there in summer, not winter, so that makes a difference to the way the land lies and how, in the original, the snow-covered landscape is sculpted by the afternoon light. The geographic location was the same but the material form was different: now the yard is gone, and there are other structures there, but you can see by the line of the roof I have missed the spot.

Whites River Hut was badly damaged by fire in 2010 when a visiting skier threw spirits into a still-glowing fire.\(^{54}\) My photographs of the hut taken just months before the fire were contributed to a community effort to document the material form of the hut before it was damaged, to help its restoration. The incident showed how photographs can document place, and as an example of how important the photographs were to restore this valuable artefact after it was damaged.

\(^{54}\) Steele and Jolly, "Generating a New Sense of Place in the Age of the Metaview," 468.
Pockets Hut was a one-day walk from the Blue Waterholes Camping Ground in the Kosciuszko National Park. I had copied the original photograph onto overhead transparency film and took that with me when hiking to the hut. Using the transparency did help with lining up the original photograph, but looking at the two together, the original was taken from the left of the rephotograph, and closer to the hut. The lens height
in the original appears to be lower, and the original may have been taken with a wider lens
as well. The position of the sun suggests that the original was taken later in the day, since
in the original the sun is lighting the interior of the verandah more than the rephotograph.
Since there is no indication of the date on which the original image was made, it is difficult
to judge the season and match the date and time in the rephotograph.
Cascade Hut is a 10 km walk in from Dead Horse Gap in the Kosciuszko National Park. Again I copied the original photograph onto overhead transparency film and used that to line up the shot for the rephotograph. Changes in the construction of the hut – the chimney has been changed and the door swings out now but in then – and the surrounding area –
the fence, the vegetation – made it difficult to match the shot. The material form of the two huts is quite different.

Although not perfectly aligned, the pair of photographs do document the hut as it was in the 1940s and again in 2010, providing the viewer with evidence of its material form then and now. The use of the hut in the 1940s is documented through a combination of what is seen in the photograph itself and the title – taken together they give the place its meaning and inform us about the value of the hut as an historical artefact.
Another day's walk was required to get to Old Currango on the Coolemon Plains. Old Currango is the oldest hut still in existence in the Kosciuszko National Park, and from comparing the original 1978 photograph taken by Klaus Hueneke with the rephotograph...
in 2010, it is apparent that significant restoration and clearing of the site had taken place in the time between the two exposures. It was impossible to find the position Klaus used to make the original photograph: from the most likely spot it was impossible to see the hut or the plain because of trees that had apparently grown in the meantime, obscuring the view. It also appears that Klaus climbed a no longer extant tree or somehow raised the height of the camera to get the angle that adds so much more of a feeling of the isolation of the place than the rephotograph does. His use of black and white photography also adds to the feeling of isolation.

**Lake Mungo – Collective impressions**

During a visit to Lake Mungo in south-western New South Wales, I tracked the places I went with a GPS device and took photographs to document the area, so that I could contribute my photographs to Panoramio and Google Earth’s records of this important place in Australia’s geological and anthropological history.

Panoramio enables the display of photographs on a map in their geographic location together with photographs taken by other Panoramio subscribers at the same location or nearby. As well as providing the geographic location feature of place, Panoramio makes it easier to see a place’s material form, especially if a number of different photographs have

---

55 When asked during a conversation with Klaus in December 2010, he could not recall how he took the photograph.

been taken there. The number of photographs taken at a particular place, and the number of different photographers who have contributed photographs to the service, are metrics that might show how much meaning and value photographers give to that particular place. I explore this idea further with geocoded photographs shared on Flickr in my *Flickring Earth* installation, discussed later.

Google selected one of my images – *Lake Mungo from Red Top Lookout, Mungo National Park* – for Google Maps, and in early 2013 had been viewed over 11,000 times. It is my most popular image on Panoramio, where views in the hundreds are more common.57

The photograph documents the place and adds to the evidence of the meaning and value invested in it by the community. By helping other people to experience these important places in Australia, I hope that I have contributed to their preservation. Photographs from the community ‘crowdsourced’ through services like Panoramio provide the world with additional visual information that documents place for posterity, particularly for places where Google’s *Street View* cameras will never go.

**Flickring Earth – An overwhelming flood of images**

“*Images transfix. Images anesthetize.*”58

I am in awe at the number of photographs on the internet; the increasing numbers of new photographs continually being created and shared; and the difficulty of navigating through them and making sense of them. Since the photographic process was announced in 1839, *trillions* of photographs have been taken.59 With the digitalisation of photography, the emergence of smartphones with built-in cameras and social networking sites like Facebook hungry for images, the rate of creation and sharing has increased.60 Many people today document their lives with photographs, but are these worthwhile records of our popular culture? What is their value? What do they represent and how can they be organised? How do you navigate through them in any meaningful way? How will future generations use this detritus of our popular culture to understand us, just as we try to interpret cave paintings in France from 30,000 or more years ago? What do they mean?

60 3,000 images are uploaded to Facebook every second: that’s a billion more every four days: Michael Zhang, “3,000 Photos Are Uploaded Every Second to Facebook,” *PetaPixel*, 1 February 2012, http://www.petapixel.com/2012/02/01/3000-photos-are-uploaded-every-second-to-facebook/.
As photography ages, much of the world has been captured. Since the beginning of photography, people, places and events have been recorded as photographs and shared through books, exhibitions, postcards, albums and the collections of galleries, libraries, archives and museums. Now online services like Flickr, Facebook, Panoramio and Picasa increase our opportunities to share and view photographs from around the world.

Digitisation of physical prints in private and public collections, and sharing them through individual websites or services like Flickr, increase our access to those images as well, but not necessarily to our understanding of the meaning and value of the places they represent. While not the only means by which photographs can be managed to help us understand them, geographic location can be a powerful organiser for them.

When considering how to organise the fire hose of images sprouting from the internet, I developed an idea for an exhibition piece that captured the feeling of all these images flowing over us from all over the world. As a viewer, I felt I was unable to manage this flow: the images swept over me and were gone. I saw the work as an exhibition piece rather than an interactive experience precisely to reinforce the feeling of being unable to control the flow. I was able to realise the work with the help of colleagues at the INSPIRE Centre at the University of Canberra.61

The question the work explores is how will digital-camera-wielding, broadband-using, Flickr subscribers map the world? In part, my brief for the work was:

*You can go into a cave in southern France and see the drawings made on the walls more than 30,000 years ago, but the billions of images that have been uploaded to the internet over the last few years are possibly just ephemera that will soon disappear.*

*We still don't know why the cave people made those drawings on the walls, but at least we can still see them. What of the representations being shared today on the internet? Will they survive for 30,000 or more years? What sense will people then make of these images, if they can see them at all?*

---

Flickring Earth seeks to represent the concern I have that these images, representing popular visual culture today, may soon be lost to us and will almost certainly be lost to future generations.62

In October 2012, the work showed that over 8 billion photos had been uploaded to Flickr. Thousands more are uploaded every minute. Many of these are geocoded and can therefore be mapped.

Geographic location alone was not sufficient for my purpose of illustrating the deluge: I wanted the images to be curated in some way so that they would be 'interesting' to viewers of the installation. As it happens, Flickr has a measure of 'interestingness' that it uses to curate images algorithmically for presentation through a number of its Explore features.63 Flickr does not define 'interestingness', but it does say:

There are lots of elements that make something 'interesting' (or not) on Flickr. Where the clickthroughs are coming from; who comments on it and when; who marks it as a favorite; its tags and many more things which are constantly changing. Interestingness changes over time, as more and more fantastic content and stories are added to Flickr.64

Flickr's application to patent 'interestingness' says:

Media objects, such as images or soundtracks, may be ranked according to a new class of metrics known as 'interestingness.' These rankings may be based at least in part on the quantity of user-entered metadata concerning the media object, the number of users who have assigned metadata to the media object, access patterns related to the media object, and/or a lapse of time related to the media object.65

However 'interestingness' is defined, recently-uploaded 'interesting' geocoded photographs are a subset that give us a way of presenting a compelling stream of Flickr images. The Flickr API gives programmers access to Flickr images and the metadata

---

64 Ibid.
surrounding them, including each day’s list of 500 ‘interesting’ images. Flickring Earth uses the API to get the list of most recent ‘interesting’ images and selects the ones that are geocoded.

The original installation runs full-screen on two monitors. The first screen has a black field on which 10 pixel by 10 pixel picons of the algorithmically-selected images are displayed one after the other using the location data embedded in the images to set its coordinates on the screen. After the most recent geocoded ‘interesting’ images are displayed, the application requests the previous day’s list of ‘interesting’ images, and so on. As each new day’s ‘interesting’ images become available, those images are selected and added to the screen one by one.

Over time, this builds up a ‘heat map’ that appears to be a map of the world. The picons dissolve away over time, implying their ephemeral nature. A second screen displays a slideshow-like stream of the photographs that are appearing on the main screen as full-screen images. Each image appears for only four seconds on the receiver before dissolving to the next one: the experience of the installation shows that four seconds is long enough to identify an image, but too short to explore it. It is a frustratingly short time, and viewers have expressed a desire to be able to stop the stream to explore individual images in greater detail. This sense of frustration at being unable to stop the stream is an objective of the work: reflecting the transient and overwhelming nature of the fire hose of images available over the internet.

A concept for running the work on a 4x4 video wall at INSPIRE was developed that uses nine of the sixteen screens to display the evolving world heat map, with the remaining seven monitors each running a receiver displaying a separate feed of the photographs.

---

Fig. 15. Concept for Flickring Earth running on the video wall at INSPIRE. James Steele 2012

A version of the work ran on the video wall in September 2012 during the experimental installation of my Cronulla Street exhibition, and it continues to run from time to time when the wall is available. The installation has received attention from many of the people visiting the INSPIRE Centre, with some viewers remaining transfixed with the flow of images for ten to fifteen minutes. Many want to know how they can interact with the flow, expecting to be able to select particular images from the map to examine them in more detail, or pause the flow of the slideshow to spend more time looking at a particular image. Their frustration at not being able to actively engage with the flow is an objective of the installation: to help them to understand that the relentless flow of images being made available over the internet will require some manner of control if we are to experience them in a way that we can manage.
The image created by *Flickring Earth* is eerily reminiscent of a map of the world, but it differs in important ways: what is busy, and what is left out give the viewer pause to consider how photographers – Flickr contributors – present and represent (or map) the world, and possibly how our own photographs are representative of place.

**Cronulla Street – Past and present**

In my *Cronulla Street, Summer. 1973-2011* exhibition I use rephotography to highlight the changes in an otherwise unremarkable suburban shopping precinct over a period of almost forty years. The photographs document the place, drawing the viewer’s attention to what has changed physically over the intervening years, from which can be inferred changes in the society over that same period.

The exhibition bring together the elements needed to realise the objective of my studio practice to explore how photographs can be used to document and represent place – digital photography, GPS and the internet. Today these elements allow much deeper exploration of place by making it easier to integrate the information necessary to reveal the connections between a series of photographs taken at separate times in the same location.
In 1973, when I was an architecture student in my second year at the University of New South Wales we were given an assignment to develop a proposal to turn the main shopping strip in Cronulla into a pedestrian mall. I left the university before completing the assignment, and 38 years later I found 36 TRI-X black and white negatives showing the area in 1973 among my effects in the bottom of a cardboard box. The original 1973 photographs of Cronulla were captured to document the built environment and the activities that people undertook there. They were not intended to be prints in an exhibition, but as records of the day-to-day life of the people there and the environment in which they lived. Over the passage of time, the original images have become historical records of the place as it was then.

Using the evidence provided by street signs at an intersection in one of the original photographs, I searched Google Maps for the location, then found the same place today with Street View. Still using Google Maps and Street View, I located where 35 of the 36 images had been captured. By creating a link between each of the photographs in the order in which they were taken (evidenced by the edge number on each negative), I was able to determine the route used to take the original photographs. I returned to Cronulla in 2011, followed the route, rephotographed the scenes and tracked my new route.
Cronulla has changed. The original 1973 assignment was to develop a proposal to turn the Cronulla Street shopping precinct into a pedestrian mall. That had indeed happened, and where once a Holden Kingswood was parked, a man now sat drinking coffee in an outside café.

The office of the *Cronulla Observer* had disappeared, replaced with a shoe shop. There were trees and marquees in what was once a suburban shopping street. In some places, buildings had been altered so they looked identical, but their height had been increased or a floor extended while maintaining the original appearance and design. It was obvious that the local building authority required the original fabric of buildings to be maintained or imitated when any renovations or new building works were done, despite the obvious repurposing of almost all of the buildings since 1973. Large apartment blocks loomed behind the shopping strip.
The photographs are documents that "reveal the overlooked and the ordinary. The focus here is on those things, activities or places that usually draw little attention...". By comparing one photograph taken in 1973 with the same scene captured 38 years later, even greater attention is drawn to objects, activities and places that are represented in them. Some elements endure, like the fabric of the buildings. Others change: the supermarkets are gone; the cars are different; people are wearing different styles of clothing. Street trees and large apartment blocks, absent from the earlier photographs, appear in the more recent ones. People sit at cafés in what were once streets.

Without comparing the two photographs, a viewer would not be able easily to establish with great certainty just what has changed over the intervening years. What is seen, in either photograph, is a moment that has passed, a history – even the recent image is now more than a year old. But by figuratively drawing a line between the two images a viewer can deduce change: the pair gives a dynamic dimension to otherwise static (both in the sense of time and of motion) reflections of the past: there is "a trail along which life is lived" between the two points in time represented by the images. As the photographer, I draw the viewer's attention to the place and the activities that occur there, or that did occur there almost 40 years before, and focus the viewer's attention on the differences between the two times. I see evidence of changes in our identity that were not apparent until I saw the two photographs together and compared them – I am asking my "audience to attend in the same manner".

In *The Photographer's Eye*, John Szarkowski says: "[t]he compelling clarity with which a photograph recorded the trivial suggested that the subject had never before been properly seen, that it was in fact not trivial, but filled with undiscovered meaning." I look at the photographs taken in Cronulla in 1973 and I am surprised at the 'undiscovered meaning' they reveal. Close examination shows us how much has changed when the original photographs are compared with what is there now – evidence of which is provided by the rephotographs captured in 2011.

The older photographs contain the potential, the promise, for what we see in the newer ones. Likewise the newer ones hold the foundations for the future. The newer ones also echo the past. Unlike the traditional view of the photograph as a frozen moment of the

---

past, in this sense the photographs are a portent of the future. I developed photographic palimpsests to explore the concept of the past, present and future in the pairs of photographs by slowly dissolving between the past and the present and then back again in an endless cycle. These palimpsests are presented as projections in the exhibition. The photographic pairs and the palimpsests are described in more detail in the appendix.

Originally proposed as an online exhibition where visitors would be able to navigate a virtual space inspired by Masaki Fujihata’s Field Works, the work changed until it has returned almost to an original concept from the 1970s – the works are displayed in real space as physical artefacts that represent the material form of the place.

Fig. 18. Cronulla Street Exhibition September 2012. James Steele 2012

An experimental installation of the exhibition ran for a week in the TEAL Room at the INSPIRE Centre at the University of Canberra to gauge visitors’ responses and plan for the final exhibition. I was surprised and gratified by the positive responses I received: visitors to the exhibition spent more time than I had anticipated looking very carefully at the prints and comparing the original and rephotographed pairs.

---

71 Masaki Fujihata’s Field Works is series of projects which reconstruct collective memories into cyberspace by combining position data from GPSs, still photographs, music, moving image and audio to create installations and exhibitions that explore space in innovative ways. Fujihata’s visualisations show that the challenges of recreating three-dimensional space from media covering several modes of perception can be explored successfully. Masaki Fujihata, “Field-Works,” June 2010, http://www.field-works.net/.

72 A navigable panorama of the exhibition was created by a colleague, Michelle McAuley, and is available online. It gives a feeling for how the space was adapted for the experimental installation, providing a compelling record of the show. See Michelle McAuley, “Cronulla Street Exhibition,” Jamessteele.me, 15 October 2012, http://jamessteele.me/CronullaStreetExhibition/CronullaStreet.html. A copy of the catalogue from the exhibition is included with this exegesis (inside back cover).
The 2011 photographs are tone-mapped to increase the dynamic range of the prints and reveal details in the shadows and highlights that would otherwise be lost. The saturated colour of the tone-mapped images says to me 'this is now', in contrast to the 'old' monochrome images. The colour in the 2011 rephotographs also reinforces the greening of the place over the intervening years – highlighting efforts to bring back elements of the natural world into the altered landscape and recalling nature retaking the culturally-altered space.\textsuperscript{73}

People visiting the exhibition were positive about the experience of having the changes brought to their attention, even when some of the memories they evoked were not so positive. One viewer, whose mother lived in the area for most of the time between 1973 and 2011, recalled how her mother began to complain about having to go far afield to do her shopping. The viewer did not really understand her mother's complaints until she compared the pairs of photographs, and realised that there were no supermarkets evident in 2011 when there were six different chains with supermarkets in Cronulla in 1973.

In a photograph, there are no smells, no sounds, no real motion. Sarah Pink proposes a theory of multisensoriality that "invites us to understand images as being produced and

\textsuperscript{73} Wells, \textit{Land Matters}, 5.
consumed as part of the experience of multisensory environments." To Yi-Fu Tuan, one experiences space through all senses, and one needs all senses to interpret space and turn it to place: to interpret it and feel comfortable in it. To explore the idea of multisensoriality the experimental installation included audio of two types: oral history recordings done in 1973 by my aunt, Hazel De Berg, from the National Library of Australia; and the Top 20 Aussie Hits of 1973 (as judged by Go Set). The recordings were played continuously and randomly during the exhibition through ceiling speakers from iTunes, and were more background reinforcement than overt sound. They were meant to provide an ambience of the time: the sounds of the seventies and snatches of the perspectives, ideas and voices of the people captured in the oral history recordings.

No-one commented on the audio. When asked, visitors had a neutral response to them. To me, they were extremely interesting to listen to, although that wasn’t the point of them: they were there more to provide an echo of the past in whispered conversations overhead by the visitors in scraps and fragments. Possibly an exhibition is a hostile environment for audio of any sort. Certainly at least some of the ‘pop’ songs were intrusive, and tastes – then and now – varied as to their appeal.

The exhibition catalogue included a map of Cronulla showing the location of each of the photographic pairs; an introduction to the exhibition; lists of the oral history interviewees and the Top 20 from 1973; as well as a list of the captions for the prints and some notes on Hugh Lunn’s books on the changing nature of Australian English. These books had given me an insight into how elements of the past – language, in Lunn’s books – need to be brought to our attention if we are to consider how our culture has changed, just as the photographic pairs alert us to changes that we would otherwise not notice.

Also included in the exhibition catalogue was an essay written by Gillian Edwards, a sixth-class student from Cronulla Primary School, around the time the original photographs were taken. I found the essay – Cronulla 50 Years from Now – in an edition of the Cronulla Observer from early 1973. It describes what a primary school student from the time the

---

75 Tuan, Space and Place, 18.
76 A copy of the exhibition catalogue is included inside the back cover of this Exegesis. Hugh Lunn, Lost for Words: Australia's Lost Language in Words and Stories (Sydney: ABC Books, 2006); Hugh Lunn and Australian Broadcasting Corporation, Words Fail Me: A Journey through Australia's Lost Language (Pymble: ABC Books, 2010).
original photographs were taken thought Cronulla would look like in the future: it is uncannily accurate. As another sensory input into the experience visitors to the exhibition had available to them, it helped visitors understand the meaning and value with which someone writing in 1973 invested the place.

Comparing the two images taken almost 40 years apart we can see that places and people change, even if we can only realise that things have indeed changed when we look at the images. It is not like being there: the two images allow us to step back and compare two frozen moments from the same location. The geographic location may be the same but the places are different. The people in them are different, the things that they are doing there are different. The material form has changed, not completely but recognisably. They are different places, sharing the same location, but the two photographs document how our identity as a community has changed physically and socially over time, changing so slowly that we don’t realise it until given the opportunity to contemplate it from outside the frames looking in, given all the time in the world to examine the two views and compare the elements within them that prove the differences.

Responding to Roland Barthes’ commentary on William Klein’s photography of children in New York in 1954, Klein notes that “[Barthes] is more interested in what he [Barthes] sees than in what the photographer sees.” I hope that viewers will look at these photographs as visual evidence for changes in our identity that are there to be seen if you look, as I have done.

People will bring their own knowledge and experience to a place however they encounter it, through visiting it or viewing photographs of it. My exhibition encourages viewers to explore the photographs with little context except the details of the location where each pair of photographs were made; some background to the show in the catalogue; and the background audio providing another sensory dimension to the experience. The experience of viewing the photographs evokes the viewers’ own responses to place based on their backgrounds and their experiences.

There is a tension about whether or not to include descriptions or further explanations of the photographs in the Cronulla Street exhibition. In No Caption Needed, Hariman and Lucaites argue that “[p]hotographs are an ideal medium for activating tacit social

---

knowledge precisely because they are a mute record of social performance." 79 While their perspectives are of the iconic photograph and photojournalism, the Cronulla Street photographs are records of social performance at two distinctly separate points in time but at exactly the same geographic location: highlighting the changes and reinforcing the reality of that social performance. A description would externalize the process and reduce the viewer’s anxiety about the meaning of the photographs: the ‘easier road’ is to let the photographer, cataloguer or curator decide how to interpret the image for them, relieving them of responsibility for thought. Without captions or descriptive text, the photographs are mute and must rely on the responses of the individuals viewing them to have meaning. Without captions, the viewer needs to look inwards to explain the views before them and resolve the reasons for the changes between the two photographs.

Central to my thesis is how photographs (not photography) document and represent place. Place, explains Gieryn, 80 must have geographic location, material form, and investment with meaning and value. The geographic location is provided in the Cronulla Street exhibition by the latitude and longitude associated with each pair of images. The photograph itself is evidence of the material form of the place. The viewer must provide the investment with meaning and value: they must decide whether or not the photographs are of a place.

Absent personal associations with the photographs (as one would with, for example, the historical photographs explored in my dissertation 81), other things are required to determine the investment with meaning and value with which the photographs can be imbued to determine not just their physical place but the place they occupy in our community. Our own received ‘wisdom’ through processes of enculturation that include schooling, reading (in the case of A Pioneer Settler, Henry Lawson’s A Drover’s Wife) and our understanding of our history (the historical treatment of Aborigines in the case of Mounted Constables Willshire and Wurmbrand) can be extended with directly reviewing the ‘original drafts of history’: the newspapers (especially in the case of Capture of Ah Kim). These are not simple associations, and we cannot expect to be able to determine a generic

---

80 Gieryn, “A Space for Place in Sociology.”
81 Steele, "Photography and Our Connection with Our Culture, History and Identity (PhD Dissertation)”. The photographs are Portrait of the Southwell family at Coolamine Homestead; A Pioneer Settler; Mounted Constable Willshire and Wurmbrand; and Capture of Ah Kim.
response to a particular photograph that will be true for all viewers: they all bring their own perspectives to the task of interpreting a photograph.

How people in future will interpret contemporary photographs of, say, Cronulla will be determined by what they bring to the task. Without personal experience of the place, they will need to rely on other things: captions, descriptions, newspaper accounts, other mediated sources like *Puberty Blues* (as a book, several films, or a television series); photographs taken around Cronulla by Hal Missingham, Max Dupain, Olive Cotton or Jeff Carter; or the police report on the Cronulla Riots. These will not be the same interpretations that people with their own personal knowledge of 'Cronulla' will bring to the task of interpreting them. The meaning and value they invest in the place may be different to mine.

Rephotography can show the changes in physical objects and community use that are highlighted when comparing the past with the present. My exhibition uses rephotography to explore the role of the photograph in revealing change. The exhibition is an expression of how old photographs provide us with the resonances that make the place what, uniquely, it is. The exhibition exposes the sometimes subtle, sometimes brutal, changes in the material form of the place and behaviour that go unnoticed without the photographic evidence of the same place taken years apart. These photographic pairs provide viewers with an opportunity for them to consider how their own environments change, and they encourage viewers to reflect on the impact that they, the viewers, might have on place.

---

Conclusion

The research journey has been about how photographs document and represent place. By combining photographs with other information I have developed works like Warrumbungle, Lake Mackenzie, Flickring Earth and Cronulla Street that show viewers the geographic location and material form of places, in ways that provoke them to consider the meaning and value of these places. Through presenting these works I have discovered how photographs can be used to help viewers understand what makes a space a place, worthy of value, regard, protection and preservation as 'capital' in the community.

I set out to explore how user-generated images could document and represent place. Aggregating, collecting and organising images by location gives us opportunities for presenting photographs that give viewers an opportunity to reflect on place and its personal and cultural relationship to them. The Flickring Earth installation provided an opportunity to evaluate how viewers responded to photographs aggregated in this way, and by observation and discussion with them it was clear that the work provoked an understanding of the connections between photographs and place. As I was, viewers were in awe of the continual growth of imagery available on the internet, and the work encouraged them to seek ways to interact with these images: something the work was designed specifically to prevent within its own context. I hope it will encourage them to explore the photographs online themselves, where they will have more control over the experience.

I used the internet to store and expose my own photographic records of bushwalks like the one around the Grand High Tops in the Warrumbungle National Park that is now an historic record of an area that was devastated by fire. Warrumbungle confirms the significance of documenting accurately the material form of place by naming and geocoding photographs taken there, and of providing the mechanism for retrieving images based on geographic location. Accessible over the internet, they are available to document past and present views of the material form of place as it was at a particular moment in time, and represent the changes wrought there by the elements.

I collaborated with the National Library of Australia to explore the role of location in relation to the items in its collections, particularly photographs, and worked with the Kosciuszko Huts Association to locate huts and merge location data with photographs,
travelling to sometimes remote locations in the Kosciuszko National Park to 'groundtruth' the position of huts and rephotograph the scenes depicted in old photographs from the National Library's collection. Using rephotography to compare old and new photographs of huts at the same geographic location, I showed how the material form of the huts was changed, raising questions about how, as artefacts, the huts represent our past. I found that even as simulacra they help to explain the activities that happened there that give a place meaning in our community and help us to understand the value of place in the historical record.

Seen in Robert Adams' terms of geography, autobiography and metaphor, the photographs in my Cronulla Street exhibition document the geography of an ordinary Australian suburban shopping strip from the 1970s and 2011. As well as being traces of the real world, they are also metaphors for an Australian suburban place. The old photographs taken in 1973 are symbolic of my own past: I place myself between the old and the new photographs, taken in 2011, remembering changes in my life between the two images. 'I was there' metaphorically in the past moment of time captured in the first image, and again metaphorically 'I am here' in the recent image: what has changed in the place is a metaphor for what has changed in the wider society and in me – my autobiography – over the intervening period.

A single photograph of a place gives a viewer one perspective on it. Show them another of the same place many years later and give them the opportunity to compare the two, back and forth, and they seek detail of the differences between them. They see the changes in the physicality of the places documented by the two photographs, and can understand from the transformations the evolution in society over the intervening period.

Give them access to further information that is relevant to the photograph, and they have an information space they can wander through as their interest takes them: a richer informative experience. Contextualised by the viewer’s experience and knowledge, or metadata like location information and written explanations that add to their meaning, photographs can document and represent place. In the wider context provided by multiple images and accurate metadata, photographs can help us identify aspects of place: the geographic location it occupies, its material form, and the activities that have occurred there over time that invest it with meaning and value. As documentary evidence of our history and heritage, photographs can inform us about the foundations of our identity and our culture.
Bibliography


---. "Photography and Our Connection with Our Culture, History and Identity (PhD Dissertation)." Australian National University, 2014.


When I hear the word Cronulla, it reminds me of the project I did in 1973 as an architecture student to document a suburban shopping strip as the basis for developing a proposal to turn the area into a more pedestrian-friendly mall. When other people hear ‘Cronulla’, it recalls different thoughts. They may have grown up there. Cronulla was the site of Cathy Lette and Gabrielle Carey’s book *Puberty Blues,* subsequently made into a film directed by Bruce Beresford, and now a television series; scenes from Charles Chauvel’s *Forty Thousand Horseman* were filmed by, among others, Frank Hurley in the sand dunes nearby; in 2005 it was the site of the Cronulla riots; or they could be familiar with the Cronulla Surf Museum’s Facebook page celebrating Cronulla’s beach culture, where contributors are encouraged to comment on old photographs of Cronulla. The beach was also the location used by Max Dupain to make some of his photographs, like *Souvenir of Cronulla; Mother and child at Cronulla;* and *Late Afternoon at Cronulla* (1937). Olive Cotton’s *Max Dupain photographing model on Cronulla Sandhills* documents Dupain’s activities there. Hal Missingham has several works featuring Cronulla’s beach culture; and there are a number of Jeff Carter’s works taken on the beaches around Cronulla that are now in the collection of the National Library of Australia. Any of these references may come to mind for some people when they think of Cronulla, and give it meaning for them, but not for me. To me, Cronulla brings to mind a landscape of suburban Sydney where I grew up, even though Cronulla isn’t the same place as Epping, far away on the other side of the city. Growing up, Sydney beaches and surf culture were foreign to me. To me, the photographs reflect a suburban Sydney shopping strip – not the beach.

85 Carey and Lette, *Puberty Blues.* The authors would have been growing up in Cronulla at the time the original photographs used for the exhibition were taken.
86 Beresford, *Puberty Blues.*
87 “Puberty Blues.”
92 Cotton, “Designers and Photographers at Work # 4.”
The Photographs

The original photographs recall my youth; the latter ones give me pause to consider how much has changed in my lifetime. A lot has happened in Cronulla (indeed throughout the world) over the intervening period, and the evidence contained within the frames of the original photograph and its rephotographed pair is not sufficient to explain the changes. Additional sources, 'triangulating' the evidence for the changes seen in the pairs of photographs, are needed before a fuller picture emerges. Certainly the experiences that viewers bring when they look at the photographs influence their interpretation of the changes they see and help to explain to them why they happened.

The Palimpsests

A palimpsest was originally a vellum or papyrus manuscript where an attempt had been made to erase the original text before new text was written over the top. Often remnants of the original text could still be seen. In architecture and archeology, indications of past use or occupation are referred to as 'palimpsests'. In some of the Cronulla Street photographic pairs, buildings have been altered but are still recognizable – the use has changed, but the evidence of the old building is still there. That the original fabric of a building has been maintained either as it was, or mimicked with renovated or new building work, indicates that some value has been placed on maintaining the appearance while the use of the space has changed. These palimpsests testify to past social performance, and by contrast emphasize current behavior and culture.

The pairs of photographic prints in the Cronulla Street exhibition express the contrast between the social performance of the past and the present. The three projections reinforce the changes – by almost imperceptibly changing from the past to the present, and then back again to reveal the correspondences and the differences between then and now. A viewer has to wait and watch before the cycle is complete – suggesting that the changes in social performance are slow enough that we don’t notice them until we step back to consider the evidence of the past and have the opportunity to compare it to the present. The techniques used to move between the past and the present views are designed to emphasize the changes – rather than only using a straight dissolve between one and the other, a ‘luminance key’ has been used as well, where the levels of light within the elements in each view rather than the image overall are used to effect the transition. Using a luminance key subconsciously draws attention to the individual elements within the frame as they change. That the 1973 views are monochrome and the 2011 views are colour reinforces the changes, especially in the projections.
**Note:**

The numbers for the photographs and palimpsests refer to the edge number of the original TRI-X negatives taken in 1973 that were rephotographed in 2011.

### List of Photographs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00</td>
<td>22 Cronulla Street</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04</td>
<td>Cnr. Ocean Grove Avenue and Cronulla Street</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09</td>
<td>65 Cronulla Street</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Surf Lane</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Surf Lane</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Arts Theatre Café, Surf Road</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>102 Cronulla Street</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Cnr. Purley Place and Croydon Street</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Cnr. Beach Park Avenue and Croydon Street</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### List of Palimpsests

The movie files for the palimpsest projections can be downloaded from https://www.dropbox.com/sh/18ti25aa5ritd14/35D18Wzpp

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Cnr. Cronulla Street and Surf Road</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Cnr. Cronulla Street and Ocean Grove Avenue</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Elliot Tuthill House, cnr. Croydon Street and Cronulla Street</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Cronulla Street in 1973 is now Cronulla Mall, and the man drinking his espresso now would then be sitting in the back seat of the Kingswood parked at the curb. Cafés, gift stores and a wine bar have replaced the supermarket, chemists, shoe store, butcher and fruit and veg shops. The Cronulla Observer has gone – it ceased publication in 1979. Although the awning hooks don’t appear to have changed, Cronulla Mall is now a leisure destination and no longer a local shopping precinct catering for the basic food, clothing, footwear, and information needs of local residents.
Cnr. Ocean Grove Avenue and Cronulla Street

The old Golden Fleece service station ('Fill 'er up with Goldie') is gone, replaced with high-rise apartments. What was once a hair salon is now a place to get a Chinese massage. Traffic is now banned, and pedestrians can walk around freely, or enjoy a latte in the shade in the middle of what was once a street. No more Valiants or Austins are on the streets. The building that used to house the hair salon has been doubled in size, maintaining something of the character and appearance of the old building, but modernized. This suggests a tension between maintaining the character of the old building while accommodating new uses – without changing the appearance too much.
Once there were establishments for billiards, a newsagent, pharmacy, fruit and veg shops, a butcher and a store for fine apparel for men: now you can get a hot sea salt body scrub, shop for Funky Femme female clothing and accessories, and eat potato wedges on the street. Trees replace the asphalt. Ready-made food replaces the raw ingredients you would buy to take home and cook for the family. What happened to the Rural Bank? Clothes are less formal and there are less of them – possibly the weather, but also suggests changes in habits between then and now. The litter bins are bigger now.
15 Surf Lane
Traversi Jones is now Mitre 10, and the surfer's VW Kombi is now the plumber's Toyota van. A man is wheeling the stroller in 2011 in this photograph. In 1973, in other photographs in the series, it is a woman who is wheeling the child around. The Chess Club and the Camera Club have lost their signage on the School of Arts, which has been refreshed sometime recently by the look of the paint job. There is no graffiti in 1973.
Not only is the Hewsons’ van no longer parked in Surf Lane, Hewsons is no longer trading. The local electronics and whitegoods stores have been replaced with national chains like The Good Guys, JB Hi-Fi, and the large department stores, which have moved to the greenfields shopping malls and out of the suburban shopping streets. The trees have grown, and so have the apartment buildings. Bright lighting and a pedestrian crossing have appeared, signaling more activity on the road and a greater need to protect pedestrian (or the local council’s increased risk-averseness).
The Arts Theatre survives, and so does, surprisingly, the shoe shop. The public library has gone (moved to a new, larger building close to the Mall). Instead of the Estate Agent, there is yet another café, bringing life to the pavement. The cars are notable for the comparison between the styles of the 1970s and those of today. *On Golden Pond* – written by American Ernest Thompson – is playing at the Arts Theatre. In 1973 it was Czech-born British playwright Tom Stoppard’s *The Real Inspector Hound*. Is this a reflection of the change in focus in Australian society between 1973 and 2011: away from our European heritage towards our American friends? Prominent red-lidded bins on the street suggest increased consumption and more waste generation than before.
29 Woolworths and Coles are gone, moved to the greenfields shopping malls that you need a car to visit. Woolworths – the location can be identified easy by the skeletal remains of the old sign – is now Hot Dollar, and Coles is now a Rip Curl outlet – not places where you can buy groceries, meat, bread or fruit and vegetables anymore. Kodak film is no longer available at every chemist. The encroachment of the pedestrian spaces onto the road has not been completely successful, and there appears to be an uneasy relationship between the people and the cars. The greenery provided by the palms and other trees is attractive, and changes the character of the place.
Cnr. Purley Place and Croydon Street

Coles has gone, replaced by surf shop Rip Curl. The Jean Shoppe is now St George Bank, and the traffic arrangements reflect the increased management of cars required – or at least imposed – on today’s motorists. The weatherboard house with the verandahs built-in (to accommodate more residents, perhaps?) is now a modern office block housing The Creative Company – a design group – and a firm of mortgage brokers and finance managers. Hardly standard industries in a suburban shopping centre 38 years ago. Surveillance cameras may monitor and record you, and a pair of shoes with the laces tied together has been flung over the street light post, maybe suggesting drugs are available close by despite the surveillance.
35 Cnr. Beach Park Avenue and Croydon Street

That could be me walking away from the camera in the 1973 photograph. It certainly reminds me of me back then – the hair, the light frame, the thongs. The posters on the wall in the 1973 photograph are advertising *The Sunshine Sea* – a surfing film that was released in 1971 (apparently *The Sunshine Sea* was a repackaging of *Waves of Change*, made in 1969). The chemist, launderette and fish and chips shop have been replaced by the convenience store and a café and a restaurant. An apartment block has replaced the block of flats from 1973. This is quite close to the Cronulla railway station, so it makes sense to increase the housing stock here, it’s much more efficient. The move from supermarkets – Woolworths, Coles, Permewa, Safeways and Flemings all had stores around Cronulla Street in 1972, now there is just the convenience store by the station – and the loss of the butchers and the fruit and veg shops all indicate a change of lifestyle from preparing food at home to convenience meals and cafés, or travelling by car to the sprawling mall and shopping there, buying much more than you would have needed, apparently, in 1973.
10 Cnr. Cronulla Street and Surf Road

Trees grow in full colour as if by magic as the view transforms from the monochrome of 1973 to the full colour of 2011. People can now stand and chat on what was once a pedestrian crossing. Dino’s Bistro has gone upmarket, transformed into the Thai Riffic restaurant – signaling a changing taste in food in Australia. Peters Ice Cream is no longer “The Health Food of a Nation”. The Holdens, VWs and Minis are replaced by the Japanese Mazdas and GM world cars.
Cnr. Cronulla Street and Ocean Grove Avenue

The Commonwealth Bank survives, but it has changed its image over the years from the savings bank that used to be owned by the government to the CAN of today. The building societies have gone, victims of government policy, acquisitions and changing circumstances in the communities that once supported them. The Health and Bulk Foods Delicatessen is gone, replaced with Runnulla on the street front and Ritz_Chix bar and gourmet food next door. Upstairs there is yoga.
Harvey Real Estate is now Elliot Tuthill House, with Toni & Guy Hairdressing on the ground floor. Elliot Tuthill are a firm of solicitors whose history in the building goes back to 1958. Holdens and Fords predominate, and the old Austin A40 Cambridge is driving on what is now the wrong side of the road – the road having been rerouted slightly to accommodate the encroachment of pedestrians and palm trees. A Mercedes van now occupies the space where the Austin once drove.
CRONULLA STREET, SUMMER. 1973-2011

An exhibition of photographs taken in 1973 and rephotographed in 2011
24 – 28 September 2012

TEAL Room | INSPIRE Centre | Building 25 | University of Canberra
13. The shadow in 1973 suggests a thinner me with longer hair. In 2011 I found the spot again and rephotographed the image.
CRONULLA STREET, SUMMER. 1973-2011

I started my PhD program with the theme *User-generated images in space, time and place*. I wanted to explore how photographs turn a space – a location – into a place: worthy of our recognition as significant in our culture. My approach was to try and make sense of the avalanche of other people’s images becoming available over the internet, by location and by time. As I explored the theme more, I became more interested in my own photographs and what they told me about my own history.

All the photographs in this exhibition were taken in the same location – around Cronulla Street in Cronulla, New South Wales – 38 years apart.

In 1973 I was enrolled in the Architecture undergraduate degree program at the University of New South Wales. I had started the program the year before after I had found out at a party from a student doing Architecture there, Les Deutsch, that students doing Architecture at the University of New South Wales learned how to make films, and I wanted to learn how to make films. As it was, mine was the only film produced that year, 1972, and early the following year I left the university and joined Film Australia as a production assistant, where I *really* learned how to make films.

Before I left the university, we had been given an assignment to develop a proposal to turn the Cronulla Street suburban shopping strip into a pedestrian mall. I left before completing the assignment.

Almost forty years later, when looking for some 35mm negatives to practice scanning for my PhD project, I came across an old box of keepsakes from my youth, and in the box were six strips of black and white TRI-X negatives: six in each strip, making 36 images in all. When I scanned the first few images, I remembered the project. One of the images, 32 (the images are named after the edge-numbers of the original negatives), showed the street signs at the corner of Purley Place and Croydon Street. Using Google Maps, I searched for the corner of the two streets, and opening up Street View I located the same place today. After several days of scanning and consulting Google Maps and Street View, I had located with reasonable certainty most of the images. I transferred the locations into a small GPS unit, and set off for the location where I thought 00 had been taken. When I arrived there, there is was – the same location, but now a pedestrian mall: Cronulla Mall. Over the new few hours, I used the GPS to find the location of almost all the original images, and rephotographed the scenes.
The exhibition shows the contrast between then and now. Comparing each set, one can see the changes in the place that have happened over time – unremarkable changes that nonetheless confront us with the differences in our urban environment now when compared with just forty years ago. The fish and chips shops and the milk bars have gone, to be replaced with continental-style street cafés. The brand-name supermarkets have left for the greenfields shopping malls: five or six names most of which have disappeared, to be replaced by Hot-Dollar, Ripcurl and trinket-stores. The building societies are gone, the cars have changed, people dress differently. Surrounding the area large apartment blocks have appeared.

The original photographs allow me to see the changes that have been happening around me, changes that would otherwise have gone unremarked and indeed unnoticed but for the photographs. A bit like the books of Hugh Lunn on the changes in Australian language: Lost for Words and Words Fail Me. You don’t know what you’ve lost till it’s gone, and until you are reminded of the past and can contrast it with the present.

James Steele
September 2012

james.steele@anu.edu.au
http://jamessteele.me
Hugh Lunn’s *Lost for Words* and *Words Fail Me*

I’m intrigued by language as communication (written and spoken, visual and auditory, kinesthetic), and can see elements of what Hugh Lunn laments as ‘Australia’s lost language’, in his books *Lost for Words* and *Words Fail Me*, in the relationship between the images captured in 1973 and those of today. For me, there is a certain nostalgia for the past we see there, my past (although I have been to Cronulla twice in my entire life – once to take the first set of photographs, and again in early 2011 to rephotograph them), that is reinforced by reading the local newspaper of the day, the *Cronulla Observer*.

What was captured in these 1973 photographs no longer exists. We prefer constancy to change, and are fooled into believing that there is constancy because of requirements that things new fit in with the old, but in fact we are not fooled and don’t get the full value of the building investment in the new spaces that are created. Things move slowly and it is the camera that provides us with the evidence, especially when we have a similar image as a reference to compare it with, gives us the opportunity to reflect from our own perspective on the changes that have been wrought. For me, there is a sense of nostalgia for the old Australia of my childhood, but an appreciation for how far we have come over that time, it is far more different that I would have appreciated before comparing these images.

Lunn was interviewed on the Australian Broadcasting Corporation’s *Lingua Franca* program on 13 November 2010, *Australia’s lost lingo*, about his books, and he considers whether the language of the 1950s and 1960s that is lost is an anglo language, and his nostalgia is for a lost anglo past that has been replaced, or morphed into, a multicultural and globalised society. I wonder the same thing about my reaction to these photographs.


> There is now a widespread idea that nostalgic feelings about the past are inherently vicious. One ought apparently to live in a continuous present, a minute-to-minute cancellation of memory, and if one thinks of the past at all it should merely be in order to thank God that we are so much better than we used to be. This seems to me a sort of intellectual face-lifting, the motive behind which is a snobbish terror of growing old. One ought to realize that a human being cannot continue developing indefinitely, and that a writer in particular is throwing away his heritage if he repudiates the experience of his early life. ... The great thing is to be your age, which includes being honest about your social origins.
While trying to identify the locations of the few photographs that I couldn't find with Street View, I researched The Cronulla Observer, in 1973 the local suburban newspaper that has now ceased publication. There I found an essay written by Gillian Edwards, a class 6AC student from Cronulla Primary School. The essay was the runner-up in an ANZ Bank Essay Competition, and was titled Cronulla 50 Years from Now. I would love to find Gillian to ask her permission to include the essay along with my work, but so far I have been unable to locate her. If you’re out there, Gillian, or someone knows you, please contact me.

CRONULLA 50 YEARS FROM NOW

We publish the runner-up in the recent ANZ Bank Essay Competition for Primary Schools. Gillian Edwards, class 6AC, Cronulla primary school, has this to say about our town in 50 years from now.

Cronulla, 50 years from now, could be a completely different place. Cronulla Street would be a mass of bustling people scurrying to offices crammed with people attending their businesses. Cars would be banned from the streets; park benches and beds of dazzling flowers replacing them. A university, with winding stairs and large diaphanous windows would spring up and students would mingle with the crowd, adding to the daily clamour.

Pollution conquered, the azure-blue skies would be smoke-free, and Gunnamatta Bay would regain its beauty and will be fit to swim in once again. The inhabitants of the water would return. Home units would be ripped down—a mass of rubble and ruin—and modern homes replace the sun blockers.

Side cafés and modern hotel-motels would be tourist attractions and air polluting vehicles will be replaced by monorails and hovercraft. Houses will be built for everyone, not just the extravagantly rich people.

Jets and streamlined ships would fill the sea and sky, and tourists would travel the world in a matter of hours. Home luxuries will be greatly increased, with the introduction of colour television computers will be introduced into the modernised universities, and public school teachers will be in lesser demand.

Tree-lined avenues will be a popular sight, while plain-cemented sidewalks will have vanished. Dogs and cats will have their own beauty parlour in the main street, while elegant fashions will disappear and swinging fashions will replace them.

Cronulla will emerge as a whole new district. Children will be freer, more wild and adventurous, prices will decrease and luxuries will be easier to afford, public parks and amusement parks will be sprouting up and life will be more easy and carefree.

An old person’s home will be constructed, giving homeless people a chance to revive their strength and give them figure to start a new life. Public libraries will be scattered about and a greater variation in stories will be available.

Discipline in schools will be less strict, and the school uniform will consist of something other than the drab uniforms of today.

Cronulla will be a place of great beauty as I have described as long as someone does something immediately about the township, otherwise things will be quite different. If something isn’t done, children of the future could grow up without even seeing a tree.

We must preserve the natural beauty of Cronulla or else!

Cronulla Observer, 18 January 1973, p. 5
Top Aussie records of 1973

Like the original 1973 photographs, the songs of the past also evoke memories otherwise long forgotten.

These are the top 20 singles from 1973, according to GO SET magazine.

1. *Heaven is My Woman's Love*  
   Col Joye
2. *You Don't Own Me*  
   The Ormsby Brothers
3. *The World's Greatest Mum*  
   Johnny Chester
4. *Your Mama Don't Dance*  
   The Bootleg Family
5. *Suzie Darling*  
   Barry Crocker
6. *Cassandra*  
   Sherbet
7. *Neither One of Us*  
   Miss Linda George
8. *Venus*  
   Jamie Redfern
9. *Je t'aime*  
   Abigail
10. *Rock and Roll (I Gave You the Best Years of My Life)*  
    Kevin Johnson
11. *Goondiwindi Grey*  
    Tex Morton
12. *Everything is Out of Season*  
    Johnny Farnham
13. *Don't You Know It's Magic*  
    Johnny Farnham
14. *Hound Dog*  
    Sherbet
15. *Wings of an Eagle*  
    Johnny Farnham
16. *I Can't Dance to Your Music*  
    Ross Ryan
17. *I Am Pegasus*  
    Johnny Ashcroft
18. *Playground in My Mind*  
    Jamie Redfern
19. *Rainbow on the River*  
    Fantasy
20. *Marrow Song*  

– GO SET magazine
The Hazel de Berg collection

Hazel de Berg was an oral historian. According to the National Library of Australia, she recorded interviews with thousands of Australian poets, playwrights, writers, academics, filmmakers and others between the 1960s and the 1980s. Below is listed the names of the people she interviewed in 1973, from the National Library’s online catalogue.

Some of the interviews can be heard online: the links for those are listed.

The recordings give us another insight into the Australia from 1973 that otherwise would have been lost to us.

Hazel de Berg was my aunt, my mother’s sister. Listening recently to a recording that Hazel had done of my mother reading her own poetry made me realise how much our recollections of the past have been shaped by the media, and how our own histories can be preserved by photographs, recordings and letters in a way that reflects a more personal view of the past.

Some of the recordings will be playing during the exhibition.

[undated] Amy Cumpston (McGrath)
22 January 1973 Herman David Black
23 January 1973 Harry M. Miller
24 January 1973 Donald Horne
13 February 1973 Derek Broadbent
15 February 1973 Susan Yorke
5 March 1973 Robert Brown
11 March 1973 Betty Burstall
12 March 1973 Alma De Groen
12 March 1973 George White
24 March 1973 Geoffrey De Groen
29 March 1973 Ross Edwards
9 May 1973 Andrew Andersons
12 June 1973 Roger McKnight
13 July 1973 Tim Burstall
13 July 1973  Phillip Adams
14 July 1973  Mary Finnin
14 July 1973  Ivan Southall
15 July 1973  Jack Hibberd
15 July 1973  Leslie James Blake
16 July 1973  Myra Roper
16 July 1973  Alexander Buzo
16 July 1973  John Timlin
17 July 1973  John Mockridge
17 July 1973  Barry Oakley
18 July 1973  Edwin Sherbon Hills
26 August 1973  Bart Bok
29 August 1973  James Murdoch
31 August 1973  Raymond Hanson
7 September 1973  Pro Hart
10 September 1973  Tony White
17 September 1973  Wilda Moxham
20 September 1973  Alfred Dangerfield
2 October 1973  Alison Bauld
12 October 1973  Rex Cramphorn
22 October 1973  Mary Drake
7 November 1973  Margaret Jones
8 November 1973  Robert Raymond
9 November 1973  Roger Woodward
13 November 1973  George F. Miller
25 November 1973  Elspeth Pender Dransfield
2 December 1973  Joan Clarke
3 December 1973  Ann (Annie) Tregenza
4 December 1973  Valmai Phillips
6 December 1973  John Andrews
12 December 1973  John Armstrong
13 December 1973  Tom W. Young
14 December 1973  Kenneth Rowell
18 December 1973  John Bell

* speaks of her son Michael John Pender Dransfield
The photographs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title*</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Latitude, Longitude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00</td>
<td>22 Cronulla Street</td>
<td>34.0520° S, 151.1530° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04</td>
<td>cnr. Ocean Grove Avenue and Cronulla Street</td>
<td>34.0533° S, 151.1525° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06</td>
<td>cnr. Purley Place and Cronulla Street</td>
<td>34.0535° S, 151.1524° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09</td>
<td>65 Cronulla Street</td>
<td>34.0538° S, 151.1523° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>cnr. Cronulla Street and Surf Road</td>
<td>34.0541° S, 151.1522° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Surf Lane</td>
<td>34.0552° S, 151.1525° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Surf Lane</td>
<td>34.0561° S, 151.1526° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Arts Theatre Café, Surf Road</td>
<td>34.0546° S, 151.1526° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>School of Arts, Surf Road</td>
<td>34.0545° S, 151.1523° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>cnr. Cronulla Street and Surf Road</td>
<td>34.0545° S, 151.1521° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>102 Cronulla Street</td>
<td>34.0545° S, 151.1521° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>cnr. Cronulla Street and Ocean Grove Avenue</td>
<td>34.0533° S, 151.1526° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>cnr. Purley Place and Croydon Street</td>
<td>34.0534° S, 151.1514° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Elliot Tuthill House, cnr. Croydon Street and Cronulla Street</td>
<td>34.0557° S, 151.1517° E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>cnr. Beach Park Avenue and Croydon Street</td>
<td>34.0557° S, 151.1518° E</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* The title is based on the edge number of the original 1973 negative (with the addition of a preceding 0 for the numbers before 10, so that the digital files sort properly).