SOCIETY AND THOUGHT IN
EASTERN AUSTRALIA, 1835-1851

Michael Roe

Thesis submitted for the
degree of Doctor of Philosophy
in the Australian National University
The work for this thesis was conducted entirely by the candidate.

Michael Roe

(Owen) Michael Roe
The thesis deals with the colonies of New South Wales and Van Diemen's Land; it begins when J.T. Bigge's ideal had come to crisis, and ends with the gold rushes. By "J.T. Bigge's ideal" is meant a society in which the Church of England and a land-owning elite joined with the executive government to establish a way of life, both hierarchical and harmonious. The Church and the gentry respectively comprise the core of the first two chapters, which describe the ideology and strength of colonial conservatism. In the former the central figure is W.G. Broughton, first Anglican bishop in Australia and remarkably sensitive to the difficulties which beset the conservative ideal. His beliefs and insight shape not only this chapter but the whole thesis. Following a description of the typical Anglican reaction to the major features of colonial life, particular emphasis is placed on the Church's attempt to assert its opinion sometimes through, sometimes against the power of the State. Here, as at many other places throughout the thesis, the education issue becomes very prominent. The Church appears as the strongest bastion of conservative thought, denouncing every aspect of society which made for change and disruption.
Although not numerous, there were other thinkers who proudly claimed to be conservative. To represent these, the second section of chapter one gives an account of the Sydney Morning Herald's editorial policy. In the thirties the journal was ultra-Tory, in the forties an intelligent disciple of the classic political economy of Adam Smith and his school.

Although the gentry suffered heavily during the forties, they remained coherent enough to study as a group. In chapter II stress is put on the degree of social responsibility among them, and so their capacity to play the role of leadership which Bigge had postulated. This involves discussion of their family background and way of life, their attitude to political and economic questions. The final section of this chapter describes other sources of support for conservatism - higher civil servants, merchant princes, Governors Fitzroy and Denison.

The four chapters which comprise part two of the thesis investigate factors inimical to conservatism. First is the squatting movement. Many participants were conservative by instinct and taste, but the nature of their pursuit forced them to oppose authority, to arouse antagonism among all other groups, to break the gentry, and to strengthen the forces of barbarism. Following the Waste Lands Act of 1846
this position altered, but before 1850 not enough to affect the general picture. The following chapter concentrates on political history in order to indicate deep-rooted forces subversive of general stability. First, attention is paid to the desire of all colonists, 'natural' conservatives well to the fore, to secure self-government. No man could anchor his ideas to a settled constitution, everyone talked of political rights and the need for change. Next appear the 'Australians' - successors to the old emancipist party and bearing witness that the penal system had bestowed a legacy of men inclined to opportunism and barren assertion. Finally, the rise of working-class, more or less democratic, feeling attracts notice.

The third and fourth chapters of part two study the 'disruptive' quality of the remaining two branches of Christianity - the Roman Catholic Church and Protestantism. Both were strong enough to rule out any possibility of society achieving union through common religious belief, or - in more practical terms - the ascendancy of the Church of England. Both encouraged that secular liberalism which Broughton detested; Rome especially forged strong links with political radicalism. Extremists in each camp execrated the other, and behaved in such a way as to foment malice, fear, and hatred.
Therefore the pillars which Bigge had designed were not strong enough to maintain Australian society. Anarchy, greed, factionalism and mutual antipathies threatened to run rampant. Whence was to come that Authority, necessary to the survival of every group?

The answer is 'Moral Liberalism', a concept described in the final part of the thesis. Sprung from the Enlightenment, and more immediately from Transcendentalists and Utilitarians, this creed taught that men could create Utopia on earth, and that striving to do so fulfilled the supreme end of man. The transformation of human nature and the human environment could come about in various ways - through applying the mind, through understanding the psyche, and through exercising the will. These three components of moral liberalism are studied in turn. In connexion with the first arise ideas concerning education, the arts, and science; with the second, phrenology and mesmerism; with the third, the Temperance movement. A further section describes the essential, if not fully acknowledged, antipathy between moral liberalism and traditional Christianity. This theoretical discussion takes two chapters, while a third measures the practical acceptance of the creed by 1850; then the reasons for this acceptance, and its import for the history of Australia and even the wider world.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AC</td>
<td>Australasian Chronicle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AE</td>
<td>Australian Encyclopaedia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.N.U.</td>
<td>Australian National University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.N.L.</td>
<td>Commonwealth National Library</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO</td>
<td>Colonial Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CT</td>
<td>Colonial Times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Col</td>
<td>Colonist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Col Ob</td>
<td>Colonial Observer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>J.A. Ferguson, <em>Bibliography of Australia</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FP</td>
<td>Free Press</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gdn</td>
<td>Guardian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>House of Commons. When followed by a date, the reference is to an official paper then published.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRA</td>
<td>Historical Records of Australia, series one.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HS</td>
<td>Historical Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HTC</td>
<td>Hobart Town Courier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hob Gdn</td>
<td>Hobarton Guardian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IE</td>
<td>Irish Exile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LC</td>
<td>Legislative Council. See note to HC above.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LE</td>
<td>Launceston Examiner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBC</td>
<td>Moreton Bay Courier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ML</td>
<td>Mitchell Library</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Note: the above require collation with the Bibliography.

'Tasmanian' is used as an adjective, but not 'Tasmania' as a noun.

The Tasmanian heads of government are referred to as Governors, although their true title was Lieutenant Governor.

Sir John Eardley Eardley-Wilmot is referred to as Sir Eardley Wilmot or Eardley-Wilmot.

The terms ex-convict and emancipist are used interchangeably.

Hobart is generally used in preference to the technically correct 'Hobart Town'.

Land acquired by either grant or purchase is described as freehold.
The number of an item in Ferguson's Bibliography is given either when identification of that item might prove difficult, or when the mere title or existence of the item supports the point made in the text.

Most newspaper references are to editorials, or to reports sufficiently indicated by the text. Where identification might prove difficult supplementary information is given in brackets after the citation of the date.

'Page', 'date', 'question number' (in the case of evidence before official enquiries), 'folio' (in the case of CO material) have been omitted.

References are given to the most accessible source and/or the best account.
FACTUAL AND STATISTICAL INTRODUCTION

Contents

Personnel xi
Constitutional Development xi
The Church Acts xii
The Education Question: N.S.W. xiii
The Education Question: V.D.L. xiv
The Land Issue xiv
Transportation xvi
Census Material xvii
Official Budgets xix
Churches and Schools xx
Further Data Pertinent to Moral Liberalism xxi
Personnel

Imperial Secretaries of State for the Colonies:

12/34 - 4/35: G.H. Gordon, Earl of Aberdeen
4/35 - 2/39: Charles Grant, Baron Glenelg
9/39 - 9/41: John Russell, Earl Russell
9/41 - 12/45: E.G.G.S. Stanley, Earl of Derby
12/45 - 7/46: W.E. Gladstone

Governors of N.S.W.:

12/31 - 12/37: Richard Bourke
2/38 - 7/46: George Gipps
8/46 - 1/55: C.A. Fitzroy

Colonial Secretaries of N.S.W.:

1/26 - 1/37: Alexander Macleay
1/37 - 6/56: E. Deas Thomson

Heads of Administration in Port Phillip:

9/36 - 9/39: William Lonsdale (Administrator)
10/39 - 6/51: C.J. La Trobe (Superintendent)
10/46 - 1/57: Lonsdale (acting Superintendent)

Lieutenant-Governors of V.D.L.:

5/24 - 10/36: George Arthur
[11/36 - 1/37: Kenneth Snodgrass, Administrator]
1/37 - 8/43: John Franklin
8/43 - 10/46: J.E. Eardley-Wilmot
[10/46 - 1/47: La Trobe, Administrator]
1/47 - 1/55: W.T. Denison

Colonial Secretaries of V.D.L.:

8/34 - 2/42: John Montagu
2/42 - 4/43: G.T.W.B. Boyes
4/43 - 2/51: J.E. Bicheno

Constitutional Development

At the end of the 1820's executive and legislative Councils functioned in both colonies. The former comprised
the chief officers of the administration; the latter, fifteen men of whom eight were officials and the remainder private citizens. All legislators were nominated by the executive, with whom lay virtually all power. Agitation for extension of self-government is described in the text.

1840: Lord John Russell introduced a Bill granting representative institutions in N.S.W., but it was withdrawn.

1842: Constitution Act established representative institutions in N.S.W. The legislative council henceforth consisted of thirty-six members; of these twenty-four were elected and twelve were nominated, six of the nominees being officials and six private citizens. Candidates had to own substantial property and electors at least to occupy a dwelling of £20 per annum value (i.e., a '£20' franchise prevailed). The Governor retained very substantial powers, especially in matters of finance and by having the right to withhold approval of legislation.

1850: The Australian Colonies Government Act separated Port Phillip from N.S.W. and constituted it as the colony of Victoria; both these and in V.D.L. representative government on the N.S.W. pattern was introduced. A £10 franchise henceforth prevailed in all three colonies.

All Acts referred to above were imperial.

The Church Acts

Occasional aid had been granted to denominations other than the Church of England since the colonies' early years. This was systematised and greatly expanded by the local Acts, 7 Wm IV no 3 (N.S.W.), 1 Vic no 16 and 2 Vic no 17 (V.D.L.). In the senior colony provision was made for an official pound-for-pound subsidy (up to £1000) for church buildings of all Christian denominations; for ministers' stipends, up to £200 depending on the size of his congregation; and for the outfit and passage-money of ministers and schoolteachers. The V.D.L. Act named only the Church of England, the Church of Scotland, and Roman Catholicism; some help, however, was given to Methodists and Baptists (see, e.g., the Estimates for 1851, below). The nominal maximum figure for minister's stipends was £400, and the provisions for church-building similar to that in N.S.W.

The administrative history of this subject is confused. In V.D.L. the Treasury could not bear the strain thus
imposed, and hence the Act 4 Vic no 16 empowered the governor to treat claims under the earlier legislation at his discretion. In consequence few church-buildings received any subsidy thereafter, and the stipends advanced usually amounted to £200 or £250.

The 1842 Constitution Act altered the situation in N.S.W. by ordering that £30,000 per annum be set aside to discharge obligations arising under the Church Act. There was, of course, no reason why such obligations should approximate to that sum, and hence the problem arose as to how the £30,000 should be divided. From 1845 the principle was accepted that the relative strength of the different denominations at the 1841 census should be the chief determinant. But again, the exactness of the application of this principle is uncertain.

The dignitaries of the major churches received additional stipends. Various allowances - fodder, stationary, housing, etc. - also added to the total aid given to religion.

The Education Question: N.S.W.

Following lengthy consideration of the problem, Bourke in 1836 advanced in the legislature a plan to give state patronage only to schools conducted on the 'National' (or 'Stanley', or 'Irish') plan. Widespread opposition forced him to withdraw, however, and so aid continued to be given on rather haphazard basis, almost entirely to denominational schools.

1839-40: Gipps proposed separate schools for Roman Catholics, but all others to come under the British and Foreign Schools Society scheme. This too failed to carry the Council.

1843: J.D. Lang led feeling in the new legislature favourable to the National system.

1844: A committee of the legislature reported emphatically in favour of the National system. Its findings were endorsed by a narrow majority in the Council, but Gipps declined to act. Over the next few years advocates of National schools maintained a steady pressure.

1848: A compromise solution reached with the establishment of two boards, one Denominational and one National.
1850: James Martin led criticism in Council of the Denominational Board, but the dual system remained intact for many years.

The Education Question: V.D.L.

1838: Franklin introduced B & F system, although with sufficient latitude to allow subsidy to Roman Catholic schools. He would also have accepted a degree of Anglican denominationalism, but the clergy of that Church maintained a near-absolute refusal to co-operate.

1843: protests from the Church of England reached a climax. The issue was consequently forced before the Secretary-of-State (Stanley) who suggested in 1844 that the prevailing system in N.S.W. be followed. Sardley-Wilmot responded (1845) by appointing a Committee of Enquiry which, like himself, favoured continuation of the B & F system.

1846: Gladstone ordered revision of system, primarily to allow denominational schools.

1848: Denison followed this direction, first by introducing a Bill into the legislature and then, following its defeat, by administrative decision. The consequent situation was similar to that in N.S.W., except that the non-denominational schools continued to follow the B & F system.

1853: the denominational system abandoned.

The Land Issue

1829: the nineteen counties, roughly forming a semi-circle of 200 miles radius from Sydney were proclaimed. Outside these land could not be held on freehold. Over the following years additional counties were proclaimed - Macquarie and Stanley on the north coast; Auckland around Boyd Town on the south coast; Bourke around Melbourne; Grant around Geelong; and Normanby around Portland.

1831: the Ripon Regulations, applying to both colonies, forbade further land grants. Henceforth land was to be sold at a minimum of 5/- per acre. Bourke enforced the Regulations strictly, while Arthur evaded their spirit by issuing many 'promises to grant' in the months before they came into force.
1838: minimum price raised to 12/- per acre.

1839: Russell planned 'dismemberment' of N.S.W., i.e., division into Northern, Central and Southern districts, and consequent reorganisation of land policy. In May, instructions to this effect were sent to Gipps.

1840: strong feeling against this move both in England and N.S.W. caused withdrawal of the (imperial) statutory authorisation, and so the plan fell through. The only effect was that until August 1841 the price of land in Port Phillip was fixed at £1 per acre, and could be purchased by 'special survey'.

1842: the Constitution Act stressed that land policy remained an imperial concern. The coincident Australian Land Sales Act increased the minimum price of land in both colonies to £1 per acre. The system of sale was an amalgam of the fixed price and auction systems. The Act was not restricted to the counties, but probably very little land was sold under its provisions elsewhere. In fact, the history of the operation of this Act is even more obscure than the rest of this most complex subject. In V.D.L. it proved quite unworkable and was suspended in 1845.

1844: the climax of a series of local moves to regulate squatting (noticed in the text) came when Gipps promulgated a double set of regulations, one providing for immediate leasing, one for eventual purchase. The former proposed a licence fee of £10 per annum for every station - defined as an area covering 20 square miles, or capable of running 4000 sheep or 500 head of cattle, whichever was the greater. The latter would grant freehold over 320 acres, and secure tenure for eight years over the rest of a station in return for the payment of £320.

1846-47; after continued agitation the squatting problem was met by an imperial Act and an Order-in-Council. N.S.W. was divided into 'unsettled', 'intermediate' and 'settled' (largely the counties) districts. In the first leases were to be for fourteen years; in the second, for eight; in the third for one. Licence fees were added, but they were moderate; in addition lease-holders were granted extensive rights of pre-emption (confirmed by a further Order in 1850) and renewal. In fact, few squatters went beyond lodging claims for leases under the Order. This was sufficient, however, to vest them with actual possession.
Transportation

1837-38: the Molesworth (House of Commons) committee strongly reported against assignment. In consequent this system was abandoned (1840) and transportation to N.S.W. temporarily ceased altogether. Tasman's Peninsula and Norfolk Island were henceforth developed as special penal stations, and the probation system adopted in V.D.L. (1842). Under this convicts spent the first part of their sentence under confinement, the latter on the open labour market. Probation did not prove efficient, and soon became unpopular.

1844-45: the 'exile' system adopted, and hence convicts on tickets-of-leave and conditional pardons went to Port Phillip from Britain and V.D.L.

1846: Gladstone strove to re-model the system. He promised to suspend transportation to V.D.L. for two years; established the short-lived Gladstone colony (on north coast); and suggested that N.S.W. accept the transportation of selected convicts. A committee of the legislature approved the idea, although professing distress at the ultimate effect of transportation. Its report provoked very strong feeling against convictism.

1847 (February): Grey answered allegations from V.D.L. that Gladstone's promise of suspension was not being honoured, by acknowledging the need for further reform. But in April he announced the resumption of transportation of ticket-of-leave holders to the island, provoking great hostility.

1847 (September): the N.S.W. legislature responded to popular feeling by repudiating the report of the 1846 committee.

1847 (September): Grey suggested a new scheme for N.S.W. whereby free migrants would be assisted in proportion to the number of transportees. In April 1848 the local legislature approved, and on hearing this Grey at once (September) began to arrange for transportation, but not for free migration.

1849-50: the total effect of these events was to provoke the anti-transportation movement, properly so called. Highlights of this were the great protest meetings in Melbourne and Sydney in mid-1849 against the landing of convicts from the Hashemy and Randolph, at which considerable
militance appeared, and the formation of various associations, of which the chief was the Australasian League for the Abolition of Transportation (begun in Launceston, formally constituted in Melbourne, February 1851).

Census Material

N.S.W. 1841: the population totalled 130,856, of whom 87,298 were males. The free male population comprised 14,819 born in the colony (BC); 30,745 arrived free (AF); and 15,760 ex-convicts (ex). The free female population comprised 14,630 BC; 22,158 AF; and 3,637 ex. The bond male population amounted to 13,844, of whom 11,343 were assigned; the bond female 3,133 (1,838). The Church of England numbered 73,727 adherents; Presbyterians 13,153; Methodists 3,236; other Protestants 1,857; Roman Catholics 35,690; Jews 856; others 207.

N.S.W. 1851: the population totalled 187,243, of whom 106,229 were males. The free male population comprised 81,226 (BC plus AF) and 22,397 (ex); the free female 76,695 and 4,232. The bond male population amounted to 2,606, of whom 1,986 were ticket-of-leave holders; the bond female 87 (46).

The Church of England numbered 93,137 adherents; Presbyterians 18,156; Methodists 10,008; other Protestants 6,472; Roman Catholics 56,899; Jews 979; others 1,592. Of males under twenty-one 22,772 could not read; 8,246 could read only; 14,686 could read and write - for males over twenty-one the respective figures were 12,475; 7,222; 40,834 - for females under twenty-one 22,253; 9,593; 15,338 - for females over twenty-one 7,010; 6,842; 19,978.

The following occupation statistics were listed - Commerce and Manufactures 12,243; Agriculture 1,898; Grazing sheep 11,449; Grazing cattle 4,170; Horticulture 930; Other Labourers 10,875; Mechanics and Artificers 5,857; Male Domestic Servants 3,853; Female Domestic Servants 6,594; Ministers of Religion 283; Legal Profession 207; Medical Profession 326; Other Educated Persons 2,188; Pensioners, etc. 694; Other Occupations 6,337; Residue 109,159.

Victoria 1851: the population totalled 77,345, of whom 46,202 were males. The free male population comprised 43,006 (BC plus AF) and 3,053 (ex); the free female 30,784 and 356. The bond male population amounted to 143; the bond female to three.
The Church of England numbered 37,433 adherents; Presbyterians 11,608; Methodists 4,988; other Protestants 4,313; Roman Catholics 18,014; Jews 364; others 625. Of males under twenty-one 8,715 could not read; 3,183 could read only; 5,529 could read and write - for males over twenty-one the respective figures were 3,140; 2,977; 22,658 - for females under twenty-one 8,434; 3,494; 5,340; for females over twenty-one 1,668; 2,103; 10,104.

The following occupation statistics were listed - Commerce and Manufactures 5,020; Agriculture 3,953; Grazing sheep 6,139; Grazing stock 1,186; Horticulture 369; Other Labourers 6,026; Mechanics and Artificers 3,415; Male Domestic Servants 1,412; Female Domestic Servants 3,198; Ministers of Religion 89; Legal Profession 105; Medical Profession 151; Other Educated Persons 947; Paupers, etc. 146; Other Occupations 3,530; Residue 41,665.

V.D.L. 1842: the population totalled 58,902, of whom 40,796 were males. There were 37,088 free persons (21,972 male); 20,332 bond (17,632); 1,431 on the military establishment (1,163); and 43 aborigines (21). Of 57,420 persons (presumably the total population excepting aborigines and military) 6,299 males and 6,425 were BC; 7,761 and 6,731 AF; 7,912 and 1,960 ex; these comprising a total free population of 37,088. Other figures for this census are incomplete.

V.D.L. 1851: the population totalled 70,130, of whom 953 were on the military establishment and 568 convicts on public works. Of the remainder 43,127 were males. The free male population comprised 10,649 BC; 7,615 AF and 12,369 ex. The free female population comprised 10,941 BC; 6,970 AF and 3,534 ex. The bond male population comprised 12,494, of whom 7,295 were ticket-of-leave holders; the bond female 4,037, of whom 1,254 were ticket-of-leave holders and 1,312 in government employ.

The Church of England numbered 45,073 adherents; Presbyterians 4,485; Methodists 3,772; other Protestants 2,379; Roman Catholics 12,444; Jews 435; others 21. The following occupation statistics were listed - Landed Proprietors, Merchants, Bankers, and Professional 1,577; Shopkeepers 1,415; Mechanics 5,687; Farmers 2,533; Market Gardeners 281; Shepherds 1,445; Gardeners, Stockmen, and Farm Servants 9,731; Domestic 5,600; Boatmen 346; Coastal Seamen 341; Whalers 42; Others 39,611.

The figures for V.D.L. in 1842 were abstracted from Statistics of Van Diemen's Land for 1842-1844, Hobart, 1847; the remainder from the legislative council papers for the respective time and place. Particular care should be taken
before assuming that true answers were given concerning ex-convict status.

**Official Budgets**

The following figures are taken from the legislative council papers for 1850. N.S.W. still included Port Phillip. Emphasis is given to items particularly relevant to the text. The figures have been rounded out.

N.S.W. Estimated Revenue for 1851: the total estimated revenue from colonial sources was £368,090. Major items were customs on spirits £122,000, on tobacco £67,000, on other goods £29,000; excise on local spirits £5,000; assessment on stock beyond boundaries £30,000; postage £21,300; licences to retail spirits £37,000; night licences to publicans £3,600.

N.S.W. Estimated Expenditure for 1851: the total was £366,000. Major items were the civil establishment £33,156; police £73,252; gaols £19,736; medical establishment (including £100 for Vaccine Institution) and lunatic asylums £7,953; education £22,051 (Church of England £5,201; Presbyterians £2,399, including £88 to Free Church; Methodists £936; Congregationalists £170; Roman Catholics £3,000; remainder, National Schools); Charitable allowances (hospitals, Benevolent Society, paupers, etc.) £9,760.

Smaller items of interest included Colonial Museum £300; Sydney Mechanics Institute £200; Brisbane ditto £300; Port Phillip ditto £150; Sydney Botanic Gardens £916; Melbourne ditto £617; Protestant Orphan School £594; Roman Catholic ditto £355.

Further to this outlay was that ordered by the 1842 Act under the so-called Schedules A, B. and C. The two former provided that £51,600 be set aside for paying the salary and expenses of the Governor, the judges, the executive officers, and their departments. Schedule C was that which designated £30,000 for the maintenance of religion. In 1849 actual expenditure under this head was only £28,946. This maintained three bishops and 60 other clergy of the Church of England, one Archbishop and 34 other of the Roman Catholic Church, 17 Presbyterians, and five Methodists.

V.D.L. Estimated Revenue for 1851: the total was £147,502. Major items were customs £71,700; publicans' licences £9,300;
port and harbour dues, fees in magistrates' courts, grant from Imperial government £30,551 (providing for governor's salary, police and gaols, and £1,800 towards religious instruction).

V.D.L. Estimated Expenditure for 1851: the total was £145,920. Major items were civil establishment £31,807; judicial establishment £13,376; police and gaols £40,460; Religion £15,875 (including maintenance of 41 Anglican clergy, nine Presbyterians, four Roman Catholics, and grants of £500 to Methodists and £150 to Baptists); Education £4,320; charitable allowances £5,090.

Smaller items of interest included Royal Society £400; Museum £100; Horticultural Society Launceston £100; Public Library £100; Hobart Mechanics Institute £150; Launceston ditto £150; Hobart Mechanics School of Arts £100.

Churches and Schools in 1850

N.S.W. (other than Port Phillip): the Church of England had two bishops, 73 other clergy, 59 churches, and a large, indefinite, number of other places of worship. The 'official' Presbyterian church had 16 ministers, 13 churches, and 15 chapels. The Free Church had 13 Ministers, two churches, and 20 chapels. The Methodists had 15 ministers, 63 chapels and 76 other preaching places. The Congregationalists had four ministers and four chapels. The Baptists had two ministers, one deacon, and three chapels. The Jews had one rabbi and one synagogue. The Roman Catholics had one Archbishop, one bishop, 28 other clergy, 23 churches, and approximately 35 chapels.

92 Anglican schools taught 5,496 pupils; 42 Presbyterian taught 2,140; 36 Roman Catholic taught 2,865; 15 Methodist taught 1,080; 25 National taught 1,507; 279 private taught 7,850; Protestant Orphan school taught 159; Roman Catholic ditto taught 155.

Port Phillip: the Church of England had one bishop, 15 other clergy, four churches, and four chapels. The 'official' Presbyterian Church had three ministers, two churches, and five chapels. The Free Church had three ministers, two churches, and seven chapels. The Methodists had three ministers and eight chapels. The Congregationalists had six ministers and eight chapels. The Baptists had one minister. The Jews had one rabbi and one synagogue. The
Roman Catholics had eight clergy, three churches and three chapels.

24 Anglican schools taught 1,840 pupils; thirteen Roman Catholic 1,064; eight Presbyterian 265; five Methodist 459; four Congregationalist 226; no return from National Schools; 112 private teaching 3,197. The total number of schools in all N.S.W. thus listed was 659, teaching 28,604.

V.D.L.: the Church of England had one bishop, 48 other clergy, and 42 churches. The Church of Scotland had 13 ministers and 14 churches. The Methodists had seven ministers and 38 chapels. The Independents had eight ministers and 19 chapels. The Baptists had three ministers and three chapels. The Roman Catholics had one Bishop, three civil clergy and ten convict chaplains.

There were 72 Anglican schools, 10 conducted under the B & F system, one Methodist and four Roman Catholic. These altogether taught 3,712 pupils. In addition there were 123 private schools, 64 of which taught 1,733 (returns not available for remainder). Thus altogether 210 schools taught probably some 7,000.

The above statistics are extracted from the 'Blue Books'. They would not be fully comprehensive or perfectly accurate.

Further Data Pertinent to Moral Liberalism

Education groups further to those mentioned in the text include debating societies or Institutes at towns such as Newcastle, Bathurst, Goulburn, Singleton, East Maitland, Parramatta and Ipswich. In Sydney, N.J. Kentish, James Martin, and the Australian College organised short-lived groups. Closer study would undoubtedly turn up many additions to this list.

For a statement of membership of the Sydney Institute see G.H. Nadel, Australia's Colonial Culture, 283. Slightly different figures appear in a paper ordered to be printed 29/6/47. This shewed a steady increase since 1844, the current total being 541 annual members and 48 life members. In Melbourne the total was 220. The Report of the Hobart Institute for 1850 (published Hobart, 1851) listed four life, three honorary, 160 annual, and 212 quarterly members.

Temperance and/or Total Abstinence groups existed in most provincial towns. Some are mentioned in the text,
others included Parramatta, O'Connell Plains, Bathurst, Goulburn, Liverpool, Maitland, Newcastle, Portland, Geelong (N.S.W.); New Norfolk, Huon Valley, Ross, Evandale, Perth, Brown's River (V.D.L.). The Launceston group was known as the Tasmanian Teetotal Society. By 1845 3,000 were said to have signed the abstinence pledge in Sydney (SMH, 19/9/45), and 1,000 in Hobart (HTC, 25/1/45).

The Standard of Tasmania, 23/10/51, gave an account of a conference recently held under the auspices of the Tasmanian Total Abstinence Agency Association. The Association itself had been established fourteen months earlier, and maintained an itinerant lecturer. According to this report the V.D.L. Total Abstinence Society had 1,000 active members, with 4,000 signatures to its pledge; the Hobart Town Total Abstinence Society had 7,261 signatures, and claimed 4,359 were faithful teetotallers; the Hobart Town Catholic Total Abstinence Society had 5,660 signatures.
INTRODUCTION

This study aims to discover the Authority which maintained society in N.S.W. and V.D.L. immediately prior to the great gold discoveries. During the very early years of the colonies' history despotism, oligarchy and the force of arms had played this part. No more sophisticated development was possible in mere penal stations, far removed from their metropolis. But as the settlements changed from gaols to colonies, a different answer became necessary. John Thomas Bigge recognised the problem, and put forward a solution which the Imperial government duly accepted. Executive power remained strong, but no longer stood alone: the Church of England and a landed squirarchy joined it as pillars of a conservative society. Until the mid-'thirties this tripartite force continued supreme, although many difficulties and opponents rose to confront it. The thesis takes up the story from when this challenge became truly formidable, and explores its outcome.

Few of the people and still fewer of the ideas mentioned in the text were native to Australia.
This is the history of a derived culture; roots and parallels, European and American, could be traced at vast length. Yet the new environment often forced the growth of popular thought rather than stunting it. "As in a smaller Colonial area", James Bonwick wrote when comparing Tasmanian intellectual life of the 'forties with what he had known in England, "men of varied and even conflicting views mingled in discussion, a livelier spirit of enquiry was excited." The Australian colonies provided a stadium in which men upholding ideologies of the Early Victorian era fought out a dramatic battle.

1 An Octogenarian's Reminiscences : 247.
CONTENTS

FACTUAL AND STATISTICAL INTRODUCTION x
INTRODUCTION xxiii

PART ONE - CONSERVATISM

I CONSERVATIVE IDEOLOGY

As Expressed by the Church of England 1
As Expressed by the Sydney Morning Herald 38

II CONSERVATIVE POWER

The Gentry 80
The Gentry and Constitutional Structure 101
The Gentry and Social-Economic Structure 123
Actual and Potential Allies of the Gentry 147

PART TWO - FACTORS DISRUPTIVE OF CONSERVATISM

III "THAT GIGANTIC ANOMALY, THE SQUATTING SYSTEM OF NEW SOUTH WALES"

Squatters and Law 159
Squatters and other classes 182
Squatters and Civilisation 203

IV RADICAL POLITICS : NEW CLAIMS AND CONFLICT

The Demand for Self-Government 218
'Australians' in N.S.W. Politics 226
Orthodox Radicalism in N.S.W. Politics 256
Tasmanian Counterparts 293

V THE ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH AND ITS MEMBERS

The Encouragement of Radicalism and Liberalism 304
Friction Within the Church 341
From Strength Towards Aggression 356
Contents

VI PROTESTANTISM

The Quality of Protestantism 381
Self-Will Rampant 400
"The Pride of Equality" 413
Sectarianism 425
Protestantism as a Social Ethic 435

PART THREE - THE 'NEW FAITH' : MORAL LIBERALISM

VII THE CREED AND ITS DISCIPLES

Statement in Brief 449
Appeal to the Mind : Culture 456
Appeal to the Psyche : Phrenology and Mesmerism 497

VIII THE CREED AND ITS DISCIPLES (CONTINUED)

Appeal to the Will : Temperance 508
What of the Soul? Moral Liberalism and Christianity 538

IX DIFFUSION THROUGHOUT POPULAR AND PUBLIC LIFE

Extent 572
Explanation 625
Exegesis 643

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY 651
PART ONE

CONSERVATISM
I CONSERVATIVE IDEOLOGY

As Expressed by the Church of England

There were nonconformists in the Australian colonies who preached the glory of servants' subordination to their masters, Sabbath observance as an inducement to docile industry, and the diffusion of their creeds as an answer to popular discontent. John McGarvie, leader of many of Sydney's Presbyterians, attacked every form of innovation with skill and pertinacity. The Roman Catholic Church, here as elsewhere, was hierarchical and authoritarian. Why then should the Church of England, which moreover enjoyed no absolute unity in either secular or spiritual affairs, have unique status as an upholder of conservatism? The obvious answer is bluntly empiric: more Anglicans advanced a more intelligent and comprehensive theory of social conservatism.

1 Gleaner: II, 227 (J. Beazley); II, 35; HTC 24/3/49 (F. Haller at Colonial Missionary Society meeting); LE 9/9/43 (H. Reed at Sunday School Anniversary).

2 He was a regular contributor to the SMH. See also A Funeral Sermon..., Sydney 1848; ML MS A2062.
McGarvie himself recognised the Church of England as "the only barrier agt. the inroads of Popery and Practical Paganism." But this was no accidental phenomenon. Conservatism in the colonies drew heavily from idealisation of the English past; the Church which had long been so powerful in England thus had a peculiarly strong and vital link with this ideology.

The origins of Anglicanism in Australia were notable only in that from the outset the state did recognise its existence, however cursorily. Similarly, many years elapsed before a clergyman of superior rank took office, T.H. Scott becoming Archdeacon in 1824, yet the move promised to confirm the superior wealth and power of his Church. By 1828 that prospect was already fading, but no year was more important in Anglican history for Scott was then succeeded by William Grant Broughton,

---

3 Letter to Mr Allen, 9/8/44 : ML MS A2062.
later to become Bishop of Australia (1835), and finally metropolitan and Bishop of Sydney (1847). Pure and sweet of character, Broughton dedicated his considerable abilities to strengthening the Church in Australia. His personal letters (especially to Edward Coleridge, master at Eton) and public actions expressed a forthright view of society, around which this chapter is constructed. The other episcopal leaders were Francis Russell Nixon (Tasmania 1842), Charles Perry (Melbourne 1847), and William Tyrrell (Newcastle 1847). Nixon was a fascinating man, if not wholly attractive. Talent, vanity, ambition, intellect, were all prominent in his flamboyant, even sensuous nature. Naples was the home of his spirit; Hobart,

5 F.T. Whittington, William Grant Broughton, Sydney 1936.


one suspects, its goal. Perry, by contrast, was a typical upper-class Englishman - cool, confident, competent. Tyrrell, a celibate, equalled Broughton in devotion to his task, and sheer achievement. Alone of the pioneer bishops, he died in Australia.

Nixon and Tyrrell were thorough-going disciples of the Tractarian revival, Broughton a sympathiser. Although the Low-Churchman Perry represented a considerable body of opinion, the general temper of Anglicanism followed the metropolitan's lead. The aims and ideals of the Church were thereby better understood and more fervently pursued; had Newman, Pusey and Keble never lived, the study of Anglicanism in Australia would be duller and less important. Yet the Tractarian contribution can be exaggerated. Broughton's policies followed an absolutely straight course from the day of his appointment, well before the first Tract burst upon Oxford. Perry was a good

8 Specific sources used are Church News, Hobart, September 1942 (in biographical file, TSA); and, with much care, Robert Crooke, The Convict, Hobart 1958 : 34-35.
and effective Bishop, in some ways encouraged by an Evangelical outlook to be less dismayed by the common task than his High Church brethren. Moreover 'Puseyism' - as its enemies usually described the new doctrine - had its disadvantages. Low Churchmen might revolt against its manifestations, while two of Broughton's clergy - T.C. Makinson and R.K. Sconce - followed Newman from Oxford to Rome (1848).

Whatever the role of Tractarianism, there can be no doubt that the Church's material strength progressed remarkably. By the test of churches, schools, and clergy, as well as nominal adherents, she remained well ahead of other denominations. Broughton strove to establish a theological college, a library, and St Andrew's Cathedral. Everywhere the laity organised for various purposes - parochial, missionary, cultural.

9 See chapter VI.

10 See statistical introduction; below (for schools). The story of physical growth is told in full detail in the various biographies and histories mentioned above.

11 In the large centres there were branches of the Societies for Promoting Christian Knowledge and Propagation of the Gospel. Other institutions included a 'Lay Association' (Sydney 1844), in connection with which there was a Choral Society; Book societies (Sydney 1841; Melbourne 1848); a Melbourne Choral Society (1847); and a Benefit Society (Sydney 1849).
Four times in Sydney, once in Melbourne, and once in Hobart journals expressing Church opinion were launched on the market, admittedly without great success. In 1850 a Conference of the Australasian Bishops formulated a basis for unity and co-operation. However loudly Anglican leaders might bewail their troubles, much solid work was done.

Many Churchmen believed that the situation in which they found themselves was enormously significant. "The question now at issue", Broughton told Coleridge early in 1838, "is really a very great one: no less than whether pure Christianity shall flourish or not over a sixth part of the habitable world..." All around him, the apostles of false

12 The Sydney Standard and Colonial Advocate (F2863; 1839); The Sydney Record (F3735a; 1843-44); The Southern Queen (F4159a; 1845); The Sydney Guardian (F4923; 1848-50); The Melbourne Church of England Messenger (F5450; 1850); The Herald of Tasmania (F4064; 1845). Note also the advertisement for The Guardian, HTC 2/6/37.

13 See R.A. Giles, The Constitutional History of the Australian Church, London 1929: chs IV, V. Minutes of the Conference are published as an appendix to Giles' work : 237 seq.

14 Letter of 6/2/38, Broughton Papers.
religion strove to achieve dominance, encouraged by that fatal leniency which had allowed the official establishment of Presbyterianism in Scotland ("schism thereby legalised") and the "Romanist Emancipation" of 1829. "The sour and wrong-headed determination of the Scotch" and "that class, which creates so much turbulence in Ireland" both threatened his own ideals. Nor was this simply a matter of religion: "if the presbyterians and dissenters carry the point ... republicanism will be triumphant in the same proportion: and if the Baptists gain ascendancy ... what are we to look for but a spiritual and political despotism"?

The latter, moreover, were consolidating their secular influence by allying with men "of a Socinian or Deistical, in one word of a liberal turn", while from a further extreme emanated "anti-monarchical and levelling principles ... of the voluntary Church

15 Letter of 14/10/39. The same ideas were repeated time and again throughout the correspondence.
16 Letters of 14/10/39, 17/2/42.
17 Letter of 6/2/38.
Even some of the Sydney clergy encouraged "a self-will, destructive of unity". Broughton appreciated that the current tendency was for all men to "think themselves qualified and privileged to rely on the exclusive guidance of their own will", but the knowledge only steeled his opposition.

One of the most interesting Anglican priests in the colonies was Henry Phibbs Fry, of Hobart; in the 'forties a fervent Tractarian, later an equally staunch Evangelical. Midway through his earlier phase he edited the local Church's journalistic venture, the Herald of Tasmania. Its first editorial argued the divine origin of the state, and man's duty under God to obey its ministers. Fry explained the need to make such principles crystal-clear:

In countries endowed with ancient and established institutions, the tranquil majority, content to enjoy and not dispute, regard with indifference the ineffectual though ardent discussions of the lovers of change: but, where numerous

19 Letter of 17/2/42.
20 Letter of 14/2/42.
21 Letter of 4/12/41.
22 18/7/45.
measures and ordinances are to be framed and moulded into a social system, the passive forbearance and silent judgements of the temperate and retired are in danger of being overcome by the less numerous but vehement partizans of extreme principles.

This sensitivity to the peculiar difficulties of the Australian environment was very common. "Here there were none of those silent holy rites which at home spread their unseen and unsuspected influences through the nation", rose up the Anglican cry; "new ties, new habits, new occupations, engender a new train of ideas;" said Nixon, as if in antiphony.

Broughton was no less disturbed. He pointed out, for instance, that free migrants wanted passionately "to make money and to raise themselves in the scale of society; and in the endeavour to do this, some (that is a great many) will break through all sumptuary regulations: and some (that is not a few) will lose their respect for moral obligations." This applied even -


nay, especially - to the upper-class pastoralists. Their "one intense effort to grasp unbounded acres and uncountable flocks" encouraged irreligion and that "spirit of self-will" so loathed by the Bishop. In politics this group threatened to curse Australia with the worst of governments - an oligarchy dependent on mob favour. The condition of native-born Australians encouraged such irresponsibility:

there is no such feeling in the minds of those who were born here as that of loyalty, or of veneration for the dominion under which they live. We find it impossible to make them comprehend even what is meant by it .... They soon pick up the shibboleth of democracy; but of monarchy and its con­comitants we see nothing and they ... con­sequently know nothing.

The fear of democracy bulked large in Broughton's mind. "In all such communities as this," he wrote, "the people have a tendency to it .... the natural man likes and there is but little here to curb the natural man's propensities." His own credo was very different:

---

26 Letter of 6/3/47; below.
27 See further chapter III.
28 Letter of 17/2/42.
29 Letter of 17/2/42.
"ordinary men never know how to act for themselves in seasons of difficulty if their responsible advisers are silent." He believed the £20 franchise set by the 1842 constitution too low; any other than a property basis, unthinkable. T.H. Braim, an Anglican schoolmaster and future parson, was a far more liberal churchman than his metropolitan but held much the same political views, deploiring "factious opposition to constituted authorities", and "all the evils flowing from radicalism and mobocracy." Another clergyman, E.G. Pryce, saw overweening prosperity as the chief incitement of colonial anarchy, and consequently believed "there could scarcely have been a greater temporal good" than the sharp full in wages in the early 'forties.

A natural outcome of such attitudes was for

30 Letter of 12/6/46.

31 Education Committee, LC 28/8/44 : 183; letter of 14/1/43.

32 A History of New South Wales : II, 321. Braim had taught at the C. of E. school in Hobart before coming to Sydney, where he became head­master of Sydney College.

33 The Church in Australia, Part II. Two Journals of Missionary Tours ... 1843, London 1845 : 10.
Anglican leaders to align themselves with the higher ranks of society. Broughton envisaged a colonial House of Lords which might encourage loyalty and adherence to English ways. He deplored the pastoralists' pre-occupation with worldly matters particularly because among them he had hoped to find his best supporters. Only with great reluctance did he admit some wealthy tradesmen to the inner councils of the Church. Perry unashamedly sought money from England wherewith to pursue "the cultivation, upon Christian principles, of such intercourse with the upper class of residents in the city, and with the settlers who are in the habit of visiting it, as may, with God's blessing, render them kindly disposed towards myself and my brethren". He found the comparative scarcity of this class a burden to his work. On the other hand, J.D. Lang complained that

34 Letter of 17/2/42.
35 Letter of 14/10/39.
36 Church in the Colonies no XXIV, London 1850 (F5318) : 21.
many Presbyterians went over to episcopacy for reasons of social prestige, and the Church certainly received the earnest support of some notable men. The archetypical lay enthusiast was the young Charles Cowper, future Premier of N.S.W. and son of a pioneer chaplain. He won election to the first legislature on a programme of unflinching support for "Ultra Church Principles", and over the next few years acted faithfully in that capacity. His election must have compensated Broughton for discovering during the campaign that the "plague spot of liberality" had infected his highest lay councils, some members of which supported the candidature in Sydney of M.C. O'Connell, representative of all that Broughton most disliked. Always strong under his calm demeanour, he forced their resignation.

The Church, with a few exceptions, was united

38 Pastoral Address..., Sydney 1844: 3.
39 SMH 1/7/43.
40 Letter of 14/1/43. See further on O'Connell's candidature, chs IV and V.
in opposition to the continuance of transportation. The same applied to many other groups, but the Anglican arguments had a distinctive twist. Nixon, whose designation had deliberately avoided 'Vandemonian' overtones, appropriately set the tone of these objections: "a convict population is a kind of chaos, a vast society, yet most unsocial". Transportation, his clergy agreed, had forced men into communities lacking the essential institutions of home and family; the consequence was "unnatural crime". Another statement from this group declared that

if criminals continue to be transported to this colony, your Majesty's petitioners, as ministers of peace, cannot but tremble at the permanent establishment of a spirit of exasperation, and of most unhappy division pervading the entire social system; seriously impeding the efforts of your Majesty's petitioners to promote the extension and continuance of Christian peace and love ...

41 An Appeal : 99.
43 Convict Discipline and Transportation Papers, HC 14/5/51 : 114.
A strong group of N.S.W. clergy petitioned in almost precisely the same terms, emphasising transportation's role in thwarting efforts to make good their "solemn pledge and obligation to maintain and set forward quietness and peace".

Despite his sympathy for its "noble object", Broughton on one occasion refused the use of an Anglican schoolroom to the anti-transportationist Australasian League. Here, in particularly graphic form was a fundamental characteristic of the Church of England which will appear time and again: a refusal to let mass-secular movements, however fashionable, become part of their religion. In their view Christianity spoke to man's eternal soul, not his temporal welfare; it found expression in the Church, not civil society.

Beyond this point the philosophy and power of the Church is best described in terms of two inter-related issues: its relation to the state, and the

---

44 The same: 194-95.

45 Convict Discipline and Transportation Papers, HC 30/4/52: 104.
education controversy. All discussion of the former was dominated by the legislation of 1836-37 by which aid was given to the major denominations, more or less in ratio to their self-help. The Anglican leaders refused to accept this as reducing them to permanent equality with other denominations, and dependence on government bounty. So late as 1845 Broughton warned against multi-establishment that it

countenances the assumption that the State is under no obligation to entertain any impression as to the superior correctness of one system of religious belief compared with other forms of doctrine. The tendency of this ... is to nourish ... a vacillation and unsteadiness of religious principle, which threatens finally to subside into actual unbelief. If the influence of Government be continually applied to abolish all concern for the distinction between true and false, the sense of moral obligation, I fear, will be gradually undermined; and the bond of integrity by which society is held together must be fatally relaxed.

Archdeacon William Hutchins, head of the Tasmanian Church from 1837 to 1841, emphatically dissented

46 See statistical introduction.

47 CO 201/358 : 435. Other such statements spanning the years were embodied in Religion Essential to the Security and Happiness of Nations ..., Sydney 1834; A Letter to the Right Rev. Nicholas Wiseman, London 1852.
from the legislation which was enacted just as he came into office. Nixon endorsed this policy, and also Hutchins' desire to secure permanent landed endowment for the Church. This latter project was especially dear to Hutchins' successor as Archdeacon, F.A. Marriott, who strove to win over both home and colonial governments to his side, but without success. Two eminent judges, W.W. Burton in N.S.W. and John Pedder in V.D.L. lent their weight to the argument that, the 1836-37 legislation notwithstanding, the Anglican Church alone was established by constitutional law in Australia.

In some ways, indeed, the Church continued to


50 CO 280/107, despatch of 1/3/39.


52 W.W. Burton, The State of Religion and Education in New South Wales : passim; HTC 4/8/37 (LC debate). The matter remained open to argument for many years, although increasingly removed from reality, cf R. Border, Was the Church of England ever established in Australia, St Mark's Review, Canberra : no 18, 20 seq.
enjoy certain distinctions. Broughton sat on the nominee legislature until its abolition, and remained on the Executive Council until 1846. Neither Bourke nor the Colonial Office were eager that he should continue in the former office after being created Bishop, but Broughton insisted on an earlier promise being honoured. To stand down, he argued, would involve "exposing me personally to an unmerited forfeiture of a lawful right, and the Church of England, and my sacred office at once, to what in the eyes of the world must be an apparent degradation". As a councillor he strove to give loyal and responsible service, without ever suppressing his own beliefs. He led almost annual committees on immigration, always enjoying the honour of being elected to the chair of any committee on which he sat. On occasion their reports went beyond the conventional reiteration of the need for more men to make such points as the undesirability of coolie migration or of 'excessive' inflow from Ireland: neither group would easily be

53 CO 201/257 : 113 seq, esp 161.
54 Immigration Committee, LC 13/8/41 : Report.
moulded to the Anglican pattern. He vainly tried to persuade the Council to enforce Sabbath observance by statute. Much more important, Broughton worked out a scheme for controlling the extension of squatting which anticipated and even shaped Gipps' own solution to the problem. Agreement on this vital issue brought the Bishop and the Governor, originally rather antipathetic, very close together.

Broughton finally withdrew from the councils on his own initiative, fancying that to continue might draw the Church into controversy and ill-favour. Nixon's attitude was rather different. As had earlier leaders of the local Church, he took a seat on the Executive Council and remained there throughout our period. Moreover he sought to regain the right, lost

55 Shooting on Sunday Prevention Bill Committee, LC 27/7/41 : Report. The act (5 Vic no 6) finally passed by the House applied only to shooting of pigeons etc, the subject originally proposed for investigation, but which Broughton sought to expand.

56 CO 201/346 : 21 seq; HRA XXIII : 559; XXIV : 780 seq; chapter III.

57 HRA XXIII : 45; CO 201/366 : 160 seq.
during Hutchins' term, of a seat on the legislature. Neither Governor nor Secretary of State for the Colonies were persuaded by his arguments.

The Church's power of jurisdiction over its clergy raised another aspect of relations with the state, for here was an area in which the two authorities could, and did clash. The issue became most important in Tasmania, partly because of Nixon's personal attitudes, partly because the presence in V.D.L. of several convict chaplains provided an immediate casus belli. Governor Eardley-Wilmot claimed they were under his direction; Nixon denied it. Specific cases arose where the two differed, quite violently, as to appropriate action. Mrs Nixon wrote to England that the government was planning the overthrow of the Church; the Bishop himself that "upon this I have quietly and deliberately resolved - to fight the battle out to the end, but not to remain


59 Cf Townsley : 17-19; K.E. Fitzpatrick, Mr Gladstone and The Governor, HS : I, 31 seq; notes 63, 64.
as the mere nominal head of the Church, without power, influence, authority, or freedom." He was, perhaps, all the more deeply galled by the knowledge that two young Anglicans, J.P. Gell and William Bedford jnr., were said to have been very real powers behind the previous government.

Consequently he refused to ordain or license the convict chaplains; he forced Marriott to resign from their superintendence; he set off for England to persuade the Colonial Office to accept his argument that the Letters Patent appointing him to V.D.L. implied the right to set up a Consistorial Court on the English model. His speech immediately before departure was militant:

In these shifting days, the Secretary of State may be a Romanist, a Presbyterian, an Unitarian, a Dissenter, nay even an Unbeliever; for these are not the times

60 Nixon, Pioneer Bishop : pp 34, 48.

61 Crooke : 48; K.E. Fitzpatrick, Sir John Franklin in Tasmania 1837-1843 : 274. Bedford's father was the senior clergyman in the diocese.

62 The Equal Legal Status of all the Churches in the Australian Colonies, Hobart 1851 : 1.
when the State feels it a duty to watch with jealous care over the high principle of Christian truth as exhibited in the Church of England, or when soundness in the 'faith once delivered to the Saints', is likely to be regarded as a necessary qualification for a Minister of State.

Nixon's lobbying of the Colonial Office displayed the same energy and spirit, but resulted only in the specific limitation of his privileges.

At this level, therefore, Nixon lost the battle; but in its course he had metaphorically and literally killed his great adversary, Eardley-Wilmot. From 1844 the Bishop had been criticising the Governor to several correspondents, Broughton and Coleridge among them. The latter carried the tale

63 Cf Nixon's letters to the Colonial Office during 1847 and the minutes thereon, CO 280/222 : passim; Colonial Church Legislation Papers, HC 17/5/52.

64 Apart from the references cited in Fitzpatrick's article the following sources have been studied: Gladstone Papers, British Museum : MS 44, 364 frames 47, 61, 65; Broughton's letters to Coleridge 4 & 7/10/44, 4/1/45, 18/9/45; LE 7/8/47, 22/9/47, 27/10/47, 24/11/47; SMH 10/11/47. A collation of these shows that Broughton lied in denying that he had ever conducted a correspondence critical of Eardley-Wilmot. For opinions regarding the latter's morality see Pedder/Arthur, 18/2/46 : ML MS A2170 (favourable); Boyes' Diary : passim (unfavourable).
to William Ewart Gladstone, that ardent young man who had entered politics so as to serve the Church. He became Secretary of State for the Colonies in November 1845, and personally dismissed Eardley-Wilmot five months later. The public reason for this step was the mismanagement of the convict system; the private reason, the Governor's personal immorality; the real reason, the power of the Church of England. There was some relation between the three, but no doubt can exist as to the overriding potency of the last. The Anglican leaders might have been pleased, but were not proud of their work. Nixon refused to extricate Gladstone from the difficulties which Eardley-Wilmot's dismissal caused the statesman at his next election; even the noble Broughton told substantially less than the truth of his part in the affair.

We have strayed rather far from the question of clerical discipline. Broughton kept a firm hand over his ministers, and had no hesitation in calling a Consistorial Court when need arose. However, its proceedings were conducted with great tact, so that no replica of the Tasmanian situation ever threatened.
When a challenge to the Bishop did come, the source was not the government, but Robert Lowe, the brilliant young Englishman who added so much vigour to N.S.W. politics during the 'forties. A firm anti-Tractarian, Lowe twice sought to persuade the Legislature to limit Broughton's authority: first (1846), by proposing a Bill which would vest the freehold of every benefice in a lay committee; second (1849), by calling for papers relative to the Bishop's disciplinary action against two young Evangelicals. The common respect paid to Broughton and his policy of lying quiet saved him from humiliation on either occasion. He was disturbed when Bishop Perry sought to clear the confusion surrounding the issue by having the Council legislate for the Melbourne diocese. The encouragement offered in Perry's draft Bills for lay participation further damned them in the metropolitan's eyes. The move was abandoned, and the 1850 Conference formulated a working compromise.

65 Whitington: 139 seq; V & P 7/8/49.
Overall, then, we can see a widening difference between Broughton and Nixon as they faced the problem of relations with secular authority. Both were sensitive to the danger of the Church falling between two stools: having no valuable exclusive privileges, yet being used as a tool of government, and bearing the odium of this contagion. Nixon chose to fight for the re-creation of the English position; Broughton, perhaps the better Tractarian in this, moved towards dissociation while still lamenting the idea of multi-establishment. The seeds of this tendency were apparent in the terms of his protest against Franklin's appointing, without any reference to himself, a temporary head of the Church following Hutchins' death; it was carried further by his withdrawal from the Councils, and the various episodes of the clerical-discipline story. Perhaps the climax came with his suggestion to Coleridge that were suitable men ready and willing, further bishoprics should be created in Australia without any reference to the Colonial Office.

68 Letter of 15/10/44.
Yet in other respects Broughton clung tenaciously to the remnants of superiority. In particular he fiercely contested recognition by the State of Roman Catholicism. In 1837 and 1839 J.B. Polding, then holding only a titular see, was received by the Governor in circumstances which appeared to the jealous Anglican to imply official recognition of his episcopal status. Formal protests were immediately entered; but without effect. The Bishop's worst fears were confirmed in 1842 when Rome vested Polding with the territorial title, Archbishop of Sydney, and proceeded to make further episcopal appointments throughout Australia. Broughton truly forecast that if this were allowed, Papacy would soon appear in the same forthright guise throughout the Empire. He opposed the plan, supported by Polding and his followers, to redistribute state aid according to the numerical strength of each denomination. The possibility of a Roman Catholic succeeding Dowling as Chief Justice appalled

69 Whittington: chapter XVI.
70 CO 201/358: 434 seq.
him: in letter after letter, Coleridge was exhorted to use his influence to prevent such a catastrophe. Right at the end of the decade he waged a (more or less successful) battle against Earl Grey's decree that a Roman Archbishop had precedence over an Anglican Bishop. During the brief operation of this rule he ordered his clergy not to attend a Government House levee, and himself refused to serve with Polding on a charitable committee. Meanwhile both Nixon and Perry had expressed hostility to the appointment of Roman Bishops in their respective dioceses; when the latter was consequently rebuked for his lack of charity, he responded with an attack on "infidel latitudinarianism" which would have done credit to any Tractarian.

A full catalogue of the occasions on which leaders of the Church protested against government

71 Letters of 7-10/44.

72 Episcopal Sees in Australia, HC 25/3/50; Roman Catholic Bishops (Australia), HC 24/2/51: both passim.

73 An Appeal: 92 seq; Goodman: 116 seq.
policies would become very long and dreary. Some samples from the Sydney diocese best illustrate the whole. Broughton's sheer political conservatism led him to dispute plans for separating Port Phillip from N.S.W. proper: this, argued the Bishop, would further weaken the ties binding the colony to the British constitution, and foster the ravages of democracy. His opposition to the sale of the lands assigned to the old Church and Schools Corporation, though which it had once seemed possible that local Anglicanism would become supremely wealthy and powerful, demonstrated his hankering after exclusive establishment. Broughton objected to the abolition of the official grant for ministers itinerating beyond the boundaries just as any other sectarian leader could, and did, apply pressure for immediate and obvious benefit. The 'dissociation from secular authority' theme came out very strongly in his antagonism to a

---

74 Cf HRA XXI : 119 (1840); CO 201/375 : 60 seq (opposition to Executive Council's final decision to advise separation).

75 HRA XIX : 739-40.

76 HRA XXVI : 230 seq.
local act which provided for the establishment of a multi-denominational cemetery, and abrogated the Bishop's right of determining burial procedure. The incident was further notable in that the Colonial Office responded to his protests with rare goodwill, while the Church went ahead and expressed its independence from government and other creeds alike by founding its own cemetery.

The Education issue incorporated the problem of state relations, as well as illuminating Anglican views on society and salvation. It was prominent from the very day of Broughton's return to Sydney as Bishop in June 1836. Bourke had just foreshadowed a proposal for instituting the Irish National System of primary education. Intended to end the expense and prejudice created by subsidising competitive sectarian schools (which inclined to concentrate together, leaving great

77 HRA XXVI: 98 seq, 747-48; advertisements for the 'Church of England Cemetery Company' appeared in the press, e.g. SMH 8/7/48.

78 For Broughton's personal efforts, Whitington: chs VII, IX.
areas wholly untended), this plan sought to comprehend all denominations. Roman Catholic approval was secured by the guarantee that all religious teaching would be based on selected extracts from the Douai translation of the Bible. In angry response, militant Protestantism demanded unrestricted access to the Scriptures; Broughton put himself at the head of a campaign which waxed so powerful that Bourke had to withdraw.

Then, and ever afterwards, Broughton's first premise was a stern refusal to allow young Anglicans to be taught generalised religion. Only on the foundation of the Church's catechism could Godly schools be built. Rightfully the state should subsidise these institutions, but if necessary they would be run on a voluntary basis. Broughton never explicitly denied the justice of other sects receiving money for the same purpose: from the beginning therefore, he inclined to dissociation from the state, so far as education was concerned.

The victory of 1836 did not go long undisputed.

79 Letter to Coleridge: 26/7/36.
From 1839 Gipps tried to persuade all non-Romans to accept the British and Foreign Schools Society scheme, while in 1844 the Legislative Council expressed preference for the Irish system, to which allegiance it remained true. Broughton fought these proposals tooth and nail: the first with virtually no support from outside his Church, the second against opposition as emotionally committed as himself, but also with the backing of Polding, and perhaps even Gipps. The establishment of the dual system in 1848 promised respite from the struggle for at least a few years. The statistics demonstrate how effectively the Church made use of denominational subsidies.

In V.D.L. the conflict was even sharper. Franklin had anticipated Gipps, enforcing the British and Foreign scheme early in his term as Governor. This was opposed by the Church of England with a

\[80\] Chapter V; J.D. Lang explicitly attributed the Governor's reluctance to press on with the Irish system to the alliance Gipps and Broughton had formed over the squatting issue, and this seems a reasonable hypothesis.

\[81\] See statistical introduction.
bitterness that grew year by year. A peak was reached in 1843 when Fry and a devout layman, J.D. Loch, prepared a scathing indictment of the system, declaring it to lack both religion and efficiency. Petitions to this effect, undoubtedly organised by Anglican clergy, swarmed into Hobart from throughout the colony. Eardley-Wilmot, a very broad Churchman indeed, refused to shift ground, but the matter had willy-nilly to go to Whitehall. Once again Gladstone responded to the call of his faith (perhaps the Governor's views on education indirectly spelt his doom), and ordered modification of the system. This was ultimately carried through by Sir William Denison, delighted to assist his Church in gaining the preponderant influence which the figures so emphatically bespeak. In this direction, Nixon had won nearly exclusive dominion

82 J.D. Loch, *An Account of the Introduction and Effects of the System of General Religious Education established in Van Diemen's Land in 1839*, Hobart 1843. Fry prepared much of the data, and may have written even more of the book than is acknowledged.

83 Despatch of 22/1/44: CO 280/167. The whole controversy is very fully documented.

84 W. Denison, *Varieties of Vice-Regal Life*: I, 84.
at mid-century.

In the course of these discussions on primary education, the Anglicans repeatedly stated their conviction that secular knowledge had no intrinsic virtue; that without a foundation of true religion it could become an instrument of evil. "It is not to the all-pervading influence of literature and science that we must look for the regeneration of a fallen world like ours;" argued Hutchins in an early attack on the Tasmanian system; "but to that of Christian truth, set home to the heart by the ever-blessed Spirit ..." Broughton argued the same point with equal firmness, if less concision, time and again. Thus he charged his clergy at the height of the 1844 crisis:

I can but express my own confirmed and painful conviction, that the adoption of the now favourite theories of general education, founded upon an exclusion of the Church from its appointed province, would but aggravate the evil which it is designed to remove. In place of the opposition which Truth has now to encounter from rooted ignorance,

there would be substituted a more embittered spirit of opposition from unsanctified knowledge; vice, in the mean while being not diminished in amount, but rendered only more specious and refined.

This theme was carried even further at an early meeting of the Church of England Book society in Sydney. "Desire for knowledge strongly tends to foster a spirit of infidelity", declared the speaker, Rev. W.B. Clarke, who went on to urge his listeners to conquer "this infidel tendency of the age" with its own weapons.

The Church was very active in providing superior education. In espousing this cause Nixon once referred to "the character that may be impressed upon the higher classes" and "those hidden bonds ... by which alone a nation can hold together": the conjunction effectively illustrated why Anglicans felt so strongly on this point. In Hobart a Grammar School had been conducted on staunch Anglican lines

87 SMH 23/10/41.
88 An Appeal : 100.
since the mid-thirties. Then Franklin took the initiative in bringing to V.D.Land J.P. Gell, with the purpose of appointing him head of a college of near-university standing. Gell was a loyal Anglican, a pupil of Thomas Arnold's, and a disciple of Learning of that higher order which associates the sentiments with all that is stable and permanent .... which not only teaches facts, but inculcates precepts and teaches uniform habits by the instrumentality of religious discipline and venerable institutions.

His views on social class were similar to Broughton's, and he lamented the current system of primary education as "putting the weapon of learning into the hands of the people, and leaving it to an independent priesthood to form the popular faith".

The proposed college had to run the gauntlet of much criticism, directed primarily at its exclusively

89 Cf HTC 15/6/38 (letter of John Gregory); 20/7/38 (LC debate); FP 15/7/41 (letter of T.H. Braim, former headmaster of the school).

90 Fitzpatrick, Franklin : 181 seq; F.J. Woodward, The Doctor's Disciples, Oxford 1954 : chapter II (biographical study of Gell); two important letters from Gell are at CO 280/128 : 4 seq; 280/146 : 7 seq.


92 Woodward : 92.
Anglican principles, and the plan was therefore shelved. Gell became Headmaster of the Queen's School, Hobart, which carried on from the earlier Church Grammar School. Franklin handsomely subsidised the new school; Eardley-Wilmot did not. One reason for his refusal was the extreme shortage of funds in the Treasury, but he made no effort to disguise his preference for a school of broader doctrinal inspiration. The Queen's School consequently collapsed. Soon after, however (1846), Nixon succeeded in reviving the collegiate plan; Gell became Warden; and 'feeders' were developed in the Launceston Grammar School, and Hutchins School, Hobart.

The model for Anglican secondary education in N.S.W. was not Rugby, but the 'King's Schools', Broughton having attended that at Canterbury. As Archdeacon he founded counterparts at Sydney and

93 CO 280/160 : despatch of 3/11/43; chapter VI.

94 As note 90; B.W. Rait, The Official History of the Hutchins School, Hobart 1930.
Parramatta; the former soon failed, but King's School Parramatta effectually set about its work of training "about 100 boys, of the best families in the country". The 'St James Grammar School' was founded under episcopal auspices in Sydney in 1843, later being affiliated with the Anglican seminary, which itself was broadened to provide some sort of tertiary education for non-divinity students. The Bishops' Conference looked forward to establishing a Church College in conjunction with the proposed University of Sydney. Meanwhile, however, the sectarian character of the institution was so offensive to the Church of England, that alone of the major denominations it had no representation on the first Senate.

By this time, the precursor of Melbourne Grammar School had been founded by Perry and R.H. Budd,

95 Broughton/Coleridge 26/7/36; S.M. Johnstone, The History of the King's School, Parramatta, Sydney 1932.

96 SMH 22/12/46; Broughton/Coleridge 1/4/45; Whitington : 128.

97 H.E. Barff, A Short Historical Account of the University of Sydney : 8 seq.
another old boy of Arnold's. Despite many difficulties and set-backs, the Church had displayed its customary vigour in providing for the education of those young men most likely to realise its ideals.

W.B. Clarke discovered gold, and hid the fact when so requested by Governor Gipps. His action brilliantly symbolised the respect of the Church for constituted authority and its antipathy to social turmoil. It represented the incompatibility of Australian history with the ideas held by men of Clarke's bent; but also their resolution to stem the current, however fiercely it might swirl against them. No group stated its philosophy so clearly, or held to it so tenaciously as did the Church of England. For these reasons, if no other, the Church achieves in retrospect near-heroic stature.

As Expressed by the Sydney Morning Herald

The secular world offered no true counterpart to the Anglicans' social theory. The latter founded
their creed on the premise that, however environments might differ, the Church remained the repository of divine truth. On what rock could other men of conservative inclination build their temple? No age-glorified interests or hallowed institutions lay to hand; the political, social and economic realities of colonial life were forever changing. When even Europe and America were palpably subject to unprecedented forces and ideas, the search for stable elements in Australia had inevitably to become tortuous. Consequently, the remarkably numerous magazines and newspapers published throughout the colonies yield little doctrine which without hesitation can be labelled 'conservative'. Of this little, the Sydney Herald (founded 1831) supplied by far the greater part. By 1835 this journal already challenged for the hegemony of the colonial press, and fifteen years later held it firmly. Its price went steadily downward, regularity of publication upward, circulation

and financial stability onward. One sharp caesura broke this progress: a change of ownership in February 1841. Both before and after that date the paper was broadly 'conservative', but in so different a temper that the two periods require separate attention.

The conventions of the day demanded that every editor renounce sectional favouritism or interest. From its birth the Herald bore two mottoes from Pope appropriate to this circumstance:

In Moderation placing all my Glory,
While Tories call me Whig—and Whigs a Tory.

and

Sworn to no Master, of no Sect am I.

They were probably chosen by Rev. John McGarvie, the most constant leader-writer of early years. We already know that this man's beliefs were not so bland as the mottoes would suggest, and the same was apparently true of the two men who shared the proprietorship from 1835 to 1841, Ward Stephens and F.M. Stokes. Never was the Herald so firmly opposed to radical ideas as in that period.

Quite often, indeed, 'Tory' and 'Whig' were
used as synonyms for 'good' and 'bad'. A "Botany Bay Tory" was thus described in 1837 as "a respectable person who has emigrated to this Colony, and who brings with him the virtuous principles which he has had instilled into him in his native land." This ideal type would hold land either purchased, or granted to him by the Colonial Government, and be a substantial agriculturalist; even the wool-growers of the far interior were "working bees", in contrast to the landlord drones of Sydney. "Emigrant Colonists" were the proper instigators of constitutional reform since they had a standing independent of the local government: rebuking Bourke for not holding a Ball to celebrate the King's Birthday in 1837, the Herald asserted that "the respectable Colonists, with their wives and daughters, have a prescriptive right to assemble at Government-house on an occasion like this". When such men clashed

101 19/1/37.
102 25/5/35.
103 23/3/40.
104 15/1/35.
105 8/5/37.
with the government, as was not uncommon in Bourke's latter years, the Herald was their stout supporter. It rejoiced, for example, in the acquittal of two landholders charged by the Crown with stealing cattle from land rented by one of them to a ticket-of-leave holder. The Wakefieldian concept of a land fund for emigration was denigrated as a sectional, unjust tax on the property-owning class, while the editors' proposals for the administration of this money prompted a very clear exposition of their sympathies. The men who contributed to the fund should be vested with the labour of all migrants and determine their selection as to age, sex, skills, etc; numbers should be drawn from England, Scotland, and Ireland in proportion to the nationality of landowners, and the law should compel all assisted migrants to become rural workers. The writer of these proposals had firmly grasped the significance of the migrant as a social force, and was determined that this power be used to create an environment patterned on the Old World.

106 15/5/37; etc.
107 15/1/38.
The Stokes-Stephens Herald was happiest when attacking the enemies of its ideal type. First on this list were British Whigs and Radicals. Not only the migration-fund idea, but also the successive rises in the price of colonial land were slated home to the pernicious influence of E.G. Wakefield. He was depicted, too, as the inspirer of the "parcel of land jobbers", who formed the South Australian "Bubble Company" and ever sought to discredit the older colonies. Justifiably, the Molesworth Committee appeared as a Wakefieldian tool, concerned only to harm N.S.W. at the expense of South Australia. A report that the Imperial Government planned to sell colonial land in Britain evoked a similar protest: "Yes, colonists, a plundering Whig ministry purposes, it is said, to seize the funds arising from the sale of your lands and appropriate them in England".

Impositions on the colonial revenue, such as payment of police expenses, the maintenance of a judge at

108 18/1/39.
110 29/6/40.
111 9/7/35.
Norfolk Island, and of a residency in New Zealand were all attributed to Whiggish greed rather than any inevitable divergence between metropolitan and colonial interests.

The local Whigs - especially Sir Richard Bourke and his supporters - suffered equal abuse. That Governor was certainly a determined, even ruthless, advocate of a policy founded upon the insistence that all citizens should be equal before the law, whatever their religion and whether or not they had once been convicts. He placed sympathisers and relatives in many important positions; the most notable instance being his replacement of the veteran Colonial Secretary, Alexander Macleay, with his own son-in-law, Edward Deas Thomson. The friction produced by Bourke's liberalism sent out some lively sparks at the end of 1835 when Roger Therry - Roman Catholic, government office-holder, editor of Canning's speeches, and the Governor's close friend -

112 18/5/35.
113 4/12/39.
stood for election to the post of Chairman of Quarter Sessions. Voters comprised all the Justices of the Peace in the colony, both the equivalents of the English Squire and the Stipendiary Magistrates through whom the colony was administered. The Herald violently supported C.D. Riddell, the Colonial Treasurer, who was a declared enemy of Bourke's policy. Riddell's victory was loudly acclaimed, and a ballot list published to show that Therry's supporters were nearly all dependent on the government. When Bourke dismissed several of the 'squire' justices some weeks later, the Herald protested in the name of "every man who is not disposed to become the slave of the O'Connell Tail faction, which at present afflicts this Colony".

The Stipendiary Magistrates were consistently presented as instruments of an arbitrary despotism. Even the colony's judges came under suspicion as lackeys of government, threatening the liberty of country gentlemen. The liberals who banded together in the

115 16/11/35.
116 11/1/36.
117 18/2/39.
Australian Patriotic Association (1835) appeared to the editors as a "motley crew of Jew pedlars, tailors, rinkers, and gentlemen in Parramatta jackets"; those colonists who attended a farewell meeting to Bourke, "shoeless and shirtless rascals". The quasi-official newspaper, Sydney Gazette, commonly bore the tag of the "Court and Convict Journal".

This reference opens up the controversy over the status of ex-convicts in the colony. Bourke had granted those who had either received an absolute pardon or served their full term the right of jury service - that is, of enjoying the most important constitutional privilege than available in the colony. This policy was bitterly fought by the Herald, which postulated a deep and permanent cleavage within society: "the law must be altered, if our 'liberal' rulers are not determined to hand over the sole administration of the law to felons and their abettors!"

119 14/4/36.
120 4/12/37.
121 9/11/35. The Sydney Gazette (F383) was no longer tied to government, but remained sympathetic to the administration.
Let emigrants be tried by emigrants; and let transported persons be tried by paid commissioners."
When, in 1835, a celebrated libel case revealed that a ticket-of-leave man, apparently of little moral worth, had virtually edited the Gazette, the Herald dwelt at length on this example of convict influence in high places. Roger Therry, who had acted as counsel for the editor, came in for particular vituperation. Many other editorials dealt with this subject in similar vein. "The respectable Emancipists", ran one illuminating sentence, "is modest and retiring; and in proportion as he is so, so is he respected."

The question of convict discipline also aroused those who believed that the colony was in danger of subjection to the evil effects of transportation. Declaring itself in support of Justice Burton, the most lucid exponent of this argument, the Herald maintained:

122 23/2/37.
123 8-9/35. The man was William Watt, cf HRA: XVIII, 306 seq.
124 30/12/39
125 3/12/35.
There is a necessity for some nervous vigorous arm to wield the sword of justice, and to tighten the reins of that insolent domineering faction, which from late specimens of its morality, would level the boundaries of morals and plunge every honest institution into confusion.

Examples of convict insubordination and crime always received full, highly-coloured reporting. The ultra-liberal penology practised by Captain Maconochie at Norfolk Island drove the editors nearly to hysteria. Comparing negro slaves and transportees, the Herald concluded that the latter were entitled to far less "natural and social liberty", since their condition derived from no accident of birth, but self-willed transgression. Putting these principles into practice, the management once offered ten shillings reward for information concerning assigned servants of the Herald who sneaked out to the theatre.

Worthless characters were prevalent amongst the migrants, too, "and, had we the power, we would

---


127 7/12/37.

exclude them from the jury box just as we would the others." Thus free working men received treatment hardly less scathing than that accorded the convict. In 1837 the shipowners were warmly supported vis-a-vis a "systematic, organised body ... whose object, if accomplished, would materially retard the progressive advancement of our Colonial marine." When a local Committee of Compositors addressed advertisements to their fellow-craftsmen in Britain, warning that jobs were scarce in N.S.W., the Herald retaliated by offering up to six positions to "Emigrants of sober habits and GOOD Workmen .... None need apply who are in the habit of working two days in the week, and drunk the other four." Early in 1840 Stokes attempted to break a combination among his workers by applying to the government for skilled convict compositors. Hints of working class activity were deplored, albeit with the assurance that material

129 30/12/39.
130 16/3/37.
131 17/5/38.
132 13 & 27/1/40.
conditions in Australia were too comfortable to foster trade unions and demagogic chartists. Roman Catholics and southern Irish similarly offended the Herald, irrespective of their penal status. "Ignorant, turbulent, mentally debased, and totally unqualified for the elective franchise", rolled out the denunciation of these people. Papists were alleged to be deliberately planning ascendancy over the "respectable Protestant Emigrant Colonists" by flooding the country with immigrants of their faith.

The small, near-peasant farmer came under much the same indictment. Bourke's system of allocating assigned labour was deprecated because it benefited these men - "precisely the parties who ought to be discouraged from having Convicts /since/ .... their intercourse is of the most familiar discription". When the government assisted the settlement of a

---

133 14/1/41.
134 8/12/40.
135 13/10/36; 31/8/40.
136 25/5/35.
group of smallholders, the **Herald** protested against such "monstrous abuse" of the land fund - creating competition for labour rather than supplying the gentleman farmer with that essential commodity. The aborigines, too, were detested as obstacles in the latter's path. One of the distinguishing features of the colonial Whig, according to the **Herald**'s definition, was to be "maudlin about the 'poor blacks'". A sneer and a snarl were ever ready to introduce story upon story of native treachery and barbarism. The moral argument against European intrusion was swept aside: "it is the right of civilized men to occupy countries in a state of nature, the inhabitants of which merely roam over the soil, without any defined form of government; because, if this were not so, the great end of civilization could never be effected." Gipps' execution of seven white men after the notorious Myall Creek massacre was described as "judicial

137 8 & 26/3/38.
138 8/3/38.
139 13/5/39.
murder", and the great blot on the early months of his government.

Even in its most Tory period, the Herald was not invariably crabbed and negative. It advocated a compulsory system of education (although on a self-contributory basis, as a free system would require emigrant tax-payers to provide for convicts' children, and Protestants for Catholics'), with industrial and agricultural schools to break down the parrot system of instruction. Broughton was supported in his controversies with the Governors, and the Church of England's claim to sole establishment conceded, but Bourke's Church Act was accepted. Constitutional questions rarely prompted careful enquiry, but we have already noted the trend towards stressing colonial interests, especially where land and finance were involved, as against the Imperial Government. One editorial went so far as to suggest that the colonists would prefer to ally themselves

140 2/1/39.
141 13/10/36; 1/3/38; 8/2/39; 19/8/39.
142 4/7/36; 6/10/36; 11/1/38.
with the United States than see their taxes diverted into an imperial defence fund. In 1840 the Herald unequivocally demanded a representative assembly, about which it had been rather chary so long as transportation continued. The whole convict system had frequently been denounced as anti-moral, expensive and inefficient, although the Molesworth Committee's disregard of colonial interests aroused some scepticism as to the wisdom of its recommendations. Coolie immigration had the active support of the editors, who developed the ingenious argument that Indians had the full rights of British subjects, and therefore could not be denied admission into N.S.W.

This positive note sounded more and more strongly during 1840. Uniform postal rates were urged; meteorological records published, as part

\[143\] 21/6/38.  
\[144\] 10/2/40; cf 12/11/35.  
\[146\] 22/2/38.  
\[147\] 27/7/38; 14/1/39.  
\[148\] 6/1/40.
of the "Advancement of Science"; the formation of an Agricultural Society hailed with enthusiasm.

What caused this change of tempo? Bourke's departure, the end of assignment, and the imminence of free institutions all served to render the old-style Toryism obsolete. Doubtless many people continued to argue in the same way as had the Herald during the 'thirties, but any journal which did so might not have long survived. There was a more direct cause for the new emphasis, however: the strengthening connection with the journal of Charles Kemp, John Fairfax, and Ralph Mansfield. This reached a climax in April '41, when Kemp and Fairfax purchased the Herald from Stokes; and with Mansfield's literary assistance, guided the paper on its new path.

All three leaders were notable men. John Fairfax arrived in Sydney in 1838, and immediately before coming to the Herald was officer in charge of the Australian Library. He was an active Congregationalist, a trained compositor, and splendid

149 18/11/40.
150 13/4/40.
man of business. Kemp had immigrated early in life, and by 1841 was an experienced newspaper man on the editorial side. His many interests led him to prominence in the Church of England, the Mechanics' Institute, moves towards establishing railways in the colony, political life, and so on. Ralph Mansfield had come to N.S.W. as a Methodist clergyman working for the London Missionary Society. Long before 1841 he had renounced this connection (although not all his religious enthusiasm), in favour of journalism, business and commercial enterprise, and public affairs. He had applied for the secretaryship of the Patriotic Association, played an important part on the Protestant Committee which defeated Bourke's education scheme, and likewise with the Australian Schools' Society which advocated the British and Foreign system. His only substantial publications were surveys of the censuses of 1841 and 1847, which suggest that he could have achieved real distinction as a social historian. In 1842 an express denial that Mansfield determined editorial policy was published, but from Governor Gipps downward everyone supposed him the dominant figure behind the **Herald**.
of the 'forties.

The new editors drew their major inspiration from the classic political economy of Adam Smith and his school. The slogans from Pope came much closer to representing the paper's real temper and creed than ever before. "'THE PEOPLE' of New South Wales," ran one typical declaration, "consist of the whole body of its free Colonists, from the highest to the lowest, from the richest to the poorest ..."

Henceforth editorial policy strove conscientiously to seek out violent or class-inspired behaviour wherever it derived. This meant that the new Herald, at least as much as the old, was most effective when criticising the transgressions of some interest or other.

It was very anxious lest government become over-active. Save for one brief period of equivocation, attempts to establish a Usury Law were firmly reproved; rarely was the editorial tone more jubilant than when bankers themselves took the initiative in

151 HRA: XXI, 671.

152 5/3/42.
restoring the interest rate to a moderate level, for this was seen as a triumph of popular opinion, sound reasoning, and the principle of veritas vincit. In replying to an advocate of a fixed price of bread, the editors admitted that if a monopoly were truly established then such a measure might be valid - "But for a season only, and only in such a manner as not to retard the desired and inevitable change which the advancement of the society, the abolition of privileges, the accumulation and attraction of capital, the perception of profits, would ere long occasion." Likewise, the fifteen-hour day allegedly required of grocers' assistants was disagreeable but "as for legislative interference, the idea is preposterous; nothing would justify it in the case of adults, who are quite able to take care of themselves." The Party Processions Prevention Act (which sought to eliminate street-rioting), a Bill intended to prevent the outflow to California of assisted migrants, and

153 2 & 3/9/43.
154 3/8/46.
155 10/12/47.
agitation for the prohibition of local distilling of spirits, were all criticised as threatening excessive interference with civil liberty. Sir William Denison's dismissal of one of his judges was criticised as a gross infringement on judicial independence.

Neither Broughton's Sabbatarian proposals, nor Perry's for the discipline and organisation of his diocese were regarded as fit subjects for legislative action.

Laissez-faire principles were applied to the ever vexed problem of land. The editors rightly saw the £1 per acre demanded by the 1842 Act as a gross infringement on the natural operation of the free market. Land simply did not produce sufficient wealth to command that price. Gipps' regulations of April 1844 which sought to equate the £1 per acre ideal with the reality of squatting inspired fierce denunciation: "folly ... cruelty .... despicable blunder ... despotism." Not only were the squatters expected to

156 14/10/46; 27/9/49; 19/10/43.
158 21/8/41; 18/7/50.
159 6/4/44.
pay an unreal price, but the government threatened to exercise a power over them, wholly inimical to the liberty of the subject. Through the shifts and changes of the subsequent years, the Herald clung more or less consistently to this point of view. The 1846 Act, although recognised as giving the squatter all he could hope so long as Wakefieldian ideas prevailed at the Colonial Office, was criticised for still requiring that "the relation between the Crown and the great bulk of our graziers be that of landlord and tenant - a relation as incompatible with the dignity and true functions of the monarch as with the freedom and energy of the subject." Frequently the Herald urged that the colonial legislature take over the control of land, and set about fixing a price which would encourage men to buy property, and settle upon it.

Broughton's misgivings about squatting were not altogether absent from the editors' minds. Theirs was the description of the system as a

160 31/3/47.
"gigantic anomaly" which heads chapter III of this thesis. Even at the height of the crisis of 1844 the pastoralists were implored to act "as becomes gentlemen and British subjects", and Gipps' later proposals received a fair hearing. In March 1847 an anonymous reviewer wrote scathingly of the "spirit of disaffection and defiance" which the great squatting companies tended to manifest. But the pastoralists' great crime in the Herald's eye was to advocate the resumption of transportation. Lord Stanley's 'exile' scheme had been favourably considered, but from 1846 onward antipathy to any relic of convictism became increasingly vehement. The society which the Herald wanted to develop must be created by free migration which promised "not only numbers, but pledges of increase, and not pledges of increase only, but pledges also of domestic happiness, of social consolidation, of moral improvement, of political growth."

---

162 9/4/44.
163 10/3/47.
164 1/1/42.
Even the more stable elements of colonial wealth sometimes incurred the Herald's displeasure. Efforts to introduce a local Corn Law which might strengthen the agricultural interest evoked a most unconservative denunciation:

> on this great national question, 'the wisdom of our ancestors' is but another term for the power and self-interest of the landed aristocracy .... to introduce this ancient tissue of blunders into a new country is to sin against the light and knowledge of modern times.

In parenthesis we may remark the Herald's jubilation when Sir Robert Peel abandoned Protection, and the eulogy of that statesman on his death as "the man of progress, in contradistinction from the man of change". Another occasion on which it suspected that unfair advantage was being sought for colonial landowners arose in 1843, when Richard Windeyer urged that the government enliven the economy by advancing credit to this class. Urban capitalists came under fire

165 22/7/41.
166 17/5/46.
167 23/10/50.
168 14/11/43.
earlier in the depression when interest rates rose so high that the Herald was shocked into the aberration of inclining towards a Usury Law. The beggary and ruin which the money-lenders' greed threatened to the community evidently sprang from stupidity beyond natural laws. Opposition to the 1842 Corporation Act was sheeted home to "the Sydney aristocracy" of money-grubbing landlords, fearful of high rates.

The colonial politicians were sometimes found guilty of excessive hostility to the government. When, in October 1843, many elected members of the Council criticised the financial estimates, a warning was at once sounded against carrying the attack too far. In particular, several editorials deprecated any incursion on money set aside for the judiciary—an institution of unique importance:

Its purity, its vigour, its perfect advocacy to the complicated necessities of a civilized people, ought, at whatever expense, to be kept beyond suspicion: for they are the fences which

---

169 16/8/42; 6 & 8/4/42.

170 2/7/42.

171 5/10/43.

172 16/10/43.
guard our property, our liberties, and our lives - all that is dear to us as Britons and as men.

If the councillors applied "the despicable spirit of a Joseph Hume, double distilled" thus immoderately, the Imperial Government would lose all faith in the colony's institutions. In the next year's session the Herald was offended by the councillors' refusal to co-operate with the government in activating the District Councils provided for by the 1842 Constitution. This failure to accept constitutional privileges sprang from querulous, disloyal and contemptible apathy: insofar as the opposition was inspired by reluctance to entail further taxation it was foolishly pernicious, for all development compelled expenditure. When the turbulent year of 1844 came to an end, the Herald judged that the Governor was but slightly more responsible than the Council for the many bitter clashes that had transpired. The Port Phillip separationists underwent

---

173 23/10/43.
174 27/7/44.
175 13/8/44.
176 7/12/44.
a still heavier barrage from similar ammunition.

Their campaign was radical, O'Connellite; the mock-election of Earl Grey as member for Melbourne (a stratagem to highlight the movement) the work of "traitors to their country".

Those who professed to lead left-wing political activity likewise threatened communal unity and cooperation. "To instil into the minds of what are called the working men," expostulated one editorial, "a feeling of class separation, or of class independency, or of class antagonism and rivalry towards the classes from which alone they can obtain employment, and with whose welfare their own is necessarily interwoven, is ... a cruel wrong to society at all times". Politics were as great an evil as intoxicating liquor for such people; their aims were often marked by the same selfishness which inspired Corn Laws and other restrictions on trade. At every election the

178 21/3/44.
179 18/2/41.
180 8 & 10/2/44.
Herald supported candidates of high 'respectability', as a rule the most conservative in the field. A quasi-Chartist address published in 1848 was characteristically dismissed as "this precious morsel of rant".

At such moments, the Herald of the 'forties came very close to the tone of the Stokes-Stephens era. The parallel could be continued quite far. "Larger holdings, by requiring assisted and divided employments, and united and co-operative labour tend to produce and diffuse wealth among all ranks of a community"; here was an 'intellectualised' re-statement of the earlier admiration for the gentleman farmer, especially as against the smallholder. For all the emphasis on personal liberty, the new editors never protested against Master and Servants legislation. Whereas Maconochie had been abused in the past, now the abolition of capital punishment was depicted as "a diseased sympathy towards atrocious criminals". Despite high sounding repudiation of the emancipist-exclusive division - "the great plague spot of our

181 21/12/48.
182 16/2/41.
183 23/9/48; cf 31/7/41.
society, the one great blot upon our happiness" - the appearance of ex-convicts on the hustings or at Government House was firmly rebuked.

The Herald's attitude to constitutional issues re-emphasised its essential conservatism. It urged the establishment of a bicameral legislature wherein the upper house would mediate between "the movement spirit of the people", and "the conservative spirit of the Government." The lower house would express the "movement spirit" and check the executive primarily by its power over finance. The editors, however, professed not to know the meaning of 'responsible government', as that term was used (virtually in the modern sense) by W.C. Wentworth and other colonial politicians. If it implied that executive officers could be dismissed at the legislature's will, then the glorious concept of monarchy was overthrown. Nor did it accept Wentworth's argument that the 1842

184 11/1/42.
185 See especially their attacks on Robert Cooper during '43 election campaign; 8, 9 & 19/6/47.
186 28/3/42.
187 25 & 27/6/44.
Constitution vested the government of the colony into local hands, where it had always by right belonged:

The colonial estate has all along been in the hands of its rightful signiors, the British Empire; it has all along been managed by competent agencies, the agencies constituted and appointed by that empire; and the present agency can have no right to question the powers of its predecessors, since those powers flowed from the same authority as its own.

As the decade progressed the Herald became less wholehearted in its admiration for Imperial power, yet still looked upon the Governor's role as comparable to that of a Prime Minister, with executive powers almost independent of the legislature. Any thought of separation from Britain was repudiated - nothing would be gained and "the only effectual guarantee for the stability of our freedom" be lost.

Like Broughton, the Herald considered a £20 franchise to be dangerously low. The Australian Colonies Government Act was coolly received, because of its even more liberal franchise provisions. The

188 16/1/44.
189 17 & 20/1/49.
190 24/5/50.
editors did not want legislators elected by the whole people, but instead men who would sincerely represent the whole people. The trend towards closer identification of council-member and his particular supporters therefore appeared to them a dangerous one.

Not surprisingly, Kemp, Fairfax and Mansfield gave generous treatment to the interests of religion. Their journal however was far more staunchly pro-Anglican than the sum of their own predilections - in this, it would seem, being conservative by some innate compulsion. Broughton had its warm support at such crucial moments as when Polding assumed a territorial title and Sconce and Makinson defected. The denominational system of education was consistently espoused, for the sanctions of morality without religion were "but a feeble barrier to the animal instincts and impetuous passions". Robert Lowe, Broughton's consistent traducer, came under frequent criticism. One instance followed his argument in a murder trial

\[\text{191 Cf 23/3/44; 1/7/48.}\]
\[\text{192 10/7/44.}\]
that the accused suffered from a psychological defect which denied the power of free will. If this view were accepted, argued the Herald, then the accepted principles of Christianity, government, and morality must all be overthrown.

The support of Anglicanism was complemented by paying short shrift to the Catholic-Irish elements in the population. On occasion, the Romanists were accused of forming a "secret society", contrary to the general well-being; their beliefs described as threatening "the great doctrine ... the universal right of conscience." Southern Irish fell far short of the Herald's ideal working-class migrant, who was a "tractable and teachable" man from the new industrial towns of England.

On matters affecting economic development the journal was far from hidebound, but constantly

193 3/45.
195 25/9/41.
196 2/3/41.
preached the need for stability and settled industry. Even at the depths of the depression the *Herald* refused to surrender to black pessimism, preferring to teach the lesson that speculation was always dangerous and should never be repeated on the scale of earlier years. The editors were particularly proud that the idea of boiling down sheep for tallow, which helped to ease the depression so much, was first aired in their columns. It was precisely the type of action, showing intelligent self-interest and diversifying the economy, which delighted their hearts. Beet sugar, wine, silk, olive oil, and tobacco were all suggested as further buttresses of prosperity. Even small-scale agricultural settlement won some favour. Scientific discoveries and land exploration also promised general advantage: Ludwig Leichhardt was presented as a benefactor to "commerce and civilisation, and all the permanent interests not only of the colonies, but of the whole future population of

197 19/6/43; 21/2/45.
198 14/5/49, 29/8/45, 5/10/46; etc.
Colonists were exhorted to display their manufactures at the Great Exhibition of 1851, the concept of which was welcomed with tremendous enthusiasm.

In a general retrospect published on New Year's Day, 1850, the Herald expressed satisfaction at the colony's progress, achieved as it had been "without any of those extraordinary accidents to which some other countries are indebted for a mushroom precocity of growth. We owe nothing to gold-dust or precious stones." Throughout the following year, the editors maintained a smugly critical attitude to the excitement and dislocation precipitated by the Californian gold-rushes. No wonder then that the local discoveries of April-May 1851 were but coldly received. "It appears that this colony is to be cursed with a gold-digging mania" was the theme of much unhappy comment.

So we are reminded yet again of the Herald's antipathy to events and influences which threatened

---

199 6/8/50.
200 21/2/50; 16/3/50.
201 16/5/51.
to break conventional moulds. "Our Conservative principles are well known," remarked one editorial, "and we are glad that some members of the community must be Conservative by virtue of their station and office." An English Tory may have found these words somewhat strange from a disciple of Adam Smith, but in the particular conditions of N.S.W. his own conservatism would have been irrelevant, even ludicrous. Even the Herald was frequently tagged with such epithets as "dear, lacrymose, old Granny", but it is hard to see that the task of maintaining the status quo could have been better performed. The proprietors of another journal once remarked of a rumour that the estate of Ward Stephens was to resume the Herald, that "the latter would then be sure to go headlong into the ranks of the Tory party - ours will then be the task to preserve the balance of the constitution - to prevent the encroachment of either party

202 13/4/49.

203 Heads of the People : II, 92; Star 23/3/44; Arden's Sydney Magazine (F3548) Oct '42 : i.
on the liberties of the people." The implied compliments were thoroughly deserved. The Herald appealed to an intelligent, disinterested elite against the ravages of greed and mobocracy. It trusted that this class could be found, and under its guidance the colony might become an Elysium of solid prosperity. God would reign in heaven, and on earth men would fulfill the duties of their respective stations in happy co-operation.

* 

The other newspaper mentioned in the previous paragraph was the Australian, which after various changes of ownership had been taken over by Messrs Statham and Forster, backed by James Macarthur. Under this management strenuous efforts were made to rebuild the paper as a powerful influence, although on an ideological basis different from the ardent liberalism with which it had campaigned.

204 Statham & Forster/J. Macarthur, ML MS A2927: 1/11/44.

205 The story is told in the above volume of Macarthur letters.
against Governor Darling. Yet it never became more than a shadow of the Herald, pursuing broadly similar policies but without the same conviction and depth. The Statham-Forster/Macarthur partnership collapsed, and the Australian staggered to its death (1848) as the organ of Benjamin Boyd.

In V.D.L. the Launceston Examiner (founded 1842) merits consideration if for no other reason than Fairfax was later to appoint its chief leader-writer, Rev. John West, first formal editor of the Herald (1854). Very sympathetic with urban financial interests, the Examiner was perhaps even more whole-hearted than the Herald in its devotion to laissez-faire philosophy:

> the grand truths are widening their dominion on the minds of men, which will ultimately effect more in the cause of justice, religion, and commerce than ten thousand exclusive laws, that every man has a full right to do and to enjoy all that does not invade the equal right of his neighbour, and that an executive government should rarely be seen but in the administration of justice, and the protection of the people.

206 HRA : XXVI, 168.

207 12/3/42.
When propounding such theory, and often when applying it to practical affairs, the Examiner was very much the counterpart of the older journal. But whereas the latter found its hero in Peel, this lauded Richard Cobden as "the man of the age". At least in this phase of his career, West tended to carry "the grand truths" to an extreme which Kemp and Mansfield would have considered dangerous.

The Hobart Town Courier (1831-59) once claimed that "our leading characteristic has been a repudiation of factions, and a tone of consistent moderation." Again we are reminded of the Herald, and again the comparison can be pursued with some advantage. The Courier gave a much fairer hearing than did most of their contemporaries to the successive Governors. At the beginning of our period it attacked the demands for self-government of an early political association; at the end, forecast that the Australian Colonies Government Act might pave the way for local sovereignty

208 12/6/50.
209 28/2/46.
within the Imperial framework. The franchise, its editor believed, should be determined on the basis of intelligence, length of colonial residence, and "social responsibility". Sensitive to the threat in colonial life of "independence of mind breaking down every barrier of religion, or treating it as world worship", the Courier advocated tolerance of all denominations, although giving its decided preference to the Church of England. This journal was so sympathetic to the large farmer that it supported the legal restriction of both interest and wage rates. It was consistently hostile towards "the mephitic, demoralising, wicked, slanderous" press which sought to inflame the popular minds.

Colonial magazines were even more disinclined to conservatism than the newspaper press. A partial
exception to this rule was the Australia Felix Monthly Magazine, published in Geelong. In lauding the ties which bound the colony to Britain one contributor attacked his enemies in thorough-going Tory style:

if we reject these instincts which sway the mind, whether or no, and pull down and build up according to the manner of our own puny intellects - we are gainsaying the institution of both God and man - and degrading to the level of mere human reason, a system of things, which, though not opposed to it, is above and beyond it. If, then, in Port Phillip society has been shorn of much which ornaments it at home, and if we are reduced to a more humble style of social architecture - let us not throw away the few graces we have left, and turn a British settlement into a Yankee republic .... Let us remember, that it was in colonial independence that the torch which has consumed half Europe was first lighted.

Perhaps it was the same writer who slated "The Progress of Democracy" throughout the world. As against Rousseau's belief in the perfectibility of human beings, he posited their fallen and dependent nature, and so the common man's incapacity for self-government.

216 I, 74 seq.
These same themes were taken up by The Politician, launched in April 1851 by a group of Australian natives. Throughout its brief existence this little magazine argued for conservative principles with unique fidelity and determination. The richest superlatives avowed the editors' loyalty to Britain, so as to demonstrate how mistakenly their compatriots' opinions "have been perverted and put forth by democratic agitators". Consciously defying the blatant optimism of time and place, one article referred to "this insignificant colony"; another attacked all working-class political action as a subversive manoeuvre to secure monopoly over the labour market. The young G.W. Rusden probably was the writer of an enquiry "On the True Principle of Representation, as Applied to Colonies." His answer was not population, nor even population and

217 I, iii.
218 I, 36.
219 I, 21.
220 I, 35 seq; cf G.W.R's letter to SMH, 12/1/47.
property, but "productive industry": in practice this meant that Sydney must not be allowed to swamp the pastoral interest.

Further dredging of editorials or articles broadly 'conservative' in tone would render little profit. Demonstrably, there were men of ability and intelligence throughout the colonies who wanted society to be guided by traditional beliefs concerning class, creed, and politics. We have now to see whether there existed sufficient men of wealth and power to put such ideas into effect.
II CONSERVATIVE POWER

The Gentry

The Herald of the 'thirties accurately distinguished the colonial group best equipped to mould society according to a conservative ideal: the men who owned (through either grant or purchase) and lived upon extensive country properties. The history, even the existence of these 'gentry' has rarely attracted notice. Only the little-read work of Samuel Bennett, History of Australia's Discovery and Colonisation, attempts to measure their significance. He saw the landowners' effort to leave their impress on Australia as an inspiring episode: "the pride of race - the consciousness of high social standing - the sentiment of family antiquity - however absurd when carried to excess, are capable of exercising, if kept under proper control, a very restraining and refining influence upon individual character." This is an excellent text for our discussion.

1 S. Bennett: The History of Australian Discovery and Colonisation, Sydney 1867: 629. See also G.H. Nadel, Studies in Thought..., HS: VII, 166.
Bennett's care to qualify his admiration, the implied warning against romanti­cism, must not be forgotten. Throughout this chapter, finer spirits and aspirations occupy our attention to the almost complete exclusion of the base and ignoble. There were undoubtedly stupid, irresponsible men among the gentry; equipped with all the anti-social attributes arising from selfishness, greed, and arrogance. Yet most nations, classes, and sects are finally judged by their elite. The men whose names appear most often in the following paragraphs were not average members of the group, but they were its bona­fide representatives, both in the Councils and public meetings of the time and before the judgement of posterity.

By standards of Australian geography, the gentry were concentrated quite close together. In N.S.W., an iron limit was set by the declared 'counties', roughly filling the arc drawn in a 200-mile radius around Sydney, in which alone land could be held on freehold. There was a fairly steady progression of estates westward from Sydney: Camden, Campbelltown, Goulburn and Bathurst were notable
foci. The river valleys, naturally, attracted many settlers. This applied especially to the Fish, the Macquarie and above all to the Hunter, along which stretched by far the most solid and imposing array. Other important districts were around Queanbeyan in the south and the New England tablelands. The Tasmanian gentry were scattered throughout the broad chevron running diagonally between the central-north and central-east coast, Launceston and Hobart being the pivots. In the senior colony, the number of estates may have reached 400; in the junior, 250.

The background of the gentry group varied widely. The oldest-established could trace their colonial roots to the first twenty years of Australian history — to the officers of the military (Macarthur, Fenn Kemp, Lawson, Piper) or civil (Wentworth, Palmer, Jamison) establishment; to non-commissioned ranks of the N.S.W. Corps (Faithfull,

2 R. Dixon: Map of the Colony of New South Wales, 4th edition corrected up to 1846.

3 G. Franklin, Map of Van Diemen's Land, London 1839 (TSA).

4 For good nominal list to that time see New South Wales and Van Diemen's Land Crown Lands Papers, HC 16/7/32.
Bradley); to the few score of free settlers sent out while the foundation ideal of peasant proprietorship retained some force (Rouse, Bowman of Archerfield, Badgery); even to the convict ranks (Lord, Pye, Reibey, Dry). The Campbells of Duntroon, William Campbell of Harrington Park, Alexander Berry, and John Grono were all men who had become landed proprietors in N.S.W. after being among the first traders and seamen to develop the colony's commerce. So early as 1805, the British Government had been attracted to the idea of encouraging settlers of larger means and prestige to migrate. The outstanding survivor of the handful who accordingly went to Australia was the Blaxland family. The Australian mourned John Blaxland in 1846 as "a type of the English Country Gentleman. In his mind and even in his features, he was emphatically Saxon". That obituary would have given its subject very deep pleasure.

5 J.K.S. Houison, John and Gregory Blaxland, RAHSJ : XXI, 1 seq.

6 20/1/46.
These were the men described by James Mudie to the Molesworth Committee as "the ancient nobility". That adjective was the key word: indeed it often became the noun used to describe the pioneer gentry. Blaxland himself had been classed as "one of the ancients". Governor Bourke wrote to the Colonial Office in 1837 regretting the death of "Mr Archibald Bell, an ancient and estimable Colonist"; a left-wing newspaper referred to Alexander Berry with half-reverence, as "The Ancient Nominee". The use of the word reflected the role of this class in mitigating the raw crudity of colonial life.

The 'ancient' nucleus was much augmented in the 'twenties and early 'thirties. These years were the hey-day of the gentry, as the Colonial Office sought to realise the plans suggested in 1822-23 by J.T. Bigge, who in turn had been deeply influenced

7 Transportation Committee, HC 14/7/37 : 1663 seq. Mudie was author of The Felony of New South Wales, London 1837.
8 14/9/37.
9 HRA XVIII : 754.
10 PA 22/9/49.
by the visions of John Macarthur. R.W. Hay as Colonial Officer, Alexander Macleay as Colonial Secretary, T.H. Scott as Archdeacon, Ralph Darling and George Arthur as Governors were all more or less devoted servants of the concept of a powerful gentry, settled on extensive acres granted them by the Crown and made productive by the ample labour of Britain's unwanted criminals. The nature of these new men is stated, directly and by implication, in a resolution sponsored by the non-official members of the Legislative Council of N.S.W. in 1838:

That, in the opinion of this Council, the numerous Free Emigrants of character and capital, including many officers of the Army and Navy, and East India Company's Service, who have settled in the Colony, with their families, together with a rising generation of Native-born Subjects, constitute a body of Colonists, who, in the exercise of the social and moral relations of life, are not inferior to the Inhabitants of any other Dependency of the British Crown, and are sufficient to impress a character of respectability upon the Colony at large.

Running through P.C. Mowle's *Genealogical History of the Pioneer Families of Australia* one comes upon

11 V & P 17/7/38.

12 Sydney 1948. See also the works of Griffith and Sharman noted below.
name after name which fits into the pattern thus suggested - Baylis, Blomfield, Boydell, Close, Gibson, Rodd, Shadford, Steel, Waldron.

Distinguished lineages were not common, but many had learnt some concept of leadership in their service careers. This background was stressed by one commentator who had spent some years among the Tasmanian gentry. Such men, he said, "felt it a duty incumbent on them to exert a control over their own actions and conduct, and maintain an elevated tone of manner". Perhaps this trait was particularly evident in the island, where ancients were rare, the men of the 'twenties correspondingly dominant.

The mere fact that these settlers could not hope to rise to the heights of British society, probably encouraged them to put down roots all the faster and more firmly into Australian soil. This readiness was splendidly apparent in the homes they built. Just as the Macarthsurs were the gentry prototype, so their residence, Camden Park, stood out from

its peers. Designed by John Verge, its outward aspect remains impressive to this day. We can also learn much about its contemporary furnishing, for James Macarthur kept careful accounts when in 1836-37 he went to England, married an English bride, and bought English wares for his home. Among his purchases were abundant saddlery and harness; glass and china; prints of the Duke of Wellington, the Earl of Eldon, the first Earl Grey, and Sir Walter Scott. One merchant in Regent Street provided eighteen French polished mahogany dining chairs, ninety-nine yards of first quality Brussels carpet, and a "pair of rich crimson silk and worsted bell ropes with tassels and rosettes".

Australia's foremost poetess has recently described Dalwood, the Hunter Valley home of her progenitors:

a great house of cool stone corridors and high ceilinged rooms, of wide iron-barred doors opening on a stone flagged courtyard where servants pumped water splashing into pails; down the passages and through the windows wandered scents from

---

14 ML MS A2973 : passim. For an ecstatic description of Camden Park, see H. Chavanne, Une Jeune Suisse en Australie, Geneva 1852 : 81 seq.

Grandmamma's garden - summer roses, lemon-hedge, lavender and sage and queer herbs for tisanes ...

George Wyndham, the owner of Dalwood, had spent some £6,000 on his estate, and came under Bourke's consideration as a likely nominee to the Legislative Council. As were the Macarthurs to the ancients, so was he to the new gentry. Yet the names and the known history of many other estates carry the same suggestion of leisured cultivation. Piper's "Alloway Bank", Wentworth's "Windermere", Thomas Walker's "Yaralla" in N.S.W.; Fenn Kemp's "Mount Vernon", Dry's "Quamby", Lord's "Quorn Hall" in V.D.L. - these are some which come to mind. Even the less imposing structures could strike a deep impression. Of one relatively small establishment a young Scotsman wrote "in all my subsequent travels I have never seen anything more calculated to convey the

16 HRA XIX : 637-38.
17 HRA XX : 54.
idea of home, of simple natural domestic life, and of family associations."

Very often, the stables were a particularly impressive appendage to the estate, for as with the English squirarchy and Southern planters, the horse was very dear to the Australian gentry. This appeared very clearly in the first Australian sporting magazine, launched by one of their number. Jorrocks, Australia's first hero of the racecourse, was praised at lavish length; the history of the thoroughbred horse in N.S.W. carefully detailed; news of the turf and hunting (kangaroos or native dogs) reviewed. Other articles dealt with fishing, woorang shooting, and "Wild Cattle Hunting in the Blue Mountains". Although irrigation and defence and even the fine arts also

19 ML MS A858 : 4 (written in 1860 of George Bowman's home at Richmond).

20 D.C.F. Scott, for whom see HRA XXIII : 358-9.

21 The New South Wales Sporting Magazine (F4842a) : I, 4 seq; 18 seq; 120 seq; The Australasian Sporting Magazine : I, 29 seq; 33 seq.

22 ASM : I, 64 seq; 92 seq; 117 seq.
received the editor's attention, the overall flavour was very much that of saddlery and horse-flesh. Among particular families who devoted much care to the breeding of horses, hunting and racing were the Scotts of Glendon, the Rouses of Windsor, and the Kearneys of Richmond, V.D.L. William Kearney earned the sobriquet of "Squire" largely, it appears, because of his devotion to the hunt. From his estate "Laburnum Park", the Richmond Club would set out on the chase, to return to open-handed hospitality.

The horse, indeed, not only provided the gentry with much personal pleasure, but gave them a bond in common. They came together in hunt and jockey clubs, on occasion organising a tourney of events, topped off by a grand Ball, which would have pleased the heart of

---

23 The New South Wales Sporting and Literary Magazine and Racing Calendar (a continuation of the NSWSM): II, 172; ASM: I, 5 seq; 36 seq.


Sir Walter Scott. The inter-marriage of two Tasmanian families was appropriately celebrated at Quorn Hall, by a chase after not kangaroos or dingoes, but stags! The house-party went on for days, pigeon-shooting and cricket filling the men's spare day-time hours, while at night "the votaries of Terpischore and Calliope" had free rein.

More formal, if not necessarily more important ties, further bound the gentry together. The Australian Club in Sydney and the Union Club in Hobart were their citadels. The former, founded in 1838, had an upper membership limit (first 200, then 300); election was by ballot; and one black ball in ten would exclude a candidate. "All the aristocracy of the country are in it", wrote Stuart Alexander Donaldson, chief organiser of the institution. The Australian Subscription Library was the cultural equivalent to the Club, and equipped with similar powers of exclusion; in some

26 A splendid description appears in HTC 5/11/44.
29 See chapter VII.
country towns - Yass and Bothwell are examples - there were smaller libraries or literary societies catering to the same taste of the same class.

The Hunter River settlers planned an ambitious society, through which might be organised a circulating library and public lectures as well as agricultural shows and festivals. The former objectives largely had to be abandoned, but the latter were pursued as in many other districts. The gentry's leadership became clear in the provision on such occasions for awards to employees with long-service records, as well as finesse in the agricultural skills. A group of squires might come together to organise a ploughing match, which all the locals would attend and afterwards disport themselves in Merrie England style.

Two Tasmanian organisations - the Midland Agricultural Association and the Northern Agricultural Association - belong to, yet transcend this category.

30 MM 18/3/43, 6/1/44, etc.
31 E.g. Penrith and Hawkesbury Agricultural Society, SMH 26/7/45.
32 E.g. Sorell, CT 28/9/47.
That is to say, they went beyond discussing farm science and holding shows to become quasi-political organisations. They earnestly propagated their own importance. "I designate the land and agricultural interests the principal wheel in this complicated piece of machinery" argued the Chairman of the Midland Association, when describing the colony's political economy to Sir John Franklin; "it sets all the others in motion, and it cannot clog without causing a general stagnation."

This association openly repudiated opinions of its patron, Sir Eardley Wilmot, in the darkest days of his government; Sir William Denison came close to receiving a similar snub, and took it as a very heartening sign when the danger passed away.

During the mid-thirties, both colonies produced a crop of regional associations "for the Suppression of Felonies and Misdemeanours". More

33 HTC 4/6/41.
34 HTC 12/9/46.
35 Varieties of Vice-Regal Life: I, 126-27.
36 HTC 13/5/36 (Oatlands); 13/11/35 (northern districts; SMH 7/5/35 (Bathurst); 9/7/35 (Cumberland).
bluntly, they were posses to curb stock-stealing. No mystic significance need be attached to this development, but it did emphasise the gentry's readiness to see themselves as the arbiters of the community: to make laws and to enforce them. The point became clear in the next decade when Eardley-Wilmot firmly rejected the Midlanders' plan to form a yeomanry so that bushranging might be combatted. Levying of armed troops, he insisted was a prerogative of the Crown.

Instinctively and inevitably the gentry expressed their cohesion and leadership on all sorts of public occasions. They dominated meetings which welcomed or farewelled local dignitaries - the police magistrate, the parson, the Governor on tour. They addressed the monarch on occasions of royal death, accession, marriage, and parenthood. Public meetings, discussing anything from major political issues to the foundation of a local hospital or mechanics institute, normally came under

the same aegis. Helenus Scott and E.C. Close were arch-typical figures in such activity.

Many of the gentry were active in Church affairs. The Church of England naturally gained the support of most, and such men as the Campbells of Duntroon, Francis Rossi, the Macarthurs, Blaxland, William Bowman, the Throsbys of Berrima built churches and chapels or otherwise endowed Anglican funds. Local landowners became lay officers in many country churches. George Cox expressed an opinion doubtless very common among his class when he declared his faith in this Church, since it embodied "a Religion our Queen and Country profess and therefore believe to be right". The Erastianism of that remark suggests why Broughton found less than absolute comfort in the support of such men; James Macarthur's refusal to protest against the Church Act, followed by his alliance with a prominent

38 A cursory study of the MM emphasising the point.
Roman Catholic in the 1843 election further emphasised that even the noblest gentry need not grant unalloyed support to the Church of England. A few members of the class owed allegiance to other faiths: the Tasmanian Russells to Presbyterianism, James Bowman to the Free Presbyterian Church, the O'Briens of Yass to Roman Catholicism, and so on. In sum, the squire and parson were tied less closely in Australia than in Britain, yet the connection remained.

The intermingling of the gentry continued in their personal life. The Anglican schools, we have seen, were deliberately intended to cater for the children of such men, and broadly achieved that aim. Apparently the King's School did not quite meet the demands of some Hunter River settlers: at one time there was a move to establish at Maitland an "Academy or College .... conducted in a manner calculated to impart not merely scholastic knowledge; but, also that gentlemanly tone and bearing which are difficult of acquirement in a Colony so peculiarly situated as this." The elite of the gentry - James Macarthur

\[41\] Draft to MacQuoid, Cowper, etc, 25/7/39 : ML MS A2995; below.

\[42\] SMH 12/4/38.
and the like - might be able to go to England to find their brides, but the majority had willy-nilly to choose from local families of equal rank. Examples could be quoted at very great length: Macarthur-King-Bowman; Bell-Cox; Sorell-Kemp; Lawson-Bettington, and so on. No historian could touch this subject without reference to the name of David Scott Mitchell, which incorporated the patronymics of two powerful Hunter River families and belonged to the man whose collection of Australiana laid the basis for one of the world's great libraries. A study of the gentry's progeny remains to be written. Judith Wright, Patrick White, and Russell Drysdale are among the names which merit prominent place in such a record.

In a word, the gentry dominated 'society'. The sensitivity of the Herald to the rights of gentlemen was not at all untypical: such feelings thoroughly permeated both colonies and so will attract our attention from time to time. Government House was the focus for this emotion. "Being, or not being, admitted here is, in this place, considered as the great criterion of a person's
social position," wrote Lady Denison, whose letters and journals frequently emphasise the significance attached to receiving invitations to her husband's entertainments, and the granting of precedence. A natural complement of this feeling was described by G.F. Davidson, an erstwhile merchant-trader who settled on the Paterson River:

To obtain admission to good society in Sydney when my family first arrived there, was no easy matter. Not that there was any lack of it in the place, but the residents were, very properly, shy of strangers, unless provided with testimonials as to their respectability.

Again that ubiquitous word! Yet not meaningless; the concept of respectability was a major ingredient in the mortar which held the gentry together.

At this point, however, a reservation must be entered against our general emphasis on the unity of gentry. Their social hauteur pleased Davidson, but not everyone so reacted, and these dissidents included embryo-gentry who found themselves ostracised. Thus James Mudie spoke of "the

---

43 Varieties: I, 58; also 35-36, 43 seq.

ancient nobility" not in awe, but sarcastic envy. His own peculiarities and pretensions partly explain why he should have been driven to this position; but there is other evidence to show that as each batch of landholders became settled, they looked with jealousy on those who followed. The basic reason was simple: the more numerous the gentry, the greater became competition for the government's bounty of land and labour.

The nature of the 'ancients' provided further reason for division. It was not quickly forgotten who were the sons of officers, or of 'poor frees', or of convicts. If among the 'ancients' themselves, there was plentiful cause for unease, the immigrant of the 'twenties might well look upon the whole group with some contempt. "The free colonists who came out in Sir Thomas Brisbane's time, /were/ men of station and education", later declared one of their sympathisers, "... but an early Gazette showed

45 D.W. Rawson, Factions in New South Wales Politics; passim; W.A. Duncan, Notes of a Ten Year's Residence in N.S.W., Hogg's Instructor : V, 132.
the tracts opened through their enterprise granted to the sons and daughters of officials, to pliant secretaries, to grog-selling captains, and to conveniently perjuring officers of police." This approached hyperbole; it remained true, however, that even the patriarchs of the two colonies, John Macarthur and Anthony Fenn Kemp, had helped depose Governor Bligh. Thus, in N.S.W. especially, the turbulent past could provide continuing tension.

Nor was there absolute ideological conformity. We have already seen the truth of this as applied to religion, and need to bear it in mind as we approach a study of gentry politics. W.C. Wentworth, to take the surpassing example, often behaved in typical gentry fashion both in his social relations (sending his son off to Trinity, Cambridge, he bid him uphold the "honor of your family & your country") and his politics; yet he will appear in the next two chapters as the spokesman of other interests. This diversity

---

sprang in part from Wentworth's dubious background, but also from his appetite for intellectual adventure.

The Gentry and Constitutional Structure

One dominant fact has already become clear: the belief of the gentry that they were the natural leaders of society. This principle they sought to impress on the legal and political institutions of their adopted country. Although the various Governors differed in their estimate of the gentry, all to some extent recognised their claim to particular respect. Accordingly, the great majority of non-official nominees to the Legislative Councils of both colonies had typical gentry backgrounds. Towards mid-century, the number of exceptions increased, but not so much as to distort the overall picture. Again, when Gipps appointed the original District Councils, the list read like a nominal roll of the local landholders, with the most prestigious carefully chosen to act as wardens. The same Governor warmly supported the idea

---

48 The names were published in the Government Gazette throughout the latter months of 1843. The plan was for these Councils to become elective after being put into motion by the nominees.
of the Imperial Government creating an Order which might appropriately reward distinguished colonists. His list of suggested recipients from central N.S.W. comprised the leading Government servants, civil and military, and also James Macarthur, P.P. King, Robert Campbell, William Macarthur ("Brother of Mr James Macarthur above named, and with him joint proprietor of large estates"), Thomas Icely, Edward Hamilton, Francis Rossi, and Helenus Scott ("A settler on the River Hunter, Warden of the District Council of Patrick's Plains, and the eldest of several Brothers, sons of one of the oldest Settlers"). These were the Lords of Australia.

Of more immediate importance, even than their place in the Councils, was the squires' role as Justices of the Peace. Thereby, as the Stokes-Stephen Herald appreciated, they could exercise a very powerful influence over the administration of justice, especially outside the metropolis. Every local bench could, and probably at most sittings did, comprise a majority of non-stipendiary magistrates, certainly

49 HRA XXIV : 126-27.
with economic interests in common and often linked by marriage or friendship. In brief, class law prevailed.

This was particularly, almost incredibly true, on the larger estates. Thus Alexander Berry ordered the local constable to maintain decorum in and around his establishment at Shoalhaven:

you are hereby requested to bring charges against Mr Hyams the Publican for a Breach of the Licensing regulations - and amongst other things for keeping John Watts the Cooper for a whole week in his house in a state of drunkenness and intoxication - and for coming upon this establishment & endeavouring to entice James Murray one of the Shepherds from his duty to go to his house as there was to be some fine Sport - you are also to bring charges against - Wells & Knight the Sawyers near the Ferry for Selling Spirits without a Licence.

The same lesson was taught time and again by the evidence given to a N.S.W. Legislative Council Committee which enquired into the condition of the police in 1835. T.A. Murray, for example, deposed that although a member of the Goulburn bench he rarely attended there, "as I hold police courts at

---

50 Letter to T. Tanner, 2/5/48 : Berry Papers V.

51 Minutes of Evidence, LC 16/6/35. The evidence was not published in question-answer form.
my own residence ... where a constable and scourger are stationed." The court was held actually within Murray's own home, and, as on many estates, there was a private lock-up alongside. The amateur justices obviously worked hard at their job; they were, indeed, essential elements in the business of government.

The influence of these dignitaries could go well beyond the apparently narrow bounds of their jurisdiction. As indicated in the previous chapter, a major theme of Bourke's government was his attempt to strengthen the executive vis-à-vis the amateur justice. This was the setting for the famous Brisbane Water cases, when the government moved against Messrs Donnison, Bean, and Moore for allegedly stealing cattle from a ticket-of-leave man. Donnison published a long account of these proceedings, suffused with indignation that such a person as himself - a Justice of the Peace - should be so treated. He depicted how, at the hearing before a stipendiary magistrate, he cross-examined a proletarian witness named Bramble:

52 The Brisbane Water Cases, Sydney 1838 (F2449) : 28 footnote.
the fellow crossed his arms, and with a knowing and familiar nod, said "come now, Donnison, I tell you what it is, I never stole any thing from you." Mr Donnison said "pray, Captain Faunce, do not allow that fellow to address me in such a manner." Captain Faunce - "I can't help it, Sir, you are only a common criminal." Mr Donnison - "I have appealed to you as a Magistrate, Captain Faunce, I now appeal to you as a gentleman." Captain Faunce (very mildly) - "Don't address Mr Donnison in that way, Bramble."

Perhaps the incident didn't go precisely that way, but the tone of its relation has intrinsic significance.

The gentry consistently strove to magnify their juristic power as against the government's. The election of Riddell over Therry as Chairman of Quarter Sessions illustrated this; in 1838 the non-official legislators carried this offensive further by moving in Council that the Court of Requests, of which Therry was Chairman, should be disbanded and its work left to the justices. The same group also pressed for the establishment of a grand jury, which would take over from the Attorney-General the task of deciding whether particular criminal prosecutions should go forward. Donnison had fervently maintained that such a body

53 SMH 31/8/38; 7/9/38.
54 Australian 15/6/39.
would have quashed the proceedings against himself, and if - as might have been expected - his fellow-squires had been jurors, that was very likely. At the same time, some of the gentry campaigned against the total abolition of military juries in criminal cases, a further liberal blow against class law. A decade later the Legislative Council stood very firm against a suggestion that the Courts of Quarter Sessions be abolished.

Important though the gentry's views on law certainly were, they only implied their theory of politics and contested but one frontier of the struggle for power. It is both instructive and necessary to study their attitude to broader constitutional issues, although in doing so there is increasing danger of attributing to the whole class opinions of a few articulate spokesmen. As in the previous paragraphs, N.S.W. must dominate our attention for early Tasmanian history fostered neither the careful statement of ideals nor the organisation

55 49 seq.
56 Col 15/10/39; cf HRA XX : 497.
57 SMH 13/7/49.
of dramatic campaigns.

Our standing point, therefore, is the senior colony in the middle years of Bourke's government. The so-called 'Hunter River clique' - the Scotts to the forefront - expressed their bitter opposition to every facet of that Governor's liberalism. James Mudie's book *The Felony of New South Wales* embodied a crude form of this antipathy, just as did the columns of the *Herald*. Soon, however, the gentry produced a few spokesmen - James Macarthur particularly - who gave an intellectual edge to this feeling. An incentive to this change was the running out of the seven-year term originally prescribed for the 1828 Judicature Act. In the event this statute was extended as long again, but immediately the various colonial interests had urgent reason to try to influence the British Government. Accordingly there now crystallised the otherwise amorphous conflict between 'emancipists' - alias Australian liberals - and 'exclusives' - as the

58 The struggle is most interestingly reflected in Bourke's correspondence, especially in letters from G.K. Holden, Deas Thomson, and Therry, Bourke Papers.
gentry and their supporters were appropriately described. The latter group's case was put in two petitions, addressed respectively to the King and the House of Commons, and in Macarthur's book *New South Wales; Its Present State and Future Prospects*. This most interesting work was published in London in 1837, where and when its author was conducting an intense lobbying campaign.

Macarthur's introduction declared that "The Petitioners look to the colony as their home, and the home of their children", thus bringing to the fore one of the gentry's major strengths - their attachment to the new land, and consequent determination to affect its destiny. These sentiments, the author continued, were revolted by the use of the

---

59 HRA XVIII : 392 seq.

60 The book was written in extensive collaboration with Edward Edwards, for whom see the article by J. Metcalfe, RAHSJ : XXXVIII, 153 seq.

61 His letters scattered throughout CO 201/258, 267, and 282 make most interesting reading, especially by contrast with the rhodomontade of Mudie's correspondence over the same period. See also A.C.V. Melbourne, *Early Constitutional Development in Australia New South Wales 1788-1856*; Rawson; chapter IV below.

62 11.
colony as a convict dump. He especially deplored Governor Macquarie's policies which had tended to glorify convictism, and to permanently brand N.S.W. with its stigmata. In particular - and here Macarthur approached the core of the political struggle - ex-convicts had come to think "that the colony was theirs by right, and that the emigrant settlers were interlopers upon the soil."

He urged that a very different dynamic should sustain the community: in effect that the colony should be handed over, morally and constitutionally, to such men as himself. To this end, transportation should be critically re-examined, with an eye to its replacement by extensive migration of the free proletariat. Ex-convicts should not be granted civil rights as a matter of course, or on a simple basis of wealth. In such a community as N.S.W. the possession of property too often was unaccompanied by the sense of honour and obligation which should distinguish the political elite. Instead the franchise

63 27.

64 Cf the 'Commons' petition, HRA XVIII : 397.
and right to sit on juries should be allotted by the Justices of the Peace in each district. These justices, or their social equals, should alone be eligible for the legislature which Macarthur postulated: two-thirds elective, one-third nominated by the Crown, and so equipped as to delicately tread the balance between the potential dangers of extreme self-government and the current situation in which the executive, possibly unsympathetic to the 'exclusives', held an impregnable position. In the light of our previous remarks the emphasis on the role of the magistracy is particularly interesting. The petition to the King had already protested against the unchecked power of the government to order dismissals from the commission of the peace, as also from the judiciary.

The exclusive case was set against a backdrop whereon the crime and immorality of the colony were luridly painted. To some extent these factors were emphasised merely to denigrate Bourke's administration, especially the admission of ex-convicts to the right of jury service. Yet it would be dangerous to
suppose that the exclusives did not feel they were indeed attempting to stem fearful ravage. Sincerity rings through many pages of Macarthur's book, and such passages from the petitions as this:

Your Petitioners are sensible that upon the measures, that may be now adopted for the Government of the Colony, depends their own best interests, as well as those of their children. Property, life, reputation, moral and political well-being, whatever in short should be dear to men who have been taught to distinguish a rational and well-founded freedom from the disorganizing doctrines, which, under the name of liberty, would subvert the land-marks of social order, and, confounding just distinctions, sap the foundations of society: all these are at stake.

Unfortunately for the historian the firmness of the exclusives' position in the mid-'thirties soon melted, and was never restored in comparable degree. Too many events moved too fast. One was the cessation of transportation - directly abetted by the petitions of Macarthur's evidence to the Molesworth Committee, but a heavy blow to the exclusives' unity and prosperity. Similarly, the inflow of free migrants, which Macarthur had urged, also created new forces inimical to his ideal. The

66 HRA XVIII : 395.
last issue on which anti-emancipist feeling acted as a political rallying call for the gentry was a Bill of 1840 which proposed to establish a municipal corporation in Sydney. The high feeling raised against the grant of equal privileges to ex-convicts forced Gipps temporarily to withdraw the legislation. This was a victory for the exclusives, but early in the following year Macarthur publicly signified that he wished to pursue the old quarrel no further.

Patently, that intelligent politician had decided that changing times necessitated changing policies. No doubt, many of the gentry did not follow Macarthur's line of thought, but in his behaviour over the years 1839-43 - and nowhere else - we can see a consistent attempt to achieve political leadership on conservative principles. As a nominee member of the Council he took up the theme of opposition to imperial taxation. There was sound precedent for this. John Blaxland had pioneered the protests, to grow louder and louder with every year, against

68 SMH 6/2/41.
colonial revenues being charged with police and gaol expenses, made very heavy by the prevalence of Britain's convicts; from 1838-40 the non-official councillors fought vehemently against an Ordnance Bill which merely proposed to reserve a few tracts of land for the use of the British Army, but was interpreted as threatening the growth of an imperial military despotism. During the 1840 Council session Macarthur joined in denouncing the burden of police expenses and led the opposition to a public works Bill, invoking "the great principle of Whiggism" against taxation without representation. "There were many with the spirit of Hampden in this colony," he proudly asserted, very likely remembering the country-squire background of that famous rebel. In 1842 Macarthur came out against the revised Corporation Bill not because it discriminated against ex-convicts, but since yet further imposts would be entailed.

69 V & P 20/9/38; HRA XIX : 609-10.
70 HRA XIX : 592 seq.
71 SMH 8/10/40.
72 SMH 17/7/40.
73 SMH 7 & 13/7/42.
So we see that Macarthur was remaining true to his promise of February 1841, that the emancipist-exclusive division should be forgotten. The particular occasion of that declaration was a meeting called to protest against Lord John Russell's legislation of 1840. This threatened the 'dismemberment' of the colony, that is its division into three districts, which for various reasons would damage the economic interests of Sydney and the established landholders. Consequently, a rough alliance was now formed between Macarthur and W.C. Wentworth, previously identified with the liberal-emancipist element. The next year both were active in the appointment of a committee, which was to petition the imperial authorities for colonial self-government. Macarthur accepted election to this body along with men whom we would have scorned as dangerous radicals a few years earlier. He did however draw the line at Henry Macdermott, outspoken leader of a popular-radical element. "They were to decide whether they would have their rights and privileges as Englishmen," said Macarthur, successfully blocking this candidature, "or that vile democracy which has led to so much anarchy and confusion in
different parts of the world. On the committee Macarthur pursued a line of moderate conservatism, holding out against approval of a £10 franchise but not otherwise being notably 'exclusive'.

Naturally, he presented himself for election to the new Council. Wentworth spoke from his platform on nomination day claiming that Macarthur had now accepted his own political views. The candidate himself admitted that in the past he might have been over-wary of change; now he "stood there as the champion of constitutional freedom and rational liberty, in contradistinction to wild and perilous republicanism." Throughout the counties other members of the gentry were securing election - T.A. Murray, William Bowman, John Coghill, John Panton, and others, while the Governor was to add still more as his nominees. Apparently, the stage was set for Macarthur to become head of a solid phalanx who would strive to establish a more-or-less benevolent oligarchy on an idealised Anglican model.

74 SMH 28/2/42.
75 SMH 2/4/42.
76 SMH 28/6/43.
This prospect exploded when Macarthur was beaten at the polls, not to join the Council Chamber until 1843. He had stood for Cumberland County, having supported none other than Roger Therry in his own electorate, Camden. This move was almost certainly part of an overall campaign to establish himself as true leader of the people, including Roman Catholics and liberals. With equal likelihood, it was the cause of his defeat. Many of the settlers would not be impressed by such breadth of mind; Cowper raised in opposition his Church-Tory programme; he and William Lawson were returned. Thus the conservative gentry went into the Council without their finest intellect. The dominant figures in the legislative proceedings of the next few years were Wentworth, Cowper, and the two liberal lawyers Robert Lowe and Richard Windeyer. Although these individuals and the Council as a whole often supported gentry interests, one cannot discern a consistent statement of constitutional theory in the exclusive-Macarthur tradition.

Occasionally however a spark of the old spirit was seen, either in or outside the legislature. The

77 See Cox' letter, note 40 above.
institution of District Council under the terms of the 1842 Constitution provided one instance. The gentry, and other members of Council refused to listen to the government's plea that unless they relaxed the qualifications for membership originally laid down, there would simply not be sufficient potential councillors throughout the colony. In a subsequent debate Edward Hamilton, non-official nominee and an extensive landowner at Cassilis, expressed his suspicion that these bodies would prove "neither more nor less than schools of political agitation". Similarly Charles Campbell looked askance at the Councils for bringing "to the very doors of quiet country folks ... all the petty intrigues, strife, and heartburnings, attendant upon a popular election". The introduction of the Australian Colonies Government Bill naturally prompted further statements of this kind. The first draft of the Bill postulated inter alia the establishment of local councils, which would

78 SMH 9/12/43.
79 SMH 10/8/44.
80 Atlas 17/5/45.
in turn elect the central legislature. Conservatives found the low franchise projected for the municipal elections objectionable, while a meeting at Patrick's Plains in the Hunter Valley claimed to express the sentiments of their fellow colonists thus:

as municipal bodies can only exist in their cities and towns, the rural, being the most important part of the population of the colony, and comprising nearly half of the same, would be wholly unrepresented, and left in a situation unworthy of their descent and intolerable as British subjects to bear.

Inside the Council debate on the Bill concentrated on the question of whether the new legislature should have one chamber or two. The gentry members assented to the general feeling that the appointment of an upper house might result in an increase of the executive's power. Outside the house, however, members of this class joined in presenting a memorial which urged that it was "of the highest importance to protect the colony against rash and hasty legislation

---

81 See esp Foster's speech, SMH 4/5/43.

82 Papers relating to proposed alterations in the Constitution of the Australian Colonies, HC 25/5/49 (F5048) : 5.
by the interposition of a second chamber". When the final draft came before the Council in 1851 the gentry legislators threw their weight solidly behind the successful move to redistribute electorates so as to give an overwhelming preponderance to the rural interest.

Some of the gentry agreed with the Herald's disapproval of the extremism with which the Council attacked the local executive. Both William and James Macarthur expressed themselves to this effect when declining invitations to stand for Camden when Therry vacated the seat late in 1844. "I consider the Council, as now constituted, to be no arena for men of moderate opinions, desirous of the public good, without selfish purposes of aggrandizement to promote, or private animosities to gratify", said William. His brother took the opportunity to call for a public protest against "that shuffling evasive policy" which had characterised the legislature's

83 Further Papers relating to constitutional changes, HC 4/2/51 : 29.
84 Cf G.H. Nadel, Mid-Nineteenth Century Political Thought in Australia : 67 seq.
85 Atlas 28/12/44.
first two sessions. "Anti-English" in nature, this 86
behaviour did nothing to redress genuine grievances.
Specific issues on which James had already expressed
disapproval of the legislature's attitude included
District Councils, which he thought should be given
every encouragement as an integral part of the 1842
87
Constitution, and the terminology used by a Council
Committee which bitterly attacked the Crown's land
policy in 1844. Together with P.P. King, Francis
Rossi and other such men, he presented a memorial
to Gipps on this occasion, expressing sympathy and
88
remorse. The mere fact that Macarthur found such
action necessary proves that there were many gentry
in Council who felt differently, but at least one
legislator declared his private regret at the extreme
to which the anti-Gipps campaign was pushed, and he
89
might not have been unique.

86 WR 11/1/45.
87 Letter to Statham and Forster, 9/8/44 : ML MS A2927; cf ML MS A2987.
88 SMH 30/9/44.
Despite his earlier protestations William Macarthur did enter the Council in 1845. Later in the year he led a gentry splinter-group which supported the executive in defeating a motion which called for the publication of Gipps' correspondence apropos of the appointment of a new Chief Justice following Dowling's death. For this he was sharply rebuked by the Atlas newspaper, which insisted that knowledge of such matters was the rightful prerogative of the local assembly. The Atlas, guided by Robert Lowe, was at this time the chief mouthpiece of the extreme anti-government party. Perhaps a move to expel Lowe from the Australian Club reflected a growing revulsion against the tactics of this group. Certainly the gentry at large rallied very strongly around Governor Fitzroy when he was assailed without inhibition by the anti-transportationists in 1849-50.

We shall have reason to stress in due course

90 4/10/45.

91 Atlas 26/7/45.

92 Convict Discipline and Transportation Papers, HC 31/1/50 : 34, 39-40; the same, continued, HC 14/5/51 : 172 seq.

93 Chapter IV.
that moderation was certainly not a distinguishing quality of the Tasmanian gentry's political behaviour. Indeed, the greater part of the island's constitutional history before mid-century must be told in terms of the extremely virulent opposition of the gentry nominees to the various Governors. In the course of the campaign they resorted to such tactics as organising a walk-out from the Council in 1846 in order to thwart Eardley-Wilmot's fiscal policies. Their leader was T.G. Gregson, a man much closer to Wentworth in temperament and belief than to the Macarthur. The behaviour of the Tasmanian gentry emphasised the feeling common to the class that the Imperial Government had no real business in the colonies. We are tempted to suppose, too, that they would have as firmly resisted any real threat to their political power from other interest groups. In fact however circumstances forced no clear-cut statement on this issue; rather, the group who embarrassed

---


95 Cf F.C. Green, Heroes in the Fight for Responsible Government, Papers and Proceedings of the Tasmanian Historical Research Association: VI, 17 seq.
Eardley-Wilmot were awarded the sobriquet of 'Patriotic Six' and regarded with widespread admiration.

The Gentry and Social-Economic Structure

The gentry sought to determine the shape of society not only by participating in politics, but also through their role as 'economic men'. A keynote was set by Charles Campbell when he told a meeting of his peers at Queanbeyan that they should act "as English gentlemen anxious to make this a second England". That these words came from an Australian native of Scottish stock might appear paradoxical but was not really so. The more distant they were from English reality, the more fervently could the gentry vest that land with romantic associations. In sum 'England' meant an idyllic rural society. Thus another member of the class spoke of the ambition of men such as himself "to exhibit, on a small scale, something like the beauties which rise at every step in the land to which we have bid adieu, well-contented if we can here and there produce a

96 SMH 31/5/44.
cornfield surrounded by a post and rail fence, or a meadow of English grasses clear of stumps." This came from the pen of a resident of V.D.L., which in this context held considerable advantages over the senior colony. In climate and topography, the island was "degrees nearer home" for such anglophiles as Mrs Charles Meredith.

In this Merrie Australia the ownership of land attained vast significance. T.A. Murray, no doubt glossing the facts, provided an excellent illustration of how the gentry liked to see themselves:

The great object which men in general have in view in emigrating to a new country, is to procure some portion of this earth as their own. That desire is so strong and so natural, that it is in itself sufficient to tempt men over half the circumference of the globe in search of a home. To make fortunes is not their object, but to ensure independence and comfort for their families.

Similarly, Robert Scott once declared that he would buy land valueless to anyone else, simply so as to

97 J. Syme, Nine Years in Van Diemen's Land, Dundee 1848 : 133.


have his estate, whole and rounded out. This veneration of freehold ownership was a potent force in the gentry's Weltanschauung; further examples will appear below.

On his land the ideal squire set out to develop a village community. Once again the Macarthur family provide the supreme example, every effort being made to establish a prosperous and happy society on the Camden estate. Substantial cottages; a school; a benefit society; payment of up to a shilling a day for child labour - these were among the boons conferred on the Macarthur tenantry. The township of Camden still symbolises this kind of life, as do a handful of others in the counties - Scone, Cobbitty, Berrima, Stroud. Even the irascible Berry could soften with indulgent pride as he described Shoalhaven: "altogether the establishment has grown up until it resembles a colony in miniature - about 200 people reside at the place amongst whom are

100 Immigration Committee, LC 26/8/42 : 32.

Blacksmiths, carpenters, coopers, Tanners & Shoemakers -
Brickmakers, Shipbuilders, etc." Andrew Lang was another Scotchman who became an Australian laird. Inevitably, Charles Campbell had much to say in praise of village communities. He chided the settlers for not fostering them enough, but in the way of enthusiasts might have been exaggerating evils he sought to remedy. The gentry at large gave solid support to the idea that leaseholders of land worth £20 annual rental should receive the vote. Even if their motive was simply to gain a dependent vote, this reaction indicates that the development of a tenantry was not untypical.

The classic statement of the virtue of this trend appears in a little book *On Improvements in Cottage Husbandry*, by William Henty, a squire of

102 Letter to W. Corben, 27/1/37 : Berry Papers V.
103 A. Gilchrist, *John Dunmore Lang, chiefly autobiographical... documents*: 228-30.
105 Franchise Committee, LC 27/9/44. Gipps discussed the proposal at length with the Colonial Office but it was shelved.
northern V.D.L. He urged the development of family allotments on big estates, the rent for which would be paid by the man's labour for his employer. If the gentry did not take the initiative in this direction, the lower classes would, with unhappy consequences: "the riotous among them will overbear the gentle and well disposed, and we shall see 'Rookeries,' with their wild and untaught progeny, instead of peaceful vales and villages". Henty was very sure that his plan was uniquely consonant with "the natural laws of social life", promising wealth and joy to all. He cited instances of Tasmanian squires who had stepped in the right direction, and appeared confident that as a class they agreed with his point of view.

Associated with the concept of raising a tenantry was the diversifying and intensifying of the general economy. Many of the gentry pushed beyond mere wool-growing: at Camden itself there were virtually no sheep. William Macarthur was passionately interested in horticulture and

107 20.
diligently communicated his knowledge to a wide circle of correspondents. He was too the author of a pamphlet on wine-growing, the pursuit of which became a distinguishing mark of the true-blue squire. Other practical guides to agriculture were published by George Suttor (oranges, grapes) and C.E. Walthall (tobacco). The latter crop was extensively grown throughout the Hunter Valley. The Scotts of Glendon experimented in the manufacture of gelatine and portable soup; George Harper of Abbotsford developed new varieties of grain; Hannibal Macarthur, Edward Lockyer and John Blaxland sought to perfect the salt-preservation of meat. The Blaxlands also interested themselves in coal-mining and the improvement of fodders; Thomas Icely bred sheep, horses, and cattle with

108 ML MS A2936: passim; F3651, 4089.
109 F3858; F3731; F4198.
111 Col 0b 16/8/43.
113 J.K.S. Houison, RAHSJ: XXI, 26 seq.
impressive results. So the catalogue goes on - culminating perhaps with Henry O'Brien's great contribution to the easing of the depression by suggesting the use of sheep for tallow.

Yet with all this the explorer Strzelecki believed that "in Van Diemen's Land, the agricultural districts are superior in appearance to those of New South Wales. The details of farms and farming are better understood and defined, and the practical results are such, that no country reminds the traveler of the old one as Van Diemen's Land." He praised especially the irrigation works carried out on the best farms, a feature also noticed with approval by Governor Denison. Henty's pamphlet, as might be expected, emphasised the need for a more vigorous agriculture.

As our study of the Herald has already indicated, the gentry sometimes used their political

114 W.A. Steel, The History of Carcoar, RAHSJ : XVII, 270 seq.
115 Chapter I.
116 P.E. de Strzelecki, Physical Description of New South Wales and Van Diemen's Land, London 1845 : 381 seq.
influence to strengthen the landed interest. During the 1843 election several candidates suggested the adoption of a local corn law, clearly addressing themselves to the large farmer rather than any peasant group. Many supporters of the scheme were shamefaced about it (Alexander Berry being exceptional in urging Protection with a passionate fervour) and the legislative technique they adopted was to 'tack' high duties on a government Bill intended primarily to diminish smuggling of spirits. Gipps returned the Bill to the Council with disapproving comments. In the ensuing debate the liberal William Bland supported the Governor's stand, castigating the move as a "tax for the relief of landlords"; but the gentry and their supporters re-affirmed the Bill which was therefore reserved and finally disallowed. Meanwhile the same group had thrown their weight behind Richard Windeyer's 'Pfandbriefe' scheme, which prescribed as a nostrum for the current economic distress

118 J. Jervis, Alexander Berry, RAHSJ : XXVII, 60 etc.
119 HRA XXIII : 296-97.
120 SMH 28/12/43.
that the government back an issue of 'Pledge Certificates', alias currency on credit, to owners of land. The idea naturally appealed to the gentry, but the government was not impressed and so the whole scheme fell to the ground.

A Usury Bill introduced by Wentworth in the 1843 session did not even pass the Council. A more moderate Bill of similar intention did gain majority support the following year, only to share the common fate of Imperial disapproval. The limitation of interest had already been bitterly contested in V.D.L. where the gentry, inside and outside the Council tried very hard to persuade Franklin to accept such a measure during the straitened months of 1843. "In a colony wholly relying on Agriculture for its existence," they argued, "without any foreign trade except what is absolutely necessary for its internal consumption, the Agricultural interests should be essentially paramount." The plea went unheeded, but the island gentry

122 HRA XXIII : 181; HRA XXIV : 156-57, 377-78.
did receive the support of government in having considerable protection extended to their farm produce.

Their action in N.S.W. politics gives a clear impression of the gentry's views on two complex subjects: the use of land by other groups than themselves; and the labour question. Consideration of the former must begin with the 'old-style' squatters— that is, the person of humble socio-economic status who ran a few sheep or cattle on land, usually within the boundaries, to which neither he nor anyone else held legal claim. For such men the gentry had an implacable hostility. The evidence to the 1835 Committee on Police degenerated at times into a catalogue of their alleged crimes. P.P. King provided one instance:

I cannot express myself too strongly on the subject of squatters. The mischief they do is almost incalculable. They harbour the settler's runaway servants; they steal his cattle and sheep; they receive stolen goods; they sell spirits on the 'sly'; they entice shepherds from the care of their sheep; and they shelter and feed bushrangers and afford them information.

---

Complaints like this induced Bourke to frame the Crown Lands Act of 1836, designed to check such lawlessness. The Governor was somewhat reluctant to act, clearly suspecting that King and the rest were, first and foremost, greedily jealous of any competition for the use of land. However the gentry's real concern for the establishment of law and order in the hinterland was re-emphasised in 1839 when another committee urged the extension of police control beyond the boundaries, and the assessment of stock to raise the necessary funds. The upshot was the Crown Lands Act of the same year.

W.A. Duncan, who will frequently attract our attention as the most intelligent Catholic layman in the community, consistently accused the gentry of hostility to the growth of a yeoman class. He particularly stressed their antipathy to Russell's legislation of 1840, which had provided for the selling of land in 80-acre lots. As with Bourke's

---

127 2 Vic no 27; cf HRA XX : 90 seq.
128 See chapter V.
suspicions, there is little direct evidence to confirm these allegations. Probably most gentry while sympathetic to the growth of a dependent tenantry, looked askance at any other form of small-farmer interest.

Far more important was the attitude of the settled landholders to 'new-style' squatting: the development of the pastoral industry by raising flocks on Crown land, usually although not always beyond the boundaries. Various facets of this tremendously complex inter-relation will arise in the present and the following chapters. Complete clarity will never dawn, because complete clarity never prevailed. Virtually all the gentry had always engaged in squatting and when, from the early 'thirties, it developed as a separate interest their loyalties divided accordingly. Sometimes they switched altogether. The balance could vary from estate to estate and from year to year according to fluctuations in the political situation and the distribution of the individual's resources. Nevertheless there remained a real difference between the squatter view of squatting and the gentry view of squatting. For the present the latter will occupy our attention.

129 The articles of K. Buckley have been of the greatest help in writing this section and parts of chapter III: Gipps and the Graziers of New South Wales 1841-6, HS VI : 396 seq; VII : 178 seq.
Russell's dismemberment proposals, which implied a threat to raising stock on unalienated land, prompted the gentry to work out a classic apologia. "Whilst in the Midland district the Colonist has planted his home, where he is domesticated in the bosom of his family," ran a petition adopted at the great meeting of February 1841 and afterwards printed for distribution to all members of the British Parliament, "he has embarked in the pasture grounds that portion of his capital to which he looks for the largest immediate returns, and for the surest provision for his posterity." The Act, by raising the price of land and abandoning the auction system opened the way for speculators and other intruders to undermine the old settlers. The petitioners deplored attempt to impose Wakefieldian principles, especially that of forcing concentrated settlement. On the contrary, they urged

Let the energies of the Colony continue to flow in the course indicated by Providence, and in due time concentration will follow as a natural result. The riches gathered in the wilderness will be stored in the towns and villages. Successive races will go forth in quest of the wealth yielded by

130 CO 201/315 : 5½ seq. Quotations are from pages 5 and 7 of the pamphlet embodying the petition, which was also published in SMH 6/2/41.
the fleece, and will return with their acquisitions to the resorts of social life. As in the old world, wealth will produce leisure, and the union of the two will be followed by steady advancement in art, science, and all the elegances of prosperous and well-peopled cities.

In these rolling sentences can be seen the essential gentry position: squatting was acceptable only when brought within the framework of land ownership and attachment to the soil. Amid all the storm of the squatting controversy there was always an element within the class ready to put this view: Robert Scott in 1842, T.A. Murray in 1843, Charles Campbell in the Queanbeyan speech of 1844. Murray's opinion, delivered in the form of a Report from a committee which enquired into the sale of Crown Lands, merits particular attention. He carried the attack on Wakefieldian theory so far as even to dispute the doctrine that money from land sales should subsidise immigration; rather, men who brought in labourers should be granted freehold land. The imposition of

131 Evidence to Immigration Committee, LC 26/8/42: 15 seq.
132 LC 5/12/43; cf HRA XXIII : 336 seq.
a uniform price should be abandoned in favour of a four-level scale, ranging from sixpence to twenty-six shillings per acre. Thus indefinite reliance on sheep-rearing would be discouraged; the prospect of "farms, settlements, ... townships ... population" raised once more.

The news of the 1846 Land Acts, which recognised squatting as an undisputable fact, hardened this attitude. James Macarthur expressed his opinion that the new regulations were "calculated to repress, if not to render impossible, the settlement of bona fide proprietors, having a direct interest in the soil, and looking to the Colony as their home, and that of their children." This theme was brilliantly expanded in the report from a legislative committee on Crown Lands, 1847. The long leases projected by the 1846 Act, together with the continuation of the pound-per-acre minimum price, were declared certain to vest the present squatters with near-permanent occupation of the land. In short,

133 Evidence to Immigration Committee, LC 14/9/47: 43.

"the settlers object to these orders because they confiscate the lands of the Colony; the squatters approve of them because they see no limit to the term of their occupancy under them." The writer of this report was not a squire, but Robert Lowe; and the gentry divided in their attitude to his recommendations when they came before Council. Two years later, however, Lowe was joined by William Macarthur and W.C. Wentworth on a committee which argued on much the same lines as those of 1843 and 1847. Its report urged the British Government to be prepared to sell land at an economic price, even if its sole immediate use was for sheep-grazing. In vain was the Imperial Government called to heed...

The feeling which associates the possession of land, in the mind of every Englishman, with aristocratical birth and political power, the notion of stability belonging to its possession, and the natural wish to possess that with which the eye has long been familiar ...

Before leaving this question of land use, one final pertinent example of gentry lobbying must be

135 SMH 23 & 24/6/47.
136 LC 3/10/49.
noticed. Soon after the announcement of the gold discoveries, Deas Thomson received a letter, shot through with urgency, from James Macarthur. The writer urged that the government temporarily prohibit all mining; thus would be halted "the deranging & upsetting of our social system to its very foundation, which is now to be feared" and "spoilation" of the country's resources. Never had Macarthur appeared so foolishly unrealistic, never had the depth of his feeling for the soil become more evident.

We may finally seek enlightenment concerning the gentry by studying their approach to the problem of labour. On many issues members of this group might disagree, but probably every single one would have echoed this statement by Edward Macarthur, the brother who while permanently resident in Britain, diligently fostered the family's Australian interests:

137 Letter of 29/5/51: ML MS A2920.

if the influx of labourers into the Colony be inadequate, it will be difficult to maintain the broad basis on which the social pyramid should rest. Amongst every indigenous Race the adjustment of the elements of Society seems by an all pervading law to be so determined - they who possess Capital will be always proportionately few in relation to the Number to be employed. And therefore when in a new country, where the great proportion of the people are not native Inhabitants but have been as Colonists transferred from a distant country, Government, by positive or negative measures, permits an infringement of this wise order of Providence, an undue, and destructive competition for the Services of the labouring class must ensue, the capital and substance of the Community will be squandered - and the elements of its prosperity dissipated.

The class assumptions behind this statement and its special pleading are too blatant to require elaboration. Yet Macarthur and his fellows were not insincere. The same basic feeling was expressed time and again, with obvious conviction, throughout the long unrelenting struggle to establish an employer-employee relationship on the pattern of the old world.

It was a battle fought on several fronts. Some of the gentry - the Macarthurs, Berry, Campbell, Gilbert Ryrie, among them - conducted their own private immigration schemes, working through agents
in Britain to secure labour of high quality. Several attempts were made to float formal companies with the same general purpose. At the political level, the Council appointed committees with extreme regularity - even in the deepest depression years - to urge upon the Imperial Government the need for extended migration and the provision of funds wherewith it might be financed. The agitation against Russell's Act, and against 'new-time' squatting both tie back in part to the labour issue: in the former case, the land fund of each district was to be used for bringing out labourers to that district alone, with obvious threat to the welfare of central N.S.W.; in the latter, more potential employers were entering the market without making any contribution to the land-immigration fund. This fund, indeed, was the centre of endless debate and discussion. So soon as it began to dry up in the

---

139 ML MS A2918; C.D. Riddell to Immigration Committee, LC 16/6/35.

140 E.g. Land and Immigration Company, 1835; N.S.W. Immigration Association, 1840; Australia Felix Emigration Society, 1840.

141 E. Macarthur's letter to Russell was written apropos of this.
late 'thirties the Council discussed how it might be augmented: one favourite suggestion, never carried out, was that a loan be floated, the security for which would be future revenue from land sales. Altogether, the gentry played an important part in shaping the history of migration to Australia before the gold rushes, although their efforts were never as successful as they would have liked.

Cheap labour schemes naturally obtruded into the discussion. Convicts, Chinese, Indian coolies, Pacific islanders all came under consideration from the gentry and others. But all, especially the first, created a dilemma. Macarthur had spoken against convict labour on several grounds in 1837: politically, its continuation threatened to strengthen the emancipist influence; economically, it was inefficient and tended to exclude high quality free workers; morally, it tainted society and broadened the gap between England and the colonies. Many of

142 Cf HRA XIX : 640 seq.
143 For which see R.B. Madgwick, Immigration into Eastern Australia 1788-1851.
144 See chapter III.
the gentry never accepted this position and as soon as the Molesworth Committee made its report a formal protest was raised among them. Yet there were those who continued to feel that only the free British proletariat could form the base of that social pyramid invoked by Edward Macarthur. "If we give way to these moral objections we condemn the colony to death," commented Edward Hamilton on one of the several occasions when the resumption of transportation became a live issue: the difficulty facing his class could not have been more neatly put. We accordingly find that the N.S.W. gentry was hopelessly divided and uncertain whether or not to press for a revival of the system; James Macarthur himself had returned to favouring this step by 1841, but failed to carry even his cousin Hannibal with him. This division was reflected in the erratic policy pursued by the legislature before finally coming out in definite

145 V & P 17/7/38.
147 SMH 25/12/41.
opposition in 1850. Even then James Macarthur and Wentworth had joined together in trying to persuade their fellow legislators to adopt a less absolute course. They urged instead that the colony bargain with the Imperial Government to ensure that a large number of free migrants be sent with the convicts; Wentworth, anticipating the debate on the Australian Colonies Government Bill, emphasised that the purpose of Council was not to represent "the mere popular interest", but to heed also the benefit of minorities.

In V.D.L. the imposition of the probation system had created a markedly different situation. Labour was plentiful enough, but the stigma of convictism correspondingly more potent. Probation, moreover, appeared to involve high police expenses, without providing free labour, as had the old assignment system. In consequence we find the Tasmanian gentry coming out against transportation far more

---

148 Speeches of James Macarthur and W.C. Wentworth, Esquires,... on the... Resumption of Transportation, Sydney 1850: esp 32.
strongly than did their brethren in N.S.W. At the same time, there was minority support for its continuance.

The discipline of the labour force loomed almost as large in the gentry's mind as did its supply. This pre-occupation dated back to the assignment era when the Hunter River clique led constant and vehement attacks on Bourke's system of convict discipline. Many of the gentry obviously felt that the government was guilty of a misplaced philanthropy which put a bar between themselves and a truly efficient labour force. Hannibal Macarthur started from this proposition to explain why he preferred free labourers:

By the present system of convict discipline, there is not a sufficient restraint upon these men, to prevent the indulgence of their vicious propensities. It is therefore

149 The anti-transportation movement will be discussed in greater detail in chapter IX; for the minority support of the system see also Further Correspondence on Convict Discipline and Transportation, HC 18/7/53 : 85-86.

150 HRA XVII : 540 seq, 600 seq, 653 seq; XVIII, 22 seq, 55.

151 To Immigration Committee, LC 16/6/35.
desirable to obtain free men at liberal wages, for all agricultural purposes, as the stoppage of wages for losses occasioned by neglect of duty, operates as a better check upon the free, than the present convict discipline on the bond ...

When free labourers became better known, however, the employing class found them unpleasantly intractable. The consequence was a series of Master and Servants Acts (1841, 1845, 1847) passed by the Council acting primarily under the influence of T.A. Murray. "As all operations of civilized life are carried on through the medium of masters and servants," wrote Murray in the report of a committee which considered the 1845 legislation, "it is necessary that the laws which regulate their mutual intercourse should be stringent and impartial". This was a fair enough description of the three major Acts as they appeared in the statute book. Yet inevitably they fell most heavily on the worker: it was significant that Murray emphasised that the 1845 Act would work only if the executive allowed the local magistrate a

---

152 4 Vic no 23; 9 Vic no 27; 11 Vic no 9.
153 LC 5/9/45.
154 See chapter IV.
strong hand. So the gentry continued their struggle to build society in the image of their ideal.

**Actual and Potential Allies of the Gentry**

From the very early years of its history, Sydney boasted a handful of merchant princes who had economic and social affiliations with the gentry. Paramount among these was Robert Campbell who opened a trading connection between Sydney and Calcutta in 1793, many years before he founded the settler family to which we have referred several times. Of similar stamp was Richard Jones, who like Campbell was honoured by nomination to the old Council and there advocated the interests of the country gentlemen. Jones' junior partner at one time was Stuart Alexander Donaldson, already noticed as founder of the Australian Club, a future Premier of N.S.W., and always very conscious of respectability and its prerogatives. S.K. Salting, a Dane whose fortune was to be used in the next generation to build up one of the great western collections of Sinologia, and T.S. Mort, perhaps the greatest

---

155 Committee Report; SMH 1/10/45.
figure in Sydney's commercial history, were both ardent Anglicans and otherwise firm upholders of the 'Establishment'. When Sydney's merchants first took to direct action in politics - at the general election of 1848 - their candidate was John Lamb, an active member of the J.P. opposition to Bourke, and subsequently a non-official nominee.

Francis Kemble, Manager of the Colonial Sugar Refinery, was one of the most outspoken Tories in the colony. At the meetings which launched the 1842 Committee to petition for self-government, he alone stood up and insisted that the colony was not ripe for that boon. As a witness to a committee of the new Council he emphasised "the charm of ownership, which is one of the first principles in human nature"; as a candidate for election he told the residents of Port Phillip that he would strive after "the immediate establishment of an order of gentry, for which the great respectability of the majority of our settlers,  

156 Dependent as they are on general knowledge, the above facts are not documented.

157 Committee on land grievances, LC 20/8/44: 3.
affords ample materials". Interestingly enough, the Council sought to pass a measure for the protection of refined sugar coincidently with the abortive Corn Law.

From the rather scanty ranks of the professions came some further support for conservatism. Hastings Elwin was a financier, a classical scholar, and a non-official nominee to the new Council who joined, for example, in deprecating the tone of the 1844 land grievances committee. William and Arthur a'Beckett, lawyer (later judge) and surgeon respectively, brought with them to Sydney the mores of the Wiltshire gentry of which their ancestors had long been members; the former was the patriarch of the Boyd family, to whom Australian culture becomes more heavily indebted with each generation. Charles Nicholson, the surgeon who eventually made a very deep mark on the political and educational history of his adopted country, also merits particular mention. His conservatism was well

158 *Port Phillip Patriot* (F2826), 11/3/44.
159 Note 119 above.
160 WR 30/9/43; F3419.
demonstrated by the comment that the Australian Colonies Government Bill threatened to give all political power to "the democratic population of the towns"; he would have preferred universal to £10 suffrage as then employers would have been able to influence their workmen's vote in a suitable direction. Nicholson doubtless spoke for many of his type when remarking that the one factor which made colonial life tolerable was the knowledge that every individual of determination and ability could, if he so wished, affect the course of the community's development.

The support given by Justices Pedder and Burton to the Church of England's claim to exclusive establishment bespoke their general conservatism. The latter echoed all the major exclusive criticisms of Bourke's government, particularly emphasising the prevalence of crime in the community and the consequent danger of granting civil rights to ex-convicts. James Macarthur pressed the Colonial Office to appoint Burton

161 To A. Cunninghame, 12/2/51 : ML MS A3180.
162 To the same, 29/2/52 : ML MS A3180.
163 V & P 1836 : 467 seq; HRA XVIII : 228 seq.
as Chief Justice following Forbes' retirement. Among other officers of government several individuals of similar outlook were also to be found, Alexander Macleay being the prototype. Even Deas Thomson moved steadily away from his father-in-law's liberalism, finally coming out in strong support for 'representation of interests' in the 1851 debate. C.D. Riddell, Colonial Treasurer in N.S.W. throughout our period, has already been mentioned as the justices' standard bearer in their attack on Bourke and Therry; among his other political actions was support of Broughton's high Tory argument against the establishment of the colony of Victoria. John Gregory, Treasurer in V.D.L. until 1840, was a true blue supporter of the Church of England against the ravages of liberalism. The diary of G.T. Boyes, Auditor and briefly Colonial Secretary in the island, reveals a man of culture and refinement appalled by the turbulence of colonial life. He strongly felt the need for cohesion of


165 He wrote a pamphlet in support of Hutchins, no copy of which is now known: T & R 2/2/38; see also his contribution to the debate on the Marriage Bill: T & R 17/8/38.
society ("the better class I mean") to resist the pollution of convictism and ravages of "the Mob". Most of the other officials remained politically anonymous.

What of the highest functionaries - the Governors? All paid considerable respect to the gentry, yet none formed close and effective alliance with that class. One reason for this was the clash of imperial and local interests; another, the importance attached by the Governors to adjudicating between the different interests in society rather than alignment behind any particular one; a third and most important, that Bourke, Gipps, Eardley-Wilmot and even Franklin, all inclined to liberalism. We are accordingly left with Denison and Fitzroy, of whom a little more must be said: both ultimately looked to the gentry's opponents for political friendship, but both were genuine conservatives.

Sir William Denison stands out as the one Governor of the era who deliberately set himself

---

166 7/8/36, 25/8/43, passim.
167 See chapter IV.
against the current trends of constitutional history. "There is", he wrote sorrowfully to Earl Grey in 1848 apropos of the draft Australian Colonies Government Bill, "an essentially democratic spirit which activates the large mass of the community". He consequently urged the formation of a second chamber which would lift its members above "the broad plain of equality". In terms which suggested that he had read de Tocqueville before coming to V.D.L., Denison argued that a few of the colonists aspired to such distinction but at present were frustrated by the jealousy of their fellows. He hoped that the second chamber would facilitate the executive holding in check the demand for power which might be expected from the legislature. When the Bill finally became law the Governor wrote many letters to Deas Thomson, seeking advice on how the incoming tide of responsible government might be resisted for as long as possible. A passage from one of these documents summarised his political belief:


169 Letter of 7/5/51: ML MS A1531/2; see also letters of 12/4/51, 13/2/52, 21/3/53.
I, as you may imagine, am altogether opposed to those democratic principles which are advocated by those needy hangers-on upon society ... with whom the world is but an oyster which they are anxious to open in order to get at the fat juicy interior .... In these Colonies the Government will always have to keep a steady pressure in opposition to the elastic force of this principle, which is most dangerous even in America .... What a state would you be in in New South Wales with an ignorant and vicious population ... were you to throw political power into the hands of such a class.

Denison believed in keeping a strong military force in V.D.L. "and to have plenty of power at hand" lest insurrection break out. That gold was not discovered in his territory he regarded as a great boon.

Sir William's sympathy for the Church of England was mentioned in chapter I. He warmly supported the continuation of state endowment for religion, seeing in the voluntary principle the threat of ministers becoming slaves rather than leaders of their flocks. He suggested that both Anglican and Roman Catholic Bishops sit in the upper house of his proposed bicameral legislature. This departure from exclusivism was significant, for it was part of Denison's essentially

170 Letter of 16/6/51 : the same.
171 Despatches of 7/10/47 : LCVDL 19/8/50; and 28/12/49.
Erastian approach. He wanted all denominations to be endowed; brought against voluntaryism the further objection that it left the working classes uncared for; and urged Nixon (of all people) to adopt Methodist techniques so that Anglican influence might be spread amongst the poor. Denison saw religion as a force making for social discipline.

Finally, this Governor was an ardent advocate of continued transportation. He firmly believed that the system promised social stability and economic prosperity, viewing with horror the N.S.W. situation where the shortage of labour had prompted insolence, sloth and gross inefficiency. "The remedy for this is to reduce the cost of labour, to bring it to a nearer relation to the cost of the necessaries of life, which can only be done by pouring in a steady supply ..." Overflowing with this conviction, apparently so congruous to the gentry's own attitude, he entered with spirit into a long battle with the

---

172 Varieties: I, 138 seq.

173 Despatch of 28/9/48: LCVDL 20/8/50. Denison's correspondence is full of such arguments.
anti-transportationists among whom were many of that very class.

Fitzroy's policies were a pale reflection of Denison's, but still more palpable than is often supposed. He too believed in an upper house as a check against the legislature; looked with distaste upon the rising democracy; and thought that transportation benefited the colonies as well as Britain. In one important particular - attempting to reduce the quit-rents still payable on freehold lands - he showed positive sympathy for the gentry. Defending his actions on this score against the criticism of the Colonial Office Fitzroy emphasised his concern to save "many of the oldest and most respectable inhabitants" from grave distress. This, however, went unheeded.

Finally, mention must be made of the squatters, 'new-style'. It has long been accepted that among

174 Further Papers relating to Constitutional Changes, HC 4/2/51 : 27 seq; see chapter IV.

175 HRA XXVI : 141.
these newcomers were many of high social calibre. When this generalisation is scrutinised, many exceptions are found, yet the basis of truth remains. One of the number claimed for his fellows "the knowledge of ... being a superior class" and "pride ... to act after that knowledge". The Australian, in its conservative phase, and the Herald saw such men as "altogether of a superior mental caste", and potentially forming "an Australian aristocracy". The very nature of the land, from which immediate profit could only be won from large pastoral holdings, seemed to vindicate such pretensions. No wonder then that Kemble lauded the Port Phillip settlers as promising material for a gentry, and that Murray and the rest sought to bring the newcomers within their embrace. All these circumstances seemed to point to the development of a vastly stronger conservative group, with an unshakable moral,

177 C.P. Hodgson, Reminiscences of Australia : 4.
178 Australian 14/10/43.
179 SMH 2/6/47.
political and economic hold over the destiny of the country. We must now see why, in the event, squatting had a very different effect. At the same time, the story of the gentry will be rounded out and largely completed.
PART TWO

FACTORS DISRUPTIVE OF CONSERVATISM
Far from strengthening conservative power, the squatters wreaked havoc. They did so not because of any innate wickedness, but as instruments of economic necessity: the pastoral industry, even Nature herself, was the ultimate villain of this story. Sometimes the gentry acted as disruptors when engaged in wool-growing, even in terms of their own ideal; often the squatters would have dearly wished to follow other courses of action. Yet on the latter must fall the brunt of the following argument. They will appear not as heroes of the golden fleece or happy spirits of the wilderness, but as men acting without grace or restraint or care for the public good. At the same time their efforts underpinned the economy, and so this behaviour carried all the more weight. Enough, indeed, to affect society to its foundations.

Squatters and Law

"The first principle of squatting", wrote Gideon Scott Lang, one of its most able practitioners
and spokesmen, "is That the Squatter shall have full power to settle without restriction wherever he can find unoccupied pasture, and to take possession of as much land as his stock can occupy." This article of faith had long and widespread currency. It perfectly expressed the squatter's feeling that his needs, not any superior authority, should determine the conditions under which he operated. The justification for this claim was simple. Until squatters drove forth their sheep, the land had been entirely unproductive; this new movement introduced civilisation and converted the wilderness into wealth. "Those persons who first reclaimed the land from a state of barrenness, the persons who first turned the forest land to their own use, have surely a far better title to the soil than the Queen of England, or any other body." In such expressions as these there lay a 'squatter theory of value', analogous to that with which Marx was soon to bolster the claims of the proletariat.

1 Land and Labour in Australia, Melbourne 1845: 14.
2 G. Mackaness (ed.), The Correspondence of John Cotton, 3 parts, Sydney 1953: II, 56.
Gipps himself, against whom the squatting interest was to launch itself with fury, stressed the movement's part in maintaining the prosperity of N.S.W. and South Australia, while adding Port Phillip and New Zealand to the Empire with little charge to Britain. The dependence of the economy on wool was beyond any denial.

That his way of life was largely determined by physical conditions strengthened the squatter's conviction that he had an overriding claim to consideration. "The Government ... had tempted him to a colony, within whose narrow limits was to starve," the stockholders of N.S.W. told Lord Stanley in 1846, "and it was the hope of existence, and not free agency, which led him beyond them. Thus the victim of a necessity which he had not contemplated when leaving home, the emigrant became squatter."

Yet in reality the more common attitude to this class was one of distrust, even contempt. So there grew up among the squatters a feeling that every

3 HRA XXI : 133; cf HRA XX : 839.
4 SMH 28/1/46.
outside interest was against them "in hatred and malice unaccountable." All these influences tended towards establishing a spirit of irresponsible aggression in matters of law and politics.

This became manifest in many chapters of the long and complicated history of land policy. Squatting, both within and outside the boundaries was common from the early years of the settlement. As a rule no legal right was held, and so the flockmasters were acting outside, if not in defiance of the law. In the mid-'thirties this kind of expansion was proceeding more rapidly than ever before, the occupation of Port Phillip being one important act in the drama. To P.P. King, son of an early Governor and himself a distinguished naval officer, the situation in this district was nothing less than "anarchy". From the strictly legal point of view, that was not


6 See S.H. Roberts, The Squatting Age in Australia 1835-1847; and K. Buckley, Gipps and the Graziers of New South Wales 1841-6, HS: VI, 396-412; VII, 178-193. The author's debt to both these historians is very heavy, and not always specifically indicated in the footnotes.

an unfair description, and it is important to notice that right throughout our period some land continued to be used without any warrant from government.

The first significant legislation was Bourke's Act of 1836. Even this, we have seen, was intended primarily to check squatting, 'old-style', but inevitably the new was also affected. Particularly important was the institution of Commissioners of Crown Lands, through whom Bourke hoped to safeguard the small, 'old-style' squatter. From the beginning, therefore, these officers of the law were disliked by the big pastoralists. The gentry were markedly hostile to the extension of the Commissioners' powers by Gipps' 1839 Act, though approving its general principles. The outback squatters of the 'forties continued and magnified this antipathy, until it became a major element in their political thought. "We demand security in our tenures, repayment for our improvements at a fair valuation, and especially proper limits to the powers of the Crown Commissioners".

8 Cf Buckley, HS VI : 404; HRA XXVI : 689 seq.
9 Cf Roberts : 105 seq; Buckley, HS VI : 405 seq.
10 F2825, 30/7/42 ("A Settler").
wrote one squatter to the Port Phillip Gazette in 1842. He might well have been a resident of the Western District of Port Phillip, throughout which Commissioner Foster Fyans was a much hated man. On occasion Fyans and his fellow-officers probably did abuse their extensive powers, but the hostility with which they met can be explained in full only by reference to the squatters' indiscriminate rejection of authority.

This issue bulked large in the 'Lee case' of 1842 - a very important clash between the gentry engaged in squatting and the government. William Lee, a landowner, had his squatting licence cancelled when his servants, moving their herds westward beyond Bathurst into an unauthorised area, fought with some aborigines. The cancellation was the work of a Commissioner, and a public meeting called at Bathurst to sympathise with Lee, fiercely attacked his action. The meeting petitioned the government henceforth to grant licences on the advice of three

---

11 See HRA XX : xx seq; SMH Aug '42 passim; HRA XXIII : 548; RAHSJ : XXIV, 222 seq and XXV, 162.
local magistrates, whose superior knowledge would enable them to exclude "dishonest and disreputable characters". James Macarthur and John Blaxland expressed sympathy for the petition when it came before the legislature. Gipps bitterly replied:

The petition was put forth in order to try the strength of the squatting interest against the strength of the Government; or on a still more important matter, the administration of the domain of the Crown by the Government .... he was bound to protect the Crown lands ... for the benefit, not of any particular class of people here, but for the benefit of the whole British empire.

Although this incident belonged to the story of the gentry's attempt to mould squatting as they wished, it well demonstrated the hostility between that pursuit and the rule of law. An outright clash between these opposing forces loomed inevitably. In 1843 an incident involving a man named Weston and very similar to the Lee case marked a further step towards this climax. All the time the true, 'new-style' squatters became more united, and more aggressive.

12 SMH 24/8/42.
13 SMH 4/43, esp 29/4/43 (letter of "Cumberland").
Battle was finally joined in April-May 1844 when Gipps issued his famous double set of propositions, one stating terms under which the squatters could occupy land, the other opening the way for purchase over an extended period. Reasonable as these suggestions were, vociferous protests at once found expression through public meetings, a new organisation called the Pastoral Association (Melbourne's counterpart was termed the Mutual Protection Society), very active lobbying in Britain, and the local legislature. The proceedings of the Committee on Land Grievances, 1844, were particularly important in the last category. Leading spokesmen for the cause were the Boyd cousins, Benjamin in the colony and Archibald both there and in Britain, W.C. Wentworth and, for a while, Robert Lowe, who in turn determined the sympathies of the *Atlas* newspaper. Ben Boyd, Wentworth and Lowe sat at different times in the legislature, where the squatting interest also had the consistent support of Henry Dangar and J.P. Robinson,

14 LC 20/8/44.
a financial associate of the Boyds. The positive demands of the interest were for security, the right of pre-emption, and compensation should land improved by the squatter be sold to someone else.

In reality these demands were expressed in a negative form — that is by reference to what the squatters denied. First, they refused to accept the right of Imperial Government to control land policy. This, the argument ran, was the province of the local government: a stand, as Gipps said, "in opposition to all Constitutional Law and the positive enactment of Parliament". At a mass meeting held in Sydney on April 9, Wentworth asserted that the Crown had been acting as "but the trustee for the public"; now the beneficiaries had come into their inheritance and demanded full control. Accordingly any tax on the land not sanctioned by the local Council was illegitimate. The squatters repeatedly insisted that acceptance of the assessment imposed by earlier Acts did not imply recognition of the Crown's rights

15 HRA XXIII: 545-46.
16 SMH 10/4/44.
over the land, but was merely a co-operative act, seeking their own protection. Gipps' proposals were obnoxious, and invalid. Lord Stanley was appalled that men like Boyd maintained this position:

I cannot suppose that such a charge would be made by Gentlemen of the talent and station of those who have advanced it without grounding it on some foundation; but, unless it is intended to be denied by them that the right of property in the land occupied by them is vested in the Crown, I am at a loss to conceive by what reasoning it can be established ....

But as the Herald remarked, the crux of the squatters' case was precisely this.

Would the squatters have objected to the payment of any tax, which they considered unjust, even if imposed by the local Council? Their arguments, especially the squatter theory of value, could be easily adapted to meet this case, and doubtless they would have been, had different circumstances prevailed. Boyd declared straight out that the payment of a £10 fee should vest the occupier with freehold rights,

17 HRA XXIV : 219-20.
18 1/7/45.
19 SMH 10/4/44.
and the Pastoral Association argued generally against the investment of capital in land. The claim to dominion was further expressed by the Grievances Committee's argument that Commissioners' powers should be transferred to tribunals of local pastoralists.

A touch of explicit sedition flavoured the campaign against Gipps. The Atlas argued that the squatter had no other choice than "ruin or rebellion". John Dunmore Lang, another short-term advocate of the squatters' cause, reported that he had heard members of the class discuss their right of taking militant action against the Governor. "The best thing they could do with Sir George now would be to Bligh him," suggested one; another, that with twenty good stockmen "any regiment in her Majesty's service" could be defied; a third, that the soldiery might be bought off by giving them twenty acres and a few cattle apiece. C.P. Hodgson, the man so conscious of the squatters' prestige and pride of class, adopted a tone of warm

20 HRA XXIII : 605-06.
21 15/2/45.
22 WR 26/7/45.
approval when describing how "the republican spirit exploded" in 1844.

Throughout this year the squatters' anger remained at white heat. There followed some months of relative complacence, as the feeling grew that lobbying in Britain was having the desired effect. However two Bills introduced into the British Parliament during 1845 - the work of Lord Stanley and Under-Secretary G.W. Hope respectively - disappointed these anticipations, and so ill-feeling revived. Attacking the second Bill in January 1846, the squatters described the selling of leases by auctions as no less pernicious than the sale of land. The speculator would blackmail the bona-fide pastoralist; the latter's expenses would rise; the "Sydney capitalists" would tighten their hold. Later in the year the squatting interest in Council was active in a successful move to deny renewal of the Act by which the Border Police were maintained. In earlier years the legislature's power over the Estimates had

23 Reminiscences of Australia: 91 seq.

24 The changing moods are most apparent in the Atlas, esp 26/4/45; 22/11/45; 10/1/46.

25 SMH 28/1/46.
been used to cut down the strength of Commissioners, but this new action went much closer to an outright declaration of anarchy. The squatters thus clearly warned that if government persisted in obstructing their wishes, the battle would be fought long and hard.

No wonder then that our conservatives were shocked. Not only had the squatters anticipated Marx’s theory of value, but they were blatantly seeking the dictatorship of their class. When Broughton, rather oddly at first glance, declared the squatters would establish "a democracy of the worst sort", he meant a government which would deny settled authority and tyrannise over minorities. Similarly the manager of the Australian told James Macarthur that the anti-Gipps front would generate a "strong democratic influence" to secure their aims. E.S. Hall, an active figure in the struggle for colonial liberties through many years, accused the Pastoral Association of planning

26 HRA XXV : 109 seq, 120 seq.
27 Letter to Coleridge, 15/8/44.
28 Statham & Forster/J. Macarthur, 1/11/44 : ML MS A2927.
"the final robbery of the people", while the behaviour of its sympathisers in Council militated against "old English loyalty and reverence for the monarchy". Were the native born to copy such examples they would become "vulgar democrats and republicans .... a nest of 29 Australian jacobins". The Australian, of which Hall was editor at about this time, anticipated its conservative brother, the Herald, in denouncing the squatters as ruthless offenders against the ideal of a co-operative community. The same argument, with a slightly different twist, was also advanced in the liberal press (most notably Duncan's Weekly Register), and soon came to have very general currency. Conservatives like Cowper and Nicholson, liberals like 30 Windeyer and Lowe, radicals like Lang—all became enemies of the squatter after having supported the protest of 1844. Typically, Lowe best justified this change:

He advocated fixity of tenure for the squatters then, because they sought it against the Crown. Now he opposed it

29 SMH 17/5/44, 23/10/44; cf 6/12/44.
30 SMH 23/10/45 (LC debate) is particularly interesting.
31 SMH 28/7/48.
because they sought it against the rights of the people .... He thought then that the squatters fought for liberty, but he found they fought only to defend their breeches pocket.

These words were spoken in mid-1848. By then the legislation of 1846-47 had ensured that the threat implied by the attack on the Border Police would not be realised. By contrast, in 1847 Wentworth and Robinson voted with the government against Windeyer, Lowe and others, to pass an assessment measure, which raised a fund for police purposes. During the debate, both sides accepted the proposition that rejection or acceptance of the Bill was tantamount to rejection or acceptance of the new squatting legislation. At about the same time a Port Phillip squatter earnestly denounced the idea that the local legislature should take over the control of land policy from the British Secretary of State. He bolstered his case by reference to "the ravings of democracy, and the vicious outpourings of infidelity". During the 1848 elections one squatter proudly designated the group supporting the

32 SMH 12 & 27/8/47.
33 SMH 9/7/47 (letter of H. Wills).
interests of his class as "the constitutional party". Here then were clear portents that the change in land policy had revolutionised the political situation, and that the squatters were now anxious to become thoroughgoing conservatives. The Australian Colonies Government Act granted leaseholders the vote for the first time, and the squatting interest was active behind the redistribution of electorates which so heavily favoured rural areas. So the stage was set for the squatters to exercise political power. In fact the gold rushes and other circumstances denied this consummation, so we will never know whether these men would have provided responsible, comparatively disinterested leadership such as Broughton and James Macarthur would have approved.

In fact, one suspects that this would not have been the case; that irresponsibility would have continued to mark squatter politics. Specific evidence for this opinion appears in the continued antipathy of many squatters to any form of restraint even when they had won the major battle on land tenure.

34 L. Mackinnon/N. Black 9/9/48 : Black Papers (all other Black material is from these papers).
Commissioners, for instance, were still a common object of dislike. The separation movement in the Moreton Bay district (later Queensland) sprang from the local squatters' determination to have a government entirely subservient to their policies. As early as 1845 the Herald denounced the Port Phillip separation movement as the work of radicals and squatters, and the latter remained active supporters of the cause. Thus, John Cotton of the Western District supported a move in 1848 to force C.J. La Trobe from the Superintendency, castigating him as "one of those ... who would maintain the divine right of Sovereigns, and would require abject submission from every person beneath his own dignity." The squatters' behaviour in the colonial legislatures of later decades rarely rose above barren negativism, although this was a natural reaction to the ever-increasing power of other interest groups.

35 SMH 6/9/50 (letter of "A Licensed Grazier").
36 Cf A.C.V. Melbourne, Constitutional Development in Australia New South Wales 1788-1856: 406 seq; below.
37 10/1/45.
38 Letter of 9/49, Correspondence: III, 47.
So far, the squatters' rejection of authority has been considered chiefly in relation to politics. Yet their way of life also encouraged a frontier lawlessness, not essentially different from its more celebrated and lurid counterpart in North America. The discouragement of Commissioners and Border Police was significant in this context: they were the men through whom authority from above was exercised in the outback. Naturally, more direct evidence of lawlessness is sparse, but an occasional glimpse breaks through the record. William Gardner, who tutored squatters' children in New England, noticed that early arrivals in any district commonly believed "that they had a right to deal out, & dictate to those who came after". This was understandable, but clearly could lead to abuse. The pastoralist wanted isolation - as much land for himself as possible - and the natural counterpart of this was a tendency to ruthlessness in his relations with others. One squatter returned to N.S.W. from a trip overseas in 1850 to find that his agents had

39 ML MS A176 : II, 23.
sold the rights to his property; the transaction appeared illegal so he took forcible possession, chopping down the new occupier's hut and driving him from the field. While a representative from Port Phillip in the legislature, J.D. Lang received a letter from a Western District squatter, who complained that Fyans had arbitrarily refused to grant him a licence. In consequence, neighbours encroached upon his run with careless impunity. "Possession is the only Sure Claim here", remarked Niel Black, another Western District man, in relating the similar offences of two "dirty mean fellows" who had come into his district. Black, a stern Calvinist, also remarked the habit of even the most honourable men to defraud the innocent whenever opportunity offered. From the other geographical extreme of the squatting movement, that is the Moreton Bay district, Walter Leslie confirmed that

40 ML MS A2762 : 40 seq.
41 From Bilston, 18/6/46 : ML MS A2226.
42 Journal, 10/3/40.
43 Letter to T.S. Gladstone, 21/9/40. These themes are taken up in a chapter of M. Kiddle's forthcoming book, which has been seen in manuscript.
"the insecurity of life and property in the wilds of Australia is considerable".

The lawless element of frontier life received its major expression in the relations of woolgrower and aborigine. "I believe", wrote Black, "they, poor creatures, are Slaughtered in great numbers and never a word Said about it"; "we gave them what they will not forget in a hurry", exulted George Leslie, after describing a native raid on his flocks. Once again, the parties most closely concerned had urgent reason to destroy all evidence, but there can be little doubt that outrage of every sort was inflicted on the aborigines. Sometimes, as at Myall Creek, they were massacred by gun-fire; sometimes by such convert means as arsenic poisoning. Even a squatter who felt interest and affection for these people, would condone his fellows taking the law unto themselves to punish


45 Journal, 25/12/39.

46 Waller : 97.

47 HRA XXIII : 499; SMH 30/6/49; Roberts : 383 seq; 402 seq; etc.
incursions on sheep and cattle. 'Rolf Boldrewood', the squatter-turned-novelist, frankly regretted the need to behave in a quasi-legal manner in these affairs. It was a grievance common to every wool-grower, from the pride of the gentry to the man on the frontier edge.

Those in Port Phillip had a particular complaint. British philanthropists, working on the sympathies of the Imperial Government, had succeeded in having established there a native Protectorate. To the squatters, this was an abomination: the Protectors encouraged the aborigines' pretensions and so made bloody strife all the more inevitable; there was a constant threat that land, precious land, would be reserved for native use. Exeter Hall -

49 Old Melbourne Memories, Melbourne 1884: 51 seq.
50 See E.J.B. Foxcroft, Australian Native Policy, Melbourne 1941.
51 E.g. James Kirby, Old Times in the Bush of Australia, Ballarat 1895.
52 E.g. Black/Gladstone, 5/7/40.
headquarters of the British "feather-bed philanthropist" - became a common target for rebuke. The colonial legislators frequently spoke out against the annual provision for the Protectors under the Estimates, and a committee which enquired into their work manifested a barren and complete lack of sympathy.

These were not the only occasions on which treatment of the aborigines became a political issue. Gipps' Act of 1839 was supported partly because it seemed to promise that a stronger hand would be taken; the Lee case aroused particular resentment, since it appeared that the government was putting the natives' interests above the woolgrowers'. Most significant of all, the Council twice (1844 and 1849) refused to validate the giving of evidence by natives in criminal cases. The Colonial Office waxed long and

53 E.g. R. Von Steiglitz, Victorian Historical Magazine : XIII, 152; Bride : 183; SMH 29/6/49 (speech of Wentworth to LC).

54 Committee on Aborigines and Protectorate, LC 4/9/49.

55 The old Council had passed such an act in 1839, but the Imperial law officers then found it unacceptable, HRA XX : 368, 756.
heated on the need for such action, and the local government too felt strongly, but even in 1849 Lowe and James Macarthur joined with Wentworth in opposition. The Herald was shocked by "their cool suggestions for the coercion of the blacks by brute force, and their scarcely concealed wish that the law and the government should connive at the extermination of the race."

When supporting the Lee petition, James Macarthur recognised that the pastoralists were advocating a point of view contrary to current British thought. Even within the colony there were some not particularly influenced by Christian philanthropy who were affronted by the treatment dealt out to the aborigines. So the woolgrower felt himself under accusation from many quarters. In defence he could

56 HRA XX-XXVI : passim (see indices for Aborigines - admission of evidence of).
57 SMH 29/6/49.
58 30/6/49.
59 SMH 24/8/42
60 G.C. Mundy, Our Antipodes : 97 seq; HRA XXI : 209; chapter VII.
only plead necessity, and a version of the squatter theory of value:

The worthless, idle aborigine has been driven back from the land that he knew not how to make use of, and valued not, to make room for a more noble race of beings, who are capable of estimating the value of this fine country. Is it not right that it should be so?

The answer which British law gave to that question was not the same as the squatters made up for themselves.

**Squatters and other classes**

The growing dominance of squatting affected other groups in the community in different ways. The common result, however, was to make each less suited to discharge the role which conservatives would assign them. This was most obviously true in the case of the gentry, for they - nucleus of conservative power - were obliterated as a result of the new movement. The divergence between the two interests has already been suggested, especially by

---

61 Cotton: III, 9. See also Von Steiglitz, Victorian Historical Magazine: XIII, 152.
reference to the gentry argument that the squatting problem should be resolved by the government selling land at a cost well below £1 per acre. The economic significance of this stand was considerable, quite apart from the tendency to invest land-ownership with a mystique for its own sake. Many of the gentry still owed quit-rents on property originally acquired by grant; throughout the 'thirties many had invested further capital in making further purchases of land, which they had then seen rapidly depreciate in the depression years. If the squatter was to be allowed to compete in selling wool and attracting scarce resources without investing any part of his capital in land, he would have a tremendous advantage. Freehold land, far from being the means to comfortable independence, would become a crushing burden. So, in brief, matters turned out.

On the other hand, squatters and gentry did have some interests in common. When W.A. Duncan

62 Crown Land Sales Act Committee, LC 5/12/43.
analysed this link in 1845, he stressed their common use of unalienated land for grazing, and hostility to District Councils. He said further that the gentry's lands were so heavily mortgaged that they had ceased to think of themselves as land-owners. To this list must be added the gentry's particular reasons for hostility to Gipps' land policies - he tried hard to collect arrears of quit-rents and otherwise tighten administration within the boundaries. These various strains often blended together, especially in the storm of 1844.

Nevertheless, we have ample evidence of the gentry and their sympathisers feeling a jealous antipathy for the newcomers. Richard Jones hoped that the 1839 Act would not be interpreted to allow the squatter freedom from any obligation beyond licence and assessment fees: instead, "let him buy land as the old Colonists have done". Robert Scott publicly

64 WR 22/3/45.

65 This theme is consistently and brilliantly explored in Buckley's articles.

66 SMH 18/3/39.
declared in 1842 that squatting had "materially contributed" to the distress of agriculturists by depreciating land values and making sales impossible. One outspoken supporter of Gipps during the crisis of 1844 was Edward Hamilton who argued that the Governor "dare not sacrifice the public interests to encourage the monopoly of a class." Several land-owning witnesses before the Grievances Committee likewise refused to accept the Boyd-Wentworth interpretation. The address to Gipps regretting the violence of the committee's language further emphasised this dissenting strain, and the Macarthurs' aspersions on the Council's behaviour through 1843-44 were sharply pointed against the squatting interest. Archibald Boyd's defeat at a bye-election in Port Phillip in 1845 should probably be interpreted as a further chapter in this story: only property owners, we recall, were enfranchised.

68 SMH 22/5/44, amplifying letter of 23/4/44.
69 Buckley, HS VII : 188-89.
70 Cf HRA XXIV : 642.
Just as the gentry interest became more emphatic after the legislation of 1846-47 that land should be sold at an economic price, rather than be made available on long, cheap leases, so its positive antagonism to squatting was expressed more directly. A series of motions put to the Council by Lowe in September 1846, and the Land Committees of 1847 and 1849 were important episodes in this story. Another, perhaps the most revealing, was a debate of May '48 which culminated in a plea to the Imperial Government that the payment of quit-rents not be rigorously enforced.

"Held down by a gigantic restriction, the holders of these grants could not thrive - they could not compete with those who occupied with the waste lands of the Crown"; argued T.A. Murray, "... By admitting the competition of the squatter, the Government had broken faith with the settler." Corroborative statistics put the case beyond doubt. In September of this year Archibald Boyd suffered another electoral defeat, the electors of Moreton Bay apparently having been convinced

71 Buckley, HS VII : 192; see chapter II.
72 SMH 8/5/48. The address presented on this occasion is at HRA XXVI : 443 seq.
by propaganda directed against the 1847 Order. Meanwhile anti-squatter feeling continued strong in Port Phillip. At one public meeting the extension of the franchise to this class was bitterly attacked, the leader of the local land-owners declaring

> the squatters ought to be quite content with what they had got without turning round on the landowners and taunting them with poverty; the boast came with bad taste from the squatters for it was the landowners' money which had raised them to their present wealthy state.

The agitation in Melbourne illustrated an alliance between agricultural and urban groups, which Archibald Boyd pointed out to the Colonial Office in 1849. By controlling the press and having the advantage of intercommunication, he argued, this combination was able to exercise a malicious influence against the squatters. "Between the counties and the districts, there always has been, and will be, bitterness of feeling and dissention", Boyd declared. "The old settlers cannot

---

73 Cf MBC 30/9/48.

74 Argus 17/1/49. The speaker was "Dr M'Arthur", almost certainly the Peter McArthur who wrote a strong letter to J.D. Lang in this vein on 7/4/46: ML MS A2226. See also Argus 24/9/47, 29/2/48.

75 CO 201/424: letter of 27/6/49.
forgive the squatters their long leases; the squatters cannot forgive the old settlers their free grants of land." No one was better qualified to judge, and few had done more to secure the victory of his party.

What, then, happened to the gentry? Many gave up their land-owning interests, and simply changed sides. Among the most important families in this list were many - Curr, Hobler, Drysdale, Russell - from V.D.L., whence indeed Port Phillip was largely settled. So 'conservative power' even in the island suffered a heavy loss of men and capital. These ex-gentry were subject to the same pressures as any other squatters, and behaved in much the same fashion. George Wyndham, owner of Dalwood and custodian of British ways, became a particular object of the Herald's attack on squatter greed and arrogance. Of the gentry who did not become squatters, only a handful survived the economic rigours of the 'forties.

76 CO 201/424 : letter of 29/10/49.


78 SMH 10/3/47.
Macarthur, Fitzroy, the Herald, all commented on the decline of the class late in the decade. The ill-times currently suffered by King's School Parramatta, Sydney College and the Australian College emphasised that the sons of the gentry were not being trained in the way of their elder brothers. When Samuel Bennett wrote the passage which introduced our study of the gentry - that is by the mid-'sixties - only vague, nostalgic memories of their glory remained.

The squatter party was dominated by its big men. Wentworth and Boyd held sway over such enormous areas that the imposition of the 1844 regulations would have meant their paying out considerable sums; hence their antagonism had much more obvious reason than did that of the rank-and-file. For the average squatter, indeed, the acceptance of Gipps' scheme might have settled more worries than it created. At

---

79 Immigration Committee, LC 14/9/47 : 43.
80 XXVI : 141, 426.
81 SMH 1/1/50.
the meeting of April 9, Boyd and Wentworth emphasised that they were fighting on behalf of the large-scale operator; in the nature of things, the working squatter in the outback could not take part in political controversy. Gradually there appeared a few hints of antagonism to the "cormorant speculators" from their less expansive colleagues, In August 1845, Boyd publicly refuted the charge that the small squatter had suffered from the policy adopted by the Pastoral Association, but early in the New Year James Macarthur was told "there is evidently a split in the faction ... the more moderate of them being quite content with the Governor's Regulations and the Big ones only looking to convert their squattages into Princely Leaseholds." A close study might reveal that the smaller squatter should be added to the list of parties who suffered through the behaviour of the squatting interest.

82 The adjective was commonly applied to the squatters, e.g. Argus 29/2/48; SMH 2/7/47 (letter of "A Real Squatter"); cf Buckley, HS VII : 181 seq.
83 SMH 26/8/45.
84 Statham & Forster/J. Macarthur, 27/1/46 : ML MS A2927.
The impact of squatting on the quasi-yeoman class must also be described in rather uncertain terms. Undoubtedly some antagonism prevailed. As early as 1838 one squatter attacked the gentry for developing a tenantry, by which the value of freehold land was increased but also the labour market further straitened. Years later J.D. Lang reported that he had often heard squatters rejoice that labourers were improvident: if they saved their money and bought small holdings, their precious services would be lost. Robert Lowe and the Atlas, in their pro-squatter phase, declaimed against the idealisation of la petite culture; G.S. Lang emphasised how foolishly optimistic were visions of the colony as thick with villages, townships, and farms. But after all, this was no less than simple truth, and Lang carefully expressed admiration for the ultimate ideal of closer settlement. In time, some squatters

85 SMH 5/10/38 (letter of "Squatter").
87 SMH 7/6/44; Atlas 8/3/45 (letter of "Argentarius").
88 106; 146.
began to form their own tenancies. On such evidence as this, squatting cannot be accused of unrelenting hostility to the small agriculturist.

When, however, we look at the situation from the viewpoint of the other side, a far more positive picture emerges. Among those few who took up the cudgels for Gipps at the public meetings of April-May 1844 was a Mr Edward Powell of Windsor, apparently a modest farmer:

hitherto the graziers had been keeping down the agriculturists; and whilst that was the case there was no outcry raised; but now that the Executive was wisely taking the burden off the shoulders of the agriculturists to put it on theirs they began to squeak.

Gipps himself favoured enfranchising leasehold farmers because he thought it would reinforce his government against the squatter opposition. The strength of his judgement became obvious in the reaction of small farmers throughout the colony to the regulations which enforced the Act and Order of 1846-47. Two features

89 Evidence of E. Willis to Immigration Committee, LC 14/9/47 : 5; ML MS A176 : passim.
90 SMH 30/4/44.
91 HRA XXIV : 717.
of these were found objectionable: the apparent ruling that land was to be sold in lots no smaller than 640 acres, and the prohibition of farming for profit on land held only on lease from the Crown, a common practise. Throughout the colony an angry campaign was launched against these regulations. The small men were sometimes joined by gentry, partly because grantees suffered discrimination (in the matter of grazing rights over unalienated tracts) as against purchasers of land; partly because, as some Port Phillip land-owners made particularly clear, they believed that the Imperial Government had been hoodwinked by squatter propaganda against the suitability of the colony for agriculture. In reply to the campaign, the government declared that land would be sold in small blocks, but expressed no sympathy for the leasehold farmer.

92 HRA XXVI : 784 seq (Bathurst, and reference to three similar protests); SMH 23/8/48 (Yass); MM 3/5/48 (Singleton); Diary of George Hawke Esq : 89 seq; C. Macalister, Old Pioneering Days in the Sunny South : 22, 150 seq.

93 HRA XXVI : 325. The Bathurst petition illustrated the grantees' complaint.

94 HRA XXVI : 785 seq.
What has all this to do with the defeat of conservatism? The squatters drew no immediate benefit from the two objectionable features of the 1846-47 legislation, nor had any direct part in their formulation. Yet overall the new situation resulted from their agitation and activity, which thus co-operated with the conditions of Australian geography to thwart the growth of a rural middle class, pastoral or farming. By all tradition and experience, this class would have made for increased social stability. A second and more important point was suggested by a petition from Bathurst protesting against the regulations:

That the said Regulations, if carried into effect, must lead to the most ruinous results disastrous alike to all classes of the community by tending to retard for years the now rising prosperity of the Colony, and causing a strong feeling of disaffection in the middle and labouring classes towards the landed proprietors generally and the Government in particular.

There is no evidence that any leasehold farmers were swept off the land, but the yeoman continued to be

95 HRA XXVI : 785.

96 On this point I have been much assisted by D.W. Baker, Canberra University College.
kept in a state of defensive antagonism. Two British travellers reported having discussed the prevailing situation with many small settlers. "We are confident," they emphasised, "that until a system is established of disposing of the waste lands in Australia in small lots ... there will always be an unsettled feeling amongst the inhabitants." Although indirectly, the triumph of squatting was responsible for this restlessness, which went clean contrary to the dream of a Merrie Australia.

It was also by encouraging militant disaffection that pastoralism helped determine that the working class would not fit into the conservative pattern. The land issue had further relevance here, for - as will appear in the following chapter - many an urban labourer aspired to become a yeoman, and with unrealistic vigour blamed the squatter for frustrating him. A far weightier proletarian grievance was the threat of cheap labour competition.

Most free workers hated the thought of employment on outback sheep-stations. By 1841 such men as

97 S. Mossman and T. Banister, Australia Visited and Revisited, London 1853 : 177.
Charles Campbell and Edward Hamilton had become fully aware of this "strong dislike to the lonely, monotonous, and indolent life of a shepherd", the contempt of having interminably to "crawl" after sheep. The most emphatic statements from the workers themselves to this effect were presented to a Council committee which in 1843 enquired into the state of "distressed mechanics and labourers". Many witnesses were probed with queries designed to suggest that if men really were destitute and honestly desired work, they need only go up-country to find it. With remarkable pertinacity the answer came back that such a venture was distasteful beyond contemplation. "Do you not know that many gentlemen have been obliged to become shepherds?", one man was asked. "Many gentlemen have perhaps brought that upon themselves, but we are not to blame for the condition we are in", was the reply, nicely suggesting that such work formed a sort of temporal purgatory. The various hardships of the

98 Evidence to Immigration Committee, LC 13/8/41: 11 and 14 respectively.

99 LC 24/11/43.

100 Evidence of B. Sutherland: 121.
country life were emphasised: ex-convicts were alleged to "take a pleasure in oppressing free men"; the fear of aborigines was strong. The payment of outback workers in truck aroused just antagonism - the claim that this was used to reduce the real value of wages is proved by squatter documents. The workers further protested that payment by orders drawn in Sydney left them without recourse should their masters' credit prove worthless.

In consequence of all these factors, the free working class failed to meet the woolgrowers' need for labour. In reaction employers looked elsewhere for this essential commodity. They were probably all the more ready and ruthless in doing so because of their experiences with convict labour: thus one squatter explained that he considered ticket-of-leave men ideal employees because "you have a check upon them, and they having undergone a certain degree of punishment are

101 Evidence of E. Mullens : 33.
102 Cf SMH 13/9/43 (letter of "One of the People").
103 Hodgson : 45-6; Cotton : I, 43.
104 See further chapter IV.
more cautious in their conduct." Charles Campbell, while emphasising a preference for free labourers for socio-moral reasons, admitted that his overseer - the practical man - found convicts better suited to shepherding. The upshot was that the squatting interest, not without the support of some gentry, liberals, and moralists, threw its weight behind moves for resumption of transportation.

Evidence of this appears in Archibald Boyd's letters to the Colonial Office; in the Moreton Bay separation movement, for the squatters there were particularly resentful of any hindrance on their obtaining such labour; even perhaps in W.E. Gladstone's encouragement of renewal, for that statesman's family had personal and financial ties with Niel Black. It

105 Evidence of J. Dobie to Renewal of Transportation Committee, LC 31/10/46 : 13.
106 Evidence to Immigration Committee, LC 7/8/38.
107 For moralists, chapter IX; the liberals included Bland, R. Hipkiss, H. Macdermott.
108 CO 201/424 : 88 seq.
109 Boyd's letters make this point; so also CO 201/424 : 469 seq (petitions from Moreton Bay squatters); Melbourne : 406 seq; Russell : 449 seq.
110 Black Papers : passim.
was in response to Gladstone's proposal that the squatting interest in the colonial legislature secured the appointment of a committee favourable to resumption. Ben Boyd was a major witness:

I believe that there is no employer of labour in the colony who would not prefer a ticket-of-leave man to a bounty immigrant; for my own part, although I came out here at first with all my English prejudices against the prisoner class, I now from experience prefer them so decidedly, that I have at this moment but few immigrants in my employment.

This committee's report was ultimately rejected by the whole Council, but so late as 1848 Wentworth put through motions in favour of transportation diluted with increased free migration. Outside the chamber the pro-convict campaign continued right through our period. Meanwhile many squatters had imported labourers, chiefly ex-convict, from V.D.L., a scheme which Boyd sought to improve upon

\[ \begin{align*} 111 & \text{ LC 31/10/46.} \\
112 & \text{ Evidence : 11.} \\
113 & \text{ V & P 114/9/47.} \\
114 & \text{ V & P 7/4/48.} \\
115 & \text{ Cf Immigration Committee, LC 30/9/45 : Report.} \end{align*} \]
by arranging with Denison for the import of men still under bond.

India, China, and the Pacific Islands all came under consideration as potential sources of economic work force. In 1837 "certain Flock-owners" drew attention to the desirability of seeking coolies from Bengal, and John Mackay presented himself as willing to manage the task. Another entrepreneur applied himself to bringing in Chinese. The issue remained prominent over the next few years, reaching a climax in 1842-43 with the organisation of an association to import Indians: among Ben Boyd's many interests was the recruiting of labourers from the New Hebrides. As a result of these and other efforts coloured workers

116 H.P. Wellings, Ben Boyd's Labour Supplies, RAHSJ : XIX, 374 seq esp 379. This article also describes Boyd's native labour schemes.

117 V & P 1837 : pages 581 seq; see also Immigration Committee, evidence and report, LC 11/7/37 and 25/8/37.

118 SMH 22/6/37. The man was G.F. Davidson, author of Trade and Travels in the Far East.

119 See HRA XIX : 401; the various Immigration Committees, especially that of 1841; Russell : 387 seq.

120 ML MS A2029 lists the Coolie Association's provisional supporters.
were brought into Australia, but few proved satisfactory. The difficulties of language and acclimatisation were massive, while the men showed a disconcerning tendency to have minds of their own.

Woolgrowers at large rather than squatters in particular were responsible for these schemes, and some of the latter were as sensitive as any gentry to the decivilising effects, on one hand of a labour shortage, on the other of fostering a degenerate proletariat. Nevertheless, the expansion of squatting inevitably strengthened the drive to obtain convicts and coolies, and so to enrage the free British worker. The dominant part of Boyd and Wentworth in the story was symbolic of the general situation. Moreover, men who fought against buying land, and so contributing to the one sure fund whence assisted migration could be subsidised had a particular responsibility to bear for the overall shortage. From the workers' point of view the squattages had the disadvantage of being further and further removed from civilisation, and increasingly suspect of those faults - truck, ill-treatment, aborigines - mentioned above.

121 Black/Gladstone, 21/9/40; Hobler, ML MS C426 : 164; Russell : 205; below.
Among the mercantile community were many whose interests were closely bound with the squatters, but also some who joined in condemning the greed of that class. Examples range from S.K. Salting to William Willmington, a petty storekeeper in a coastal town south of Sydney. Charles Nicholson probably represented the upper-crust professional point of view when he sneered at Ben Boyd's final downfall and departure: "such is the climax of all the hectoring and pretension of this man." We are reminded of Archibald Boyd's emphasis on the link between town and agricultural groups. And although Ben Boyd failed personally, the class he represented did not. Few admired the squatters, many had suffered at their hands, all had to recognise the fact of their triumph.

* *

122 Evidence to Committee on Minimum Upset Price of Land, LC 28/9/47 : 52.
123 HRA XXIII : 790 seq; XXIV : 562 seq, 733 seq.
Squatters and Civilisation

Squatting tended to create anarchy in the social and cultural sense, as well as in politics and class relations. Several subjects already discussed had implications in this broader field. The decline of the gentry worked against the direction of Australian society by a sophisticated elite; pastoralist-aborigine relations reflected not only lawlessness but an ugly primitiveness of thought and deed. Labour and land issues particularly had a wider significance, and so require further notice.

By common consent, the ideal immigrant was a young married Briton. He, his wife and his children seemed to promise the best hope of developing a community, sound in moral health and amenable to the influence of high ideals. The clash between this way of thinking and the squatters' cheap labour schemes can hardly be overstated. To illustrate the point, we shall notice only the discussion on Asian and Pacific workers; the anti-transportation movement, which was similar in quality but on a much grander scale, is better left to later chapters. We have
already noticed that Broughton took precisely the same stand against coolies as he did against convicts. Thus he wrote in the Report of the 1841 Immigration Committee, presumably expressing the opinion of its other members as well as himself:

> whatever defects may be chargeable upon the state of society here, it is at present so unmixed in its composition as to promise to supply materials for the fabrication of a social and political state corresponding with that of the country from which it derives its origin.

Gipps and the Colonial Office ranged themselves firmly on the same side. The Governor stated his conviction that the protagonists of the early moves for obtaining coloured workers were "men ... looking rather to their own immediate wants than to the ultimate good of the community", and warned the legislature against the creation of "a degraded class" analogous to the negroes of America. The councillors gave Gipps no very enthusiastic response, but later in the decade the new legislature did take up a firm anti-coolie

125 LC 13/8/41; cf SMH 21/7/41 (Broughton in LC).
126 HRA XIX : 401; XXI : 435.
127 SMH 21/7/41.
position. A move to have the Musters and Servants Legislation extended to cover Pacific Islanders was rejected, much to the annoyance of Boyd, who declared that this was the chief reason for the failure of these labourers to give satisfaction. He also alleged that the Council was inspired by deliberate malice, and feeling certainly ran high: "'Lock up the land' say they", so Murray angrily represented the squatters' argument, "'keep down the immigration funds, and then we shall be obliged to have transported labour for nothing, or savages at next to nothing'." Robert Lowe called the government's attention to what he termed an incipient slave trade, and the 1847 Immigration Committee denounced "the evil of having to depend upon a coloured population for the supply of labour".

Mrs Chisholm, mother-figure of Australian family morality, became an avowed enemy of the

128 SMH 3/11/47.
129 SMH 23/6/47.
131 LC 14/9/47 : Report.
squatter "capitalists" and their labour policies. There was every reason for this conflict. In 1838 a public meeting of the colonial respectability expressed their firm conviction that public money should not be spent on importing persons who wished to settle in groups or mechanics with their wives and children. "An essentially Pastoral Country" required that every emphasis be placed on bringing in farm labourers and shepherds. This meeting paid homage to the ideal of a homogeneous population, based on the family unit, but perhaps with a smack of hypocrisy. Other squatters in private, or even in public, made no bones of their dislike for married shepherds, who were reluctant to move far from their homes when tending the sheep, and whose families imposed a heavy drain on the station budget.

The squatters' policies on this head certainly

132 HRA XXV : 408; and generally M. Kiddle, Caroline Chisholm.

133 V & P 1838 : pages 583 seq; Immigration Committee, LC 7/8/38, which was partly inspired by the public meeting.

appear reprehensible, but what of the accusations that they deliberately obstructed a more fruitful use of the land? The pastoral industry had survived without the help of convicts or coolies, but we still look forward to the day when intensive agriculture becomes possible throughout the eastern hinterland. Yet not only radical politicians, sentimentalists, and theologians declared that closer settlement was a geographic possibility, but also men of comparatively unbiased outlook and sound practical experience. William Bland, T.A. Murray, the Herald - all declared with blithe confidence that sheep-rearing could only be a temporary basis for the economy, and that it was a matter of immediate urgency to develop "the superior resources of the land". Did the ghost of John Macarthur shudder as his son inveighed against those whose policy it was to act "as if this fine country had no higher destiny than to continue a sheep walk for ever"? P.P. King made a sounder point:

135 SMH 26/9/46 (Bland to LC), 11 & 20/1/47.

136 Evidence to Immigration Committee, LC 14/9/47: 43.

Land is not improved by occupation unless it is occupied with judgment - I mean by not overstocking it - but what cares the squatter - he puts as many sheep as he can on a small space & when the pasture is destroyed he moves off and leaves the ground a waste.

These attacks on the squatters were part of a general condemnation of their life. On all sides this was declared innately contemptible - demanding little skill and not at all creative. Those who pursued squatting developed no attachment to the soil; they had no concern for the country beyond rape of its wealth. An anthology of the various statements of this conviction would make interesting reading, but cannot be attempted here. The statements of Broughton and Edward Macarthur quoted in the previous chapters indicate the general trend; only a few more instances need be cited to show the force of the argument, and its widespread acceptance.

E.G. Wakefield merits first place in our list of anti-squatters. With all his faults, dogmatism and ignorance, Wakefield was the great prophet of civilisation for the colonies. His basic argument was that unrestrained dispersion thwarted the development of social relations, the division of labour, and so the
culture of arts and sciences by a leisured upper class. He wanted no land to be used other than what was sold, and that at a high price; he wanted the waste lands of the colony reserved to imperial control for the benefit of future generations; he wanted family migration. Few colonists ever had anything favourable to say of Wakefield, but to the squatters alone were his ideas thoroughly, irrevocably alien.

Sir George Gipps was influenced by Wakefield, and his account of the squatting life had undertones of that prophet's doctrine with a strength that could only come from knowledge and involvement:

We here see a British Population spread over an immense territory, beyond the influence of civilization, and almost beyond the restraints of Law. Within this wide extent, a Minister of Religion is very rarely to be found. There is not a place of Worship, nor even a School. So utter indeed is the destitution of all means of instruction, that it may perhaps be considered fortunate that the population has hitherto been one almost exclusively male. But Women are beginning to follow into the Bush; and a race of Englishmen must speedily be springing up in a state approaching that of untutored barbarism .... here and there a Building has been erected, which may deserve the name of a Cottage, but the Squatters in general live in Huts made of the Bark of Trees; and a Garden, at least anything worthy of the name, is a mark of civilization rarely to be seen.
Such arguments convinced the British civil servants who determined land policy that unless strenuous action were taken to combat the problem "a great calamity" would ensue. The final result - not an illogical one - was to give in to squatter demands.

Among the bravest souls in the colonial community were those who tried to maintain a literary culture. Among this group, the outstanding individual was Charles Harpur, native born poet and philosopher. Harpur expressed his view of the squatter in a sonnet "On the Political and Moral Condition of Australia in 1845", dedicated to Gipps in admiration of his policies:

My Country! I am sore at heart for thee!  
And in mine ear, like a storm-heralding breeze,  
A voice against thee gathers warningly.  
Lo, in what hands seem now thy destinies!  
Hands grasping all, through party means, to seize  
Some private benefit: and what should be  
Thy Freedom's dawn, but gives ascendancy  
To lawless Squatters, and the Hacks of these!  
Woe waits a land, where men are wise or brave  
For naught but self! Where even the best aside  
Are thrusting honesty to don the knave!  
Where worth is trampled on by vulgar pride!  
And where all beauty of the mind, decried,  
Hangs dying o'er a Mammon-delved grave.

139 HRA XXIV : 445 seq, esp 454.  
140 WR 26/4/45.
Among the many little magazines which other apostles of culture launched on the colonial market, the Colonial Literary Journal and the Australian Era were outstanding. Both regretted the implications of squatting: the former saw therein "proofs of the poverty, decomposition, and mismanagement of society"; the latter anticipated the theme of this chapter by remarking that far from the well-bred and educated squatters making any contribution to local refinement, "the pursuit which, beyond all others, is at present most essential to the material interests of the colony, has morally and socially a debasing tendency."

The squatters themselves provide the evidence which clinches the truth of these various assertions. Witness after witness to the Land Grievances Committee of 1844 depicted the horrors of barbarism into which the squatter was forced by insecurity of tenure: Gipps was accused of ignoring those very conditions which he so effectively described. Some who pursued the argument might have been hypocritical, but there was ample
reason for sincerity. Most squatter accounts which give a generally favourable view of the life were written in long retrospect or 'ghosted' at a distance; the one positive virtue noted by most contemporary participants was "independence" or "freedom", concepts which might as justly be termed licence and irresponsibility. Otherwise the squatters' account of their own lives is one of misery, boredom, and discomfort.

This was particularly true of the accounts confided to diaries or intimates. No more poignant description of the squatter life survives than that embodied in a series of letters from William Forster, future Premier of N.S.W., to Vincent Dowling, at this time studying law in London on the first stage of a career which was to end on the Supreme Court Bench.

---


145 Roberts' account of "The Squatting Life" remains unsurpassed: chapter X.
"A miserable sort of outlaw", Forster described himself, writing from the Molonglo plains, "exerting the whole of my faculties in taking care of sheep and cattle"; and later, "I am ... stagnant in the depths of a half savage colony where mind feels itself like a galley slave brought to the oar taught to subject its power and impulses to the omnipotence of money."

Having moved on to the Clarence River ("purgatory ... in the middle of all the romance of uncomfortable solitude") Forster deplored "the want of society, the want of books, the want of amusement" and found himself most industriously lending my aid in transforming the wild and rich luxuriance of these unfrequented and once beautiful forests into the demi civilised but entirely disgusting aspect of one of those mansions of wool, salt beef, and misery denominated a station .... I must move actively to prevent myself from going to a state of smash altogether ...

Women never accompanied pioneering parties, and even when a station was established, many a squatter was
reluctant to gather his family about him. "I cannot yet reconcile myself to bring you and the dear children up so far to be separated from all social comforts"; wrote William Campbell, another squatter and politician of the future, to his wife, "... happy you cannot be in a wilderness like this". Similarly George Hobler was genuinely distressed that his eldest son should pass his twenty-first birthday "stowed away in a slab hut in the far west of New Holland".

As Forster's letters illustrate, these men were self-convicted of that rapacious materialism which formed so important a part of the charge against them. The simple fact that the squatter was commonly a man of culture and respectable connections increased his reluctance to view Australia as anything but a source of quick money. "Had I given up friends, family, civilization, and dear old England, in vain?", asked one, as he set out to his station. C.P. Hodgson, described how men such as himself looked upon their

150 19/8/46 : ML MS A3587.
151 15/7/46 : ML MS C425.
152 Haygarth : 11.
sojourn in the colony as "a few years of banishment", made bearable only by the hope that he would be able to return to the bosom of his family, free from the cares of poverty. "Although called Settlers we are never permanently settled anywhere;" wrote Niel Black in his journal, "we have always an eye to returning home some day or other".

The early squatters thus made clear that they held their way of life in no great esteem, and took no pride in adopting it. Edward and Leonard Irby, sons of the Honourable and Reverend Dean of Peterborough Cathedral, would have liked to take Broughton's advice and become land-owning agriculturists. Boyd could express the village settlement ideal as romantically as Charles Campbell himself, and at the whaling settlement of Boydtown, showed that, in different economic circumstances, he was prepared to act as well as speak. Wentworth forecast the danger of miscegenation arising.

---

154 Journal, 15/3/40.
155 Memoirs of Edward and Leonard Irby, Sydney 1908: 44 seq.
156 Evidence to Committee on Land Grievances, LC 20/8/44: 13.
from coolie migration; Black feared that the introduction of ex-convicts from V.D.L. would create social havoc; and the Moreton Bay squatters were ashamed of their efforts to introduce cheap labour. Yet all these people believed, with greater or less justice, that reality demanded that they should act contrary to their own ideals; each saw himself as "a victim of necessity".

Moreover when, after 1846-47, the squatters were granted their demands the attitude of many did change. They did begin to settle, to raise families, and to pursue culture, just as they tended to become politically conservative. But, perhaps in part because of the reaction from long years of ostracism, they never approached a position of social leadership. They were regarded with envy and hatred, which grew as their position became more secure. Yet had this security not been given, the barbaric, lawless elements of the squatting life would have continued and increased.

---

157 Evidence to Immigration Committee, LC 11/7/37.
158 Black/Gladstone, 30/9/46.
159 Russell : 392.
The discovery of an industry which had made the community wealthy and so prepared the way for national advance, had magnified social tension. So appear still more facets of "that gigantic anomaly", which the Herald so wisely perceived in the squatting movement. "Rights clash with rights, interests with interests", declared another editorial on the same problem. "Ill feeling is everywhere engendered."

In such a climate, the conservative ideal could not flourish.
IV. RADICAL POLITICS: NEW CLAIMS AND CONFLICT

The Demand for Self-Government

To control the destinies of the state in which one lives is a desire so natural as to require little elaboration. The claim to self-government derived much from men inspired by devotion to the mechanism of politics; men who made their mark in Council by introducing legislation, carrying the burden of work on select committees, scrutinising the executive's every move. Many of the leading figures in the movement were ambitious, and some were greedy - office, and the fruits of office meant a great deal. Little high philosophy inspired the clamour for control of land policy, or the resistance to police and gaols expenditure, or the antagonism to the Ordnance Bills and the District Councils. All these issues, and the excitement they aroused, sprang from a loathing of taxation too absolute for the twentieth-century mind to comprehend readily. It was no less strong in V.D.L. where the determination of councillors to resist every species of impost wrecked several important measures: bills for civic improvement, road
building, and primary education were among them. Denison had a titanic clash with his judiciary over an issue as superficially petty as the legitimacy of a dog licence fee, Judge Montagu becoming something of a public hero when he argued against it. At times it seemed that in both colonies agitation for self-government cloaked sheer miserliness.

The attack on Gipps in 1844 differed only in degree from the general character of the campaign. The colonists fought with remarkable vehemence and effect to force the executives' hand. The members of the N.S.W. legislature quickly took the initiative from the executive in clear contradiction of the spirit of the 1842 Constitution Act. Each year the Estimates were studied and amended with ruthless precision; this power over finance was ingeniously adapted to expand the legislature's influence; a move was even made to reduce Gipps' salary, and

1 HTC 16/3/41, 18/2/45, 9/8/45; Hob Gdn 22/3/48; etc.
2 LE 20/10/47, seq gives the best commentary on this issue, which became quite important.
3 A.C.V. Melbourne, Constitutional Development in Australia New South Wales 1788-1856 : 288-89; HRA XXIV : 643; etc.
thereby - so the Governor himself alleged - diminish
his prestige. Tasmanian politicians had less scope
for imposing their will, but earnestly pursued every
opening. Eardley-Wilmot and Denison were seriously
embarrassed not only by the walk-out of the 'Patriotic
Six' but further by the reluctance of other notables
to fill the empty seats. Sir William was also moved
to complain of "the ardour of public meetings" which
aspired to "take upon themselves the whole of the
legislative and executive functions of this govern-
ment." Boyes' diary bore frequent witness to the
overwhelming difficulties encountered by this Governor
as he sought to govern the island with a strong hand.

Contemporaries were not slow to classify the
agitation as quasi-democratic. Boyes sympathised
with the upper class colonists in their struggle
with Denison, his own bête noir, but years before
had described them as "all Radicals of the worst

4 HRA XXIV : 374.

5 W.A. Townsley, The Struggle for Self-Government
in Tasmania 1842-1856 : i.

6 Letter to E. Deas Thomson, 12/4/51 : ML MS
A1531.
kind, and their children ... brought up in the belief that all Government are bad". Chief Justice Pedder, high Tory that he was, declared in 1838 that he would prefer a Council elected by universal suffrage to one composed of "trimming, shifting, gentry"; Eardley-Wilmot described the opposition voiced by the non-official legislators as "radical, and even Jacobinical". These comments are reminiscent of the criticisms, quoted in the previous chapter, directed against the squatting interest when it spearheaded the opposition to the N.S.W. executive. In similar fashion James Stephen of the Colonial Office described an Act by which the legislators of the senior colony sought to weaken the executive by prohibiting the election to Council of government employees as "in the highest degree democratic and anti-monarchical."

This unsigned analysis of W.C. Wentworth appeared in

7 Hudspeth Memorial Volume, Hobart 1944 : 112.
10 Melbourne : 285; cf SMH 10/10/46 (LC debate). The Imperial authorities disallowed the Act.
the colonial press following his successful leadership of a move to reduce the number of police magistrates, and so to save government expenditure:

The bugbear of your inmost soul is — an official. Of this class you were, early in life, a sort of victim. Power had for you nought but frowns, and a deep hatred of the tribe has grown with your growth and strengthened with your strength till you can see but a barren usefulness in the most necessary offices. A government officer is in your eyes a tool of power, an agent of corruption, the unblessed offspring of tyrannous rule, and you think you do the state good service when you rush upon the body with indiscriminate slaughter.

The movement in which Wentworth played so notable a part smacked through and through of this anarchic flavour.

Support of this cause inevitably stunted the growth of conservatism. It forced a wedge between interests which otherwise had much in common. The appointment of Denison to a community owning a tight-knit propertied class culminated not in a powerful conservative alliance, but fierce, deep conflict.

This was the extreme example, but in varying degree

11 WR 27/7/44 (letter of "An Ex-P.M.").
all Governors but Bourke would have been happy to establish friendly relations with precisely that class which bridled most under Imperial restraint. Conservative unity was further impaired by disagreement as to how far the campaign for self-government should be pushed: the Herald regretted severe adjustments of the judicial estimates; Macarthur felt that District Councils should be supported; not many of the respectability answered Lowe's call to humiliate the Governor by boycotting the Queen's Birthday levee of 1845. Furthermore, men whose chief political activity was to attack the government were inhibited from developing a conservative theory. "The law of the institutions of a new country is, not stability, but progress", declared an Atlas editorial, making the point that the hybrid constitution of the day could attract the loyalties of no-one. This was neither shrine to be protected, nor rock whereon ideas might be founded.

12 All the journals discussed the issue in May-June, 1845.

13 Atlas 18/1/45; quoted, G.H. Nadel, Australia's Colonial Culture: 63.
By contrast, the major arguments advanced by the colonial politicians vis-à-vis the executive - the right of self-determination, rigid government economy, no taxation without representation - were inherently liberal in quality. The outstanding spokesmen in the campaign, Wentworth, Lowe, Windeyer, all belonged in this tradition. Conversely, to advocate the cause pushed men to the political left. James Macarthur had to adopt the language of Whiggism in the early 'forties; Charles Cowper entered the legislature a Tory but after five years' active support of colonial rights was an ally of Lowe's at the second general election. The many taunts directed at Wentworth's alleged betrayal of radicalism had little basis in cold fact, but his detractors probably felt that so outspoken an advocate of self-government must have been a near-democrat.

Time and again the concept of political rights was invoked in this debate. Usually the right of wealthier Britons to have the same political privileges as they would at home was meant, but sometimes

\[14 \text{ SMH 2/8/48.}\]
the argument became more abstract. Thus "the dictates of natural justice" found a place in the armory of the Port Phillip separationists, fighting their own small battle for financial autonomy. James Macarthur ventured a similar pronouncement in 1842, and was at once taken up by the radical E.J. Hawksley, who insisted that natural law made no discrimination between rich and poor. This one specific example probably symbolised a fairly general reaction: when rights are once invoked, all conditions of men will apply the doctrine to themselves. Shortly after returning to England in 1850 Robert Lowe - his opinion was uniquely significant - bemoaned that his fellow agitators were "obliged, in order to make an impression on the British Government, to stimulate the passions and inflame the minds of the masses in the colonies." He warned that the longer self-government was delayed, the more turbulent would be the body politic in later years.

15 E. Curr, The Petitions of the District of Port Phillip, Melbourne 1844 (F3887) : x.
16 AC 3/3/42.
As early as 1843 the Launceston Examiner argued that unanimous hostility to Imperial restrictions was the first cause which drove colonies towards democracy. This remains a sound proposition.

'Australians' in N.S.W. Politics

James Macarthur bewailed that the emancipists tended to think of the colony as "theirs by right", and saw in this attitude a powerful threat to his own ideals. Thus he pointed out a most important theme of colonial politics: the claim that convict background should not disqualify any man from political influence— even indeed that it bestowed a particular right to affect the colony's destiny. To act on this belief was to adopt a position on the political left. It encouraged the demand for self-government, with the results noticed above; it entailed attachment to principles of civic equality, for ex-convicts had most to fear from the imposition of any inequality; and, most important of all, it was a movement springing from new men, if not poor men. Thus liberalism

18 5/7/43.
and the emancipist cause were inextricably joined. Liberals like Bourke, Sir John Jamison, and E.S. Hall supported ex-convicts as a matter of intellectual conviction; William Bland happened to have come to the colony a convict, but would have played a similar part in local affairs whatever his personal history.

The greatest and most significant figure in the liberal-emancipist party was W.C. Wentworth. There was no causal relationship between this man's leadership of the squatters and this role, but in both he could express that antagonism to the ruling powers, so well observed by the unknown psychologist already quoted. That account indicated another of Wentworth's traits most important in this context: that he fought throughout life the battles of his early years. The readiness of convicts' sons to inherit their fathers' quarrels was a feature of Sydney life in the mid-'thirties which struck Charles Darwin; the following pages will bear out his perspicacity. Partly because of the prominence of

the second generation in our account; partly because the emancipist issue was peculiarly a local phenomenon, the label 'Australian' has been adopted. Natives were active in every department of colonial life (among the gentry leadership and in running that conservative magazine *The Politician* to take two examples), but Wentworth and his fellows were shaped by and conscious of their birth to an extreme degree.

Wentworth has also attracted our notice as a leading advocate of continued transportation, and in this too he represented much liberal-emancipist sentiment. The case had sound economic backing - the pastoralists' need of labour, the argument (which Bland ceaselessly advanced) that no colony could afford to export capital to subsidise migration - but the issue went beyond such considerations. Probably no 'Australians' planned to strengthen their party by urging the constant inflow of convicts, but it was natural they should react against the cry that transportation had marked the colony with a stain that should be erased with all possible vigour.

"Theirs by right" - what was the social background to this idea? The colonies had in fact been
founded primarily as convict depots, and transportees had contributed vastly to whatever civilisation had ensued. Travellers reported hearing old hands scorn "bloody immigrants" and the "self-imported devil". Such observers as E.S. Hall and Caroline Chisholm declared ex-convicts as a class to be extraordinarily rich in the fundamental virtues, and so to deserve particular consideration. The memory of Governor Macquarie, the convict's friend, quickly achieved a mystical power. Wealthier ex-convicts had acquired a reputation for generous philanthropy; the Sydney College proclaimed their devotion to higher learning. Fewer emancipists amassed great wealth as time went by, and probably fewer convicts arrived who were non-criminal and had surpassing ability. Nevertheless ex-convicts remained prominent among Sydney's plutocracy – Lowe declared that after the depression

20 R.B. Ward, The Australian Legend: 53, 57. This important study throws much light on the general argument of the following paragraphs.

of the early '40s they were relatively more powerful than before.

The social cleavage between the tainted and the clean-skins also persisted. Among the more pertinent reports, widely scattered as to year and place, a letter from Port Phillip in 1838 may be chosen for quotation. The writer emphasised the rigidity with which ostracism applied:

This you will say is hard ... I grant it especially as regards the children of emancipists, for I am no admirer of the exclusive system, nor of the secret heart-burnings and open alienation and dis-sensations that spring from it yet ... were you here with a young family you would feel the power of public opinion, and secretly dread an intercourse that might lead to family connections, of which you could not approve, even while you were convinced that the peace and harmony of the colony required you to give your feelings, and fears to the winds.

Even the most successful ex-convicts - in a sense, particularly the most successful - must have smarted under this treatment. Yet even if a return to


England were practicable, the likelihood of settling there happily was not great. Their destiny lay in Australia, and the incentives towards adopting an aggressive, self-conscious determination to leave what mark they could, were strong.

The native element could make its own contribution to the party's mores and strength. Broughton's lament over the Australians' disrespect for traditional belief found many echoes: most strikingly perhaps in the shocked dissatisfaction of a Sydney police bench when an eleven-year-old answered the conventional question about religious belief by saying he was a native! Inevitably, the narrow environment in which most of the colonial born were reared comprised their universe, provoking an arrogant self-satisfaction galling to many British travellers. Yet the assumption that local birth bestowed particular virtue was not confined to those who personally enjoyed that boon. An old and expansive tradition that young

---

24 Cf Mrs C. Meredith (L.A. Twamley), Notes and Sketches of New South Wales, London 1849: 50-51.

Australians far outshone their fathers continued right through our period. "The men manly and generous, the women beautiful and good" was one forecast of the future race.

The political variation of this attitude was to assume that a native instinctively possessed that much-belauded virtue, freedom from faction. "A son of the soil - a sprig of the true Iron Bark" - wrote a journalist in praise of Nelson Lawson, "his sympathies and predilections are closely and inseparably interwoven with those of his fellow-colonists."

Hyperbole was very near, yet so common was this type of argument that it must have had some power. Candidates for election always claimed local birth when they could, or otherwise stressed their ties with the country. As the transient money-seeker was scorned, so the settled native won praise.

The first major phase of 'Australian' activity in our period was the seven years' activity of the Australian Patriotic Association, founded in 1835 as

27 The Sporting Times (ML) 29/7/48.
a consequence of the expected termination of the 1828 Judicature Act. The significance of this title was even greater than appears at first glance. It expressed the organisers' ambition to build a very broad political front, isolating the hard-core exclusives and presenting them as 'anti-patriots', opposed to the general welfare. The Indian Congress Party provides a latter-day model of this design.

In fact the charisma of universality proved elusive, and the organisation soon became no more than the medium of liberal-emancipist opinion. Bitterly opposed to the exclusives' pretensions, the Patriots expressed preference for a strong executive as against government by oligarchy. Still more desirable, however, were representative institutions elected on a broad franchise. Above all, the A.P.A. insisted that - as in Britain - once a prisoner had served out his punishment he should be eligible for full citizenship. Its whole case rested on the assertion that, despite penal associations, the colony was a thoroughly normal community.

---

28 Melbourne : 202 seq; D.W. Rawson, Factions in New South Wales Politics : 129 seq.
One of the Patriots' achievements was to secure an agent - first H.L. Bulwer, and then (1837) Charles Buller - in the House of Commons. When the Imperial Government at last addressed itself to the colony's situation, Buller received from the Association a series of letters (actually written by Bland) which splendidly applied the liberal philosophy. The findings and recommendations of the Molesworth Committee regularly bore the brunt of Bland's fire, reflecting as it did the opinions of James Macarthur and urging the cessation of transportation. At this point the cleavage between the colonial liberals and E.G. Wakefield opened very wide - yet Wakefield inspired the English radicals and colonial reformers, among whom were counted Bulwer and Buller as well as Molesworth. The inevitable friction became apparent in 1838-39, when Buller devised his own plans for constitutional reform. Bland told him bluntly that he had accepted the Molesworth-Mudie-Macarthur heresy; that the £10 franchise he proposed would hand over the colony to

29 Melbourne : 247-48; Bland, Letter from the Australian Patriotic Association ... March 1939, Sydney 1840 (F2930).
a rapacious plutocracy; and that to give such men plenary legislative powers would endanger even the retention of these civil rights which had already been won. A £5 franchise and vote by ballot, to check the landed gentry's power over their tenants, were essential.

During 1840 the Association addressed Buller on two related issues. One was the Municipal Bill which came before Council in that year. The controversy, mentioned in Chapter II, as to whether any disqualification should be imposed on ex-convicts in this legislation, naturally roused the emancipists. The leading barrister, William a'Beckett argued their case before the Council, emphasising that they had acted, and would act as a party only when so compelled by exclusive hostility. Bland repeated to Buller that any disqualification was unconstitutional, and designed to assist the most selfish interests in the colony. Gipps' retreat from his original position

30 SMH 29/6/40.

31 Letter ... on the Bill for the Introduction of Municipal Institutions ..., Sydney 1840.
pleased the A.P.A., but it regretted the shelving of the Bill, which promised some local control over taxation. The proposed £30 franchise was thought excessive. Meanwhile an Act for taking a census had been introduced into the Legislature, and on Macarthur's initiative amended to require all citizens to state whether they had arrived free or bond. Bland told Buller that this was intended to effect the exclusion clauses of the Municipal Bill. The legislation aroused strong feeling outside the House, vindicated when Justices Dowling and Stephen (not Burton) declared the offending clause to contradict British constitutional law. 'Arrived free' remained a separate census category, but pertinent information had to be supplied voluntarily, or from independent sources.

Meanwhile, Lord John Russell planned to

32 Letter from the Australian Patriotic Association ... February 1841, Sydney 1841 (F3145).

33 Letter ... on the Census Bill ..., Sydney 1840; cf SMH 21/10/40 (LC debate).

34 HRA XXI : 154-55. The Census Act was 4 Vic no 26.
'dismember' the colony and revise its constitution. 
In February 1841 Bland wrote Buller that the Association warmly supported the broad principle of the new proposals. No wonder, for Russell had completely eschewed any discrimination against ex-convicts. 
Soon afterwards, he instructed Gipps that Municipal legislation was to follow this precedent, and Lord Stanley pursued the same policy in the 1842 Constitution Act. Bland could not have foreseen all these details in February 1841, but he probably realised that the long battle was virtually won. Macarthur, one suspects, concurred: hence his offer at precisely this time to bury ancient feuds. In fact, the A.P.A. had triumphed, and now practically ceased to exist.

The two parties joined together in attacking dismemberment. This was in sharp contrast to earlier squabbles, and doubtless prompted Gipps reporting in September 1841 that the old animosities were fast disappearing. He spoke too soon, forgetting perhaps

35 Melbourne : 255 seq.
36 Letter from the Australian Patriotic Association ... February 1841.
37 HRA XXI : 441-42.
that reconciliations had happened before. The events of 1841–42 did mark a dividing line in that the grand constitutional question of emancipists' rights was then settled, but the old political factions remained. Although representatives of the two groups sat together on the 1842 Petition Committee, tough bargaining went before, and tension between them persisted. The A.P.A. even sparked into life to urge upon it a one-chamber legislature, which the *Herald* declared a "Revolutionary Innovation". The election of 1843 taught the same lesson. Macarthur and Wentworth might sit upon the same platform, but the latter and Bland won Sydney with a machine controlled by Samuel Lyons, arch-type emancipist merchant.

Nevertheless the first five years of the new legislature's history added little to the 'Australian' tradition. Wentworth remained the outstanding protagonist of self-government, and was probably the

---

38 HRA XXI: 510. Rawson stresses the constant fluidity of the various factions.

39 AC 1/3/42.

40 28/3/42.

41 AC 17/6/43.
most influential man in the Council. Lowe, Windeyer and Cowper were little inferior, however, and the major issues of the period - squatting, education, finance - provided little opportunity for the coalescing of 'Australian' sentiment. To find a stronger thread of continuity in our story, we have to explore the rather shabby purlieus of the Sydney City Council.

Bourke had suggested incorporation in 1835. The immediate response was a public meeting which repudiated the possibility as threatening further taxation. Bourke pursued his plan no further, but this opposition did not evaporate. When at last Gipps had overcome the emancipist obstacle, and notwithstanding the A.P.A.'s official approval of incorporation, Wentworth and some wealthy ex-convict associates led the attack on the Act as a tax measure. Having failed, they pressed for a very high franchise - even £100 was suggested! The top echelon of the 'Australian' party was far from egalitarian.

The first municipal elections, held late in 1842 on a £25 franchise, were hard-fought, and the

42 SMH 27/8/35.
43 This story is told in detail in ML MS A2877.
results fell into a definite pattern. The urban upper classes - represented by Charles Nicholson, Alexander Macleay, Robert Campbell II, F.L. Wallace - fared very badly. Gipps rather acidly described the victors' occupations: seven merchants, three butchers, two solicitors, two publicans, two tanners, two builders, a miller, draper, cabinetmaker, tailor, druggist - and one 'esquire'. No councillor was an ex-convict, but around half were natives, and several of these the sons of ex-convicts.

This feature of the Council's composition was maintained if not strengthened throughout the decade. It dominated the appointment of mayors, until 1849 elected from and by the councillors themselves. First office-holder was John Hosking, whose selection the Herald deplored as rank "Australianism". Himself the son of a Methodist pioneer, Hosking was married to the

44 Col Ob 5/11/42; AC 3/11/42.
45 HRA XXII : 376-77.
46 Unfortunately the material has not been found to admit a more detailed conclusion. General information appears in C.H. Bertie, The Early History of the Sydney Municipal Council, Sydney 1911.
47 14/11/42.
daughter of Samuel Terry (died 1838), the most blatant­ly successful of all ex-convict capitalists. He was succeeded by J.R. Wilshire, whose free immigrant father had established a tannery in Sydney forty years before. George Allen (1844-45), a solicitor and later a nominee legislative councillor, was an apparently unconventional choice, but he had connections with Sydney College, lived in Sydney from boyhood and was the step-son of a convict. Henry Macdermott another immigrant who became mayor, has several paragraphs to himself in the next section of this chapter. Thomas Broughton, the next incumbent, was the offspring of a Hawkesbury farmer, probably settled by Macquarie. Rev. John McGarvie noted that emancipist feeling permeated this election: sixteen ex-prisoners or ex-prisoners' sons voted for Broughton. Thomas Josephson (1847-48) was the only mayor elected before 1851 who had not sat in the first Council: he and his two successors, Edward Flood and George Hill, were all natives. Flood's father was certainly a convict, the others' probably.

The rejection of 'aristocratic' candidates in 1842 set an anti-conservative tradition in the Corporation's affairs which never quite evaporated. Wilshire as well as Macdermott will appear in our next section, while several further councillors also showed sympathy for orthodox radicalism. Except in once petitioning the legislature to reduce the municipal franchise to £10, the Council pursued no policy particularly helpful to the working man or expressed any ideological position, yet the most respectable and established members of society regarded it with definite misgivings. This was best demonstrated in June 1844, when a public meeting discussed the 'insecurity of life and property in Sydney'. It was dominated by the brightest lights in the Legislative Council who painted a very grim picture indeed. Their motive was almost certainly to discredit the Corporation, and frustrate its wish to manage the metropolitan police. Later in the year, a select committee of the legislature investigated

49 Gdn 22/6/44.
50 SMH 10/6/44; Bertie: 44 seq.
51 Cf HRA XXIV: 83-84.
the same subject and presented a highly-coloured report. Again, when a government measure reduced the municipal franchise to £20, the legislature added the proviso that voters adduce documentary evidence of having paid rent for the past six months. Wentworth's prominence in these manoeuvres again showed that the 'Australian' party was no monolithic unit, but stressed that some men of property deeply suspected the Corporation.

Year by year, the reputation of the City Council steadily declined. At length (1849), the legislature appointed a committee, Robert Lowe in the chair, to investigate its old adversary. Many witnesses averred that councillors had ruthlessly used the position to improve their own property at public expense: up to £700 was spent on securing a seat. Particularly interesting evidence was given by Henry Hollinshed, who had sat in the Council in its first year, and shown himself a doctrinaire radical by arguing that

52 Insecurity in Sydney Committee, LC 23/8/44.
53 8 Vic no 14.
54 City Corporation Committee, LC 2/8/49. See esp evidence of G. Wright, and R. Driver.
mayor and aldermen should not wear distinguishing robes of office. Hollinshed told the committee that on Council "the class of convicts and their families always united against the class of emigrants"; the consequence was to revivify these old animosities. Somewhat illogically for one of his political beliefs, he traced the Corporation's failure to the defeat of respectable men in 1842. Natives had headed the polls—and Hollinshed clearly saw a direct antithesis between respectability and native birth. He believed too that some councillors had sought election chiefly to gratify their wives' ambition to attend a Queen's Birthday Ball at Government House.

Lowe composed a blistering report. The Corporation, he said, was hampered by cumbersome machinery and inefficient control; the mayor had been overpaid, many...


56 4 seq.

57 11; cf T.H. Huxley, Diary of the voyage of H.M.S. Rattlesnake, ed. J. Huxley, London 1935: 273 (the appearance of aldermen's wives at this function acidly commented on by Henrietta Heathorne, young lady of a respectable merchant's family).
aldermen and councillors were imbued "not with the desire faithfully to discharge the duties of the office, but to raise themselves to a false position in society." The abolition of the Corporation, and its replacement by a paid commission were recommended. Lowe was answered with much anger and some force, and he failed to carry his proposals through the legislature, Wentworth and Deas Thomson leading the opposition. By the Act 14 Vic 41 less sweeping reform was substituted: inter alia both councillors and mayor were henceforth to be elected by mass vote. In the event matters went on much as before, but this legislation provides an appropriate termination for our story. The Council had clearly become the petty, but appropriate medium through which middling-wealthy 'Australians' expressed their sense of unity and possession. The constant re-election of the same men suggests that they enjoyed general sympathy. The calumny they bore might have added a tincture of

58 SMH 16 & 18/8/49, 26/9/49.

martyrdom to their appearance before men of similar parentage.

Since early in 1843 meanwhile, there had been gathering in the legislature a distinct faction, 'Australian' in experience and ideas; "the Party" as it was described by a contemporary, "rooted in early associations, family connections, and local prejudices". Wentworth was at its core, together with G.R. ('Bob') Nichols, James Martin, and Robert Fitzgerald, each of whom merits biographical notice.

Nichols' father, Isaac, was a convict of the early days; uncommon ability soon secured for him fairly important government offices, and he became wealthy enough to send his son to England for a few years education. Nevertheless the latter returned to Sydney to learn the solicitor's profession, and did so very capably. In the later 'thirties he owned the Australian, which continued to preach an intelligent liberalism under the slogan Vox Populi, Vox Dei. A wide range of public affairs attracted Nichols'.

60 PA 14/4/49.

61 Both father and son are noted in the AE.
interest. At the Anniversary Day dinner in 1842, he responded on behalf of the natives, denouncing transportation as a blot on the country and urging his brethren to be prepared for militant action in the cause of self-government. Many left-wing meetings listened to speeches which justified his self-description as a "radical reformer". Meanwhile Nichols had become a leading freemason and, although an unsuccessful nominee for the City Clerkship, was appointed the Corporation's solicitor. He sat on the Parramatta District Council, parading his native birth as a major electoral asset.

From June 1848 the 'Australians' had a useful ally in the newspaper Bell's Life in Sydney, an emancipist-edited journal which now came under the part-ownership of Nichols' brother, Charles. This

62 SMH 28/1/42.
63 SMH 10/9/49 (LC debate).
64 Bertie: 35, 40.
65 Cf Parramatta Chronicle (F3687a): 11/5/44.
66 Bell's Life 10/6/48; regarding the emancipist see A. Gilchrist, John Dunmore Lang, chiefly autobiographical ... documents: 458. This paper, like the short-lived Bell's Life in Australia (ML) was modelled on Bell's Life in London.
journal aimed deliberately at a mass lower-class audience: sport, crime, gossip and politics dominated its columns. The liquor interest always met with sympathy: Fitzroy said the journal was most commonly found in public houses. Insofar as liquor-and-sport invoked a political wind, it certainly blew in the 'Australians' favour. We might quote one passage from Bell's Life, which imparted its characteristic tang. A group of Sydney larrikins express their disgust at one whom they suppose a British prince:

Well, may I lose my wits, 
If Tom Sparks would not lick him into fits, 
Let Britain now shut up about her seed 
If yon's a specimen of her crack breed; 
I wouldn't give a lock of Wentworth's hair, 
Or Bob's small toe-nail, for a thousand pair.

Sparks was a local prize-fighter who had distinguished himself abroad. Few politicians of later years could rank with a folk hero of such eminence.

Nichols won Northumberland Boroughs in 1848 and soon displayed his allegiance to Wentworth. The young Henry Parkes, then at the far left of the colony's

67 HRA XXVI : 169. 
68 3/8/50.
political spectrum, regretted this behaviour from such a radical. "It is to be feared", he wrote, "that a feeling on account of these gentlemen's Australian birth had more force than public principle ..."

James Martin, the son of an Irish (apparently non-convict) publican, was Nichols' protege. He served his solicitor's articles in the latter's office, and worked for him on the *Australian*. That word appeared once more in the title of a work, *The Australian Sketch Book* (1838) which Martin proudly presented as the first by one wholly educated in the colony. Appropriately, Sydney College was his school. Among the *Sketch Book*'s most interesting features were its dedication to Nichols, an expression of faith in Australia's future, and a romanticised account of "the ancient freeholders", settled along the Cumberland Rivers before and during the government - suitably hallowed - of Macquarie. Martin worked on the *Atlas* in the mid-'forties, and his name occasionally appeared in other connections:

69 PA 21/7/49. The ML file is marked for Parkes' contributions.

70 Martin Papers, ML MS. Martin too appears in the AE.

71 F2543 : 72, 104.
as Secretary to the Sydney College Council; or
organiser of a congratulatory dinner to Wentworth.

Defeated at a bye-election early in 1848
Martin stood for Cook-Westmoreland in the general
election of that year. The other candidate was
Alfred Cheeke, Commissioner of the Court of Requests-
that is a Crown employee, and so highly vulnerable to
attack:

Every tax - every imposition - every
exaction - every job - every proposal
to squander the public money - he must
support by his vote.

Martin presented himself, by contrast, as "perfectly
independent"; he also made a false claim to Australian
nativity. His election was secured, but subsequently
declared void because of the alleged fabrication of
his property qualifications. Among his backers were
Michael Gannon, an emancipist who played an active
but largely hidden role in Sydney politics, Robert
Fitzgerald and Samuel Lyons. Their generosity soon

72 SMH 13/1/46.

73 Handbill in Martin Papers. This also makes the
claim to local birth.

74 Evidence of Gannon to Martin's Qualification
Committee, LC 13/6/49; Bell's Life 5/2/48,
triumphed, for Martin had no opponents in the fresh poll.

Fitzgerald was the son of another successful, office-holding convict. He entered the Council after an interesting bye-election for Cumberland County early in 1849, triumphing over Archibald Michie, who campaigned on a straight anti-transportation programme. The Herald vehemently supported Michie; Cowper, Kemp, Charles Campbell, and Lowe sat on his electoral committee. Their opponents? "Many persons of convict origin or connection are supporting Mr Fitzgerald ...", wrote one observer, "caught, I imagine, by some notion that they are bound to stand by their class". "We are charged to vote for Mr Fitzgerald," declared another to his brother natives, "because he is an Australian! This is a bug-bear ... William Charles Wentworth has been our idol for years! But what has he done?" On nomination day Nichols attacked Michie as the type who would leave the colony,

75 SMH 27/3/49 ("A Clergyman").
76 SMH 26/3/49 ("A Native").
77 SMH 23/3/49.
once his fortunes were made. Wentworth himself played on this theme, while Fitzgerald evoked the grand old days of the crusade against arbitrary government. The 'Australians' spoke equivocally of transportation, becoming increasingly reticent of outright support as the campaign went by. Thus Fitzgerald's slamming victory was hardly a pro-transportation vote: its primary message was that 'Australianism' still thrived.

It was evoked at other elections, not always effectively. The election for a Sydney seat in 1850 was an important case in point. The 'Australian' candidate was J.R. Holden - a free migrant, but the 'esquire' on the first Corporation and active in the sporting world. His opponent was J.D. Lang, and from the latter's point of view we shall later notice the campaign more closely. An item of Langite propaganda deserves immediate attention however: a "Programme of Responsible Government (according to Bob Nichols)", which listed a mock cabinet. Wentworth, Fitzgerald, Nichols, Lyons, and their allies all appeared, while

78 Cf PA 14/4/49; Bell's Life 9/3/50 (suggested candidature of H.G. Douglass).
the final entry read "Chief Justice: James Martin"!

The paragraph was less remarkable for satire than for truth. It detailed Wentworth's party and pointed straight to its objective - government of the colony. In Council the 'Australians' did solid work of a mundane quality, Nichols especially helping along many liberal-reformist measures. But their driving passion was to strike off Imperial fetters. One notable expression of this occurred in 1850 when Nichols submitted a series of resolutions - passed with some amendment - insisting that the local government have control of appointments to its service, and that only settled residents should be eligible. The party vigorously attacked the Australian Colonies Government Act, bringing against it all the old animosity to Imperial taxation and control of land, as well as a version of Nichols' patronage scheme.

Yet the 'Australians' simultaneously moved towards alliance with Fitzroy. This might have been

79 The Representative (F5498): 18/7/50.
80 V & P 12 & 16/7/50.
81 Melbourne: 379-80.
the product of a long-range scheme to curry his favour against the coming of responsible government, but there were less hypothetical reasons for mutual sympathy. From early in his term, Fitzroy came under criticism for inviting to Government House persons who lacked proper 'respectability'. The charge was double-headed: evidently both loose women and emancipists had achieved the guest-list. Bell's Life and Fitzgerald's supporters rallied to the Governor's defence on this head. The 'Australians' less than absolute rejection of convictism provided further common ground: their leading figures, again supported by Bell's Life, stood by the Governor during the anti-transportation storms of 1849-50. At the mayoral election of 1850 the same forces combined to support Hill against Allen and William Thurlow, long a reformist in the Corporation. Allegedly, all government employees had

82 8, 9, & 19/6/47; Atlas 14/11/46.

83 Bell's Life 26/12/46; SMH 26/3/49 (election meeting).

84 Cf Gilchrist: 488; Bell's Life 17/8/50; Convict Discipline and Transportation Papers, HC 31/1/50: 31, 34; the same, HC 14/5/51: 169 seq.
instructions to vote for Hill, who easily topped the poll, but was then found guilty of contravening the electoral laws and so had to make way for Thurlow. During 1850 Fitzroy had dismissed the new mayor from the commission of the peace on rather trivial grounds, and now refused to recognise his official position. The peculiar conditions of Sydney politics had welded an alliance between Hill, a lowly 'Australian', and Fitzroy, the sprig of ancient dukedoms.

So the 'Australians' maintained their fight for prestige and power. Wentworth's final disgust with colonial politics is well known, yet in 1851 he still had many moments of power and influence before him. Nichols had already reached high cabinet office when he died quite a young man in 1857: had he lived his ability might just possibly have established a new and positive 'Australian' outlook. Neither as Premier nor Chief Justice did Martin approach this, but so long as he remained in public life, a tradition

85 Bell's Life 7/12/50 (allegation at public meeting re government servants); see also 16/11/50.
86 Empire 11/1/51.
stretching back to the 1790s was maintained. History was against the 'Australians' but they remained tenacious to the end.

**Orthodox Radicalism in N.S.W. Politics**

The gentry, the squatters and many 'Australians' were made radicals by the peculiarity of the local situation. A few individuals supported the cause through intellectual conviction - the poets Charles Harpur and Henry Halloran, who both expressed vaguely socialist ideas; William Clifford, an old soldier of the Napoleonic Wars, who publicly expounded his sympathy for the principles of 1789 and detestation for regimes established after 1815; a group of atheistic Owenites. But these men were isolated. The radicalism with which we have now to deal sprang

---

87 See AE for Harpur, and L.H. Halloran, father of Henry. Their socialist ideas, MM 5/7/48 (notes from Jerry's Plains, almost certainly written by C.H.); **Spectator** 341.

88 Cf his *An Address to Sir John Lewes Pedder*, Launceston 1843.

from, or at least appealed to, the mass of the working class.

Several background features promised to aid this movement. That the assertiveness of gentry, squatters and 'Australians' weakened social rigidity needs no further elaboration, nor does the fraility of many traditionally conservative pillars - church, army, gradations of class, local administration. Above all, labour was scarce, and the labourer consequently enjoyed higher wages, greater freedom and broader opportunity than his old-world counterpart. Even before the end of assignment one land-owner declared his class to be "held in a sort of moral slavery" by their employees. Throughout the upper classes' endless discussions on labour ran the conviction, suggested by the Macarthurss and endorsed by the 1847 Immigration Committee, that in N.S.W. master-servant relationships were unnaturally reversed. Increased political interest among workers was no necessary result of this situation, but when they did

90 SMH 16/10/37 (letter of "Sandy Macalpin").
91 LC 14/9/47 : Report.
speak, it would be with all the more self-confidence and determination. The facility with which colonial fortunes were won encouraged radicals in another way: they commonly adopted the tactic of scorning their wealthy opponents as jumped-up parvenus.

The "moral slavery" mentioned above was imposed by convicts. Men still under sentence were the first in Australia to combine and to strike. Strong among them were qualities of fraternity, anti-authoritarianism, and sensitivity to class injustice. But many felt hostile to 'frees', while others were utterly broken by servitude or threw all their political weight behind 'Australianism'. In simple fact, few of this class appeared among the political leaders of

92 Cf J. Ward : 308. Examples appear in the text.
93 Thomas' major thesis is that convicts set the distinctive form of the labour movement.
94 These points are central to R.B. Ward's argument and well argued by him. See also evidence of O. Bloxsome, Land Grievances Committee, LC 20/8/44 : 31; answers of J.C. Wickham, the same : 44; evidence of W.A. Miles, Renewal of Transportation Committee, LC 31/10/46 : 35 seq; etc.
95 Cf Lady Franklin's diary in New South Wales : 36.
the working class. Instead the typical figure was the free migrant, who imported socio-political ideas derived from British experience. This man was going to demand a high living standard with particular vehemence: self-betterment was his one reason for coming to Australia. All migration literature stressed the country's wealth ("Meat three times a day!!", proclaimed one of Caroline Chisholm's pamphlets); some deliberately prepared the common man to assert himself against the wealthy.

The migrant who failed to 'get on' was likely to direct his resentment against established authority. The Australian colonies were comparatively unattractive in these years of North American boom, and so migration thither was state-encouraged on a unique scale. Official publications avoided gross exaggeration of the colonies' charms, but even the issue of an

96 F4487.

97 Especially that issued by John and Samuel Sidney: F4888-93 inclusive, 5169-70, 5513.

accurate list of wage-rates could be interpreted as a guarantee of such employment being available. This claim against the state could be extended to more general political questions - just as it was by those who claimed self-government as the right of Britons.

One contemporary thus wrote of "The Emigrant":

When a man removes into such new countries, he seems born again into the world - his possibilities have become great .... He learns to speak his opinions boldly upon all matters, and cares not though smooth-faced men call it heresy or treason .... He walks to heaven on his own path, and pays no toll.

These were bold, but not unreasonable generalisations. Simply to endure a hundred-odd days of shipboard life must have increased many migrants' self-confidence. Some would then make their first contact with formal education, and so disembark literally better or better-equipped men. Occasionally unfair treatment of

99 A regular chore of the Land and Emigration Commissioners, cf F3591.

100 Simmonds's Colonial Magazine ..., London (F3903) : IX, 196-97. For relevant discussion see Nadel : 29 seq.

101 Cf Emigrants' Letters, London 1850 (F5351) : 11 seq.
steerage passengers would inflame militancy among them. One traveller to Australia in the early 'forties was struck by the change wrought in his old servant after a few years' colonial residence: "self-possessed and more independent; and he can say Mornin' - the usual Australian salutation, with as much brusquerie as any American." One wonders if "James" was now a less amenable servant: the insubordination of emigrant labourers, and the difficulty of binding them to agreements was bemoaned with particular emphasis.

Working men could seek their improvement along several avenues. Some supported self-help institutions, of which more will be said in later chapters; others joined trade organisations, which had industrial as well as benefit-society aims, and pursued them vigorously. They struck, sought to impose closed-shop rules, helped each other in times of crisis, agitated against the over-employment of apprentices. Compositors

102 SM 16/8/37 (letter from John Barry passengers); 20/2/40 : ML MS B1187.
103 J. Hood, Australia and The East : 146.
defended both their right to combine and a claim for higher wages by reference to British conditions; the handloom weavers of Sydney opposed mechanisation; building workers agitated for a basic wage. Obviously the unions merit an important place in the full history of Australian labour, but their work has been so well treated by other historians that only incidental mention is here necessary.

The story of working class political action is well introduced by a petition addressed to the Colonial Office late in 1835 by a number of recent migrants. They protested that conditions were much inferior to those promised. The government should therefore establish "thriving farms and neat Cottages" on "our fertile plains", and encourage general diversification of the economy, including local manufactures.

106 PA 22/6/50 (correspondence).
107 SMH 2/9/46 (letter of "Screwdriver").
108 Hume; Thomas; Crowley.
109 HRA XVIII: 516 seq, esp 525.
One would like to know how many of the signatories were members of the Patriotic Association, which early had a distinct left wing, led by Richard Hipkiss, an old Birmingham Political Union man. This faction achieved little, but by 1840 the political force of the rapidly-swelling free migrants was so strong as to be decisive in swinging popular opinion against the invidious census clauses. Such at least was the opinion of W.A. Duncan, himself active in this agitation and a warm admirer of the ability and independence of the new-comers.

In the same year Duncan and the trade unions protested against the more stringent clauses of the current Masters and Servants Bill, which was subsequently modified. A few months later radicals maintained that the anti-dismemberment agitation sprang only from the greed of wealthy men, seeking

110 Thomas: 61 seq; Australian 13/10/35.

111 ML MS A2877. The AC, of which Duncan was then editor, fully reported these crises of 1840.

112 SMH 28/9/40 (meeting); 1/10/40 (LC debate).
a monopoly of the soil. The workers saw a further threat to their living standards in the legislature's plan, broached late in 1841, to float an immigration loan. In mid-'42 a proletarian deputation helped persuade Gipps to take the initiative in reducing the municipal franchise to £25, £15 less than first proposed.

Very prominent in these campaigns was Henry Macdermott, the mayor of 1845-46. A protestant Irishman and former schoolteacher, he arrived in Australia as a senior non-commissioned officer and on retirement became a prosperous liquor merchant. Macdermott helped launch the A.P.A. and opposed Bourke's incorporation scheme; lamented the end of assignment and in the sharp recession of 1839

113 SMH 8/1/41, 6/2/41 (report of meetings); FP 9 & 13/1/41; G.H. Nadel, *Mid-Nineteenth Century Political Thought in Australia*: 28 seq.
114 AC 23/12/41.
115 AC 7/7/42 (meeting); SMH 7/7/42 (LC debate).
116 SM 13/6/35.
117 SMH 27/8/35.
118 SMH 11/2/39.
fought any discrimination against ex-convicts in the allocation of relief. Duncan, no lenient judge, admired him considerably. Macdermott cultivated many groups - he joined the freemasons, organised an Australia Day dinner, participated in Catholic secular affairs. His advocacy of the underdog's view was probably sincere, but lacked any deep philosophy. In 1842 he wrote that his inspiration was "a desire that the squirearchy of New South Wales should make no ridiculous comparison between themselves and the landed proprietors of England", and determination that Australian workers should enjoy the living standards of their British counterparts. Macdermott scorned any suggestion that he, a veteran soldier, could be rebellious. In fact, he was neither rebel nor fighter for the reconstitution of ancient manners in N.S.W. He represented a new

119 Thomas: 65.
120 AC 28/9/41.
121 SMH 28/1/43.
122 Chapter V.
123 FP 8/3/42 (letter).
force in politics, bringing into play an umbrella party of divergent groups united in vague antagonism to the 'Establishment'. Hence Macarthur's forcing his exclusion from the 1842 Petition Committee; a stand with which, so Duncan alleged, Wentworth and Bland privately sympathised.

Despite this setback Macdermott remained an important figure. From the outset he was a strong force on the Corporation. His candidature for the city in the first legislative elections was suggested, but abandoned in favour of support for Captain M.C. O'Connell, son of the officer commanding the local forces, grandson of William Bligh, native of N.S.W., kinsman and admirer of Ireland's 'Great Liberator'. Macdermott also formed a vague alliance with another candidate, Robert Cooper, an ex-convict distiller who was particularly likely to appeal to working-class 'Australians'. It was at a meeting called by Cooper that Macdermott denied the prevalence of any real distress at this time (May 1843):

---

124 AC 1/3/42 seq.
125 Col Ob 10/5/43, See also Col Ob 3/5/43 (accusation against Cooper); Australian 12/5/43 (denial from Macdermott of any plan to prolong run).
A few who intended to monopolise the country to themselves ... found that they had mis-calculated .... The poor were becoming rich, while the monopolists were becoming poor, and that was all - and the sooner the revolution was completed the better.

This speech prompted the accusation that Macdermott wanted to prolong a current 'run' on the Savings Bank, the origin of which some rumours attributed to Cooper. Had the two concoted a plan inspired by Francis Place's scheme to organise a 'run' during the Reform campaign of 1832?

Consistently devoted to the peasant ideal, Macdermott refused to join in the pastoralists' outcry of April '44. Two months later his name figured prominently at the meeting which discussed the security of Sydney - in fact the convenors deliberately aimed their heaviest fire at Macdermott. Soon after came a renowned dispute with Robert Lowe, who impugned our subject's character following his alleged blackballing from the Australian Library. Macdermott at once challenged for a duel, but Lowe spurned this action both as coming from a social inferior and as a breach of

126 SMH 10/4/44.
Council privilege. The legislature readily supported the latter charge, and consequently Macdermott was brought before the courts. Not only did this litigation fail but the issue roused great demonstrations in Macdermott's favour: in the latter months of 1844 he reached a peak of popularity. Even the legislature now recognised him as a representative figure. He appeared before the Committees on Education and the Elective Franchise in 1844, and that on Master-Servant legislation in 1845. He sought a higher representation of Sydney in the Council, and the encouragement of small farmers by giving them the vote, and allowing preferential rates on spirits distilled from local crops.

Then a heavy blow fell: narrow defeat at the

127 A.P. Martin : I, 216 seq; Privileges Committee, LC 7/12/44.

128 SMH 2/7/44 (police court proceedings), 7/8/44 (meeting); C. Macalister, Old Pioneering Days in the Sunny South : 167.

129 LC 28/8/44. See especially his evidence : 60-61.

130 LC 27/9/44. See especially his evidence : 5, 20 seq.

131 LC 5/9/45.
mayoral election of November 1844. A year later Macdermott won this honour, and the populace applauded, but the tempo of political life had slowed down very far. Only in being one of the few public figures to applaud Gipps at his farewell did the mayor hint at important political facts. With a backing of "seventeen hundred unwashed" he then demonstrated the latent sympathy between executive and the masses vis-a-vis the economically powerful classes. Had Macdermott been a greater man, he might have created an open and effective alliance from this situation. But the obstacles were great, and when Macdermott died soon after concluding his term as mayor, he left behind little impress.

One of the difficulties in the way was suggested by a peculiar remark in Duncan's account of these years. Having described the struggles of 1840 he went on:

---

132 SMH 11/11/44 (City Council).
133 SMH 11/11/45.
134 Atlas 11/7/46.
135 Notes of a Ten Years' Residence in New South Wales, Hogg's Instructor: V, 147.
This was about to be succeeded by a violent strife between the elements of aristocracy and democracy, when the monetary crash of 1843-4 interfered, and went far to heal all political distinctions.

Superficially this was nonsense: like most depressions, this one encouraged militant radicalism. But Duncan might have meant that this sharpening of class consciousness irreparably split Macdermott's chance of comprehending in one faction a variety of dissidents, from left-wing 'Australians' to immigrant Chartists. From 1843 on there had developed a distinct working class political movement, fated to suffer ups and downs but gradually strengthening overall. This we have now to consider.

The workers responded to the depression in three major ways. First, they attacked cheap labour. Particularly obnoxious were the employment of convicts in positions that free men would be able and anxious to fill, and the pastoralists' renewed plans for introducing coolies. By petitioning that these projects were "unjust to those immigrants, who have been induced to leave their Native Country to sojourn in this distant land", 1,129 signatories demonstrated

136 HRA XXII : 594 seq.
that the 'immigrant claim' had lost no potency since 1835. It played a still larger part in the second line of offence: that the government had a positive duty to find employment for men whom it had brought to the colony. To this end, so the argument ran, public works should be launched, and full wages paid. Thirdly, the workers sustained the traditional cry for a yeomanry.

In August 1843 this feeling crystallised, and the Mutual Protection Association arose. "Its political principles," declared one manifesto, "are those of Constitutional Radicalism, or in other words, those of pure and rational liberty, based on the indefeasible rights of man, and regulated by just views of social expediency and sound policy." Any

137 SMH 3/1/43 (agitation against convicts on street construction works); 11/1/43 ('no coolies' an election issue); 2, 10, & 28/2/43 (compositors' agitation against convicts); WR 12/8/43 (mass meeting expressing general arguments); 28/10/43 (similar); 25/5/44 (meeting against government employment of convicts); Gdn 24/8/44 ('yeoman' argument at meeting); V & P 1844, 19/6, 24/7, 15/8, 21/8, 10/10, 27/11 (petitions on various points).

138 Studied at some length by Hume; Thomas; Nadel, Political Thought.

139 Gdn 16/3/44.
craven subserviency to "party spirit" or "democratic feeling" was repudiated: the Association sought only to check the blatant greed of the pseudo-aristocrats. More specific aims included the encouragement of colonial manufactures and the return of sound men to the Corporation and legislature. Membership reached 500; activity continued for over a year. The Association's newspaper, The Guardian, maintained consistent high quality. The first few issues were edited by James McEachern, both before and after this episode a staunch upholder of Australian radicalism; the rest, by Benjamin Sutherland, by trade a cabinet-maker and moving spirit behind the M.P.A. Members of the Association met regularly to thrash out their problems. It ran an employment agency and organised mass expressions of the attitudes already mentioned. One meeting

140  Gdn 20/4/44.
141  Gdn 17/8/44.
142  F3834.
143  Nadel, *Political Thought* : 34 seq.
144  These activities were all regularly reported in the Gdn.
protested against all further immigration of labourers, whatever their background.

In both 1843 and 1844 committees of the legislature enquired into the plight of "distressed labourers". The direct incentive in the former year came from the presentation of a petition, organised by the M.P.A. and detailing a sorry state of unemployment and poverty. The 'immigrant claim' rang out:

Your Petitioners had hoped better things would have fallen to their lot, recollecting the many fair promises and flattering hopes that were held out to many of them, as inducements to leave their native land, and immigrate to this Colony ...

The signatories objected to Gipps' niggard provision of public works, and to the upper classes' attitude that the unemployed should go into the interior to look for work. They wanted full employment, on full wages, in Sydney. Various witnesses amplified these themes, Benjamin Sutherland at their head. J.D. Lang, in the chair, was sympathetic, although most committee

---

145 SMH 7 & 8/2/44.

146 Printed in facsimile as frontispiece to the Report, LC 24/11/43.
members suspected the M.P.A. as an illegitimate combination seeking exorbitant wages and political power.

The committee rejected the claim to full, state-subsidised employment, but did suggest some positive action by the government - increase of public works, a special subsidy to the Benevolent Society, provision of funds to move up-country those willing to go. Sutherland also appeared before the Immigration Committee of 1843, taking the opportunity to repeat a demand for the protection of locally-made furniture from American competition. The 1844 "distressed labourers" Committee followed, if rather weakly, the same course as the previous year's. Meanwhile the government had created employment to ease the sharpest poverty and adopted the up-country work proposal, while the Immigration Board acted as

147 LC 5/12/43 : 17; cf SMH 10/2/43 (letter of "B.S.").
148 LC 19/9/44.
149 HRA XXII : 67; XXIII : 86, 212, 248.
150 See below.
an outdoor relief centre. Deas Thomson even said in Council that "as the people had been brought here ... it was the duty of the Government to rescue them from destitution". The workers' voice had sounded to some effect.

Superficially the Association's major victory was in its association with the City Council. Six members of the second Corporation actually belonged to the M.P.A., while others were endorsed as sound men. The Guardian sympathised with the lesser body against the legislature during the troubles of mid-'44, supported its wish for a £10 franchise, and abused the six-months' rent limitation. Wentworth hereupon rebuked the Association's presumption in summoning city councillors to give an account of

151 WR 26/10/44 (classified advertisement from F.I.S. Merewether).
152 WR 17/8/44 (LC debate).
153 Gdn 17/8/44.
154 15/6/44.
155 22/6/44.
156 14/9/44.
their actions, while Bland spoke darkly of "pestilent demagogue influence". This connection between M.P.A. and Corporation warns against any absolute separation of 'Australianism' and the new left; on the other hand, Hollinshed's deliberate efforts to unite migrant and ex-convict councillors came to nothing.

As soon as economic pressures lifted, the Association collapsed. This end was hastened by internal quarrels, sometimes reflecting important divisions of opinion - especially whether or not to support Gipps against the squatters. This in turn reflected doubt as to the relative priority of winning self-government or pulling down the colonial aristocracy. Meanwhile Macdermott and even Wentworth continued to draw off segments of radical feeling. There is simply not the evidence to show which particular men chose which particular standpoint, but undoubtedly the colony had not yet reached a stage where one organisation could enjoy permanent strength and stability. The Association

157 SMH 26/9/44 (LC debate).
158 His Evidence, City Corporation Committee, LC 2/8/49 : 4 seq.
159 Cf Hume : 149-50.
explained its weakness by reference to "the varied and individualized nature of employment in this city", "reluctance on the part of the people to associate", and "the apathy which has grown up amongst the humbler classes in the colony, out of the protracted political subserviency into which they have been placed."

From 1845-47 only a few transient journals kept radical ideas alive. Outstanding among these was The Star and Working Man's Guardian, which professed to illuminate the way towards "an ultimate revolution in the whole system of political economy". The editor was always sensitive to class legislation, and became increasingly bitter against the selfishness of wealthy men. "Vampire capitalists" always combined together, he wrote in mid-1845; workers must do likewise, and use their power to wring concessions from whichever of the parties in the legislature - executive and

160  Gdn 17/8/44.

161  F3914. The Parramatta Chronicle carried the same editorials as the Star. Other papers to put more or less radical viewpoints at this time were The Age (2/45 to 2/48; ML) and The Citizen (F4253).

162  2/3/44.
opposition - finally sought their aid. The Star
had the temerity to hit out at the "respectability"
so dear to the age; supported a £10 franchise; and
urged the government to exploit sugar, flax, minerals,
and such products. The sole mass movement in these
years answered the threat of renewed transportation.
Late in 1846 6,600 persons petitioned the Crown on
this subject, reviving all the traditional arguments
against cheap labour. They stressed the unhappy posi-
tion of those migrants who had left Britain only
because "the Stain, which this colony had previously
been labouring under, was gradually being removed".

The year 1848 glorified Australian, as well
as European democracy. From mid-July the leading
journals carried an advertisement advocating the
return of Robert Lowe for Sydney in the forthcoming
general election. The signatories, on behalf of a
committee, were J.R. Wilshire, the second mayor;

163 10 & 24/5/45.
164 4/10/45.
165 10/5/45.
166 1/3/45.
167 HRA XXV : 348 seq, esp 349.
J.K. Heydon, an ex-convict, Catholic, tradesman; and Henry Parkes, making his political debut. Lowe's appeal to working class radicals was manifold: he had brilliantly opposed the squatters' land monopoly, Boyd's importation of Pacific islanders, and convict transportation. Parkes, writing in long retrospect, stressed this last factor and the near-universal hostility of free migrants to any resumption. Himself the incarnation of migrant assertiveness, Parkes made clear that thence Lowe gathered strongest support. Very likely a direct connection lay between the renaissance of political interest and the increased tempo of free migration at this time. This hypothesis dissolves the apparent paradox of Macdermott's old enemy becoming the standard-bearer of the left: Lowe's staunch antagonism to all 'Australian' associations would be no handicap in the newcomers' eyes. Yet some continuity persisted for Parkes had been the intimate of Macdermott's ally, W.A. Duncan, and years afterwards

168 Fifty Years in the Making of Australian History: 10.

169 In this connection see his An Emigrant's Home Letters, Sydney 1896.
was to revere E.S. Hall as his first mentor in colonial politics.

Lowe's official propaganda stressed his devotion to the great liberal principles - general education, government economy, wider franchise, antipathy to corrupt electoral practices. Above all, he proclaimed his freedom from all factional bias: in one sense the vital significance of this campaign was that an eminent spokesman of high British liberalism recognised the working class as the guardians of general liberty and the public good. But Lowe was the man who in the 'sixties bitterly attacked the extension of the franchise to the British working class, forecasting that it would lead to the tyranny of the mob. Perhaps this conviction derived from his experiences of the late '48 when he refused to support a working-class demand for the expansion of public works to combat unemployment, and was therefore abused at a mass meeting, speakers at which

170  *Fifty Years*: 8; AE for Hall.

171  SMH 1/8/48; cf The Elector (F4755a) 27/7/48, article on Robert Lowe (by himself, according to annotation on ML copy).
asserted that "their" member should do as they wished. Here was precisely the factional greed which classical liberalism detested.

Such considerations did not appear very important at the time. Lowe's victory - he finished behind Wentworth but ahead of Bland and John Lamb - carried his supporters to the point of ecstasy. "That was a day when public virtue sprung up", wrote Henry Parkes a few months later. "That was the birthday of Australian Democracy." Before 1848 closed, Australian radicalism made two further notable advances.

On December 2nd appeared the first issue of the People's Advocate, for six years to advocate Chartist-type radicalism under a motto from Lamartine:

Political economy has hitherto occupied itself about the production of wealth. It must now occupy itself about the distribution of wealth, so that the labourer may no longer be left without his fair share of the produce.

Editor of the Advocate was E.J. Hawksley, formerly a Catholic schoolteacher and publicist; the man who

172 SMH 22/12/48.

173 The significance of the election is discussed further in the final chapter.

174 PA 10/2/49 (Recognition of Party).
took James Macarthur up on the issue of natural rights. Hawksley accepted Locke's theory of civil government, and so argued that the people had a right to rebel against a tyrannous government - power lay where they determined. He openly proclaimed the role of 'party' action in politics, albeit with a suggestion that universal suffrage might remove its necessity. The Advocate frequently criticised the 'Australians' - indeed from its columns have we learnt much of their inner history. "Even Sparta had its unworthy sons", remarked one editorial, while W.C. Wentworth was dubbed "the infamous Australian". In his constant efforts to incite the workers to action, Hawksley became confused in a most interesting way. While rejecting the idea that colonial labourers had no substantial grievances, he also maintained that simply because the common man was more affluent in Australia his claim to citizenship had greater weight. Outside the narrower field of politics, the Advocate supported voluntaryism in

175 28/4/49.
176 14/4/49.
177 24 (The Cumberland Election) & 31/3/49.
178 6/1/49, 10/2/49.
religion, extolled the power of education, and kept a sharp eye on public administration. Hawksley wrote the vast bulk of editorials, but for the first twelve months or so received frequent assistance from Henry Parkes.

The last radical achievement of 1848 was the establishment of a "Constitutional Association". This political union aimed at franchise extension, re-distribution of electorates on a population basis, greater responsibility of government, and a land policy designed to encourage agriculture. The ideal of uniting all classes received due homage, but anti-pathy to the colony's "Lordly Landed Interest" played a more immediate part in the Association's philosophy. Hawksley, Parkes, Hipkiss, Sutherland and Heydon were notable members. The Association's great triumph was to organise the massive anti-transportation outbursts of June, 1849. The ward meetings of "citizens", the mass petitions, and the display of physical force which

179 23/3/50.

180 PA 23/12/48, passim; for regular reports of meetings, etc.

181 PA May-June '49.
marked this phase of the movement largely sprang from Parkes and his associates. The many commentators who attributed the demonstrations to political ambition and demagoguery were not altogether wrong. Even E.S. Hall wrote to the Colonial Office apropos of "the turbulent spirit, which now governs the immigrant mob of Sydney", and depicted Lowe as a Ledru-Rollin leading a gang of Chartist desperadoes.

Meanwhile the Association had agitated for the reduction of the legislative franchise to £10, and supported Michie in his election against Fitzgerald. Later in 1849 it urged that the Corporation's manifest weaknesses could and should be solved by reducing the municipal franchise at least to the British level. Its final fling was to campaign for J.R. Wilshire

182 Letter of 8/7/49 : CO 201/424; cf anonymous letter, the same : 4. Bell's Life pursued the same line of argument, as did Grey, Fitzroy, and many other colonists, for whom see esp Convict Discipline and Transportation Papers, HC 14/5/51 : 172.

183 PA 27/1/49 (public meeting).

184 PA 3/4/49.

185 SMH 6 & 7/9/49 (note the counter propaganda of "A Real Committee of Citizens").
when Lowe's resignation entailed another election in Sydney. William Bland won a very dull election, only made notable by the speech of a third candidate, Adam Bogue, at the declaration. Wilshire's defeat, according to Bogue, revealed that no gentleman, however competent and eligible to become a candidate, who had been put forward by a secret society, whose best exertions were put forward for the propagation of communist and socialist principles could hope to succeed.

Parkes stood up, and denied that he was a communist.

The drabness of this poll contrasted sharply with the excitement prompted by Bland's resignation in mid-'50. Again Parkes organised the radicals, whose new champion was J.D. Lang - veteran anti-emancipist, sympathiser with the underdog throughout his earlier term on Council (1843-47), and firm admirer of American democracy. Lang had just returned from a long sojourn in Britain, during which he had clashed with the Colonial Office on many issues. The immediate prelude to his candidature was the presentation of two lectures.
in Sydney on "The Coming Event" - namely, the complete break of the Australian colonies from Britain, and the establishment of a new era of social justice. The land monopoly, transportation, imperial patronage - all would disappear; the spirit of nationalism would achieve the same glorious effects in the Antipodes as in Europe. Parkes, Michie, Wilshire and many others helped Lang launch the Australian League which aimed to realise these aims. The League itself never became important, but this propaganda, spiced with a class-consciousness which made some sense of renewed charges of communistic extremism, carried Lang to narrow but glorious victory over Holden. Orthodox radicalism had vanquished 'Australianism' in open combat. Yet among Lang's warmest congratulators was M.W. Henry, an ex-convict who had spent fifty years in the colony. His letter symbolised Lang's achievement in bringing together, and bringing to triumph, the strongest elements of Australian democracy. The radicals, probably through stressing anti-transportation, also won to their side

188 Letter of 4/11/50 : ML MS A2226. It is just possible that Henry was not an ex-convict.
a strong mercantile interest, which had earlier considered nominating Robert Campbell II.

As two years earlier, electoral victory set off a salvo of energetic actions. Parkes inspired further anti-transportation demonstrations in August-September 1850, while other Langites warmly defended their hero against the legislature's criticism of his immigration project at Moreton Bay. Hawksley and others were active in the election of city councillors at the end of the year, while Parkes advocated the claims of George Allen for mayor.

At the very end of 1850 Parkes launched the Empire newspaper, just before Lang commenced another, far less important journal, The Press. These combined with the Advocate to maintain a heavy fire on their opponents - Hill and Fitzroy, Wentworth, the 'Australians' generally. In answer to Wentworth's taunts, the Empire even began a series of "Songs of the

189 SMH 27 & 28/8/50.
190 PA 19/10/50 seq.
191 SMH 3/12/50 (requisition).
192 See esp Empire 11/1/51.
Early in the New Year Hawksley proudly announced the formation of the "New South Wales Political Association", very similar to the Constitutional Association save in lacking Parkes' support. The new organisation aided Lang's victory in heading the first poll for Sydney under the new £10 franchise. Meanwhile the far greater fact of the gold discoveries had burst upon the colony. Radicals at once saw the discovery as a decisive help to their cause, just when the re-distribution of seats had threatened to secure conservative dominance. "The moment has arrived" exulted Hawksley, "for a great moral revolution". His confidence was not misplaced, but the past fifteen years had seen a far more profound change in the nature of Australian radicalism than did the immediate future.

A few footnotes should be added to round out this history. 'Did nothing happen outside Sydney?' someone might ask. Indeed, very little. Transportation schemes alone provoked much reaction in

193 30/4/51.
194 PA 15/2/51 seq.
195 PA 24/5/51; cf The Press 11/6/51.
Melbourne, although the workers' discussion on how to celebrate Port Phillip's separation was unusually interesting: one party wanted a new self-help institution, another the total abolition of assisted migration. For a few weeks Geelong boasted a paltry working-class newspaper. At Brisbane a Mr Langridge, particularly skilled in putting the 'immigrant claim', tried to assert himself as a radical spokesman, but with little success; he and his fellows were very anxious lest the northern district be separated from N.S.W., and left to the mercies of the labour-hungry squatters.

The tremendous hostility to up-country work, emphasised in the previous chapter, faithfully expressed the immigrant's psychology. His search for a higher living standard led inevitably to the urban fleshpots.

---


197 28/9/50.

198 F5231.

199 MBC 10/8/50; 17/11/49.

200 MBC 9/11/50; 21/12/50.
The strength of this disposition was pointedly demonstrated when the government could spend only £120 of the £1,000 set aside in 1843-44 for taking unemployed up-country, whereas coincident expansion of public works pulled many workers back to the metropolis.

This concentration in Sydney had the remarkable effect of making British radical ideas more or less appropriate to a very different economic environment: the Australian bush did not serve as a safety valve for democratic notions because, unable to become yeomen, most democrats refused to go there. By contrast many workers were avid to seek out good employment. The restless habits of the lower orders frequently evoked complaints from employers, and reproof from other observers. They went to China, to Chile, above all to the goldfields of California; altogether 2,434 persons left Sydney for the last destination in

201 Committee on Distressed Labourers, LC 19/9/44: Report, and evidence of F.L.S. Mereweather: 89.

fifteen months from January 1849. Even those working men who did go to the bush found no reason to forget democratic ideas but rather an environment which in its own peculiar way added strength to the principles of equality and unity.

Solidarity could be strong even without formal organisation. An employment agent once remarked that men often refused to take wages below a certain level "through a fear of making themselves disagreeable to fellow workers". Unionists who did so would be "marked men", but the feeling prevailed among all grades and conditions. Similarly, Mrs Chisholm warned against large parties being sent up-country. Before their fellows, men would not accept wages offensive to their pride; isolated, they would take their wives' advice, and submit. On a few occasions

203 AC 19/6/44 (China migration); HRA XXIII : 212 (Chile); Argus 19 & 30/1/48 (working class meeting to discuss migration to California); Paper, LCNSW 5/6/50 (Californian statistics).

204 The work of R.B. Ward makes elaboration unnecessary.

205 G.F. Johnson to Immigration Committee, LC 5/12/43 : 45 seq.

206 Distressed Labourers' Committee, LC 24/11/43 : 45.
the mob showed feeling in forceful action: it barrack-
ed Mudie, a particularly brutal master, in court; 207
pursued the secretary of the coolies' association
through the streets; stoned Fitzroy. 208 209

In Australia as elsewhere the tightening
intimacy between political representatives and their
supporters was largely the work of the left, and
added most to its power. Richard Windeyer first
broke openly with the old tradition, professing to
vote only as the majority of his constituents desired: 210
the Herald wept, but the electorate applauded. City
Councillor Thomas Smidmore went still further when he
publicly apologised for having mistakenly cast his vote 211
against Macdermott in the 1844 mayoral contest. The
M.P.A.'s connection with the Corporation and the after-
math of Lowe's election also strengthened and illuminated
the trend. Parkes' and Hawksley's advent bespoke a new

207 SMH 28/10/40.
208 Col Ob 18/1/43.
209 SMH 24/8/50 (The Mayor's Ball).
210 Atlas 23/3/45 (Singleton); SMH 23/3/44.
211 SMH 13/11/44.
age in political organisation. In time, the former conceived a fantastic mastery of the art, but Hawksley was more devoted to its philosophy. Once again he stood out as a pioneer of democracy.

**Tasmanian Counterparts**

V.D.L. had many ex-convicts among its citizens; commentators who feared the irreverence of native youth and the "leveling principle" induced by convict behaviour; trade societies which forcefully upheld union principles. In short, many of the ingredients which produced the radicalism of N.S.W. prevailed also in the island. Yet they never formed so potent a mixture, primarily because of the few opportunities for economic advancement open to Tasmanians. No ex-convicts rose to

212 Cf PA 17 & 24/5/51 (efforts to organise a joint committee for the liberal candidates in the forthcoming Sydney election).

213 Cf W. Denison, *Varieties of Vice-Regal Life*: I, 29 (Mrs Nixon's concern at the application of Biblical names to Tasmanian towns).

214 J. Ross/Pedder, 1838(?) : ML MS A2170.

the eminence of Lyons or Terry; very few to that of Nichols' father, or Fitzgerald's. Nor did free migration attain a volume sufficient to build up a strong, persistent 'immigrant claim'. Moreover, Tasmanian history included no figure comparable to Macquarie. The gentry alone could feel that the colony was "theirs by right"; as pointed out in chapter II, the real birth of the colony dated from the 'twenties, with Bigge its midwife. The settlers had amply responded to this situation, taking the initiative in every field. That they did so in politics, not hesitating to adopt a radical stand when necessary, still further constricted the area in which other groups might move.

Consequently only two episodes of real interest appeared in the history of the Tasmanian have-nots. The first centred on the combination of workers against transportation, which in V.D.L. put probation convicts into direct competition on the labour market. The depression of 1844-45 impelled a formal protest to Eardley-Wilmot against the employment of such men, and the organisation of a
Free Labour Union to pursue this campaign. Times improved and the movement fizzled until anti-transpor­
tation feeling revived on a wide front in 1847. In April of that year a proletarian assembly appointed William Jeffrey "as a delegate of the working classes to attend the meeting of the influential gentlemen". Jeffrey went along, and also many of his peers, who loudly expressed their feelings. Fresh life per­
vaded the Labour Union, which strove to establish employer-employee co-operation to reserve the labour market for free men.

The plan did not work too well, but two years later a Free Tradesmen's Association with similar aims began at Launceston. At this time anti-transformation employers were contemplating a boycott on probation labourers; the Association naturally sought to drive this principle home, wanting consumers to discriminate against any person who broke the rule. It urged

216 Cf CT 4/2/48; HTC 19/10/50.
217 HTC 28/4/47.
218 HTC 8/5/47.
219 Hartwell : 92.
moreover that such ostracism should be extended to anyone who encouraged "the importation of British goods that can be manufactured in the colony". This was pipe-dreaming, but some employers did cooperate with the labour boycott, and the Launceston group thus became a model for Hobartians. The Labour Union rose again, under the title "Hobart Town Trades Union". It planned to blacklist employers of probation labour, to start an employment agency, and to practise "a system of passive resistance" against continued transportation. Jeffrey and two other operatives, John Williams (Hobart) and John Denney (Launceston) served on the "influential" anti-transportation committees from August-September 1850. At this time too Williams exhorted his comrades to interest themselves in politics, and so ensure the return of sound men to the first elected legislature. Two leading anti-transportation candidates, Robert

---

220 LE 18/7/49; also 20/6/49, 22/12/49; chapter IX.
221 HTC 18/9/50 (Jeffrey's speech at meeting).
222 HTC 25/9/50, 19/10/50.
223 HTC 21/9/50; LE 31/8/50.
224 HTC 19/10/50.
Pitcairn and T.D. Chapman, were said to have received the Union's official blessing. Jeffrey certainly used his influence to help the latter, who ultimately topped the Hobart poll. Mutual antipathy to convicts had effectively dampened class conflict.

From 1846 the unionists had received some support from the newspaper, Britannia and Trades Advocate, edited by John Morgan, whom we shall meet in various connections. He reported the Union's proceedings in some detail, called for the establishment of a Reform Association, and warned Denison that his mis-government was making democrats out of loyal Tasmanians. Otherwise the Britannia argued from silence that 'trades advocacy' had little scope or popular appeal.

By contrast, our second episode - the story of the island's 'Australian' counterpart - must be told almost wholly by reference to a journal, The Hobarton

225 Hob Gdn 23/11/50.
226 HTC 13/9/51 (election advertisement).
227 F4242.
228 30/12/47.
229 13/9/49.
Guardian. Founded in May 1847, its editor was William Bailey, an Anglican deacon and pedagogue who had been transported for some financial malpractice. The early issues of the paper fiercely attacked the anti-transportation campaign, making the point that cessation would damage the economy to the injury of the free worker and everyone else. Bailey also deplored the inhumanity of those who would cast out the convict; and scorned "the silly toys of self-government", with which so many colonists amused themselves. The colony had most to hope from "an enlightened Executive, patriotically guided, and salutarily controlled, by public sentiment, conveyed through an independent, unhired press". How inverted could Tasmanian politics become! In order to challenge the dominant class, this theorist of Tasmania's 'new men' must align himself with the most

230 F4527. All future references in this chapter are to the Hob Gdn, unless otherwise noted.
231 E.M. Miller, Pressmen and Governors: 285-86.
232 22/5/47.
233 24/7/47, 18/8/47, 23/10/47.
234 21/8/47.
conservative of all Governors. A tortuous path, and one which the Hobarton Guardian's proprietor, John Moore, hesitated to follow. He quarrelled with Bailey, and the journal suddenly switched from 'Australian' to 'orthodox' radicalism. Denison and various aspects of the public administration came under sharp criticism; the local magistrates' court was constantly accused of bias against the poor; the People's Advocate welcomed as a kindred spirit. Early in 1849 the Hobarton Guardian even supported the anti-transportation cause.

In September of that year however, T.G. Gregson persuaded the legislature to resolve against the employment of ex-convicts as government schoolteachers. At once Bailey attacked this discrimination, and published an address calling upon emancipists vigorously

235 Bailey might have ceased editing the paper for a while, although Miller does not think so.
237 12 & 29/11/48; etc.
238 3/1/49.
239 10 & 21/1/49, 5/5/49.
240 1 & 5/9/49.
to answer this alleged threat of slavery. "And to whom are you thus to submit" demanded the writer, "- by whom are you to be thus swindled and disfranchised - mark it, by men who by your sweat and heart's blood reared princely fortunes." The new year saw the launching of the oddly-styled "Society for the Propagation of the Charities, &c. of the Gospel", which abused the anti-transportationists and lauded Denison. The Society misfired, but reappeared in October as the Prisoners' Protection Society, soon renamed The Tasmanian Union. Throughout the Hobarton Guardian warmly supported these moves, and became official organ of the Union. Bailey's name did not appear on the committee of the organisation, but probably he inspired much of its activity.

The Union's basic aim was to save ex-convicts from partial treatment. The granting of hotel licences, appointment to the public service, and election to the magistracy were all cited as areas

241 12/9/49 ("F.T.F.").
242 30/1/50; etc.
243 5/10/50.
244 See the address, 30/10/50.
of likely discrimination. Its official propaganda claimed the lofty purpose of combining "all the hitherto disovered elements of our social system ... into one compact body ... immovable, controlling and irresistible". Bailey's wife applauded:

In moral power proceed - may Heaven your Union bless! And grant your virtuous efforts safe and sure success.

Members were very conscious of the impending elections, but for which the Union might never have existed. So early as June 1850 the Hobarton Guardian urged Hobart's emancipists to support William Carter, a wealthy immigrant merchant prominent in the Union. Later two other leading members appeared as possible candidates - William Watchorn, of similar background to Carter, and Edward Howe, probably an ex-convict. All three had some connection with the rudimentary municipal organisation set up in Hobart in 1846-47; Carter was to become first mayor in 1853 and Watchorn a pioneer alderman.

246 27/11/50, seq.
247 19/6/50.
248 Biographical material on all three is filed in the TSA.
The Union doubtless accepted Bailey's argument that its chief enemy was the Anti-Transportation League - devoted, he said, to creating class feeling and manipulating it to political effect. Positively, the Union advocated free institutions, development of local resources and manufactures, the abolition of differential duties, and improved education. It denied any hankering after transportation, despite Bailey's and Carter's previous attitudes. Opponents of the Union alleged it to be the executive's pawn, and that Denison hoped to strengthen his government with the support of any legislators who might emerge from its ranks. Gregson probably referred to the Union when he told Boyes that he regretted the imminence of self-government now that the convict influence had grown so potent. Morgan and the Trades Union were also among its critics: the comparison with the

249 23/10/50.
250 12/2/51.
251 CT 15/11/50.
252 8/7/50: Boyes' diary.
253 18/12/51.
Empire-Advocate-Lang opposition to the Fitzroy-'Australian'-Bell's Life alliance was very close. Yet at this decisive moment, the Tasmanians failed to rally support outside a very limited circle. Well before election day the Union had passed into oblivion, poisoned by the taint of connection with Denison and transportation. Carter, Howe and Watchorn did not even nominate.

Puny though they were, these movements reveal that throughout eastern Australia both penalism and capitalism - one distinctly local, one inherited from Britain - contributed to social stress. Convictism and its aftermath, democracy, socialism: all appeared to conservatives as fearful and ever-present dangers. Comments to this effect often exaggerated, but did not invent. These elements did exist, and would have somehow to be contained.
The Encouragement of Radicalism and Liberalism

Various references in the previous chapter indicated that early in Australian history the Roman Catholic interest established an association with political radicalism. De Tocqueville believed that the intrinsic nature of Catholic belief conduced to secular democracy; occasionally Australian Catholics appealed to religious principles in order to strengthen a radical point of view. Yet one hesitates to explain the leftward inclination of this group in terms of their theology. All Christian doctrine has shown itself, from place to place and time to time, capable of infinite variety of interpretation when applied to social matters. The national, economic, and juristic background of Australian Catholics was a far more telling cause of their radicalism.

2 E.g. AC 23/9/43 (usury).
The overwhelming majority were of Irish birth or descent. Their old-world memories conduced not only to hatred of English government, but to distrust of all authority. The Herald's punning description of Irish loyalty as "Pat-riot-ism" had a sharp, sound point. Catholic spokesmen could and did evoke old antipathies to bolster up their policies: denigrating the National System of Education as that forced upon Ireland by her foreign rulers; or sneering at laissez faire as a doctrine all very well for England but not, as a necessary consequence, for everyone else. This rejection of English ways probably explained why Catholic spokesmen pioneered the idea of developing Australian national sentiment. The Church paper in Sydney, the Chronicle, easily anticipated Nichols' demand for the reservation of government positions to local men.


4 G.H. Nadel, Australia's Colonial Culture: 208.

5 AC 31/1/44.

6 AC 29/11/43; Souvenir of the Centenary of the Australian Holy Catholic Guild of St Mary and St Joseph, Sydney 1945: 8.

7 23/8/45.
The most obvious demonstration that Ireland's wrongs were not forgotten was the formation, at least in Sydney (1842) and Parramatta, of branches of the Association for Repeal of the Union. "The magic voice which roused the active sympathy of thousands in America, has found its way to the distant shores of Australia," declared the Sydney Repealers, inviting all friends of civil liberty to join their "glorious and constitutional struggle". The fortunes of the movement always attracted lively interest among the Austral Irish. One public meeting protested against the exclusion of Catholic jurors from the state trials of the nationalist leaders in 1844; Daniel O'Connell's release a few months later prompted J.B. Polding, episcopal leader of Australian Catholics from 1834, to make a speech after Sunday evening service which hailed Repeal as a movement "of justice, of morality, of religion, and of God". At this time some enthusiastic

8 SMH 2/9/44.
9 SMH 23/11/42.
10 HRA XXIII : 711-12; see also SMH 27 & 28/11/44.
11 AC 1/1/45; see also SMH 16 & 18/1/45 (celebratory meetings).
Repealers launched a newspaper which advocated both O'Connell's cause and the radical interest in N.S.W. politics. Two more successful journals directed by Irish Catholics - the Freeman's Journal, started late in 1850 by Rev. John McEncroe, a man of vast influence; and the Irish Exile and Freedom's Advocate, the child of Patrick O'Donohoe, one of six Repealers transported to V.D.L. for complicity in the rising of 1848 - deliberately invoked memories of Ireland and the principles of liberty. O'Donohoe and his fellow rebels had a rapturous welcome from the island's Catholic population; like the ever-revered United Irishmen of 1798 they bore human witness to the animosity between Catholicism and English rule.

12 Unseen but see Atlas 21/12/44 (Domestic); Sen 8/1/45.

13 F5357a. A journal of this name was well-known in Ireland.

14 F5400.

15 J.H. Cullen, Young Ireland in Exile, Dublin 1928, and T.J. Kiernan, The Irish Exiles in Australia, Melbourne 1954. One of them, W.S. O'Brien, was a Protestant.

16 The most famous was William Davis, for whom see AC 19/8/43 (obituary).
Australian Catholics were largely of humble social class, as well as largely Irish. Almost certainly a higher proportion of Catholics than any other practising Christians came to Australia as convicts. The Church made no distinction between free and bond either before the communion table, or at quasi-political meetings. Very many of the Church's leading laymen were emancipists. When Judge Burton sneered at this, he was effectively answered by W.G. Ullathorne, Vicar-General of N.S.W. from 1832-41: "to hold men down in degradation whom no law degrades - is this the way to raise them up? Is this mercy?" The background of most Irish-Australians left them relatively unschooled and unskilled, and therefore more likely to engage in proletarian politics.

The third factor shaping Catholic politics was the favour recently bestowed upon the Church by left-liberal philosophy. Thence had come the

17 A.E. Stephen, The Diary of Thomas Callaghan, B.A., RAHSJ: XXXIV, 271; the 'Willis' meetings (see below).
18 A Reply to Judge Burton, Sydney 1840: 94.
19 Cf Immigration Agent's report, LC 21/6/49.
Emancipation of 1829; thence, O'Connell and many others hoped, would come Repeal. In colonial affairs the same influence had made a heavy mark: the appointments of Catholic laymen Roger Therry (Commissioner of the Court of Requests, 1829; Supreme Court Judge at Melbourne, 1845) and J.H. Plunkett (Solicitor-General, 1832; Attorney-General, 1836) could not have happened before Emancipation; nor the appointment of a Governor so sympathetic to the Catholic interest as Bourke; nor above all, the passage of the Church Acts. We shall notice in later chapters that many colonial liberals remained sympathetic to Catholicism, especially in its struggle against Anglican ascendency.

The Catholic influence in politics begins with its support of Richard Bourke. The conservatives' attack on Roger Therry aimed true, for he ranked very high among the Governor's personal friends and political advisers. Both were related to Edmund Burke, and warmly shared his beliefs. Before coming to Australia Therry had edited the speeches of

20 See his Reminiscences of Thirty Years' Residence in New South Wales and Victoria, Sydney 1863.
Canning; his library held the works of Grattan, Huskisson, Romilly and Windham. Another Catholic layman to uphold Bourke's policies was Dr John Lhotsky, an eccentric but able jack-of-all-sciences. In 1835 he argued for the grant of colonial self-government, cessation of anti-emancipist feeling, and resumption of small land grants; in sharp contrast to the Tories' demands for stricter convict discipline, Lhotsky argued that prisoners regarded themselves "as innocent and guiltless victims, merely hunted down by the conventional rules and practices of society." Bishop Polding, too, sympathised with Bourke. He feared and detested the "cold self-calculating Scotch Tory Officials" against whom the Governor had to contend. Nor had the Bishop any sympathy for gentry pretensions. "The convict system

21 WR 18/1/45 (advertisement).

22 An Impartial Observer, Illustrations of the Present State and Future Prospects of the Colony of New South Wales : 67 and passim. See also note under F1979; the British Museum catalogue for Johann Lhotsky; and Col 23/6/36; for Lhotsky's plan to start a newspaper called The Reformer.

23 H.N. Burt, Benedictine Pioneers in Australia : I, 288; see also I, 400.
is creating amongst us the aristocracy of wealth, the worst of all tyrannies", he wrote, welcoming the end of assignment as a blow to the land-owning class.

In 1837 Bourke had left Australia, farewelled by the Catholic clergy with a fulsome address. His memory was not forgotten: Therry organised the erection of the statue which still graces Sydney's domain; and Irishmen were very prominent at its unveiling on April 11th, 1842.

The Chronicle, begun in 1839 under official auspices, held firmly to the leftward course. First editor was W.A. Duncan, the young Scotchman who has already appeared in our narrative. He was a remarkable man - as bibliophile, musicologist, publicist, and liberal thinker. Under his direction the Chronicle became the most forthright critic of the gentry among

26 SMH 12/4/42.
27 See generally ML MSS A2876, A2877, A2879.
the colonial journals. He accused this class of wanting to make Australia "the paradise of the tyrant and the prison of the slave"; its members were no true aristocrats, but "mushroom stockmen" making no contribution to the social good. In their ill-treatment of convicts lay "the grand cause of ... bush-ranging, and of the sympathy by which the bush-rangers are protected and enabled to exist"; in their ill-treatment of emancipists, the impulse to any factional bitterness in that quarter; in their ill-treatment of workers, an attempt to deny the common right to "comfortable independence".

Duncan's detestation of the gentry led him to support the current forms of both 'Australian' and 'orthodox' radicalism. On every major issue - census, corporation exclusion, masters-and-servants Bill, coolie schemes, the plan for an immigration

28 10/9/39.
29 3/3/42.
30 6/6/40.
31 17/3/40.
32 16/1/41.
loan - he effectively presented the underdog's case. This prompted close and friendly alliance with Macdermott, increasing alienation from Wentworth and Bland. The proceedings of the Petition Committee, whence Macdermott had so firmly been excluded, found little favour in the *Chronicle*. Meanwhile Macdermott ardently pursued his courtship of Catholic favour - supporting the St Patrick's Society, for instance, and a presentation to a uniquely popular priest, J.J. Therry. It is very likely indeed that popular demonstrations in Macdermott's favour came from Irish throats.

Polding too was Duncan's personal friend and political ally. The Bishop wrote several leading articles for the early *Chronicle*, faithfully following the editor's prevailing course. Thus in 1839 he regretted Gipps' appointment of P.P. King to the Legislative Council "when he had the opportunity of placing a liberal mind, a Wentworth for instance,

---

33 See esp 7/4/42.
34 1/12/40; 13/7/41.
amid that mass of dull obstructiveness." Polding, with Ullathorne, encouraged Duncan's stand against the invidious census question, thereby stressing the link between the Church and the Australian Patriotic Association. Other articles from the Bishop's pen urged the establishment of self-government: later Polding wrote Duncan that his sole criticism of the 1842 constitution was the franchise being twice too high.

Duncan's radicalism finally lost him his job with the Chronicle. Most of the journal's financial backers opposed Gipps' incorporation Act because of its threat to their pockets. Duncan, by contrast, praised the legislation as a step towards local responsibility. Consequently Wentworth used his influence - it is interesting that it should have been so powerful - to build up feeling against him. This crusade gathered further weight when Duncan

35 22/11/39. The ML has Duncan's own file for this year, and his annotations indicate the authorship of the various editorials.

36 Birt: I, 502-03.

37 The letter is copied out in ML MS A2877.

38 ML MS A2877; AC 7 & 30/6/42.
refused to stomach the Therry-Macarthur-Wentworth alliance of the 1843 election. Francis Murphy, Ullathorne's successor as Vicar-General until 1844 and currently in charge of the diocese during Polding's absence in Europe, accused the Scot of creating dissension among the faithful, and fully supported his deposition from the editorial chair early in 1843. Duncan appealed to Polding on the latter's return some weeks later, and believed that he had the sympathy of both the Bishop and the rank-and-file. But he was not reinstated.

Duncan worked hard for Captain M.C. O'Connell in the 1843 election. That candidate had his association with the great Daniel and a liberal Anglican outlook of the Bourke stamp to recommend him to Catholic voters, who responded in considerable force. Duncan no doubt hoped to spike Wentworth's guns, and believed that O'Connell's politics were close to his own. In fact, the Captain's platform was no more

39 An Appeal from the unjust decision of the Very Rev. Vicar General Murphy to His Grace the Archbishop of Sydney, Sydney 1843.

40 Cf Col 0b 17/6/43.
radical than his great antagonist's or even Roger Therry's, which rested on defence of the Church Act. But this in turn had militance enough to make Therry's victory a triumph for both liberalism and the Church: eight years later he still claimed that his defeat might have encouraged the legislature to overturn multi-establishment. Edward Curr (Melbourne) and Robert Fitzgerald (Cumberland Boroughs) were other candidates who rode the Catholic-liberal alliance; like O'Connell, they were defeated.

Duncan continued an influential, if not an officially-representative, Catholic for in mid-'43 he began an independent journal, the *Weekly Register*. The early issues continued to harass the established upper classes, whose unity vis-à-vis the government drove Duncan to modify his theoretical antipathy to all factional activity in politics:

41 See his speech in *Election for the County of Camden*, Sydney 1843 (F3650).

42 Letter to J. Macarthur, 15/9/51 : ML MS A2930.

43 Cf A. Gilchrist, *John Dunmore Lang, chiefly autobiographical... documents* : 334 seq; Col 0b 12/7/43.

44 W. Walker : *Reminiscences... of a Fifty Years' Residence at Windsor*, Sydney 1890 : 44 seq.

45 WR 5/8/43.
The greatest danger we opine that could befall the Colony, would be this total inattention to the views of parties. Unanimity is a good thing in its way, but let this unanimity prevail in the Council for twelve months, let the people shut their eyes in obedience to the Herald's advice during that period, and when they open them they will, in all probability, find a suit of very well-contrived fetters fitted to their ankles. An assembly without parties cannot be made out of human materials.

As a radical it embarrassed him to say so, remarked Duncan subsequently, but the executive had proved itself more liberal and conscious of the public good than had colonial representatives. Although consistently maintaining this point on the Weekly Register, Duncan did not forsake his erstwhile causes. He warmly supported Macdermott in the privilege dispute with Lowe and browbeat the legislators for refusing to take the opportunity to extend self-government through the District Councils. For this he won the approving notice of James Macarthur.

With that man, once the incarnation of all he

46 21/10/43.
47 20 & 27/7/44.
48 16/9/43.
most disliked, Duncan soon had further common ground—detestation of the squatter interest. The struggle of 1844 appeared to him as "a contest between the public and a few half-ruined monopolists—between justice and injustice, and between morality and vice." Week after week he attacked the squatters on this broad front: Charles Harpur's poem, quoted in chapter III, first appeared in the Weekly Register, and perfectly expressed its editorial policy. Among Harpur's other works at this time was an ode in praise of Duncan: the two were intimate friends.

While attacking first the gentry and then the squatters, Duncan ceaselessly praised the ideal of a closely-settled agricultural community. The most constructive of his editorials on this subject were later reprinted in two pamphlets, On Self-Supporting Agricultural Working Unions and A Practical Treatise on the Culture of the Olive Tree. Another frequent

50 13/4/44.

51 In Harpur/Parkes, 16/8/44: ML MS Ah131. Duncan was the publisher of Harpur's first collection, Thoughts, Sydney 1845.

52 F3818.

53 F3817.
theme of the *Weekly Register* was abuse of W.C. Wentworth, whose leadership of the squatters added further venom to Duncan's longstanding hostility. Again it was Harpur who asked "Is Wentworth a Patriot?" and answered scornfully

However loud he bawl
About his country, 'twere as fit to call
Maize dumpling gold, because forsooth - 'tis yellow.

Obviously Duncan had much in common with the 'new left' of post-depression years. Although never enthusiastic about workmen's combinations, and in later years a critic of democracy, he consistently sympathised with the working class. Once again he contradicted his theoretical presuppositions when arguing that work and decent wages should be extended to the unemployed:

Wages, like everything else, ought, in a sound state of things to be regulated by the supply and the demand. But what we complain of is, that, in this case, we do not enjoy a sound state of things.

Had the *Weekly Register* continued, its pages would probably have contained the wisest commentaries on

---

54 8/2/45 ("An Australian"); see also 1/2/45 (verse), and the "psycho-analysis" quoted in chapter IV.

55 12/8/43.
the radicalism of later years. But at the end of 1845 financial pressure forced Duncan to give up, and accept a post as customs officer at Brisbane.

Meanwhile the Chronicle, edited by McEncroe until November '43 and for the next three years by his nephew Michael D'Arcy, had followed a policy no less radical than Duncan's. These men were less hesitant than their predecessor in casting off the dogmas of laissez faire, which were not only scorned as English-maintained, but even, in their extreme form, described as "fell and satanic". Thus the new Chronicle was uninhibited in its demands for government action on behalf of the working class, whom D'Arcy lauded as "the great producers of everything useful, agreeable, and beautiful". He wanted substantial protection for the corn-grower and, echoing Benjamin Sutherland, for such trades as carpentry. Still more radical were suggestions that the government should interfere in financial

56 19/10/44; see also note 5 above.
57 29/11/43.
58 27 & 30/12/43.
59 6/1/44.
matters by establishing a state bank to issue credit and discount small bills, and by relieving the poor with loans from an official mont-de-piété. Nor did the Chronicle of these years accept the common opinion that the diffusion of education would eliminate all wrong-doing. "Ages of misrule and oppression, producing poverty, degradation, and baseness of spirit among the people! these are what cause crime", cried D'Arcy in refutation of such assumptions.

Like the Weekly Register the Chronicle glorified small farming and had little time for the Pastoral Association. D'Arcy feared lest the grant of representative institutions had been premature, giving power to men with little concern for the common weal; he proclaimed that local politics must be re-generated by "a lofty, manly, wholesome democratic spirit". On Gipps' departure from Sydney the

---

61 9/10/44; cf Nadel: 208-09.
62 10, 13 & 24/4/44; etc.
63 27/7/44.
64 12/10/44.
Chronicle described his administration more fulsomely than did any other journal.

At this point practical politics re-enter our story, for the current Vicar-General, H.G. Gregory, organised a farewell testimonial to Gipps: once again Macdermott and the Church trod the same path. Orange propaganda suggested that the continuity had been maintained on the Corporation, which it alleged to be dominated by a "papal-democratic mob". Certainly, many Irish names appeared among the lists of councillors. An even more evident link bound Catholicism and the post-1848 'Australian' party in the legislature. Fitzgerald was sympathetic to the Church; Martin still nominally faithful; Nichols a convert of the future; Wentworth himself an old friend. Throughout their history 'Australians' had a temperamentally affinity with the Catholic interest, and probably thence drew much electoral power.

---

65 27/5/46.
66 Cf Birt : II, 261.
67 Sen 12/3/46.
68 Information from T.L.L. Suttor.
Catholics also helped along the radicalism of the late 'forties, as previous references to Heydon and Hawksley have shown. The latter assisted in the production of the Chronicle for eighteen months preceding its closure in September '48, and helped carry it towards a straight-out Chartist position. Co-editor for most of this time was Charles St Julian, also a Catholic and a radical. Many of the Advocate's readers probably fitted the same description. One contemporary pointed to a remarkable feature of Lang's electoral triumph: the support this candidate, a militant anti-Papist, received from Irish Catholics. The explanation offered was that the democracy of these voters was so violent that religious sentiment went by the board. This probably had some truth, although Lang's advocacy of Irish Repeal no doubt helped to swing the balance. Not that all Catholics rallied to his flag—

69 21/7/47, 21/10/47, 26/8/48.
70 Gilchrist: 483-4.
71 Cf his pamphlet Repeal or Revolution; or, a Glimpse of the Irish Future, London 1848.
Heydon and Edward McEncroe, the priest's brother, were notable exceptions in 1850.

John McEncroe had not moved into the conservative camp however. He supported the anti-transportation movement, in working-class rather than Anglican style and with such warmth that Lang later declared the Catholic, not himself, to have been Australia's first republican. The Freeman's Journal carried on the old hostility to squatting: as a mere "accidental pursuit" this deserved no voice in the legislature, even though the 'representation of interests' concept was sound. A major policy of this paper was to press for the £10 franchise, for McEncroe believed that not democracy but ruthless oligarchy was likely to provoke communistic turbulence. These arguments received striking confirmation from other notable Catholics: the former from Caroline Chisholm, ever an advocate of small farming, and after

72 The Representative: passim.
73 J.D. Lang, History of New South Wales: I, 359.
74 17/4/51.
75 3, 24, & 31/10/50; 24/4/51.
1850 the squatters' declared enemy; the latter from Vicar-General Gregory. Writing to Rome apropos of the Constitution of 1851 that dignitary remarked:

The Bill recently granted by the Imperial Parliament, for a new arrangement of the Legislature in the Colony, will also, it is probable, be serviceable to the cause of Catholicism, inasmuch as by the extension of the voting franchise, the influence of the labouring and trading classes will be rendered more able to cope with that of the wealthy landowners and capitalists who are almost exclusively Protestants.

By instinct and background Gregory was a thorough conservative. That such a man could adopt the language of democracy brilliantly demonstrated the strength of the pressures driving the Church to the political left.

Tasmanian Catholics were closely associated with the local 'Australian' faction. John Moore, proprietor of the Hobarton Guardian, belonged to the Church, and Bailey might also have accepted the faith. Their journal showed great and sympathetic interest in Church affairs, especially during the

76 Cf M. Kiddle, *Caroline Chisholm* : 232.
78 See biographical cards in TSA.
Papal crisis of 1848-49. Father J.J. Therry, then serving in Hobart, accepted a position on the committee of the Tasmanian Union, having first made clear his opposition to transportation. The Irish Exile held much the same socio-political views as the Hobarton Guardian, scorning those who would "stigmatize the bondsman with criminality", and the gentry as "a class, in every sense wholly alien and bitterly hostile to the population." O'Donohoe saw nothing terrible in continued transportation or the alleged Denison-Union link.

At the same time he spoke up on behalf of orthodox radicalism. The working men should organise to elect one of their number to the legislature, and so dispute the power of the rapacious gentry. One wonders if O'Donohoe had read the Communist Manifesto:

79 Esp 24/11/49.
80 Hob Gdn 27/11/50.
81 9/2/50.
82 13/7/50.
83 See esp 16/11/50.
84 12/10/50.
85 9/3/50.
When the making and administering of the laws are the privilege of a few, and when the great body of the people lie legally at the mercy of those few, the laws will be framed in order to obtain and secure for the ruling class a monopoly of the results of the labour and skill of the entire community; and the unfranchised people may be left destitute of material happiness or the means of obtaining it.

To him both "the devilish doctrines of Malthus" and laissez faire appeared as cloaks for pulling down the standards of the poor. He encouraged militance among his readers by regularly publishing reports from the Irish Democratic Association and forecasting the day when V.D.L. would become "one member of a grand Southern Confederation of Sovereign States — AMEN!" Such exuberance inevitably led O'Donohoe into conflict with the government, and the Irish Exile died in consequence.

In both the theory and practice of politics, therefore, the Catholic interest maintained a steadily anti-conservative course. This was an important development from its original indebtedness to liberal philosophy, but not the only one.

86 6/4/50.
87 13/7/50.
Liberalism itself extended from the restricted field of politics to teach a whole new doctrine concerning man's relations with the state, with his fellow citizens, and with the meaning of existence. Later chapters study this 'new faith' in detail, and to discuss here the Catholic encouragement of its principles smacks of putting cart before horse.

Moreover, each of the following sections in this chapter relate back to this question. Nevertheless some leading ideas can now be put forward, dependent though they are.

The Church and its spokesmen constantly proclaimed the glory of multi-establishment, of tolerance, and of social harmony. Folding's answer when Broughton protested against his recognition at the 1839 levee was a splendid case in point:

the question at issue regards not vestments and habiliments, crosses and rings, but something of infinitely higher importance; whether each religious denomination is to enjoy freedom of conscience on the footing of perfect equality, or whether a hateful exclusiveness is to be introduced and established; whether one, whom the Right Honourable Lord Glenelg had distinguished "as the Bishop of the

88 HRA XX : 270.
Church of England in Australia," is to be the only recognised Spiritual Head in the Colony, or whether each religious denomination recognized by the Government in its Head and in its Members, looking up to Her Gracious Majesty as a common Protector and friend, free from all unseemly jealousy and contentious bickering for exclusive favour and domination, shall be recommended on the distinctly avowed basis of perfect equality, to cultivate peace and social love.

R.W. Willson, appointed first Catholic Bishop of Hobart in 1842, used similar terms when reply to Nixon's objection against his assuming that title. "We are placed here by the government, if I understand our duty rightly, for a purpose very different from that of religious strife and contention," he said in lofty rebuke, "...Every man who has truly the welfare of this most important colony at heart will strive his utmost to cherish a spirit of peace, concord, and friendly feeling in all classes of society." When campaigning for Camden Roger Therry repudiated the vote of any Catholic "in whose breast there lurks a latent love of ascendancy". A final example can be drawn from the humble, parochial level. When Rev.

89 LE 5/4/45. Willson's statement was dated 14/10/44.  
90 SMH 8/2/43.
Michael McGrath left his charge at Windsor, Protestants joined with parishioners in his praise. "With you no petty difference, dissension, or disunion, arising from religious differences, or sectarian rancour exist", replied the priest, "no you are too good, too generous."

One interesting growth from such feeling was the admiration of many Catholics for the principle of voluntaryism - that absolute separation of Church and state was intrinsically admirable, not merely (as the Freeman's Journal already hinted in mid-'51) a necessary tactic to free the Church from secular control. While editor of the Chronicle Duncan suggested to Lang that their supporters unite in securing "entire relief ... from state support and state control". O'Donohoe too wished to strike off these "links of gold". He was anticipated by the Tasmanian laity at large, who in 1846 had described the Church Act as "the MAGNA CHARTA OF OUR RELIGIOUS RIGHTS AND STANDING", any amendment of which they would never countenance

91 SMH 6/8/47.
92 Esp 3/7/51.
93 20/3/41.
94 IE 16/3/50.
"except, indeed, it be to give place to a more liberal system, (the voluntary system) whereby all classes of Christians would enjoy without distinction, the most perfect equality."

Catholics paid further allegiance to "social love" by stressing that they made no discrimination of creed in doing good works. Before coming to Australia Bishop Willson had given much attention to the care of criminals and lunatics. This interest he kept up, offering to advise on the establishment of a lunatic asylum even before leaving Europe and giving much of his time to investigation of the convict system. Caroline Chisholm ever proclaimed her contempt for sectarian favouritism, and her Immigrant's Home was supervised by a multi-denominational committee. Both in Sydney and Hobart Sisters of Charity worked among poor and convict women of all faiths and none.

95 Addresses to the Right Rev. R.W. Willson, D.D., Hobart 1846 (F4445) : 11-12.


98 Their story is told by J.H. Cullen, The Australian Daughters of Mary Aikenhead, Sydney 1938.
The lay 'Friendly Brothers' of Melbourne and Geelong upheld the same ideal. One of the most important lay groups in Sydney, the Holy Catholic Guild of St Mary and St Joseph, invited all citizens to use its library. Catholic Temperance Societies also welcomed non-believers - Rev. John Lynch of Maitland gave buildings dedicated to this cause such names as 'Hall of Conciliation', 'Ark of Peace', 'Temple of Concord'.

At no point does the affinity of the Church with 'moral liberalism' become stronger than in this advocacy of Temperance. Following the Irish pattern, Australian Catholics placed great stress on their rejection of strong drink as a qualification to responsible citizenship: just as Daniel O'Connell regenerated politics, so the great Temperance advocate Father Theobald Mathew regenerated morality. The first Catholic society began at Sydney in 1835, and


100 AC 26/11/45.


102 Cf AC 9/7/40 (St Patrick's Society meeting).

was followed by many, many others. McEncroe (himself an alcoholic at one time), Ullathorne, Lynch, and Rev. John Rigney of Illawarra were the outstanding clerical advocates of the movement, but differed from most only in the degree of their enthusiasm. Twice Catholic priests carried the pledge-concept to a further extreme. While serving as convict chaplain at Norfolk Island McEncroe became intimate with that ultra liberal penologist Alexander Maconochie. The two organised a 'Reform Society' of which the members (600 altogether; 430 Catholic) pledged to abstain from "all profane, impure, and improper conversation" and to use their influence for good among other convicts. William Hall, Willson's Vicar-General, later formed a similar society in Hobart.

On many other occasions the Church showed great concern for punctilious moral rectitude. Polding's

104 S. Leslie (ed.), From Cabin Boy to Archbishop: 123.
106 AC 25/8/40.
107 Hob Gdn 12/6/47.
Lenten Instructions for 1837 thus indicted Australian 108 behaviour:

The sacred name of God is blasphemed worse than among the Gentiles; the holiness of an oath is trampled under foot; the Sunday is no longer deemed a day consecrated to the Lord; children grow up in the habits of sin unchecked and unheeded; with a lamentable precocity, before their mental or corporeal powers are developed, they emulate the bad example of their parents; the sanctity of marriage is deemed of no account. Drunkenness, the parent and progeny of misfortune and of crime. - Who shall recount the victims this monster daily sacrifices to hell?

Catholic priests were forbidden attendance at horse-racing, theatres, or any other public meeting where the cloth might appear out of place. Text books used in Church schools taught simple morality in a way which no secularist could have bettered. The Guild excluded from its library all books "having the smallest tendency to immorality".

Mention of schools and books provokes consideration of the Church's attitude to that other

109 Acta et Decreta ..., Sydney 1844 (F3895a) : 10.
110 The Second Reading Book, Sydney 1850 (F5502).
111 SMH 23/3/46.
great ingredient of moral liberalism - culture. Catholic leaders gave much care to the development of education and at some times during the various controversies stirred up by this subject, went close to adopting the liberal position. In 1835 Ullathorne and Roger Therry joined with critics of all religious instruction in schools to belittle nonconformist pressure for official adoption of the British and Foreign scheme. The following year no criticism emanated from this quarter when Bourke suggested the Irish National system, and Polding wrote a series of letters to the Australian in its favour. Subsequently the Church swung around to full support of denominational primary education. Even in 1844 however Polding declared his readiness to have older children educated in general schools; moreover, he would establish a literacy qualification for the franchise. The Bishop, who once declared that "the

---

112 Any detailed account is rendered unnecessary by R.N. Fogarty, Catholic Education in Australia 1806-1950.

113 Col 22/1/35, 5/2/35; Leslie : 90.

114 Kenny : 83 seq.

115 Cf Moran : 864 seq.

diffusion of sound taste and a love of the fine arts" ranked among his ambitions second only to the spread of religion, was more ardent in devotion to culture than his clergy at large. Even so, there was a perceptible difference between his Church and the Anglicans on this crucial issue.

The liberal elements in Catholic theology came strongly to the fore in these years. Polding, so Ullathorne reminisced, was happy to have himself presented in colonial newspapers as representative of "a reformed Catholicity, that was universally charitable and tolerant" while his Vicar-General came under fire as bespeaking "all the old, mediaeval bigotry and intolerance". The education controversy showed the nub of truth in thus regarding the Bishop, especially when his Australian letters angrily denied that the Council of Trent debarred Catholics from reading the Bible. Sensitivity on this point was very general: we will see below that Bible Societies, which so frequently alleged priestly determination

117 Birt : I, 411.
118 Leslie : 158.
119 Kenny : 88 seq.
to keep the people ignorant, were an important target for Catholic fire. A pamphlet issued by the Church in 1839 emphasised Catholic veneration for the Scriptures; and went on to deny the power of any priest to pardon any unrepentant sinner, and to declare that persecution of Protestants by Catholics was as sinful as the reverse. John McEncroe also developed this point in a polemical essay, ascribing the horrors of the Inquisition to causes beyond the Church's control. A Hobart reprint of The Principles of Roman Catholics by the Bishop of Cloyne avowed the possibility of the Church committing errors in civil policy, the fallibility of the Pope, and the Church's utter condemnation of its members practising equivocation, mental reservation, or temporal disloyalty.

In 1845 Francis Murphy, now Bishop of Adelaide, issued a syllabus of Vindications which some Protestants interpreted as a harbinger of a second Reformation. The

120 The Touchstone of the New Religion, Sydney 1839 (F2872) : 19 seq.

121 The Wanderings of the Human Mind ..., Sydney 1841 : 68.

122 F2962. The same had been printed in Sydney in 1825, F1005.
Chronicle jeered at such naivete, yet the virtual repub­
lication of Murphy's document in Port Phillip in
1849 incited the same reaction. The Anglical cleric
William Trollope at once asked Are the Catholics of
Port Phillip Tridentine Romanists? Trollope's pur­
pose was to sneer at the Church, and a local layman
answered at length. Nevertheless the Protestant did
establish that the emphasis of the Vindications (on
such matters as those raised above and idolatry,
Mariolatry, the Pope's power to remit sins), differed
markedly from the Council of Trent.

Sometimes this liberalism in theology was car­
rried to a decidedly peculiar extreme. J.J. Therry once
told the people of Hobart that in pursuit of Christian
unity he was prepared "cheerfully to sacrifice ...
everything but the strict integrity of faith, and
the essential purity of morals. Even the discipline
of our Church, sacred and salutary as it has proved
to be, might be materially altered". The veteran

123 AC 12/11/45.
124 F5551. See also F5552.
125 P.A.C. O'Farrell : F5474-75.
126 CT 9/4/39.
struck another odd note when thanking the commander of
the local regiment for no longer requiring children of
his Catholic soldiers to attend Protestant service:

The Protestantism of the present day requires
neither force nor fraud for its support; it
scornfully rejects the proffered service of
either. It is now simply a protestation
against error, wherever it exists, and not,
as formerly, against the Catholic church.

T.A. Murray had argued on similar lines at a public
meeting of Catholics in 1836. He believed that
Protestant liberality for Catholics promised "an
approaching revolution ... when the Christians of
one sect will commonly say unto him of another,
'the God whom thou worshippeth is the God whom I
also adore, I will help thee to build an altar to
him." Murray himself lived by these principles,
being a pewholder at the Anglican Church of St
John, Canberra.

So early as 1836 Polding had said apropos
of the Reformation:

127 HTC 25/11/42.

128 A Report containing The Pastoral Address of
The Right Reverend Bishop ..., Sydney 1836
(F2166) : 10.

129 Kenny : 94.
In the first struggles for change, civil or religious, the cry of liberty is raised loudly, and the abstract individual rights of man are asserted strongly. There is an object to be gained. Flatter the pride of man and he instantly becomes the instrument of his own subjugation. When that change has been brought about, and the transfer of power has been accomplished, a return of those principles of subordination and restriction, the experience of ages has proved to be essential to the well-being of society, is made invariably.

In 1844 the Bishop explained the troubles of the Spanish Church in similar terms, as did Willson the Italian uprisings of 1848-49. Clearly these leaders recognised the liberal heresy, and its threat to the Church. The same lesson appeared in the increasing antipathy to secular education: the Church argued against the non-religious character of Sydney University that the professors would form a sect of their own, positively hostile to religious belief. On two outstanding occasions the Chronicle denied basic liberal tenets concerning the latent powers of unfettered man, and the place of religion in society. "We maintain that the Christian religion

130 Moran : 436.
131 Pastoral, Hobart 1849 (F5250).
132 SMH 6/9/50.
was never intended to civilize the world, or to smooth the face of society, or to facilitate the movements of civil government, or to spread abroad knowledge, or to cultivate the reason or for any great worldly objects whatever**: this declaration came from none other but Hawksley or St Julian.

Obviously the marriage of liberalism and the Church was marred by an ultimate incompatibility of ideas. The needs of convenience tended to mislead both parties. Yet the Church gained much from the match, and often spoke with sincerity when praising its partner. As yet there was no real thought of divorce.

Friction within the Church

The previous section aimed to convey the flavour of the Church in toto. Occasionally the untypical might have become too prominent - Polding's views on education, for example, or the theology of Father Therry and Murray - but no policy which Catholic leaders repudiated was advanced as representative.

133 AC 11/4/48; see also 17/9/45.
Constantly, however, internal pressure strove to push the Church towards a more novel position than the hierarchy would accept. Liberal intellectuals and Irishmen, who did so much to set the tone of the Church as a whole, were also behind most of these movements. Therefore a study of the friction which resulted not only fills out the argument of the preceding section, but reveals in microcosm the difficulties of integrating Catholicism into society at large.

In the account of intellectual dissent Duncan again stands out as an arch-typical figure. Converted to the faith in early youth by his own unaided reading, he always tended to value culture more highly than did the priesthood or the Chronicle of 1844. Commenting on the difficulties of colonial development, Duncan once stressed that here were "none of those feudal, patriarchal or spiritual ties which bound men together"; to supply this want "sound moral and intellectual education" should be compulsory. In opening the School of Arts at Brisbane in 1849 he argued in similar

134 WR 27/1/44; 6/7/44.
vein that the twin advance of learning and commerce promised humanity's best hope for peace and happiness. "By the culture of his physical Intellectual and moral constitution, man may greatly ameliorate his condition", the speech continued; the founders of the School would one day be honoured as national pioneers. On this occasion Duncan stressed that he did not accept the doctrine of human perfectibility. Nor could any Catholic, but a few years before he had spent many hours with Parkes and Harpur discussing the glories which they all believed the future to hold.

Duncan ever upheld the virtues of general education, despite the Church's increasing preference for the denominational system. Others to take the same stand were Roger Therry; J.H. Plunkett, Chairman of the National Board after 1848; and James Martin. In this allegiance such men showed both devotion to culture, and their intense wish that the Church should

137 See his pamphlet, F5340.
138 See his pamphlet, F2191.
separate itself from the general community as little as possible. Contradicting the Chronicle during the controversy of 1844 Duncan insisted "the Government here is 'sincere and friendly'; or what is perhaps better, just and impartial": the implication was to accuse official policy of not accepting perfect equality. Therry's repudiation of ascendancy seekers at Camden had the same tang of rebuking some of his co-religionists. When the Catholics of Maitland proposed to break away from the district hospital, following alleged discrimination against Lynch when attending patients, Plunkett wrote that such a separation would be a strange departure from the sound policy which has been observed during the successive administrations of Sir R. Bourke and Sir George Gipps ... the object of which has been to amalgamate all Christians as closely as possible in harmony, good feeling, and charity towards each other.

Plunkett also disagreed with the official Church policy of opposing the principle of the General Cemeteries Bill, and warned the legislature of the power of the

139 WR 27/7/44.

140 SMH 8/10/46. The dispute extended over many months. It was extensively reported in the MM; see also Maitland Hospital Committee, LC 8/10/46 : Report.
priests over their congregations in such issues. Caroline Chisholm probably belonged to this 'integration' school: she reported that many Catholics dis-liked her refusal to favour fellow-believers.

Part of the intellectuals' attitude was their reluctance to see militant Irish feeling exacerbated. Again the Duncan-Chronicle quarrel over education pointed the moral, for had not the latter evoked old-world feeling against the general system? National differences played a part in losing the Scot his editorship in 1843. Murphy and McEncroe, both very conscious of their Irishness and hotly loved by the rank-and-file, were among his leading antagonists in the dispute; he had already built up ill-will by but coldly reporting the Repeal Association and the lavish welcome given to J.J. Therry when that veteran hero of local Irish-Catholics re-visited Sydney in 1841. Plunkett and Roger Therry, despite their birth, apparently held much the same views as Duncan on this question.

141 SMH 6/8/47.
142 Port Phillip Patriot 31/3/46 (reference indicated by T.L. Suttor).
143 Appeal: 4 seq.
Thus they advised Polding against allowing the display of Irish emblems on the occasion of the laying of the foundation stone of St Patrick's, Sydney, in August 1840. An interesting converse was the attempt during the 1843 election campaign to smear Therry as the kind of man who would not support Repeal at home.

Irishness was much more important as a positively disrupting factor than as a goad to the intellectuals. Infinite trouble arose from the pioneer priests and the laity being overwhelmingly Irish while most of the superior clergy were English. The moment Ullathorne, an Englishman and a Benedictine, arrived in N.S.W. he clashed with J.J. Therry, limited in everything but rude vigour and the admiration of his flock. Tension reached breaking point soon after the arrival of Polding, who had a genuine affection for things Irish but dreamed that the Benedictine order, to which he too belonged, would ever dominate the Australian mission. Rumours spread around Sydney that Therry

---


145 Col Ob 21/1/43 ("An Elector").

146 Cf Leslie : passim.
was to be moved from the city. The lay-members of the committee of St Mary's Cathedral prepared a strong protest, telling the Bishop that his own popularity owed much to Therry's earlier work: for all their protestations of obedience, this sounded much like a threat. But the Irishman was despatched to Campbell-town, and Polding's references to a Therry "party" in homeward correspondence allowed no doubt that strong feeling boiled up. This simmered again in 1838 when Therry was detailed to the Tasmanian mission. Anger lulled when the report went around that the move was only temporary, but in 1839 Polding asked Therry to remain as Vicar-General in Hobart and could hardly be refused. Ullathorne almost certainly planned this permanent exile from Sydney.

During the latter's absence in Europe 1836-38 Polding had come under the influence of Francis Murphy and Charles Lovat, an Englishman who presided over the superior school attached to St Mary's. Murphy moreover

---

147 O'Brien : 325 seq.
148 Birt : I, 293.
149 O'Brien : 196.
had succeeded to Therry's place in the hearts of local Catholics, and the struggle for ascendancy which ensued on Ullathorne's return incorporated the theme of national friction. Ullathorne scored a major victory when, assisted by Roger Therry and Plunkett, he persuaded Polding to ban all Irish insignia at the St Patrick's stone-laying. He never quite re-settled, however, experience having convinced him that Australia must become an Irish mission. Subsequently he refused the Hobart bishopric, lest another clash with Therry result.

Ullathorne therefore left Australia forever late in 1840. Polding too embarked on this voyage, and in his absence Murphy administered the Church. If Duncan's account is trustworthy, Irish emotion and criticism of Polding were now allowed to run rampant. When the Bishop returned he upheld Murphy in not reinstating Duncan, but otherwise had moved away from the Irishman. Now his guiding spirit was

151 Leslie: 144 seq.
152 Leslie: 164 seq; Birt: I, 369.
154 Appeal: 4 seq.
H.G. Gregory, another English Benedictine, determined to impress the characteristics of his nation and order on the Australian mission, and a man ambitious of pomp and power.

This priest was largely responsible for a steady worsening of relations between the Irish and their English superiors in N.S.W. In trying to enforce Benedictine rules, he quarrelled with the two Irish religious orders in the colony, the Sisters of Charity and the Christian Brothers. That these disputes signified a general malaise was demonstrated in two letters written to Rome from the colony in 1851. In one Gregory expressed his hopes for immigration of British and French Catholics who would dilute the rude Irishness of the laity. The second came from John McEncroe, the undisputed inheritor of the Therry-Murphy mystique. He urged that the Church be saved from the unhappy effects of "national antipathies and mutual distrusts" by the creation of many

155 Cf Cullen, Daughters of Mary Aikenhead: 40.
156 Cullen, Daughters of Mary Aikenhead: 72 seq; O. Thorpe, First Catholic Mission to the Australian Aborigines, Sydney 1950: 143-44.
new sees under Irish Bishops. His tone suggested that the peak of high feeling had passed, but Polding later reported that McEncroe himself was busily intriguing at this time. The Church in N.S.W. was far from unity at mid-century.

However McEncroe's prime example of "national antipathies" came from V.D.L., where Willson and J.J. Therry had long pursued a fantastic quarrel.

The ground was prepared even before the Bishop left England, for he had stipulated the removal of the Irishman and brought with him a new Vicar-General, the Englishman William Hall. The substance of the dispute, was the Bishop's refusal to accept responsibility for Church debts contracted by Therry. Not until 1858 was a settlement reached, and throughout all those years both parties displayed extreme obstinacy, prevarication and ill-feeling.

McEncroe was surely right in emphasising the

---

158 Moran: 778 seq.

159 Birt: II, 184; cf Moran: 736.

160 Cf J.H. Cullen, Bishop Willson; Australasian Catholic Record (new series): XXVI seq. Cullen and O'Brien wrongly deny the presence of national feeling, but give the essential facts of the dispute.
place of Irish-English antipathy in the dispute.

Early in the proceedings he personally led a committee in Sydney which worked on Therry's behalf; Willson attributed Polding's equivocal attitude on the issue to fear of the Irishman's sympathisers in N.S.W. National feeling became overt in August 1849 when a letter signed "An Irishman" appeared in the Hobart press. It jeered at "Bishop Willson and his anti-Irish clergy", and claimed that such "birds of passage" had no right to the use of a cathedral built with Irish money. Willson answered these attempts to alienate "his Irish flock", while another newspaper correspondent alleged that the Therryites were declaring their hero "would be supported *right or wrong* - that the Bishop and his Clergy were English and consequently not entitled to support or protection!!!" The Hobarton Guardian and the Irish Exile both took Therry's part, the

---

161 HTC 6/9/45.
163 CT 17/3/49; HTC 15/8/49.
164 Cf CT 7/12/49.
165 CT 26/2/50 (letter of "Palaemon").
latter repeatedly attacking Hall and sneering at Willson "for upholding British supremacy under the veil of Catholicity". Willson's denunciation of Irish priests became so bitter that a relevant document remains unpublished; years later he advised that an Irishman take over from himself.

At one stage of the quarrel Willson angrily accused Polding of improper interference. This was but an extreme example of the insubordination bred by the dispute. Polding's coadjutor Bishop C.H. Davis, reported of Therry in 1850 that "nearly all the people sympathise with him, and, as you may suppose, the Bishop's unpopularity is proportionate". This attitude became manifest on many occasions. One incident concerned the removal of H.N. Woolfrey from the Huon River parish, apparently because that priest had declared for Therry. Local Catholics at once criticised Willson in a public statement, which, after some delay Woolfrey formally disowned. The laity

166 9/3/50.
167 Birt : II, 148, 283-84.
168 O'Brien : 226 seq.
responded with another declaration, denigrating Bishop and priest together! But the most remarkable feature of the dispute was Therry's invocation of ultra-Protestant support. His early steps in this direction merely continued the tradition of Catholic appeal to the community at large, but by 1850 the anti-Willson party embodied a strong Protestant faction. Thus Hall replied to a renewed invitation that he should cooperate in finding a compromise solution:

Amongst such a set? Mr Therry - Your Redeemer associated with the humbler classes. Vicar-General - Do you call upon us to associate with Orangemen? Mr Therry said it had been remarked that if there were wolves within the fold, there were sheep without it.

The reference to Orangemen bore upon John Morgan, who had thrown the Britannia against Willson for years past. His chief technique was to play upon Irish nationalism - thus, when Willson had issued his pastoral condemnatory of the Italian uprisings of 1848-49 an article in the Britannia pointed out to

170 HTC 6/10/49; CT 14/8/49, 18/9/49.
171 Cf HTC 6/9/45.
172 HTC 9/3/50.
173 Cf 30/7/46.
"you kind-hearted Irish Catholics" that similar arguments had long been used against their rebellious compatriots "by the lords and spiritual prelates of Robert William's country". Denounced by Willson, Morgan issued a pamphlet which repeated his absolute sympathy for Catholic laymen against the tyranny of their priests. O'Donohoe was one Therryite who found Morgan's arguments repugnant, but few others seemed to bother. Early in 1850 the more enthusiastic opened a subscription to meet the priest's financial obligations "and for his support as a clergyman on the voluntary principle." The Colonial Times saw in this a prospect of a Free Catholic Church under a second Luther, but the move fizzled out.

Dissidence sometimes appeared among both clergy and laity which had no obvious Irish or intellectual origins. In 1841 Therry himself had appeared on

174 11/10/49 ("A True Catholic"). These were Willson's baptismal names.

175 Give us Light ..., Hobart 1850.

176 CT 15/3/50.

177 For a discussion of such disputes see K.S. Inglis, Catholic Historiography in Australia, HS : VIII, 242 seq.
virtual trial before his parishioners to answer charges of inefficiency, and earlier still the pioneer priest in the island, Philip Conolly, had so far alienated many of his flock that they petitioned the Imperial Government for his removal. The priest-in-charge at Melbourne until 1848, B.P. Geoghegan alleged that an "Orange Catholic" planned to establish an ostensibly pro-Church journal in that district: did this hint at another alliance of dissidents and ultra-Protestants? Not that Geoghegan lacked warm supporters among the rank-and-file - in fact the appointment over his head of Bishop J.A. Goold provoked some angry murmur. Such incidents were unimportant in themselves yet in sum demonstrate that for all its weight of tradition, hierarchical government, and firmly-knit belief, the Church suffered many pains of growth. Not only in relation to Irishmen and intellectuals did its

178 HTC 29/1/41, 9/3/41; Moran: 252-53. Therry was exonerated.
180 AC 6/11/47.
181 E. Finn, Chronicles of Early Melbourne: 143.
experience illustrate the difficulties of building a consolidated society.

From Strength Towards Aggression

The story of the Catholic Church in Australia has an epic quality. Great men, high ideals, selfless enthusiasm - all were very prominent. With awesome rapidity the faith built up many pillars of strength - churches, schools, lay institutions, journals, above all priests and religious. Despite the various troubles mentioned above the Church's achievement by mid-century excelled that of any other denomination and allowed no doubt that it would long be a dominant force in Australian life.

To Catholics this progress seemed inspiring; to liberals, impressive; to conservatives, fearful. From the viewpoint of such as Broughton, Burton, and the Herald, every advance made by the Church pertained to the theme of disruption. Greater discrimination has determined the content of the following paragraphs. They emphasise the advances made by the Church - in comparison with the British situation - vis-à-vis the state and other denominations; organised pressure-
grouping which sought to extend Catholic influence
still further; recourse to exaggeration, half-truth,
or emotional-cum-physical duress. It was in relation
to such matters that the conservatives had most
reason to feel aggrieved; although no suggestion is
meant that they had any overriding right to do so.

Ever ranking as the Church's great achievement was its formal recognition by government. This traced back to the turn of the century when Governor P.G. King had allowed James Dixon, a transported priest, to celebrate Mass; the appointments of Therry and Conolly (1819), Ullathorne (1832) and Polding (1834) had the Home Government's approval. All these priests received financial aid from the state and were allowed to conduct marriages. Thus the Church Acts were not wholly innovatory, although they did mark a tremendous advance. Moreover this Church was particularly assiduous in using the opportunities thereby created. "I have sent in our estimates for this year", wrote Polding to England in the early days of the N.S.W. Act's operation, "-- the Tories will be astonished at
our impudence. N'importe: they dare not refuse."

182 Birt : I, 291.
In 1844 N.S.W. Catholics petitioned that the £30,000 set aside for religious purposes under the 1842 Constitution be redistributed according to current 183 census figures; nearly every year the Colonial Office received requests for aid from Australian clergy visiting Europe, or their agents in Britain.

The second major event in the progress of the Church's constitutional status was the establishment of a territorial hierarchy in Australia early in 1842. Previously Polding had held the titular see of Hiero-Caesarea; now he became Archbishop of Sydney, and plans were laid for appointments to Adelaide and Hobart. Polding later said that the Colonial Office answered "do what you like" when sounded on these 185 moves. Perhaps so, but the department was not wholly unconcerned by the drift of events. When, late in

183 HRA XXIII : 346 seq; XXIV : 440, 712 seq. Note the comparable agitation in 1849 for distribution of money for education according to numbers in each denomination : V & P, daily proceedings, passim.

184 The CO miscellaneous files provide the evidence.

185 Moran : 226. Unfortunately the directly relevant correspondence appears to have been abstracted from the CO files.
1841, Polding requested the transfer of Ullathorne's salary as Vicar-General to Murphy, Under-Secretary James Stephen minuted his letter to the effect that by the Act of Supremacy the government had no more right to establish the Church of Rome in a settled colony like N.S.W. than in England. "The difficulty is a grave one;" Lord Stanley replied "... the concurrence to the strict letter of the law, after the series of precedents which have been set, appears as objectionable as its violation." Even the tolerant Gipps was somewhat disconcerted by the establishment of the hierarchy; the outcry which arose in Britain against 'Papal aggression' in 1851 when territorial titles were there created further emphasised the novelty of the Australian position.

"In those days," reminisced Ullathorne of the late 'thirties, "we had to meet the long-cherished traditions of Protestant supremacy, and to assert that equality before the law, which the law itself

186 CO 201/315 : 224 seq; see also 201/292 : 468 (earlier intimation).
187 HRA XXII : 598.
The former Vicar-General had often applied this precept: his *Reply to Judge Burton* embodied a particularly bitter onslaught against the Anglican claim to supremacy. Polding felt no less strongly. On a trip to V.D.L. in 1836 he had quarrelled with Conolly, who thereupon brought a libel action against his superior. Polding at once demanded of Arthur that the Crown undertake his defence. The matter ended out of court, but not before the Bishop's argument was accepted. Three years later Polding led an attack on Judge J.W. Willis, who publicly charged Catholics with idolatrous and other non-Christian practices. Catholic meetings throughout the colony protested to the Imperial Government via Gipps; Polding reported the matter to the Catholic Institute and his other contacts in Britain. "Spare no expense, no trouble; oust Willis", he cried, "you must move

188 *Autobiography* : 168.

189 Ullathorne followed very closely the argument of the Tasmanian Presbyterian, James Thomson, for whom see chapter VI.

190 CO 280/66 : 524 seq.

191 HRA XIX : 586 seq; Moran : 296-97.
heaven and earth in this business." In fact the Judge, having quarrelled violently with his Sydney brethren, was soon moved to Melbourne, where he became the focus of another violent controversy. The Catholic interest was strong among the anti-Willis party, which eventually had the pleasure of seeing its antagonist leave Australia under a heavy cloud. Meanwhile Broughton's protest against Polding's appearance at the 1839 levee had provoked not only the latter's statement concerning "social love", but a demand by Sydney Catholics for the removal of Broughton from the Councils and their insistence that religious liberty was a natural right of man. This matter too had repercussions in Britain: all parliamentarians received detailed accounts, and the Catholic Institute took it up with the Colonial Office.

192 Birt : I, 336, 337. There is no evidence to support Birt's claim that this outcry was the real cause of Willis' posting to Melbourne.

193 The documentation for this episode is vast. See esp the petition calling for Willis' dismissal, CO 201/377 : 14.

194 AC 2/8/39.

195 Kenny : 174 seq.
The right of government-supervised Catholics to free religious exercise often aroused contention. Father Therry had to work hard in V.D.L. before the government capitulated to his successive demands concerning convicts on government work, assigned servants, women in the house of correction, state orphans. In N.S.W. the general principle triumphed much earlier, but Polding fought rear-guard actions over the power of Protestant masters to direct the religious observances of their assignees, and the attendance of Catholics at Anglican services aboard transport vessels. These campaigns were successful, but not the Bishop's contesting of Gipps' decision that a group of imprisoned non-Christian aborigines should be put in the exclusive care of an Anglican chaplain.

Disparagement of Irish migrants was another common challenge to battle. A mass meeting in Sydney

---


197 Moran: 297 seq, 309.

198 HRA XXIII: 677 seq; XXIV: 231 seq, 384.
protested against the 1841 Immigration Committee's argument that Irish immigration should be restricted to maintain the prevailing balance. Duncan saw in this argument a threat to suppress all minorities; other speakers referred to the temperance and high morality of the Irish; yet others to the need for local self-government. In 1842 Daniel O'Connell himself presented to the Commons a petition from V.D.L. charging Franklin with discrimination against Irish migrants. Late in 1849 the St Patrick's Society of Melbourne protested against an official statement from Britain to the effect that few Irish would be sent to Port Phillip in the immediate future because of their unpopularity; some months later the same organisation defended the morals and efficiency of Irish Orphan girls recently arrived in the colony.

Only by noticing a few trivial instances can the force of Ullathorne's comment about assertion be appreciated. He personally tried to persuade Gipps

---

199 AC 16/9/41.
200 CT 26/7/42.
201 Mackle : 153 seq; IE 1/6/50.
to prohibit government officers from supporting the Bible Society at Sydney; Willson rebuked Denison for countenancing that at Hobart. A meeting of Catholics formally objected to the decision of the police magistrate at Dungog to employ only Protestant constables; Polding protested to both local and Imperial Governments when Justices of the Peace joined in a public meeting at Penrith which attacked Roman Catholicism during the crisis of the Scone-Makinson conversions. Any hint of Anglican supremacy was contested very fiercely indeed. Roger Therry's (vain) attempt to have any reference to Anglicanism struck out in a public address to Victoria on her accession, and Willson's objection to Nixon's Consistorial Court scheme were instances of some weight, but again

203 Kelsh : 70.
204 AC 31/3/40.
205 CO 201/409 : 291 seq.
206 SMH 20/11/37.
207 CO 280/222 : 343 seq. To press this protest was a major reason for Willson's return to England at this time.
mountains were made out of molehills. The use of a school-room in Sydney, occupied for a decade by Catholics, formerly belonging to the Church and Schools Corporation became a full-scale battle, causing Gipps much trouble. When in 1844 Broughton accused Catholics of illegitimate proselytising at the Female Factory, Parramatta, copies of a fully-documented denial were distributed to the Archbishop of Canterbury, the Anglican Archbishop of Dublin, Sir Robert Peel, and Lord Stanley. John West described how at the funeral of Sir Eardley Wilmot "the Catholic priests, by a rapid evolution, shot a-head of the procession", neatly ousting the Anglicans from that honoured post. The same jealousy appeared in the speed with which Hall sought a housing grant for Wilson once Nixon had so benefited.

Overall the Church received favourable treatment at the hands of the state and often expressed

208 HRA XXI : 497-98, 681 seq. The Governor worked out a compromise.

209 Moran : 440 seq. No apparent repercussions followed.

210 The History of Tasmania : I, 260.

211 LC 3/11/49.
reciprocal gratitude and admiration. On the symbolically important issue of titles and designation, however, it did not hesitate to override official wishes. Gipps once suggested to Polding that he abandon even the title 'Roman Catholic Church' to avoid giving any offence. The Bishop firmly refused, and the matter dropped. In 1847 Earl Grey directed that Catholic Bishops should not claim territorial titles; no "do what you like" spirit prevailed now. This despatch came to hand shortly before Perry disputed Goold's claim to the title 'Bishop of Melbourne', and in consequence Deas Thomson asked that some other designation be adopted. But Goold and Polding continued to do precisely as they liked, and the government found it had no power to enforce its wish. Late in 1848 another relevant directive came from the Colonial Office: the simple style 'Catholic' should not be allowed "as it confines the character of Catholicity to the Roman Church alone, and impliedly represents all others as schismatical." Again the only response was a refusal to be

212 Moran : 236.

213 HRA XXVI : 48; Moran : 745 seq; CO 201/411 : 419 seq.

214 HRA XXVI : 776.
bound, coupled with a disavowal of any wish for
ascendancy.

At such moments one can justly doubt whether
the Church's devotion to "social love" and "perfect
equality" was altogether whole-hearted; whether,
indeed, there was not a sinister undertone to
Ullathorne's inference that Polding did not mind
the press exaggerating the Church's advance from
"old, mediaeval" traditions. This suspicion gains
greater weight from a study of Catholic attitudes
towards the community at large rather than, as in
the preceding pages, towards the state alone. The
intellectuals' fear that integration was not always
pursued as far as it might had some justice. Even
such actions as forming separate Temperance Societies
and breaking away from the Melbourne Benevolent Society
lent it credence, although in these and an uncertain
number of like occasions anti-Catholics probably cast
the first stone.

216 See chs VIII, IX.
217 Mackle : 76.
Earlier references have shown that the 1843 candidatures of O'Connell, Fitzgerald and Curr, if not Therry, drew heavily on Catholic support; mob demonstrations, closely following the Irish pattern, honoured all three. Yet to presume that more than instinctive national-religious sentiment lay behind these appearances would be dangerous. Similarly, although attempts were made to rouse Catholic feeling against Lowe, Wilshire, and Lang in 1850, no high-level plotting was insinuated. In '48, at least, Polding asked his flock to act with moderation and the awareness that good faith could prevail on more than one side. For the Sydney and later Cook-Westmoreland elections of 1851, however, there nominated one Alexander Longmore, a Catholic almost certainly prompted to stand by John McEncroe. The *Freeman's Journal* welcomed him as a man who if elected would "represent Catholics as a civil society" in the

218 Atlas 15/7/48 (Lowe's clerk denies that that candidate had refused to employ a Catholic servant).

219 PA 22/12/49.

220 *The Elector* 22/7/48.
legislature - just as Deas Thomson wanted other interests to have their voice. Never had Churchmen moved so far from integration. On the other hand many Catholics failed to respond - Longmore himself minimised his specific Church backing, McEncroe felt impelled to deny charges that the clergy were interfering unduly in lay affairs, and the candidate failed. Hawksley, long a critic of direct Church participation in politics, forecast that many of his fellow-believers would adhere to Lang in deliberate hostility to Longmore's candidature.

Catholic attempts to influence the state's education policy had a more positively Machiavellian flavour. McEncroe sought to explain the change from support to condemnation of the National System thus:

When Sir Richard Bourke proposed the introduction of the Irish system, so called, we had only two or three very indifferent Catholic schools, supported by Government, and were not opposed to any experiment in

221 22/5/51.
222 Freeman's Journal 31/7/51.
223 Letter to J.D. Lang, 26/7/51: ML MS A2226.
224 Moran: 864.
education that promised to improve the then very defective education of the Catholic children.

Even on its own value, this amounted to saying that the Church was prepared to co-operate when weak, not when strong. Moreover McEncroe was glossing the truth in implying that the Church had given only passive endorsement to Bourke - he could not have been unaware of Polding's letters to the Australian. Meanwhile the occasion of St Patrick's stone-laying had played a part in the education controversy. Just previously Gipps interviewed Ullathorne and Polding, evidently telling his plans to introduce a general system. He had come to this decision, the Governor said, because of the strength of popular opinion in its favour. Ullathorne thereupon organised a massive demonstration of Catholics at the aforementioned ceremony. "This was the answer given to the remark that we were the weaker party," he concluded his subsequent account of the story. "It proved us strong in union; and we heard no more of the new scheme". This spirit sounded again in 1844 when a

225 Leslie : 168.
mob, almost certainly organised by McEncroe, broke up a meeting of friends of the National system.

Although no Irish emblems appeared at St Patrick's, many other means were employed to build up what Ullathorne described as "exalted enthusiasm". Mass processions, brass bands, uniforms and regalia - these very frequently acted as bonds of Catholic loyalty. Investiture to the Holy Guild followed an elaborate, semi-religious procedure; its office-bearers and members clothed themselves in nicely-graduated finery. Melbourne's men of St Patrick marched to the opening of St Francis' Church in that city to the tune of martial music, waving banners and wearing "rich, embroidered green scarves". The temperance societies particularly revelled in pomp and ceremony, that at Illawarra achieving a remarkable degree of elaboration.

226 Cf WR 7/9/44; the AC lamented the disruption, 4/9/44.

227 Souvenir: 10 seq; AC 26/11/45.

228 Moran: 717.

229 AC 26/8/41 (advertisement).
Rarely did these demonstrations have a specific purpose, but their constant repetition came close to psychological offence. It was to check such displays, and the no less ardent reaction of Orangemen, that in 1846 the government put through the Party Processions Prevention Act. The Chronicle first opposed, then accepted this legislation; other Churchmen appear to have paid little heed to its provisions. Early in 1847 Plunkett, as Attorney-General, wrote to McEncroe, pointing out that the recent march of the St Patrick's Total Abstinence Society had infringed the Act. The priest replied that the procession was not a religious one, nor the society exclusively Catholic. This intransigence was in full accord with McEncroe's general outlook, as already noticed. Perhaps its extreme manifestation was his plan to hold mass hurley games in Sydney on Boyne Day, so as to ensure that Catholics would be well-armed against any Orange outbreak.

230 HRA XXV : 308; the Act was 10 Vic no 1. See chapter VI.
231 10 & 21/10/46.
232 AC 3/4/47.
233 Moran : 138.
The Church also sought to encourage a high pitch of emotionalism by purely religious means. Never did "exalted enthusiasm" reach a higher pitch than in the welcome accorded Polding on his return to Sydney from Europe early in 1843: Gipps remarked upon the display in his despatches, which generally avoided mention of religion, and a Passionist missionary accompanying the Bishop's party said that in Italy only the Pope would be so honoured. Most interesting of all, these secular displays merged into the "singular" pomp with which Holy Week was celebrated immediately afterwards. Polding, for all his personal humility and simplicity, knew very well the effect of building up a highly charged religious atmosphere:

To suppose that the cold forms of Protestantism can ever have effect on our abandoned population is absurd. Zeal amounting to enthusiasm is required. So long as Methodism does not come in, we have no rival to fear ... 

The Bishop did not hesitate to invent ritual when he

234 HRA XXII : 598; Thorpe : 208.
235 Moran : 430.
felt the occasion to demand some special celebration. McEncroe, again true to his part, mishandled the facts of religion more grossly. A pamphlet he wrote depicted Calvin as a Sodomite, Elizabeth a sex-craved infidel, and the Reformation inspired by their passions. It is possible that the teaching of vulgar Catholicism rested heavily on such propositions.

The facts of Australian history were also distorted - deliberately to create a heroic mystique and incidentally to encourage feeling at odds with integration. The most fascinating chapter in this story concerns the fate of some consecrated bread supposedly left in Sydney by Jeremiah Flynn, a priest deported from Sydney in 1817 after a few months' service. Ullathorne described the 'miraculous' preservation of the bread in The Catholic Mission in Australasia, and played upon this theme to work up enthusiasm at St Patrick's stone-laying, perhaps on other occasions also. Later historians have found grave inaccuracies in his

237 Cf Fogarty : 418.
238 The Wanderings of the Human Mind ... : 80, 86, etc.
239 Liverpool, 1837 (F2392). Cf Inglis, H.S. : VIII, 239 seq; AC 27/8/40.
account. Similarly, Catholic spokesmen over-stressed the early troubles of the Church in Australia. It was absurd to say in 1841, even at a St Patrick's Day dinner:

If, sir, I for one moment take a retrospective view of my religion in this colony, from the days of Father Harold and Dixon until the present hour, what do I perceive during that period but one continued scene of cruelty and dire oppression.

Father Therry frequently invoked this species of battle-cry, which must have had a strong effect upon those whose memories of Ireland were fresh. But Polding, we have already mentioned, exaggerated the degree of erstwhile persecution during his trip to Europe in 1841-42; and it was Murphy's party who objected to his doing so, even refusing to help Duncan defend the Bishop from the anti-Catholic press. Nor was Duncan himself free from the common tendency: "we almost seem as if we still groaned under the

240 AC 18/3/41. Harold, like Dixon, was transported after the rising of 1798.

241 Cf LE 26/10/42. That he also went so far along the road of liberal theology was paradoxical, but not uncharacteristic.

242 Duncan, Appeal: 5; AC 10 & 11/41.
rigour of the penal laws" the first *Chronicle* told its readers. The Sydney branch of the Catholic Institute set sail on a flood of rather maudlin memories and fears; the days of persecution were invoked even at the hearing of a libel action brought by a Catholic priest against the *Colonist* newspaper. "A handful of priests ... a host of prejudices ... a want of means" were the elements stressed by the *Chronicle* when it sought to inspire Catholics with a sense of the similarity between the Australian Church and that founded by the Apostles.

Occasionally the Church appeared guilty of deliberate dissimulation. Thus the prospectus of the Melbourne St Patrick's Society disclaimed any religious allegiance, and sought the membership of both Protestant and Catholic Irishmen; yet members attended the opening of St Francis' and the celebration

---


244 Kenny : 177 seq.

245 Col 13/7/39.

246 AC 25/9/44.

247 *Code of Laws* (F4143).
of High Mass there; and apparently acted on Goold's direction when upholding the Irish orphans. When protesting to the legislature against the Procession Bill the Holy Guild claimed to be little more than "a mere benefit society"; yet not only was investiture semi-religious, but Duncan had earlier said that it offered "certain advantages peculiar to the Roman Catholic Church". Such equivocation lends weight to the Protestant charge that the Church hoped to attract converts by opening her Temperance societies to all.

A correspondent of the Colonial Observer alleged that Rigney administered the pledge from the altar: certainly his society met in the Illawarra Church, an odd procedure for a group proud of its Protestant support. This same district, a Catholic stronghold, was where Caroline Chisholm settled several small farmers: was

---

248 Mackle: 30-31.
249 Moran: 731.
250 AC 14/10/46.
251 WR 29/11/45.
252 2/12/41 (letter from G.U.A.).
253 AC 28/1/41.
254 Cf Kiddle: 67.
she quite so impartial after all? The answer remains unknown, but certainly her Catholic supporters spoke with two voices. At a public meeting in August '47 McEncroe affirmed that the Catholic clergy as a body "had nothing whatever to do with Mrs Chisholm's mission"; some months later a Chronicle editorial said very nearly the direct opposite.

Did the Church harbour any desire to achieve predominance in Australia? A somewhat unreal question, but one to which our study must lead. Three passages from homeward letters suggest that the idea was within the bounds of contemplation. "We only want priests to make this country Catholic", Polding wrote after detailing the tremendous progress achieved in his early months in Australia. This comment might have sprung from mere exuberance, but not so the Bishop's evaluation of why a territorial hierarchy should be formed. He emphasised

255 AC 11/8/47.
257 Birt : I, 292.
the utmost importance that the Holy See take first possession of the principal towns as seats of episcopal jurisdiction. The first possession gives an incalculable advantage; and in the minds of vast numbers will form a plausible reason for continuing in schism in case that first possession be taken by the Bishops of the Anglican sect.

Polding's words apparently fell on receptive ears: Rome anticipated Lambeth in appointing Bishops to Adelaide, Perth, and (when the Imperial Government planned a settlement in the Northern Territory) Victoria Harbour. The third letter, from H.G. Gregory's sister, a Benedictine nun, was the most forthright of all. "Here, if anywhere, we see our holy faith practised in its primitive fervour," she wrote in March '48, "there is no doubt but that the country will become entirely Catholic." Sister Gregory had just arrived in the colony and was probably elated beyond reason by the Sconce-Makinson conversions; on the other hand, her brother's thoughts might have informed her artless pen.

If this account has at times appeared to deny the right of Catholics to pursue their religion without restraint, the following chapter will disclose

that contemporary Orangemen would have found it far too lenient. Some of their violent accusations might even have deserved more serious attention than they here receive. In any case, the behaviour of the Catholic Church remained peculiarly antagonistic to the conservative view of society. Encouraging liberalism or - by asserting her own autonomy - denying it, she always offended Broughton and his like.
VI PROTESTANTISM

The Quality of Protestantism

The disrupting effects of Protestantism were essentially like those of the Roman Catholic Church. It too encouraged liberalism, fomented ill-feeling within the community, provoked assertion against English tradition and certain types of authority. Yet if the destination was similar, the route differed. Signposts were obscure and often contradictory; the vistas less colourful. There is a great breadth of material relevant to this chapter - Jews and low-Church Anglicans mix with Presbyterians, Methodists, Independents (Congregationalists), Baptists, and sectaries - but rarely does it achieve a satisfying depth. Australian conditions made little distinctive contribution to Protestant development; the sublime issues of the Reformation arise in a form so imitative and limited as to approach the ridiculous.

Every denomination mentioned above had established itself in both colonies by 1835 and - aided in highly varying degree by the Church Act - continued steadily to expand. The basic facts of this progress are set
out in the census statistics quoted in the introduction, and a multitude of church histories. This institutional achievement was not unimpressive, but cannot be detailed here. However, a few marginal notes are necessary to its appreciation.

Bible and Tract societies, so much disliked by the Catholics, had solid support throughout the colonies. A few attempts were made by Methodists and Presbyterians to establish such groups on a denominational basis, but far more powerful were the local auxiliaries of the 'British and Foreign' organisations, which had the support of virtually all Protestants. Apart from a check in the depression years, these groups flourished consistently, so that by 1849 Bible societies had risen so far afield as Bathurst and Goulburn, while in 1850 no less than 12,650 tracts were broadcast throughout Sydney.

1 See the bibliographies in the various relevant articles in the AE.

2 The Hobart Town Almanack ... 1838, Hobart 1838 (F2520) : 48; J. Colwell, The Illustrated History of Methodism, Sydney 1904 : 225, 264.

3 SMH 16/1/50; Report of the Australian Religious Tract Society, for the year ending 31st December 1850, Sydney 1850.
Sunday Schools flourished similarly. The Methodists gave them particular attention, forming an independent 'Union', the rest usually pooled their resources.

The churches' role in primary education is but partly told in our introductory statistics. In V.D.L. Protestants consistently supported the British and Foreign Schools Society system, applauding its practice and regretting Denison's decision to adopt a quasi-denominational plan. One consequence of this change was the establishment in Hobart of a society to propagate the principles of the British and Foreign scheme. This had been the object of the Australian Schools Society founded in the mid-'thirties in Sydney, and which for some years had run its own school. Overall however the N.S.W. Protestants did not find a consistent policy, later (except for the Methodists)

---

4 A separate report on this work was sent home to London each year. See the published Minutes, F4434, 4950, 5238-39-40-41.

5 Cf SMH 6/11/47; HTC 19/1/50.


7 HTC 3/11/49.

8 Cf F2700.

9 Cf SMH 11/9/44.
supporting the Irish system. John Wesley's followers also struck out by establishing grammar schools in both capitals in 1839. Several Presbyterian ministers - most notably J.D. Lang, Henry Carmichael, and James Forbes - were active in developing good secondary schools, although building on a broader theological basis than their own creeds. The Hobart Town High School, eventually begun in 1850, was another Protestant creation.

The heathen were not forgotten. J.D. Lang organised a group of German missionaries who worked among the aborigines at Moreton Bay; the London Missionary Society had a station in the west of N.S.W.; the Methodists established the 'Buntingdale' mission

10 Col 23/2/39 (Domestic); CT 4/1/39.

11 For Lang and Carmichael see G.H. Nadel, Australia's Colonial Culture : passim.

12 E. Sweetman, Victoria's First Public Educationist, Melbourne 1939.

13 Cf A. Gilchrist : John Dunmore Lang, chiefly autobiographical ... documents : 303, 378-9; evidence of W. Schmidt, Aborigines Committee, LC 31/10/45.

14 Led by L.E. Threlkeld, for whom see B.W. Champion, Lancelot Edward Threlkeld, RAHSJ : XXV, 279 seq, 341 seq.
near Geelong, and the Baptists a school at Merri Creek outside Melbourne. All unsuccessful, these efforts lacked neither devoted servants nor lay support. Congregationalists in V.D.L. made tentative efforts to minister to the island's rapidly dwindling native population. Moreover, the great British missionary organisations had considerable local backing. The British and Foreign Aborigines Protection Society; the London Missionary Society; the Wesleyan Missionary Society - all had active admirers. The Wesleyan Society in Hobart once collected £583.13.5d. in twelve months; in Sydney, at the nadir of the depression, a single meeting of the L.M.S. auxiliary raised £113.0.3½d. Even such recondite organisations as the Society for Promoting Christianity among the Jews and the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East had their devotees in V.D.L.

15 C.S. Ross, Colonization and Church Work in Victoria, Melbourne 1891: 313 seq. See also evidence of J. Ham, Committee on Aborigines and Protectorate, LC 4/9/49.

16 F. Miller/London Missionary Society, 6/12/44: Australian Correspondence, LMS papers (microfilm CNL).

17 HTC 24/11/37; SMH 26/8/42.

18 F5541; Tasmanian Auxiliary to the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Report for 1850, Launceston 1851.
We have already mentioned several examples of Protestant unity. Further notable instances were maintaining churches for seamen, and the conduct of several journals - Sydney Protestant Magazine (1840-41), True Catholic (Hobart 1843), Gleaner (Sydney 1847-48), Christian Standard (Sydney 1848). Clerics of one denomination would sometimes fill the pulpits of another, without anyone showing concern. This process culminated in V.D.L. with the establishment (1844) of an Evangelical Union on "the broad principles of biblical Christianity". Melbourne followed suit in 1847, but Sydney failed to do so although the Tasmanian example was held up for emulation. Congregationalists were particularly active in this cause.

Lay societies were numerous, their chief purpose being to raise funds for building churches and
paying clergy. Sometimes they took on the functions of Benefit Societies, or adult education. Other groups concentrated on philanthropic work; occasionally restricted to fellow-believers, more often extended to all.

Outside the major Protestant denominations were several smaller groups of earnest believers. Between 1832 and 1837 two notable Quaker missionaries, James Backhouse and G.W. Walker travelled throughout the Australian colonies, establishing permanent groups in Sydney and Hobart. Walker settled permanently in the latter city, much to its benefit. Apart from his endeavours, however, Quakers made little impression. An English Mormon named William Barrett was appointed to Sydney in 1842, and three years later that faith

23 E.g. the Congregational Christian Instruction and Benefit Society (Launceston); the Protestant Benefit Society (Sydney 1842, chiefly Presbyterian); Wesleyan Union Benefit Society (Hobart 1846).

24 E.g. Methodist libraries at Hobart and Sydney, James Forbes' work.

25 E.g. society for relief of distressed Presbyterian immigrants (Sydney 1839).

26 E.g. Methodist Strangers' Friend societies; the Presbyterian Female Visiting Society, Melbourne 1845.
had eleven adherents; late in 1851 large-scale "Mormon Mania" swept Sydney. In May 1850 some Unitarians had met together in Sydney; a couple of weeks earlier German Lutherans resident in Melbourne had planned to obtain a minister of their faith. Several clergymen gathered hybrid congregations. Thus the pioneer Baptist minister at Moreton Bay formed a 'United Evangelical Church'; the Presbyterian Alexander Laurie received a call at Portland from a group which included Catholics as well as every species of Protestant; Rev. Thomas Atkins, an Anglican, ministered to Presbyterians, Independents and Baptists and his own co-religionists at a 'Free' Church in Balmain, Sydney.

27 Information supplied by Mormon historical secretariat, U.S.A.
29 SMH 18/5/50.
30 Argus 26/4/50.
31 A. Hay, Jubilee Memorial of the Presbyterian Church of Queensland, Brisbane 1900: 6.
32 Laurie Papers: Public Library of Victoria.
Only one unorthodox sect made any real impact, that of John Wroe, an Englishman who preached a version of Christian Israelism. Contemporaries linked the Wroeites creed with those of Joanna Southcote, the Plymouth Brethren, and Mormonism, but probably the most accurate description was this:

They say that, according to an ancient prophecy during the Mosaic Dispensation, that the Jews who were the chosen people of God, before they forfeited the Divine favour by their rejection and crucifixion of our blessed Saviour, were, in the latter days of the world, to be gathered from all quarters of the earth and incorporated in one elect body, of which those bearded fanatics either pretend or really believe they are the precursors.

Wroe's prohibition on shaving, referred to in this paragraph, caused his followers to be widely known as "beardies". He also forbade conventional doctoring and imposed rules concerning food, drink, and clothing.

---

34 The only substantial commentary on Wroe is in the Dictionary of National Biography.

35 Port Phillip Herald (F3064) 5/3/44; A. Stackhouse, Eight Lectures on the Signs of the Times, Launceston 1849 : 68; HTC 27/11/47.

36 Age 14/2/46.

37 SMH 11/10/50 (report of death of Wroeite who followed this rule).

38 Private Communications given to John Wroe, volume III, Gravesend 1853 : 38, 550.
A disciple of Wroe's, one Charles Robertson, came to Australia in the late 'thirties, and soon the press was noticing the fanaticism he aroused. An impressive figure, Robertson worked with such effect that the message spread to Port Phillip and V.D.L., and the authorities considered taking legal action to check its excesses. In 1843-44 the Master himself visited N.S.W., addressing many meetings in Sydney and the surrounding country districts. Happily Wroe believed that the "Private Communications" granted him by the Almighty should be recorded, so we have unusually exact knowledge of what happened on these occasions. The dominant impression is of mumbo-jumbo and vast excitement, relying heavily on sexual allusions. Thus at Penrith one Harriet Hoe discarded all restraint:

39 The first noticed is AC 10/3/40.
40 Cf J. Hood, Australia and the East : 240.
41 In addition to other references see Port Phillip Christian Herald (F4366) 3/8/49; Ross : 336.
42 AC 13/10/40; Col Ob 13/1/42 (News of the Week).
43 Private Communications : 20-21; the tour generally : 13 seq.
She ran through a field near the bush, and there she stripped herself quite naked, except her shoes and stockings .... When near the house, she walked as upright as possible. Many friends were in the house when she entered; she began dancing and said she never danced before .... Her sinews were quite contracted, and her skin wrinked up.

On remarking Wroe's departure from Sydney in February 144, John McGarvie commented that the Australians had been "too 'cute for him". Nevertheless the creed lived on, and in 1850 Wroe returned. "If I had displeasure in England, it is not so here"; he wrote home, "for the Lord says his prophet is not without honour, save in his own country." Chapels arose at Melbourne, Sydney, Geelong, Liverpool and Penrith: perhaps his Australian disciples numbered a thousand or more. The sect survives still in Australia.

It is relatively easy to give a quantitative statement of Protestant strength - the number of adherents, of churches, of schools, and of clerics.

44 30/1/44 : ML MS A2062.
45 Private Communications : 563; the tour generally : 507 seq.
46 As above.
But can we measure the dynamism of the different groups and their influence within society? It is a hard task, but some general impressions might now be advanced.

The history of Presbyterianism in N.S.W. was marked by a long succession of internal quarrels. Most divisions within Protestantism sprang from enthusiasm. Men only dispute when they feel deeply, and having done so will apply themselves all the harder. These generalisations were broadly applicable to N.S.W. Presbyterians, but their quarrels ran particularly deep. Was the local Church a representative of the Scottish establishment, upholding authority against the rigours of social change and spiritual innovation? Or was it primarily a loose confederation of evangelicals, crying out against all corruption? McGarvie was the incarnation of the former view, J.D. Lang of the other. Until these antipathies were resolved, Presbyterianism could not adopt a distinctive character and influence. In V.D.L. these strains had far less importance for Rev. James Lillie, the dominant Presbyterian in the island, succeeded wonderfully well in combining the McGarvie-Lang
positions. Before 1850 the Church remained pretty well united, and very active in both the secular and spiritual worlds.

Although numerically weaker than Presbyterianism, Methodism moved more hearts more deeply. Detailed figures of Church activity suggest that a notably high proportion of nominal adherents attended regular service, enabled to do so by many lay-preachers serving in small chapels and occasional places of worship. It is interesting that the N.S.W. Methodists, like Roman Catholics, petitioned for re-distribution of state-aid according to changing census figures: had Polding's forebodings about Methodism come true? Certainly this group had succeeded in arousing "zeal,

---

48 In N.S.W. in 1849 there were 2,615 full members, 58 chapels, 106 other preaching places, 17 clergy, 6 catechists, 43 day-school teachers, 418 Sunday-school teachers, 113 local preachers, 175 class leaders, 63 Sunday-schools, 3,557 Sunday scholars, 27 day-schools, 1,657 day scholars, and 12,340 persons on average attending weekly service: see Minutes of the Thirty First Annual Meeting, Sydney 1849: 66. In V.D.L. in 1850 there were 831 full members, 43 places of worship, 6 clergy, 147 Sunday-school teachers, 27 local preachers, 56 class leaders, 1,276 Sunday scholars, and 4,950 average attenders: see C.C. Dugan, A Century of Tasmanian Methodism 1820-1920, Hobart 1920: 50-51.

49 HRA XXV: 383 seq.
amounting to enthusiasm". In the early 'forties, Sydney and nearby districts were swept by classic Methodist revivalism of which "the fruit soon appeared in changed lives, in earnest work for Jesus, and in cheerful giving to His cause." At other times and other places this fervour manifested itself in various 'primitive' forms.

The most notable Methodist leader was Rev. W.B. Boyce, Superintendent in N.S.W. from 1846. His future father-in-law was G.W. Allen, shining light of the Sydney laity. Early Tasmanian Methodism owed much to the labours of Revs. Joseph Orton and Nathaniel Turner: the private papers of both reveal utterly selfless devotion. Allen's counterpart in the island was Henry Reed of Launceston. "He is a wonderful trophy of saving mercy", Turner wrote, "and flames with loving zeal for the salvation of perishing men."


51 ML MSS A1714-15-18-19; A1835-36-37-38. See also AE (Orton) and J.G. Turner, The Pioneer Missionary, Melbourne 1872.

52 ML MS A1836 : 399-400.
Congregationalism was markedly more powerful in the smaller colony, probably through the chief ministers' personal quality. Frederick Miller (Hobart), Charles Price (Launceston), and that "man of colossal intellect", John West, were a splendid trio. Among their achievements were the Evangelical Union, and a Home Mission Society which maintained a few itinerant clergymen. One of these, Joseph Beazley, reported in 1837 that "the attention and seriousness in every place where the word is preached is equal to anything I ever witnessed." Tasmanian Independency also gained much from the generosity of a very wealthy merchant, Henry Hopkins. Inter alia he provided the money for Miller to come to Hobart, and Melbourne's first minister, William Waterfield, to go thither. His reward was great: the dedication of West's History. Another Hobart merchant, Frederick

53 Cf W. Moss in The Principles and History of Independency, Melbourne 1879: 79 seq.
54 H. Button, Flotsam and Jetsam: 59.
56 Principles and History: 81 seq.
Haller, was also a generous supporter. There were notable names among the Sydney laity too: John Fairfax, David Jones, and Ambrose Foss, while J.P. Fawkner straddled both colonies. The leading Independent clergy in Sydney, Robert Ross and Barzillai Quaife, were not nonentities, but failed to generate a pervasive influence.

Baptism never achieved more than marginal importance. Rev. John Saunders, clergyman in Sydney 1834-1847, was far more important as a Temperance pioneer than as a theologian or church-builder. He was a very sane, intelligent man, representing one side of his Church's character; the layman John McKaeg, who pioneered Baptism in Sydney and continued to hold meetings of his own followers after Saunders' arrival, represented another. "This man possessed the gift of uncommon good lungs, and voluntarily crying;" acidly reported one commentator, who nevertheless witnessed McKaeg's attraction over Samuel Terry. A group of Particular Baptists had their own organisation in Port

---

57 A.L.F. The History of Samuel Terry ..., London 1838 (F2645) : 10-11.
Phillip by 1850, but the Melbourne Church and those in V.D.L. generally followed the Saunders model.

Men do not join obscure groups unless they feel deeply. Thus Unitarians, Quakers, Mormons and Wroeites, even though few in number, deserve some recognition. Nor should we overlook the handful of men who have left evidence of overwhelming personal experience: Samuel Newham, an ex-convict, who found salvation among the Tasmanian Methodists; John Wilcox, a British soldier serving in V.D.L., tormented as to whether salvation could be found in the Church of England, however low; John Davis, a working class Presbyterian so distressed by the heresies of Wroe and Mormonism that he took up his pen to refute them. Undoubtedly there was a hard


59 J.A. Manton, The Good Shepherd, Hobart 1849 (F5124).

60 A. Hackhouse, The Successful Pole-Climber. A Memoir of John Wilcox, London 1859. In fact the author's name was Stackhouse.

61 Cf F5335; The Bible as a History Consistent with Itself, Sydney 1873; and his work on Mormonism. Other publications of this type were The Touchstone, By a Labouring Mechanic, Sydney 1850 (F5415); A Christmas Offering from Australia, Sydney 1850 (F5315); The Christian Citizen (F5316a).
core of believers absolutely devoted to their faith.

Lamentably few contemporaries tried to estimate the power of Protestantism. Both Arthur and Denison commended the influence of Methodism among the poor; Gipps commended the effect of the Church Acts in promoting religion generally. John West's experience led him to take an optimistic view:

The tendency of small communities is not unfavourable to the progress of religious denominations. The only interruption to the monotony of life is found in the church: the only association which can be readily offered to strangers is provided by the religious bond. Opinion acts with increased power where the social inequalities are slight.

A similar theme appeared in the verdict of T.H. Braim, low-church Anglican: "the public feeling is all on the side of the form of religion, how much of the power exists among us, the searchers of hearts alone can tell." Dozens of statements showed that many devout

62 For a recent analysis see Nadel: 239 seq.
63 HRA XVIII: 490.
64 W. Denison, Varieties of Vice-Regal Life: I, 138 seq.
65 HRA XXI: 219.
66 The History of Tasmania: I, 214.
67 A History of New South Wales: I, 169
believers felt that "power" was singularly lacking. Such evidence was often untrustworthy, but probably not the recollection of David Blair, disciple of Lang and future historian, that Sydney in 1850 had many chapels and churches but also thousands of citizens quite untouched by religious feeling.

Protestant denominations were effective only within the cities and the agricultural areas. The pastoral hinterland presented difficulties far beyond the power of such tiny groups to solve. Thus derived the general tendency for religion of this type to be more influential in V.D.L. than N.S.W. For the rest, our generalisations must become even vaguer. Around that hard core of believers already mentioned was a penumbra, inhabited by persons moved by habit, goodwill, and uncertainty. So Protestantism could summon a sizable number to its banners and exercise a powerful influence in public affairs. The way in which it faced up to the problems of colonial life would palpably effect the resolution of those problems.

Self-Will Rampant

The great Protestant Reformers no more believed in the divinity of individual judgement than did their hated adversary. Nevertheless the paramount result of the Reformation was to encourage that self-will so abhorred by Broughton. Its peak was reached in the mid-nineteenth century. In the Australian colonies, as throughout the world, Protestants then constantly battled against restraint, both secular and spiritual, on the practice of their religion. Passing from denomination to denomination we will notice three major themes in this story: the resistance to any suggestion of spiritual hierarchy; antipathy to control from Britain; and antipathy to control by the state.

As already suggested, Presbyterianism in N.S.W. suffered many internal strains. The Lang-McGarvie quarrel began in the early 'thirties, and Lang's chief achievement during his visit to Britain in 1836-37 was to gather nine ministers and fifteen school-teachers, with whom he planned to re-assert supremacy. Returning

---

69 Gilchrist: 308 seq. Throughout the following paragraphs footnotes have been reduced to a minimum as the facts are well-known. Other than Gilchrist, see J. Cameron, Centenary History of the Presbyterian Church in New South Wales, 2 vols, Sydney 1905.
to N.S.W. at the end of 1837, Lang quickly disputed McGarvie's compliance with the recently-passed 'temporalities' Act, by which the local church was recognised only as a branch of the Church of Scotland. The latter had long claimed jurisdiction over the colonial Church, although to date the question had remained academic. Now Lang chose this as a field of battle, and when defeated withdrew from the main body to form the independent Synod of New South Wales. The Scottish Church bewailed such "violation of presbyterian order" and advised the government not to grant the break-aways state aid. Gipps, however, had already made a provisional step in this direction, and Lang returned to Europe to secure the rights of his Synod. In his absence, however, the colonial churchmen reached a compromise, and the Synod of Australia resulted (October 1840). Although remaining officially connected with the Church of Scotland, this new body emphasised its complete independence of jurisdiction.

Lang did not long accept the compromise. For years past an admirer of the theory of voluntaryism, he announced in February 1842 that he could no longer
accept state aid in good conscience. He therefore broke away once more, although not until the end of the decade did another Synod of New South Wales gather round him. Meanwhile the famous 'Disruption' of the Church of Scotland itself - the break-away of those who were not prepared to accept state interference in church affairs - had repercussions in the colony. Although not directly involved, many local churchmen felt they must testify their sympathy with the disruptors by repudiating all connection with the Church of Scotland. During 1843-44 there were some tentative moves to have the Church Acts amended to allow aid being given to these 'Free' Churchmen, while the Synod tried to work out a compromise satisfactory to all. By 1846 however the failure of these moves became plain and the 'Synod of Eastern Australia' broke away from the parent body. Like the Free Churchmen in Scotland they preferred to repudiate all state aid rather than compromise the purity of their belief.

70 V & P 10/10/43 (Lang moves Bill to this effect); Col Ob 23 & 30/5/44; V & P daily proceeding 6 & 7/44 (petitions to this effect, none printed); The Voice in the Wilderness (F4430), 15/5/46, 1/6/46 (this journal was the organ of Free Church opinion in N.S.W.).
Similar complications tangled the progress of the Church in Port Phillip. A local Presbytery within the Synod of Australia was formed in 1842, and quickly bridled under control from Sydney. In 1847 James Forbes established a one-man 'Free Presbyterian Synod of Australia Felix' in sympathy with the disruptors. That year also saw the arrival in Melbourne of Rev. A.M. Ramsay, originally a member of the United Presbyterian Church, and so the representative of a long tradition of voluntaryist belief and hostility to the established Church of Scotland. His attitudes found much favour, and in January 1850 Ramsay attracted together a motley bunch of clergy to form the 'United Presbyterian Church of Victoria'. These men, as one historian has remarked, "ventured forth on a home made creed of their own."

Tasmanian Presbyterians did not wholly avoid such troubles. In the mid-'thirties the believers in Hobart quarrelled over the morality and ministrations

---

71 F.R.M. Wilson, Memoir of the Reverend Irving Hetherington, Melbourne 1876 : 111 seq.

72 F.M. Bradshaw, Scottish Seceders in Australia, Melbourne 1947 : 17.
of the leading parson, Rev. Archibald McArthur, only a few continuing to attend his services. A number among the rest disliked the majority's decision to appeal to the Church of Scotland for recognition and support in the mid-'thirties. The disruption had sufficient effect to force a statement proclaiming judicial independence from the Church of Scotland, and a flurry of resignations when this stand was apparently modified. In Launceston a 'Free' congregation formed, independent of ministerial leadership.

The internal history of Methodism is more interesting and less complex. The great problem was how to restrain the enthusiasm of many devout laymen. Discontent was first expressed in Hobart in 1837-38,

---


74 Heyer: 59 seq.

75 By the Church's protest against Nixon's Consistorial Court scheme, in the course of which the connection with the Church of Scotland was emphasised. See LE 26/8/46 (letter of "Anti-Mormon"), 7/11/46 (meeting of presbytery).

76 F4812; Heyer: 62 seq.
an erstwhile London lay-preacher named William Barnett leading a 'Wesleyan Association' hostile to both the parent body and its local representatives. Orton lamented that "methodistically seditious publications" aroused disaffection, especially among class leaders and Sunday School teachers. "The people here ...", he reported, "are like tinder prepared to ignite at every falling spark of radicalism." Such sentiment spread to Launceston, as Orton discovered when he referred the congregation there to a decision of British headquarters as a reason for adopting a particular liturgy. Their reply so bluntly scorned this argument that the District ministers protested:

Such a right of dictation as is assumed in the document before us as to the mode of conducting the worship of God, would be an undue interference with the scriptural rights of a minister of Christ, and an infringement on the rules of our connection, the operation of which would be as injurious as the bounds might be indefinite.

---

77 Cf Dugan : 39. Whether this was simply an extension of the British 'Wesleyan Association' is uncertain.

78 Letter to E. Hoole, 16/8/37 : ML MS A1719. See generally his correspondence at this time.

79 Dugan : 61.
Nathaniel Turner finally repaired the quarrel with the Association, which had established its own chapel, in 1840. He apparently brought to the problem a less rigid devotion to the ordinances of the home Conference.

These events were not matched in Sydney until 1842 when an "unnatural and disgraceful schism effected by two or three unreasonable men" gravely disturbed the official Methodist body. These break-aways styled themselves 'Australian Methodists' and so for a while were remarkably active in Sydney and nearby rural areas, even having separate schools. One of the dissenters was Nathaniel Pidgeon, revealed by his autobiography as a street-corner evangelist of classic type, subject to "the shouting influence" and capable of whipping up fanatic enthusiasm. Restriction on such lay-preaching was one influence prompting the establishment of the Australian Methodists; another the feeling

80 Cf CT 10/3/40; ML MS A1836 : 407.
81 Meeting of 15/9/42, ML MS A2806.
84 Pidgeon : 31-32.
that as the clergy were maintained by grants from either Britain or the local treasury, they were dangerously irresponsible to lay control. Even Pidgeon balked at the invective cast upon both British and colonial clergy; tryannous though the former were, the Australian Methodists told their sympathisers at home, the latter went even further in demanding absolute obedience, and were avaricious money-grubbers besides.

J.D. Lang sought to persuade the legislature to recognise the validity of marriages and baptisms conducted by the new sect. He failed, however, and so vanished any possibility of state aid being offered in that quarter. The group had its own troubles, and evidently died out by the end of the decade. By then

85 SMH 21/2/42 (statement of J. Byrnes), 26/3/42 (advertisement signed W. Rowe); The Teetotaller (F3514) 12/3/42.

86 Col 0b 8/8/44 (statement of J. Garrett).

87 Col 0b 20/6/44.

88 There appears to have been no link between this group and the Australian Methodists in South Australia for whom see D.H. Pike, Paradise of Dissent : 264.
the "disaffection" of other Primitive Methodists had bothered the N.S.W. Conference, and a few chapels of this persuasion arose. A particularly boisterous 'Wesleyan Association' flourished in Melbourne.

Reluctantly the official body in Sydney relaxed its rules against street-preaching and camp-meetings, both conducive to extremism.

The Independents' form of church organisation has always been suspect of encouraging the tyranny of congregation over minister. Just as frequently the charge has been rebutted - most notably in this time and place by John West. The case of William Jarrett, pioneer of this denomination in Sydney, provided powerful evidence for the former view. Friction arose between the two parties during 1835, Jarrett being accused of

89 Cf Hunter River report, meeting of 31/3/45: ML MS A2806.


93 The Voluntary Support of the Christian Ministry Alone Scriptural and Defensible, Hobart 1849.
reading his sermons "and that by no means in an animated strain", failure to make himself comprehensible to the less learned of his flock, and an imperious manner towards all. This dissatisfaction boiled over when the minister married a young woman who not only was outside the Church but - "she had been gay". The congregation dissolved the connection, and in his Farewell Discourse Jarrett passed some bitter remarks concerning persecution, slander and disbelief. Barzillai Quaife had a similar unhappy experience.

There were many lesser incidents pertaining to this theme, J.D. Lang himself incurring some criticism from his congregation. One earnest Christian even impugned so flexible an organisation as the Quakers': personal revelation was all, and anything which intervened between the individual and God deplorable.

94 Letters of W.P. Crook, 8/35, 25/11/35, 24/2/38; and of Threlkeld, 18/3/37: LMS Australian correspondence.

95 Letter of Crook and others, 12/4/38: LMS Australian correspondence.

96 Sydney, 1838.

97 B. Quaife, The Vindicator, Sydney 1865: 15 seq.

98 SMH 2/3/42.

99 The Touchstone, By a Labouring Mechanic.
However the detailing of such minor eruptions is less profitable than a brief study of Protestantism within the Church of England. For although the Catholic influence of Broughton and Nixon percolated deep into their Church, it failed to conquer a solid wedge of Low-Church sentiment. On the contrary, the presence of this enemy incited Protestant Anglicans to battle.

In consequence it was Nixon, the sterner authoritarian, who first experienced real difficulties with his clergy. As noticed in chapter I, an important factor in that Bishop's quarrel with Eardley-Wilmot was his attempt to discipline two chaplains, Thomas Wigmore and Gregory Bateman. Doctrinal differences, personal malice and mutual obstinacy combined to cause Nixon to attempt arbitrary dictation of the ministers' movements, while they more or less successfully appealed to the Governor for protection. Even some of the High Church clergy reproved the Bishop's procedure. Further trouble arose between Nixon and the senior

100 Most conveniently documented in Ecclesiastical Jurisdiction Papers (part I), HC 25/3/50. This also describes the Bedford quarrel.

101 LE 21/5/45.
chaplain, William Bedford; at one stage the latter refused to hand over the key of the cathedral to his superior! In 1847 Bedford broke his life-long rule against joining multi-denominational societies, declaring that support of the Bible Society was necessary to check the encroachment of Puseyism.

The Rev. James Edmondston, an enthusiastic critic of episcopal power, had pursued a long quarrel with Broughton during the mid-'forties, but it was not until the Sconce-Makinson conversions to Rome that the Sydney diocese suffered a real crisis. William Woolls, a future clergyman, then issued two pamphlets which attacked Tractarianism generally as "a step ... towards re-establishing Popish notion of merit and the doctrine of Justification by works"; and the offertory as a means of raising a fund which would render the Priest independent of his flock. Woolls wanted the laity to have some say in the

102 Atlas 5/6/47.

103 See his Proceedings ..., London 1848 (F4755), and letter, CO 201/437 : 204-05.

104 A Tract for the Times, Parramatta 1849 : 19, passim; also his Postscript to the Tract for the Times (F5253).
election of Bishops, and for the Church to move closer towards other Protestant groups. Several congregations showed their sympathy with such attitudes.

Broughton's disciplining of F.T.C. Russell for having publicly criticised the Tractarian influence within the Church provided another important occasion for the demonstration of Low-Anglican feeling. Similarly the report of the Bishops' Conference in 1850 sparked off demonstrations in Hobart (opening a new chapter in an increasingly bitter struggle between the two factions); while even in Melbourne, Perry's firm Protestantism was insufficient to ward off all criticism of the general tone of the episcopal proceedings.

Meanwhile steps had been taken in both Melbourne and Sydney to found a 'Free' Church of England. Although

105 Atlas 18/3/48 (report of plan to establish a 'low' Australian Church Society); 6/5/48 (Parramatta); 27/5/48 (Liverpool).

106 SMH 6/12/49; F.T.C. Russell, Statement ..., Sydney 1849.


108 Australian 10/3/48 (editorial and letter of 'Laicus'); SMH 28/7/49 (advertisement); Argus 19/12/49 (clergyman said to be on way).
these apparently came to nothing, they were still further evidence of the growing preference for voluntaryism among Protestants. Lang's 'conversion'; Presbyterian sympathy for the Disrupters; the rise of left-wing Methodism: all emphasised this trend. Even within 'official' Methodism, at least in V.D.L., there was a strong feeling that state aid was ruinous. This phenomenon had many significant facts, but none more important than the implied refusal to accept domination from the state in religious matters. Instead the role of the individual believer became yet more effective and immediate.

"The Pride of Equality"

In these words John West effectively described the feeling with which the various Churches insisted on their equal standing before the law. Protestants pursued this ideal no less fervently than Roman Catholics, each of the major denominations making a distinctive contribution to the argument. They

109 Pike : 365.

110 West, History : I, 216.
firmly believed that equality served the cause of Christianity, and certainly it furthered the immediate progress of their respective sects. Nevertheless Broughton's lament that such insistence developed secularism and indifference to ultimate truth was not unsound. Claims to civil rights, the glory of toleration, and abuse of the Church of England, were far more dominant themes in this discussion than the advance of religion. Thus Protestantism further contributed to the defeat of the conservative ideal.

Presbyterians had one tremendously powerful argument ready to advance in this contest: since their faith was established in Scotland, and the colonies were British, their status should be precisely that of local Anglicans. This proposition obviously required close connection between colonial Presbyterians and the Church of Scotland. As a natural consequence of the situation already explained it had incomparably greater strength in V.D.L. than N.S.W., and there reached a much higher intellectual level. In 1835 a meeting of the Hobart laity petitioned the Church of Scotland to take the Tasmanian
Church under her jurisdiction, to send out ministers, and to dispute any Anglican claim to ascendancy in the colonies. In this year too a school-teacher named James Thomson issued a pamphlet, *Remarks on the Status of the Presbyterian Church in the British Colonies*. He emphasised that as a matter of historical fact, statute law determined what was the established religion of Britain from time to time; in the absence of any such legislation directly pertaining to the colonies, the common tendency to give particular privilege to the Church of England had no constitutional foundation. Rather some Imperial Acts had deliberately recognised dual establishment - for example one which decreed that official chaplains in South Australia should be either Presbyterian or Anglican.

Thomson and his fellows must have been well pleased when in August 1836 the legislature endorsed the principle that the Churches of England and Scotland

111 F2055. The introductory pages of this pamphlet describe the earlier action of the laity.

112 Heyer: 22.
should enjoy equal standing. Kenneth Snodgrass, himself a Scot, encouraged this claim to equality, but legal intricacies and the arrival of Sir John Franklin thwarted plans to establish it beyond doubt. However the Church Act soon quieted any apprehensions. Meanwhile the Scottish authorities had answered the earlier call for help and through their efforts, in the course of which the approval of the Colonial Office was sought and vouchsafed, John Lillie assumed the post of Moderator.

Soon after his arrival in 1837, Lillie brushed with Archdeacon Hutchins, who attacked dual-establishment as the first stage towards infidelity and the ultimate cessation of all state aid to religion. "This certainly is a grave charge", declared Lillie, no less reluctant to see such things come to pass. But, he emphasised, Hutchins' argument still rested on the false presupposition of Anglicanism having a

113 CO 282/11, meeting of Executive Council 24/4/37; West, History : I, 202 seq.
114 See his correspondence, CO 280/89 : 14 seq.
unique status. In fact, the Presbyterian suggested, Hutchins was abetting the causes he professed to oppose. If the principle of dual-establishment, as set out by Thomson, were denied, the only tenable alternative in law was that no church was established; moreover, religion suffered from any promotion of ill-feeling. These arguments, if not indisputable, were quite sound, but Hutchins must have believed himself vindicated when Lillie (as had Thomson) accepted the principle of state support for the Church of Rome:

We look upon the recent ecclesiastical arrangement as a great experiment, in which two systems of belief, fundamentally opposed to each other, and one of them therefore, necessarily false, are to meet upon equal terms - and no man, who believes in the irresistible energy of truth, when opposed to error, can for a moment doubt the issue.

This was an argument entirely different from that by which dual establishment was upheld. In the following decade Presbyterians went still further on this divergent path by joining with Baptists and Independents to assert "The Equal Legal Status of

116 A Letter : appendix, viii.
all the Churches in the Australian Colonies" against Nixon's Consistorial Court scheme.

By then the Presbyterians in V.D.L. had established themselves as the leaders of a very effective political pressure group. Sometimes it rose to action only on matters directly affecting religion—during 1839, for instance, battles were fought over the replacement of a Presbyterian minister by an Anglican at Oatlands, the occupation of a Church at Bothwell which Hutchins claimed for exclusive use although previously shared, and similarly over the right to a schoolroom at Sorell. Education generally evoked much determined action. As noticed above Dissenters staunchly supported the British and Foreign system of primary education, and emphatically told the legislature so. The Franklin-Gell College plan came under bitter fire from the same quarter, Lillie seeing therein "invidious and degrading distinctions".  

117 This being the title of a pamphlet which embodied Protestant objections, published in Hobart 1851.  

118 J. Thomson, *Vindication of the Presbytery of Van Diemen's Land*, Hobart 1839; Heyer : 21 seq; Bothwell Church papers, LC 26/9/40.  

119 Petition, LC 1/9/40 : 4-5; see also petition, LC 4/9/40.
The Queen's School was no more popular, and probably inspired the Protestants to plan their own secondary school from 1843 onward. Eardley-Wilmot sympathised fully with their position, cutting off aid to the former establishment and encouraging the latter, particularly by promising a grant of land. This Governor's recall disrupted all plans and Denison later granted the land to Hutchins' school! Lillie angrily protested, until Denison offered the site on which the High School soon arose.

The Protestants did not stop short at exercising their influence on these specific issues. Lillie openly threatened Franklin with withdrawal of support from his government, and apparently sided with that Governor's enemies during the period of crisis immediately preceding his recall. This was surely a reaction to Gell's high standing at Government House; conversely Lillie and his followers stood firmly by Eardley-Wilmot, the Anglican's

120 Cf CT 8/5/46.
121 HTC 4 & 18/9/47, 8/12/47.
123 6/43: Boyes' Diary.
arch-enemy. Thus the Observer, launched in 1846 under Frederick Haller's ownership, almost alone had some kind words to say of this unhappy administration, while among Eardley-Wilmot's nominees to replace the 'Patriotic Six' were Henry Hopkins and Henry Reed. Denison was well aware that 'Presbyterians' (Protestants would have been the more accurate description) stood to lose by his educational reforms, and also noticed their influence in Hobart's rudimentary municipal government.

Methodists commonly asserted their claim to equality by emphasising how close they were to the Church of England. Ralph Mansfield regretted that his co-religionists were tabulated in the Census under the general heading of 'Dissenters' since for many it was "a point of conscience, and in some sense, a point of honor, to repudiate the imputation of dissent". Orton particularly was a stickler for both the rights of his Church and "adhesion to the

---

124 The Observer. A Van Diemen's Land Journal of Politics (TSA).

125 Varieties: I, 84, 57.

126 Evidence to Census Bill Committee, LC 14/10/45: 4.
usages and recommendations bearing upon a uniformity with the Established Church. Men who felt thus were naturally aggrieved when Anglicans emphasised the gulf separating the two. Thus "A Friend to Peace and Truth" angrily rejected the charge of H.T. Stiles, the Tractarian priest at Windsor, that all Methodists were schismatics:

where the doctrines of the Church of England are fairly and fully preached to the people, neither Dissenters nor Methodists can make much progress.

By implication, Methodists were truer Anglicans than Stiles and his like.

It was a prime principle of the Congregationalists' creed (as with all voluntaries) that the state should abstain utterly from interference in religious matters. This view permeated editorial after editorial in the Launceston Examiner: one, almost certainly written by West, repudiated the use of the term "religious toleration" since it implied that the state had a right to allow (and so to disallow) the practice

of religion, whereas in fact man had an inalienable
claim to this freedom. The Observer described the
function of the state in Locke's terms, deliberately
contrary to that recently proposed by H.P. Fry in
the Herald of Tasmania.

The Congregationalist viewpoint necessarily
involved agitation for the abolition of all state-
aid: if any group, such as themselves, refused to
participate, or at least fully participate, in dis-
bursements of this money, it was unfair that any
others should so benefit. This feeling remained
fairly academic until the colonists' own taxes main-
tained state aid, but already West's congregation
spoke of the need to "equalize taxation and produce
the happy fruits of political justice." Ross and
Saunders similarly insisted before the 1844 Education
Committee that if any denomination wished to have
separate schools, then it must not expect any
assistance from the state.

129 LE 26/10/42.
130 5/6/45.
131 West, Voluntary System : 2.
132 Saunders : 20; Ross : 4.
The Jewish community advanced a rather different 'secular' view of the state's attitude towards religion. "As British subjects," one petition to the N.S.W. legislature declared, "the Israelites of this colony are entitled to the same rights of civil, political and religious liberty which their fellow subjects of different religious opinions enjoy". Thus dutiful performance of civic obligations became the sole criterion for winning the state's approval. Over many years the Jews pressed for recognition of this principle, not so successfully as they would have liked but winning considerable sympathy.

This account has emphasised that "the pride of equality" normally expressed itself vis-à-vis state aid, but there were other occasions. Outstanding among these was the claim to full rights in performing marriage. Even the staid McGarvie refused to obey a law which required that any but an Anglican minister demand formal declarations from the wedded couple.


134 The above journal has several relevant articles most notably I. Porush, The Story of State Aid to Jewish Establishments in New South Wales: I, 337 seq.
that they were his parishioners. The Free Church-
men of N.S.W. were also very sensitive on this issue,
since considerable doubt prevailed as to the legality of marriages performed by colonial ministers having no connection with the Church of Scotland. An act of 1851 finally removed all discrimination in N.S.W.; in V.D.L. the current legislation (1842) went a long way towards recognising equality, but not far enough to disarm all protests.

Overall, Protestants maintained a constant scrutiny of Anglican claims. "If Romish assumption is intolerable", declared the Colonial Observer, "Protestant or Episcopalian assumption is still more so."
The Presbyterians of both colonies protested against Anglican dignitaries remaining on the Councils; Catholics and Protestants joined in criticising both Nixon's

---

135 Argus 9/4/50; Voice in the Wilderness 15/12/49.
136 See esp Free Church Marriage Bill Committee, LC 7/9/47; Free Church petition, LC 18/4/48. The Bill was re-submitted in '48, but again lapsed.
137 Cf V & P, LC VDL, 29/8/42; the NSW Act was 14 Vic no 28; VDL, 6 Vic no 18.
138 18/3/43.
139 Col 23/1/39; CO 280/146 : 229 seq.
Consistorial Court and the Bills Perry had introduced in the legislature in 1850. Such feeling even led Protestants to attack Broughton's criticism of the hierarchy and Nixon's lectures on the past iniquities of Rome. Roman Catholics hated Tractarianism because it threatened the strongest citadel of their own faith; ultra-Protestants hated it because thereby the ancient enemy won new ground. Out of this dialectic sometimes emerged so peculiar an alliance.

Sectarianism

'Sometimes' was a very necessary qualification in the last sentence. Despite these expressions of sympathy on the one hand and the Roman Catholic progress "from strength towards aggression" on the other, the fact remains that Protestant antipathy to Roman Catholicism was often virulent to the point of injustice and responsible for much ill-feeling. From

140 Ross: 326-27.
141 Note 138 above.
142 HTC 19/5/43 (letter of "A Protestant"); 3/8/44 ("Gamma Delta"); 7/9/44 ("A Unitarian"). The LE consistently maintained a similar attitude.
individuals like J.D. Lang and other leading Protestants, from the Bible and Tract societies; and from various journals (Colonist, Colonial Observer, Sydney Gazette, and even the Herald) a steady fire rained down. Then in the mid-'forties came a burst of explicit Orange activity, over a dozen lodges opening in N.S.W., while John Morgan led similar developments in V.D.L. The Sentinel (Sydney 1844-48), the Argus (while edited by William Kerr, 1846-48), and the Britannia were Orange journals, the former devoting itself almost entirely to anti-Catholic propaganda. Although even within the lodges there were 'moderates', and although the movement passed its peak after migration to California drained off many members, this stands out as one of the periods in

143 A Grand Lodge opened in Sydney in 1845, and there were branches afterwards opened in the large country towns. See Sen, passim; R. McGuffin, Rise and Progress of Orangeism in New South Wales Vindicated, Sydney 1872; W. Freame, Newspaper Cuttings volume III, ML; V & P, LC NSW : 16/8/49; Finn : 620 seq, 675 seq; Britannia 4/11/47, passim.

144 Its chief contributor was the Anglican (later Presbyterian) J.B. Laughton: PA 24/2/49 seq.

145 See esp F4630, which was first published in Sen.
Australian history when anti-Catholic feeling reached a high pitch of organisation.

The major charge laid against the Romans was that they planned domination. "From Supreme Courts - through benches of magistracy - in halls of municipality - down to the constabulary forces of Sydney and the colony, Papacy lords and predominates beyond tolerance": this half-sentence summed up many, many Sentinel editorials. Elaborating a theme advanced by the old Herald, Lang warned in 1841 that the influx of Irish migrants was so great that soon this interest would be strong enough to play off other parties in the community against each other, and so ultimately to achieve independent power. This crusade the Doctor steadily maintained, especially in his pamphlet Popery in Australia, and his attack on Caroline Chisholm's female migration schemes for allegedly "extending the Romanism of the country through the

146 11/6/46.

147 Cf The Question of Questions!, Sydney 1841: 16, passim.

148 Edinburgh 1848.
vile, Jesuistical, diabolical system of 'mixed marriages'.

The Sentinel frequently accused Romans of employing, or threatening physical force. As each St Patrick's Day, Boyne Day and Guy Fawkes' Day went by, stories were told of plotting and intimidation; several editorials claimed that the Party Processions Prevention Act was flouted on these and other occasions. The Catholics of Bathurst were said to have 'framed' a charge of attempted murder against an inn-keeper who allowed riotous celebration of November 5th on his premises. Ribbonism was active in Sydney, another article claimed, introducing a long account of that movement's depredations in Ireland. Again, the Sentinel reported that a Protestant inn-keeper on the South Head Road had received the following message:

149 Letter to The British Banner 15/11/48 (seen on typescript copy, prepared by Miss M. Kiddle, now at Australian National University).
150 E.g. 3/12/46.
151 19/2/45.
152 11/11/47.
153 22/7/47.
YOU ORANGE THIEF,

This is to caution you - you are watched, and will get that which you deserve. I caution you to be on your guard, for YOUR DOOM HAS BEEN PRONOUNCED.

There followed the insignia of a coffin, bearing the inn-keeper's initials and a skull and cross-bones. "Simple-minded Australians" were warned against dismissing the letter as a hoax.

The theology of Catholicism also came under attack. Protestants were anxious to identify the Pope as "the Man of Sin," and to represent the denial of private judgement and sufficiency of faith merely as tools in the construction of a priestly despotism. Not only black Ulstermen held such views: Robert Ross' denunciation of "tyrannical priestly power" certainly rang true. Nevertheless the inevitable effect was to foment a sense of contempt on one side and of persecution on the other.

Ultra-Protestants did not reserve their venom

154 See A. Physician, The Man of Sin Revealed, Sydney 1848 (F4853); letter of Threlkeld 18/3/37: LMS Australian correspondence.

155 The Church, The Foundation and The Keys, Sydney 1848: 2, passim.
entirely for the Church of Rome. Tractarians, as we have already remarked, were no less an abomination. Lang once forgot his grammar sufficiently to describe Puseyism as "even the worst of the two", while the Sconce-Makinson conversions gave the Sentinel a fine opportunity to criticise all forms of Catholicism without reserve or discrimination. More surprisingly the Argus and the Sentinel provided the only blatant examples of anti-Semitism. The former implied that Catholics and Jews allied for political purposes; the latter attacked Judaism as a "wretched system of theological monadism" and described Mr Cohen, a candidate for the Sydney Corporation, as "a foe to Christianity" supported by a "cabal of Jews and infidels". Thirdly, ultra-Protestant literature has several echoes of Broughton's condemnation of the Rome-liberal alliance. Thus the Protestant Magazine bewailed that past persecution of this faith had

158 13/10/46 (mock requisition for city council election).
159 25/5/48; 28/10/47; see also 4/11/47.
"attracted that sympathy which even merited suffering never fails in the end to call forth"; aided by such sentiment Catholics persuaded many that Rome no longer sought temporal power, stressed the virtues of charity and benevolence, in short used every means "to cry up the spurious liberality of the day". The True Catholic pursued a similar argument against "false Liberality", especially when many potential readers declined to subscribe because of the journal's anti-Catholicism. The Sentinel so abhorred the liberal idea of a General Cemetery (what decent man would want to lie buried beside a Catholic?) that it joined the Churches of England and Rome in opposing the measure. Similarly it could have been one of the high Anglican journals which thus attacked the "Illiberality of Religious Liberalism":

Any Christian Church, or any Christian man is fair game: they that revile and injure them really believe they are doing God service. Religion can be abused ad libitum, almost

160 II, 1 seq.
161 I, 161 seq.
162 I, 181.
163 29/7/47.
164 11/11/47.
with impunity; but if a Christian writer dares to breathe one syllable opposed to the tyrannical creed of the school of indifference, instantly the cry rises "Away with such a fellow from the earth, for it is not fit that he should live!"

The desire to best Catholicism had a decisive influence on Protestant attitudes generally. It was a powerful factor behind the growth of voluntaryism. James Forbes said bluntly that his main objection to state aid was that Romans and Tractarians obtained the lion's share; Lang swore his enmity to "the present monstrous system of universal Church establishment - the main stay of Popery and Puseyism and every other corrupt and apostate form of Christianity." The degree of unity achieved by the Protestants also owed a good deal to antipathy to Rome: the Sentinel was particularly eloquent in its advocacy of this cause. John Morgan's behaviour was but an extreme instance of a common tactic - to excoriate differences within the Church in the deliberate hope of reducing its

165 Port Phillip Christian Herald 4/10/50, 1/11/50. See also Voice in the Wilderness 1/4/47.
167 8/1/45.
strength. Again, many Protestants, especially in N.S.W., shaped their attitude to the education controversy according to what the Catholics didn't want. So Broughton was able to organise a united non-Roman front against Bourke's plan of 1836: Saunders frankly told the 1844 Committee that he joined in this agitation simply because he suspected the current protagonists of the Irish system. Subsequently he, Lang and many others supported that plan, just as the Roman Catholic Church moved against it.

These remarks give some idea of how fiercely sectarianism raged, a point reinforced by many lesser episodes. The Melbourne election of 1843, when Lang and Kerr organised Henry Condell's campaign against Edward Curr, illustrated that the battle could be fought in pure political terms. The electoral history of both Melbourne and Sydney Corporations had overtones

---

168 Cf The Protestant Proceedings Vindicated, Sydney 1836 (F2170).
170 Gilchrist : 33½ seq.
171 Cf Finn : 620, 834-35.
172 See chapter V; Sen 5 & 12/3/46. Perhaps the activity of Methodists in the Corporation was a reaction to Catholic participation.
of this struggle, and it probably played a larger part in contests for the legislature than the contemporary record tells. As the Processions Act indicated, physical force was not unknown: for a week before and after Boyne Day 1846 Melbourne suffered the tensions of civil war. Colonial presses were quick to republish Rebecca Reed's horrific account of her monastic experiences and a lurid description of Roman Catholic Morality dredged from official documents. N.S.W. could even boast its own 'Rebecca Reed' - a girl called Agnes Byrne who publicised a distorted version of Catholic practices, after having apostatised in the late 'thirties. When France seized Tahiti in 1844 protest meetings were held in both colonies; Protestant ministers were prominent among the speakers, and detestation of Catholic expansion a major theme of discussion. Ardent

173 Finn : 680 seq.
174 F2171-72.
175 F2831.
176 S. Leslie (ed.), From Cabin-Boy to Archbishop : 156-57.
177 Col Ob 13/6/44; LE 18/9/44.
Protestants were no less guilty than some Catholics of declining to join in mutual philanthropy. The establishment of the Sydney Female Refuge Society in August 1848 was a direct and deliberate rejoinder to the recent foundation of such an institution by Roman Catholics. At the end of the decade Hawksley alleged that sectarianism had invaded even the Sydney Benevolent Asylum, long regarded as a model of inter-denominational co-operation.

**Protestantism as a Social Ethic**

John Dunmore Lang stood first, but not alone, among Protestants who were also radicals. His own letter-books witness this, for many correspondents agreed with the Doctor in both religion and politics. Thus Rev. A.M. Ramsay rejoiced that the gold-rushes had enabled many thousands to "have breathed for once the sweet air of liberty & they will never afterwards suffer themselves to be unjustly deprived of it. Australia will date her patriotism from this hour."

---

179 PA 9/2/50.
180 Letter of 23/2/52: ML MS A2226.
Even among the most conservative group doctrinally — orthodox Methodists — a parallel appeared. It was probably Boyce himself who wrote an article in the *Christian Standard* which contemptuously dismissed the past thirty years of British History as "an age of little men and little measures": Parliamentary Reform, Free Trade, Emancipation, colonial self-government — all these excellent ideas had been accepted in principle but were carried not nearly far enough. Among many other relevant examples, Alexander Laurie's eulogy of the French Revolution was outstanding:

Principles in morals, in politics, and in human right were brought into contact with minds of masses of men. Government, political economy, and metaphysics, no longer the speculative amusement of the schools, or of the literary conversazioni of a luxurious aristocracy, became the theme of thought for the peasant and the artisan.

Laurie rejoiced that the ideas thus generated were securing recognition and triumph throughout the world.

If such attitudes were very widely held by

181 I, 277.
182 Laurie Papers: address to School of Arts.
Protestants, and as a necessary consequence of their religious belief, the 'disruptive' quality of such a creed would be very plain. Yet neither point was true. There were many Protestant conservatives, just as good theologians as their political opposites. Temperamental factors doubtless often explained both a man's religion and his politics; fighters in the cause of church equality and freedom from state control made a real contribution to the strength of civil liberty - beyond these obvious generalisations no progress is possible. The assumption guiding the following paragraphs is not that Protestantism had a peculiar connection with socio-political radicalism, but that insofar as any religion emphasises the importance of its social ethic rather than questions of salvation and eternity, so diminishes its authority over the faithful and - even more - the could-be faithful. Thence comes disruption.

Several Protestant clerics warned against over-emphasis on worldly benevolence. Frederick Miller bitterly condemned the many people who assented to the moral ordinances of Christianity without appreciating the need for a complete change of heart; John McGarvie

183 On Unscriptural Marriages, Hobart 1834 : 5-6.
coupled the Moralist, with the Artist, Historian and Metaphysician as men who exaggerated the power of humanity to do good and avoid evil. R.K. Ewing, an ex-Congregationalist who served as moderator of the Tasmanian Presbyterians 1850-51 decried the infinite time Christians were required to give "in order to work out schemes of secular learning and philanthropic plans." Such statements demonstrated that not all Protestants accepted secularism, but each of these men felt the tide of opinion to be running against him. Theologians such as Broughton would maintain that it was inevitable for Protestantism to follow this course: once the roots of tradition and the tie of spiritual authority weakened, this lesser currency of religion was free to drive out the higher. Here we again founder upon a mighty contention which ultimately is beyond proof. Nevertheless an empirical study of Australian experience contributes much support for the Broughton-Catholic view.

184 A Funeral Sermon..., Sydney 1848: 12 seq.
185 A Sermon, Launceston 1851: 22, passim.
McGarvie and Ewing notwithstanding, this trend appeared with particular clarity among Presbyterians. Calvinism was often shorn of its harsher implications when preached from colonial pulpits. Thus Lang, describing The True Glory of a Christian Church could expiate at length on the value of sound doctrine without making any reference to predestination. Not that formal orthodoxy was all that important: indeed it ranked as "a matter of very little consequence" compared with "the formation of an intelligent, and virtuous, and Christian, population." Rev. William Hamilton argued that justification through faith was "a means employed by God to attain a greater end," namely "man's advancement to a holy and heavenly character"; thus justification accelerated the drive to good works, rather than the opposite. A newspaper once reported John Lillie as having "slighted the assertion which had been made, or insinuated, that the hopes of salvation of those belonging to his own

186 Sydney 1835: 15-16.
communion depended on the uncovenanted mercies of God, and concluded by urging practical piety as the main thing, in comparison to which modes and ceremonies were of no importance." Lillie's published works indicate that the journalist was not misrepresenting his general argument. In his introductory sermon at Hobart he emphasised the need to recognise "the essential connection of religion with the well being and property of society in the present life," and on another occasion declared that Nature was "as truly the book of God, as the Bible."

Presbyterians took the lead in emphasising Sabbath observance. James Forbes described the Melbourne Sunday of 1849 in these lurid terms:

The youth strolls along the street, laughing, jesting or whistling - rejoicing in his sin. Groups of idle females gather round the doors to retail the gossip of the week. Children let loose upon the streets, renew their week-day sports. Vehicles of all sorts wheel away out to the bush, conveying large parties, bent

188 HTC 30/8/44.
189 A Sermon ..., Hobart 1837 : 18 seq.
190 Lecture upon the Advantages of Science, Hobart 1839 : 17.
on pleasure excursions. And what, in fine, is the Sabbath to the multitude in our large towns, but a day of recreation, mirth, and revelry?

The sum total of such views as these, repeated again and again must have been to reinforce Lang's dictum that Sunday observance was "the best test of the moral and religious character of any people." Fully consonant with this attitude was the peculiarly Protestant emphasis on decorous behaviour, in every form and on any day, as the means to salvation. A Discourse Upon Nonconformity is the title of a pamphlet, written in Hobart by a Presbyterian Sunday School Teacher, which promises to expand our knowledge of the theology of colonial Protestantism. It turns out to be a barely credible indictment of all the human foibles from gambling to singing.

John West set the key-note of the Congregationalist contribution to this debate:

Religious men must no longer avoid the strife of the hustings as inconsistent with piety, or set the claims of religion in opposition

192 Gilchrist: 242.
193 E. Graff (F5363a).
194 History: I, 346.
to the obligation of the citizen. Both are in reality one; and while churches in their corporate capacity stand best when they are most distant from the arena of politics, it is the duty of all who reverence the Almighty's will and regard the welfare of mankind, to devote themselves to the social and political amelioration of society.

Rev. Alexander Morison, the leading Independent in Melbourne before 1850, linked 'amelioration' with religion rather differently in two sermons he gave on Revelations, XVI 12-16 during 1848. The first pointed to several signs of impending world-crisis, among them the spread of aristocratic presumption, which had even infected Melbourne; the second demonstrated that the 1848 French Revolution, of which news had just arrived, heralded the Millennium. The world had yet to endure many troubles, but in some thirty years Christ would come again, to end all tyranny and all suffering. Barzillai Quaife preached on the same subject in Sydney in the same year. He believed that Christ would establish his kingdom through human instrumentality rather than personal intervention.

195 The Sixth Vial Poured Out, Melbourne 1848;
The Outpouring of the Seventh Vial, Melbourne 1848.
Essentially spiritual, the new order would nevertheless effect every facet of life:

Hence the outward forms of society will undergo a vast and radical change .... every government and political institution will have to be either dissolved or expurgated.

Clearly Morison and Quaife both qualified as politically radical Protestants. The latter even contributed to the People's Advocate.

Emphasis on social ethics naturally came to the fore in the advocacy and practice of Protestant union. Thus the Colonist welcomed the formation of a Bible Society at Newcastle since through its agency the moral influence of the Scriptures would "dissipate the deadly rancour of controversy, and promote harmony and charity amongst all men". The Van Diemen's Land Evangelical Union likewise invoked "the obligations of brotherly love." Nor did this spirit find expression only in formal organisations. West averred that at least in country districts the itinerant minister had

196 Lectures on the Prophecy and the Kingdom of Christ, Sydney 1848 : 11 seq.
197 Nadel : 220.
199 LE 28/11/46.
no alternative but to discard "controversial divinity": amorphous benevolence doubtless took its place. The Presbytery of V.D.L. once issued a pastoral letter emphasising that colonial believers were in a different position from their Scottish counterparts:

our Church meets on common ground with a variety of other Christian Churches, distinguished by all shades of difference both in doctrine and polity, from our own, and out of this new position arise corresponding obligations. While you are on no account to concede or compromise what you believe to be truth, you are at the same time to cherish a spirit of Christian forebearance and charity .... And whenever you find those who entertain the same great principles of Christian doctrine, though they may differ from you in minor points, you are to sympathize and co-operate with them, in every good work.

Did not the constant divisions within Protestantism show such sentiments to be meaningless? This question comes quickly to mind, but cannot quickly be answered. The dichotomy whereby unity was loudly praised by men most arduous in promoting new branches of Christianity presents a very subtle problem. Overall one has the impression that 'self-will' was 'rampant' enough to cause even more fractionalisation

200 Cf Nadel: 255 and preceding pages.
201 Hobart 1850 (F5489): 7.
had not the balm of brotherly love been applied; moreover that contemporaries recognised this and so called upon this remedy all the more insistently.

Thus the proposition that the nature of colonial development helped 'socialise' Christianity remains unshaken. A fascinating by-way of Protestant Anglicanism offered further evidence to confirm this view. In 1836 there appeared from Sydney a strange volume entitled The Language of Theology Interpreted. Its author, G.M.C. Bowen, was an ex-officer, settler, and magistrate who had determined to enter the Anglican Church and wished Broughton to be fully aware of his beliefs. Bowen could best be described as a hyper-generous Arminian. He believed that the day would soon come "when the single and universal passion among men shall be a constant burning desire to increase the amount of human happiness;" the Scriptures were a giant parable rather than literal truth - if regarded as the latter they produced all kinds of confusion; no hell of physical torment existed, but only

202 F2094.
203 179.
alienation from the will of God. Predestination, with its corollaries that not all men would be saved and God might reject a repentant sinner implied "either a want of power or a want of benevolence in the Heavenly Parent." Particularly significant was Bowen's emphasis that he felt his theology justified by the tremendous material progress proceeding all around him in N.S.W. It is hardly necessary to add that conventional Anglicans were struck aghast: H.T. Stiles refused Bowen communion (even when he came and knelt at the altar-rail); Broughton tried to negotiate a compromise but finally had to support Stiles to the full.

The climax of this argument is to suggest that Protestantism, or rather important strains within it, turned into moral liberalism. If this was so, we would expect to find particularly strong evidence in Protestant attitudes to education and temperance. Any judgement apropos of the former is particularly difficult

204 128.
205 178.
206 Cf Bowen's correspondence, CO 201/262: 358 seq.
if the Protestants' own standards are accepted, as they must be. Broughton and McEncroe thought that general education must damage Christianity, Ross and Saunders did not. Henry Carmichael who believed that children should be given no theological teaching (in his school the Bible was available only "as a book of reference and voluntary perusal, its lessons of wisdom and morality will be turned to as affording rules for the guidance of life"), would maintain that he served the best interests of Christianity. However, John Lillie made a significant admission when he once spoke of the "sacrifice" made by Presbyterians in not seeking to establish their own schools. When taken up by an Anglican priest, Lillie re-emphasised the evil of animosities created by denominational education and denied that he had forsaken any Christian principle. But the apologia was rather awkward, and his adversary must have felt confident of victory. Heterodoxy again came near when the *Christian Standard* linked the progress

207 Nadel: 236, passim.

208 Lillie's original statement appeared in LE 7/11/46 (meeting of Presbytery). He had a subsequent correspondence with R.R. Davies in the HTC from 18/11/46.
of adult education with "the motto of our progressing Christianity ... 'Behold I make ALL THINGS NEW.'"

The Synod of Australia advised its members to speak against drunkenness at every opportunity. Carrying out this injunction, William Hamilton described the habit as "a sin which extensively prevails in this colony, which leads to the commission of many of the other sins which disgrace it, and which hinders, perhaps more than any other cause, the success of those means which are employed to diffuse religious knowledge and extend the practice of true religion." A.M. Ramsay believed that God showed his displeasure at the prevalence of this same 'sin' in Melbourne by inflicting a particularly violent storm upon the city. So the evidence mounts for imputing the paternity of moral liberalism to Protestantism. But there was very much more to the new faith than its connection with the old. We have now to turn to a study of moral liberalism in toto, remaining alert to notice the mighty part played in its advance by Protestants, both active and indifferent.

---

209 I, 74.

210 Practical Discourses ... : 80-81.

211 The Voice of the Storm, Melbourne 1850.
PART THREE

THE 'NEW FAITH': MORAL LIBERALISM
VII. THE CREED AND ITS DISCIPLES

Statement in Brief

Frederick Maitland Innes, Premier of Tasmania 1872-73, first came to the island in 1833. Throughout his long career he was active in many aspects of colonial life, but particularly as a journalist. Among the several papers he edited was the Tasmanian, for which on January 4th 1839, he adopted a new editorial text. It comprised two sentences from the American Transcendentalist, Ellery Channing (1780-1842): "I know no wisdom but that which reveals man to himself, and which teaches him to regard all social institutions, and his whole life as the means of unfolding and exalting the spirit within him. All policy which does not recognise this truth, seems to me shallow." The Transcendentalist creed could not have been expressed more neatly. More verbose, but more interesting from our point of view, was Innes' statement explaining why he had selected a text from Channing:

1 See AE; E.M. Miller, *Pressmen and Governors*: passim; and below.
He stands nearly at the head of that rapidly increasing class of political reasoners who exalt principle above expediency in weighing the counsels of nations; and who consider nothing gained, if at the expense of virtue, even though apparently directed towards its promotion - Fiat Justitia, ruat caelum, would be their motto, if they could bring themselves to believe that Justice and Heaven are ever in opposition. But they take higher ground, for they contend that only by Justice can Heaven be attained, - or in other words, that the Just is always the Expedient. They resort, accordingly, to moral principles on all occasions of doubt, not to a balance of apparently conflicting utilities; and truly Catholic alike in their views and faith, they contend that what it is right to do, it is also desirable for all interests concerned to have done....

It is very remarkable how often in reasoning the extremes of dissent meet at length in assent. One man goes East around the world, and another West; but they encounter as they advance, and then traverse, each the other's former steps. Thus the political faith of the Utilitarians, and of the sect whom we describe, but who have as yet no distinctive name, are theoretically wide as the Poles asunder; - yet do they coalesce in their results on more points than almost any other two denominations of political thinkers. Both appeal to first principles, - the one to find the useful, whence they deduce the right, - the other to find the right, whence they deduce the useful. And their agreement is one of the strongest arguments that can be adduced in favor of the strict alliance between the principles of which they respectively assert the supremacy.

Morally, Metaphysically, and Religiously there can be no question which of them is rigorously right; - but practically, as but too often happens, those who are not morally, metaphysically, religiously right, - in other words, whose standard is a low one, are yet the more successful disputants, and in smaller matters the reader guides. A utility lies on the surface, while a moral principle is hidden deep below it; and a very ordinary intelligence will discover the one, while the other may not be comprehended by it, even if disinterred.
It is in combination, rather than in antithesis, that each of the theories which we have thus described is seen to greatest advantage; and their essential union, however they may appear occasionally to differ, is happily the creed of both the parties who maintain them. No sane Utilitarian sees usefulness, in the sense which he attaches to the word, in crime; and the loftiest (sane) Moralist sees no virtue in avowedly useless refinement. As already observed, they set off to circumnavigate the political globe in opposite directions, but their courses eventually coalesce. They do not head in the same direction, but they equally make for the same Port. Happy the Statesman who reaches that Port, by whichever Pilot guided, and who finds his search for usefulness end in virtue, or his search for virtue end in usefulness. And happy the People whose Ruler is indeed persuaded that the perfection of each may be tested by such identity.

Charles Harpur (1813-68) was another admirer of the Transcendentalists, and the supreme colonial theorist of the 'new faith'. Born in Australia of convict parents he continually strove to universalise his thought and work. Thus in his note-books many poems are prefaced by explanatory essays, often more interesting than the verse itself. This applied with particular force to an ode entitled Finality, written in 1846 and published shortly afterwards in the Atlas.

2 21/8/47.
Harpur showed his own awareness of the essay's significance by later preparing it for publication in Parkes' *Empire*. It ran, in part:

When Rousseau desiderated the savage state as the noblest for man, he was wrong. But he was led into the error by the partial perception of a great truth: namely, that the best condition for the development of the full majesty of man, were one in which the personal freedom and sovereignty of savage life should co-exist with all the artistic beneficences and moral security of civilized society. And such a condition is indeed the great end of all human community - is social individualization, the finality of the future.

And education and social individualization should also be infinitely more than they are - the finality of the present; in other words, a teaching and employing process by which every individual might be improved to the full extent and according to the specific character of his capacity. This is demanded by a new and singular (self-sustained and sustaining) order of consciousness, which is fast developing itself in the whole human race. All the great political, social and religious interests that were originally only operant as motive powers upon men in bodies or nationally, are beginning to centre and manifest themselves in Man the individual. Centuries of thought and self-investigation - the experience for good and evil of entire races; these, in effect, are becoming constitutionally accumulated, and additionally transmissive, in single individuals.

Hence the "greatest good of the greatest number" is not a final principle of human community, and is fast giving place to another that is: namely,
the greatest good to each and all. Hence, too, men can no longer be the creatures of Governments; these can no longer mould them characteristically into masses; because the association tendencies of all are beginning to cognise and perfect their end in each. Even the Austrian - even the thinking Russian can now grow up under the thundrous shadow of his paternal despotism, with a distinct personal consciousness of inherent independence - of the self-possession of spiritual prerogatives which reduce it, even in its apparent almightiness, to a mere temporal accident; and he can dare to look it in the face therefore, as being a thing only, - an awful one indeed, but which, as a person, - as a man, he has a right to question.

And as this Individualizing process grows natively out of the Past, it cannot be arrested. It should be carried forward then; and for this to be done harmoniously, individual education upon the most liberal and adaptative scale must be speedily resorted to; so that all men, having progressed beyond the state-legislation contemporaneously obtaining, may become more and more, to the destined extent, - each and all of them Governments in themselves.

Echoes of the same spirit pervaded a Herald editorial of early 1849:

The present ... is a great era. In this respect it is similar to the sixteenth century. The same revulsion against spiritual and political tyranny, the same craving for novelties of thought, of word, and of deed, of action, declaration, and speculation; the same spirit of awakened enterprise, warlike and commercial, the same outcry and necessity for organic and social changes in old and settled countries; the same attraction to colonists from ... unpopulated countries, the same aspirings, but more widely felt and better directed, for contributing personal efforts and private means to the improvement of the human race....
Taken together these three paragraphs convey very well the leading features of the 'new faith'. It arose on a Benthamite foundation - individualism, rationality, man's power to control his environment, the need for sweeping reform, the concept of progress. But the superstructure rose to a height well beyond the contemplation of the pioneer Utilitarians. The quest of human perfection became the key-note: man should cast off all vice, stupidity and selfishness as he created an earthly Utopia. This was the chief end of human existence, its achievement demanding the sacrifice of all other considerations. Every person could and must participate in this glorious advance. Upholders of this doctrine necessarily had a simple and optimistic view of humanity. "A large faith in the capacity of human nature for good, is the root of all genuine morality", wrote Harpur; while Lillie contended that "truth and justice and goodness are essentially and unalterably congenial to the rational and moral apprehensions". A cry of angry dissent

5 Note to "Have Faith": ML MS C382.

6 Lectures delivered at the Mechanics' Institute, Hobart Town ..., Hobart 1849 (F5103): 7.
repudiated the suggestion of one colonial philosopher that all acts, however benevolent in appearance, arose from self-interest.

So the cold, academic qualities of Utilitarianism were swept away on a torrent of Millenarian fervour. The concept that some might have to suffer pain to advance the pleasure of others was rationalised out of existence; so too, as Innes emphasised, any contradiction between material and spiritual advance. Perhaps a more informative title for the 'new faith' would be 'Transcendentalised Utilitarianism', or, daring to be inventive, 'Utopilitarianism'. Why did no contemporary solve our problem by coining some descriptive tag? In part because simple 'liberalism' could convey approximately the right meaning (John Henry Newman wrote a magnificent description of the 'new faith' under this designation); partly because the creed was highly amorphous.

This vagueness of moral liberalism creates many difficulties of presentation. The divisions

8 Apologia pro Vita sua, New York 1947 : 264 seq.
which have been adopted in the following account are slightly unreal; some themes are repeated, while others tend to disappear. Yet when the whole canvas is painted an impression should appear of the 'new faith's' meaning, both to committed adherents and to society at large.

**Appeal to the Mind : Culture**

From the early years of Australia's history to the present day men have argued that all-pervading culture had a unique power to dissolve the ills which beset her development. To claim precedence for any one period in this story would be invidious, but the mid-nineteenth century certainly has a strong claim to that distinction. Historians have shown their implicit recognition of the theme and its significance by providing a comparative wealth of pertinent material especially on the development of education; the most recent and best of these studies - *Australia's Colonial Culture* by G.H. Nadel - deliberately examines the concept that the diffusion of knowledge should act as the foundation and cement of society. Such work has also contributed to an institutional history of culture,
although much yet remains unknown. The following account pushes only a little way into this latter field; its basic aim is to elaborate the more important principles and implications of the belief that man's increasing knowledge would effect vast and beneficial changes.

The foundation of the creed was confidence that learning made finer men from human clay. One of the few locally-printed (although not locally written) school books to survive from this period had a chapter devoted to "Improvement of the Mind". The summary ran thus:

Great end of knowledge, - not worldly advantage, -
not merely to get on, - not mere gratification, -
not display, - but to make us happier and better, -
to do good to others, - to lead to God.


The advance of education, whatever its level, appeared in this light. At Hobart in 1835 an Infant Schools' Society was told that nineteen crimes out of twenty were "committed in order to obtain the means of gratifying the dissipated and bad passions of our nature,

9 Daily Lesson Book for the Use of Schools and Families, Hobart 1849 (P5032) : 19.
which it is the object of Infant Schools to subdue";
Wentworth advocated the Sydney University Bill of 
1849 by declaring that "this measure - this which is 
to enlighten the mind, to refine the understanding, 
to elevate the soul of our fellow men; this of all 
our Acts contains the germ of immortality". The 
Colonial Literary Journal - in the top rank of the 
numerous little magazines which strove to vanquish 
the forces of barbarism - constantly emphasised the 
value of learning to the individual, just as a Calvin­ 
ist might expound the glory of personal revelation. 
"The reward which the man of letters obtains for all 
his labours, is, a soul free from vulgar fears and 
prejudices, a comprehensive and cultivated mind full 
of inexhaustible stores of entertainment and reflec­
tion, a perpetual spring of fresh ideas, and the 
conscious dignity of superior intelligence." Such 
a man would never feel the pangs of worldly disappoint­
ment, but achieve serene content far above all petti­
ness.

10 HTC 21/8/35.
11 Two Speeches Delivered by William Charles 
Wentworth, Esq., Sydney 1893 : 22.
12 II, 81-82; cf II, 97-98; passim.
More often culture appealed as the source of communal, rather than personal beatitude. Duncan's argument that education must provide the tie which political or religious tradition supplied in the Old World had widespread acceptance: Innes phrased the idea with rare clarity in one of the frequent addresses he gave to Mechanics Institutes in V.D.L. It was from the pages of the Colonial Literary Journal that Harpur was summoned to come forth "as the guiding star of his countrymen in the glorious and soul-elevating paths of literature, - of a literature NATIONAL and Australian, for if it be worthy of the land of its origin, the terms are synonymous!" The poet was far from insensitive to such a call, and later bewailed his compatriots' deafness to "the Lyre of Australia". In a similar state of mind, the respective editors of the literary journals launched their works with a very definite sense of mission - not only to refine society, but to encourage the expression in literature of the sense of nationality.

14 II, 207 ('of' not in original).
15 ML MS C382.
Formal education had a vital role in this process. The application of the term 'National' to the non-denominational schools in N.S.W. - and with but minor qualification liberals threw all their weight behind 'general' schemes of education - had an obvious, important symbolism. Upholders of denominationalism protested against this designation; in reply they were told, not very convincingly, that it was a mere matter of convenience. The Mechanics Institute at Sydney passed this interesting comment on the spirit of the times, and its own place therein:

The results of the diffusion of knowledge among the human family, and the moral and intellectual improvements of the day, are far outstripping the calculations of the philosopher or the statesman. Sound and cheap education is the great moral lever. The schoolmaster's ferule has superseded the warrior's sword. Society must now be led, not driven. In accomplishing thus far this great work, Mechanics' Institutions, and kindred societies, have in no small measure assisted.

The role of a university was frequently described in the same terms. So early as 1837 the Hobart Courier

16 SMH 12/5/48 (LC debate).
17 SMH 8/2/49.
urged that some such institution arise lest "our national (Colonial) character ... eventually be one of rustic boorishness, and impenetrable ignorance"; Sydney's University was hailed for enabling Australian natives to equip themselves as philosopher-kings of their country.

"National Education," one enthusiast declared, "affords one of the most powerful means in the hands of a government to allay the animosity of political and religious controversies, and to lead the people into the paths of peace and order." The peculiarly liberal affection for general education sprang from this conviction: in devotion to the 'new faith' all disharmony would melt away. "Which is the nobler, purer, feeling:" demanded Robert Lowe, the advocate par excellence for National schools, "to adopt the intended system of social enlightenment, or to encourage the splitting up of the community into sectarian parties?" By far the most powerful weapon

---

18 23/6/37.

19 G.H. Nadel, Australia's Colonial Culture: 57; W. Woolls, Lines ..., Sydney 1850 (F5590).

20 Col 13/4/37 ("A Correspondent").

in the armory of the anti-denominationalists, this had frequent and effective use.

Political, as well as religious divisions were fated to evaporate under the new dispensation. In fact, all factional and self-seeking politics would become obsolete. The culturists were revolutionaries in that they expected and demanded great social change, but they were confident of the capacity of human intelligence to achieve this result without any explosion of militant discontent. Learning established its own forms of social control, infinitely more just and no less effective than the old. Thus when Denison's criticisms of the turbulent egalitarianism of Tasmanian society became public knowledge, the Courier advised him to look to the leaders of such bodies as the Mechanics Institute for "the real conservatives who temper the democratic spirit by an authority which it debases no man to acknowledge". According to the classic liberal view, classes would remain but movement between them depend largely on

---

22 HTC 12/9/49; among other examples see SMH 8/2/49 (Mechanics Institute Report); LE 16/10/44 (MI meeting).
intellectual merit. James Lillie was quick to see in the changing nature of current British politics a forecast of this Millennium. "The tory of former days is all but extinct", he told the Hobart Institute, of which he was the President for many years, "while the modern conservative who occupies his place, is so essentially changed ... that he would have been recognized by the former rather as a foe than a friend."

An interesting extension of this outlook appeared in proposals for an 'academic' franchise. The idea, expressed in several editorials and speeches from time to time, had its warmest advocate in Richard Windeyer. He suggested to the 18½ Franchise Committee that some supervisory board should issue a diploma, carrying the right to vote, to all who had reached a specified level of education. "If it should be said that this might end in universal suffrage," Windeyer argued, "my answer is, that if there were universal enlightenment, there would be no danger in universal suffrage". The Committee sought the opinion of other

23 Knowledge as the Means of Correcting Prejudice, Hobart 1843: 30.

2½ Evidence to Franchise Committee, LC 27/9/½ : 12.
witnesses, most of whom were favourable, and tentatively endorsed the idea in its Report. Though impracticable, the scheme well expressed the temper of the 'new faith'. The introduction of free, secular and compulsory education is often traced to the legislators' wish to 'educate their masters'; while not unsound, this argument ignores the subtlety of the link between universal education and political democracy.

This context explains why culturists put particular emphasis on the need for universal dissemination of their panacea. The drive to establish a really efficient, state-subsidised system of primary schooling sprang from the determination to embrace the whole population; denominational schools were out of favour, because they not only encouraged sectarian feeling but made the task of providing a comprehensive structure far more difficult and costly. So obviously did this appear as a function of the state, that no-one pointed out its contravention of the purest laissez faire. Compulsion was still objectionable to the liberal conscience as expressed, for example, by the 1844 Committee. But we know that Duncan moved to the opposite position, and his view received further
support from an anonymous pamphleteer, Catholicus, in 1848. He scorned "the liberty which an ignorant and unnatural parent may claim to withhold from his child the blessings of education. I question whether this liberty is entitled to the consideration of a right either on natural or social grounds." The Atlas reviewer agreed.

The concern for universality appeared in the preface to the Act establishing, and stating the aim of Sydney University:

to hold forth to all classes and denominations ... without any distinction whatsoever, an encouragement for pursuing a regular and liberal course of education.

The legislators made no attempt to explain how poor men could spend some years at a fee-paying university. Nevertheless other friends of culture attended to the problem of educating the adult workman by striving to develop the Mechanics Institutes as 'popular universities'.


Rev. Charles Price, a leader of the Launceston Institute, spoke out with particular determination on this point:

The intellectual nature of the working classes demands improvement. It has commenced, and will go forward in spite of all opposition. It is determined to tread down the already mouldering traditions, in law and science, and religion, by which the working classes have been kept in the prison house of ignorance, grinding for the pampered few.

Already the Launceston body had sought to attract interest from this quarter by throwing open their lectures without charge; at Hobart, a specified number of operatives sat on the managing committee, while special subscription rates were offered to their fellows. But the most important technique of spreading education was to provide evening 'classes' with a definite programme and scope. A notably ambitious (but unsuccessful) plan on these lines was put forward in Sydney in 1844: over three years a student would undergo a course in mathematics, physics, chemistry, English language and political economy.

28 LE 24/4/50.
29 SMH 8/5/44.
Price's statement represented a great number of attacks on privilege—deplorable in any shape or form, according to the liberal philosophy, but especially when pertaining to culture. Thus among the many protests directed against the Gell-Franklin College was a petition which sneered at the proposed "monastic system"; such might suit the hereditary aristocracy of England but had little relevance to the "usefulness and respectability" of hard-working colonists. In 1844 J.D. Lang exploded a bombshell among Sydney's upper classes by denouncing the 'exclusive' tone of the Australian Subscription Library. At a fierce general meeting of members called in consequence, the Doctor sought to carry a motion of virtual no-confidence in the current executive, castigating especially the system of balloting for members. Only the Catholic liberals supported him, and but half-heartedly: this stinging rebuff very likely accelerated his progress to the political left. A few months later Lang provided yet another

30 LC 4/9/40.
31 SMH 22 & 23/2/44.
instance of the feeling against privilege when he objected to the Sydney Institute receiving £200 from government coffers, while its rural counterparts went quite unaided. In Hobart the Protestant-liberal Colonial Times joined with the Hobarton Guardian to criticise alleged clique-control of the Institute, the Public Library (established 1849), and other aspects of the city's cultural life.

In the welter of argument on education many 'advanced' ideas found expression. European reformers, especially Pestalozzi and de Fellenberg, were frequently invoked against parrot learning, and as having demonstrated the need to train a child's whole character and mental processes. Corporal punishment appeared as a symbol of the cold, cruel order of things which all aspired to

32 SMH 6/9/44.
33 CT 17/3/48 (art union), 30/1/49 (MI), 22/5/49 (Public Library); Hob Gdn 27/9/48 (Royal Society), 8/12/49 (Library).
34 E.g. Col 3/1/38; Atlas 23/8/45 (Dr Goodwin's lecture); V.D.L. Monthly Magazine (F2067): I, 172.
replace. The problem of supplying education to children in the bush prompted much enquiry, the most favoured solution being the establishment of country boarding schools. Advocates of this scheme pointed out that students would be amenable to instruction in agricultural skills; further awareness of vocational training was shown by empowering the National Board to create Industrial Schools. Tasmanian Government schools operated lending libraries which both pupils and their parents could, and did use. Some educationists insisted on the desirability of females having opportunities equal to their brothers; thus the opening of the Hobart Town High School prompted one contemporary to urge an equivalent institution for girls. An even more notable feature of the High School's early history

35 HTC 2/2/50 (Eccleston).
37 Regulations, LC 22/5/49.
38 Education Board Report, LC 8/9/46.
39 CT 15/2/50. See also ML MS B923-24; M.C.I. Levy, Governor George Arthur, Melbourne 1953: 221.
was its marked breakaway from the traditional curriculum of English education.

Among those who endeavoured to realise these ideals were men of great ability. In V.D.L. from 1847 the Inspector of Schools was Thomas Arnold, son of the great Rugbeian and no less devoted to the problems of education than his brother Mathew. Arnold's contemporary and counterpart in Port Phillip was Hugh Childers, already displaying the ability which led him to a Cabinet post under Gladstone. G.W. Rusden, historian and littérateur, played a crucial part in the early years of the N.S.W. National Board. The original appointee as headmaster of Hobart High was the philosopher and historian James Anthony Froude; following his withdrawal the post descended to James Eccleston, a leading figure in the English 'College of Preceptors' and a believer in the "almost godlike

40 See E.L. French, Secondary Education in the Australian Social Order 1788-1898 (seen in typescript).


42 See A.G. Austin, George William Rusden and National Education in Australia 1849-1862.
power" of his profession. He was, alas, to die within a few weeks of taking office. Among other outstanding pedagogues, all of whom have been subjects of historical study, were T.W. Cape, Henry Carmichael, James Forbes, and William Wilkins.

Such men as these and their less distinguished brethren strove very hard to improve the status of the profession. A group in Sydney organised an association in mid-1847, which petitioned the legislature to appoint a board for the issue of diplomas to satisfactory teachers. Three years later pedagogues in the same city formed the 'Professional Literary Association', which sponsored that excellent literary magazine, the Australian Era. Among the best of the articles published before the

---

43 Address by James Ecclestone, Esq., B.A., Hobart 1850 (F5034) : 10.

44 S.H. Smith, William Timothy Cape, RAHSJ : V, 201 seq; C.C. Linz, The Establishment of a National System of Education in New South Wales, Melbourne 1938 : chapter VI (Wilkins); E. Sweetman, Victoria's First Public Educationist, Melbourne 1939 (Forbes); Nadel : passim (Carmichael).


46 Argus 9/7/50 (Sydney correspondent).
gold rushes terminated its life was "Education in New South Wales" by Edward Reeve. Teachers, he complained, enjoyed neither proper respect nor proper remuneration, and therefore had little chance to impress learning or discipline upon their pupils; parents interfered grossly with matters which rightly belonged to the teacher alone; children moved from school to school, rendering hopeless any systematic approach. Reeve's article doubtless evoked many a hard-felt 'hear, hear'.

Rather than to attempt a composite statement of the ideals and practice of the best teachers, we might briefly notice another individual similarly 'advanced' and in the long-term more significant: James Bonwick. Trained at the British and Foreign Society's school in London, he was selected along with his wife and five other couples to carry their skill to V.D.I. Arriving at Hobart late in 1841 the Bonwicks at once took charge of a 'Model' school under government auspices. To all his scholars James taught arithmetic, mensuration, music, and some

47 I, 11 seq.
geography, geometry, and natural history; older pupils touched history, natural philosophy, and French. Himself an Anglican in childhood, and thereafter moving freely between Baptists, Quakers, and Independents, Bonwick imparted as much of the meaning of the Scriptures as was possible without impinging on the Sacraments, the Apostles' Creed, or the Ten Commandments. This latitudinarianism did not endear him to Loch and Fry, when they investigated his school in the course of preparing their report; nevertheless they did remark, in condescending praise, that "the order of the children in this School was very remarkable, and the discipline of the Schoolmaster of a very peculiar nature." Bonwick was much upset by the enquiry, and even earlier had felt unhappy with his situation. At the end of 1842 he advertised his willingness to accept private pupil-boarders who would

48 Evidence to Committee of Enquiry 1845, CO 280/182: esp questions 228 seq; CO 280/182: 654 seq (memorandum by J.B.).

49 See chapter I.

be instructed in the duty of man to his neighbour and "especially, that knowledge of the nature of their own minds and bodies, which may lead to the preservation of health, control of thought, and rectitude of conduct." In 1844 Bonwick left the public service and launched a boarding school, named Hofwyl House in commemoration of the Swiss institution where de Fellenberg applied Pestalozzi's principles. Press notices remarked on the fine equipping of this school, the concern for cleanliness and ample playing-space, and especially the vigorous tone of the public examinations, altogether free from the much-spurned "merely mechanical process".

In 1845 issued the first substantial work from Bonwick's pen, a Geography for the Use of Australian Youth. It spoke the unalloyed language of moral liberalism:

---

51 HTC 30/12/42.


53 HTC 30/12/44, 17/5/45.

54 Hobart 1845 (F3994) : quotations from 62, 73.
The modern Greeks are addicted to falsehood and dishonesty; but much of their bad character is owing to their oppression under the Turks. When freedom is given to the Prussians they will know well how to use it and value it, because they have had an enlightened education. This freedom will come, and come quickly, for the noble and generous King has promised a liberal constitution.

And so on with all the peoples of the world. For the rest of his long life Bonwick kept up a copious flow of such textbooks, as well as opening up fresh fields of research into Australian history. A study of the distribution and use of these works might well indicate that no man had greater influence in propagating the 'new faith'.

Bonwick's repudiation of crude mind-packing reflected a common appreciation that rationality need be infused with imagination. The question was delicate, for many culturists feared lest too great a dose of the latter would inflame those gross passions, which it was one of the major purposes of learning to subdue. So the Australian Era denounced the "garbage" of European novelists as one of the
most potent influences encouraging criminality; while the Illustrated Australian Magazine characterised the confirmed novel-reader as a "mental drunkard", whose ever-growing appetite for fiction would extinguish all desire for other, more lofty, pursuits. The same outlook prompted condemnation of the popular theatre and the dominance of fiction in the Institute libraries. Unchecked it could lead to a narrow, negative moralism, directly contrary to the message of the American Transcendentalists. But the issue at stake was crucial: no true disciple of the 'new faith' could admit to any weakening of the hegemony of the mind. In short, the two sides to this question balanced very evenly.

Harpur was the most forthright spokesman of the 'imagination' school. He emphasised that his "high and sacred" Muse sought to impress mankind by appealing to the passions rather than to reason; these "elements of human life" could inspire as well as degrade. It was interesting that when making these

55 I, 81 seq. See also Nadel: 91 seq.
56 I, 267 seq.
57 C382 (general prefatory note).
points Harpur defended himself against ministers of religion, not the apostles of education. His attitude did not, of course, imply any lessening of his wish to improve humanity - he but explored a new avenue to that end. This was a poet's task: Shelley, for all his brilliance, lacked that sense of "solid humanity" essential to perfection.

Few other culturists faced up to this issue so squarely as Harpur, preferring to confuse inextricably the appeal to the mind and the appeal to the imagination. In consequence the fine arts were warmly approved despite their essential consanguinity with fiction and drama. Music won particular applause. Several of the Institutes started up choral groups, and no other aspect of their work had greater success. The Australian believed that a music school could do much "to elevate the mind and refine the manners of the people"; the Colonial Times used almost precisely the same words when welcoming the establishment of a

58 Harpur/Parkes 21/3/44 : ML MS Ah131; cf WR 26/7/45 (article on Poetry).

59 7/9/41.
choir in Hobart. The most distinguished musician to live in Australia before mid-century – indeed over a much wider time-span than that – was Isaac Nathan, composer and organist. He publicly expounded his belief in the power of the "glorious science" of music to inspire men with a sense of social duty and the evils of crass materialism.

Painting enjoyed very similar prestige. It too was encouraged by some Institutes, and along with "The Philanthropist", "The Temperance Advocate", "The Poet", had its representative featured in an intelligent little journal, The Heads of the People. J.S. Prout, a gifted water-colourist and this art's equivalent to Nathan, shared the latter's concern for the diffusion of taste and high ideals. Bookshops – shrines of culture in every community – added to their charms by sponsoring 'art unions', that is lotteries

60 3/5/45.


62 See esp B. Duterreau's lecture in F5103.

63 I, 145-46.

64 See chapter IX.
from which the proceeds bought works of art for distribution among the winners. Artists began to organise, and put the improvement of public appreciation high among their aims. Residents of the major cities occasionally had the opportunity to attend exhibitions, comprising local work and loans from personal collections. In opening such a display at Launceston John West emphasised how the perusal of great works could "diminish the power of meaner gratifications", and continued:

every addition to the intellectual amusement of the day is a new guarantee for the morrow. The youthful visitor will return with his views increased, and his notions more distinct; he will feel a new interest in his race, and a fuller consciousness of its mental dignity; dissipation will be resisted, not only by the warnings of authority, but by the instinct of taste.

Even public building was called into service by the apostles of culture. If men were to become aware of themselves as civilised, intelligent beings,

65 E.g. SMH 7/7/47 (Grocott), 6/11/48 (Ford); cf 14 Vic no 13 (N.S.W.).
66 Cf SMH 9 & 22/6/47; Argus 9/7/50 (Sydney correspondent).
67 The Fine Arts, Launceston 1848: 3-4.
declared an *Australian Era* article on "The Australasian Metropolis", intelligence and civility must dictate the plan of his environment. This ideal already prevailed to some extent in Britain, where many towns possessed baths, wash-houses, parks and playgrounds. The writer urged that the local administration quickly abandon its cadge-penny policies and erect public buildings in the admiration of which all classes might join; thereby the drive towards "sensual desire and sensual gratification" - a potent force for evil, especially among working men - would slacken. The neatly planned streets of Melbourne might be expected to have appealed to this frame of mind, but an article in the *Australasian* magazine suggested the reverse. The writer bemoaned that the "panel-system" made no provision for a civic square which might serve as commercial focus and aesthetic inspiration. The assumption that architecture reflected character was given an interesting twist by a contributor to the *Illustrated Australian Magazine* who praised the High

68 I, 17 seq.

69 F5265 : I, 137 seq.
School as "the architectural glory" of V.D.L. He found peculiar significance in its Elizabethan style - "a symbol of the large mindedness, enterprise, and earnestness of purpose pertaining to the days of mental emancipation; when the Gothic passed away with darkness and superstition, of which it was an appropriate but fantastic emblem."

The concept of physical culture grew steadily in these years. While fisticuffs and duels were everywhere condemned as anti-rational and therefore vicious, other varieties of sport won the accolade of the 'new faith'. T.H. Braim gave considerable emphasis to the benefits of physical prowess in an address he gave as headmaster of Sydney College in 1842; a club formed to organise the 'Victorian Gymnastic Games' in celebration of Port Phillip's separation, stressed its exclusive interest in activity which employed "the noble faculties of mind".

---

70 II, 273-74.
71 An Address to the Students of the Sydney College, Sydney 1842 : 6 seq.
72 Argus 17/6/50.
The editor of the Australasian Sporting Magazine presented himself as a campaigner against materialism and crudity, precisely as did his counterparts of the literary periodicals. His publication of an article on the fine arts in Australia (written with great intelligence) continued the parallel. Swimming had its devotees, most notable among them N.L. Kentish, whose devotion to moral liberalism will cause his name to reappear several times in the following pages. He admired this exercise not only for its effect in purifying the mind, but also for cleansing the body - a factor which, as the Australian Era's praise of baths and wash-houses has already shown, apostles of the 'new faith' kept well in mind. In doing so they again revealed their concern to bring the working man into the circle of 'respectability' and full citizenship.

Gardening and farming were other forms of physical action which ranked high in the culturists'...

73 I, 4.
74 I, 36 seq.
75 Sydney Times (F1855) 13/1/35, 31/12/36.
estimation. The 'Nathan' of the former craft was Daniel Bunce, of Hobart and later Melbourne; a manual of instruction from his pen lauded gardening as "a pursuit, combining, more than any other, health, recreation, profit, information and innocent enjoyment". The Hobart Town Horticultural Society was the precursor of the Royal Society of V.D.L., the most distinguished body of its type in the colonies. The Australian showed its recognition of the status of these activities when it included the Floral and Agricultural Society, and the Hunter River Agricultural Society in its account of "liberal" associations in N.S.W.; heading the list were the Mechanics Institute and the Subscription Library. This connection appeared again in the name of an institution founded in 1850 in Sydney: the Australian Society for Encouragement of Arts, Science, Commerce and Agriculture.

\[\text{X}\]


78 29/2/44.

79 AE, "Royal Societies".
This title emphasised a further crucial element in the 'new faith' - extreme interest in the advance of science, and confidence in its efficacy to transform all things. In fact, science was culture. The Mechanics Institutes symbolised this union in their efforts to develop museums and laboratories as well as reading rooms and lending libraries; to provide lectures in Zoology, Botany, Physics, and Chemistry, as well as literature and art. The curricula of Hobart High and Sydney University reflected the same trend. Well before either of these institutions commenced operations the Courier had remarked:

The improving spirit of the times has distinguished itself in nothing more than the reform it has introduced into the old system of scholastic and collegiate education. The useful is gradually ingrafting itself on the abstract. Science, the most natural associate, but long alienated helpmate of literature, is gradually coming by the voice of common sense in all our most approved places of instruction, into closer alliance.

The New South Wales Magazine carried the sub-title "Journal of General Politics, Literature, Science, and the Arts"; the editor's initial address to the
public touched upon all the leading features of the 'new faith', and linked Literature and Science as the two great fields in which all colonists could join to "Advance Australia".

There were several strong personal links between science and other aspects of the 'new faith'. Lillie acted as Secretary of the Royal Society as well as President of the Institute, and (following Eccleston's death) temporary Rector of the High School. William Bland was not only a political liberal and generous philanthropist but also a surgeon of some eminence. When he developed a technique for by-passing ligatures and deep-seated blood vessels in the course of an operation, the local press loudly applauded. Nor did Bland's gadgeteering stop at medicine; he devised a means for curbing fires in ships carrying wool, and submitted to the Great Exhibition of 1851 a model of an 'atmotic' airship, which would cut down the Australia-England journey to a matter of days. One of the

81 I, 1 seq.
82 Cf Col 28/3/38.
83 Cf N.J. Dunlop, Dr William Bland, RAHSJ: XI, 321 seq.
most regular contributors to the first medical journal established in Australia was W.R. Pugh of Launceston; like Bland he was a philanthropist, an innovator in medicine (pioneering the most dramatic advance of all in these years, the application of ether), and a modest inventor (preparing his own drugs, and experimenting with gas illumination). N.L. Kentish claimed to have resolved the secret of perpetual motion and to be able to apply his knowledge to ocean-going vessels. Charles Price supplemented his spiritual and secular good works with various scientific interests, including telegraphy and the application of galvanic batteries to medical complaints.

The great contribution of science to moral liberalism was to strengthen belief in progress. The attention given to improved medical techniques,

84 F4222.


86 Cf his letters to Lang, 3/3/50 & 31/7/50 : ML MS A2226.

especially the use of chloroform, was the natural reaction of a creed which placed overwhelming emphasis on humanity and temporal happiness. But it was the steam engine which really enthralled the culturists. To Lillie the discovery of steam power marked "an era in the history of our species ... working a mighty revolution in the social and economical condition of the world". The lecture to the Institute whence came this remark postulated that scientific discoveries promised to realise the gospel ideals of unity and fraternal love. This might sound odd, but Lillie was not quite typical. While he and others were glorifying steam, some were already looking to electricity as the hope of the world - most explicit among them W.R. Wade, a Baptist clergyman and ex-missionary who was the salaried majordomo of the Institute in Hobart. The editor of the *Australian Era* rode both horses and reached an appropriate destination. To him the wonders of telegraphy and the steam train proved the magazine's

---

88 E.g. HTC 5/7/48; SMH 6/6/48.

89 *Lecture upon the Advantages of Science*, Hobart 1839: 7.

90 Cf CT 23/2/49.
guiding principle - "MIND shall work out the physical
regeneration of the human race."

It was appropriate that this writer should emphasise two aspects of science relating to communications. Bland and Kentish were far from being the only colonists to dabble in this field: another exhibit from N.S.W. at the Great Exhibition was Sir Thomas Mitchell's device to apply a boomerang propeller to steamships; a Sydney engineer named John Curr claimed to have devised a technique of ascertaining the optimum size of working-parts in a steam-engine, and so to facilitate passage by rail and sea; several inventors in both colonies applied themselves to ballooning and heavier-than-air flight. The upholders of the 'new faith' saw the advance of communications

91 I, 5.


94 SMH 8 & 9/6/43 (letters of F. Forbes and 'Aeronaut'); 28/6/43 (editorial), 1/9/43 (R. Mudie); for balloon ascents LE 21/5/45; SMH 14/2/46.
as answering Australia's most pressing problems - distance from Europe and lack of inland waterways; moreover space and time were annihilated in a near-miraculous way, in effect adding years to the life-span of mankind. Above all improved communications enabled the transmission of ideas, and so enhanced the power of mind to solve all ills. As the Colonial Observer said:

They are binding together the whole human race into one nation, into one family. They are doing more to put an end to the barbarous practice of war, and spread the arts of peace and civilization over the whole surface of the globe, than has ever yet been done by all the philosophers .... The interchange of sentiments and opinions and practices that is now taking place between the inhabitants of the old and new worlds, through the successful establishment of a steam-bridge across the Atlantic - the action and reaction produced by the natural and daily exhibition of the social improvements of the one continent, and the civil and religious liberty of the other - is undoubtedly the most interesting phenomenon of the age ...

This emphasis on the power of a common culture to secure universal peace naturally had a very powerful appeal. George Allen, littérateur and journalist,

95 HTC 26/6/35 (Mr Hackett's lecture); SMH 24/10/49.
96 23/12/41.
went further in his estimate of science's capacity to effect this boon: he forecast the day when men would produce weapons of war so horrible as to preclude all thought of war.

The Colonial Literary Journal once remarked that the best promise for "improvement in the tempers and in the manners of the people" lay in "the magic efforts of that mighty engine, the press". 'Engine' had a literal meaning in this context, for not the least of steam's glories was its role in the cheap dissemination of literature. Improvements in postal communications conduced to the same end. Thus a N.S.W. Act of 1850 which followed the British 'penny post' example deeply impressed William Westgarth, most intelligent disciple of the 'new faith' in early Melbourne. He described the legislation as "in consonance with the state and progress of the age, which is not now disposed to handle that great social department as a question of mere public revenue".

97 A Lecture on the Mechanical Agency of the Press, Melbourne 1840 : 30.
98 I, 370.
99 Illustrated Australian Magazine : I, 71.
If concerned primarily with the mind and hostile to crude money-grubbing, moral liberalism did not spurn the economic-physical aspects of prosperity. Rather, individual and collective well-being necessarily evoked the approval of a creed which emphasised the concept of progress. "In this age of wonders, nothing new in the material, mental or moral world ought to excite astonishment" was a declaration which nicely epitomised this interdependence. Moreover, the achievements of industry and commerce made possible universal free trade which would supplement the exchange of ideas in establishing world peace: the Great Exhibition of 1851 won the Australian Era's applause as well as the Herald's, and inspired the establishment in Victoria of an 'Industrial Society' interested in developing both the cultural and economic resources of the new colony. Upholders of the 'new faith' were anxious that Australia should participate in what the

100 LE 20/6/46.

101 Argus 13/6/50; Illustrated Australian Magazine: passim; Australian Era: I, 97 seq.
Australia Felix Monthly Magazine called "the natural progress of nations", namely "from the prairie and the forest to the city and the town, the roaming flock gradually receding before the plough, the shepherd and stockman before the husbandman and artizan, the hut of the rural proprietor making way for the palace of the merchant prince, or the stores and buildings of the manufacturer". From such attitudes sprang the culturist antipathy to squatting, sufficiently illustrated in chapter III; hence too the high place accorded the science of agriculture. Within one year the Port Phillip Magazine published separate articles on land-drainage, meat-processing, tobacco culture, and the adaptability of Peruvian sheep to Australian conditions; literary men as well as entrepreneurs lavished praise on Ludwig Leichhardt. And what of the gold discoveries? Perhaps the Illustrated

102 F4972 : I, 16.
103 F3690 : I, 49, 72, 93, 118.
Australian Magazine best expressed the reaction of moral liberalism:

We may expect ... an immense diffusion of mankind under circumstances highly favourable to the production of physical comfort ... We believe that the time will come when unskilled labour will be superseded by mechanical inventions - when men, enjoying in rich abundance the bounties of nature, will be employed in the grateful application of its principles to the development of the useful and the beautiful, accompanied by a practical carrying out of Christian principles, of which the beauty is now acknowledged while their authority is too often disregarded.

Once again science appeared as the herald of Utopia.

The syllabus of the Sydney Mechanics' Institute of 1841 comprised Zoology, Cosmology, Physics, Peritropology (the study of change), and "Anthropology, or Man Study". This symbolised an awareness, not great but still perceptible, of the possible value of investigating human relations and behaviour; in other words, of social science. The Council of Hobart High decided to build right in the city partly in order to encourage pupils to observe society at work, and so be better equipped to act for its

105 II, 380.
106 SMH 16/6/41.
welfare. The Atlas newspaper had earlier professed its interest in discovering the laws governing human behaviour. A leading article in the first number expressed the editor's determination to enquire into the mechanism of politics, how public opinion formed, and the operation of interests; "it is as if Political Economy were being acted on a stage," declared a later editorial emphasising the suitability of local conditions for such an enquiry, "for in a colony we may watch the growth of human society as plainly as we can observe the operation of bees through a glass hive."

To people of such mind the state of the aborigines clearly offered scope for action. So we find John Lhotsky adopting quite sophisticated techniques to extract information from William Buckley concerning the tribes among whom he had lived so long; and Alexander Maconochie applying

107 HTC 11/9/47 (Prospectus).
108 30/11/44.
109 7/12/44.
110 T & R 26/1/38.
to Bourke for a position in Port Phillip so that he could investigate the culture clash of Europeans and aborigines. Overall the problem posed by these unhappy people evoked reactions which showed that devotion to moral liberalism did not lead all men to the same conclusion. Robert Lowe and Archibald Michie were frankly contemptuous of a people, whom they believed to have shown themselves deficient in that most crucial of human attributes, intelligence; another writer of similar outlook urged "Coercive Education and Employment"; yet another applauded "the extinction of unimproved humanity", while wanting their death to be as comfortable as possible. This hint of benevolence was amplified in Richard Windeyer's persuasion of the legislature to consider the aboriginal problem. At a further extreme, Harpur

111 A. Maconochie, Australiana, Hobart 1838: 186 seq; letter to Bourke 10/6/37, Bourke Papers.
112 SMH 29/6/49 (LC debate); WR 25/4/44 (lecture on phrenology).
113 Arden's Sydney Magazine: I, 65 seq, esp 76.
114 New South Wales Magazine: I, 51 seq.
115 See documents, LC 30/10/45, 31/10/46.
and his fellow-poet Halloran deplored the atrocities of European behaviour, while Bonwick's textbook described the aborigines as "for savages, a very harmless, happy race of people ... rendered fero-
cious and blood-thirsty by the treatment they received". Several journalists and especially Westgarth adopted a more 'modern' attitude: western civilisation only harmed these people and should not be introduced to the detriment of their tribal life.

Westgarth was the outstanding sociological thinker of the colonies. With Ralph Mansfield, and Rev. T.J. Ewing of V.D.L. he pioneered the


117 Geography: 17.

118 Cf T & R 18/3/36; Australian 6/3/35; HTC 20/2/35.


120 Note his census studies: F3246, 4592.

121 See F3746.
collection of social statistics, a study which the New South Wales Magazine applauded as prominent among "those practical sciences which have an immediate bearing on the improvement of mankind". That Westgarth himself thought on these lines appeared very plainly in an address he wrote for the Institute at Melbourne. This urged the study - not only for their own sake, but as affecting society - of history, religion, law, and the mechanism of the human mind. In the last category Westgarth emphasised the message of phrenology. No other social science attracted such attention in the colonies, nor was more relevant to our theme.

Appeal to the Psyche: Phrenology and Mesmerism

As Nadel has emphasised, many of the colony's cultural leaders found phrenology worthy of their

122 See his Reports: F3952, 4205, 4206, 441, 441; and later contributed to the Illustrated Australian Magazine.

123 I, 4.

124 Address by the Committee of the Mechanics' Institute at Melbourne, Edinburgh 1846: 16 seq.

125 139 seq.
study. Michie, Windeyer, Carmichael and Bland were men already mentioned in this chapter who investigated this concept, the fore-runner of modern psychology, that a man's cranial development could be 'read' so as to reveal his inner personality. The Colonial Literary Journal and the New South Wales Magazine published articles on the subject; it was frequently lectured upon at Mechanics Institutes; even the sober Australian Subscription Library received the Phrenological Journal from Britain. The spirit in which the matter was approached accorded precisely with the temper of the 'new faith':

the Science of Phrenology being so easily studied, so interesting and so advantageous, we are called upon as men to examine its merits, and to reduce the truths which it develops, for the prosperity and happiness of the human race.

At first glance, this attitude might appear illogical. If man's characteristics were so obvious,
if they appeared in the very structure of his bones, was not pessimism the natural result; pessimism based on the apprehension that men were fixed in their ways, good and bad, beyond all control? In reality, not one advocate of phrenology took this determinist view. The common argument was that once a man's implanted characteristics were understood, then he could be trained into righteousness. Thus phrenology coalesced with the general emphasis of moral liberalism on education, particularly education of the young. Henry Melville, journalist-philosopher of V.D.L., went closer than most to grappling with the logical problem of determinism, but reached an absolutely typical conclusion:

the form of the skull is either stamped at the birth by nature, following her own laws, dependent on the generative organs of parents transmitting their peculiarities; or by education .... I have no doubt but that, if children's heads were carefully examined, and their organs studied, their propensities might be very materially guided as the teacher pleased. Bring up a child in the way he should go, and he will not depart from the path of rectitude.

It was natural therefore that one of the most fervent advocates of the study as "not only a true but a practical Science" should establish a school guided by its principles. Similarly a pedagogic manual designed for bush mothers who had to teach their own children - Letters on Education by Hannah Villiers Boyd - carried adulation of phrenological principles to an extreme beyond any other recorded. A school-teacher herself, Mrs Boyd displayed many attitudes typical of the best educationists of the day - admiration for Pestalozzi; advocacy of higher status for teachers; confidence that the goodwill generated by learning could obliterate all factional antagonisms. Some of her remarks touched the grotesque:

I have studied phrenology a little; and I am quite certain that Cain would never have killed Abel if his mother had known how to train him properly.

If you observe the upper part of his forehead much over the region of the eyebrow, it is an evidence that his observing faculties require stimulating.

131 James Hamilton, for whom see Nadel : 140; and Odd Fellow (ML) 20/12/45.

132 Sydney 1848.

133 5, 119.
Yet Mrs Boyd was using the hammer of phrenology to drive home a vital point: that every personality required individual treatment, without which the value of education would quickly depreciate. An attitude which first appeared crudely naive, in fact encouraged subtlety and discrimination.

Education was not the only branch of sociology with which phrenology had an intimate link. Men interested in the treatment of criminals and lunatics also looked to it as a valuable aid towards achieving unprecedented success. As early as 1836 a Scottish baronet named Mackenzie suggested to the British Government that all convicts sentenced to transportation should be phrenologically examined, so that those best suited to colonial pioneering be sent to Australia. The greatest of all penologists to work in the colonies, Alexander Maconochie, was a sympathetic student of the science. It fitted in very well with his quasi-Owenite belief that personality could be shaped by intelligent treatment. By

134 Cf CO 201/392 : 3 seq.
teaching that man's untrained faculties determined his actions phrenology presented a powerful weapon to those who denied that vengeance should be a determinant in punishment. Lowe's 'psychological compulsion' defence of the murderer Knatchbull, which so annoyed the Herald, was reported in full by the Zoist, a phreno-mesmerist journal published in London.

In the realm of lunatic reform the great man in N.S.W. was Dr Francis Campbell. He was a devout phrenologist, concepts drawn from the study appearing again and again in his case-book, which a latter-day psychiatrist has described as "a clinical masterpiece". Parallels between the work of Machonochie and Campbell, and their further relevance to the 'new faith' will appear in chapter IX.

Mesmerism first attracted attention as an auxiliary to the practice of medicine. A Dr Smith of Melbourne conducted several operations with its

136 Cf Martin: I, 199 seq.

aid during 1844, evidently with notable success. As a fore-runner of chloroform it enjoyed some of that prestige which generally attached to medical science. Even after the introduction of anaesthetic, the admirers of hypnosis claimed that this threatened far less physical harm to the patient. Furthermore they said that mesmerism provided the channel whereby a doctor could exercise his powers of 'animal magnetism' on the patient, with near-miraculous results. Another branch of the subject, clairvoyance, was hailed as facilitating diagnosis. Examples quoted appeared to go well into the land of fantasy. The Australian Medical Journal cast a cold eye on the claims of mesmerism, just as it did on those of phrenology.

The two studies had much more in common than this however. It was found that hypnotised subjects

138 LE 13/11/44.
139 J.B.H. A Catechism of Mesmerism, Melbourne 1850 (F5392) : 9.
141 I, 4 seq; I, 132-33.
would display the phrenologically appropriate emotions when various parts of his cranium were tapped or otherwise excited. How many people thus responded and whether any were themselves ignorant of phrenology is unknown—few and none might well be the correct answers. Nevertheless it was not doubted among the faithful that this 'phreno-mesmerism' proved the truth of phrenology.

One of the first in Australia to state this belief was Henry Melville and he did so on a most intriguing occasion: the final paragraph of a pamphlet (1844) which revealed (but did not describe) the author's discovery of a "lost creed" based on the ancient rites of freemasonry, somehow co-related with an abstruse system of astrology. Did phreno-mesmerism have a connection with this philosophy, which Melville believed would shake the world? Alas, his discoveries in their final published form are beyond comprehension.

142 Exposition: 194; cf Bonwick, Reminiscences: 114 seq.
143 Veritas, London 1874.
Not until the very end of the decade did mesmerism enjoy a popular vogue, but within a narrow range it was then intense. In 1850 a Melbourne man named William Edwards wrote a pamphlet which expounded all the virtues of the science, especially in its connection with phrenology. He argued that all children should be 'read', their particular weaknesses discovered, and that these be cured by training under hypnosis. Edwards stressed that any moral—but not immoral—lesson taught a mesmerised subject would remain permanently planted. Thus "our children born in a world of temptation, with organisations tending or prone to gratify the propensities of their nature, can be changed by Mesmerism, into moral and happy members of society." Believing this, Edwards was naturally convinced that mesmerism ranked as "the greatest boon on earth" and called for its support in tones of ringing enthusiasm.

The response, at least from his fellow towns­men, was appropriate. The Argus forecast that the
pamphlet would enjoy a popularity unprecedented in Melbourne's history. At least two other treatises issued from the presses; the city's premier periodical, the Illustrated Australian Magazine frequently discussed the subject; W.B. Wilmot, City Coroner and a devout educationist, welcomed this proof that the mind had an independent system of intra-communication, which could be investigated and used for beneficent ends. Meanwhile, public demonstrations of phrenomesmerism aroused tremendous interest. Up to 700 people came to watch a Mr Gilbert 'perform' on his subject, an aborigine. They heard all the virtues of mesmerism expounded, especially its promise to introduce a new stage in human development "by exhibiting man as at once delivered from the thraldom of his exterior senses, and enabled to attain to greater heights of moral excellence." Another

146 27/8/50.
147 See note 139 above, and F5415a.
148 See esp I, 92.
150 Argus 31/7/50, 1/8/50.
earnest advocate of the cause was Dr James Motherwell, destined to be leader of Melbourne's spiritualists when this study made a notable contribution to the golden-age of Melbourne's cultural life. Strangely enough mesmerism attracted no great interest in Sydney. In Hobart the latter months of 1850 saw a reflection of the hubbub in Melbourne, the leading figure being one William Poyser.

Edwards had said that mesmerism was "the greatest boon on earth", but when merging into spiritualism it also invaded heaven. Melville's interest in astrology also reflected this aspect of the 'new faith'; in Sydney a Mr Moreau, self-described as an "Ultra Phrenologist" and also interested in astrology, set up as a consultant on future events "more particularly on all questions which involve loss or gain." At such moments elements of charlatanry and the absurd became clear, yet some deeper significance remained. Moral liberalism encompassed every facet of life and all eternity. Moreau and Melville were genuine creations of the Zeitgeist.

151 Cf Argus 30/8/50.
152 Hob Gdn 11/50.
153 SMH 4, 18 & 21/11/46; cf Nadel : 140.
Appeal to the Will: Temperance

The Temperance movement in Australia claims only the barest outline history, and hence the facts presented in the statistical introduction require some elaboration. The Quaker missionaries Backhouse and Walker carried the message to Australia, and inspired the foundation of a society at Hobart in 1832; almost simultaneously Charles Price and his fellow Independent minister, W.P. Crook, organised groups at Launceston and Sydney respectively. These sparks did not catch fire for a few years, but then the flames quickly rose. From being so many more conventions of local do-gooders, lay and clerical, the societies assumed a distinct and even formidable character. This was recognised by the Hobart Courier, for example, in August 1837. A few weeks previously there had appeared in Sydney the first number of the Australian Temperance Magazine, first of many journals

1 J.W. Meaden (ed.), Temperance in Australia, Melbourne 1889: 12 seq.
2 25/8/37.
3 F2224.
devoted to this cause. Its literary quality was high, and its circulation (4,000 was the nominal peak) far above that of any other magazine. The next three or four years were the heyday of 'moderate' Temperance: appropriately this was the subject of the first public lecture delivered in Melbourne, the child of the 'thirties.

Meanwhile, the cry of Total Abstinence had rung out. Early in 1838 the Temperance societies in both capitals were exhorted to abandon moderation. In September 1838 one William Rowe and five comrades formed a teetotal society in Sydney, and this year also saw an initial attempt to establish the principle at Launceston. The difference in formal ideology centred on attitudes to non-spirituous alcoholic drinks. A typical Temperance pledge ran:

4 II, 11.
5 Cf I. Selby, Old Pioneers' Memorial History of Melbourne, Melbourne 1924: 311.
6 SMH 25/1/38; T & R 16/3/38.
7 Meaden: 19; SMH 26/9/39.
8 Van Diemen's Land Temperance Herald (F4197): I, 1.
9 ML MS At71.
We agree to abstain from distilled spirits, except for medicinal purposes, and to discountenance the causes and practice of Intemperance.

While the Tasmanian abstainers pledged thus:

We, the undersigned, do agree that we will not use intoxicating liquors as a beverage, nor traffic in them; that we will not provide them as an article of entertainment, or for persons in our employment; and that, in all suitable ways, we will discountenance their use throughout the community.

Abstainers openly expressed their belief that moderates were hypocritical or dishonest. "Cheating of conscience" was a forceful phrase used in the course of the controversy at Hobart; in Melbourne hostility became still more palpable. Suspicion that Temperance men wanted to deprive the labourer of his grog, but not the rich man of his wine, permeated many of these discussions.

The result of the clash was a near-absolute victory for teetotalism. In Sydney this was

11 CT 19/4/42.
12 Port Phillip Herald 25/2/42.
symbolised by the somewhat reluctant conversion of John Saunders, since 1835 the guiding light of Sydney Temperance. Under his guidance the Temperance Advocate, a weekly newspaper which had taken over from the Magazine in mid-1840, went increasingly on the defensive vis-à-vis abstinence, even to adopting the argument - not inherently absurd, but unlikely to win much respect - that the aims of Temperance and teetotalism were identical, but the former offered more effective means. By the Annual Meeting of the N.S.W. Temperance Society in 1842 this apologetic tone was yet stronger: few speakers claimed more for moderation than that it prepared the way for abstinence. Already (January 1842) the Advocate had become the Teetotaller and General Newspaper. Elsewhere moderate societies folded up completely; total abstinence, the rebellious but legitimate child of moderate Temperance, ruled the household. Except where specifically noted, the


14 SMH 28/4/42.
subsequent text does not distinguish between the different aspects of the movement.

Fortified by the triumph over moderation, teetotalism went from strength to strength in the early 'forties. The societies founded at Launceston (1841), Melbourne (1842), Hobart (1843) and an uncertain number of provincial towns grew finely; meetings were held as often as once a week. During 1843 the Teetotal Advocate appeared in Launceston, while the Total Abstainer and Temperance Advocate briefly took over from the defunct Teetotaller in Sydney. Another journal to highlight the cause in the latter city was the Sun (1843), the main function of which however was to urge the election of Robert Cooper, Sydney's chief distiller, to the Legislative Council! Hobart entered the field with a magazine, the Van Diemen's Land Temperance Herald (1845-49?) and John Moore struggled to establish a

15 F3739.
16 F3928a.
17 F3730.
18 F3103.
teetotal newspaper immediately prior to commencing the Hobarton Guardian.

The first flush of enthusiasm died away in 1846-47. The Temperance press weakened almost to nothing, meetings no longer attracted notice in the general newspapers, the whole movement faltered. Partly as a symptom, partly as a result of this decline, squabbling erupted in the leading societies of both capitals. The upshot differed markedly, however. In Sydney these disputes confirmed the aura of depression; in Hobart friction produced new energy. Two notable results of this were the creation of an 'Agency', which raised funds to send an itinerant advocate into country districts; and the appearance (1850) of the Temperance Banner, later the Standard of Tasmania. Editor of this journal was William Poyser, the mesmerist.

The secular societies emulated John Lynch's enthusiasm for building halls devoted to the cause.

---

19 Cf F4064.
20 See below for details and discussion.
21 Files in TSA.
Hobart and Melbourne claimed particularly impressive structures, but even a tiny settlement like Longford, V.D.L., added to the number. Benefit associations, libraries, a debating club, even a school, ran in conjunction with different societies. Juvenile organisations also appeared, 'Cold Water Army' being the most popular designation. Meetings generally were characterised by infinite speechifying, and infinite tea-drinking. Indeed the whole movement swept along on a torrent of this beverage. What, one wonders, did the consumption total at a Melbourne tea-party where some of the ladies tallied sixteen cups apiece;

22 Teetotal Advocate 25/11/43 (Hobart), 10/4/43 (Longford); Argus 1/10/47 (Melbourne).

23 Teetotaller 26/10/42 (Hobart); SMH 6/9/42, 6/1/49 (Sydney).

24 Argus 9/1/50 (Melbourne); Teetotal Advocate 25/9/43 (Launceston); ML MS A585 (Hobart).

25 Temperance Herald : I, 332 (Hobart).

26 HTC 5/1/48 (Hobart Town Total Abstinence Society : see below).

27 Argus 10/11/46 (Melbourne); Teetotaller 29/3/43 (Sydney); Annual Report of the Van Diemen's Land Total Abstinence Society, Hobart 1850 (F5570).

28 Teetotal Advocate 22/5/43.
at the festival sponsored by George Allen during his mayoralty which 1,000 guests attended; at Maitland when Lynch organised for his teetotallers a "rational evening's entertainment" which continued to four o'clock next morning (some weeks later the priest presented this group with a tea-service for 400)? Meanwhile coffee houses had appeared in the larger towns, providing both a centre of conviviality alternative to the public-house and facilities for signing the pledge. The first Temperance Hotel in Australia opened in 1842: how the faithful must have delighted to read of public-house keepers changing over to Temperance principles! The vogues for such establishments quickly grew strong in Melbourne, later to boast coffee palaces equal to any in the world.

29 WR 14/6/45.
30 MM 29/3/45.
31 AC 5/7/45.
32 Cf Meaden: 19.
33 HTC 8/2/42; although see FP 9/1/41 (advertisement for Commercial Coffee House).
34 Cf Van Diemen's Land Observer 2/1/46 (Susan Stephenson).
The movement attracted the support of eminent and able citizens. Saunders recorded his first impression of the Australians as "people so thin, so sunburnt & many of them so drunk"; he at once set out to change the last quality. Secretary of the Temperance Society for years, its quasi-missionary in rural districts, editor of the Magazine and Advocate, strong link between moderation and abstinence - these were among his roles. Saunders' departure from N.S.W. at the end of 1847 was marked by a public meeting at which many of Sydney's notabilities spoke with clear sincerity; nothing was said of the Baptist Church, a great deal of Temperance. A fulsome appreciation of "the Temperance Advocate" also appeared in Heads of the People, while Harpur addressed Saunders a paean of praise:

If a large love of the whole human race,
With charity that hopeth a meet cure
For life's worst evils, indicates the grace
Of goodness, thine is such as will endure.

35 Letter of 15/12/34 : ML MS B1106.
36 SMH 1/12/47.
37 II, 55-56.
38 Poems, Melbourne 1883 : 236.
The equivalent figure in V.D.L. was G.W. Walker, for whom Temperance probably bulked largest in his arduous work for social regeneration. He and Bonwick organised the abstinence group at Hobart in 1843, and three years later a specifically Christian society. Rev. M.T. Adam, originally imported by Lang as chaplain to the seamen's Bethel, was a dominant figure among Sydney teetotallers in their halcyon years. Born and educated in Scotland, later a representative of the London Missionary Society in India, Adam had spent some years in the United States immediately before coming to Australia and brought with him the confidence and determination which characterised the movement there. His farewell - in November 1845 - prompted a meeting more enthusiastic than that later accorded Saunders, but it did not have the same social tone.

An exact and interesting measure of the difference between Governors Bourke and Gipps, both liberals, was that while the one displayed partiality

39 Cf Col Ob 15/3/43.

40 SMH 6/11/45.
to Catholics and doctrinaire Whig-radicals, the other supported Temperance. The first N.S.W. public meeting ever to boast the Governor as its chairman, was the Annual Meeting of the Sydney society in June 1838. Gipps became president of this body, and as will appear in the next chapter - remained its influential friend. He never signed an abstinence pledge, but his speech at the 1842 Annual Meeting of the Temperance men perfectly expressed that apologetic strain which had become so pervasive:

He was not a teetotaller, but one of those called, sometimes reproachfully, moderate drinkers, but he thought that the Teetotalers ought to be satisfied if he acknowledged that their merits were greater than his.

Franklin, La Trobe, Eardley-Wilmot and Denison were other heads of government in varying degree sympathetic to the movement. The N.S.W. bench provided several notable supporters - Forbes (first president of the Temperance Society in Sydney), Dowling, Burton, a'Beckett and especially Stephen, an outspoken abstainer. Boasting of its circulation, the Teetotaller

41 Australian Temperance Magazine: II, 1 seq.
42 SMH 28/4/42.
named most of these luminaries as well as Deas Thomson, Roger Therry, and Sir Maurice O'Connell.

The conviction most obviously underlying the Temperance philosophy was that alcohol caused much of the world's evil. Writing a report on the colony's morality Gipps pursued the 'line' advanced ceaselessly by Temperance publicists: "Drunkenness, the fruitful parent of every species of Crime, is still the prevailing vice of the Colony." Plunkett, another lawyer-sympathiser, likewise slated intemperance as the major sources of all crime; the Advocate put the figure at nineteen-twentieths, the residue being attributed to "man's natural depravity". In the same simpliste spirit, Temperance men attributed the depression of the 'forties to general extravagance and especially the export of capital to pay for liquor from abroad.

43 14/5/42.
44 HRA XXI : 510.
45 Col 13/6/38.
46 3/11/41.
47 E.g. HRA XXIV : 72 (Adam).
Clearly, Temperance aimed at a thorough-going regeneration of society rather than mere reform of drinking habits. Indeed the question of alcohol was not the crux of the movement. 'Temperance' above all offered disciples of the 'new faith' yet another opportunity to proclaim their message. Utopia could be reached not only through understanding and educating the mind, but through the sheer effort of will signified by pledge-signing. We have already touched upon some links between culture and Temperance, and there were many others. Saunders once described his followers as constituting "in effect, an education society"; the Temperance organisation at Patrick's Plains grew out of a debating club; in the most 'cultured' production of the Sydney press before 1850 - J.S. Prout's Sydney Illustrated with letterpress by John Rae - a reference suddenly appears to "the property of Mr Nobbs .... one of a very prolific class of public nuisances, where distilled poison is daily dispensed to Her Majesty's lieges in the Australian metropolis." The devotion

of Bonwick to Temperance is also pertinent; still more so that Harpur was a devout abstainer who provided the most illuminating of all comments on the inner nature of the movement:

being founded in the heart of wisdom; being a child of the world's better destiny; being of the essence of that spirit of moral enlightenment which is beginning to burst like sunrise over the long benighted earth; being, in fine, not so much a graft upon the tree of modern advancement in social propriety as a shoot from its very pith.

While in verse he celebrated its effect thus

And Ignorance and Crime - each brutal vice
   That brands the brow with shame and steels the heart,
   Are starting from their lairs in human sties.

"What is Temperance?" asked a writer in the New South Wales Magazine, and answered with an exhortation to selfless, reasoned behaviour in every facet of life. He too appreciated both the inner meaning of the movement, and its alliance with culture.

Once the full implications of Temperance are grasped, many statements advanced in its behalf

49 Dated 10/2/48: ML MS C382; see also his notes on teetotalism, ML MS A87.


51 I, 266 seq.
achieve a deeper significance. We find intemperance described as "the bane of social order and national improvement" - not 'a bane', or 'an impediment to'.

At Launceston a Temperance lecturer posited his subject as the supreme issue on the battle for human regeneration:

there are two ruling principles operating in the world, those of good and evil, and by our daily words and actions we are aiding the one or the other.

The equation of Temperance with morality-at-large distinguished an attempt to found a society at Maitland in 1841. Some local worthies declared themselves conscientiously opposed to signing a pledge, although fully supporting the ends it sought. Someone suggested as a compromise that the organisation simply call itself "the Society for the Moral Improvement of Maitland". The Advocate denigrated the plan: the pledge had proved incomparably effective.
Like culture, Temperance sought to comprehend every member of society. This was one aspect of the teetotallers' protest against moderation. But well before he accepted teetotalism Saunders had published articles in the Magazine which called upon "The Magistracy" and "The Gentry" to discard all reservation in support of the movement. Primarily, however, the message was directed towards the working man, or - to use Saunders' term - "The Commonalty":

The fangs of Intemperance are clotted with the blood of the poor .... to the needy Intemperance is the King of terrors, to them he is worse than death.

Such declarations often sounded patronising; but like the advocacy of baths and wash-houses, they were well meant.

The movement deliberately sought the patronage of women. Lady Gipps followed her husband's lead, perhaps influenced also by Lady Franklin - another link between culture and Temperance, whom John Saunders urged to intercede with her counterpart

55 III, 129 seq; 161 seq.
56 III, 177 seq.
57 Meaden : 27.
in Sydney "as female sanction much wanted". One of the fiercest advocates of the cause in southern Australia was a Mrs Dalgarno, a sea captain's wife who travelled with her husband from port to port. She strongly urged the formation of separate women's societies, a development which did duly occur. This trend ran parallel to the dawning concern for the better education of girls, just as the emphasis on juvenile societies did to the faith in primary education. "Shall we be unmoved, and sigh over the desolations that are destroying myriads of the human race?", demanded Poyser in advocating Cold Water Armies, "No, rather let us perish in the conflict; and first let us secure the vantage ground - take possession not only of the youth of this colony, but also of the world, and indoctrinate their minds with the debasement of the rational soul, with the immense depravity which follows drunkenness, and which expands

58 Lady Franklin's Diary in N.S.W. (unnumbered page).
59 H. Button, Flotsam and Jetsam: 89.
60 E.g. Port Phillip Herald 10/3/43.
61 E.g. Standard of Tasmania 9/6/51; Meaden: 27.
into potential evil, beyond the power of moral remedies to resist and subdue."

The main stream of the movement always urged administrative action against the liquor trade, seeing therein yet further promise of man achieving Millennium by resolute, straightforward action. As early as 1835 the cry arose against the government regarding liquor primarily as a source of revenue - an idealistic proposition indeed, for thence came an extremely high proportion of all official income. The Colonist approved full prohibition of the spirit trade in April 1836, and the subject quickly became prominent at society meetings. Saunders proclaimed that it was "the acknowledged duty of government to exercise its power for the welfare of the people,

63 For dissidents see below.
64 *Van Diemen's Land Monthly Magazine* (F2067): I, 65 seq.
65 See statistical introduction.
66 21/4/36.
67 See esp *Australian Temperance Magazine*: II, 5 seq.
and yet it will be found that in the spirit question it has exerted an influence altogether of a pre-judicial kind." He went on to urge that the government encourage the manufacture of cheap wine and, more interestingly, the provision of facilities for manly sports and wholesome amusements. Everywhere Temperance men kept a close eye on the licensing courts, anxious to delimit the retail trade. The Melbourne societies appointed a standing counsel to represent their interest in the courts. A more positively political note sounded when Sydney's teetotallers were addressed en masse by a candidate at the first municipal election, while Tasmanian spokesmen frankly argued for the return of sympathisers to the legislature. Appropriately, some

68 The same: II, 129.
69 The same: I, 185; passim.
70 See further chapter IX.
71 Cf Port Phillip Herald 28/5/44.
72 Teetotaller 22/2/43.
73 Temperance Banner 29/11/50; cf 4/7/50 (letter of "A Teetotaller").
Sydney groups petitioned against the Party Processions Prevention Bill: by 1846 the movement did constitute a 'party'.

While engaging in short-term politics, Temperance men believed most emphatically that their doctrine promised relief from all factionalism, both political and religious. The claim underlay much of the philosophy already outlined, but we might notice two striking examples of its direct adumbration. The first appeared in the Sydney Sun:

Under the banner of Total Abstinence is protection from the deadliest assaults of the enemy of mankind, and from the sound and fury of controversial warfare both in politics and religion. Here all national, religious and political prejudices vanish and are absorbed in the one overpowering sentiment of charity and good will to all.

While the Launceston Teetotal Advocate thus delineated "The Character of Teetotalism":

It is a principle for the rich, and yet it is not aristocratic; it is a principle for the poor, and yet no democratic exclusiveness can be detected in it. It is a

74 V & P 14 & 30/10/46; 13/6/49.
75 29/4/43.
76 26/6/43.
principle for the people, and yet it is unmixed with politics; it is a patriot principle, ready to hold warm and affectionate intercourse with every party in the state, and yet from the views of each and every party, studiously keeping itself aloof .... All can adopt it.

These passages emphasise the parallel between Temperance and culture. Both movements sought to achieve the perfect society by infusing all men with fraternal benevolence and common ideals. Temperance men as well as culturists believed that their specific had far greater potency than police or soldiery; that it would eliminate unjust and rigid class distinctions; that hence nationhood could and must derive. An early declaration of the Sydney Temperance Society condemned drunkenness for "loosening all the ties which bind man to man"; as if in antiphony a correspondent of the Magazine later exhorted his fellows to "rest at nothing short of this consummation, one so benevolent, so honourable, so desirable, and so

77 Some further relevant references are at ML MS A286 : 133 seq; Illustrated Australian Magazine : II, 1 seq; SMH 25/1/38 (Temperance meeting).

78 Half-an-Hour's Reading, Sydney 1834 : 3.
glorious - the absolute sovereignty of temperance." The Advocate made a claim to "the right to dictate, if we dictate well". This was an aggressive creed, seeking absolute triumph.

The movement was remarkable for adding much colour to the lives of its devotees, evocative of a heartfelt passion not easily achieved in the humdrum life of a small colony. An early dramatic moment came in 1836 when the quasi-Quaker merchant John Tawell dumped a load of spirits, consigned to him in pre-conversion days, into Sydney harbour. Many spectators gaped in wonder, and from a nearby boat a man called "that's real murder" (one wonders how he felt when Tawell later went to the gallows for precisely that crime). Allen and Saunders showed how deep were their feelings by forswearing the use of tobacco, which many a spokesman condemned second

79 II, 131.
80 8/12/41.
81 A. Jose, John Tawell, RAHSJ : XVIII, 31 seq, esp 37.
only to alcohol. Indeed devotion to the cause affected many areas of life. The Australian Methodists were very active teetotallers, and broke away partly through their repugnance to take wine, even in the Sacrament. The appearance of a pamphlet on Hydropathy (Launceston 1846), and the arrival of Dr John Singleton (Melbourne 1851) were two forecasts of the impact of Temperance upon medical practice.

The rise of teetotalism, in conflict with Temperance proper, belonged to this theme of enthusiasm. 'Moderation' not merely in drinking, but in every attitude, conflicted with the abstainer's ethos. So the proceedings of the teetotal societies provided much evidence of how thoroughly the movement absorbed the affections of its disciples. At one stage the Sydney group seriously considered the adoption of a full dress uniform. The plan apparently fell through, but the

83 Cf Col Ob 27/6/44 (Garrett's statement).
84 F4254.
86 SMH 13/12/41.
faithful could at least display their belief by wearing Temperance medals. Many teetotal meetings were enlivened by personal testimonials, perhaps from lifelong sobersides, perhaps from ex-drunkards, perhaps from the associates of ex-drunkards. "Well I and mother know it," said one boy in reference to his father's new-found virtue, "for everything goes on well now, and I am sent to school, which I never was before." Propaganda stressed the terrible physical effects of drinking alcohol (in extreme cases it could lead to internal combustion of the body) or the wonderful strength vouchsafed by abstinence (one teetotaller had undergone an operation for the removal of a growth from his testicles, disregarded medical advice to take spirits to deaden the pain, and recovered completely in a matter of days).

The display which characterised the Catholic teetotal societies was typical of the movement

88 SMH 6/9/39.
89 Col 12/1/37.
90 Sun 20/5/43.
generally. Whatever their theology, abstainers throughout the world loved brass music: those at Launceston formed probably the pioneer civil band in Australia, while the Melbourne teetotal society sponsored the first performance on the saxhorn in that progressive city. Temperance song-books appeared on sale in Hobart in 1846, and at least some of the abstainers there took pleasure in dancing on the green. Temperance Festivals were frequent and highly convivial affairs, distinguished by processions, exhortations, tea and cake. Singing, too, of such 'hymns' as this:

Let the Sun be thy nectar!
Drink deep of its beams:
Let the green sward of nature
Thy banquet hall be!
Fill they spirit with sunlight, -
'Tis richer than streams
Of the wine-flowing goblet,
And better for thee! -

91 Cf E. Finn, Chronicles of Early Melbourne : 539; Argus 23/3/47; Victorian Historical Magazine : XV, 13; AE, "Brass Bands".
92 Britannia 1/1/46 (advertisement).
93 HTC 5/1/48; below.
94 The Tasmanian Magazine and Masonic Register (F5208) : I, 43.
Let the Sun be thy nectar;  
'Tis next to divine!  
Where's a vintage more golden  
To gladden thine eyes?  
What's the charm of the goblet,  
The grace of the vine,  
Compared to a bouquet  
Thus brought from the skies? -

Oh! air of the mountain!  
Best wine of the world! -  
Enrich'd with the sweetness  
Of nature alone, -  
I drink of thy spirit  
With sun-gems imppearl'd;  
And challenge Man's vintage  
To equal thine own!

Especially in Hobart were there spokesmen prepared to give a theoretical edge to this encouragement of the emotions. In doing so they revealed very clearly the dissonance between this line of thought and the Puritan emphasis on decorous behaviour, which was no less genuine a factor in moral liberalism. Thus, the editor of Moore's short-lived teetotal newspaper quoted Ellery Channing to counter prudish, spoil-sport criticism of the abstainers' singing and dancing. William Poyser spoke out in the same Transcendentalist vein:

95 Hobart Town Herald 23/1/47.
96 Cold Water Army : 5.
Give to the young disciples of temperance the elements of thought, self-reliance, a capacity to investigate, an inherent love of truth, to embody self-evident truths in gorgeous drapery of fancy, and the refined and sublimated associations of imagination, in pastural beauty, scenic embellishment, up to the most extended combinations of spiritual enthusiasm. Create a taste pure and classical, until the soul is exalted and lives on truth, moral and inspired.

Poyser again expressed this attitude in approving the formation of a cricket club at one of Hobart's Temperance hotels. This recalls Saunders' advocacy of government-sponsored amusements, while Gipps too linked his Temperance principles with desire to see the common people engaging in "the athletic sports, which are national to us."

Many upholders of Temperance felt misgivings about extremism. Saunders himself, while not denying the value of teetotalism, rebuked the "personality and tirade" which marred the abstainers' work, in contrast to the "moderate and rational" quality of the older movement. This type of criticism

97 Temperance Banner 11/4/50.
98 See above.
100 Temperance Advocate 11/8/41.
found clearest expression in the *Herald*, for all three guiding lights of this journal supported moderate Temperance yet treated Adam and his abstainers in much the same fashion as Lang and his democrats. Nor did the encouragement of singing and dancing win universal praise: many Teetotallers adhered to the Puritan rather than the Transcendentalist position.

This division of opinion was part of a wider cleavage within the 'new faith'. Many upholders of moral liberalism came to fear, in Duncan's words, "that the temperance movement is not progressing from the effects of reason and enlightenment, but from those of enthusiasm, which is to be despised, or perhaps dreaded." The Launceston *Examiner* maintained this view with particular intelligence and pertinacity. One correspondent argued that abstinence attracted a certain kind of person chiefly through the opportunities it offered for fanaticism; in the short run this pleasure might be potent enough to

---

101 Cf the 1846 split in Hobart (below); *Argus* 30/10/50 (teetotallers against dancing at Separation fair).

102 AC 20/7/41. Duncan himself did not agree with this view.
replace craving for alcohol, but it would exaggerate rather than correct a drunkard's unbalance of mind. Another aspect of this controversy was the culturist denunciation of the Temperance philosophy on the ground that "no people can be moral who are uneducated." To such people as this commentator Temperance appeared to deny the importance of intellectual training. James Lillie's first address as President of the Hobart Institute touched the issue:

Institutions similar to that which he addressed, were the most effective sort of Temperance Societies; ... providing rational amusement and intellectual relaxation for the labouring as well as for the more affluent was the best preventive Police, and the easiest method of keeping the streets free from drunkards, and the prisons clear of criminals.

Two distinct, if not mutually exclusive groups faced one another in Launceston in the early 'forties: one all in favour of the Institute, one all in favour of Temperance. In N.S.W. Wentworth denounced the movement as "humbug", but generally this feeling never

103 17/9/42 ("A Philanthropist").
104 T & R 2/1/35.
105 True Colonist (F1858a) 7/6/39.
106 LE 22/4/43, passim.
107 SMH 12/9/45 (LC debate).
became so explicit. Only the silence of such as Bourke, Lowe and the Atlas school indicated that they were more or less contemptuous of the movement.

The movement's belief in legislative action encouraged such criticism. A correspondent of the Magazine said in deprecation of the extremists that "they appear to insist on a radical reform of the commercial world which were their principle fully carried out, must destroy all the existing arrangements of society." Richard Windeyer had the temerity to criticise the prohibitionist trend at an Annual Meeting of the Sydney Temperance Society. The Sydney Monitor contradicted the Temperance claim by laying down the proposition that "a statesman must not legislate on the abstract principles of christian morality - he must legislate on principles of expediency"; the appetite for strong liquor was as far beyond the power of legislation to control, as was the appetite for sex. The Herald had no doubt

110 27/7/38.
111 30/7/38.
that the principles of Adam Smith were right in this matter, and the prohibitionists wrong.

Does this division of opinion make nonsense of bringing the whole Temperance movement under the banner of the 'new faith'? Not at all. The prohibitionists' argument was more novel, but not essentially different from the conviction that the state must provide a comprehensive system of education. More important, the controversy at large merely continued that between those who spurned and those who upheld the role of drama and imaginative literature. Poyser's appeal to the affections was the counterpart of Harpur's exposition to the nature of poetry. The enthusiastic strain in Temperance did not deny its legitimacy as a factor in the 'new faith', but rather stressed that moral liberalism was a life-affirming force which appealed to every faculty of man.

What of the Soul? Moral Liberalism and Christianity

As well as being a student of phrenology and astrology, Henry Melville was an outright critic
of Christianity. "The Christian creed," ran a typically obscure sentence from his pamphlet of 1844, "wash it of its dross and tinsel, and it is but the creed of the Egyptian triad and the Buddhist unity." He repudiated the Bible story of the creation, especially its disregard of geological truth, with a touch sure enough to justify his later claim to have anticipated Bishop J.W. Colenso. The moral doctrine of Christianity was satisfactory enough, but few practised it with thorough-going sincerity - more than any other major religion this bore the ugly scars of sectarianism. Among the many contradictions which Melville saw in the Christian creed was belief in God's omnipotence side-by-side with His alleged incapacity to remedy "man's evil propensities". No less objectionable was the notion that one repentant sinner had greater glory in Heaven than the lifelong exponent of good works. Although

---

114 Ignorant Learned, Hobart 1863.
115 Exposition: 80 footnote.
116 The same: 94-95.
Melville scorned his contemporaries' smug confidence in the incomparable wisdom of their age, he had no doubt that Christianity was about to give way to a higher dispensation. "The march of intellect ... as it advances, will induce men to read and judge for themselves, and the whole vision of our fabled superstition must, before long, be exploded".

This pamphlet, which Melville withdrew after publication, was unique in its explicit attack on Christianity from the standpoint of moral liberalism. Most upholders of the 'new faith' would have angrily repudiated the charge of unbelief. Two episodes in particular illustrated this attitude. The first concerned Robert Lowe's 'psychological compulsion' defence of the murderer Knatchbull. The Zoist's publication of Lowe's address naturally aroused interest in Sydney. The Atlas quoted the English magazine at length; the Herald, as noted in chapter I, criticised Lowe's argument as contrary to the Christian doctrine of free will. The barrister's response was to accuse the editors of Pelagian over-

117 Exposition : 124.
emphasis on the area of choice open to man; he evidently did not think of adopting any other touchstone than formal Christianity. The second episode related to the appointment of a headmaster to the Hobart Town High School; a task delegated to two colonists resident in London, J.A. Jackson and Charles McLachlan, acting in conjunction with the Senate of University College. As already mentioned, their choice fell upon J.A. Froude. Just as the decision was announced however, the publication of his agnostic essay *The Nemesis of Faith* led to Froude's disgrace at Oxford and severance from Anglican orders. The Tasmanian selectors at once cancelled his appointment. They had justice on their side in claiming Froude contravened the requirement that candidates hold "no extreme religious opinions", but the Englishman's biographer was not unfair in accusing them of having acted "pusillanimously".


119 HTC 27/6/49, 11/8/49.

The School Council supported the move, angrily denying Gell's charge that the original choice showed their institution's "infidel" tendency.

But was not the qualification demanded of candidates revealing? Did Eccleston care a whit more than Froude for "Faith"? Writing home Arnold described the second choice as "a canny, talkative Irishman, with nothing spiritual about him". And did Lowe use the Pelagian argument in any other than a point-scoring spirit? These episodes have the further significance of suggesting that despite the superficial loyalty of 'new faith' to the old, the two were finally at odds. This proposition has been implicit in much of the argument of the past chapters, and will now be expounded at greater length. Melville will appear unusual only in his forthrightness; the underlying trend of his argument was absolutely typical.

This is not to imply that the advocates of moral liberalism were consciously hypocritical. The situation was far too confused to allow so simple a

---

121 HTC 30/10/50.

judgement. These men did not work out a new system of thought, a new vocabulary of definitions. What they did do, subconsciously and informally, was to identify their belief with so-called 'true religion'. That is, they declared that Christianity taught brotherly love, the importance of secular happiness, the overriding claims of harmony and tolerance. The Monitor put the issue very clearly:

What is the end of religion? The honor of God. What is the honor of God? To do to others as you would be done to; to love justice and mercy; to do good to the fatherless; to plead for the widow; to be kind to all...

Were they wrong in thus interpreting Christianity? This is a question we touched upon in chapter VI, and our answer must again be vague. Had Christ come again in 1850 he might have joined the moral-liberal camp, but if so he would have found himself opposed by the colonists most attached to Christian Truth in its traditional, theological sense. The point is best made by touching upon the controversy first in relation to the major divisions of Christianity; then to the major divisions of moral liberalism.

123 SM 6/2/37.
The Tractarian Anglicans led the Christian attack on the 'new faith' and in turn drew most fire from that quarter. In part liberal animosity to this Church sprang from Utilitarian hatred of privilege. In England actually, in the colonies potentially, Anglicanism had a peculiar, and therefore abominable status. Hence developed in the days before the Church Acts strong liberal sympathy for the voluntaryist principle. E.S. Hall (in his Sydney Monitor) and R.L. Murray (in his Hobart Review) - particularly interesting figures in the story of liberal attitudes to Christianity - pushed this argument very hard; the latter designated any connection between church and state as "adulterous", "incestuous". The Church of England rather than the concept of state-aid being the target of their animus, such men did not object to multi-establishment. On the whole, the Church Acts appealed more to men of the 'new faith' than the old. Coincidentally, as Broughton knew too well, the liberals did in a sense treat Anglicans differently from

124 SM 18/2/35; T & R 9/9/36, 5 & 12/2/36, 26/5/37.
other Christians - as more open to government control and interference.

This animosity soon took on the distinctive colour of moral liberalism. The Church's stubborn insistence on its claim to status, and duty to uphold distinctive beliefs, seemed to demonstrate irresponsibility, if not delinquency, especially by fostering a like spirit of assertion in other groups. The great bane of this Church, declared one commentator in 1839, was its want of "a mild, a tolerant, and a conciliatory spirit". The Monitor even suggested that the government should replace Broughton with a man of more amenable temper. Tractarianism, which emphasised these undesirable elements, naturally provoked the liberals' wrath. Especially during Lowe's editorship, the Atlas maintained this offensive with extreme acerbity. It jeered at the attraction of 'Puseyism' for women; at the "mediaeval nonsense" which emphasised the

125 Cf CT 20/8/39.
127 21/9/36.
significance of ritual and architecture; at the
tendency of the new doctrine to create division
within the Church. The *Australian* once bemoaned
this last tendency simply because it lessened the
effectiveness of the Church as a pedagogue of
morality.

The heaviest charge of the 'new faith'
against Anglo-Catholicism was the latter's reserva-
tion towards human liberty and rationality. Thus
the *Atlas* denigrated opposition to non-denomina-
tional education as part of "a deep and settled
plan" to keep the people in passive ignorance.
The journal appealed to "the enlightened members
of each congregation" to throw off this yoke; the
Lay Association and the Choral Society, subservient
to the clergy and proud of it, seemed very terrible
indeed. That ministers encouraged these organisa-
tions bespoke their "ridiculous and insane" desire

128 17/1/46; 24/1/46; 8/5/47.
129 *Australian* 19/3/44.
130 *Atlas* 10/5/45.
131 17/5/45.
to enslave the masses, deny private judgement, and halt the onward march of enlightenment - all "for the sake of priestly power and influence".

These themes combined in attacks on the formal government of the Church. To the Colonial Times Broughton's appointment seemed to interfere in the progress of colonial self-government; Murray's Review treated the development as a gross joke, frequently gibing at "My Lord Will", or "the Ecclesiastical Baron, the Lord 'Will B. Australia'", who for all his pomp had less "practical usefulness" than many a humble Dissenter. The Bowen affair was held up as an example of arbitrary discipline, anticipating complaints that were steadily to multiply. "We warn all proud Prelates," the Atlas thundered, "that unless they think a little less of their own worldly honours, and a little more of the

133 5/7/36.
134 18/11/36; see also 2/9/36.
135 28/10/36. Broughton's initials were in fact W.G.
136 Cf Sydney Times 27/5/37.
Spiritual welfare of their flocks, their Lordships will soon be 'left alone in their glory'." This journal further alleged that Broughton opposed squatting because he would find a scattered Church more difficult to control. Lowe's 'Freehold Benefice Bill', mentioned in chapter I, was a deliberate attempt to weaken episcopal power; debating the measure he said it aimed to secularise the clergy, to unite them with their congregations, to encourage a noble "spirit of independence". In the course of the controversy surrounding Rev. F.T.C. Russell, Lowe maintained in Council that Broughton violated the constitution in applying law through a Consistorial Court - an argument supported by the British law officers vis-a-vis Nixon.

As other Christians complained and we have had frequent reason to notice, many liberals

137 26/4/45.
138 10/5/45.
139 SMH 11/9/46; Atlas 26/9/46.
140 The Speech of Robert Lowe ... on Tuesday the 7th of August, 1849, Sydney 1849 (F5097).
sympathised with the Roman Catholic Church. Not only Bourke, but Wentworth, Jamison, Bland - that is, the core of the 'Patriotic' group - all actively supported the Church's claim to status and respect. Among the younger liberals Richard Windeyer spoke of Polding as having "the greatest share of dignity ... the greatest respect and influence in the colony", while Robert Lowe addressed a poem to Mrs Chisholm as "The guardian angel of her helpless sex". The attitude of several newspapers carried through the same pattern. Until alienated by Ullathorne's criticisms of transportation, the Australian consistently backed up the Catholic interest, making unnecessary any such journal as

143 Cf AC 1/12/40 (contributor to St Patricks); SMH 16/9/41 (in chair at immigration protest meeting).
145 M. Kiddle, Caroline Chisholm: 16.
the Chronicle; E.S. Hall showed sympathy on the Monitor, as later when accusing the colonial Tories of seeking to rouse a cry against Romanism as previously they had against emancipists. Murray's Review, the Colonial Times and the Port Phillip Herald further testified to the alliance.

Whence sprang this liberal attachment to Rome? First, it was a factor of the hostility to the 'exclusive' Church of England: the history of British Catholicism was one of persecution, the antithesis to privilege. Second, the Church's expression of liberal principles, stressed in chapter V, naturally prompted reciprocation. A hope arose that Romanism was experiencing a wonderful sea change, in favour of the principles of moral liberalism. Again the contrast with the current history of the Anglicans was dazzling. Governor Gipps perfectly expressed the temper of the 'new faith' when he sought to rebuke Broughton by declaring that "Rome was becoming more tolerant than Lambeth". Non-Roman comment

146 SMH 17/2/41.
147 Broughton/Coleridge, 14/10/39.
on the appearance of novel elements in the Church's philosophy had a double edge: Morgan (an admirer of Channing) spoke as a defender of the 'new faith' as well as an Orangeman when he appealed to the laity to pursue their religion free from the burden of a dominant priesthood. We have already noticed a passage in which the Hobart Courier deprecated militant anti-Romanism:

There is no danger of superstition in a new colony: there is far more danger in religion being converted into a mere engine of worldly pursuits. Popery is only inveterate in old countries like Spain and Ireland. Where men have to seek their fortune in a new and distant country, they involuntary acquire an independence of mind and action fatal to all superstitious usages.

This comment illustrated that the apparent sympathy for Catholicism often masked misunderstanding, even contemptuous misunderstanding, of its true nature. When other liberals faced up to this reality, they showed the same hostility to Rome as to the Church of England. Harpur's discussion of "Finality" perfectly expressed this state of mind: the Church


149 Empire 30/6/51.
might appear to have accepted enlightenment, but at bottom the priesthood sought power and wealth in a greedy, earth-bound spirit. Similarly E.S. Hall castigated the idea of church infallibility as "slavish", and had no more sympathy than Morgan for the priesthood. Within eighteen months of publishing the editorial quoted above the Courier savagely attacked the priest-despotism of Rome; the Colonial Times said quite bluntly that Catholicism was acceptable only so long as its votaries refrained from public affairs. This latter was precisely the attitude of the Atlas. So long as Romanists applied themselves to religion alone, argued one editorial, "we shall do no more than smile at their nonsensical mummeries, or pity their senseless superstition"; but should they engage in politics, remorseless attack would ensue. The columns of this journal were chosen by one who had

150 SM 15/4/35; below.
151 19/12/49.
152 25/8/40, 14/10/45.
noticed and wished to publicise the equivocation of Mrs Chisholm's supporters; Polding's opposition to general education was stigmatised as harshly as Broughton's; the Sconce-Makinson conversions used to browbeat every form of Catholicism.

Devotees of the 'new faith' reciprocated the trend of Protestantism towards their own way of thinking. The Protestant emphasis on individual judgement; the favour accorded general education in this quarter; and the growing support for voluntaryism, which appeared to guarantee non-interference in secular affairs and the freedom of the laity - these specific factors cemented the bond. Yet absolute harmony did not prevail: ultra-Protestant criticism of "false liberality" also had its counterpart. The most obvious form this took was deprecation of Orange extremism. To Lowe the movement was a "hideous monster"; he and other liberals voted for the Party Processions Prevention Act, its infringement on personal liberty notwithstanding, because it checked

154 6/5/48 ("Look Ahead").

155 T & R 19/8/36, 3/1/40; Australian 23/7/46; CT 19/11/47.
Orange ravages. But the conflict between Protestantism and the 'new faith' touched deeper levels. R.L. Murray denied the common assumption that post-Reformation Christianity had inspired freedom and enlightenment; the link was but a negative one, comprised of "counter-forces" which were "indirect and independent of her will". Harpur declared that Protestantism came much closer to his ideal than other forms of Christian belief, but warned:

Still mere Protestantism is not the Religious Finality - and least of all Church and state protestantism. Religion in the future will have to found itself upon the nearest approach which can be made by it, in its collective operancy, to an individual basis - namely, a congregational one: or continuing to strive against the spirit of progress, it will be eventually trodden out by it; that is, in its public capacity, to exist simply as a private tendency in the pious hearts and unfailing consciences of men - of men religiously guided by, and amenable to God alone.

One of the major themes of a large theological work to which Hall devoted his latter years was criticism of the clergy of all sects, Protestant or Catholic. Years before the Monitor had written apropos of a

156 Atlas 17 & 24/10/46.
157 T & R 13/4/38.
158 Book I, chapter 7 : ML MS A3221.
scandal surrounding the Baptist, John McKaeg: "any man taking a pew in a chapel can be devout; but who can be always benevolent, always generous, always good?" All this evidence indicates that only on its own terms did moral liberalism accept Protestantism; whenever the latter inclined to hierarchical organisation, or emphasis on sophisticated theology - whenever, one is tempted to say, it took itself seriously - friction developed.

The ultimate incompatibility of 'new faith' and old is reaffirmed by a closer study of the appeal to culture. Again we must turn to Harpur's "Finality" for the single most revealing comment. "What can true religion have to fear from knowledge, the correlative of truth?", the poet demanded. "Or if superstition be necessary to hold ignorance in order, should the people be kept illiterate for the sake of a check so meanly, so miserably reactive? But away with all paltering! Whatever cannot coexist with

159 31/10/36.
entire intellectual liberty, and an unlimiting scope for knowledge, progressively extending itself in all directions, cannot be a true Finality." This comment aimed directly at those who rejected the report of the 1844 Education Committee, which had also invoked "true religion" in support of general education. If one accepts the Catholic viewpoint this controversy obviously has the greatest significance in showing the contempt of the 'new faith' for old; even if one does not, it remains interesting that Carmichael was not alone in discouraging all religious teaching in schools, and that much of this thought had a very sharp anti-clerical edge. W.B. Wilmot of Melbourne sharply distinguished between the "natural" and the "spiritual" mind, maintained that the former alone was amenable to training, and insisted that none but secular education could discharge this function. Through the interference of professing Christians, Wilmot believed, "the goodly plant of social morality which teaches us our duty towards our fellow creatures ... is supplanted by that spurious growth of pharisaical hypocrisy, the peculiar object of
God's displeasure." Wentworth, an arch-secularist in every way, claimed that he desired to exclude all trace of religion from the university simply to avoid dissension, but the persistent telltale phrase reappeared in his declaration that this institution "by increasing education, by diffusing enlightenment, by softening and elevating the habits and manners of the people, will greatly advance the cause of true religion." Hall and Eccleston would also exclude all formal religion from education. In the same spirit, Mechanics Institutes and literary magazines generally took a positive pride in avoiding religious topics. Yet all these people simultaneously claimed to be offering the true basis for personal and communal happiness: in sum, religion had no part in the most vital area of life.

The culturists provided many illustrations of


162 SM 14/1/35; Address by James Eccleston, Esq., B.A., Hobart 1849 : 13 seq.
the identification of Christianity with simple moral virtue. "We love God not for his omnipotence, but for his goodness", declared one speaker at the Sydney Institute, a sentiment which Harpur also expressed. The Heads of the People declared the seeking of truth to be the philosopher's task, while the man of religion should devote himself to "the principle of promoting 'peace on earth, and goodwill towards men'." Perhaps the magazine Literary News best epitomised the common feeling:

an intelligent community without churches, is better than churches without an intelligent community. The moral and intellectual faculties, should, if possible be made to keep pace with one another; but the former can only be worked upon, or appealed to, through the medium of the latter.

The writer's identification of the moral faculties with religion should not be overlooked. His conviction that the mind inspired the soul coincided with Bonwick's dictum that "the brain is the organ

163 Atlas 29/5/47 (Dr a'Beckett).
164 Preface to "Have Faith" : ML MS C382.
165 II, 75.
by which the spiritual part of man acts." We know that Bonwick professed Christianity; but did not his breadth of sympathy, typical of the 'new faith', bespeak an equal shallowness?

Henry Melville was not the only Christian to feel that modern learning had impugned the infallibility of the Scriptures. Hall devoted a chapter of his magnum opus to this subject, self-annotating it as "well argued but will be held dangerous". Lecturing the Launceston Institute on "Natural Theology" a Dr Udny declared "we are not to shift and shuffle the solid strata of the earth to suit the dogmas of any class of men", and went on to attack revealed religion as the progenitor of bloodshed, ignorance and superstition. Yet he believed the study of geology to prove the existence of some Almighty Power, and concluded that practice of the golden rule discharged "all that religion can ever require of us." William

167 J. Bonwick and T. Turner, A Letter to Parents upon the Education of their Children, London 1840: 3.

168 ML MS A3221.

169 LE 17/6/43.
Westgarth also believed that the Bible story needed modification to accord with geological advances. But his greater interest in this context was to express a tension between social science and Christian assumptions. Much of the harm suffered by the aborigines, he believed, sprang from an arrogant attempt to impose Christianity upon them.

The aftermath of Lowe's defence of Knatchbull was the only notable incident relating Christianity, or rather anti-Christianty, and phrenology. The Herald's theology one feels was stronger - even that journal's fierce enemy, John Dunmore Lang, condemned Lowe's argument in similar vein. However no explicit Christian attack on the phrenologists' view of human personality appears in the historical record, logical though it would be. Speakers on the subject did sometimes deny that they were anti-Christian,
evidently an undercurrent of such feeling did prevail. Alexander Harris believed that far from denying Christian truth, phrenology proved it: the science had shown the central organ of the brain to be "venerative", therefore an object of veneration must exist. Similarly the Christian virtues of Faith, Hope and Charity were now demonstrably innate human characteristics. In short, "phrenological discovery brings to testify to the correctness of the sacred ethics a visible and undeniable fact." Alas for the sake of our argument that Harris did not use "true religion"! But the difference between this and "sacred ethic" was purely verbal.

Even more than phrenology, mesmerism and spiritualism and astrology tend to run counter to Christianity by their very nature. It was surely no accident that Henry Melville was uniquely articulate both in his criticism of religion and his confidence in phreno-mesmerism. John Saunders delivered a public lecture in counterblast to Moreau's pretensions;


175 SMH 21/11/46 (advertisement).
an Anglican clergyman who saw Gilbert during the latter's heyday in Melbourne had no doubt that he faced a creed hostile to his own. The very title of the pamphlet, *A Catechism of Mesmerism*, hinted at blasphemy.

In this respect, as so generally, Temperance most truly revealed the nature of the 'new faith'. Christian criticism of the movement was explicit and strong. Three points stood out: that Temperance sought to replace the Gospel with a secular technique, thereby both reflecting on the efficacy of God's word and exaggerating the power of man to help himself; that the pledge-concept denied Christian free will; and that Temperance men invested their faith with the quality of a new religion, concerned only with secular morality.

The best statement of the Christian case occurred when the Anglo-Catholic newspaper *Southern Queen* explained why no Anglican clergyman attended Mayor Allen's tea-party:


177 21/6/45.
there already exists a temperance association, divinely instituted, of infinite power, and efficacy. The substitution of these confessedly human helps for that society, is a dishonor to the clergy (who are its sole accredited officers) .... A resort to the attraction of a festival to lead men to the false idea, that a pledge administered for purposes of sobriety, is the sum of moral requirements, cannot be too strongly condemned.

Archdeacon Marriott once criticised the movement in similar words on a more interesting occasion. Eardley-Wilmot had authorised the mass purchase of the Temperance Herald for distribution among the convicts; Gladstone questioned the move; La Trobe, temporary head of the Tasmanian administration, defended it; Marriott dissented; James Stephen sneered at such exclusive churchmanship; Earl Grey agreed to the purchase, provided that the magazine avoided extremism. Thus Temperance held up a mirror to the dominant trends of current British thought. A third 'blanket' charge against the movement came from the pen of an anonymous commentator who abhorred its "tendency to make a man esteem the world BEFORE his God, as being in itself more powerful for his

178 Enclosures to and minutes on despatch of 12/12/46 : CO 280/198.
conversion, or entitled to a higher degree of homage from its worshippers".

The pen-name of this last writer was "Catholicus", an appropriate choice. Marriott, Gladstone, the *Southern Queen* all attacked Temperance with the same clarity and vigour as they did secular education. Broughton himself was at first sympathetic to moderate Temperance, but then moved away; doubtless his influence caused the clergy's non-attendance at Allen's festival, as later at Saunders' farewell. Yet the High Anglicans were not alone. Bishop Perry told the Melbourne abstainers that men had a God-given right to the rational enjoyment of alcohol; the *Colonial Observer* presented a similar argument; and the *Launceston Examiner* objected on Christian grounds to men who one day attributed their reformation to the Bible, and the next to teetotalism. Even A.M. Ramsay's journal condemned the "blasphemous" assertion that abstinence had shown itself superior

---

179 *Temperance Advocate* 3/2/41.
181 24/9 A2.
182 3/12/42.
to the Scriptures in that it kept men sober more effectually.

How does the support of Roman Catholicism for the movement adjust to this pattern? As suggested in chapter V, it in some degree reflected the Church's alliance with moral liberalism. At the same time there was further significance in the formation of separate Catholic societies. It showed the Church's reluctance to allow the faithful to co-operate fully in the movement at large, and so implied that the latter could easily become antipathetic to the faith. Indeed this broad argument applies to all the moves to establish specifically Christian societies, of which there were several. In Hobart in the early days there were two branches of the movement, one more clerical than the other; in the late 'forties the 'Sydney' (as distinct from the 'Australian') society underwent a crisis for vague, sectarian reasons. Above all, the quarrel


184 The 'Auxiliary' (to the British and Foreign) Society was highly clerical; cf F2406.

185 Christian Standard : I, 21, 74, 94. The 'N.S.W. Total Abstinence Society' now formed.
among the Hobart abstainers in 1846 caused Bonwick and Walker to organise the break-away and deliberately Christian 'V.D.L. Total Abstinence Society'. The new group alleged first, that most of the original body were "especially prompted ... by their enmity or indifference to the religion of the Saviour"; and second, that they proclaimed abstinence to be man's transcendental religious duty.

Temperance statements provide only indirect, yet powerful evidence of the charge of heresy. The Sun used the vital phrase in describing the movement's power to divest true Religion of the repulsive vestments in which ignorance and error have clothed her, and to allure back those who have been affrighted at her disguise, by presenting her in white and shining raiment with a cheerful, placid, sincere, benign countenance and pitying look, inviting the return of her truant children, and promising them protection and rest ...

One earnest teetotaller did go so far as to say that abstinence was essential to sincere Christian belief; Alexander Harris also identified the creeds, in that

186 ML MS A585 : 160.
187 Sun 29/4/43.
188 Argus 10/10/48.
the prime result of his (doubtless sincere and spiritually deep) conversion was strict adherence to teetotalism. Neither of these men was typical. Harpur was more so in using religious terms, both in describing his own personal experience as an abstainer and in his poem to the movement:

A power is stirring - a broad light has shone
Amid the nations; - in the wilderness
Of the world's social horror and distress,
Heralding temperance as the Baptist John
Announced the Christ.

Comparisons between the early days of the movement and of Christianity were frequent (both underwent persecution, appealed to the poor, and countered the prevailing conventions of the day); while such disputes as one concerning whether Isaac Sherwin of Launceston could work for a spirit merchant without impugning his faith, had all the marks of dogmatic controversy. In short, the whole movement advanced in an air of blasphemy.

189 Testimony : 163 seq.
190 Poems : 235; cf lecture on teetotalism : C382.
191 Cf AC 15/9/42 (St Patrick's abstinence society).
192 Teetotal Advocate 3/4/43 seq.
The weakness of Temperance replies to the anti-Christian charge provides final evidence of its truth. A Mr Jones of Hobart illustrated how the essaying of this task could lead to blatant 'identification':

In answer to the objection that they were putting teetotalism in the place of the gospel, he said he denied it, their object was to produce peace and love in the world, and that was the essence of the gospel.

Equally puny were attempts to explain away Biblical references to wine by saying that this was unfermented grape juice; and to build up Scriptural authorisation for abstinence on Paul's declaration that "It is good neither to eat flesh, nor to drink wine, nor anything whereby thy brother stumbleth, and is offended, or is made weak." No abstainer upheld vegetarianism: nor did any attempt to answer the criticism that the movement contradicted the Bible by allowing women an important place in public affairs.

---

193 Temperance Banner 8/8/50.

194 Romans XIV 21. This text was published in each issue of the Van Diemen's Land Temperance Herald.

195 Cf Port Phillip Herald 28/5/44.
Substantial arguments in favour of the consonance of the two faiths were attempted by Saunders and Alfred Stackhouse, an evangelical Anglican of V.D.L. The former began by stressing that Temperance applied only to the improvement of "this terrestrial life"; the Christian should join in, along with "the moralist, the optimist, the good-natured or the worldly wise man" as a proper part of his concern to see Christ's ethic accepted on earth. Further, said Saunders, the practice of Temperance could, and had, led to revelation. He then clinched his argument with the assertion that "what God honours man may cheerfully approve". The vital question was begged; the second part of the essay contradicted the first; Saunders had implied that God blessed a movement in which deists and atheists participated equally with true believers. Stackhouse's lecture on the subject was notably honest. The result was his admission that some teetotallers had justified Christian

196 Australian Temperance Magazine : I, 177 seq.
197 Religious Objections to Teetotal Societies, considered in connection with Christian duty, Launceston 1846.
criticism: he denied, for example, that Temperance really claimed equality with the Gospel message "whatever may be the opinion of individual members." So the book became a call for Christians to mould the movement to their faith, rather than a defence of Temperance as it stood. The implication was precisely that of the formation of Christian societies: the pure essence of the 'new faith' did run counter to the old.

In the course of his argument Stackhouse demanded why anti-Temperance Christians did not feel the same hostility to other means of securing temporal welfare - gaols, police, mutual benefit groups, wash-houses. "They had benevolent societies and building societies, all intended to do good," said Mr Jones of Hobart, "and they were not sneered at because they interfered in the gospel." Neither speaker felt it necessary to examine his assumptions; Stackhouse's query was purely rhetorical. Yet their words had great significance. The 'new faith' did
not stop short at culture, phrenology, mesmerism, and temperance. To gauge its true extent we have not only to measure the impact of the principles underlying these movements, but also to venture into a much wider field of everyday life.
IX DIFFUSION THROUGHOUT POPULAR AND PUBLIC LIFE

Extent

By 1850 the colonial governments had accepted the principle of sustaining primary education. Mechanics Institutes, botanical gardens, the Australian Museum, the Tasmanian Public Library - all benefited from official aid. In brief, the demands of culture had left an impress on 'public' affairs. But what of 'popular life' - the standards and behaviour of the average man?

In both colonies the number of schools and scholars, both state and private, was very high indeed. From V.D.L. various witnesses confirmed that these statistics represented genuine feeling. T.A. Forster, Anglican chaplain on a convict transport, believed that the only way in which his Church could impress itself upon the Tasmanian lower orders was by establishing schools, for even the most depraved wanted their children to receive instruction.

1 See statistical introduction.

Also writing in the late 'forties, H.P. Fry declared that no community afforded more opportunities for popular education. Melville agreed: "there may be said to be a school fever just now raging among all classes of the people. With the infantile population, scholars are sought, and fought for, with great zeal". One of the government schoolmasters in Hobart found parents who insisted on paying more than 3d. per week. "Respectable persons sometimes think the usual payment is too small."

Precisely similar comments concerning N.S.W. do not exist. Nevertheless, the long argument as to the best system proceeded on the assumption that the people wanted education; one legislative committee heard that ex-convicts especially were anxious for their children to enjoy this blessing. The great test came after 1848, for the inauguration

---

5  CO 280/182 : 322.
6  Evidence of J.L. Innes, Renewal of Transportation Committee, LC 31/10/46 : 30.
of National schools depended largely on local enthusiasm. A.G. Austin's study of G.W. Rusden, touring agent for the National Board, leads him to conclude that the new venture revealed a "heartening demand" and that "the people's response in terms of schools initiated had been very satisfactory." The archives of the National Board show that enthusiasm fluctuated widely, but could touch genuine excitement. From Wagga Wagga the police magistrate reported:

the anxiety so generally evinced by the laboring classes here, for the education of their children, affords ... the most confident assurance that the establishment of a school at Wagga Wagga, will be hailed as a blessing by those for whose benefit it is principally intended, and that when in operation, it will be warmly supported by all classes and denominations throughout the District.

One of the few places at which arose a clash between the two systems was Carcoar (August 1849). Under the cry "if we cannot have divinity in any particular form, let us have reading and writing in all their branches", the nationalities overwhelmed their

7 A.G. Austin, George William Rusden and National Education in Australia 1849-1862 : 60.
8 F.A. Tompson/National Board of Education, 19/9/49 : N.B. Correspondence, ML.
opponents. The incident must have delighted Rusden who by 1853 claimed that the national system had proved far more popular. The distinctively liberal view of education was making headway fast.

 Probably the most illuminating document relevant to this issue was a report on Victorian schools, prepared in mid-'51 by Hugh Childers. He praised the "prevalent spirit of enquiry, the attention and goodwill of the Legislature, and the absence of the extreme social distinctions", all of which contributed to an atmosphere receptive to education. Childers estimated that two-thirds of eligible children attending school in urban areas, one-half in the "suburbs", and considerably fewer in the bush. "The colony swarms with petty schools", he commented; but the conductors of many were semi-literate old men or labourers' wives, acting as baby-minders rather than pedagogues. Pupil numbers rose appreciably as feast-

9 SMH 13/8/49.


and prize-days came around. Such remarks echo Reeves' *Australian Era* article, and many other lamentations over the disregard for learning (especially clear among the natives, commented *The Heads of the People*, in contrast with their enthusiasm for sport). Nor should the high ideals of the best teachers blind us to the tragicomic reality experienced by most. The school on Duntroon estate probably excelled many, yet squire Charles Campbell found the pupils ludicrously ignorant.

Such ambiguities dominate the popular reaction to science. There were manifestations of real interest. Heated debate continued over the most preferable steam route to Britain; a public holiday (July 3, 1850) marked the opening of work on the Sydney-Parramatta railway; balloon ascents attracted many spectators, and the first large-scale

---

12 I, 85.


15 See references cited note 94, chapter VII.
illustration featured in the Australian press was of
a flying machine recently constructed in Britain.
But obviously vulgar curiosity and material interest
explained much of this reaction. Gipps commented
that the Botanic Gardens enjoyed popularity only as
a place of relaxation; while for all the interest
in medical science, the common people consumed vast
quantities of Holloway's Pills, advertised to cure
everything from venereal disease to tuberculosis.

General literary culture had more palpable
success. A Presbyterian clergyman, David Mackenzie,
commented upon the "immense number of books of a
certain class read throughout the colony. Everybody
reads." He exaggerated, but not grossly. One
traveller described how shepherds crammed together
to hear Nicholas Nickleby read aloud; Alexander
Harris believed that an itinerant bookseller would

16 Australian 14/8/43; SMH 15/8/43; LE 19/8/43.
17 HRA XXIV : 723.
18 Cf letters of T. Holloway, CO 201/424 : 429-
30; 201/437 : 395.
19 Ten Years in Australia, London 1851 (first
published 1845) : 44.
prosper in the bush for his wares would be "at once, one of the most scarce articles in the colony and one of the most desired." The proliferation of newspapers, an outstanding feature of these societies, could not have happened without a receptive audience. T.J. Ewing justly expressed proud wonder when showing that 214,877 journals went through the Tasmanian post in 1841. Several newspapers sought an audience outside the educated bourgeoisie; so too did the Australian Penny Journal and, outstandingly, The Heads of the People.

John McGarvie had this to say of the power of the press:

Times are widely different from the last Century. Then the church and pulpit were the vehicles of knowledge, now it is the daily Press. Men are less evangelical for Religion. They hear a Sermon, but read Six newspapers weekly, the Bible never. The voice of the people was echoed by the Minister, now the Editor is the organ of politics and liberty.

23 F4703.
24 Quoted Nadel, Australia's Colonial Culture : 242.
Just as many apostles of culture tended to exaggerate how far the colonies fell short of their ideal, so McGarvie approached the other extreme. Yet his judgment has an impressive ring of certainty. Similarly, J.S. Prout's opinion concerning the development of popular artistic taste carried unique authority. In the Sydney of 1839, he declared ten years later, some individual homes possessed true elegance, but generally "love of ornament" found expression in "vulgarly coloured scriptural prints, sporting subjects, unwieldy oxen, etc. etc." Yet Prout's lectures to the Institutes attracted enthusiastic audiences, and the success of the exhibitions he helped arrange marked further progress. Retailers found it worth their while to import high quality art materials; engravings from Landseer, Wilkie and Turner replaced garish prints.

What of the Institutes, most determinedly 'popular' of all cultural media? Nadel has argued that they failed, especially in bringing education to the working man. Certainly the Institutes never

25 HTC 13/6/49 (from the Art Union Monthly).
realised their loftier ambitions, and finally faded into decay. By then however primary education had made adult instruction more or less irrelevant: before 1850 there was a distinct working class response. Even the Melbourne and Sydney Institutes, which more than most remained bourgeois reserves, were described respectively as "supported by all classes, and tolerably well attended by the operatives"; "numerously attended by all grades of society, from the Governor down to the chimney sweep". Insofar as these statements were true, the Institutes had succeeded not only in winning the masses, but also in fusing economic classes together. At Lillie's inaugural address in Hobart the pit and stalls of the Victoria Theatre were occupied irrespective of rank. The (largely successful) movement for shorter hours among drapers' and other shop assistants likewise redounded to the glory of the 'new faith'. The assistants stressed that they needed leisure in which to become educated

27 Mackenzie : 45.
28 True Colonist 7/6/39.
and moral citizens, and showed their good faith by raising self-improvement societies in both capitals.

A development still more interesting, albeit at odds with the 'new faith' claim to heal all sectional antipathy, was the appearance of proletarian consciousness vis-à-vis the diffusion of culture. This theme traced back to the foundation of the Sydney Institute, for a group of Sydney artisans, including the radical Richard Hipkiss, anticipated Carmichael in formally constituting this organisation. In 1841-42 this Institute suffered an upset when its debating group insisted on discussing political issues and broke away when refused permission. Leading spirit in the Melbourne Debating Club later in the decade was William Clifford,

29 Cf SMH 10/12/44 (public meeting); CT 12/2/47 (assistants' statement); Nadel: 180-81.

30 The Sydney Drapers' Assistants started a cultural society in 1843, which later became the Commercial Reading Room, then Bellingham's Reading Room; a second venture began in 1848. For the Hobart group see HTC 15/12/47, 16/2/48, etc.

31 Griffiths 199-200 (the narrator is at fault in speaking of "William" Hipkiss).

32 See esp SMH 27/9/41.
the old soldier who so detested the despotisms established throughout Europe in 1815. Another pertinent Melbourne-ite was a Mr Tankard who led the working-class meeting which discussed the celebration of Separation. As noticed in chapter IV, one speaker urged the prohibition of all assisted migration; but Tankard's, the stronger, faction wanted the construction of a hall devoted to Temperance and education.

Brisbane also contributed an interesting episode. William Langridge, the chief working-class spokesman there, was also secretary of the Institute and doubtless had something to do with charges that the body was a hot-bed of radicalism. Although Duncan at first denied this criticism, he later withdrew from the presidency because of the democratic, turbulent tone of several leading members. Even more interesting was the establishment (1849-50) of the V.D.L. Mechanics School of Arts, as distinct

33 Argus 28/9/50.
34 ML MS A2877; cf MBC 13/10/49 (letter from Duncan).
from the Hobart Institute to which alone we have previously referred. It aimed to teach simply reading and writing; operatives alone managed its affairs; and one leading personality was William Jeffrey, chief working-class politician in the island. Meanwhile Hawksley had inspired similar moves in Sydney, but they came to nothing.

Our estimate of the spread of Temperance can begin where that of education ended: with the response of the working man. Both Tankard (wonderful) and Jeffrey earnestly supported this cause; the latter had been prominent in the 1846 split among the Hobart abstainers, which almost certainly involved an element of class antagonism. This feeling had erupted in Sydney during 1842 when members of the Australian Total Abstinence Society witnessed considerable political action; working men were warned against allying themselves with power-seeking gentry and urged to think of themselves as the productive,

36 PA 21/7/49; see also 10/2/49, 7/7/49.
vital part of the community. "The society was the working-man's society," said one speaker at the General Meeting in August, "they did not want gentlemen among them." George Allen ceased thereafter to be president of this group, and was soon after prominent in the foundation of the Sydney Total Abstinence Society.

This turbulence, precisely like that within the Institutes, contradicted the idea that the new faith should unite all groups in harmony. Yet to emphasise this qualification too much would be foolish; rather, such turbulence evinced moral liberalism's success in attracting the common man. Bonwick's Reminiscences have particular interest in this regard since the author makes clear his admiration for the days when the movement was genuinely popular, before the churches took over. Yet Bonwick had split from the Jeffrey group on religious grounds: did his Reminiscences mean to apologise to these old

37 Teetotaller 9/7/42 (correspondence); 16/7/42 (meeting).
38 Teetotaller 31/8/42.
antagonists? Whether so or not, Bonwick had made the point of the popularity of the movement in the 'forties. In Australia as elsewhere, teetotalism was largely the creation of the working-class. Both in teaching the techniques of organisation and implanting a sense of respectability, the movement demands recognition as a vital passage on the road to latter-day democracy. As mentioned in chapter V, the Catholics were particularly conscious of this political aspect, but they were not alone - Poyser, for example, recognised it explicitly.

The statistical introduction shows that the number of pledge-signers put Temperance upon the level of a sizable religious sect, and we have seen that "exalted enthusiasm" was common. A few glimpses into the personal life of teetotallers bear out the impression that the creed meant much to its disciples. Governor Fitzroy, requested to provide information concerning Rosina Spence, an emigrant girl, reports that she and her husband live in teetotal bliss;

40 Cf LE 2/4/43; SMH 20/5/39, 6/9/39.
41 Temperance Banner 26/9/50.
42 HRA XXVI : 235-36.
Michael Monaghan, an Irishman in Rigney's parish, stresses his membership of the teetotallers when urging his wife to join him; J.F. Mortlock, a gentleman convict in V.D.L. penned this glorious affirmation of moral liberalism:

Economy being the order of the day, my humble deposits in the savings bank slowly accumulated. Abstinence from all fermented liquors was no sacrifice; fine clothes had ceased to be appropriate. Except for a slight subscription to the Mechanic's Institute, I only indulged myself with a healthy ramble ...

Multiply such instances a few hundred times, and the sum becomes very large.

Despite the proletarian consciousness we have described, despite the sectarian divisions within the movement, despite further quarrels instigated by Rechabites in both colonies, Temperance did have some success in fusing society together. Other signatories to the pledge on which Gipps affirmed his allegiance included one woman, a menial servant, at least on Roman Catholic, other Irishmen, and

43 CO 201/341 : 137.
44 Experiences of a Convict, London 1865 : 98.
45 Sun 6/4/43; HTC 6/7/50.
semi-literates. So late as 1848 Boyce and McEncroe joined forces on the Temperance platform, suggesting that Catholic support of denominational societies did not exclude wider participation. Charles Harpur and his brother Joseph continued close friends despite the latter's conversion to Rome. They had a common belief in Temperance and other aspects of the 'new faith' - in fact through associating with Lynch on this question Joseph became sympathetic with the Church. That he remained a particularly liberal Catholic, supporting National Education for example, was particularly significant. A wider-ranging tribute to moral liberalism came from H.P. Fry, his Tractarian beliefs notwithstanding. In 1845 he wrote that V.D.L.

is not disturbed by processions of Socialists or assemblies of their organised thousands cheering with loud acclamation the expression of atheism and blasphemy. The lower classes

---

46 ML MS At71. The Catholic was Standish Callaghan.


48 Information by courtesy of J.N. Rawling; SMH 1/10/42; MM 4/10/45, 4/12/47.

49 Correspondence on Convict Discipline and Transportation, HC 16/2/47: 191.
of our society evince a more hopeful inclination, by attendance at Temperance Assemblies and meetings of Mechanics' Institutions.

The evidence so far accumulated hardly touches the question whether Temperance succeeded in regenerating popular habits. It is a question inherently difficult to answer. Most supporters would have led upright lives quite irrespective of the organised movement; many joined societies simply to set a good example. "When a sober man and all his family are included in the list of converts," sagely commented the Examiner, "it may be set down to the progress of opinions, but not of morals". Change of opinion is important, but the Temperance men claimed to be achieving more. Yet there is a still greater obstacle to reaching a firm conclusion. What is the relation between the activity of Temperance in any particular environment and the surrounding moral state? The Examiner comment suggests that a powerful movement would denote a community already devoted to moral principles. On the other hand, it

50 Cf Mackenzie: 51.
51 3/12/42.
appears very logical that Temperance be strong where drunkenness and other laxity abound: conversely, even the dying off in Sydney at the end of the 'forties might have been the bitter-sweet fruit of a little success. Finally, few contemporaries could deliver knowledgeable and impartial judgement. Even the honest G.W. Walker might have exaggerated when he wrote from Hobart (1845) that Temperance had "wrought a complete change in the circumstances, character and prospects of, I believe I may say, hundreds in this town." A police officer anxious to proclaim his own efficiency was no better witness when claiming increased sobriety, than a quick-moving tourist ready to assert that "Drink, drink, drink" was the "universal motto" in Sydney.

People did, of course, continue to get drunk; Mrs Dalgarno attracted hecklers ("where's your


53 Evidence of J. Wearin to Police Committee, LC 14/9/47: 54.

54 J.C. Byrne, Twelve Years' Wanderings in the British Colonies from 1835 to 1847, 2 vols, London 1848: I, 136.
breeches?"") as well as converts; many citizens continued to read such journals as Bell's Life which stood for all that Temperance opposed. Nevertheless one's general impression is that drunkenness did lessen. Charles Windeyer, speaking with the authority of a metropolitan police magistrate, said in 1844:

I think the offence of drunkenness has diminished; that the Temperance Societies have been doing a great deal of good; and that distress has been doing still more; the inability to purchase the indulgence has been, I think, one of the main causes.

An official Tasmanian committee which enquired into the decline in revenue from the liquor trade (1849) reversed this emphasis, noticing the impact of a current recession but underlining changed drinking habits. Whereas a few years before pounds would be squandered on rum, "now, a man more frequently calls for a moderate quantity of beer, which he divides with his companion; and there is, comparatively speaking, no immoderate treating."  

Westgarth

55  Port Phillip Gazette 18/5/44.
56  Insecurity in Sydney Committee, LC 23/8/44 : 35.
showed that the Melbourne police courts heard start-
lingly fewer drunken charges each succeeding year in
the early 'forties; Catholic societies won applause
for the marked decrease of alcoholic rowdyism on St
Patrick's Day. Probably Bonwick used the happiest
phrase when he spoke of a developing "national feel-
ing of respect for temperance".

The movement's impact on official policy was
particularly interesting in N.S.W. during Gipps'
government. At his first General Meeting (1838)
the Governor told the Temperance Society that he
would introduce legislation to regulate the trade,
although severe legislation, he feared, would en-
courage evasion. The statutes duly went through
Council, against the opposition of local distillers.
During the 1839 session the legislature received
many petitions urging that local distillation be

58 *A Commercial, Statistical, and General Report
on the District of Port Phillip ... 31st of
July, 1845, Melbourne 1845 : 30.

59 22/3/45.

60 *Australian Temperance Magazine* : II, 5 seq.

61 2 Vic no 18, 2 Vic no 24, 3 Vic no 9, 3 Vic
prohibited, and a committee enquired into the subject. It supported the move, as a first step towards more thorough restriction. The issue never came to a general vote, indicating that the committee's opinion was not general. But the Temperance viewpoint continued to pull on Gipps' mind, tearing him away from the common sense administrative position. In 1840-41 he increased the excise on all spirits to what he probably hoped would prove a quasi-prohibitive level (maximum, twelve shillings per gallon). It was a bold stroke, and must have caused the Governor many worried hours. At first Gipps claimed success in having reduced consumption; yet evidence grew that while the revenue shrank, smuggling and illicit distillation expanded. The alternative had to be faced: still sterner repression or recourse to moderate excise. After planning a measure enforcing the former policy, the

63 4 Vic no 11, 4 Vic no 16, 5 Vic no 16.
64 HRA XXI: 720.
65 Cf HRA XXI: 725.
Governor instead sent down a bill which cut duties by half (1843). Saunders protested; Gipps, vacillating pitifully, was clearly pleased to recommend disallowance of his own measure when the Council converted it into a corn-protection law. This could only postpone a showdown, however, and two years later excise was reduced to 3/6d. per gallon. Quasi-prohibition had failed.

Yet at other points Temperance men had reason for satisfaction. The Tasmanian Government forbade local distillation in 1838 - purely a fiscal measure, but one firmly upheld by teetotalers. Gipps stopped the issue of rum to Imperial troops and inspired an Act which encouraged the manufacture of wine as a check against spirit-drinking. Further legislation

66 V & P 31/10/43.
67 SMH 13 & 15/11/43.
68 HRA XXIII : 296.
69 9 Vic no 20, 9 Vic no 26, 11 Vic no 7.
70 F2656; 2 Vic no 20.
71 Cf LE 1/1/45 (Temperance Festival speeches).
72 HRA XXI : 718 seq; XXIII : 284; XXIV : 154.
echoed Adam's plea that aborigines should be sheltered from the white man's curse. Gipps' statutes of 1838-39 were but part of a very long history of increasingly severe control over the mechanism of the trade; in V.D.L. both Franklin and Denison attempted to restrict the total number of public houses. Especially in Melbourne the constant pressure on the magistrates' courts to issue licences with care had some effect. Governments gave support of another kind when they purchased Temperance publications for bulk distribution among convicts, and issued land grants for Temperance halls.

* *

Official action did not end with control of the liquor trade. We have noted many times that the legislatures diligently propagated the "true religion" view of Christianity. Bourke's original

73 SMH 6/9/42 (Adam); 13 Vic no 29, clause 47.
75 Cf Argus 8/5/49, 16/4/50.
76 Australian Temperance Magazine: I, 68;
 CO 280/198: 150 seq.
Church Act specifically mentioned "morals" as well as "religion", and that emphasis grew steadily. Denison's education policy was a victory for traditional Christianity; but against this stood multi-establishment, the Marriage Acts, general cemeteries, a near-secular university, and the refusal to have prayers read in the N.S.W. legislature. While the Denominational Board found increasing disfavour, teachers under the National system were required to evince not "Christian belief" or "Christian zeal" but "Christian sentiment". The popular representatives were significantly ahead of the government in such matters. Wentworth and J.P. Robinson fiercely lashed opponents of general cemeteries, for example, showing not a whit of sympathy for Broughton's protest. Wentworth, Lowe, Richard Windeyer led the majority who urged that the government extend state aid to Jews: the local

77 Nadel : 252.
78 Cf H.N. Birt, Benedictine Pioneers in Australia: II, 166.
79 By-Laws of National Board, LC 22/5/49.
80 Esp SMH 6/8/47.
executive was willing, but Grey and James Stephen most emphatically opposed. The only legislator who consistently stood against the tide was Charles Cowper, true to his election platform of 1843.

Concern for morality showed itself at a different level in connection with public administration. Tasmanian history provided two early illustrations. In 1835 the convict transport George III ran aground in d'Entrecasteaux Strait, 134 deaths resulting. Rumours spread that immediately after the disaster the military guard had shot down the convicts as they strove to burst above decks. A commission of enquiry examined these allegations; it found them proved, tragic, yet not directly censurable. Four years later public opinion rose high when the principal of the government Orphan School in Hobart accused his second master of inhumanly using the whip. After a tortuous, angry, controversy both men left the institution.

---


82 HTC 24/4/35.

83 HTC 9, 16 & 23/8/39.
In Sydney the drive to purity affected police administration very deeply. Bourke and Gipps both paid this question much attention, but only with the appointment of a Council committee in 1847 did great interest arise. Witnesses stressed the need for higher standards, especially in the human quality of the ordinary policeman. Over the next two years successive heads of the force, W.A. Miles and J.L. Innes, were dismissed for inefficiency. In 1850 another committee sat, while one W.C. Mayne prepared an independent report to Council. The result was an Act (14 Vic no 38) which centralised the administration of the force and imposed minimum conditions for the constabulary. Both Governor Fitzroy and the Australian Era ranked police reform as a most significant issue of the 1850 session. Meanwhile the administration of Darlinghurst gaol (Sydney) had come within the legislature's critical

84 Cf H. King, Some Aspects of Police Administration in New South Wales 1825-51, RAHSJ : XLII, 205 seq.
85 Police Committee, LC 14/9/47.
86 Police Committee, LC 27/8/50; Police Establishment papers, LC 5/6/50.
87 V & P 2/10/50; Australian Era : I, 6 seq.
purview and its Governor, Henry Keck, gone the way of Miles and Innes. If witnesses to the pertinent committee spoke truly prisoners had an easy life indeed, enjoying the government's bounty while engaging in lucrative manufacture of cabbage-tree hats. But the sanitary condition of the gaol and its educational facilities also attracted the legislators' notice. Lowe's enquiry into the City Corporation (1849) professed to aim at corruption and inefficiency: without forgetting the points made in chapter IV, we need not deny all good faith in this.

In 1843-44 police action in Sydney suppressed three sport-cum-scandal sheets; the editor of one, T.R. Johnson (later connected with Bell's Life) was sentenced to two years' gaol for obscene libel. The first charge against a seller of obscene prints in Sydney came before the magistrates late in 1844. N.S.W. law regulated public bathing and the conduct

88 Darlinghurst Gaol Committee, LC 22/8/49.
89 City Corporation Committee, 2/8/49.
90 Australian 12,17 & 19/4/43; F3269, 3703, 3884.
91 Atlas 14/12/44 (the charge failed).
of gaming houses, while Tasmanians who conducted places of entertainment or travelled on steamboats also came under restraint. Both colonies legislated to enforce some Sabbath observance, and against cruelty to animals.

The greater part of paternalist legislation aimed at improving public health, a subject on which popular feeling ran high. The Corporation's unpopularity and vulnerability both owed much to its indifferent record in improving the sanitation of Sydney. Thus a major witness before Lowe's committee was Dr Isaac Aaron, a political radical and the colonies' nearest counterpart to Edwin Chadwick. Still earlier (1848) the legislature had taken action to establish a general abattoir on Glebe Island, ending the practice of every butcher having his own slaughter-house. Probably in response to the criticism of 1849, the Corporation itself considered

92 2 Vic no 2, 14 Vic no 9 (N.S.W.); 6 Vic no 5, 6 Vic no 10 (V.D.L.).

93 2 Vic no 22 (V.D.L.); 2 Vic no 2, 5 Vic no 6 (N.S.W.).

94 8 Wm IV no 3 (V.D.L.); 14 Vic no 40.

95 Slaughter House Committee, LC 31/5/48: Report; cf 13 Vic no 42.
appointing a Board of Health, and the construction of public baths. The N.S.W. Statute Book included references to public lavatories, sewerage, safety regulations on steamboats, and sanitation in factories. So early as 1838 a legislative committee had enquired into the medical profession, and so did another eleven years later. From 1840 a statutory "Court of Examiners" regulated medical standards in V.D.L.

The government maintained public hospitals as part of the old convict system, and thither the indigent poor generally could resort. As Transportation to the senior colony ceased, the local administration began to subsidise several civil hospitals - not willingly, but virtually coerced by public opinion. From 1847 Sydney had a government-

96 PA 16/11/50, 7/12/50.
97 2 Vic no 2; 11 Vic no 3; 14 Vic no 33.
98 Practice of Medicine Committee, LC 2/10/38; Medical Profession Bill Committee, LC 5/10/49.
99 4 Vic no 24.
100 Cf K.S. Inglis, Hospital and Community, Melbourne 1958; J.F. Watson, The History of Sydney Hospital from 1811 to 1911, Sydney 1911.
sponsored vaccine institution, and various philanthropic institutions in that city further enjoyed official bounty. But attracting more attention, and prompting clearer expression of the time-spirit was the lunatic asylum at Tarban Creek. Erected in 1836, the asylum had as its first manager J.T. Digby - a man of humane spirit and great devotion to his work. Nevertheless in 1846 criticism (not altogether free from the taint of jobbery) alleged that he treated the lunatics in crude and barbaric fashion. The legislature appointed a committee which reported in terms of profound sympathy for the insane. Not only the question of undue discipline attracted notice, but also health, cleanliness, and the provision of books. In consequence of this enquiry several administrative charges came about, some contemporaries seeing therein promise


104 Cf *Bell's Life* 19/1/50.

105 Lunatic Asylum Committee, LC 21/10/46.
of a new era in this unhappy subject. Particularly important was the appointment as superintendent of Dr Francis Campbell, the disciple of phrenology and a man who believed philanthropic work to be "divine". He at once set out to prove his faith in absolute non-coercion, believing (like Maconochie) that sympathetic treatment could transform men often considered far beyond redemption. Campbell never became disillusioned and looked back with pride on his work at Tarban Creek as "the conversion of a hell into a heaven for that isolated portion of human brotherhood whom it has pleased God to be-reave". All V.D.L. had to offer against this episode was the presence of Bishop Willson, an act tightening up the treatment of the insane, and John Morgan's long standing insistence that forward looking principles should determine the administration of asylums, hospitals and gaols.

---

106 SMH 11/12/47; Heads of the People : II, 68.
107 Atlas 7/2/46 (letter).
109 Tasmanian Weekly Dispatch 27/11/40; Britannia 12/2/46. The Act was 10 Vic no 9.
Meanwhile "popular life" had kept pace with these 'public' developments. Somewhat patronising, do-gooder charity had a long history in the colonies: we have mentioned various societies from time to time and for Sydney at least a very thorough account is available to the historian. A similar study of Hobart would include reference to the Maternal and Dorcas Society (so old-fashioned as to heed members who on principle opposed the education of the poor), two societies for retrieving prostitutes (1842, 1848) and the Hobart Town Dispensary and General Humane Society. In 1851 eight towns in N.S.W. had general benevolent groups; Victoria and V.D.L. probably equalled the tally. Personal distress and public calamity (bushfires, depression, above all the British famine of 1845-46) prompted subscription lists and generous giving. All this benevolence is relevant to our theme. Sectarianism did sometimes

110 Peyser.
112 Cf F3635, 4543, 4941, 5223.
113 Benevolent Societies paper, LC 18/12/51.
arise within the societies, but more as the exception than the rule: thus a great stir arose when H.P. Fry refused to serve with William Hall on the committee of the Hobart Dispensary. For the rest, these societies did provide a place where men of different faiths joined in a common endeavour. Further, benevolence helped express that fraternal love so dear to the 'new faith'. It was after listing the charitable institutions in Sydney that one traveller commented:

In a word, Australia is a pattern to all new colonies, and Sydney - all its history taken into account - is a thing to wonder at! It is marvellous in its institutions of every kind, and though striking evidences of its origin and newness meet one everywhere, as must be expected, there are other evidences equally striking, which prove that the energies of a great community and an enlightened people are struggling to advance the public good in every department of human acquirements.

Still further, we find even within this traditionalist charity, hints of an approach yet more akin to moral liberalism. The Sydney

114 AC 7/12/47.
Benevolent Society presented its work as the strongest barrier against the evils of a Poor Law; at its asylum efforts were made to impose "a strict and humiliating discipline for ... moral improvement." The Hobart Dispensary emphasised its respect for the ideal of encouraging "self-respect and self-support" among the people. Most of the famine relief fund went to subsidise not doles, but emigration. Do these trends smack of the hypocritical arrogance usually associated with Samuel Smiles? In part, yes. But here, as with Temperance and wash-houses, the idea that the working-class could and must achieve respectability, was more important than any excrescence, however nasty. Harpur's "individualization" and Channing's belief (not unnoticed in the colonies) in the glory of men voluntarily associating together to remedy their ills made a sum little different from 'self-help'. As the common

117 The Hobart Town General Dispensary and Humane Society, Hobart 1847 (F4543) : 3.
118 Cf SMH 5/12/49.
119 Col 18/2/36.
man answered this call, so he acted in the light of moral liberalism.

And help himself he did. The number of benefit societies within the colonies is well beyond computation. Members of a common trade, or district, or congregation, or masonic lodge, or Temperance society - all banded together for this purpose. The syllabus of the Camden Park society shows that theoretically at least these clubs aimed to provide security from cradle to grave as well as providing a social centre, insurance fund, and savings bank.

Doyen of general groups was the Australian Union Benefit Society (Sydney 1834), in the foundation of which the radicals led by Hipkiss had again played a part. In 1849 the Australian Mutual Provident Society set out on its successful history. "A poor law degrades the character of a man," said an early A.M.P. statement, "but Life Assurance or a Deferred Annuity, exalts and improves it." The Melbourne

120 ML MS A2987.
122 Australian Mutual Provident Society (Rules), Sydney 1849 : 8.
U.B.S. (from which, significantly, the Mechanics Institute had sprung) expressed the same idea in this self-portrait:

this institution ... encourages a friendly and social feeling, it tends to promote sobriety and frugality, and to lessen crime by animating hope, and dispelling despair. Thus, every lover of mankind, every true friend to the interests of his adopted country, every benevolent and moral minded individual, is interested in its welfare.

Isaac Aaron referred to the wide membership of these clubs as he supported the Constitutional Association's demand for a lower franchise. The Statute Book also recognised their existence and importance.

The government, the do-gooders, and individual doctors all helped provide medical relief, but not to the exclusion of self-help. Late in 1840 a self-supporting hospital began at Hobart, contributors paying 3d. per week. "Many of the labouring classes of Society," declared the prospectus, "are prevented

123 Nadel : 131.
124 Articles and Rules ..., Melbourne 1839 (F2808) : vi.
125 SMH 24/1/49.
126 7 Vic no 10; 11 Vic no 53; 14 Vic no 11 (all N.S.W.).
seeking Medical advice from the want of means, or the objection to resort to a Public Hospital as objects of Charity." W.R. Pugh later founded a similar organisation at Launceston, aiming to establish higher standards than prevailed in the government establishment. The evidence suggests that neither venture met with great success. But nor did the Sydney Vaccine Institution, partly because most workers were happy to pay a doctor's fee. The civil public hospitals could not have begun or continued without popular support; an Act of 1848 vested legal personality in ten such institutions outside Sydney.

Savings Banks were a very important item in the history of self-help. They too initially depended on the goodwill of philanthropists or government, but had no reason for continued existence but the

---

127 *Tasmanian Weekly Dispatch* 20/11/40.


130 11 Vic no 59.
working man's support. This flowed generously. The accountant of the Sydney Bank told a legislative committee in 1840 that mechanics, servants and labourers were his chief customers, and that their number constantly increased. "A great many" Sydney artisans had from fifty to one hundred pounds deposited; some saved their whole wage beyond paying for food and board. Supervision of the Hobart Bank was among G.W. Walker's good works, and a very satisfying one. "Few things would tend more even to the moral welfare of our working classes here," he wrote home of the proposed Bank early in 1845, "... especially now that hundreds, nay thousands, are discontinuing their visits to the public house, and begin to find that money remains in their pockets". The link with Temperance prevailed also in Launceston, where the two managers of the Bank were ardent teetotallers.

131 S.J. Butlin, The Beginnings of Savings Banking in Australia, RAHSJ : XXXII, 1 seq.

132 Evidence of G. Miller to Immigration Committee, LC 2/9/40.

133 Life of Walker : 520; The Hobart Savings Bank ... 1845-1945, Hobart 1945.
Henry Dowling and Isaac Sherwin; and in a different way at Sydney when the suggestion arose that jealous publicans abetted the 'run' of 1843. The importance of the Bank in everyday life appeared in the crisis that then arose, "society appearing for the time as if it had been violently torn off its hinges." The passing of the situation without serious damage probably owed credit to the sober wisdom of depositors: such was the interpretation put by the Examiner on a similar incident in Launceston two years later. In Melbourne J.P. Fawkner launched a "People's Bank" on terms more generous than the government's; journalists and Governors commonly quoted the banks' prosperity as evidence of general well-being.

On one such occasion the Herald remarked that an indication of the depositors' providence appeared

134 H. Button, Flotsam and Jetsam : 156.
135 Col 0b 3/5/43.
136 The same.
137 22/11/45.
138 F5479.
139 As above, HTC 21/1/45, etc; HRA XX : 800, XXIII : 83.
in "the humble cottages springing up in thick clusters in the Surry Hills, at Chippendale, at Pyrmont, at Balmain". John West noticed the determination of immigrant labourers to build their individual small homes; one of the first colonists to use the term "working classes" was an estate agent seeking purchasers of his "village allotments" around Sydney; the Crown Auctioneer in that city remarked on the common desire to secure "heritable property" of a modest order, and believed the inclination to be an outstanding specific against intemperance. In short the atmosphere was most congenial to the development of building societies - which Mr Jones of Hobart properly compared with Temperance, and which the Hobarton Guardian, the People's Advocate, and the Temperance Banner all welcomed as ancillaries to their respective causes. About a dozen building

---

140 12/5/43.
141 The History of Tasmania: I, 222.
142 Cf WR 8/3/45 (W. Stubbs).
144 25/7/49; 7/4/49; 15/8/50 respectively.
groups had formed by 1850, Melbourne claiming at least four. A correspondent of the Argus lauded their effect in combating the ideologies of Red Republicans, Levellers and Socialists:

They are calling in the million to support peace and good government; while Building Societies are on the one hand counteracting the monopoly of property in the hands of the few, they are on the other hand, by its acquisition lessening the number of persons who because they hold no property, consider they have no interest in the welfare of the state.

Statutes of both colonies protected building societies as well as banks.

Schools spread, drunkenness diminished, benevolence and self-help thrived; did all this mean that the general level of morality rose markedly? Reporting to England in 1841 Gipps commented:

The ordinary proprieties of Society are observed amongst the better portion of the population of New South Wales, in as great

---

145 Argus 22/7/50; SMH 19/12/49, 9/10/50 (advertisements); F4601, 4971, 4977, 5042, 5207, 5229, 5230, 5459, 5542, 5555; note 146.

146 Argus 1/2/50 ("No Monopoly"; cf editorial).

147 11 Vic no 10 (NSW); 12 Vic no 1, 14 Vic no 7 (VDL); Butlin.

148 HRA XXI : 510.
and perhaps in a greater degree than amongst persons of the same class elsewhere. The fear indeed of being suspected of the taint of Convictism operates in a wholesome manner as a restraint upon those who are free from it.

Two Tasmanian gentry argued in very similar terms apropos of the island. Many allegedly immoral practices came under public censure - the recognition in society of bastard children, the prevalence of brothels; banks raising capital through lotteries. The private papers of George Allen, of the gentry-squatter Russell family, and of Chief Justice Dowling throb with passion for moral rectitude. The charge of sexual immorality which played some part in Eardley-Wilmot's dismissal was not a unique event. The Atlas launched a similar campaign against Captain Cockburn of the local regiment, accused of


150 Col 16/2/39 (letter of "Publicus"); SM 17/8/36; Atlas 7/12/44, SMH 22/1/49, Argus 2/2/49.


152 See chapter I.
seducing a Parramatta girl. Governor Fitzroy and his sons came under such heavy suspicion of misconduct that David Blair remembered it as one of the outstanding features of "Sydney in 1850". Sometimes this moralistic feeling became ludicrous: an Institute lecturer blushed at Shakespeare's indelicacy, and a lady novelist enquired whether bullock-drivers had ever really tried to manage their charges without swearing. Charles Harpur could write with bitter spleen at times; nor did his personal character escape reproach. Cant, self-advancement, pharisaical conceit - all became associated with moral liberalism. Yet in so lush a growth as the 'new faith' a degree of frankness was inevitable, and some meaning lay behind the moralisation. Opinions changed more than behaviour, but the shift in both was sufficient to merit recognition.

\*\*

153 18/4/46.
154 Centennial Magazine : I, 685 seq.
155 Col 3/10/40.
An appropriate climax of this study is to notice the impact of moral liberalism on jurisprudence, a crucial element in every society. Earlier remarks on police reform touched this subject, for an underlying theme of much current thinking was that if moral, rational, principles determined the law, then a law-abiding society would come much closer. Especially in N.S.W. colonial legislators strove to emulate the British Utilitarians. Lowe, Windeyer, and a Port Phillip representative named E.J. Brewster took the lead, and the local executive assisted effectively. Many of the issues touched upon were highly technical - recovery of small debts, administration of insolvent estates, conveyancing, freehold, administration of grant deeds, the law relating to real property. Jury law reform had more immediate relevance to our theme. In 1844, Windeyer carried through a statute which prescribed that in civil cases, a majority of nine jurors to

159 For all these see V & P 1846 (second session) : passim. Only legislation concerning the former two passed.

160 Real Property Bill Committees, LC 5/10/49, 2/10/50.
three would suffice after six hours deliberation; after twelve hours the jury would be dismissed. An Act of 1847 carried still further the 'decision by majority' principle, and won the Herald's applause for striking against the perjury and concealment of opinion encouraged by the unanimity rule. Underlying such reform were the faith in rational judgement and impatience with tradition so typical of the 'new faith'.

Still louder echoes of moral liberalism sounded throughout moves to remodel the legal profession; moves which often implied that many victims of the law were really victims of the lawyers. Thus John Morgan's Tasmanian Weekly Dispatch condemned "the senseless jargon of the Courts, the wig and gown fooleries"; while even Gipps suffered rebuke from a professional association in Sydney for having encouraged "vulgar and vague prejudices" of this sort.

161 8 Vic no 4.
162 5/7/47; the Act was 11 Vic no 20.
163 13/11/40.
164 SMH 1/9/42.
A Tasmanian statute regulated the qualifications of attorneys as early as 1840; even the procedure of the N.S.W. Supreme Court came under the scrutiny of a legislative committee (1845). But the overriding liberal concern in the senior colony was to abolish the division between barristers and solicitors, which vested hateful privilege in the former and allegedly added much to the expense of litigation. Brewster introduced a Bill ending the division in 1848. It was referred to a committee which reported in September 1847 that the division did not cause the evils generally alleged against it, and that only subsidiary reforms (especially provision for training local youths as barristers) were necessary. The report clearly represented Wentworth's opinion as against that of Lowe, T.A. Murray and perhaps other members of the committee. Wentworth carried an Act to this effect through the legislature (1848), defeating a final attempt by Murray to achieve more

165 4 Vic no 29.
166 Supreme Court Rules Committee, LC 29/10/45.
radical reform. The barristers retained their status, perhaps for good and sufficient reasons, but in violation of the liberal ethos.

Legislation of the day included several references to the treatment of convicted persons. Imprisonment for debt ("oppressive and unnecessary") ceased to apply in the majority of cases. Several N.S.W. Acts ameliorated the punishment of women - by exempting them from the dark cell in any circumstances, from the fiercer penalties prescribed in the Master and Servant legislation, from the summary clauses of the Bushranging Act. Capital punishment was struck out as the nominal punishment for sheep and cattle stealing (V.D.L.); riotous destruction of property, forgery, and other comparable offences (N.S.W.). G.R. Nichols sponsored an Act which provided for the education of infant criminals. Not greatly

168 V & P 16/5/48; the Act was 11 Vic no 57.
169 7 Vic no 19 (NSW); 9 Vic no 4 (VDL).
170 5 Vic no 3; 4 Vic no 23, 9 Vic no 27; 11 Vic no 45.
171 6 Wm IV no 17 (VDL); 2 Vic no 10, 9 Vic no 3, 9 Vic no 11 (NSW).
172 13 Vic no 21.
impressive in themselves these measures were the 'public' expression of much more widespread 'popular' feeling which sought to bring even the wrong-doer within the beneficent influence of the 'new faith'.

Central to this story was Captain Alexander Maconochie, upholder of phrenology and the Owenite maxim that "good men may be made by good management". Believing that "the communication of moral impulses to the human mind" promised vast benefits to mankind, he set up his penological work alongside advances in education, treatment of the insane, and physical science. Maconochie had many admirers in the colonies, F.M. Innes at their head. Others included Lady Franklin, R.L. Murray, and a leader writer in the Colonial Times who nicely sensed the universal significance of Maconochie's "Social System":

Everything is progressing around us: knowledge, intellectual power, the arts and sciences, and even morality and religion,

175 F3231; J.V. Barry, Alexander Maconochie of Norfolk Island : 58 passim; E.M. Miller, Pressmen and Governors : 17.
176 7/1/40.
are all advancing with rapid strides. May not, then, the convicted offender, sunk so low though he be in depravity and crime, have advanced progressively with the rest of his fellow men?

The Captain lost his job at Norfolk Island in rather unhappy circumstances, but not before making a notable contribution to Australian intellectual history.

He was not the only original thinker on penological issues. Colin Arrot Browning acted as surgeon on several convict transports and organised a system of education, Christian instruction and collective discipline which had the same lofty aim of total regeneration. "This day commences a new era in your existence", he told his charges at the beginning of their long voyage; and proceeded to describe his system of management "which contemplates you as intellectual and moral beings; as beings who are capable of making great attainments; who necessarily exert an incalculable influence, good or bad, upon each other, upon mankind, and upon the moral universe". H.P. Fry never had to face practical difficulties as did Maconochie and

177 England's Exiles, London 1842 : 5. See also F3164, 3580, 3796.
Browning, but equal compassion and perhaps more balanced wisdom determined his thoughts on the problem. In 1850 he published a study which stressed the need of "placing criminals under new relations, and submitting them to the influence of the natural expectations and prospects of men in a healthy state of society." Fry urged the classification of criminals, strictly measured punishments, and the diffusion of education. "Crime is generally the result of necessity", he argued; relieve destitution, and the genuinely criminal type would stand unmasked.

Feeling against harsh, vindictive punishments permeated all thought on this subject, and permeated widely throughout the community. So early as 1836 a legislative committee had required facilities for "complete separation and classification" in the Darlinghurst Gaol, which accordingly followed the pattern of the famous Philadelphia penitentiary.

178 Penal Discipline : x.
179 37.
As did its counterpart of 1849, this committee showed concern in the welfare of inmates, especially their cleanliness. If The Heads of the People spoke truly conditions within the gaol complemented its physical design:

HUMANITY is the standard to which the internal regulations are invariably referred, and inasmuch as imprisonment under some of the penal and arbitrary laws of this land of contrarieties, is still awarded for poverty, improvidence, thoughtlessness, and other such dire offences and crimes, the kindness and patience of the Governor are constantly taxed to an extent to which our happy go lucky citizens have little idea ... 

Indiscriminate flogging incurred much criticism from reformers, John Morgan and Alexander Harris among them. In his novel The Emigrant Family, Harris had one of his characters express a general argument that over-punishment led to "felon fraternity" against the welfare of society at large. That colonial courts imposed over-severe sentences

181 I, 4.


was one of the major themes of the *Atlas* newspaper throughout its existence.

Such feeling culminated in opposition to capital punishment. Contributing to the growth of this campaign was near-unanimous hostility to public execution, attendance at which ranked as the *non plus ultra* of anti-rational amusement; and the Benthamite view that in the prevailing condition of English law the death penalty served little useful purpose. But most abolitionists felt a deeper passion. "I believe," affirmed Charles Harpur in 1848, "that to be an advocate for abolition of capital punishments, upon any ground, is one of the highest proofs a man could possibly give of his being in full fellowship with the better spirit of the age." This remark prefaced an adulatory poem to Barzillai Quaife who had shortly before delivered two public lectures on the subject. A further consequence of the lectures was a rebuttal from

---

184 See esp 19/4/45.
J.B. Laughton, who drew heavily from the Scriptures. Quaife attempted to reply in the same terms, but not convincingly: again the 'new faith' clashed with traditional Christianity.

Quaife and Harpur both published in the *Atlas*, which very staunchly upheld the abolitionist cause. Lowe continued vehement on this subject, joining in 1849 with G.R. Nichols to oppose that clause of the Estimates which provided an allowance for the public hangman. N.L. Kentish also sought to rouse opinion against the practice, believing that "advancement in Knowledge and Virtue, in true Religion and Happiness" demanded its cessation. Kentish's efforts to work up a public petition evidently came to nothing, but there were some indications of widespread feeling. Debating societies often considered the issue, while

189 E.g. 7/12/44, 22/2/45, 2 & 23/9/48.
190 *Argus* 17/9/49. For earlier legislative debates see SMH 18/9/45, 1/10/45.
192 See e.g. *Port Phillip Herald* 24/5/42; CT 23/1/49.
petitions in favour of reprieveing particular criminals sometimes went around. The most dramatic case concerned the Tasmanian bushranger Kavenagh; when Eardley-Wilmot responded to the appeal, Judge Montagu publicly expressed his dissent.

Explanations

Penological thought had much to do with the next issue we are to discuss - the anti-transportation movement. So too did many other aspects of moral liberalism, and from that fact the subject derives its chief interest. One logical deduction from this would be to suggest that the movement belongs in the previous section as further proof of the diffusion of the 'new faith'. This judgement certainly applies to the parallel debate on coloured labour, as the comments made in chapter III affirm. But the crusade against transportation had a unique, transcending quality. "It remains now to record the most important colonial agitation of modern times",

194 I, 276.
wrote West in introducing his chapter on the movement. He did not exaggerate. So the fact that the issue was argued out largely in terms of moral liberalism went beyond explaining 'how far' the creed had pervaded society to answer the deeper problem 'why so far'. In other words, this controversy acted as a 'fix', pressing the leading concepts of the 'new faith' deep into the Australian mind.

From the very beginning of our period, anti-transportationists put forward arguments consonant with moral liberalism. In his History of Van Diemen's Land, published in 1835, Henry Melville argued that the system degraded the colonies, without transmitting any real benefit. It failed to impose an exemplary punishment, or to encourage reformation - convicts had too easy a life so long as they avoided transgressing the colonial law; yet having done so, they had to endure the all-corrupting misery of Port Arthur. R.L. Murray frequently argued to the same effect in his Review, alleging widespread homosexual abuses at the penal stations. "Upon what possible

195 The History of ... Van Diemen's Land, London 1835 : 225 seq.
principle," demanded the Review in 1836, "can Trans-
portation, under the present frightfully atrocious
system, be endured by the enlightened and phil-
anthropic men in whose hands are the destinies of
the British nation?" The Molesworth Committee
answered that the current system must cease. The
colonial witnesses before this committee all stressed
the moral evils of the system - Macarthur, demon-
strating how squarely the exclusives' case rested
on an ethical basis; Ullathorne, with his horrific
stories of Norfolk Island; Lang, anticipating the
enmity of 'orthodox radicalism' to the convict
heritage.

Despite the changes consequent upon the
Molesworth Report, the debate on transportation
continued to incorporate such themes. Eardley-
Wilmot's dismissal owed something to charges that
sodomy raged in the probation camps, Fry in
particular describing these in terms very similar
to Ullathorne's account of Norfolk. William

---

196 T & R 25/3/36.
197 Correspondence on Convict Discipline and
Transportation, HC 16/2/47 : 186 seq, passim.
Westgarth, again the true social scientist, remarked in criticism of the 'exile' system:

> the humanity of the age has adopted the theory, that the punishment of a criminal consists in a process that may effect his reformation. The great defect in the system of transportation consists in the association of the various criminals, educated and uneducated, noviciates in crimes and incurable offenders, in the same company or the same quarter of the world.

John Saunders and James Aikenhead, proprietor of the Examiner, were others who forcibly argued that the government must do more to remedy crime than shovel out transgressors to Australia.

As the years went by, however, more and more emphasis was put on convictism's evil effects on the community at large. Literally hundreds of illustrative passages remain in the record. From London a colonial pressure group denounced transportation as an evil of stupendous and vital moment, not only, (although more immediately,) to the free colonists of Van Diemen's Land, and the wretched convicts themselves, but to this whole nation and all humanity.

---

198 Report ... to 31st of July 1845 : 29.

199 SMH 28/10/46; Further Correspondence on Convict Discipline and Transportation, HC 7/49 : 70 seq.

200 J.S. The Moral and Pecuniary Evils which the Free Colonists of Van Diemen's Land are suffering ..., London 1847 (F4639) : 12.
Melbourne's citizenry rejected Grey's proposals of 1848-49 with the declaration that no motives of expediency can ever reconcile them to the moral evils which must arise from the association with convicted felons of the mother country; ... the good effects arising from the great efforts that are being made to extend educational and religious institutions throughout the district, will, in a great measure, be neutralized by the introduction of a felon population.

A pamphlet issued in Launceston thus depicted the struggle:

to clear away the ruins of a long existing social state, and to build anew, is at least a formidable undertaking, however certain of ultimate reward. The reflecting abolitionist knows all this .... yet for the sake of our children - for the sake of our workmen - for the sake of political freedom we have encountered these alarms, and ventured on the unknown futurity.

This expostulation directed at Earl Grey by the Hobart abolitionists sounds an appropriate concluding note:

Despotic rulers have often invaded the temporal interests of their subjects, but it remained for your Lordship and the

---

201 Further Correspondence, HC 14/8/50 : 175.
202 Memoir of Proceedings, Launceston 1847 (F4604) : 7.
203 Further Correspondence, HC 30/4/52 : 8.
ministry of which you are a member to present the first example of a constitutional Government invading and destroying the moral interests of a community.

In these passages and throughout the campaign generally the echoes of moral liberalism were loud indeed. The same wish for absolute moral regeneration; the same concern to build society on principles of unalloyed purity. West's Australasian League sought to create a spirit of nationalism and at least succeeded in uniting the movement throughout the colonies, and prompting Harpur's "Anthem to the Australasian League", which perfectly expressed the 'new faith':

Shall we sing of Loyalty
To the far South's fiery youth?
Yea - but let the paean be
Of loyalty to God and Truth:
To Men, to progress and to all
The free things, nobly free,
Of which their loved Australia shall
The golden cradle be.

Further parallels appeared in the stress on the welfare of children and the appeal to women. Mrs


Dalgarno spoke publicly in the cause, and 8,506 members of her sex signed a special petition to the N.S.W. legislature. Like Temperance men and educationists, spokesmen for the movement placed great emphasis on the need for a contented, morally healthy proletariat: "I never heard it advanced (till of late in this country)," gibed an opponent of the crusade, "that the bad example or bad morals of the lower ranks infected the higher." The warm support accorded the campaign by the Australian Era and Illustrated Australian Magazine expressed the benediction of culture. But as our earlier chapters have hinted, every interest - the squatters alone excepted - gave strong support to the cause. It thus realised the 'new faith' ideal of common action towards a noble aim.

Just as Launceston was a focus for other aspects of moral liberalism, so the local anti-

206 Victorian Colonist (F5233) 14 & 17/2/51.
207 Abstract of Petitions, LC 2/10/50.
208 LE 5/5/47 (Rev. S. Martin).
209 Esp I, 68; II, 95 seq respectively.
transportation movement had particular interest. Thence came West's book and the organisation of the League. There the abolitionists sought to advance the cause by organising a fast - a blasphemous touch very reminiscent of Temperance. The associations against convict employment bound the two movements yet tighter, for members pledged their adherence and compared the non-employment of post-1849 arrivals as equivalent to moderate Temperance, complete non-employment to abstinence.

Criticism of the abolitionists also followed a path made familiar by our discussion of the 'new faith'. From Earl Grey downwards came charges of hypocrisy and politico-economic jobbery. The bandwagon certainly rolled towards abolition and no sensible labourer or politician would want to throw himself in its way. Abolitionists sometimes congratulated themselves on spurning a system which added to their prosperity, sometimes asserted that the end of transportation would introduce an era of

210 Cf Hobart Town Advertiser (F2770) 22/1/50.
211 LE 27/1/49.
unbounded prosperity. Furthermore, the principles of moral liberalism could be and were interpreted to defend the system. The N.S.W. emancipists in the 'thirties and the Tasmanian Union both accused their opponents of inhumanity, and so did more disinterested commentators. Maconochie, Innes, Kentish, and (for a while) Fry, all believed that transportation could serve excellent penological ends. E.S. Hall went furtherest on this road. He ever maintained that transportation had encouraged sterling virtues among convicts, and so described the Macquarie era as "the most social, & the happiest" in N.S.W. history. Hall felt that the Molesworth Report had caused the abolition of assignment precisely when the community had achieved a ratio between bond and free most likely to facilitate success. He offered his own services to re-establish in western N.S.W.

212 Cf F4629 ("A Prisoner of the Crown"); F4623 (Z.P. Pocock); F4453 (W.R. Allison); CO 201/426 : 243 seq (W. Bland); etc.

213 HTC 2/6/47; F4509.

214 Letter of 14/11/49 : CO 201/424. See also there, letters of 8/7/49 and 1/8/49 (cf F5373); and 21/1/50 : CO 201/437.
"a system of secondary punishment into which George the third & his Ministers were led by divine Providence."

Hall, Fry and the rest demonstrated that the abolitionists did not interpret moral liberalism in the only possible way. On the other hand they emphasised that the 'new faith' was so strong by mid-century as to be the touchstone for both sides in this most vital debate of the times. Nor does their sincerity deny that altruistic passion of equally high order was the major element in the abolitionist crusade.

The anti-transportation movement was the outstanding particular reason why moral liberalism should 'fix' on to N.S.W. and V.D.L., but several general factors also demand attention. So general indeed as to threaten platitude and tautology, but for that none the less potent: other parts of the world, even other parts of Australia, embraced the 'new faith' without having to fight against transportation. Never has the derivative element in our study been
more obvious than in this chapter: Savings Banks, building societies, police and law reform all copied from British models. So the first general reason why moral liberalism pervaded so deeply is because V.D.L. and N.S.W. were British colonies, partaking in a world-wide experience.

Once more treading the narrow path between 'extent' and 'explanation', we can see as a second reason the common ground offered by the 'new faith' to various ideologies current in Australia. In our introductory description of moral liberalism appeared a quotation from the Herald; citations from that journal, and others previously labelled conservative, occurred time and again throughout the subsequent discussion. This was the consequence not so much of deliberate choice, as of inevitability. That is to say, even those few colonial thinkers who boasted of conservatism had accepted many principles of the 'new faith'. Again, in chapters V and VI evidence that moral liberalism had penetrated traditional Christianity was presented as a mark of disintegration. So, in an important sense, it was. Yet from our present viewpoint this development could and did
act as a unifying bond. In addition, the present chapter offers proof that even class conscious proletarians responded to the call. Nor was the gentry ideal inconsistent with the 'new faith': James Macarthur's father was the patron of Charles Harpur's father. Once again only the squatters and, to a lesser degree, the Anglicans, remained outside the circle.

That N.S.W. and V.D.L. belonged to the new world further tightened their allegiance to the 'new faith'. The adjective demands repetition. Upholders of every creed felt a missionary zeal when confronted with a virgin society - Anglo-Catholics no less than Temperance men. Yet inevitably conservatives felt the absence of tradition as a handicap whereas their adversaries found it a boon. Contrast the laments of Broughton and Nixon with this extract from the Temperance Advocate, already quoted in part:

In England, in withstanding Intemperance at Christmas, we have to resist the prejudices of fathers and grandsires .... It is not so

Information from J.N. Rawling.
in Australia, we are young and have a right to dictate, if we dictate well, to future generations.

The converse attitude was for all who felt aware of the colonies as 'new' lands to be sympathetic to a new rather than an old faith.

We have noticed Charles Nicholson's belief that the chief attraction of colonial life was opportunity to shape the course of history; and also that the migrant, qua migrant, was anxious and in some degree equipped to realise his inner personality. These attitudes have very close affinities with Harpur's 'individualization', explaining both why that concept should appeal to the colonial mind, and why the New rather than the Old World should see its fulfilment. The Australian Era made the point in an article which lauded "The Year 1850" as giving promise of a regenerated world. "In a limited community like this" the way of truth and light stood out more clearly, and "each of us, in our individual capacity, has ... greater opportunity of impelling the onward march". Nearly

---

216 I, 68.
twenty years before Alexis de Tocqueville had noticed "How Equality Suggests to the Americans the Idea of the Indefinite Perfectibility of Man." By equality in this context he meant the whole complex of physical and social fluidity: as real and as powerful in Australia as in America.

These remarks open up the wider issues of 'Progress'. This concept knit the 'new faith' and colonial life still more closely, for it was the mainspring of both. "What Will Sustain the Country?" asked a writer in the Australasian magazine. "The principle of progress," he answered himself, remarking that the concept already "has found, in these far lands, an abiding place in the same degree secure and lasting, as the energy of the spirit of adventure and acquisition which moves the people." He was not the only commentator to notice the interdependence of this principle and the distinctly colonial environment. Every Anniversary Day, every New Year, often without formal excuse, colonists praised themselves - not

218 I, 611 seq.
without justice - on the transformation wrought within a few decades. Some emphasised the role of emigration in rebutting the dread pessimism of Malthus, and so allowing man to exercise "the amative propensity" without fear. A reviewer in the New South Wales Magazine discussed the effect of European expansion in stimulating "new opinions, new forms of government, and social combinations such as had never hitherto been witnessed"; in short he anticipated frontier historiography, especially W.P. Webb's "Boom Hypothesis of Modern History" which postulates this expansion as the prime cause of the optimistic individualism distinctive of the latter-day western world. The Atlas, referring primarily to constitutional matters maintained that "the law of the institutions in a new country is, not stability, but progress"; the Illustrated Australian Magazine

220 Col 20/7/37; Australian 2/4/44.
221 I, 9 seq.
223 Quoted Nadel : 63.
gave the argument a different twist by urging that the coming of self-government should inspire loftier ideals in every activity.

The writer in the *Australasian* felt no shame in praising "acquisition". To do so was thoroughly in keeping with the 'new faith's' emphasis on material well-being, and re-emphasised that the comparative affluence of Australian life encouraged acceptance of the creed. Fry wisely linked the efficacy of Temperance Halls and Mechanics Institutes with V.D.L.'s freedom "from the fearful evils of the Factory System and the fatal consequences of extreme poverty and excessive wealth." Childers' splendid report on Victorian schools and the *Australian Era's* glorification of "The Year 1850" emphatically repeated the latter point. The squatter H.W. Haygarth put the issue very bluntly:

> in Australia, where worldly success is so immediately and so visibly the result of any reform in conduct, and where want is scarcely known, the missionary of reformation may expect a degree of success beyond

---

224 I, 4, 409 seq.

what the greatest zeal and ability could obtain for the preacher who labours among the vicious part of our poorer population at home.

So bluntly indeed, that a sneer might come to the lips: people and nations will ever get along contentedly enough so long as they enjoy prosperity; no faith is tested unless it has to weather hardship and want. The point is sound in itself, but does not constitute a logical charge against moral liberalism. A first principle of the creed was the inextricable mingling of 'material, mental, moral' advance; it did not, and could not, claim to be effective when any one factor was absent.

Finally, the colonial environment encouraged "true religion" as against traditional religion. De Tocqueville, Webb, and many other historians have endorsed this judgement, the former describing American antipathy to church interference in politics or claim to exclusivism in terms startlingly appropriate to Australian experience. This general argument too has come to our notice in earlier chapters: when quoting the Courier's

226 II, 20 seq.
deprecation of militant anti-Catholicism and, more substantially, in suggesting that frontier conditions impelled Protestantism towards emphasising social ethic rather than sophisticated theology. Indeed only one further point demands notice: the significance of Alexander Harris. First, because he wrote an account of the bush-workers' attitude to formal religion which indicated that the common man at least on the frontier held much the same opinions as Harpur or E.S. Hall. Second, and more important, the 'mateship' which Harris so splendidly described amounted in sum to "true religion" in practice: in other words, frontier conditions created that at which moral liberalism aimed. Finally, it must be remarked that the man who stands out as the first recorder of "The Australian Legend" (although, hardly less interestingly, Hall has some claim to this distinction) was very much a disciple of the 'new faith' - as shown by his attitude to Temperance, phrenology, and the punishment of criminals.


Exegesis

The general trend of this chapter has been to prove one of the most vital claims of the disciples of moral liberalism: namely, that their creed had the power to support and invigorate the development of a whole community. By mid-century the 'new faith' was far on the way to becoming the supremely potent influence in both N.S.W. and V.D.L. Its vocabulary provided the terms in which the great issues of the day were discussed; its mores were accepted as standards, if not always in day-to-day life. Broughton had lost his battle. To find evidence clinching this point we must dare venture briefly into the later years of the colonies' history, remembering the many dangers besetting our way: that the 'new faith' embraced factors capable of explaining very different results; that possibility of explanation is not equivalent to truthful explanation; that there neither is nor can be full agreement on what did happen in later Australian history, especially in matters not strictly factual.
These qualifications apply with particular, inhibiting force to the two issues most directly pertinent to our discussion — attitudes to morality and to education. With regard to the former, one would suggest that in Australia more than in most countries propriety of behaviour has always won both 'respectability' and respect. The 'wowser' has scored many notable statutory victories, and incurred contempt only when appearing hysterical or extremist; few enemies have dared deny his basic assumptions. The simple virtues evoke a popular piety, often smug and conventionalised, but nevertheless real. This vague mystique also enshrouds education. Education not for its own sake, but to make oneself or one's child a better person, a person who has experienced progress, a person more useful. The crudity and shallowness which can thus develop showed all too clear in the nineteenth century debates on primary education, and often enough since. Yet simultaneously the important point is repeated: this is an issue capable of rousing vast interest and high passion.
What were some other such questions? In Victoria and N.S.W. the crusade against the squatters dominated politics for many years. Any further explanation of why this struggle should have spread beyond the bounds of politico-economic reality is unnecessary. This was not merely a class war, but a holy war. Similarly with the tremendous emphasis placed on the virtues of industrialisation and manufactures: here were relevant the 'new faith' themes of progress, prosperity, and social intercourse, as well as the proletariat's demand for congenial work, and the capitalists' for profitable investment. Again, in Australia the role of the state has been significantly extensive, and of a peculiar quality, "to employ collective power to foster interests which are primarily individual." Both these characteristics relate to moral liberalism. Educationists and Temperance men called very loudly for official intervention to help every man attain to goodness; self-help and charitable societies felt no embarrassment in seeking or receiving aid from government.

229 W.K. Hancock, Australia, London 1930: 140.
George Miller, the Accountant of the Savings Bank, told a legislative committee in 1841 that local banks needed much more official support than did their British counterparts. "In a new country like this, society is very different, no division of it is fixed; a great proportion of the population are recent arrivals, and the only permanent body is the Government." A truism in itself, the statement could not have come from any more appropriate source.

The political, and still more the social character of this country has taken much of its distinctive colour from the strong influence exercised by the working class. Again the nature of moral liberalism is relevant, especially its constant stress on the importance of comprehending this sector of the community, previously ignored or patronised. The evidence that the working man did respond thus becomes yet more significant; so too Harpur's sympathy with left-wing politics. Indeed, the Australian working man took moral liberalism for his own. In consequence the 'new faith' became

230 Evidence to Savings' Bank Act Committee, LC 27/7/41 : 5.
vulgarised (as teetotalism was a vulgarised species of Temperance), and made more plainly materialist (as in support of the anti-transportation movement), and given a class-conscious edge; but these changes were peripheral. One factor facilitating the process was the absence of a strong middle-class. John Hood, travelling in Australia in the 'forties, feared lest the weakness of the colonial bourgeoisie would allow fierce democracy to rule unchecked. West gave the true, if paradoxical answer a few years later: "the prevailing spirit of the colonies is democratic: the democracy of the middle classes, not of the mob." The interim had witnessed the election of Robert Lowe to represent Sydney in the N.S.W. legislature. "To the working classes alone he could turn", declared that brilliant exponent of moral liberalism during the campaign, the first deliberately organised by the Australian left and remarkable for having established new standards of electoral

231 Australia and The East: 309 seq.
232 II, 347.
morality. Lowe's subsequent quarrel with his supporters notwithstanding, his victory symbolised the situation described by West. Only occasionally has the Australian working man used his political power in a "fiery and democratic" way; more often he has shown concern to realise the bourgeois-conceived ideals of the 'new faith'.

Like the proletariat, women early won political privileges in Australia. This situation sprang directly from moral liberalism, the protagonists of which not only appealed to women as had no previous creed but believed female suffrage would serve immediate political ends. Yet apart from their having the vote, women play little part in Australian public life. Perhaps the very triumph of the working man fostered this situation: Temperance addressed its appeal to middle-class women and working-class men, but not to working-class women. When we turn from 'public' to 'popular' life a more appropriate picture appears, for in the latter women certainly are effective and even dominant.

The more deeply one penetrates into purely social issues, the more overwhelming become ambiguities and alternatives. However, three issues have already impinged so far into our discussion as to demand explicit notice. First is the suburb, that most potent influence in everyday life. The development owed much to the passion for an industrialised society; more from self-help, as expressed through Savings Banks and building societies. Second is the cult of 'manly, wholesome' sport, certainly not unique to Australia but again particularly strong. Saunders, Poyser, Gipps, Braim, Kentish—these were men of very different backgrounds and behaviour yet devotion to moral liberalism led all to praise cricket and athletics. The final issue is trivial yet provocative. Why do Australians bathe themselves more often than their British cousins? Because of the climate; because of relative affluence; or because their country grew up coincidentally with the idea that bodily purity encouraged moral purity, and that all citizens must enjoy its blessing? Historical study which deliberately sets out to measure the impact of moral liberalism might one day answer such questions as these.
Yet we can already declare with confidence that Australia's history is significant chiefly as a test of the 'new faith'. Here lies proof that a nation can arise on the foundation of this teaching, and therein find Authority, sufficient yet not oppressive. But what of the final and most sublime claim of moral liberalism: that such a nation must necessarily be wise and good and splendid? There is no simple answer. Today the intellectual heirs of Broughton detest and decry all they see about them. They have their reasons; even Harpur might hesitate still to "sing of loyalty". Yet most who feel the poet to be their kindred spirit will believe that here men have created not the perfect society, but at least one finer than any inspired by other creeds. Those so inclined must continue to cherish the national virtue, ever hoping that the future will answer a definite 'yes' to the ultimate claim of the 'new faith'. This thesis is written in the hope of adding a little to that culture, from which, so men like Harpur and West believed, national virtue derived peculiar strength.
SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

The following list is particularly selective with regard to books and pamphlets noticed in Ferguson's Bibliography. The essential details concerning all items not listed hereunder appear in the footnotes.

I REFERENCE WORKS


II HISTORICAL JOURNALS

Historical Studies: Australia and New Zealand. Melbourne, 1940-.

Royal Australian Historical Society: Journal and Proceedings. Sydney, 1901-.

Tasmanian Historical Research Association: Papers and Proceedings. Hobart, 1951-.

Victorian Historical Magazine. Melbourne, 1911-.

III OFFICIAL MATERIAL

The New South Wales Government Gazette. Sydney, 1832-. Includes statutes and much other information relevant to the administration.
The Hobart Town Gazette. Hobart, 1816-. The Tasmanian equivalent to the above.

Votes and Proceedings of the Legislative Council of New South Wales with relevant documents. Sydney, 1832-.

Votes and Proceedings of the Legislative Council of Van Diemen's Land with relevant documents. These were issued spasmodically and in varying forms. See the note in Ferguson, II, p.29, and the various annual entries therein.

Colonial Office Records. These are available on microfilm at the major Australian libraries and include the following important series.

201: Despatches from the governors of N.S.W., with relevant enclosures and often minuted by the Colonial Office staff and the Secretary of State. The despatches and enclosures up to 1848 are published in the Historical Records of Australia (ed. J.F. Watson), series one. Sydney, 1914-25.

Letters from miscellaneous individuals to the Office.

202: Despatches to the governors of N.S.W.
204: 'Blue Books' (annual compilation of statistics) for N.S.W.
280: Despatches etc. from the governors of V.D.L., and miscellaneous individuals.
282: Sessional papers, V.D.L. These include the proceedings of the Executive Council.
284: 'Blue Books' for V.D.L.
408: Despatches to the governors of V.D.L.

National Board of Education: Minutes 1848-53 and Inward Correspondence 1848-51. Held in ML.

IV GENERAL PUBLISHED WORKS


Barff, H.E. *A Short Historical Account of the University of Sydney.* Sydney, 1902.


Duncan, W.A. *Notes of a Ten Years' Residence in New South Wales.* Hogg's Instructor. Edinburgh, vol.V.


Fitzpatrick, B.C. *The British Empire in Australia; an Economic History 1834-1939.* Melbourne, 1941.


Gilchrist, A. (ed.) John Dunmore Lang, chiefly autobiographical...documents. 2 vols, pagination continuous. Sydney, 1951.


Harris, A. Settlers and Convicts. Ed. C.M.H. Clark. Melbourne, 1953. Throughout the text, Harris is accepted as a bona fide figure.


Lang, J.D. History of New South Wales. 2 vols. 1875.


Macalister, C. Old Pioneering Days in the Sunny South. Goulburn, 1907.


Thomas, L. *The Development of the Labour Movement in the Sydney District of New South Wales 1788-1848.* Type-script, pagination irregular. Copy used that of Professor C.M.H. Clark, Canberra University College.


The title given is that by which the item was best known, and the frequency of publication the maximum attained before 1851. Where no terminal date is given the item continued publication beyond 1851.

Arden's Sydney Magazine (monthly). 1843.
Argus (daily). Melbourne, 1846–.
   Also published as Morning Chronicle and Sydney Chronicle.
Bell's Life in Sydney (weekly). 1846–.
Britannia and Trades' Advocate (twice weekly). Hobart, 1846–51.
Colonial Times and Tasmanian Advertiser (twice weekly). Hobart, 1825–.


The Heads of the People (weekly). Sydney, 1847-8.

Hobart Town Courier (twice weekly). 1827-.


Illustrated Australian Magazine (monthly). Melbourne, 1850-.

The Irish Exile and Freedom's Advocate (weekly). Hobart, 1850-1.

Launceston Examiner (twice weekly). 1843-.


Maitland Mercury and Hunter River General Advertiser (weekly). Maitland, 1843-.

Moreton Bay Courier (weekly). Brisbane, 1846-.

New South Wales Magazine (monthly). Sydney, 1843.

People's Advocate (weekly). Sydney, 1848-.

Port Phillip Herald (twice weekly). Melbourne, 1840-8.

The Sentinel (weekly). Sydney, 1845-8.

The Spectator (weekly). Sydney, 1846.


The Sun, and New South Wales Independent Press (weekly). Sydney, 1843.
Sydney Monitor (twice weekly). 1826-41. Also published as The Monitor.

Sydney Morning Herald (daily). 1831-. Also published as The Sydney Herald.

Sydney Times (twice weekly). 1834-8.

Tasmanian and Review (weekly). Hobart, 1834-45. Under this designation is included R.L. Murray's Austral-Asiatic Review. For further information on the extremely complex bibliographical history of these journals see E.M. Miller, Pressmen and Governors, 173 seq.


True Colonist (daily). Hobart, 1834-4.


Weekly Register of Politics, Facts, and General Literature. Sydney, 1843-5. Also known as Duncan's Weekly Register.

VI PRIVATE MANUSCRIPT MATERIAL

Mitchell Library Manuscripts

A 87-98 inclusive: Charles Harpur papers.

A 176: W. Gardner, Northern and Western Districts of N.S.W. 2 vols.


A 585: Tasmanian Total Abstinence Agency, etc.


A 858: A.C. Grant, Early Station Life in Queensland.

A 923: Henry Parkes' Correspondence. H-I-J.
A 1531: Edward Deas Thomson Papers. 3 vols.
A 1977: King Papers: Correspondence, 1830-1917.
A 2226: Lang Papers: Letters to Rev. J.D. Lang, 1820-54.
A 2878: W.A. Duncan, Lecture on Science and Commerce.
A 2879: W.A. Duncan's diary for 1856.
A 2918: Macarthur Papers: Sir Edward Macarthur. Emigration Correspondence.


A 2987: Macarthur Papers: Camden District Council Minutes and Miscellanea. 1843-55.


A 3180: Cunningham Papers: Letters to A. Cunningham. 1845-56.

A 3221: E.S. Hall, Credulity of Deism.

A 3587: Papers of William Campbell, 1835-57.

Ah 131: Harpur: Letters to Parkes, etc.

Ak 8: King Family: Miscellaneous Papers.


B 1106: Scrapbook relating to John Saunders.

B 1187: Falconer Journal.


Bourke Papers: Uncatalogued.

James Martin's Papers. Uncatalogued.
Other Manuscripts

W.G. Broughton Papers. Originals at Diocesan House, Sydney; or microfiln at C.N.L.

Niel Black Papers. Originals at Public Library of Victoria; version used was a typescript collection in three volumes, prepared by Miss M. Kiddle, and now at A.N.U. Library.

G.T.W.B. Boyes' Diary. Original held by the Royal Society of Tasmania; copy used was the typescript held in T.S.A.

George Hawke's Diary, C.N.L.

Lady Franklin's Diary in N.S.W., C.N.L.

Rev. Alexander Laurie's Papers, Public Library of Victoria.

Sir T.A. Murray Papers, C.N.L.