ENGAGING INDIGENOUS ECONOMY

DEBATING DIVERSE APPROACHES
ENGAGING INDIGENOUS ECONOMY

DEBATING DIVERSE APPROACHES

Edited by
WILL SANDERS

Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research
College of Arts and Social Sciences
The Australian National University, Canberra

RESEARCH MONOGRAPH NO. 35
2016
Engaging indigenous economy: debating diverse approaches / editor William Sanders.

ISBN: 9781760460037 (paperback) 9781760460044 (ebook)

Series: Research monograph (Australian National University. Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research) ; no. 35.


Other Creators/Contributors: Sanders, Will, editor.

Dewey Number: 338.994

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Cover design and layout by ANU Press.

Front cover image: Masig Island’s fleet of small boats supports the island’s commercial, subsistence and ceremonial fishing activities. Dinghies such as the one shown here provide a significant degree of economic independence and resilience to Torres Strait Islanders across the region, in a context where other sources of income are sparse. Photo: Annick Thomassin.

This edition © 2016 ANU Press
Contents

List of figures ........................................... ix
List of tables ............................................ xiii
Abbreviations and acronyms. .............................. xv
Contributors ........................................... xvii

1. Taking difference seriously: Life, income and work
   for Jon Altman and friends .............................. 1
   Will Sanders

Part 1: The Hybrid Economy: Theory, Practice and Policy

2. From Samoa to CAEPR via Mumeka: The hybrid economy
   comes of age .......................................15
   Geoff Buchanan

3. From public policy to pure anthropology: A genealogy
   of the idea of the hybrid economy ....................... 29
   Chris Gregory

4. Cultural domains and the theory of customary
   environmentalism in Indigenous Australia .................. 43
   Kim de Rijke, Richard Martin and David Trigger

5. What is the policy significance of the hybrid economy? ........ 55
   Nicolas Peterson

6. If the market is the problem, is the hybrid economy
   the solution? ........................................65
   Katherine Curchin

7. Valuing Aboriginal cultural activity: Beyond markets .......... 79
   Kaely Woods

8. Hybrid economies as life projects? An example from
   the Torres Strait ..................................... 95
   Annick Thomassin
9. Indigenous country in the southwest Gulf of Carpentaria: Territories of difference or indifference? ....................... 111
   Seán Kerins and Jacky Green

10. Indigenous-owned art centres, tourism and economic benefits: The case of Maruku Arts ......................... 129
    Marianne Riphagen

11. Five theses for reinstituting economics: Anthropological lessons from Broome ..................................... 143
    Stephen Muecke and Ben Dibley

Part 2: Critiquing Neoliberalism and the Guardian State

12. Neoliberalism and the return of the guardian state: Micromanaging Indigenous peoples in a new chapter of colonial governance ............................. 155
    Shelley Bielefeld

13. Media stars and neoliberal news agendas in Indigenous policymaking .................................................. 171
    Kerry McCallum and Lisa Waller

14. Trapped in the gap ............................................. 183
    Emma Kowal

15. Neoliberal rhetoric and guardian state outcomes in Aboriginal land reform ............................................. 193
    Leon Terrill

Part 3: Land, Housing and Entrepreneurship: Altman Applied

    Ed Wensing

17. Exploring hybridity in housing: Lessons for appropriate tenure choices and policy ................................ 223
    Louise Crabtree

18. The political economy of the Aboriginals Benefit Account: Relevance of the 1985 Altman review 30 years on ........ 239
    David P Pollack

19. The work of rights: The nature of native title labour ........ 251
    Pamela McGrath

20. Indigenous small businesses in the Australian Indigenous economy .......................................................... 265
    Jock Collins, Mark Morrison, Branka Krivokapic-Skoko, Rose Butler and PK Basu
Part 4: Personal Reflections

21. Reflections of a PhD student ...................... 277
    Benedict Scambary

22. Reflections of a senior colleague .................. 283
    John Nieuwenhuysen AM

    Jon Altman

CAEPR Research Monograph Series ................... 305
List of figures

Fig. 2.1 The hybrid economy model ........................ 16

Fig. 2.2 Decentralised communities: A model ................. 19

2.2.1 Traditional (pre-contact) household 
production scenario. ........................................ 19

2.2.2 Neo-traditional (post-contact) household 
production scenario. ........................................ 19

2.2.3 Prospective household production scenario ....... 19

Fig. 2.3 Jon Altman at work, Gurror outstation, Maningrida 
region, north-central Arnhem Land, Northern Territory, 
May 1980 ........................................ 22

Fig. 2.4 Jon Altman digging for white pigment at Gudjangal, 
Maningrida region, north-central Arnhem Land, 
Northern Territory, September 1980 ....................25

Fig. 3.1 Nine variant forms (V1–9) of the visual representation 
of the hybrid economy ......................................... 32

Fig. 3.2 The ‘true’ binary logic of the hybrid economy 
in black and white (V10) ................................. 34

Fig. 3.3 The ‘true’ binary logic of the hybrid economy showing 
distinction between the eight bounded white segments 
and the three coloured sectors (V11) ................... 35

Fig. 3.4 The ‘true’ binary logic of the hybrid economy showing 
how the ‘true’ logic of primary colours creates eight 
coloured segments ......................................... 35

Fig. 3.5 Interpretation of the eight segments defined 
by Boole’s zero/one binary logic ............................ 36
ENGAGING INDIGENOUS ECONOMY

Fig. 3.6 Interpretation of the three sectors using data on their changing relative importance over time. .............. 39
Fig. 5.1 The hybrid economy ................................................. 58
Fig. 8.1 Map of the Torres Strait ............................................. 99
Fig. 8.2 Aerial view of Masig and Koedal Islands .............. 99
Fig. 8.3 Masig Islanders’ typical fishing boats ............... 102
Fig. 9.1 Map showing Indigenous peoples of the southwest Gulf of Carpentaria ............................................. 112
Fig. 9.2 Copper sulphide from Redbank mine flows directly into Hanrahan’s Creek killing all aquatic life ............ 114
Fig. 9.3 Sulphur dioxide billowing from McArthur River Mine . . 114
Fig. 9.4 Drawing of settler colonial violence in the Gulf Country, Dinny McDinny, (1927–2003) ......................... 115
Fig. 9.5 Same story, settlers–miners, Jacky Green, 2013 .......... 116
Fig. 9.6 Land tenure in the southwest Gulf of Carpentaria . . 117
Fig. 9.7 Garawa ranger Donald Shadforth undertaking aerial controlled burning of his country at Robinson River .... 119
Fig. 9.8 FIFO—Fly In Fuck Off, Jacky Green, 2013 .................. 121
Fig. 9.9 Whitefellas work like white ants, Jacky Green, 2014 . 122
Fig. 9.10 Wundigala, Myra Rory, 2008 .............................. 125
Fig. 10.1 Maruku Arts’ expenditure on puŋu in 17 regional Anangu communities per financial year ..................... 138
Fig. 10.2 Maruku Arts’ expenditure on puŋu in 11 regional Anangu communities with an art centre per financial year ............................................. 139
Fig. 10.3 Maruku Arts’ expenditure on puŋu in six regional Anangu communities without an art centre per financial year ............................................. 139
Fig. 13.1 Indigenous health reporting: number of stories in The Australian, Sydney Morning Herald and Courier Mail, 1994–95, 2002–03, 2006–07 ................................. 173
Fig. 16.1 A snapshot of Indigenous-held land from 1788 to 2013 . 209
Fig. 16.2 Indigenous land titling under three tenures .......... 211
Fig. 16.3 Distribution of Indigenous population from the
2011 Census and Indigenous land titles in 2013 .......... 211
Fig. 17.1 A spectrum of housing options according
to key variables ..................................... 228
Fig. 17.2 Steps in the Tauranga Papakāinga housing toolkit .... 229
Fig. 17.3 Author’s schematic of Stone’s (2009) ‘resident-saver’
model .................................................. 232
Fig. 17.4 Spectrum of housing tenure models across the US,
UK and Australia ..................................... 234
Fig. 19.1 Map of Nyangumarta native title determination area ... 255
Fig. 19.2 Nyangumarta native title work by activity type
(% of total time of Nyangumarta participation) .......... 258
Fig. 19.3 Professions of non-Nyangumarta individuals
involved in Nyangumarta native title activities,
1999–2014 .......................................... 259
Fig. 19.4 Number of organisations involved in Nyangumarta
native title activities by type, 1999–2014 ................. 260
Fig. 23.1 Bogged in the Mann River Crossing, May 1979 .... 291
Fig. 23.2 Anchor Kalumba at Mumeka, late 1979 .......... 291
Fig. 23.3 Indigenous census count 1971–2011 .............. 294
Fig. 23.4 Ratio of Indigenous to non-Indigenous employment
and income outcomes, 1971–2011 ...................... 295
Fig. 23.5 Ratio of Indigenous to non-Indigenous
educational outcomes, 1971–2011 ....................... 295
Fig. 23.6 Land rights and ownership under three tenures, 2014 .. 296
Fig. 23.7 Distribution of the Indigenous population, 2011 ...... 297
Fig. 23.8 Distribution of discrete Indigenous communities ...... 298
Fig. 23.9 Poster from Not Dead Yet: A Retrospective
Exhibition featuring the work of Therese Ritchie
and Chips Mackinolty .................................. 302
List of tables

Table 10.1 Maṟuku Arts’ art market in Yulara ................ 134
Table 10.2 Maṟuku Arts’ dot painting workshops .......... 134
Table 10.3 Maṟuku Arts’ total annual expenditure on puņu
in 17 regional AṆangu communities ................... 136
Table 16.1 Summary of dealing provisions in the NTA
and the statutory Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander
land rights regimes around Australia
(as at November 2014) .................................. 215
Table 19.1 Nyangumarta native title work by activity
type, 1999–2014 ........................................ 257
Table 20.1 Gender of businesses across region:
qualitative results ....................................... 267
Table 20.2 Location of businesses across region
and state: quantitative sample ......................... 268
Table 20.3 Role of spouse in the business
(formal business partner and contributor
to the business): qualitative results ................. 270
Table 20.4 Community contributions of private,
community and cooperatively owned businesses:
quantitative results ..................................... 271
Table 20.5 Community contributions of urban, regional
and remote Indigenous businesses: quantitative results . .. 272
## Abbreviations and acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4WD</td>
<td>Four-Wheel Drive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABA</td>
<td>Aboriginals Benefit Account</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABS</td>
<td>Australian Bureau of Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABTA</td>
<td>Aboriginals Benefit Trust Account</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABTF</td>
<td>Aborigines Benefits Trust Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AEDP</td>
<td>Aboriginal Employment Development Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AHURI</td>
<td>Australian Housing and Urban Research Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIATSIS</td>
<td>Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALRA</td>
<td><em>Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act 1976</em> (Cwlth)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANU</td>
<td>Australian National University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APY</td>
<td>Anangu Pitjantjatjara Yankunytjatjara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARC</td>
<td>Australian Research Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATSIC</td>
<td>Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAEPR</td>
<td>Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CATSI Act</td>
<td><em>Corporations (Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander) Act 2006</em> (Cwlth)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDEP</td>
<td>Community Development Employment Projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDA</td>
<td>Committee for Economic Development of Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLT</td>
<td>Community Land Trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COAG</td>
<td>Council of Australian Governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRF</td>
<td>Consolidated Revenue Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAA</td>
<td>Department of Aboriginal Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDTL</td>
<td>Executive Director of Township Leasing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FaHCSIA  Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs
FIFO  Fly in/Fly out
GDP  Gross Domestic Product
GFC  Global Financial Crisis
IAS  Indigenous Advancement Strategy
IPA  Indigenous Protected Area
ITA Act  Income Tax Assessment Act 1936 (Cwlth)
IVAIS  Indigenous Visual Arts Industry Support program
LNG  Liquefied Natural Gas
MRE  Mining Royalty Equivalent
MWT  Mining Withholding Tax
NG  Ngaanyatjarra
NGO  Non-government Organisation
NLC  Northern Land Council
NNTT  National Native Title Tribunal
NTA  Native Title Act 1993 (Cwlth)
NTAC  Northern Territory Aboriginal Council
NTER  Northern Territory Emergency Response
NTRB  Native Title Representative Body
NWAC  Nyangumarta Warrarn Aboriginal Corporation
ORIC  Office of the Registrar of Indigenous Corporations
PBC  Prescribed Body Corporate
PZJA  Torres Strait Projected Zone Joint Authority
RJCP  Remote Jobs and Communities Program
RNTBC  Registered Native Title Body Corporate
ROCO  Register of Cultural Organisations
YMAC  Yamatji Marlpa Aboriginal Corporation
Contributors

Jon Altman is a Research Professor at the Alfred Deakin Institute for Citizenship and Globalisation at Deakin University, and an Emeritus Professor of The Australian National University located at RegNet: School of Regulation and Global Governance. From 1990 to 2010 he was foundation Director of the Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research at ANU. He is an enthusiastic advocate for the power of critical and independent academic research to persuade.

PK Basu is an Associate Professor in the Faculty of Business, Charles Sturt University. His research interests include Indigenous entrepreneurship. His research has been funded by the Australian Research Council (Discovery and Linkage Grants).

Shelley Bielefeld is a Braithwaite Research Fellow at RegNet: School of Regulation and Global Governance at The Australian National University where she is undertaking scholarship on the interaction between the regulatory state and Indigenous peoples in the area of welfare reform.

Geoff Buchanan is a PhD candidate at the Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research, The Australian National University. He commenced a career in policy research as Jon Altman’s research assistant in 2004. He has worked at the Native Title Research Unit at the Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies and currently works with the ACT Council of Social Service.

Rose Butler is a Research Associate with the Centre for Social Impact at the University of New South Wales. She undertakes Australia-based ethnographic and qualitative research on children’s economic lives, family and economy, class and cultural diversity in education.
Jock Collins is Professor of Social Economics in the Management Discipline Group at the UTS Business School, Sydney, Australia. His research interests centre on an interdisciplinary study of immigration and cultural diversity and include immigrant and Indigenous entrepreneurship. His research has been funded by the Australian Research Council and the Rural Industry Research and Development Council.

Louise Crabtree is a Senior Research Fellow in the Institute for Culture and Society at Western Sydney University. She has recently led work funded by the Australian Housing and Urban Research Institute focusing on appropriate housing tenure options for Aboriginal communities in New South Wales and the Northern Territory.

Katherine Curchin is an applied political philosopher with research interests in social policy and Indigenous policy in Australia. She is a Research Fellow in the Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research, The Australian National University, and holds an Australian Research Council Discovery Early Career Researcher Award. Her current research project compares Noel Pearson and Jon Altman’s visions of Indigenous development.

Ben Dibley is a Research Fellow at the Institute for Culture and Society, Western Sydney University, Australia. He is co-author of Collecting, ordering, governing: anthropology and liberal government (Duke University Press, forthcoming).

Jacky Green is a Garawa warrior and artist from the Gulf country of the Northern Territory. He says he started painting to get his voice out: ‘I want to show people what is happening to our country and to Aboriginal people. No one is listening to us. What we want. How we want to live. What we want in the future for our children. It’s for these reasons that I started to paint. I want government to listen to Aboriginal people. I want people in the cities to know what’s happening to us and our country.’

Chris Gregory is an Adjunct Fellow in Anthropology at The Australian National University. He is an economic anthropologist who has lived and worked in Papua New Guinea, India and Fiji. He is the author of Observing the economy (Routledge, 1989, with Jon Altman). A second edition of his book, Gifts and commodities, has just been published by HAU books.
Seán Kerins is a Research Fellow at the Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research, The Australian National University. Over the past 25 years he has worked with Indigenous peoples and local communities on cultural and natural resource management issues in Aotearoa/New Zealand, the Faroe Islands, Norway and Australia.

Emma Kowal is Professor of Anthropology in the Alfred Deakin Institute for Citizenship and Globalisation and the School of Humanities and Social Sciences at Deakin University. She is the author of Trapped in the gap: doing good in Indigenous Australia (Berghahn, 2015).

Branka Krivokapic-Skoko is an Associate Professor in the Faculty of Business, Charles Sturt University. Her research interests include the revitalisation of regional and rural Australia through ethnic business and immigration. Her research has been funded by the Australian Research Council and the Rural Industry Research and Development Council.

Richard Martin is a Research Fellow and Consultant Anthropologist at the University of Queensland. His research is focused on the politics of land and identity in Australia. He has undertaken numerous applied projects, including research on multiple native title claims and cultural heritage matters around Queensland. He was co-editor (with Cameo Dalley) of Dichotomous identities? Indigenous and non-Indigenous people and the intercultural in Australia, The Australian Journal of Anthropology, Volume 26, Issue 1 (2015).

Kerry McCallum is Senior Research Fellow in the News and Media Research Centre, Faculty of Arts and Design, University of Canberra. Her research in political communication examines the relationships between changing media, political participation and the development of social policy, with a particular focus on Australian Indigenous affairs.

Pamela McGrath is currently Research Director with the National Native Title Tribunal. Her research interests include the social impacts of native title, Indigenous heritage management, information management and archiving. She has worked in the native title sector for over 15 years and in 2010 co-founded the Centre for Native Title Anthropology at The Australian National University.
**Mark Morrison** is Sub-Dean Research in the Faculty of Business, Charles Sturt University. His research has been funded by the Australian Research Council (Discovery and Linkage Grants), the US Environmental Protection Agency and National Science Foundation, NSW Environmental Trust, Land and Water Australia, Country Energy, IPART and the US Forest Service.

**Stephen Muecke** is Professor of Ethnography in the Environmental Humanities Program at the University of New South Wales. His book *The Mother’s Day protest and other fictocritical essays* will be published by Rowman and Littlefield International in June 2016.

**John Nieuwenhuysen** is a Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences in Australia, and is currently Emeritus Professor, Monash University. In 2003 he received an award (AM) in the Order of Australia for services to independent research on immigration, multicultural, equity, indigenous, taxation, labour and industry issues, and to reform of the liquor laws of Victoria.

**Nicolas Peterson** is Professor of Anthropology at The Australian National University. He has a long-standing interest in Australian Aboriginal anthropology, land and sea tenure, economic anthropology, and fourth-world peoples and the state. His most recent book is *Experiments in self-determination: histories of the outstation movement in Australia* (coedited with Fred Myers, ANU Press, 2016).

**David P Pollack** is a former adviser in the Australian Government specialising in land rights, native title and royalty management. He has a special interest in the Aboriginals Benefit Account and worked closely with Jon Altman in researching the financial aspects of the *Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act 1976* during the period of the Reeves Review in the late 1990s.

**Kim de Rijke** is Lecturer in Anthropology at the University of Queensland. His current research is focused on the sociocultural dimensions of unconventional gas developments in Australia, Europe and the US. For the past 13 years he has also carried out applied research on native title and Indigenous cultural heritage, and was managing and senior anthropologist at the Kimberley and Central Queensland Aboriginal Land Councils from 2003 to 2008.
Marianne Riphagen is a Visiting Fellow at the School of Archaeology and Anthropology, The Australian National University. She also teaches anthropology at the Radboud University Nijmegen, the Netherlands. Her research has focused on art created by urban-based Indigenous Australians, Indigenous cosmopolitanism and the economic value of Aboriginal cultural heritage in Australia’s Western Desert.

Will Sanders joined the staff of the Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research (CAEPR) as a Research Fellow in 1993, having previously been a CAEPR Associate and co-author with Jon Altman of CAEPR’s Discussion Paper No. 1. He works on policy issues relating to housing, local government and social security. His political science training has also led to a research interest in Indigenous people and elections. Will was Deputy Director of CAEPR from 2010 to 2014.

Benedict Scambary is an anthropologist with 20 years’ experience working with Aboriginal people in the Northern Territory. He completed his PhD at the Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research under the supervision of Jon Altman in 2007. He is currently the Chief Executive Officer of the Aboriginal Areas Protection Authority.

Leon Terrill is a lecturer in the University of New South Wales Law School and a Research Director at the Indigenous Law Centre. He is the author of Beyond communal and individual ownership: Indigenous land reform in Australia (Routledge, 2015) and teaches land law, contract law and Indigenous legal issues.

Annick Thomassin is an anthropology PhD candidate at McGill University (Canada). Her thesis examines the politics underpinning fisheries co-management strategies in Torres Strait. She is also a Research Officer at the Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research, The Australian National University, where her research focus is largely on the political ecology of coastal and marine resources management.

David Trigger is Professor of Anthropology at the University of Queensland. His research interests encompass the different meanings attributed to land and nature across diverse sectors of society. He has carried out more than 35 years of anthropological study on Indigenous Australian systems of land tenure, including applied research on

**Lisa Waller** is a Senior Lecturer in the School of Communication and Creative Arts, Deakin University. Her research is concerned with how news media shape society, from Indigenous Affairs policy, to their role in regional and rural identity formation and the administration of justice.

**Ed Wensing** is a Fellow of the Planning Institute of Australia and of the Higher Education Academy. He is currently a PhD Scholar at the National Centre for Indigenous Studies, The Australian National University, and Adjunct Associate Professor in the College of Marine and Environmental Sciences at James Cook University. He has over 40 years’ experience as an urban and regional planner and policy analyst and has worked extensively with Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people on a wide range of land administration and land use planning matters.

**Kaely Woods** has had a long career as a senior bureaucrat in Indigenous affairs. She is now a PhD candidate at The Australian National University, researching the role and value of Indigenous culture in economic development, particularly in remote Australia. Her other research interests include Indigenous control, governance, and participation in enterprises and services across cultural and other industries.
Taking difference seriously:
Life, income and work for
Jon Altman and friends

Will Sanders

The engagement of Indigenous Australians in economic activity is a
matter of long-standing public concern and debate. Jon Altman has
made it the focus of an academic and public career spanning almost
40 years. First as an economist at Melbourne University and then
as an anthropologist at The Australian National University (ANU),
Jon explored issues of life, income and work among Indigenous
Australians at geographic scales from the local to the national
(Altman & Nieuwenhuysen 1979, Altman 1987). He tussled early
with policy questions around mining, tourism, arts and homelands
and with the research methods of economic anthropology (Gregory
& Altman 1989). All this was done before Jon established the ANU
Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research (CAEPR) in 1990,
of which he became the foundation Director. Jon’s output over the
next 20 years, often in conjunction with his CAEPR colleagues, was
sustained and prolific (Thomassin & Butler 2014). At the 10-year mark,
Jon engaged Tim Rowse to review ‘the CAEPR corpus’, which resulted
in the book Indigenous futures: choice and development for Aboriginal
and Islander Australians (Rowse 2002a). Launching that book,
Hal Wootten wondered whether Tim’s focus on the ideas of choice
and ‘the Indigenous sector’ was what Jon expected. For Wootten (2002: 79), this was a worryingly positive ‘lens’ on developments and achievements about which he was ‘much less sanguine’. He saw ‘prison camps’ with walls only partly torn down, or in the jocular metaphor of Aboriginal people, a ‘yabbie bucket’ out of which it was still very hard to jump. Rowse’s response to Wootten was that he was ‘taking choice seriously’ among Indigenous Australians, as he argued CAEPR research had done over the previous decade (Rowse 2002b: 82).

My impressions of Jon’s work over 35 years are that he has always taken Indigenous choice and difference very seriously. He has seen past Indigenous agency contributing to current social and economic circumstances and current Indigenous agency contributing to future possibilities. This is not to deny that the economic structures surrounding Indigenous people can be powerfully constraining, but it respects Indigenous people as competent judges of the possibilities and opportunities they face. Jon’s hybrid economy approach suggests that Indigenous people are competently exploring their comparative advantage drawn from the customary sector, while also exploring the opportunities and constraints they face in the market and state sectors. These exploratory choices both reflect and lead to differences, among Indigenous Australians and between Indigenous and settler Australians. Differences in socioeconomic status cannot simply be reduced to ideas of disadvantage and structural lack of opportunity. These are contentious ideas, but ones worth thinking about hard and taking seriously.

The following collection of papers is drawn from a conference held in September 2014 to coincide with Jon’s 60th birthday and his retirement from CAEPR and ANU as a member of staff. It includes contributions from some of Jon’s most long-standing colleagues: his economist colleague from the University of Melbourne John Nieuwenhuysen; his anthropology PhD supervisor from ANU Nicolas Peterson; and his postdoctoral collaborator on the methods of economic anthropology Chris Gregory. It also includes numerous contributions from younger scholars who have found Jon’s work stimulating or useful in shaping their own. What is missing, quite notably, is papers by Jon’s CAEPR colleagues of the last 25 years. This is explained in part by the interest expressed by over 50 people in giving papers at the conference. The program committee of Tim Rowse, Kirrily Jordan and myself chose 35 and in the process cut out a number of offerings by CAEPR staff.
This was not intentional, but it seemed reasonable. Long-standing staff could contribute to the conference and the CAEPR publication program in other ways, while for those beyond CAEPR the conference was a rare opportunity to engage directly with Jon and his work.

Part 1 of this collection focuses on Jon’s core concept of the hybrid economy, in theory, practice and policy. In Chapter 2, one of Jon’s PhD students, Geoff Buchanan, provides a ‘genealogy’ of Jon’s work, going right back to a Master’s thesis on export instability in Samoa. Jon was already interested in the idea of ‘subsistence affluence’ as an alternative to exposure to the vagaries of the capitalist market economy. Jon’s academic journey was ‘circuitous’, argues Buchanan, taking in ‘articulation of modes of production’ and ‘relative autonomy’ before settling on the idea of ‘economic hybridity’. At the other end of the collection (Chapter 21), another one of Jon’s PhD students, Ben Scambary, argues that Jon has used his privileged position in academia over many years to ‘speak truth to power’ in a ‘frank and fearless’ way. Ben’s PhD was part of a CAEPR research project on relations between Aboriginal communities and mining companies. He notes acknowledgement that CAEPR’s research was ‘a key influence on Rio Tinto’s $2 billion mining agreement in the Pilbara’, speaking truth to corporate power (see also Scambary 2013).

Two other contributions in Part 1 are from PhD students who have been influenced, though not supervised, by Jon Altman. Kaely Woods is a former senior Indigenous affairs bureaucrat who engaged with Jon and CAEPR during the 1990s and 2000s. Having left the public service, she is now trying to push further Jon’s methods of measuring and valuing non-market aspects of Indigenous activity. Woods is using ‘choice modelling’ to test and value ‘the tension and trade-offs between paid employment and cultural activity’ for Indigenous people (Chapter 7). In Chapter 8, Annick Thomassin provides a classic account of hybridity in the ‘life projects’ of Masig Islanders in the Torres Strait. Being a ‘fisher’ on Masig is, she argues, not a ‘job’ or a ‘profession’ but a ‘way of life’. While fishing is a useful way to feed the family, it can be seasonal and unreliable, as too can be the income derived from it. So land-based activities under the long-running state sector Community Development Employment Projects (CDEP) scheme have provided fishers with a steady base income on which to build.
Although a McGill University PhD scholar, Thomassin has chosen to sit at CAEPR for the last five years, clearly influenced and inspired by Jon’s work.

While this volume is a festschrift for Jon Altman, it also attempts to be critical. Jon often gives ‘robust’ critiques of other people’s work and he asks for nothing less in return. In Chapter 3, Chris Gregory picks at the logic of Jon’s three-sector model of economic engagement and income generation. In strict binary terms, the model leads to eight segments, not seven, and the sectors themselves must also be separately considered. There are thus 11 distinct spaces to be logically considered in the hybrid generation of work, life and income, not just seven. Chris also points out that Jon’s empirical work on the changing relative importance of the three sectors over time is not represented in his Venn diagram. This, Gregory argues, would lead to a consideration of ‘changing relations of domination and subordination’, as much as hybridity.

Chapters 4–6 continue in this critical vein. De Rijke, Martin and Trigger raise questions about the idea of ‘customary environmentalism’ which they discern at the heart of Jon’s recent research project with others entitled People on Country. Despite aspirations of ‘two way’ knowledge exchange, they argue that contemporary Indigenous environmental work is often a more prosaic form of low-waged employment, continuing more than transforming past economic relations. Nicolas Peterson sees Jon’s hybrid economy model as only relevant to a small proportion of Indigenous people, even in remote areas. He suggests that for the ‘difficulties the majority of the remote area populations are facing’, the model is not ‘a coherent basis for policy’. Katherine Curchin offers the idea of ‘partial commodification’ as a way of thinking more clearly about the ‘livelihood activities which typify the hybrid economy’ and she notes that there are also many non-Indigenous people, like academics, whose livelihoods ‘mediate market and non-market norms’.

The later chapters in Part 1 all focus on the practice of the hybrid economy in particular regions, although at times they are also oriented to theory or policy. In Chapter 9, Seán Kerins and Jacky Green show how they have worked together on alternative development strategies in the Gulf country. This has occurred under the auspices of the People on Country project, combining the labours of an Indigenous
land owner and artist with those of an academic collaborator. Green’s paintings are both striking and powerfully evocative of ideas of hybrid land-based development. His words of explanation, carefully recorded by Kerins, suggest how these images draw on adverse Indigenous experiences of imposed economic development. The case for difference and alternative development strategies on country could not be more strongly put.

In Chapter 10, Marianne Riphagen revisits Altman’s work in the 1980s on tourism and art at Muṯitjulu, adjacent to Uluru. She reflects on more recent developments at Maruku Arts. With the commercial success of wooden artefacts, known as puŋu, declining since 2007, Maruku has experimented with art markets and dot painting workshops for tourists in Yulara since 2012. Riphagen notes that these initiatives have provided additional income for Indigenous artists resident at Muṯitjulu, but that puŋu production has largely been based in other communities some distance away. While the local Muṯitjulu artists have benefited from Maruku’s recent experiments, the broader ‘regional economy’ of art production has had attention drawn away from it and possibly fallen further into decline. Maintaining comparative advantage in the hybrid economy can require changing explorations of possibilities with unintended adverse consequences as well as successes.

In Chapter 11, via a slightly obscure reference to Karl Marx’s 11 theses on Feuerbach (Tucker 1972: 107–9), Stephen Muecke and Ben Dibley offer us ‘five theses for reinstituting economics’ developed from their observations of Broome during conflict over the proposed gas plant at James Price Point. They see the proponents of the gas plant, Woodside and the Western Australian government, as using a ‘modern’ language of ‘the Economy’ from which all supposedly benefit. As environmental humanists, Muecke and Dibley want to reinstitute a more grounded, ethnographic language of ‘economies’ that have local ‘contingencies’ and do not ‘determine all values’. Their economies are ‘earthbound’ and variable, have ‘non-human stakeholders’ and are all ‘hybrid’, just ‘especially in Aboriginal Australia’. They see Altman’s work as contributing to this ‘deflation of the Economy’ into ‘a diversity of economic activities and livelihood sources which evidence creative postcolonial adaptation’.
Part 2 of the collection focuses on the somewhat unlikely twin ideas of neoliberalism and guardianship in recent debates about Indigenous policy. Shelley Bielefeld shows how there is a return to state paternalism, as well as market liberalism, in recent policies of income management within the social security system. She sees this as a continuation of the unfinished ‘colonial project’ of reforming Indigenous norms (Chapter 12).

Kerry McCallum and Lisa Waller (Chapter 13) provide an analysis of the media and Indigenous policy over a 20-year period. They focus on The Australian newspaper as a self-conscious ‘keystone’ of Australian Indigenous affairs reporting promoting ‘neoliberal policy agendas’. They also note the ‘singular influence’ of Noel Pearson as a regular commentator columnist in The Australian. Jon Altman, by way of contrast, has been a regular commentator columnist in The National Indigenous Times and Tracker, two somewhat more marginal parts of the Australian media landscape.

Emma Kowal (Chapter 14) offers a more personalised account of how, as a young medical and arts graduate, she enthusiastically stepped into the public health gap between Indigenous and other Australians. A few years later, disillusioned and sensitised to the ‘moral politics of race and identity’, she developed an analysis of the ‘intense identity work that consumes so much effort in Indigenous affairs’. She sees Jon, like herself, as ‘trapped in the gap’ between ‘two equal and opposing fears’, which she labels ‘remedialism’ in one direction and ‘orientalism’ in the other. This is a sophisticated analytic version of a central question that has always hung over CAEPR’s and Jon’s work: when is socioeconomic difference to be judged adversely as structural disadvantage and lack of opportunity and when supportively as reflecting autonomy, informed choice and cultural difference (see for example Altman and Rowse 2005)?

In Chapter 15, Leon Terrill uses the idea of renewed state paternalism in his account of the recent push for ‘township leases’ on Aboriginal land in the Northern Territory. He sees ‘neoliberal paternalism’ as a two-step process in which the state first imposes higher levels of ‘discipline’ on poor individuals and households through requirements like standardised rent and tenancy agreements. The more distant and long-term second step is to produce responsible and competent actors in private housing markets. Having identified the first step as
a form of guardianship, Terrill asks whether there are others, besides government, who could exercise this ‘control’. Jon would argue that in the ‘massive change in land titling in Australia’ since 1977, it has been Aboriginal land councils and groups of traditional owners who have exercised such control, but that recent governments have not respected their different choices.

Terrill’s contribution leads in well to Part 3 of the collection focusing on applications of Altman’s ideas in land, housing and entrepreneurship.

Ed Wensing (Chapter 16) examines both native title and 23 statutory forms of Aboriginal land rights developed in Australia in the last half century. His focus is on the inability of native title holders to use their interests in land as part of the ‘modern economy’. He argues that it is appropriate that Aboriginal land cannot simply be sold, but that it ought to be able to be leased and used to secure a mortgage. Some of the statutory land rights regimes show how this can be done, but they too can be restrictive and ultimately are also subject to the restrictions of native title. As a land use planner, Wensing wants to break through some of these ‘legal orthodoxies’ and think differently.

In Chapter 17, Louise Crabtree takes inspiration from the idea of hybridity in exploring possible alternative affordable housing tenures beyond the existing polarised options of mortgagee home ownership and public housing. Through ideas of community land trusts, she opens up a spectrum of variable equity housing tenure possibilities between these polarities. Her empirical inspiration comes from outside Australia, but is clearly reinforced by Altman’s determination to take difference seriously.

David Pollack’s political economy of the Aboriginals Benefit Account in the Northern Territory in Chapter 18 is more historical in its inspiration. Rich in legislative and policy detail, it revisits ideas about the use of mining royalty equivalents (MREs) derived from Aboriginal land which Altman explored in an official review in 1985. Pollack asks why the ambiguous policy foundations noted by Altman have continued since with their shortcomings and inconsistencies.

Pamela McGrath (Chapter 19) reports on a study of how much labour, or work, has gone into native title processes for the Nyangumarta people over the last 15 years. McGrath finds that more than 140 Nyangumarta have allocated over 2,700 days to native title business,
but that they have only derived possibly $250,000 income, as their predominant mode of involvement is as unpaid volunteers. It is the 300 non-Nyangumarta—lawyers, mining executives, bureaucrats, anthropologists, etc.—who have derived significant income from these activities. Jon Altman will not be surprised by these findings, either as a well-paid ANU academic or from his own time allocation studies of Indigenous groups. Indigenous income from activities related to custom is more imputed than monetary, while settlers are well paid for their engagements.

Jock Collins and his co-authors (Chapter 20) report on a recent survey of over 300 Indigenous entrepreneurs, plus 38 more in-depth interviews. Through the idea of the ‘community contribution’ of Indigenous businesses they discern a large hybrid economy, while also arguing that it is the market that sets basic business constraints.

Part 4 of the collection comprises personal reflections, by PhD student Ben Scambary (as already discussed), by senior colleague John Nieuwenhuysen and by Jon Altman himself. John Nieuwenhuysen clearly takes considerable pride in having lured Altman from New Zealand to Australia with the offer of a job at Melbourne University in 1976. Thus began an association of almost 40 years in which, Nieuwenhuysen argues, Jon Altman has kept the ‘faith for independent, fearless scholarly research’ that is ‘directly related to policy’ and ‘exposed to public debate’. Jon Altman’s own reflections reinforce this idea when he notes that the ‘social justice fire’ that he shared with a young Aboriginal man in Melbourne in the late 1970s has not ‘abated’. Jon clearly takes great pride in advocating forcefully for his friends of 35 years at Mumeka and for other Indigenous groups across Australia. Indeed, in retrospect, forceful outspoken advocacy is perhaps Jon’s default setting, which was perhaps just slightly tempered during his first 17 years as the Director of CAEPR.

Nic Peterson identifies 2007 and the Northern Territory Emergency Response (NTER) as a turning point at which Jon Altman became the outspoken critic of ‘the government’s approach in Indigenous affairs’ and was no longer interested in the measured, insider-speak of policy targets and reform. Jon agrees, saying that he took a ‘decisive stance’ against the NTER and that he no longer felt it was ‘possible to produce research in good faith that would be genuinely received by government at face value’. This was a difficult stance to take as
the Director of a university centre receiving significant government funding and, no doubt, it contributed greatly to Jon’s decision to stand down from the CAEPR directorship just three years later. These were difficult years at CAEPR, as they were in Indigenous affairs more generally. Collegiality and friendship forged over the previous two decades was tested to the limits, as some wanted to become outsider critics of government with Jon and some to continue to play the measured, insider game.

The tensions within CAEPR during these years were not so much disciplinary as strategic. If, following Altman and Rowse 2005, this was economics and equality versus anthropology and difference, where did John Taylor and I fit in the mix? John Taylor’s measured population geographies and demographies were the very centre of the CAEPR corpus, producing powerful numbers with which public servants, politicians and Indigenous communities all wanted to engage. My own contributions from a political science background sometimes included numbers but were more distinctive for their focus on the internal dynamics of the state sector. I am not sure that my contributions were so well appreciated within government and they certainly had little to do with differences between anthropology and economics. But Jon Altman always defended both the independence and the wide interdisciplinary nature of CAEPR, which enabled my own work (and income) to be sustained over many years. For this I will be forever grateful.

It is with sadness that I note the absence of any contribution to this conference or volume from John Taylor. Indigenous affairs is, in many ways, a hard school. John Taylor took over as CAEPR Director in 2010 and continued, with other staff members, to produce those powerful numbers. Jon Altman tells us in his reflections that he had by then abandoned the ‘path to parity’ with its ‘imagined homo-topia’ and its ‘hegemonic deficit-focused indicators of success, failure and accountability’. This forthright outsider stance meant that Jon Altman was not easy to have on staff at CAEPR over the next four years, but his presence was always worthwhile.

The economic activities of Indigenous Australians are challenging to engage with, conceptually, empirically and strategically. Like Jon, I was drawn into this field as a young postgraduate over three decades ago. Jon’s work displayed a clarity of thought and method which is
Engaging Indigenous Economy

its hallmark to this day. It also displayed that fire of commitment to social justice and advocacy for modern hunter-gatherers, which is still evident in all that Jon says and does. Just to think that some Indigenous Australians can be modern hunter-gatherers is to take difference very seriously. We need more serious theorists of difference in Australia, like Jon Altman, to continue exploring Indigenous peoples’ postcolonial economic possibilities. Otherwise we may indeed lapse into some lazy, unintellectual ‘homo-topia’.

References


