



Australian
National
University



ENGAGING INDIGENOUS ECONOMY:
A SELECTED ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY
OF JON ALTMAN'S WRITINGS 1979–2014
A. THOMASSIN AND R. BUTLER

Centre for
Aboriginal Economic
Policy Research
ANU College of
Arts & Social
Sciences

CAEPR WORKING PAPER NO. 96/2014

Series Note

The Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research (CAEPR) undertakes high quality, independent research to further the social and economic development and empowerment of Indigenous people throughout Australia. For over 20 years CAEPR has aimed to combine academic and teaching excellence on Indigenous economic and social development and public policy with realism, objectivity and relevance.

CAEPR is located within the Research School of Social Sciences in the College of Arts and Social Sciences, at The Australian National University (ANU). The Centre is funded from a variety of sources including ANU, Australian Research Council, industry and philanthropic partners, the Australian Government Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet, and State and Territory governments.

CAEPR maintains a substantial publications program. CAEPR Working Papers are refereed reports which are produced for rapid distribution to enable widespread discussion and comment. They are available in electronic format only for free download from CAEPR's website:

caepr.anu.edu.au

As with all CAEPR publications, the views expressed in this Working Paper are those of the author(s) and do not reflect any official CAEPR position.

Professor Matthew Gray
Director, CAEPR
Research School of Social Sciences
College of Arts & Social Sciences
The Australian National University
August 2014

Front cover image 'Living on country at Nandel' courtesy of Tony Griffiths



Engaging Indigenous Economy: A Selected Annotated Bibliography of Jon Altman's Writings 1979–2014

A. Thomassin and R. Butler

Annick Thomassin is a PhD candidate in the Department of Anthropology of McGill University (Montreal, Canada). She works as a research officer for the Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research (CAEPR).

Rose Butler recently completed a PhD in anthropology in the College of Arts & Social Sciences at the Australian National University (ANU). She currently works for the Cosmopolitan Civil Societies Research Centre at the University of Technology, Sydney.

Working Paper No. 96/2014
ISSN 1442-3871

ISBN 0 7315 4995 3

An electronic publication downloaded
from <caepr.anu.edu.au>.

For a complete list of CAEPR
Working Papers, see
<[caepr.anu.edu.au/publications/
working.php](http://caepr.anu.edu.au/publications/working.php)>.

Centre for Aboriginal Economic
Policy Research
Research School of Social Sciences
College of Arts & Social Sciences
The Australian National University

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank Jon Altman, Elise Klein, Denise Steele and Matthew Gray for guidance, support and editing assistance throughout the development of this annotated bibliography. Very special thanks go to Susie Russell, who allowed parts of *The Hybrid Economy Topic Guide* to be used and adapted for this bibliography, as well as for her edits and comments.

Abbreviations and acronyms

ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
ACCC	Australian Competition and Consumer Commission
AEDP	Aboriginal Employment Development Policy
ALRA	Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act
ANU	Australian National University
ATSIC	Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission
BAC	Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation
CAEPR	Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research
CASS	College of Arts & Social Sciences
CDEP	Community Development Employment Projects
CNRM	cultural and natural resource management
DSS	Department of Social Security
EPBC	<i>Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999</i>
GMIO	guaranteed minimum income for outstations
IAS	Indigenous Arts Strategy
ICGP	Indigenous Community Governance Project
IPA	Indigenous Protected Area
MAC	Maningrida Arts and Culture
MRE	mining royalty equivalents
NAILSMA	North Australian Indigenous Land and Sea Management Alliance
NATSI	National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Survey
NATSISS	National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Social Survey
NRM	natural resource management
NSW	New South Wales
NT	Northern Territory
NTA	Native Title Act
NTER	Northern Territory Emergency Response
NTRB	Native Title Representative Bodies
ORA	outstation resource agency
PES	payment for environmental services
PoC	People on Country research project
RCIADIC	Royal Commission into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody
RDA	Racial Discrimination Act
TPA	<i>Trades Practices Act 1974</i>
TSRA	Torres Strait Regional Authority
WoC	Working on Country

Contents

Series Note	2
Acknowledgments	4
Abbreviations and acronyms	4
Note from the authors	6
Preface	7
1. Comparative modern hunter-gatherer studies	10
2. Economic hybridity and alternate development	15
3. Community Development Employment Projects (CDEP)	30
4. The Indigenous visual arts industry	38
5. Sustainable land-based Indigenous livelihoods	49
6. Employment and labour markets	68
7. Land rights and native title	86
8. Neo-liberalism or the return of the guardian State?	103

Note from the authors

Throughout this annotated bibliography the terms 'outstation' and 'homeland' are used interchangeably. The authors also note that the names 'Kuninjku' and 'Gunwinggu' refer to the same group while 'Momega' and 'Mumeka' refer to the same location.

In the bibliography, Altman's foundational writings have been marked with an * for easier identification.

Preface

Engaging Indigenous Economy: A Selected Annotated Bibliography of Jon Altman's Writings 1979–2014 is published in conjunction with the conference 'Engaging Indigenous economy: Debating diverse approaches', convened at the Australian National University, 4–5 September 2014. The publication and conference coincide with Jon Altman's retirement



Photo: Mark Chew

from the Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research (CAEPR), where he was foundation director from 1990 to 2010. The annotated bibliography aims to summarise many of the themes to which Altman has dedicated his career to date, and is designed to be a navigational tool for paper presenters, conference delegates and others wishing to engage with Altman's work.

The bibliography was written in conversation with Jon Altman and is structured around the six conference themes selected by conveners Kirrily Jordan, Tim Rowse and Will Sanders to reflect Altman's writings: comparative modern hunter–gatherer studies; economic hybridity and alternate development; employment and labour markets; land rights and native title; sustainable land-based indigenous livelihoods; and neoliberalism or the return of the guardian state?

The bibliography has its basis in an earlier publication, *The Hybrid Economy Topic Guide*, prepared by Susie Russell as an element of the Australian Research Council Discovery project 'Hybrid economic futures for remote Indigenous Australia: Linking poverty reduction and natural resource management'. In looking to update this topic guide in early 2014, a decision was made to considerably extend its coverage to encompass a far wider selection of Altman's published research.

Given the breadth of Altman's research over a long career, it has not been possible to include all of his published work; however, the bibliography covers a large proportion of his written contribution. Classification of works according to the conference themes has required judgments, as many publications could be allocated to more than one theme. The authors have sought to address the challenge of some inevitable arbitrary

judgment by developing a set of keywords for each annotated item.

The publications selected here draw attention to the developing research, practice and political agendas of Altman's work. Throughout his academic career, Altman has been committed to influencing public policy with rigorous, empirically grounded and theoretically informed scholarship. CAEPR was established in 1990 with the aim of assisting the development of government strategies to increase Aboriginal employment and economic status through research of the highest academic standards. Altman's large number of submissions to parliamentary and other government inquiries attest to this goal. His work has focused on securing the same entitlements for Indigenous people as provided by the state to the rest of the Australian population. Along with other CAEPR colleagues, Altman has pushed for changes in the five-yearly census and special surveys to improve the quality of information collected on socioeconomic status and trends for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander individuals and communities. In other areas of his work, Altman has explored how social scientists, particularly anthropologists, can better influence the formulation of Indigenous public policy.

The annotations in this document highlight ways in which Altman's research has been influenced by his early disciplinary training, first in economics and then anthropology. Altman interwove these fields in a manner that was at its time ground-breaking for Indigenous development research. A combination of economic pragmatism and cultural relativism have clearly influenced this approach, while his long-term commitment to the Kuninjk people in Arnhem Land, with whom he lived during his doctoral fieldwork, has driven his determination to achieve real outcomes for people using the combined lenses of culture and commerce.

Altman's relationship with the people of Arnhem Land, and with Kuninjk-speaking people in particular, began during his PhD candidacy (1978–1982) and has been maintained to the present. These long-term and robust collaborations permeate much of his early writings on comparative modern 'hunter–gatherer' studies, and in his more recent publications on the Northern Territory Emergency Response intervention and the state. It is the articulation of different forms of data and analysis that lends his work the most insight, building on his assumption that both qualitative and quantitative research—deploying thick description and statistics, respectively—are essential.

Since 2001, Altman has redefined his earlier work on diversity as the 'hybrid economy model' (Altman 2001). This model is a means of theoretically recognising the existence of, and interdependencies between, diverse and distinct forms of productive activity undertaken by Indigenous people in remote and regional Australia. To the conventional two-sector conceptualisation of the economy (market/private and state/public), Altman adds a third sector, which he terms 'customary' (non-market). The customary sector, he argues, is central to sustainable livelihoods on lands held under various forms of Indigenous title today.

In the hybrid economy model, the customary, state and market sectors are considered interdependent. Economic productivity and cultural vibrancy are maximised at the intersection of these three sectors; what Altman refers to as the 'bliss point' (Altman 2010). This point is particularly illustrated in his research on Aboriginal visual art production, where a 'single' productive activity is generated by all three sectors of the hybrid economy. This bibliography therefore includes a category for the Indigenous visual arts sector to reflect much of Altman's research dedicated to this cultural production.

Altman and others have drawn on observations of productive regimes at Kuninjku outstations/homelands in western Arnhem Land that began in 1979, and applied the hybrid economy model to other regional and remote Aboriginal contexts. This work has especially focused on areas where livelihood options in market capitalism are rare or absent.

Using innovative economic modelling, Altman has made the customary sector visible, quantitative and official, and these data have been of fundamental importance to many of his political arguments. Through ongoing fieldwork since 1979, he has retained the topicality of his research to current policy and political circumstances, shaping the nature of this work to ensure that data and analysis remain as relevant to those who live it as to those who read it.

Altman has also emphasised and widely documented the salient role played by the state-funded Community Development Employment Projects (CDEP) scheme in underwriting Indigenous hybrid economies. He has critically examined and assessed the program since its launch as a pilot program in 1977 and has a long-term perspective on its operations. Today, as the program is being phased out across the country, Altman continues to defend its critical importance in supporting Indigenous aspirations and sustainable alternatives. Reflecting this key topic in Altman's writings, this bibliography

includes a separate category for the CDEP scheme. This category has also been deliberately placed outside the employment and labour market section to properly reflect Altman's argument that the role of the CDEP scheme was not solely to address the objective of mainstream employment. Rather, the scheme was designed to provide income support, community development and enterprise development to underwrite non-market livelihood options.

From the mid 2000s, through his focus on economic hybridity, and influenced by such authors as Arturo Escobar, James Scott, Tania Murray Li, James Ferguson and Paul Nadasdy, Altman's theoretical framing shifted towards the critical fields of anthropology of development and political ecology. This intellectual move informs much of his current work, as well as his contributions to the major project he established in 2007, 'People on Country, healthy landscapes and Indigenous economic futures'. The project, primarily funded by the Myer Foundation with support from the Australian National University and the Australian Research Council, was a collaboration among a small team of CAEPR researchers and seven community-based ranger groups in north Australia and New South Wales, focusing on sustainable land-based Indigenous livelihoods.

Altman's research agenda changed somewhat after the Northern Territory intervention in 2007, as did Altman's relationship with Australian governments. During this time, Altman became an outspoken critic of the government's approach to Indigenous affairs. In this more recent period, his work reflected his growing disillusionment with the ability of evidence-based research to inform productive Indigenous policy and practice, which he saw as being increasingly influenced by particular ideologies and interest group lobbying. This shift coincided with Altman's experience of a decline in the expectation that academic research will be openly critical of government, especially if it is government funded. Altman subsequently turned to the media, especially alternative print media and community radio, as an avenue through which he sought to influence public opinion.

In his more recent publications, while Altman continues to advocate the outcomes of both statistical and qualitative research, he increasingly draws on his personal relationships, specific case studies and a post-structuralist framework to humanise difficult Indigenous development circumstances that are increasingly debated in the popular media. In this sense, Altman seeks to actively engage in the politics of intercultural mediation. His works continue to oscillate between the

micro and macro perspectives, as Altman, influenced by the writings of Pierre Bourdieu, Loïc Wacquant and Michel Foucault, has turned to theorise the state and its actors in the production of Indigenous economic policy. He continues to insist on policy flexibility and community control, a stalwart argument throughout his career. His recent writings also show an increased emphasis on cultural difference and seek to challenge depictions of remote Australia that support the current dominant mainstreaming agenda.

There are several provisos in this annotation of Altman's published works and their classification. First, as stated at the outset, the organisation of much of Altman's research into categories is difficult and almost arbitrary: as an obvious example, research on Indigenous engagement with mining can be categorised as employment and labour markets; land rights and native title; and neoliberalism or the return of the guardian state. Second, while this annotated bibliography refers to Altman's body of work, one of the enduring characteristics of his research is collaboration, from his first major publication in 1979 with John Nieuwenhuysen. A large proportion of the works annotated here are either co- or multi-authored. Similarly, while much of Altman's sole-authored research incorporates multiple disciplinary lenses, his collaborative publications are more eclectic and multidisciplinary. He has co-authored notably with economists and anthropologists, but also with lawyers, demographers, geographers, historians, political scientists, ecologists, botanists and zoologists, among others. Finally, Altman's long-term focus on research that aims to make a difference has generated a body of work that is at times highly applied, or integrates pure research with the applied, but which is rarely solely theoretical. A hallmark of his work is that it is difficult to categorise; while often politically engaged, it seeks to raise questions and provide social sciences critique rather than definitive answers.

Annick Thomassin
Rose Butler

August 2014

References

- Altman, J.C. 2001. 'Sustainable development options on Aboriginal land: The hybrid economy in the 21st century', *Discussion Paper No. 226*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/2001DP226.php>>.
- Altman, J.C. 2010. 'What future for remote Indigenous Australia? Economic hybridity and the neoliberal turn', in J.C. Altman and M. Hinkson (eds), *Culture Crisis: Anthropology and Politics in Aboriginal Australia*, UNSW Press, Sydney, 259–80.

1. Comparative modern hunter-gatherer studies

Altman, J.C. 1979. 'The question of affluence: Yolngu economy in northeast Arnhem Land', *Canberra Anthropology*, 2 (1): 1–29, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1979_CanberraAnthro.pdf>.

Keywords: Subsistence economy, affluence, Yolgnu

Summary: Altman argues that Yolngu people of northern Arnhem Land maintained an affluent economy prior to European contact despite possessing the means to become sedentary agriculturalists. Written in the 1970s, this theory runs against the canon of anthropology which conceived of 'hunter-gatherer' societies as having been both materially poor and living close to the subsistence margin. Altman disputes these orthodoxies which both perpetrated unilateral evolutionary theories, and which assumed that 'hunter-gatherers' with surplus labour, skills and technology would evolve into agriculturalists.

Altman, J.C. 1982. 'Hunting buffalo in north-central Arnhem Land: A case of rapid adaptation among Aborigines', *Oceania*, 52 (4): 274–85, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1982_Oceania.pdf>.

Keywords: Remote livelihoods, technology, cultural production, Momega/Mumeka, Eastern Gunwinggu economy

Summary: This article discusses the incorporation of feral water buffalo, *nganaparru*, into the Eastern Gunwinggu economy in north-central Arnhem Land. Through a case study of Gunwinggu buffalo hunting practices, Altman argues against a prevalent ethos which sees Indigenous people as being unwilling to adapt their economy to new production possibilities. Rather, Altman details the history and current practice of hunting buffalo in this cultural environment, highlighting ways in which this practice has enabled cultural reproduction and taken place without structural changes to the social organisation of production or belief systems. Changes which have occurred in this area have taken place at the technological level through the introduction of the shotgun and subsequently different hunting techniques. Gunwinggu also distribute and consume buffalo through existing relations and social obligations around all game,

though not including taboo restrictions. Hunting buffalo also has non-economic outcomes which reproduce existing forms of social relations, notably status.

Altman, J.C. 1982. 'Maningrida outstations: A preliminary economic overview', in E.A. Young and E.K. Fisk (eds), *Small Rural Communities, Development Studies Centre*, ANU, Canberra, 1–42, available at <http://www.anu.edu.au/caepr-dev/sites/default/files/StaffProfiles/stafffiles/jon-altman/1982_ManingridaOutstations.pdf>.

Keywords: Outstations, subsistence economy, Maningrida

Summary: In this chapter Altman outlines the contemporary economies of Maningrida's outstations in north-central Arnhem Land. He evaluates and analyses a broad range of quantitative data on populations, economic activity (production for use, and production for exchange), cash income levels and sources, expenditure patterns, and the availability of services. While transactions involving the market economy (production for exchange, income from social security, and expenditure patterns) are more readily quantified, Altman stresses that the traditional economy (production for use) in a modified form is still important. He argues that the outstation movement has resulted in the re-emergence of production for use, which now revolves around food production. In the realm of production for exchange, there also appears to be a substantial surplus during some times of the year from subsistence production for exchange using traditional modes of production (hunting and gathering). This surplus could be readily marketed.

Altman, J.C. 1983. 'Male role in economy and technology', *The Australian Encyclopedia*, The Grolier Society, Sydney, 178–181 (reprinted 1988 and 1995), available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1983_AusEncyclopaedia.pdf>.

Keywords: Subsistence economy, gender, technology, cultural reproduction

Summary: This entry documents the men's economy in pre-contact Indigenous livelihoods, arguing that people enjoyed a form of subsistence affluence. Altman argues that this economy was largely undifferentiated from other aspects of social life, with a strict division of labour taking place by age, sex and ritual grading. No definitive statement can be made regarding the relative importance

of the foodstuffs contributed by men and women, however men's level of production was far greater than previously thought. Hunting techniques, fishing methods and technologies, cooking methods, and non-subsistence men's production are all outlined. Altman concludes by arguing that men's hunting economy remains viable, particularly in areas where the outstation movement is strong, with market technology having been adopted and adapted to people's needs.

Altman, J.C. 1983. 'Eastern Gunwinggu fish trapping at Gunbatgarri', *The Beagle, Occasional Papers of the Northern Territory Museum*, 1(7): 59–71, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1983_Beagle.pdf>

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, subsistence economy, *mandjabu*, eastern Gunwinggu people, Momega/Mumeka, north-central Arnhem Land

Summary: The *mandjabu* is a conical fish trap manufactured and used in conjunction with a trapping fence to catch mainly barramundi and catfish among eastern Gunwinggu people. This article documents a specific *mandjabu* which was used by eastern Gunwinggu during the 1980 fish trapping season and subsequently sold to the Northern Territory Museum in Darwin. This *mandjabu* was manufactured by Anchor Galumba of Gurulk clan estate (*gunnguya*), the senior land owner at Momega outstation in north-central Arnhem Land. Alongside a number of photographs, Altman provides a detailed discussion of the *mandjabu*'s manufacture, the construction of the fence or *gun. galehwobeh*, the trapping operation, and the economic and social significance of fish trapping today. While its economic significance has declined due to the adoption of market technology, the activity remains symbolically important as it strengthens particular cultural practices, notably the status of elders. In this discussion, Altman builds on his broader argument that some Gunwinggu cultural practices have the ability to be monetised while also having the ability to contribute to a higher standard of living.

Altman, J.C. 1984. 'Hunter-gatherer subsistence production in Arnhem Land: The original affluence hypothesis re-examined', *Mankind*, 14 (3): 179–90, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1984_Mankind.pdf>.

Keywords: Subsistence economy, cultural transformation, gender, affluence

Summary: The significance of women's subsistence economy has diminished rapidly among north-central Arnhem Landers at the same time that men's hunting economy has remained resilient. In this article, Altman outlines numerous factors that have contributed to this transformation, many of which have an economic explanation. Of particular importance is the emergence of artefact production for exchange, through which the market value of men's art has been far higher than women's craft. Since the advent of unemployment benefits, men have also received more cash payments than women. Access to market commodities has further supplanted women's traditional subsistence production of bush carbohydrates and flora, while resulting in a supplementation in men's production. Access to market technology, especially in hunting, has also increased the efficiency of men's production, while women's productive efficiency in gathering has remained fairly stable. Reasons outside the economic domain have further contributed to this transformation, notably the correlation between men's hunting skills and rate of success in the ritual domain.

Also published as Altman, J.C. 1987. 'Hunter-gatherer subsistence production in Arnhem Land: The original affluence hypothesis re-examined', in W.E. Edwards (ed), *Traditional Aboriginal Society: A Reader*, Macmillan, Melbourne, 53–67 (reprinted in 1996), available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1987_TraditionalAboriginal.pdf>.

Altman, J.C. 1985. 'The dietary utilisation of flora and fauna by contemporary hunter-gatherers at Momega outstation, north-central Arnhem Land', *Australian Aboriginal Studies*, 1: 35–46, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1985_AusAboriginalStudies.pdf>.

Keywords: Bush foods, economic development, Momega/Mumeka, Eastern Gunwinggu

Summary: This article examines the dietary use of bush foods by Eastern Gunwinggu people in Arnhem Land

who continue to use a wide range of flora and fauna as subsistence produce. Drawing on data from his fieldwork at Momega outstation between 1979–1980, Altman outlines the correlation between this region's seasonal cycles and the collection and use of specific bush foods. From these data he assesses the protein and kilocalorie contribution that flora and fauna make to the Gunwinggu contemporary diet and economy. A comprehensive list of bush foods is provided and drawn on to argue that Gunwinggu continue to use their land productively as a result of their hunting and gathering skills, knowledge of the environment, and their land-extensive and semi-nomadic mode of living. Such knowledge and skills offer great potential for future economic development.

Altman, J.C. 1985. 'Gambling as a mode of redistributing and accumulating cash among Aborigines: A case study from Arnhem Land', in G. Caldwell, M. Dickerson, B. Haig and L. Sylvan (eds), *Gambling in Australia*, Croom Helm, Sydney, 50–67, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1985_Gambling.pdf>.

Keywords: Outstations, gambling, sharing, egalitarianism, cash redistribution, Momega/Mumeka

Summary: This chapter examines the role of gambling for cash in the outstation economy of Momega in north-central Arnhem Land between 1979–1980. Through a case-study of approximately thirty-one Eastern Gunwinggu people, Altman examines the economic role of gambling and how this social practice is characterised by egalitarianism in the material domain. In this social context, gambling performs redistribution and accumulative functions, existing as it does alongside a productive subsistence economy, a vibrant ceremonial system, and the welfare system. Like market technology and food, gambling has been adopted and adapted to meet particular Indigenous requirements – notably the injection of cash into the Gunwinggu economy through unemployment benefits. Gambling has evolved into an important mode of 'sharing', used by people to redistribute and accumulate cash among kin, and can be regarded as a positive form of cultural maintenance that extends egalitarianism from the subsistence domain to that of money.

*Altman, J.C. 1987. *Hunter-Gatherers Today: An Aboriginal Economy in North Australia*, Australian Institute of Aboriginal Studies, Canberra.

Keywords: Hunter-gatherers economies, customary sector, art market, state colonialism, Kuninjku/Gunwinggu

Summary: This book is the published version of Altman's PhD thesis *Hunter-gatherers and the State: The Economic anthropology of the Gunwinggu of North Australia* (1982). It is the first specifically economic ethnography of a small Aboriginal community in Arnhem Land which quantifies the customary sector, documents relations of production and their transformation under state colonialism, and outlines the economic ties that Kuninjku (eastern Gunwinggu) people in remote western Arnhem Land have with the global fine arts market. This book established the foundations for Altman's subsequent research on contemporary hunter-gatherers, and more significantly provided the empirical basis for the later development of economic hybridity theory.

Altman, J.C. and Peterson, N. 1988. 'Rights to game and rights to cash among contemporary Australian hunter-gatherers', in T. Ingold, D. Riches and J. Woodburn (eds), *Hunter and Gatherers – Property, Power and Ideology*, Berg Publishers, Oxford, 75–94, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1988_HunterAndGatherers.pdf>.

Keywords: Property and ownership systems, social relation of subsistence, moral economy, rules and ethics of sharing/meat distribution

Summary: This book chapter by Altman and Peterson examines the question of property and ownership systems with a special focus on the Arnhem Land context. The 13 case studies presented illustrate the complex rules underlying the rights to game and cash, but also the rights to demand-sharing and status and conflicts. The authors shed some light on the distinctions between sharing cash and sharing meat, and discuss sharing avoidance and conflict avoidance strategies.

Altman, J.C. 1992. 'Comment on 'Beyond "The Original Affluent Society": A culturalist reformulation' by N. Bird-David', *Current Anthropology*, 33 (1): 35–6, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1992_CurrentAnthro.pdf>.

Keywords: Subsistence economy, Sahlins, affluence, academic relevance

Summary: This is a comment on Bird-David's critique of Sahlins' 'Original Affluent Society' hypothesis from 1972, an argument which Altman sees as having merit for its time. The major conceptual problem faced by Sahlins, Altman argues was that his measurement of 'affluence' used the notion of labour time, or hours worked. Affluence can also be measured and cross-checked using other criteria, such as dietary intake and social accounts, yet Sahlins ignored the demographic components of groups and the associated extent of work-participation. On the basis of these findings, Altman accepted the 'affluence' proposition, although argued that this affluence was a modern condition, one which was largely underwritten by the financial contributions of the Australian welfare state alongside access to bought food and new technology. Altman further highlights the cultural, historical and political context within which Sahlins was writing, and the contribution of Sahlins' work to debunking deeply ingrained evolutionary perspective on 'hunter-gatherers'. It is the very anthropological culture on which Bird-David's critique of Sahlins' work is generated that Altman sees as being worthy of critique. In the present period, 'hunter-gatherer societies' are either incorporated into the world economy or are under threat from a range of powerful industrial interests.

Altman, J.C. 1993. 'Comment on 'Why hunter-gatherers work: An ancient version of the problem of public goods', by K. Hawkes', *Current Anthropology*, 34 (4): 351–352, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1993_CurrentAnthro.pdf>.

Keywords: Hunter-gatherers economies, property rights, reciprocity models

Summary: To explain hunter-gatherer game sharing practices, Kirsten Hawkes argued for the replacement of the commonly accepted 'reciprocity model' with a 'public-goods model', where medium to large game were regarded as common property. Altman draws on his own data and that of Betty Meehan's to dispute Hawkes' argument on the basis that large game also has

characteristics of private good, that game sharing is a way to minimize risk, and that ecological constraints limit the choice of hunting strategies.

Altman, J.C. and Hinkson, M. 2007. 'Mobility and modernity in Arnhem land: The social universe of Kuninju trucks', *Journal of Material Culture*, 12 (2): 181–203, available at <<http://mcu.sagepub.com/content/12/2/181.full.pdf+html>>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, mobility, Kuninju/Gunwinggu

Summary: The authors describe here, in historical context, the ways in which vehicles mediate Kuninju social processes. They identify the significance of vehicles for Kuninju moving to Maningrida in the 1960s, and then back to their ancestral lands in the 1970s (having collectively bought vehicles for this purpose). As welfare payments are fixed, Kuninju can influence their income level in the customary (harvesting) and market (arts) sectors of the hybrid economy. Trucks thus allow a high degree of mobility between the customary, market and state sectors of the hybrid economy. Such mobility is partially underwritten by the state, but undermines the state project of sedentarisation and mainstreaming. The mobility afforded by vehicles has also facilitated shifting identity and status for Kuninju, as well as self-directed, yet in some ways constrained, livelihood options. The use of vehicles enables large-scale harvest expeditions and distribution of bounty, and in this sense plays a role in reaffirming the strength of customary livelihood practices.

Altman, J.C. 2009. 'Manwurrk (fire drive) at Namilewoho: A land management, hunting and ceremonial event in western Arnhem Land', in J. Russell-Smith, P.J. Whitehead and P. Cooke (eds), *Managing Fire Regimes in North Australia Savannas: Ecology, Culture, Economy*, CSIRO Publishing, Collingwood, 165–80, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2009_ManagingFireRegimes.pdf>.

Keywords: Kuninju/Gunwinggu people, western Arnhem Land, hybrid economy, economic cooperation and productivity, environmental management

Summary: In this chapter Altman revisits a 1980 *Manwurrk*, or fire drive, in which he participated at Namilewoho during his fieldwork in western Arnhem Land with Kuninju people, and reframes this event

in terms of economic hybridity. This *Manwurrk*, which Kuninjkun describe as the last of its kind on the west Arnhem Land escarpment, is examined as an example of economic cooperation and productivity, environmental management, and as a ceremonial occasion, encompassing the three sectors of the hybrid economy model.

Altman, J.C. 2011. 'From Kunnanj (Fish Creek) to Mumeka (Mann River): Hunter-gatherer tradition and transformation in Western Arnhem Land, 1948–2009', in M. Thomas and M. Neale (eds), *Barks, Birds and Billabongs: Exploring the Legacy of the 1948 American-Australian Scientific Expedition to Arnhem Land*, ANU E Press, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Kunnanj-Fish-Creek-Mumeka-Mann-River-Hunter-gatherer-tradition-and-transformation-Western-Arnhem-Lan>>.

Keywords: Hunter-gather economies, 1948 American-Australian Scientific Expedition to Arnhem Land, Momeka/Mumeka, hybrid economy

Summary: This chapter was prepared for the 'Barks, Birds and Billabongs' Conference at the National Museum of Australia in 2009. It recounts research undertaken by McArthur and McCarthy concerning Indigenous people's consumption of naturally-occurring foods and work effort during their 1948 American-Australian Scientific Expedition to Arnhem Land. Altman compares findings of this expedition with his own fieldwork at Mumeka outstation and its surrounds in western Arnhem Land in 1979–80. Over a seasonal cycle, Altman gathered quantitative data from this same region on productive activity in the three sectors of that economy which he then described as being comprised of subsistence/non-market, arts and craft, and social security. The hybrid economy model is used here to sketch the economic continuity and change in this region between 1948–1980, and then from 1980 to the present. Research in the same region in 2002–03, when Altman collaborated with biophysical and social scientists, also shows that the customary economy has remained significant and environmentally sustainable. However it has also declined, in part because of increased activity in the market and state sectors and their intersections. Altman outlines how that the nature of customary engagement has also changed in key ways. These changes consist of hunting large species, the use of guns and vehicles facilitating more short-term hunting on country, and the rise of more formal engagements in natural resource management by community rangers.

2. Economic hybridity and alternate development

Altman, J.C. 1980. 'The Aboriginal economy', in R. Jones (ed.) *Northern Australia: Options and Implications*, Research School of Pacific Studies, ANU, Canberra, 87–107, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1980_NorthernAustralia.pdf>.

Keywords: Economic dependence, economic development, outstations, decentralisation, hybrid economy

Summary: This comprehensive overview of the Indigenous economy in northern Australia charts its transformation from pre-European contact to the present day, outlining options for viable economic development. Altman argues that European encroachment into the north created an economic dependence for Indigenous people on Europeans, and specifically on the government sector. This has led to two types of 'dependence economies' among Indigenous people in the north today. The first is tied to government settlements, missions and European owned pastoral stations where the bulk of employment opportunities in these communities is financed by the government sector. The second dependence economy is embedded in decentralised communities and Indigenous-owned pastoral stations. These movements have involved a retreat from European way of life and a decline in dependence on the government sector, raising people's economic status in the process. This has led to the subsequent regeneration of the Indigenous economy in a modified form. In such environments, Altman argues, Western style economic indicators, notably regarding employment and occupational status, are of little use. With the granting of land rights, the number of decentralised communities will increase rapidly, and Altman stresses that any development strategy for such communities must be appropriate to these non-economic, social subsystems of society.

*Gregory, C.A. and Altman, J.C. 1989. *Observing the Economy. ASA Research Methods in Social Anthropology 3*, Routledge, London.

Keywords: Economic anthropology, ethnography, subsistence economy, ideology of development, Sahlins, affluence

Summary: This book, produced for the Association of Social Anthropologists (UK), is the outcome of collaboration between economic anthropologist Chris Gregory and Altman. The book draws on the research methods used by Gregory and Altman in Papua New Guinea, India and Australia, and seeks to provide both practical and theoretical guidance, particularly for doctoral students undertaking fieldwork. Focusing ethnographically on these countries, Gregory and Altman argue that micro-economic studies of an ethnographic kind are crucial for understanding the nature and causes of wealth and poverty across the globe. Based on the anthropological lineage of economic theory, *Observing the Economy* stresses key research methods crucial to Altman's later research on the Indigenous economy. Of particular note are the cross-cultural implications of 'development' ideology (Altman 1993), and reference to theorists such as Marshall Sahlins, against whom Altman builds his argument that Yolngu people of Northern Arnhem Land maintained an affluent economy prior to European contact (Altman 1979).

Altman, J.C., Bek, H.J. and Roach, L.M. 1995. 'Native title and Indigenous Australian utilisation of wildlife: Policy perspectives', *Discussion Paper No. 95*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1995DP95.php>>.

Keywords: Native title, land and sea rights, economic development, subsistence, customary sector.

Summary: In the early post-Mabo decision context, it was expected that the amount of land and sea available to Indigenous interests would increase. It was assumed that this augmentation would be accompanied by a growth in Indigenous people's access to wildlife resources as well as in their capacity and aspirations to use, manage and protect these resources. However, rights to land and sea do not necessarily mean access to resources, in the same way that the absence of full land ownership does not automatically preclude opportunities to subsistence resources. In this paper, the authors advocate the need for governments to assess the value of Indigenous wildlife usage as an economic option, and the importance, from a policy perspective, of broadening economic development choices for Indigenous Australians. This will allow new possibilities to expand subsistence activities without tying Indigenous people into a production system just based on the availability of wildlife.

***Altman, J.C. 2001. 'Sustainable development options on Aboriginal land: The hybrid economy in the 21st Century', *Discussion Paper No. 226*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/2001DP226.php>>.**

Keywords: Hybrid economy, customary sector, alternative development

Summary: In this paper, Altman makes his first comprehensive articulation of his hybrid economy model. This model is framed as a means for understanding the economic situation on Aboriginal land in remote and regional Australia, as well as inherent challenges of its economic development and the creative possibilities available. Altman argues here for an expanded and hybrid intellectual framework which conceptualises this economy as encompassing three, rather than the conventional two, inter-linked spheres. These are the state, the market, and the customary sectors. The non-monetised customary sphere, generally overlooked in mainstream economics, is described here as being constituted by a diversity of productive activities. These include hunting, gathering, fishing, land and habitat management, species management and biodiversity maintenance. In this analysis, Altman attempts to reframe the development debate by arguing that the crucial question is not how to pursue development solely based on market engagement in remote Aboriginal communities, but rather, how to 'grow' the hybrid economy. This can be done, he insists, by recognising the significant contributions made by Aboriginal people to both regions and the nation as a whole (such as in natural resource and land management). This also requires that existing state responsibilities be met, and that support for the environmental services provided by remote-living Aboriginal people be increased. This paper was presented at *The Power of Knowledge and the Resonance of Tradition* AIATSIS Conference in 2001, and was subsequently published in the conference proceedings in 2005.

Altman, J.C. 2001. 'Aboriginal economy and social process: The Indigenous Hybrid Economy and its Sustainable Development Potential', *Arena Magazine*, 56, 38–39, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/2001_Arena.pdf>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, sustainable development, remote Indigenous communities, Community Development Employment Projects, customary economy

Summary: Economic development, understood here as social process, needs to be adjusted to the circumstances and aspirations of Indigenous communities. In remote and very remote Australia, mainstream market economic opportunities may exist under various forms (such as mining, tourism, art production, land management and commercial fisheries). However, these opportunities remain rare and are often unevenly spatially distributed. In such contexts, local Indigenous economies generally consist in their original articulations of three economic sectors; the market, state – mainly through CDEP and Centrelink payments – and customary sectors. In this article, Altman argues that economic development is occurring in regions where such hybrid economies exist. Yet the question remains as to how the state can be modified to meet these diverse aspirations and sustain such alternate forms of economic development. Through this discussion, Altman underlines the futility of prescriptive market-centric and universalistic approaches towards development, advocating that such developments actually endanger the local and national benefits generated by existing hybrid economies. Any economic development, Altman insists, must recognise both the diversity of Indigenous circumstances and aspirations, and the formal and informal ecological services performed by such people living on country which benefit the nation as a whole.

Altman, J.C. 2002. 'Indigenous hunter-gatherers in the 21st Century: Beyond the limits of universalism in Australian social policy?', in T. Eardley and B. Bradbury (eds), *Competing Visions: Refereed Proceedings of the National Social Policy Conference 2001*, SPRC Report, SPRC, UNSW, Sydney, 35–44. <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2002_CompetingVisions.pdf>.

Keywords: Australians Working Together, welfare reform, mutual obligation principle, outstation, commitment to universalism in Australian social policy, unrecognised and undervalued customary sector, hybrid economy

Summary: In this chapter Altman criticises the universalist notion that welfare support for the able-bodied is a temporary measure tolerated only until the recipient finds a 'proper job'. Such universalism, asserts Altman, ignores the realities of remote communities and outstations, realities which underpin the emergence of creative solutions to economic development, such as the implementation of a Guaranteed Minimum Income for outstation residents. This type of scheme would allow the already productive customary sector

to flourish further, and in such contexts, constant state support would lead to economic development via the customary and market sectors. Altman concludes this argument with recommendations for the development of regional solutions to these extremely complex social and economic issues.

Altman, J.C. and Cochrane, M. 2002. Comment submitted on the Queensland Government's Wildlife Management Review, *Topical Issue No. 4/2002*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/topical/wildlifealtcoch.pdf>>.

Keywords: Customary sector, wildlife harvesting, Queensland

Summary: This submission by Altman and Cochrane critiques the Queensland Government's Wildlife Management Review Discussion Paper for being driven by the view that the use of wildlife is inherently risky and costly in terms of biodiversity loss and control. The authors argue that the Review is too focused on processes and fails to consult a wide range of stakeholders outside those who interact more directly with wildlife enforcement officers. It does not examine approaches adopted by other states, nor the role of Indigenous institutions or community rangers programs to guide innovative approaches to the management of wildlife. Furthermore, the authors continue, the Review made no reference to Indigenous interests in wildlife harvesting for both commercial and customary use as an avenue for improving often marginal economic circumstances. Nor does it examine how commercial uses of wildlife can be undertaken in a sustainable manner and provide economic benefits to the community without adversely affecting the populations of harvested species. The general conclusion of the authors is that the Review is unlikely to have a positive impact on conservation in Queensland.

Altman, J.C. 2004. 'Economic development and Indigenous Australia: Contestations over property, institutions and ideology', *The Australian Journal of Agricultural and Resource Economics*, 48 (3): 513–34, available at <<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1467-8489.2004.00253.x/pdf>>.

Keywords: Resource Economics Society, Indigenous economic development, hybrid economy

Summary: This article is a response in part to Ron Duncan's presidential address at the 2003 Australian Agricultural and Resource Economics Society annual conference. It is primarily addressed at resource economists, whom Altman encourages to shift in their thinking towards Indigenous development issues. Altman urges that resource economists take into account the three sectors of market, state and customary, all of which constitute the Indigenous economy in remote Australia. In particular, he encourages economists to participate in quantifying the benefits and positive externalities generated by this hybrid economy in order to kindle greater support from the state. Altman further advocates the need for creative and innovative solutions to the complex economic development issues faced by remote Indigenous communities; what Ron Duncan has called Indigenous underdevelopment. He suggests that when the customary sector is taken into account, circumstances do not appear as underdeveloped as they do according to official statistics. In the Native Title era, there is an increased recognition of Indigenous property in customary resources and greater leverage to negotiate with developers. Indigenous communities are likely to also increase their participation in both the customary sector (which might be enhanced through negotiated compensations and revenues from mining) as well as the market sector. In this context, resource economists are further invited to assist in redesigning and strengthening state and Indigenous institutions. Altman urges economists to reduce their focus on market opportunities and perhaps comment on the political economy of resource distribution.

Altman, J.C. 2004. 'Economic development and participation for remote Indigenous communities', *Topical Issue No. 04/2004*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2004TI4.php>>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, customary sector

Summary: Altman was invited to present a version of this Topical Issue to the Ministerial Council for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs in 2003. Here, the author highlights the diversity of circumstances in remote and regional Australia where hybrid economies dominate. Altman argues that the narrative of remote economies being in crisis, as promulgated by official statistics, is overstated, given that official conceptualisations of such economies ignore the customary sector. The Indigenous arts sector and community-based ranger programs are used here to demonstrate the extent to which the

customary sector, and the diverse benefits it creates, figures prominently in remote and regional communities.

Altman recommends that the contribution of Indigenous people in the hybrid economy be acknowledged, as well as the likelihood that many Indigenous aspirations in such remote regions will gravitate towards this livelihood form. He further considers the intrinsic barriers to expanding the hybrid economy, such as those associated with gun and fishing regulation and property rights, funding, and infrastructure shortfalls. Any chance of statistical equality and welfare reduction will require an honest discourse about Indigenous development which recognises the general absence of market in some settings, and which acknowledges the complex factors preventing economic independence. Finally, the hybrid economy model could be applied in more settled regions of Australia, even in metropolitan contexts, with appropriate adjustments.

Altman, J.C. 2004. 'Promoting Aboriginal economic interests in natural resource management in NSW: Perspectives from tropical North Australia and some prospects, Topical Issue No. 06/2004, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2004TI6.php>>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, Arnhem Land, New South Wales, Kuninjku/Gunwinggu, Cultural and Natural Resource Management

Summary: This Topical Issue is adapted from a paper presented at the symposium 'Relationships between Aboriginal people and land management issues in NSW: Barriers and bridges to successful partnerships' in October 2003 at the University of Wollongong. It draws on the Kuninjku example to describe the customary economy as it is situated within the 'Caring for Country' movement in northern Australia. Altman suggests here that Aboriginal people's living on country and customary economic engagement is highly compatible with, and even essential for, general conservation and biodiversity management goals. The customary economy is implicated in global processes while also generating local, regional and national benefits which remain substantially unrecognised. Altman further compares the hybrid economy in the north with NSW, showing the existence of greater private sector employment and small business opportunities in the latter. He finds the customary sector in NSW to be smaller and more oriented towards establishing and maintaining cultural connections, particularly through heritage protection and via co-managed national parks in NSW.

Wildlife harvesting and cultural and natural resource management, on the other hand, are more common in the north.

Altman, J.C. 2005. 'Development options on Aboriginal land: Sustainable Indigenous hybrid economies in the twenty-first century', in L. Taylor, G. Ward, G. Henderson, R. Davis and L. Wallis (eds), *The Power of Knowledge, the Resonance of Tradition*, Aboriginal Studies Press, Canberra, 34–48, available at <http://www.anu.edu.au/caepr-dev/sites/default/files/StaffProfiles/stafffiles/jon-altman//2005_PowerOfKnowledge.pdf>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, 'real' and 'unreal' economy, customary sector

Summary: This chapter builds on Altman's 2001 Discussion Paper 'Sustainable development options on Aboriginal land: The hybrid economy in the 21st century' (see p.14). The 'real' (market) and 'unreal' (welfare) economic binary is argued here as being an oversimplification in which the significant and often robust customary (or non-market) sector is disregarded. Altman cites Yang's concept of economic hybridity and Gibson-Graham's community economy as approaches related to his own. The hybrid economy is here presented as being intercultural and dependent on community-based organisations and brokers. Its key features include its ability to accommodate and facilitate Indigenous norms of mobility (i.e. people move between the different sectors); the variability in size, depending on location, of each sector; and little material accumulation, long-term saving and investment from the perspective of dominant market-based economic thinking. The relationship between 'culture' and 'economy', Altman argues, can be recast by repositioning the customary sector as a key component of the contemporary economy.

Altman, J.C. and Hunter, B. 2005. 'Economic life', in B. Arthur and F. Morphy (eds), *Macquarie Atlas of Indigenous Australia: Culture and Society Through Space and Time*, The Macquarie Library Pty Ltd., Sydney, 182–93, available at <http://www.anu.edu.au/caepr-dev/sites/default/files/StaffProfiles/stafffiles/jon-altman//2005_MacAtlas_Economic.pdf>.

Keywords: Alternative economic development, customary sector, CDEP, Djelk Community Rangers Program, Maningrida

Summary: In this synoptic chapter, Altman and Hunter argue that the dominant definition of development (in the Western context) as the market value of production, results in an overlooking of the customary sector and social dimensions of the economy such as patterns of consumption and distribution. In the customary sector, 'economic' and 'cultural' values converge (if indeed they are ever separate), and the Djelk Community Ranger Program, based in Maningrida, is an example of this work. The authors note that customary economic activity is particularly significant in areas where the market sector is small or barely exists, and further outline the compatibility of CDEP with hunting and gathering and the capacity to meet cultural obligations. They conclude that there is locational variation with regard to the size of the market and customary sectors for Aboriginal people, with the market dominating in metropolitan Australia and the state and customary sectors being paramount in remote areas.

Altman, J.C. and Cochrane, M. 2005. 'Sustainable development in the Indigenous-owned savanna: Innovative institutional design for cooperative wildlife management', *Wildlife Research*, 32: 473–80

Keywords: Economic development, wildlife harvesting and management, Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation

Summary: Land rights and native title rights have led to a significant and progressive increase in Indigenous land holdings. These rights comprise non-commercial customary harvesting rights for Indigenous land owners, and are recognised as high priority areas for conservations. However, as the authors point out, land ownership that is disconnected from commercial rights in valuable resources actually hinders Indigenous owners' economic development. In 1999, the *Yanner v Eaton* High Court judgement found that Indigenous customary rights in wildlife prevail. In this article, Altman and Cochrane argue that for many Indigenous people, especially those living in remote locations, sustainable economic development is interrelated with wildlife harvesting and management. Yet because of challenges posed by new ecological circumstances (such as the introduction of feral animals and exotic weeds, or modified fire regimes), sustainable harvesting and wildlife management requires a high level of cooperation between Indigenous harvesters of wildlife and biological and social scientists. While institutions facilitating such harvesting and collaboration already exist, there is a need for further institutional innovation and purpose-built design. This requires the development of hybrid

institutions and approaches to sustainability in the context of Indigenous hybrid economies. In this paper, the case-study of Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation (BAC) provides empirical evidence of such institutional hybridity. The authors conclude that policy rhetoric about sustainable development futures for remote Indigenous communities needs to be matched by specific commitments from the state. Such commitments must include decentralised cooperative management regimes and explore ways to divest commercial rights in wildlife to Indigenous interests.

A similar version of this paper has been published under Altman, J.C. and Cochrane, M. 2003. 'Innovative institutional design for sustainable wildlife management in the Indigenous-owned savanna', *Discussion Paper No. 247*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/2003DP247.php>>.

Altman, J.C. 2005. 'Economic futures on Aboriginal land in remote and very remote Australia: Hybrid economies and joint ventures', in D. Austin-Broos and G. Macdonald (eds), *Culture, Economy and Governance in Aboriginal Australia*, University of Sydney Press, Sydney, 111–134, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2005_CultureEconomy.pdf>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation, customary sector

Summary: The hybrid economy is presented here as being both intercultural and highly reliant on community-based organisations. Many such organisations, like the Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation (BAC), are 'joint ventures', being Aboriginal-controlled, state supported, and often white-managed. In this chapter, Altman describes the particularities of the development context in remote Indigenous Australia. This includes the different forms of land ownership, the existence of small populations which are geographically and culturally isolated from the market, and the late arrival of colonialism in some areas of Arnhem Land and Central Australia. These characteristics mean that customary systems and practices remain strong, and that development policies for remote Australia based on the two-sector economic model will fail. Altman concludes that the hybrid economy is the real economy for Indigenous people in remote and very remote Australia, outlining the dominant relations of production and distribution in each of its three sectors.

Altman, J.C. 2005, The governance of outstations in the Maningrida region, north-central Arnhem Land, and the challenges posed by the new arrangements, *ICGP Occasional Paper No. 11*, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/others/governance/Occasional-papers11-1190988000.php>>.

Keywords: Outstations, Outstation Resource Agency, Maningrida, Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation governance, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: As part of the Indigenous Community Governance Project (ICGP), this paper examines how western (corporate) and customary (kin-based) forms of governance are balanced in the operations of the Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation (BAC), a successful Outstation Resource Agency (ORA). Altman argues that over its 26 years of existence, BAC has effectively addressed numerous management issues and adjusted its functioning to meet multiple challenges. At the time this paper was written, new arrangements based on a Commonwealth and NT joined-up approach, termed by Altman as 'metropolitan managerialism', were posing new risks for the organisation. Altman concludes by arguing that the metropolitan management approaches adopted by the national government have generated interferences which will likely undermine the capacity and legitimacy of resource organisations, and which risk impacting negatively on the management of outstations.

Altman, J.C. and Biddle, N. 2005. 'Conceptual overview: Economic and social development in Indigenous Australia', in K. Landvogt (ed), *Microcredit: More than Just Small Change*, Conference Proceedings, Melbourne, Good Shepherd Youth and Family Services, Melbourne, 50–57, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2005_Microcredit.pdf>.

Keywords: Microfinance, locational disadvantage, socioeconomic development

Summary: This paper examines circumstances in which Australian Indigenous socioeconomic development could be slightly improved through enhanced access to microfinance. Altman and Biddle warn that while such developments might generate some positive outcomes, microcredit, microfinance, or greater access to banking and financial services alone are no panacea to the social and economic disadvantages experienced by Indigenous

Australians. This is especially the case for people living in remote or very remote contexts where, other factors aside, development opportunities are unlikely to ever match those of mainstream metropolitan Australia.

Altman, J.C. 2005. 'Bringing it all together: Key implications for research and policy', in T. Lea and B. Wilson (eds), *The State of the North*, Charles Darwin University Press, Darwin, 125–130, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2005_TheState.pdf>.

Keywords: Intercultural collaborations, environmental management, economic development, sustainable future

Summary: In his concluding note to the symposium *The State of the North*, Altman discusses the past and possible futures of Northern Territory. In this process he underlines the importance of Indigenous cultures and intercultural collaboration in the areas of both environmental management and economic development, particularly in the NT context. Drawing on his 25 year research relationship with the territory, Altman argues that the NT must recognise the value of its particular diversity and hybridity. In this process, it will need to shift from a market economy and economic growth mentality to embracing a national and international leadership role. This must be one which is founded on sustainability principles and is supportive of its rich, diverse and robust Indigenous cultures.

Altman, J.C. and Morrison, J. 2006. 'Enhancing economic independence', *Journal of Indigenous Policy*, 5: 48–53, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2006_JofIndigenousPolicy.pdf>.

Keywords: Natural Resource Management, Indigenous labour market, Community Development Employment Projects, reconciliation, economic opportunities, hybrid economy

Keywords: This article provides insights into how economic independence for Indigenous Australians might be enhanced. It reflects the growing recognition that Indigenous people need a greater share of the national economy both to improve their economic independence as well as for national benefit. The authors present 11 issues concerning opportunities for Indigenous economic development, based on the wider recognition that economic integration can sit

alongside distinctive belief and value systems and practices. These issues address the narrow definition of 'economic independence', the limits of state aid, and the need to recognise the public good that is generated through Indigenous natural resource management while also providing greater and recurrent funding for such knowledge-based projects. Further attention is directed towards areas such as the recognition of Indigenous property rights in commercially valuable assets like water, fisheries and minerals, rather than land rights alone, in order to deliver development and independence.

A version of this paper was published as Altman, J.C. and Morrison, J. 2005. 'Enhancing economic independence in Reconciliation Australia', National Reconciliation Planning Workshop: Discussion Papers, Reconciliation Australia, Canberra, 34–37, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2005_NationalReconciliation.pdf>.

Altman, J.C., Buchanan, G. and Biddle, N. 2006. 'Measuring the "real" Indigenous economy in remote Australia using NATSISS 2002', *Australian Journal of Labour Economics*, 9 (1): 17–31, available at <<http://search.informit.com.au/fullText;dn=200612745;res=APAFT>>.

Keywords: National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Social Survey, customary sector, hybrid economy, Canadian Aboriginal Peoples Survey

Summary: This article represents one approach to 'Indigenise' the economy by including the frequently ignored non-market customary sector. The authors examine the questions, results and limitations of the 2002 NATSISS and make recommendations for the 2008 NATSISS regarding data on hunting, fishing and gathering activities. The 2001 Canadian Aboriginal Peoples Survey is discussed as a guide to collecting data on hunting, fishing and gathering as economically and culturally significant activities (i.e. as activities that occupy several overlapping sectors of the hybrid economy). Overlooking such contributions of Indigenous Australians in the customary sector of the hybrid economy, the NATSISS reinforces a notion of development that may undermine Indigenous people's world-views, practices, wellbeing and aspirations.

A similar version is published as Altman, J.C., Buchanan, G. and Biddle, N. 2006. 'The real "real" economy in remote Australia', in B. Hunter (ed.), *Recent Evidence on Indigenous Socioeconomic Outcomes: A focus on the 2002 NATSISS*, ANU E Press, Canberra, 139–152,

available at <http://epress.anu.edu.au/caepr_series/no_26/mobile_devices/ch12.html>.

Altman, J.C. 2006. 'The Indigenous hybrid economy: A realistic sustainable option for remote communities?' *Topical Issue No. 02/2006*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2006TI2.php>>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, community-based development, Caring for Country ranger programs.

Summary: This paper was presented to the Fabian Society in Melbourne in late 2005, outlining the hybrid economy in the context of development debates. Examples of Aboriginal art and wildlife harvesting/natural resource management are used here to argue that in remote Aboriginal Australia, customary activity is both contemporary and integrated into the modern capitalist economy. Altman concludes by calling for community-based approaches to development which support the inter-sectoral linkages of the hybrid economy, such as the existing community-controlled art production and Caring for Country ranger programs, with a view to 'growing' all sectors of the economy: market, customary and state.

Altman, J.C. 2006. 'Land tenure, land management and Indigenous economic development', in R. Hill, K. Golson, P. Lowe, M. Mann, S. Hayes and J. Blackwood (eds), *Kimberley Appropriate Economies Roundtable Forum Proceedings*, Australian Conservation Foundation, Cairns, 124–26, available at <http://www.acfonline.org.au/uploads/res/res_kimberleyfinal.pdf>.

Keywords: Land rights, native title, hybrid economy, Community Development Employment Projects, Natural Resource Management, livelihoods

Summary: Drawing on the 2002 NATSISS Survey, Altman demonstrates here the significant reach of customary activities among Indigenous people in the north. This, he argues, is a positive aspect to land rights and native title, and one which is largely ignored in public debates about Aboriginal economic development. Such debates tend to present the communal ownership dimension of native titles and land rights as an impediment to land management and Indigenous economic interests and development. In this short paper, Altman highlights the cultural, conservation and economic value of Indigenous

land ownership, and an economic rationale which combines customary activities, involvement in CDEP, and various degrees of involvement in paid employment within the private or public sector (hybrid economy). Various land rights and native titles, he continues, can be beneficial for both Indigenous and non-Indigenous Australians and are compatible with land management and economic development. However, ensuring economic equality for Indigenous people, as well as the sustainability of the benefit associated with formal and informal Indigenous land management practices, will require a new way of thinking about Indigenous livelihoods. Enhanced financial resources will also be needed to enable these activities to continue.

Altman's paper in this publication is followed by Patrick Sullivan's discussion of employment in Kimberley hybrid economies, in which Sullivan employs Altman's hybrid economy diagram and analytical framework.

Altman, J.C., Buchanan, G. and Larsen, L. 2007. 'The environmental significance of the Indigenous estate: Natural resource management as economic development in remote Australia', *Discussion Paper No. 286*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/2007DP286.php>>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, payment for environmental services, Community Development Employment Projects, Indigenous estate

Summary: This paper addresses a significant gap in the literature regarding the biodiversity and environmental values of Indigenous land holdings. It overlays a conservatively-sized estimate of the Indigenous estate onto several resource atlas maps such as those depicting bioregions, environmental threats, and degrees of land and river disturbance. The false binaries of modern/traditional that are implicated in Native Title in Australia are described as misleading and obscuring of the intercultural reality of Australian Indigenous people's economic lives, or the 'third way', which includes the hybrid economy. Payment for environmental services (PES) on the Indigenous estate is cited as an opportunity for activity across all sectors of the hybrid economy, as well as being a means of strengthening the linkages between customary, state and market sectors. Through this lens, the authors continue, the success of Indigenous ranger programs is striking and significant. These ranger groups often provide a base for various economic initiatives in the hybrid economy, such as small-scale wildlife-based enterprises. This success is all the more

noteworthy as it has been achieved without adequate funding, and the authors argue that the CDEP scheme is a key factor in the provision of base-level wages for rangers in Indigenous Protected Areas. While this paper does not include a diagram of the hybrid economy, it provides a similar diagram of the relationship between the Indigenous estate and the conservation estate. This, along with the aforementioned maps, provides a strong visual representation of the extent and significance of the Indigenous estate.

Altman, J.C. and Jordan, K. 2008. Submission to the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs Inquiry into Developing Indigenous Enterprises, *Topical Issue No. 11/2008*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2008TI11.php>>.

Keywords: Indigenous enterprises, natural resource management, climate change, hybrid economy, customary sector

Summary: This submission to the Inquiry into developing Indigenous enterprises focuses on two of the Inquiry's terms of reference which seek to identify areas of Indigenous commercial advantage and strengths. Firstly, emerging industries on the remote Indigenous estate that could provide opportunity for Indigenous enterprise are highlighted, notably in provision of environmental services to generate carbon and biodiversity credits. The submission recommends that the Committee pay particular attention to emerging natural resource management opportunities and options to support such initiatives. Sustenance for these activities is pressing, not only in the face of continued Indigenous economic disadvantage, but also in light of the ongoing threat to biodiversity and the critical need to respond to climate change. Secondly, the submission outlines criticisms of applying a mainstream economic model onto Indigenous economic development models due to the dominant hybrid economy in such regions. Alternatively, three examples of successful and durable inter-dependent models are provided.

Altman, J.C., assisted by Branchut, V. 2008. 'Fresh water in the Maningrida region's hybrid economy: Intercultural contestation over values and property rights', *Working Paper No. 46*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/WP/2008WP46.php>>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, contestation over water, property rights in water, water management, Maningrida, Djelk Rangers, Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation

Summary: This paper traces the complex political economy of water in Maningrida from an historical perspective, provides an analysis of water in the regional hybrid economy, and examines water governance in Maningrida and the hinterland region. It culminates in a review of cross-cultural contestation over water values and property rights, and of measures taken to address such tensions. The authors note that the Maningrida hybrid economy is unusual for the strength of its customary sector, particularly at outstations, though this is variable within the region and over time.

The hybrid economy model was developed predominantly to challenge the conventional notion that economies have public and private sectors only. However the model can also be used to problematise the consumptive/productive and non-consumptive/unproductive dichotomy. This paper looks at the role of the Djelk Rangers in water management at outstations in the region, and canvasses two options for developing the regional economy : by expanding each sector of the hybrid economy, or by altering the combination of sectoral activity with the expansion of private and public activity driven by policy. Altman employs the hybrid economy model here to observe the spatial and sectoral inter-linkages in water management in the region. Access to water free of charge in Maningrida, he argues, is key to economic ventures, and this includes the commercial activities undertaken by Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation (BAC). The paper calls for more clarity and transparency in water governance and proposes that full property rights to water, as well as to land, for Indigenous Australians in Arnhem Land be recognised as a means for regional development.

Altman, J.C. 2008. 'Different governance for difference: The Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation', in J. Hunt, D.E. Smith, S. Garling, and W. Sanders (eds), *Contested Governance: Culture, Power and Institutions in Indigenous Australia*, CAEPR Research Monograph No. 29, ANU E Press, Canberra, 177–203, available at <http://eprss.anu.edu.au/caepr_series/no_29/pdf/ch07.pdf>.

Keywords: Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation , Northern Territory Emergency Response, Maningrida

Summary: This chapter charts the organisational history of the Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation (BAC), an outstation resource agency based in Maningrida, north-central Arnhem Land, from its establishment in 1979 until late 2007. BAC is a dynamic organisation with a frequently changing all-Aboriginal executive and a non-Indigenous senior management with low turn-over. The Northern Territory Emergency Response has created new challenges for BAC. Altman argues that one key dimension of BAC's success is its ability to navigate tensions between market-based and kin-based forms of governance and accountability. However, continuing this success depends, to some degree, on the state's willingness to tolerate difference. BAC's governance is intercultural and hybrid; indeed, the organisation has actively adopted the hybrid economy model, which accords with its sense of appropriate development for its members and provides a platform for political advocacy.

Altman, J.C. 2009. 'The hybrid economy and anthropological engagements with policy discourse: A brief reflection', *The Australian Journal of Anthropology*, 20 (3): 318–29, available at <<http://search.informit.com.au/fullText;dn=201001507;res=APAFT>>.

Keywords: Economic anthropology, local economies, Kuninjku/Gunwinggu people, hybrid economy, Northern Territory Emergency Response

Summary: Altman developed this article from a presentation delivered at the Australian Anthropological Society Plenary Panel Session 'The economic in contemporary anthropology' in 2007. Kuninjku people tend to conceptualise their productive economic activities as occurring in three discrete spheres (market, state and customary), whereas Altman is interested in the overlap of the sectors of the hybrid economy. The Northern Territory Emergency Response, Altman argues, revealed tensions in the extent and form of state involvement

in remote Indigenous Australia. The 'real economy' framework, he continues, overlooks the structural limitations of mainstream employment in such regions and the interdependencies between all sectors of the hybrid economy. Altman describes the hybrid economy discourse as subordinate, yet also as being influential in certain spheres. He insists that economic anthropology needs to understand changing intercultural hybrid economies in the current climate, and must engage in the political processes which effect local economies.

Altman, J.C., Biddle, N., Buchanan, G., Ens, E., Jordan, K., Kerins, S. and May, K. 2009. 'Indigenous interests in land and water', in P. Stone (ed), *Northern Australia Land and Water Science Review 2009 Chapter Summaries*, Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development and Local Government, Canberra, 20–21, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2009_Chapter%2007_IndigenousInterestsInLandAndWater.pdf>.

Keywords: Northern Australia Land and Water Science Review 2009, water rights

Summary: This is a contribution to the Northern Australia Land and Water Science Review 2009, commissioned by the Northern Australia Land and Water Taskforce. The authors emphasise that access to, and use of fresh and salt water and its associated resources are vital to the Indigenous tradition-based economy. This access underlines the need to recognise and support Indigenous commercial and non-commercial interests in water and water planning. They stress that Indigenous rights to water can improve the socioeconomic situation of Indigenous people. Such rights must accommodate the diversity of Indigenous economic activities and support Indigenous people to exercise real and decisive influence on decision-making.

Altman, J.C. 2009. 'Benefit-sharing is no solution to development: Experiences from mining on Aboriginal land in Australia', in R. Wynberg, D. Shroeder, and R. Chenells (eds), *Indigenous Peoples, Consent and Benefit-Sharing: Lessons from the San-Hoodia Case*, Springer, Berlin, 285–302, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2009_San-Hoodia.pdf>.

Keywords: Economic development, benefit-sharing agreements

Summary: In this chapter, directed at an international audience, Altman explores some of the fundamental tensions that arise when the interests of Indigenous minorities in commercially valuable resources are belatedly recognised in post-colonial circumstances. Altman argues that benefit-sharing agreements, which emerged from the leverage gained through land rights and native title laws, often generate development outcomes that are disappointing for all parties. This occurs when such agreements are not a product of Aboriginal groups being empowered to take control of such agreements or to tailor such agreements and their implementation to their own particular needs and aspirations.

Altman, J.C. 2009. 'Contestations over development', in J.C. Altman and D. Martin (eds), *Power, Culture, Economy: Indigenous Australians and Mining*, CAEPR Research Monograph No. 30, ANU E Press, Canberra, 1–15, available at <http://epress.anu.edu.au/caepr_series/no_30/pdf/ch01.pdf>.

Keywords: Mining, hybrid economy, interculturality, Ranger Uranium Mine, Yandicoogina Mine, Century Mine

Summary: This chapter is based on an Australian Research Council (ARC) Linkage Project between CAEPR, Rio Tinto and the Committee for Economic Development of Australia (CEDA) between 2002 and 2007. Research findings from this project concentrate on three case studies: the Ranger Uranium Mine in the NT, the Yandicoogina Mine in WA, and the Century Mine in north Queensland. Altman questions whether large, long-life extractive mines on Aboriginal land can change the marginal socioeconomic status of Indigenous Australians in a sustainable and significant way. More generally, he analyses the triangular relations between the state, the mining sector and Indigenous people. With the three sectors of the hybrid economy being highly interdependent, none exists in a 'pure form' isolated from the others. An adherence to the notion that Indigenous Australians are either 'traditional' or 'modern' lies at the heart of the troubled relationship between the state and mining companies on one side, and with Indigenous traditional owners of land on the other. This question is approached from the perspectives of economic hybridity, interculturality, and the complexity and politics of 'authenticity' and 'recognition' (in Native Title and Land Rights processes). The hybrid economy model is used to explain these articulations, a model which Altman insists should be considered as a significant development option for remote-living Indigenous people.

Altman, J.C., Biddle, N. and Jordan, K. 2009. 'Climate change impacts on livelihoods', in D. Green, S. Jackson and J. Morrison (eds), *Risks from Climate Change to Indigenous Communities in the Tropical North of Australia*, Department of Climate Change, Canberra, 66–75, available at <<http://web.science.unsw.edu.au/~donnag/Risks%20from%20Climate%20Change%20to%20Indigenous%20%20Communities%20in%20the%20Tropical%20North%20of%20Australia.pdf>>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, climate change, adaptability, resilience

Summary: The hybrid economy is highly reliant on natural resources and could be dramatically affected by climate change. Yet climate change also represents new opportunities for this specific economy, particularly in terms of activities and industries targeting a reduction in greenhouse gas emissions. The authors here describe the diversity, adaptability and resilience of the hybrid economy as its very strengths, with customary production being a critical part of meeting people's everyday needs. The lack of direct incentives, and the presence of disincentives for Indigenous people to manage their lands with a view to carbon sequestration, are further considered.

Altman, J.C. and Jordan, K. (in consultation with Munro, I., Ryan, M. and Mirikul, M.) 2009. 'Maningrida region, Arnhem land, Northern Territory', in D. Green, S. Jackson and J. Morrison (eds), *Risks from Climate Change to Indigenous Communities in the Tropical North of Australia*, Department of Climate Change, Canberra, 99–106, available at <<http://web.science.unsw.edu.au/~donnag/Risks%20from%20Climate%20Change%20to%20Indigenous%20%20Communities%20in%20the%20Tropical%20North%20of%20Australia.pdf>>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, climate change, water resources, adaptability, resilience, Maningrida

Summary: The hybrid economy in the Maningrida region exists both in the township and at outstations, with most Aboriginal residents making their livelihoods by engaging in economic activity across two or more of its sectors. The 2006 Cyclone Monica revealed potential direct and indirect impacts that such severe weather events could have on Indigenous communities. It also highlighted the

remarkable ability of the residents to cope with and adapt to such circumstances.

Altman, J.C., Jordan, K., Kerins, S., Buchanan, G., Biddle, N., Ens, E.J. and May, K. 2009. 'Indigenous interests in land and water', in Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO) *Northern Australia Land and Water Science Review 2009: Full Report*, Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development and Local Government, CSIRO, Canberra, Chapter 7, available at <http://www.nalwt.gov.au/files/Chapter_07Indigenous_interests_in_land_and_water.pdf>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, Natural Resource Management

Summary: Through a review of the literature, the authors find that many Indigenous people in northern Australia achieve their livelihood through a mixture of customary activity (non-monetised and based on cultural continuities), and state-supported market exchange. Water is significant to this process, both for customary and commercial economic engagement. This includes the customary harvest of wildlife and floral species, agricultural and pastoral operations, commercial art sales, nature and cultural tourism, safari/conservation hunting, plant propagation, commercial wildlife and bush food ventures, and land and sea management. As this hybrid economy depends on natural resources, the livelihoods of Indigenous people may be put at risk by the expansion or development of competing water-reliant industries in northern Australia, as well as by the ongoing effects of climate change. The authors argue that the hybrid economy model reflects the complexity of the Indigenous economy and is a useful framework for future sustainable economic development.

Buchanan, G., Altman, J.C., Arthur, B., Oades, D. and the Bardi Jawi Rangers. 2009. “‘Always Part of us’: The Socioeconomics of Indigenous Customary Use and Management of Dugong and Marine Turtles—a View from Bardi and Jawi sea Country, Western Australia’, *NAILSMA Knowledge Series 001/2009*, Research Report, NAILSMA, Darwin, available at <<http://nailsma.org.au/hub/resources/publication/always-part-us-socioeconomics-indigenous-customary-use-and-management>>.

Keywords: Bardi Jawi Rangers, West Kimberley region, Dugong and turtle hunting and management, hybrid economy, sustainable livelihood, North Australian Indigenous Land and Sea Management Alliance

Summary: The Northern Australian Indigenous Land and Sea Management Alliance (NAILSMA) commissioned this report as part of its Dugong and Marine Turtle Project. The report describes the situation in northern Australia, with a detailed case study resulting from collaborative research between the Bardi Jawi Rangers in the west Kimberley region and CAEPR staff. This consisted of a survey of harvest activities and a survey of management activities over a 12 month period between 2007–2008. The authors argue that mainstream statistical measures do not take into account the activities, values and benefits of the customary sector, including marine turtle and dugong harvest and management. These practices occur within the context of a hybrid economy, where livelihoods are made at the intersections of the customary, market and state sectors. Buchanan *et al.* suggest that opportunities for hybrid solutions which combine Indigenous and Western forms of knowledge and expertise on sustainability, as well as economic and social value and viability in wildlife management, are apparent in this project.

Altman, J.C. and May, K. 2010. ‘Poverty alleviation in remote Indigenous Australia’, in G. Minnerup, and P. Solberg (eds), *First World, First Nations: Internal Colonialism and Indigenous Self-Determination in Northern Europe and Australia*, Sussex Academic Press, Eastbourne, UK, 149–167, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2010_FirstWorldFirstNations_AltmanAndMay.pdf>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, post-colonial adaptation, National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Social Survey data, customary sector, mainstreaming, outstations, remote Australia

Summary: The hybrid economy is discussed here as an example of post-colonial adaptation. Unlike in comparable ‘Third World’ settings, the state is both directly and indirectly central in supporting customary and market activity in remote Aboriginal Australia. Analysis of data from the 2002 NATSISS, which suggests that the customary sector is robust throughout remote Aboriginal Australia, is used to address the concern that the hybrid economy may be limited to certain geographical areas. The authors critique the mainstreaming approach evident in current policy towards Aboriginal people, particularly with regards to homelands or outstations, for overlooking the comparative advantage that remote-living Aboriginal people have in the customary sector. They suggest that such an approach will not achieve poverty reduction and could unintentionally have the opposite effect.

Altman, J.C. 2011. ‘Alleviating poverty in remote Indigenous Australia: The hybrid economy’, in G. Argyrous and F. Stillwell (eds) *Readings in Political Economy: Economics as a Social Science*, 3rd edn, Tilde University Press, Prahran, Victoria, 330–336.

Keywords: Cultural and Natural Resource Management, hybrid economy, customary sector

Summary: This paper exemplifies a ‘livelihoods approach’, with the hybrid economy at its core, in contradistinction to a ‘mainstreaming’ agenda of Indigenous poverty alleviation. Altman outlines the ‘poverty traps’ facing Indigenous people in Australia, such as extremely high effective marginal tax rates, and compares the situation of Indigenous Australians to ‘Third World’ situations, notably in the Pacific. He finds that while there are many similarities across these regional case-studies, the central role of the state in supporting customary and market activity for remote Indigenous Australians is distinctive. Emphasis is placed on the key role of the customary sector in addressing Indigenous poverty in Australia, and particularly on the opportunities and benefits derived from Indigenous natural resource management.

This is an updated version of Altman, J.C. 2007. ‘Alleviating poverty in remote Indigenous Australia: The role of the hybrid economy’, *Addressing Poverty: Alternative Economic Approaches*, *Development Bulletin*, No. 72, March: 47–51, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/system/files/Publications/topical/Altman_Poverty.pdf>, also available as *Topical Issue No. 10/2007*, CAEPR,

ANU, Canberra <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2007TI10.php>>.

Altman, J. C. 2011. 'Alternate Development for Indigenous Territories of Difference', *Topical Issue No. 5/2011*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2011TI5.php>>.

Keywords: Alternate development, Indigenous estate

Summary: In this article, Altman probes possible prospects for re-envisioning the immense Indigenous estate as 'territories of difference', with alternate development that is based not only on production, mineral extraction and commercial agriculture, but also on self-provisioning, tourism, the arts, and environmental services. These avenues are discussed in light of the sound environmental condition and value of the Indigenous estate, as well as the continuing development and land pressure and projected impacts of climate change across Australia. Such developments, Altman argues, are already underway, though often in spite of state efforts and owing to state enabling.

Altman, J.C. 2011. 'Wild rivers and Indigenous economic development In Queensland', *Topical Issue 6/2011*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2011TI6.php>>.

Keywords: Wild rivers Bill, property rights, Indigenous economic development, Queensland

Summary: This Topical Issue paper underlines the need to revisit two major public policy issues associated with the Wild Rivers (Environmental Management) Bill 2010. These concern the value of native title and land rights property, and the extent to which these property rights can be utilised or leveraged to ensure beneficial development outcomes for Aboriginal people holding land interests. Altman focuses on the interlinked issues of property rights, Indigenous economic development, empirical evidence on development options, and practical implementation considerations to argue that the Wild Rivers Bill should be supported and extended to all parts of Australia. The Bill looks to empower Aboriginal land owners with an unprecedented form of property as a special measure for their advancement and protection.

Altman argues that considerable effort should be invested in unpacking the diverse meanings of 'Indigenous

economic development'. This is important in light of the high priority placed on garnering the perspectives of Indigenous people, who are frequently treated by political and bureaucratic processes as passive subjects of the state project of improvement. The Wild Rivers Bill also highlights important issues pertaining to the value of Aboriginal land ownership if unaccompanied by effective property rights to allow choice about the form that development might take.

This Topical Issue is a version of Altman, J.C. 2011. Submission to the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Economics Inquiry into Indigenous economic development in Queensland and review of the *Wild Rivers* (Environmental Management) Bill 2010. See also Altman, J.C. 2011. Submission to the Senate Standing Committee on Legal and Constitutional Affairs (Legislation Committee) Inquiry into the *Wild Rivers* (Environmental Management) Bill 2011.

Altman, J.C. 2011. 'The Draft Indigenous Economic Development Strategy: A critical response', *Topical Issue No. 03/2011*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2011TI3.php>>.

Keywords: Closing the Gap, Indigenous economic development, customary sector

Summary: This *Topical Issue* is an adaptation from a submission to the Australian Government's Indigenous Economic Development Strategy Draft for Consultation. Here, Altman contests the prominent 'narrative of [overwhelming] failure' in Indigenous economic development, arguing that past success needs to be acknowledged and replicated. The Draft Strategy is characterised as 'Close the Gap Plus', meaning a model based on statistical deficits. The direct and indirect benefits of Aboriginal customary economic activity, including self-provisioning and the maintenance and reproduction of local knowledge, are detailed. Altman makes a series of recommends which consist of a more nuanced definition of economic development; acknowledgement that an intercultural mix of norms inform economic decision-making; engagement with complex issues of identifying and targeting economic development assistance to Indigenous Australians; engagement with past policy reviews; consideration to strengthening Indigenous property rights in commercially valuable resources; a focus on the state getting institutional settings right; improved engagement with Indigenous communities regarding the development of the Draft Strategy itself; and the establishment of

a parliamentary enquiry into Indigenous economic development in Australia.

Altman, J.C., Biddle, N., Buchannan, G., 2012. 'The Indigenous hybrid economy: Can the NATSISS adequately recognise difference?', in B. Hunter and N. Biddle (eds), 'Survey Analysis for Indigenous Policy in Australia: Social Science Perspectives', *CAEPR Research Monograph No. 32*, ANU E-Press, Canberra, 163-191, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Indigenous-hybrid-economy-Can-NATSISS-adequately-recognise-difference.php>>.

Keyword: National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Social Survey, socioeconomic indicators, customary sector

Summary: This chapter is part of a volume that examines how the data used and analysed in the National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Social Survey (NATSISS) can advance social science and inform Indigenous policy. The authors argue that while the NATSISS was developed as an instrument to allow the collection of official statistics to capture Indigenous differences, the survey has failed to provide enough information on the significance of the customary sector, measured under the label 'cultural production activities'. By locating this sector within the realm of the 'cultural', the authors argue, the survey failed to recognise it as a proper 'economic' sector.

Altman, J.C. 2012. 'People on country as alternate development', in J.C. Altman and S. Kerins (eds), *People on Country, Vital Landscapes, Indigenous Futures*, The Federation Press, Sydney, 1-22, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2012_PoCasAltDev.pdf>.

Keywords: Development options on Indigenous estate, hybrid economy, Payment for environmental services, Aboriginal-state relationship

Summary: In this introductory chapter to *People on Country, Vital landscapes, Indigenous Futures*, Altman discusses options for alternate development on the Indigenous estate. Altman, like the other contributors to this book, challenges the state's solutions regarding the development of remote Indigenous communities. These consist of either bringing mainstream employment opportunities to Indigenous communities (e.g. mining

industry), or inviting Indigenous individuals to migrate to locations where such opportunities exist. Altman points towards a third way based not only on mineral extraction and commercial agriculture, but also on self-provisioning, tourism, the arts, and on the delivery of conservation services that preserve the cultural and environmental value of the Indigenous estate while proving important ecosystem benefits of national scale. He highlights the need to sustain such hybrid economy, and to find a balance between government and other sources of funding in order to ensure a sufficient degree of independence from the state.

Altman, J.C. 2012. 'Indigenous rights, mining corporations and the Australian state', in S. Sawyer and T. Gomez (eds), *The Politics of Resource Extraction: Indigenous Peoples, Corporations and the State*, Palgrave, London, 46-64.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, economic autonomy, mining

Summary: In this chapter Altman argues that the potential for economic autonomy for Indigenous people is heavily constrained by the complexity of recognition, the thin veneer of rights in land, the retreat of the state, and the privileging of mining above Indigenous interests. The author calls for greater recognition of, and respect for Indigenous rights and diversity, insisting that for sustainable livelihoods to occur alongside mining on Indigenous lands, the state and resource developers must recognise and support Indigenous people's intercultural values and diverse development aspirations. This will take place notably by acknowledging the value of flexible Indigenous hybrid economies which locally articulate participation in market, state and customary activities. Political and economic empowerment is also required to address both the current power asymmetry and to accommodate Indigenous rights to live differently on the lands that they own. Even in situations of agreement making between powerful mining corporations and Indigenous landowners, Altman argues that options for alternate development must be seriously considered in preference to concentrated dependence on mining, as currently advocated by the Australian state.

Case studies of the Ranger and Century mines are further used to illustrate the interculturality of hybrid economies, and to examine the dynamics of identity and representation they generate. These dynamics are shaped by Native Title and Land Rights requirements and the 'repressive authenticity', a term coined by Patrick Wolfe, while also being adaptively employed by

Indigenous people in negotiations regarding mines on their land. Where major mining agreements have been negotiated, development outcomes for Indigenous Australians have been by and large underwhelming. Altman concludes that the intercultural values and varied development aspirations of Aboriginal Australians must be recognised for sustainable development to occur.

Altman, J.C. 2013. 'Land rights and development in Australia: Caring for, benefiting from and governing the Indigenous estate', in T. Rowse and L. Ford (eds), *Between Indigenous and Settler Governance*, Routledge, London, 121–134.

Keywords: Alternate development, Indigenous estate

Summary: Historically, the territories that have been reinstated to Indigenous interests through land rights and native title laws have left these groups with few options besides entering into partnerships, where possible, with resource developers such as mining companies and the tourism industry. More recently however, Indigenous territories have been recognised not only as mineral rich but also as particularly biologically diverse. This comprehension has the emergence of economic alternatives for Indigenous interests in the form of conservation activities and ecological services on the Indigenous estate. Altman argues that this has opened the door for diverse forms of development which allows significant choices about the nature and degree of engagement with the market. Yet despite these new avenues, governments and industry continue to for the integration of Indigenous people into the mainstream economy. This consists of encouraging them to either seek employment in the mining sector, move to urban and regional centres to find employment or improve their skills, and more recently, to opt for the privatisation of their land. Each of these options comes with a potential risk of losing their titles on their lands and waters (discontinuity). Altman stresses the need for economic equality and autonomy, self-determination and governance for Indigenous landowners, all of which will lead to more clearly defined property rights and ensure better land management rights.

3. Community Development Employment Projects (CDEP)

Altman, J.C. and Sanders, W. 1991. 'The CDEP scheme: Administrative and policy issues', *Australian Journal of Public Administration*, 50 (4): 515–25, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1991_AusJofPublicAdmin.pdf>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects, Indigenous employment, remote and very remote Australia, notions of 'work'

Summary: This paper focuses on the nature of several unresolved administrative and policy issues relating to the CDEP scheme. As Altman and Sanders argue, many of these issues are associated with the somewhat ambiguous nature of the scheme and the ways in which it juxtaposes competing roles; It is meant to be both a welfare support program and an employment development-workforce program. For the authors, the chances of finding definitive solutions to these problems are unlikely. However they suggest that efforts should be directed towards clarifying which of these competing objectives is to be given precedence in the scheme.

Also published as Altman, J.C. and Sanders, W. 1991. 'The CDEP scheme: Administrative and policy issues', *Discussion Paper No. 5*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1991DP5.php>>.

Altman, J.C. and Daly, A.E. 1992. 'The CDEP scheme: A census-based analysis of the labour market status of participants in 1986', *Discussion Paper No. 36*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1992DP36.php>>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects, Indigenous labour market activities, CDEP as substitution funding regime

Summary: This paper represents an attempt to address the identified lack of research looking at the effectiveness

of the CDEP scheme. Constraints associated with the paucity of accurate historical data on CDEP participants, owing notably at the time to their invisibility in the census, means that this exercise was moderately speculative in nature. However, it was a first step in generating quantitative data on some labour market characteristics of employed persons in communities participating in the scheme.

The authors used data from the 1986 Census to document the labour market activities of Aboriginal people living at 19 of the 38 communities participating in the scheme at that time. This relied on the crucial assumption that most people working less than 24 hours per week in the selected communities were in fact CDEP participants. These data provided some indications regarding the participants' age, gender, income, educational status, occupations, industry of employment and industry sector. In terms of policy implications, Altman and Daly's analysis shows a clear need for mechanisms which enable the identification of CDEP participants in official statistics. Their analysis also queries whether the CDEP scheme operated as a substitution funding regime. Based on the available data, it appears that the scheme was financing community service functions which are usually responsibilities of the State and local governments.

Altman, J.C. and Smith, D.E. 1994. 'Compensating Indigenous Australian 'losers': A community-oriented approach from the Aboriginal social policy arena', in P. Saunders and S. Shaver (eds), *Theory and Practice in Australian Social Policy: Rethinking the Fundamentals*, Proceedings of the National Social Policy Conference, Sydney, Vol. 2: Contributed papers, Social Policy Research Centre, UNSW, Sydney, 1–14, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1994_TheoryAndPractice.pdf>.

Keywords: Market 'losers', compensation, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: This paper questions the ability for social policy to foster economic adaptation more generally, and the degree to which it should be concerned with compensating Indigenous people who are those most disadvantaged by the market. The authors argue that this compensatory approach is encompassed in the CDEP scheme which allows for the 'Aboriginalisation' of work, a high degree of flexibility, and local control over schedules and outcomes. Yet while expansion of the scheme

provides a means to reduce unemployment rates officially defined in the census, it may lock participants into ongoing low-paid employment. It is also unclear whether the scheme has the capacity to compensate people at the individual level due to community politics. For example, in some cases women have received less than their welfare entitlements under the CDEP scheme owing to the devolution of control over resource distribution to community councils. The authors further highlight the need to consider similar programs for the wider Australian community, and outline difficulties that mainstream policy might experience in such attempts.

Also published in 1993 as CAEPR's Discussion Paper No. 47 <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1993DP47.php>>.

Altman, J.C. and Hunter, B. 1996. 'The comparative economic status of CDEP and non-CDEP community residents in the Northern Territory in 1991', *Discussion Paper No. 107*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1996DP107.php>>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects, non-CDEP

Summary: This paper represents the first attempt to compare labour market outcomes for communities participating and not-participating in CDEP. The results of this exploratory comparative analysis show that the communities participating in the CDEP scheme have higher employment levels, albeit with levels of income that are either similar or slightly below those of non-participating communities. Drawing on these data, Altman and Hunter highlight the possibility that CDEP might have been less efficient than expected in achieving the policy goals of improving economic status of Indigenous Australians. The authors further argue that part of the problem may reside in the ambiguous nature of the scheme with its competing income support or welfare, and employment development or workforce objectives.

Altman, J.C and Hunter B. 1996. 'Welfare assistance and the Indigenous labour force: An analysis', *People and Place*, 4 (2): 46–58, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1996_PeopleAndPlace.pdf>.

Keywords: Spatial analysis, Indigenous labour market, Department of Social Security, Community Development Employment Projects, educational training

Summary: This paper examines the inter-relationship between Department of Social Security (DSS) beneficiaries and those employed by the CDEP scheme in order to address the institutional and labour market processes which partially underpin Indigenous welfare. The authors focus on the spatial distributions of CDEP scheme employment and unemployment related benefits, and examine how these data can help to target policy to improve employment outcomes. The CDEP scheme affects the number of DSS clients on unemployment-related benefits and the extent to which these clients are long-term welfare recipients. However, understanding the pattern of dependence of Indigenous people on DSS support cannot be generated from CDEP and DSS numbers alone. Likewise, the CDEP scheme cannot be seen as a simple welfare tool, but rather as both a labour market and welfare program. The authors highlight the need to address educational training opportunities which facilitate mobility of employment across sectors.

Altman, J.C. and Hunter, B. 1996. 'The geographic distribution of unemployment-related benefits and CDEP scheme employment', *Discussion Paper No. 112*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1996DP112.php>>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects, Indigenous labour market activities, spatial and vocational mobility

Summary: In this paper, Altman and Hunter simultaneously examine the geography of unemployment-related benefits and CDEP scheme employment in order to get insights into Indigenous labour market activities in different regions. They further seek to estimate the proportion of the Indigenous labour force which depends on some form of government assistance.

In remote communities, where mainstream employment opportunities are lacking, CDEP appears to have been effective in providing a substitute for limited employment

demand. This paper suggests that the spatial mismatch between employment demand and Indigenous labour supply could be addressed by focusing on the vocational mobility rather than spatial mobility of Indigenous labour.

Altman, J.C. 1997. 'The achievements and limitations of the CDEP scheme – a twenty year perspective', *Social Security Journal*, December, 1–18.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects achievements, challenges and future

Summary: 20 years after the implementation of the CDEP scheme, this paper retrospectively examines its achievements and limitations. It considers the conditions for its survival and expansion, and addresses some of the major issues and challenges undermining the scheme.

See also 'The CDEP scheme in a new policy environment: options for change?', *Discussion Paper No. 148*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1997DP148.php>>.

Altman, J.C. 2000. 'Indigenous work-for-the-dole and mutual obligation: Prospects for employment generation in remote Australia', *Australian Journal of Labour Economics*, 4 (2): 91–102, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2000_AusJofLabourEconomics.pdf>.

Keywords: Employment and development in remote Indigenous Australia, Community Development Employment Projects, mutual obligation schemes, social security system reforms, active CDEP v passive welfare, 'real' economy; McClure Report, Noel Pearson

Summary: In this article, Altman positions CDEP as one of the drivers of development and employment generation in remote Indigenous Australia; a context in which mainstream employment opportunities are often very limited. He reiterates the necessity of distinguishing the scheme from passive welfare, and highlights that the CDEP scheme, established in 1977, is largely founded on the principle of 'mutual obligation' advocated by both McClure and Pearson in their recommendations for welfare reform. Altman suggests revamping or strategically restructuring the scheme to provide a more effective framework for Indigenous economic development in remote regions. He further argues that to achieve positive outcomes, the community-based

organisations underpinning the scheme need to be well resourced with both capital and capacity.

Altman, J.C. and Gray, M. 2000. 'The effects of the CDEP scheme on the economic status of Indigenous Australians: Some analyses using the 1996 Census', *Discussion Paper No. 195*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/2000DP195.php>>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects, 1996 Census, National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Survey, Special Indigenous Personal Forms

Summary: The 1996 Census was the first to identify and provide data on CDEP participants for the discrete Indigenous communities in which the *Special Indigenous Personal Forms (SIPF)* was employed. This discussion paper is the first of CAEPR's publications on CDEP to have had access to appropriate, albeit incomplete, statistical data on the scheme. The analysis of these new data appears to confirm past inferences that people employed by the CDEP scheme earned higher incomes than those receiving social security entitlements, and significantly lower incomes than people in mainstream employment.

The authors outline persisting gaps in these data. While recognising the importance of future Census and National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Survey (NATSIS) data, they stress the need for these tools to consider a wider range of variables (health status, arrest rates, flow between CDEP and the other labour force status). Broadening this range of variables would allow statistical measurement of the benefits of the scheme, not solely in terms of labour market performance, but also in terms of community development (in other words, it would enable the assessment of the two sides of CDEP program). Moreover, in the absence of statistical data on the scheme prior to 1994, it is difficult to measure its long-term effectiveness and socioeconomic impact. The authors conclude by reiterating the need for improved statistical information about CDEP scheme participation, and the need for community-based case studies to be conducted in order to assess the impacts and benefits of the scheme on communities as distinct from impacts on individual participants.

Altman, J.C., Gray, M.C. and Sanders, W. 2000. 'Indigenous Australians working for welfare: What difference does it make?', *Australian Economic Review*, 33 (4): 355–62, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2000_AusEconomicReview.pdf>.

Keywords: Socioeconomic status, National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Survey, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: This paper explores the difference made to the socioeconomic status of Indigenous people who are participating in the CDEP scheme. Comparing data from the 1994 National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Survey (NATSIS) and the 1996 Census, the authors argue that working for welfare through the CDEP scheme has clearly made some difference to the socioeconomic status of Indigenous people at the individual level. In regional and rural areas, it has also made a difference at the community and labour market level. In such geographic locales, the scheme appears to increase the employment to population ratio and the labour force participation rates, while decreasing unemployment. This is compared with the income of Indigenous people in 'mainstream' employment, the Indigenous unemployed, and those not in the labour market. One aspect that has most likely contributed to this enhanced socioeconomic status is the CDEP scheme's flexibility in pursuit of both employment and community development. However, this benefit may not be so easily replicable or generalisable to other programs, or to the non-Indigenous population.

Altman, J.C. and Johnson, V. 2000. 'CDEP in town and country Arnhem Land: The Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation case', *Discussion Paper No. 209*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/2000DP209.php>>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects, welfare reform, Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation, outstations, Maningrida, complex work sociology, employment

Summary: This discussion paper presents the findings of research undertaken in 2000 on the CDEP scheme administered by the Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation (BAC) located in Maningrida in central Arnhem Land. Participants of BAC's scheme reside both in Maningrida township and at outstations in the hinterland. The research sought to assess the benefits generated by the operation of the scheme in these locales, both in terms

of employment as well as social, cultural and broader economic benefits. It occurred at a time in which social policy debates revolved around the apparent negative impacts of welfare dependence, particularly 'passive' welfare (see for instance McClure's review of the Australian welfare system, and Pearson's book *Our Right to Take Responsibility*). The study focuses on a situation where 'active' welfare—CDEP scheme participation—has been an important option, and concludes that there was evidence of its significant net benefit in a range of areas.

In the case examined, the authors argue that these benefits appear to outweigh the negatives of the scheme. However, as underlined in several publications authored by CAEPR staff since the early 1990s, there are issues with the scheme that need to be addressed. This particularly concerns its administration and its dual role (income support and work program). Hence this discussion paper concludes with some recommendations for improving the workability of, and outcomes from the CDEP. It is suggested that amendments to the BAC CDEP scheme (and the CDEP scheme more broadly) could provide opportunities to expand the regional economy and to make people less dependent and more politically engaged.

Altman, J.C. 2001. "'Mutual obligation", the CDEP scheme, and development: Prospects in remote Australia', in F. Morphy and W. Sanders (eds), 'The Indigenous Welfare Economy and the CDEP Scheme', *Research Monograph No. 20*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/mono/2001RM20.php>>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects, passive and active welfare, 'real' economy, employment, remote communities, Indigenous economic development aspirations, mutual obligation

Summary: This chapter seeks to explore how a modified version of the CDEP scheme could be used as an institutional framework for Indigenous economic development. Altman notes the overall positive impacts of the CDEP scheme in remote and very remote Indigenous contexts, arguing that most of the program's streams are based on a 'mutual obligation' principle.

Altman, J.C., Gray, M.C. and Levitus, R. 2005. 'Policy issues for the Community Development Employment Projects scheme in rural and remote Australia', *Discussion Paper No. 271*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/2005DP271.php>>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects, economic development, customary sector, 'mutual obligation' principle

Summary: This paper examines the statistical evidence for the social and economic outcomes of the CDEP scheme. The data indicate that the scheme is cost-effective in achieving positive economic and community development outcomes. Indigenous Australians participating in CDEP (around 35,000 people, or more than one-quarter of total Indigenous employment at the time of writing), were engaged in a mutual obligation type of arrangement long before the new and explicit policy emphasis on 'mutual obligation' that resulted from the 2000 McClure review of the social security system. The authors explain that those employed in CDEP are more likely to participate in customary activity than those in mainstream employment; part of the attraction of CDEP is that it facilitates undertaking customary activity while maintaining paid work. They recommend continued support and enhanced resourcing for CDEP.

Altman, J.C., Gray, M.C. and Levitus, R. 2005. *Skilling Indigenous Australia: Policy issues for the Community Development Employment Projects scheme in rural and remote Australia*, Chifley Research Centre, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/2006_SkillingIndigenous.pdf>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects, welfare reform

Summary: This paper reviews the evidence of the social and economic impacts of the CDEP scheme and canvasses options for future policy directions concerning both Indigenous economic development and the role of CDEP (both in remote areas and major cities).

The authors find that the scheme is cost effective and produces positive social and economic outcomes for the participants and their communities, particularly in remote and very remote areas. They highlight the schemes association with positive outcomes in terms of individual, family and community wellbeing, while also generating (often unacknowledged) benefits of national significance

when providing ecological services through 'caring for country' activities. Furthermore, the scheme is relatively cheap when compared to more traditional income support options. In the light of this evidence, and in spite of the criticisms that CDEP does not provide or lead to enough 'real' unsubsidised jobs, the authors conclude that the scheme should continue to be supported and resourced.

Altman, J.C. 2005. 'CDEP 2005—A new home and new objectives for a very old program?', *Topical Issue No. 07/2005*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2005TI7.php>>.

Keywords: Work for welfare, Community Development Employment Projects, hybrid economy

Summary: This Topical Issue was originally presented with Matthew Gray as part of the 2005 CAEPR seminar series. The previous year, CDEP was moved from ATSIC to the Department of Employment and Workplace Relations (DEWR). What began as a 'work for welfare' program in 1977 expanded to involve community development, enterprise development, employment creation and income support. Most CDEP participants live in remote or very remote communities, where mainstream employment options are very restricted. Altman argues that CDEP is actually active welfare, however many people have conflated it with passive welfare, leading to the assumption that it is part of the 'unreal' economy. He summarises CAEPR *Discussion Paper 271* and a DEWR Discussion Paper released shortly after. This DEWR CDEP Discussion Paper, Altman asserts, ignored official statistics and research which demonstrated that many activities which create local and national benefits are reliant on CDEP. Altman further looks to the challenge of how CDEP development could grow all sectors (market and non-market) of the hybrid economy.

Altman, J.C. and Gray, M.C. 2005. 'The CDEP Scheme: A flexible and innovative employment and community development program for Indigenous Australians', in M. Considine, B. Howe and L. Rosewarne (eds), *Transitions and Risk: New Directions in Social Policy*, International Social Policy Conference, Centre for Public Policy, University of Melbourne, Melbourne, 1–9, available at <http://www.anu.edu.au/caepr-dev/sites/default/files/StaffProfiles/stafffiles/jon-altman//2005_TransitionsAndRisk.pdf>.

Keywords: Labour markets, Community Development Employment Projects, national resource management

Summary: This paper was prepared for the *Transitions and Risk: New Directions in Social Policy* conference in Melbourne in 2005. It situates CDEP within the recent mainstreaming and 'mutual obligation' turn in Indigenous affairs, arguing that CDEP has operated under principles of mutual obligation and reciprocity for nearly 30 years. CDEP is described as the most significant labour market program for Indigenous Australians, particularly in remote and very remote parts of the country. CDEP organisations are provided funding which is then used for wages for CDEP participants, employment training, activity and enterprise support, administrative and capital support, and income support. As such, the authors insist that CDEP is a positive and appropriate scheme for Indigenous people in remote and very remote Australia. Such people are distant from mainstream labour markets and opportunities and may also have different hopes and opportunities to other Australians. Altman and Gray cite studies of the CDEP scheme which find that the scheme generates positive wellbeing, community development and social outcomes. Findings from the 2002 NATSISS further suggest that CDEP employment allows participants to engage in both the customary and market sectors. The authors also argue that CDEP generates significant benefits, in what they call 'national resource management', through 'Caring for Country' programs, as well as providing the flexibility for participants to choose to engage with resource management related activities should they wish to.

Altman, J.C. and Gray, M.C. 2005. 'The economic and social impacts of the CDEP scheme in remote Australia', *Australian Journal of Social Issues*, 40 (2): 399–410, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2005_AusJofSocialIssues.pdf>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects, economic development in remote Australia

Summary: Almost 30 years since the inception of the CDEP scheme, research on its economic and social impacts has been severely limited by data limitations. This is despite the significance of the program, which in 2005 accounted for over one quarter of the total Indigenous employment. This paper focuses on the CDEP scheme in remote areas, drawing largely from the 2002 National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Social Survey (NATSISS) which was the first survey to provided relatively reliable data on the scheme in remote and very remote areas. The authors argue that the scheme has been successful in generating economic and community development outcomes at minimal cost to the Australian taxpayer.

Altman, J.C. 2007. 'Scrapping CDEP is just plain dumb', *Topical Issue No. 11/2007*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2007TI11.php>>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects, Indigenous Protected Areas, Caring for Country Ranger programs

Summary: In this Topical Issue, first published in *Crikey*, Altman strongly criticises the move to abolish the CDEP scheme in the Northern Territory. Without CDEP, Altman insists that the arts, the management of Indigenous Protected Areas and community-based Caring for Country Ranger programs (which are important and dynamic components of the hybrid economy), and levels of Indigenous employment more generally will all suffer. In his argument, Altman takes an historical view of unemployment in remote and very remote Australia, citing the introduction of award wages in the 1970s as the catalyst for the introduction of CDEP by the Fraser Government in 1977. CDEP maximises individual choice because participants can work part-time, full-time and overtime if they so choose. Altman suggests that another motive for dismantling CDEP, besides the stated aim of creating 'real jobs', may have been to have a single system for welfare quarantining and possibly to limit

the power and influence of Indigenous organisations administering CDEP.

'Scrapping CDEP is just dumb, dumb, dumb', *Crikey*, 24 July 2007, <<http://www.crikey.com.au/2007/07/24/scrapping-cdep-is-just-dumb-dumb-dumb/>>.

Also published as 'Scrapping CDEP is just plain dumb', *ABC online*, 26 July 2007, <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/stories/2007/07/26/1988592.htm>> .

Altman, J.C. and Sanders, W. 2008. 'Re-vitalising the Community Development Employment Program in the Northern Territory', Submission prepared in response to the Northern Territory Government's Review of Community Development Employment Program Discussion Paper, *Topical Issue No. 05/2008*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2008TI5.php>>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects, Guaranteed Minimum Income for Outstations, outstations, spatial and occupational mobility

Summary: In this Topical Issue, CDEP participation is positioned somewhere between employment and unemployment. Altman and Sanders highlight the flexibility of CDEP in accommodating spatial as well as occupational mobility (i.e. between different sectors of the hybrid economy). They insist that there is a crucial differentiation which needs to be recognised between labour markets in remote communities, and people's frequent movement between them. Easier access to capital support, multi-year rolling funding for robust CDEP organisations, and a Guaranteed Minimum Income for Outstations (GMIO) are among the recommendations proposed here. Describing CDEP as welfare, the authors continue, is a misrepresentation which overlooks the employment, productive activity, service provision and income it generates. However, CDEP alone cannot provide the solutions to complex pressures and hardships in remote Aboriginal Australia.

Altman, J.C. 2008. 'Submission to Increasing Indigenous Economic Opportunity – A discussion paper on the future of the CDEP and Indigenous Employment Programs', *Topical Issue No. 14/2008*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2008TI14.php>>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects reform, evidence-based policies, self-determination

Summary: This submission presents a critical perspective on the Australian government's discussion paper titled *Increasing Indigenous Economic Opportunity: A Discussion paper on the future of the CDEP and Indigenous Employment Programs*, published in May 2008. For Altman, the paper was disappointing and flawed because it attempted to redefine CDEP as a labour market program, rather than as an expression of self-determination or a community development program. In Altman's critique, it focused solely on the economic dimension of the program while overlooking its social agenda.

Altman decries the paper's lack of engagement with most of 30 years evidence-based research and reviews written on CDEP (including statistical evidence) which assess the program positively, despite highlighting areas in need of improvement. In this submission, Altman advocates for the reinstatement of CDEP in the NT and an evaluation of the program on a case-by-case basis.

Altman, J.C. 2008. 'Submission to the Australian Government's Increasing Employment Opportunity Discussion Paper', *Topical Issue No. 16/2008*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2008TI16.php>>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects reform, evidence-based policies, history of CDEP scheme, Closing the Gap

Summary: This submission focuses on the proposed reform of the CDEP program and foresees that it would generate outcomes counter to the over-arching Rudd Government goal of closing the employment gap. The proposed reform, Altman argues, should have focused on Indigenous unemployment rather than on the 25,000 plus CDEP participants at the time. The reform did not address the real issue, which Altman outlines as the lack

of employment opportunities in remote and very remote Indigenous communities.

This submission provides statistical evidence about the success of the CDEP program, and recommendations for its enhancement and improvement in accordance with the Rudd government's pre-election ALP National Platform. It raises concerns about the potential negative impacts on social and economic circumstances for Indigenous people if CDEP was regarded solely as a labour market program, and further warns about the risks of tampering with CDEP at a time of great economic uncertainty. Ironically, Altman notes, the policy changes proposed appear to recreate the very economic conditions that led to the establishment of CDEP in the first place (i.e. an increased level of unemployment and decreased level of employment).

Note: This submission includes a chronology of the Community Development Employment Projects (CDEP) Program 1977–2008 compiled by Melissa Johns.

4. The Indigenous visual arts industry

Altman, J.C. 1982. 'Artists and artisans in Gunwinggu society', in P.M. Cooke and J.C. Altman (eds), *Aboriginal Art at the Top*, Maningrida Arts and Crafts, Maningrida, 12–16, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1982_AboriginalArts.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, cultural maintenance, cultural reproduction, Kuninjkun/Gunwinggu, north-central Arnhem Land

Summary: In this paper, Altman details the complex economic, social and cultural reasons that eastern Gunwinggu people produce artefacts for sale in north-central Arnhem Land, a production which counts for proximately 30 per cent of people's total cash income. Altman details the growth and links of this market exchange with the outstation movement that began in Arnhem Land during the 1970s, noting that the only regular means for earning cash at outstations other than from social security payments remains through the production of artefacts for sale. The pivotal forms and role of cultural continuity and maintenance in these production processes are outlined, notably at a time when Gunwinggu values are perceived as being challenged and threatened by the wider European society.

Altman, J.C. 1983. 'The structure and future of artefact production for exchange in north-central Arnhem Land', in P. Loveday and P. Cooke (eds), *Aboriginal Arts and Crafts and the Market*, North Australia Research Unit, Darwin, 7–19, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1983_ArtsAndCrafts.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, tourism industry, sustainability, Maningrida

Summary: Drawing on fieldwork from 1979–80 and shorter visits in 1981 and 1982, Altman provides an overview of art and craft production for market exchange in the Maningrida region of north-central Arnhem Land. He traces the significance of artefact production for the market in this regional economy, the social and cultural demographics of its producers, and the economic and

non-economic returns that people receive from their artefact work. Through this process, and drawing on results from a 1978–80 database, attempts are made to predict future artefact levels in the region. Altman further considers the possible effects of external factors on these production levels, such as the availability of unemployment benefits, mining royalties and alternative employment opportunities. This subject is approached with a view to ensuring the practice's sustainability over the long-term. Altman argues that it is the combination of art and craft income and social security entitlements, plus the returns from subsistence production, which make economic life on outstations comparable to the living standard in Maningrida.

Altman, J.C. 1986. 'The significance of artefact production for market exchange in an Arnhem Land outstation economy', (paper presented at the AIAS Biennial Conference 'Aboriginal Arts in Contemporary Australia, 7–9 May 1984) in Official Hansard Report (Volume III) of the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal Affairs, Reference: Aboriginal Homeland Centres, Government Printer, Canberra, 20 November 1985, 508–527, available at <http://www.anu.edu.au/caepr-dev/sites/default/files/StaffProfiles/stafffiles/jon-altman/1986_ArtefactProduction.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, outstations, homelands, Momeka/Mumeka

Summary: In this paper Altman examines the role of artefact manufacture for market exchange in the micro-economy of Mumeka outstation in north-central Arnhem Land. In the early days of the outstation movement, survival was dependent on artefact production income as well as access to raw materials and subsistence productivity. Since the early 1970s, demand for Indigenous artefacts has also increased by both Euro-Australians and overseas tourists. More recently, state involvement has risen in the marketing and subsidisation of Indigenous arts and crafts. However over the past two years, industry growth has stagnated and possibly declined. Altman argues that this has created a crisis in the supply side of the industry for producers who create individual items for payment (rather than those who receive a wage), and in places where people have full access to social security payments. The varied and gendered sources and types of income in Mumeka across the three sectors of subsistence, market exchange and social security are outlined, with Altman surmising that the most significant factor in the decline of the

sector has been reduced returns to producers. This has stemmed both from demand and from prices remaining constant alongside a varying mark-up policy, and there is a risk that artists may come to see inadequate gains resulting from producing artefacts, as well as feeling exploited. Given these circumstances, Altman argues that cash returns to art producers need to be immediately increased.

Altman, J.C. 1986. 'Marketing Aboriginal art and craft: Some economic realities and subsidisation options', (paper presented at the AIAS Biennial Conference 'Aboriginal Arts in Contemporary Australia, 7–9 May 1984) in Official Hansard Report (Volume III) of the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal Affairs, Reference: Aboriginal Homeland Centres, Government Printer, Canberra, 20 November 1985, 528–548, available at <http://www.anu.edu.au/caepr-dev/sites/default/files/StaffProfiles/stafffiles/jon-altman/1986_ArtAndCraft.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, community art centres, marketing, fine art

Summary: This paper discusses several economic realities of marketing Indigenous artefacts and the immediate need for financial subsidisation of the industry to avoid a supply crisis. Drawing on the little public data available, as well as his own research experiences, Altman provides an analysis of the multifaceted and fragmented nature of the industry, presenting a series of policy options and their potential ramifications. Stressing that no simple or short-term solutions will suffice, suggestions for how an increased subsidy may be expended are discussed. These include the role of community art centres, the potential of regional craft centres, the possibilities of national and global marketing, and the potential of art fellowships for leaders in the field.

Altman, J.C. 1988. 'The economic basis for cultural reproduction', in M. West (ed), *The Inspired Dream – Life as Art in Aboriginal Australia*, Queensland Art Gallery, Brisbane, 48–55, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1988_InspiredDream.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, cultural reproduction, industry commercialisation, northern Australia

Summary: The Indigenous arts and crafts industry has been highly successful, currently enjoying prosperity and popularity, and such practice enables traditions to be passed from one generation to the next. However without a firmer economic base, the long-term viability of this industry, which plays a significant role in cultural reproduction, is insecure. For many people who produce artefacts for sale, it provides the only means to increase cash income above social security payments. However, despite the attention that the Indigenous arts and crafts industry has attracted in recent years, little attention has been paid to its economic significance. Considerable thought must be given to restructuring the industry to make it sustainable, recognising the central role of its commercialisation and somewhat different requirements to those of the previous two decades. Altman outlines the need for an Aboriginal-controlled organisation in northern Australia to act as a resource organisation on behalf of all Indigenous art centres. He further recommends that links be established between the manufacturing sector and the wider economy at Indigenous communities. This would maximize returns to producers, ensure the future supply of product, and establish employment equity between Indigenous and other Australians.

*Altman, J.C. 1989. *The Aboriginal Arts and Crafts Industry*, Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, industry review, industry sustainability

Summary: This published report was authored by Altman as the ministerially-appointed chair of a major national review of the Aboriginal arts and crafts industry conducted with co-reviewers Chris McGuigan and Peter Yu. The research on which this review was based included the collection of a considerable body of primary data and field-based research with a large number of community-based Indigenous art centres Australia-wide. It provided the blueprint for the federal arts funding framework the National Arts and Crafts Industry Support Strategy established by ATSIC in 1991 that continues in the present as the Indigenous Visual Arts Industry Strategy. It was also the foundation for a subsequent body of research by Altman on the Indigenous visual arts sector.

This policy review examines the extent to which government intervention can economically assist the feasibility of the Indigenous arts and crafts industry in the future, and makes recommendations for facilitating the current and future viability of the industry. A key policy

issue is whether federal support for the industry should be rationalised, and if so, where the institutional locus should reside. As the first examination of the industry in eight years, this research takes place during a time of unprecedented boom as well as a total absence of industry statistics. Attempting to represent regional variability, the report provides a realistic analysis of positive and negative aspects of the industry and its growth and decline, while also paying attention to issues around cultural integrity and copyright.

Altman, J.C. 1990. 'Selling Aboriginal art in the 1990s', in J.C. Altman and L. Taylor (eds), *Marketing Aboriginal Art in the 1990s*, Institute Report Series, Aboriginal Studies Press, Canberra, 5–15, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1990_MarketingAboriginalArt.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry

Summary: This chapter was written as an introductory contribution to the workshop 'Marketing Aboriginal Art in the 1990s'. It assumes familiarity with *The Aboriginal Arts and Crafts Industry: Report of the Review Committee* that was released the previous year. Altman argues here that while the Indigenous arts and crafts industry is the cultural and economic success story of the 1980s, a series of challenges must be addressed if these gains are to be maintained in the 1990s. The 1989 Review argued for genuine reform in the industry and further establishment of mechanisms to ensure equitable and realistic resourcing of Indigenous art centres. In this paper, Altman discusses the features, structure and scale of the industry with a view of how to maintain its future prospects.

Altman, J.C. 2000. 'The Indigenous Visual Arts Industry: Issues and Prospects for the Next Decade', *Artlink* 20 (1): 86–92, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/2000_Artlink.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, fine art market, tourism art, tourism industry, retail royalty, art centres

Summary: In this article Altman argues that the Indigenous arts industry has economic potential for Indigenous Australians, with sales being likely to increase, but that most of this economic opportunity has yet to be realised. He outlines practical steps to

ensure that an equitable share of the profits and spin-offs being generated by the industry are captured by Indigenous people. This requires the rapid adoption of a national strategic approach to Indigenous arts industry development, recognition of the long-standing division between fine art and tourist art, and an examination of a possible *droite de suite* (resale royalty) being introduced in the fine art market. In the tourist art sector, Altman continues, Indigenous people need to develop commercial expertise and gain access to capital in order to capture a great share of the profits. Continued government support for art centres will also ensure sustainability of the community-based art sectors.

Wright, F. and Altman, J.C. 2000. 'Introduction: Project overview', in F. Wright and F. Morphy (eds), *The Arts and Crafts Centre Story*, Volume 2, Summary and Recommendations, ATSIC, Canberra, 1–14, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2000_ArtsAndCrafts_Intro.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, art centres, performance indicators

Summary: This is an introduction and overview of the Arts and Crafts Centre Story (ACCS) project, which undertook an industry wide survey of activities and practices of the government supported community art centres in remote Australia. Under the National Arts and Crafts Industry Support (NACISS), art centres need to be highly accountable for their funding and performance. A high degree of transparency is required to ensure the maintenance of best value for scarce art support dollars. However, there is a lack of basic data and tools necessary to evaluate the financial performance of art centres under the NACISS program. The ACCS project gathered basic information about the centres in order to assess their current functioning, identify areas of best practice, and highlight problems in need of resolution. This will enable national standards from art centres to be set within an industry wide context. The results of this data collection and analysis are discussed in this 5 part volume (II–VI).

Altman, J.C. 2000. 'Aboriginal Art centres and NACISS: An appraisal of performance based on financial statements', in F. Wright and F. Morphy (eds), *The Arts and Crafts Centre Story*, Volume 2, Summary and Recommendations, ATSIC, Canberra, 74–102, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2000_ArtsAndCrafts_NACISS.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, art centres, performance indicators

Summary: This is a financial appraisal of community-based art centres funded under the National Arts and Crafts Industry Support program, and based on a 'naïve' desk-top analysis of audited art centre financial statements. Altman calculates the straightforward, quantitative performance indicators using publicly available data, and illustrates the type of financial scrutiny that art centres may reasonably expect from any program administrator or policy maker. This simple approach is designed to allow comparability with historical data, and to demonstrate to art centres how straightforward the calculation of quantitative performance indicators can be. The ability to provide comprehensive data is essential to support any claims for the continued funding of Indigenous art centres, and to quantitatively substantiate any public policy case. Key findings of this appraisal show that art centre sales have been robust over the last three years, and that art centres continue to deliver a high level of opportunity to producers. Policy issues that arise from these data include the lack of regular performance analysis, and the need for quantitative indicators which are supplemented with qualitative and narrative indicators of performance.

Wright, F., Altman, J.C. and Morphy, F. 2000. 'Recommendations', in F. Wright and F. Morphy (eds), *The Arts and Crafts Centre Story*, Volume 2, Summary and Recommendations, ATSIC, Canberra, 103–116, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2000_ArtsAndCrafts_Recom.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, art centres, performance indicators

Summary: Tensions between the cultural and commercial aspects of art centres are inevitable outcomes of mediation between host communities and the outside world. The authors argue that these tensions must be managed in ways that enable them to function as both effective cultural institutions which reflect the values of

their host communities, and as economic enterprises. This can be done by firstly acknowledging the complex role of art centres so that sources of tension can be addressed. Secondly, art centres need to improve their performance within parameters that constrain their activities. Key areas in need of increased efficiency include recruitment and employment conditions, strategic planning, financial management and office systems. The authors provide a series of recommendations concerning Indigenous ownership and control, staffing, Aboriginalisation of staff positions, training of Aboriginal staff and artists, funding provisions, resourcing, and the servicing and support of art centres.

Altman, J.C. and Taylor, L. 2000. 'Commerce and Culture: Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Art and the Market', in M. West (ed), *Transitions, Museums and Art Galleries of the Northern Territory*, Darwin, 9–19, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2000_Transitions.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, art centres, art advisors, fine art market

Summary: This paper is an overview of the Indigenous arts industry and the market's achievements of the last two decades, situating the industry's current importance in the year (2000) of the Sydney Olympics. The authors outline the identities and works of the industry's artists, and the central role of government assistance in marketing their art through community-based and controlled arts and crafts centres. They detail the important role of art advisors, who act as intercultural mediators between Indigenous artists and the market, alongside the budgets of museums, art galleries and public arts institutions that provide important support to the industry. Until the early 1990s, there was strong government support directed towards stimulating the Indigenous arts and craft market. However, there are now more private dealers who are concerned to protect the cultural priorities of the artists, and artists and buyers are more aware of the operations of the entire industry. The last decade has also seen the growing participation of leading mainstream commercial galleries in the exhibiting and sale of Indigenous art, as well as the rise of auction houses. This last development has underpinned the marketing of Indigenous fine art as investment art, and the growth of overseas links through collections, exhibitions and collectors.

Altman, J.C. 2000. 'Marketing Aboriginal Art', in S. Kleinert and M. Neale (eds), *Oxford Companion to Aboriginal Art and Culture*, Oxford University Press, Melbourne, 461–466, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2000_Oxford_MarketingArt.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, fine art market, marketing

Summary: An Indigenous art market and a marketing industry have been developing since the early 1960s. The industry consolidated in the 1990s, as changes in marketing reflected a new era of industry stability. A number of marketing issues also arose at this time. These included questions around resale royalties to Indigenous artists or their heirs, and questions over authenticity and authorship which are important to market confidence in the product. Diversification in marketing modes and healthy competition between some agents does well for artists whose work is in high demand. However, only commercial outlets and a few top artists take most of the profits. This marketing history must continue to develop in order to ensure the industry's survival in the coming decades.

Altman, J.C. 2001. 'Eastern Kuninjku 'Grow Up' an art collector', in *Outside In: Research Engagements with Arnhem Land Art*, ANU, Drill Hall Gallery, Canberra, 6–13, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/2001_OutsideIn.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts market, Momeka/Mumeka, Kuninjku/Gunwinggu art, recognition

Summary: In this piece Altman discusses the social, emotional, aesthetic and economic reasons behind his own appreciation and collection of Kuninjku art. In doing so, he reflects on the growing art movement over this time and the artistic development of the artists. Altman provides his views on the creation of key artistic works, the social implications for himself and his friends at Mumeka from these productions, and reasons for their personal significance. A crucial part of being 'grown up' at Mumeka, he insists, was learning to understand and appreciate the complex Kuninjku artistic system. He makes it clear that his experiential understanding of Mumeka livelihoods and socialities is deeply tied to his comprehension of, and participation in this knowledge system. Developing meaningful relations with people inspired him to purchase their art, and these social

relations have been maintained over time. In the process, Altman sees his personal link with Arnhem Land artists and friends as having been sustained in part through the objectification of those relationships in this art form. It is in these relationships that the meaning and value of the artworks reside.

Altman, J.C., Hunter, B.H., Ward, S. and Wright, F. 2002. 'The Indigenous visual arts industry', in J.C. Altman and S. Ward (eds), *Competition and Consumer Issues for Indigenous Australians*, A report to the ACCC by CAEPR, ACCC, Canberra, 64–101, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2002_CompetitionAndConsumer.pdf>.

Keywords: Trade Protection Act, Australian Competition and Consumer Commission, community stores, art centres, Indigenous arts and crafts industry, Indigenous Arts Charter, remote Communities

Summary: This chapter is a preliminary discussion of how the *Trade Protection Act (1974) (TPA)* might be relevant and apply to a key Indigenous industry, namely the Indigenous visual arts and crafts sector. The central TPA issues of relevance to the industry are anti-competitive practices (Part IV), unconscionable conduct (Part IVA), and fair trading and consumer protection (Part V), with the latter two issues being of most significance. The authors discuss these complex issues in considerable detail, drawing on existing literature, their own research and experiences, and a theoretical economics framework that meshes with the focus of the TPA. There are no immediate solutions to the problem of unconscionable conduct, they assert, however the education of artists to encourage strong allegiance to accountable and well-governed organisations is one recommended future role for the Australian Competition and Consumer Commission (ACCC). The ACCC could also watch for interactions that might be classified as unconscionable conduct, coercion or harassment under the TPA. In terms of fair trading and consumer protection, the authors recommend an industry Arts Charter to facilitate producer and consumer information, and to reduce the risk of unconscionable conduct and false and misleading conduct.

This chapter was also published as Altman, J.C., Hunter, S., Ward, F. and Wright, F. 2002. 'Some competition and consumer issues in the Indigenous visual arts industry', *Discussion Paper No. 235*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/2002DP235.php>>.

Altman, J.C. 2003. 'Developing an Indigenous Arts Strategy for the Northern Territory: Issues paper for consultations', *Working Paper No. 22*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/WP/2003WP22.php>>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, Indigenous Arts Strategy

Summary: This Issues Paper reports the first step in the unprecedented development of an Indigenous Arts Strategy (IAS) for the Northern Territory (NT). The paper was prepared for the purpose of stakeholder consultations and with the aim of charting a realistic pathway to ensure Indigenous arts success under an NT Indigenous arts advocacy and support framework.

The aim of the IAS is to promote and further develop Indigenous art, and to enhance and maintain the national leadership in Indigenous arts in the NT, particularly in visual arts. The IAS is based in Indigenous control in order to protect its integrity and to maximize the benefits that can flow back to communities. The political will and development of an IAS is founded on the evidence-based policy view that there is a link between Indigenous engagement with the arts and general socioeconomic benefit, both in employment opportunity and additional income earned. NT Government policy is also looking to promote cultural tourism and cultural knowledge as drivers of Indigenous development, both of which have links to the Indigenous arts sector.

Through a discussion of the literature as well as 32 stakeholder perspectives from arts interest groups in the NT, Altman outlines the cultural, political, geographic and economic complexities required for this to take place. These include defining the Indigenous arts sector; understanding how it operates in all its geographic, organisational and art forms diversity; structuring a sensible arts support strategy; and targeting support to Indigenous practitioners on an accepted policy basis.

Altman, J.C. 2003. 'An Indigenous Arts Strategy for the Northern Territory: Recommended Framework', Prepared for Arts NT, Northern Territory Government, Darwin, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/2003_ArtsStrategy.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, Indigenous Arts Strategy, Northern Territory

Summary: This discussion paper is the final output from a consultancy that began in March 2003 which sought the input of an independent expert to mediate between the Northern Territory (NT) Indigenous arts community, arts policy makers and bureaucracy at the Territory and Commonwealth levels. The advice from this paper was used in the development of an Indigenous Arts Strategy (IAS) for the NT, which was to be principally concerned with enhancing NT investments in the Indigenous arts sector.

The economic and cultural success of this industry has created a significant comparative advantage for both arts practitioners and more generally for the Territory. Yet while Indigenous people in the NT are highly engaged in the state's arts sector, they have a low engagement in the mainstream state economy. An impetus for a focus on the Indigenous arts sector has been a view in policy that its growth will enhance Indigenous economic development. Altman proposes ten actions that need to be embedded in such a strategy. These include championing, profiling and brokering Indigenous arts; strengthening Indigenous arts infrastructure and practice; investing in under-resourced regions; incubating under-resourced art forms; protecting the NT Indigenous arts' comparative advantage; retaining talent; and tracking performance. The growing Indigenous arts sector will not provide a cure to Indigenous disadvantage, however enhanced sector investment in this form will be a low-risk means to make a very real and positive difference.

Altman, J.C. 2004. 'Brokering Kuninjku art: Artists, institutions and the market', in H. Perkins (ed.), *Crossing Country: The Alchemy of Western Arnhem Land Art*, Art Gallery of New South Wales, Sydney, 173–187, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2004_CrossingCountry.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, art centres, hybridity, inter-cultural brokering, remote Australia

Summary: Altman presents a socio-political history of Maningrida Arts and Culture (MAC, Maningrida Arts and Craft from 1968–1993), which forms part of the Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation (BAC), as it relates to the Kuninjku, with whom Altman has a long association. He focuses on the shifting and multi-faceted role of (generally non-Indigenous) art advisers at MAC, and their relationships with Kuninjku artists and their work. Kuninjku art production changed under the reins of various art advisers at MAC, and booms in

particular art forms such as wood carvings and *mimihs* (sculptures of spirits) in the mid-1990s demonstrate the ability of Kuninjkul artists and advisers to adapt to market demands. The Kuninjkul, among the last wave of Aboriginal people to encounter colonialism in Australia, are now among Australia's leading indigenous artists, with vast quantities of cultural capital on the local and international stage. Altman traces this success to a period of 'cultural revival' from the 1970s, with land rights, the outstations movement and state support for Aboriginal community based corporations, combined with the 'cultural brokering' of Kuninjkul artists, being key processes. Here Altman suggests that the commercial is embedded in the social, and MAC's status as a hybrid institution is key to its success.

Altman, J.C. 2005. *Brokering Aboriginal Art: A critical perspective on marketing, institutions, and the state*, Kenneth Meyer Lecture in Arts & Entertainment Management, R. Rentschler (ed.), Centre for Leisure Management Research, Bowater School of Management and Marketing, Deakin University, Melbourne, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2005TI5.php>>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, art centres, hybridity, inter-cultural brokering, remote Australia

Summary: In this Kenneth Myer Lecture, Altman examines the paradox of the international success of the Indigenous art market alongside Indigenous Australians' stagnating socioeconomic conditions. Focusing on artists and art centres in remote regions, this paradox is examined through an historical analysis of state-sponsored arts infrastructure in the Indigenous arts sector, and the dominant form of mediation undertaken by art centres. This is contextualised within the rise of the modern Indigenous arts movement, the political and policy circumstances of the early 1970s, and the diversely structured forms and operations of art centres themselves. Inherent tensions and contestations are discussed in the three areas of 'marketing', 'institutions' and 'the state'. Altman stresses the need to recognise and support the essential hybridity of Indigenous artworks and art centres as institutions which combine cultural and commercial sectors. The success of this industry has been largely dependent on state support, yet constant pressure on art centres to be independent has seen support cut from thriving centres. It would be more appropriate, he argues, to recognise the success of the arts as a means to convert customary and contemporary

specialties to economic and cultural benefit, and to invest in the complex inter-cultural brokering on which such prosperous endeavours are founded.

Altman, J.C. 2005. 'From Mumeka to Basel: John Mawurndjul's artistic odyssey', in C. Kaufmann (ed.), <<*Rark*>> *John Mawurndjul: Journey Through Time in Northern Australia*, Schwabe Verlag, Basel, 30–41, available at <http://www.anu.edu.au/caepr-dev/sites/default/files/StaffProfiles/stafffiles/jon-altman//2005_JohnMawurndjul.pdf>.

Keywords: John Mawurndjul, Indigenous arts and crafts industry, hybrid economy

Summary: This contextualising biographical essay charts John Mawurndjul's life and career, from his birth in Arnhem Land, adolescence in Maningrida, and artistic beginnings in Mumeka, up to his retrospective exhibition in Basel, Switzerland in 2005. Mawurndjul is a hunter, fisher, commercial harvester of wildlife and ceremonial leader. He is involved in cultural and natural resource management as well as being an artist; his economic engagement is thus in all sectors of the hybrid economy. Altman looks at the complex and competing demands Mawurndjul negotiates to successfully fulfil all of these roles.

Altman, J.C. 2006. 'The invention of Kurulk art', in Altman, J.C. (ed), *From Mumeka to Milmilngkan: Innovation in Kurulk Art*, Drill Hall Gallery, ANU, Canberra, 16–33.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts market, cultural maintenance, Jimmy Njiminjuma, John Mawurndjul, James Iyuna, Kurulk art, west Arnhem Land, homelands, centralisation

Summary: In this essay Altman discusses the evolution of Kurulk art produced by members of the Kuninjkul-dialect community of western Arnhem Land. Through the artistic histories and practices of three artists, Jimmy Njiminjuma, John Mawurndjul and James Iyuna, Altman shows how this art has provided Kurulk and their families with a means of cultural, political and economic empowerment over the last thirty years. Three areas in relation to this art movement are addressed – the production of places, the artistic development cycle of three small family art schools, and the engagement of Kurulk artists with the national and global market for high art. Through this essay, the pre-conditions of this highly

successful art movement are outlined. These conditions, Altman argues, have become jeopardized by current policy and populist propositions that such outstations no longer be supported. Suggestions that residents at Kurulk outstation be relocated to larger urban areas undermines the circumstances required for this nationally important and internationally recognised art industry to continue successfully. It also fails to recognise the positive gains that people like Njiminjuma, Mawurndjul, Iyuna and their families have created for themselves within it.

Acker, T. and Altman, J.C. 2007. 'It's all art but still we have a "fibre problem": Economic reality, contested value and Aboriginal arts', *716 craft design*, 018 (March), available at <<http://basement.craftaustralia.org.au/research/20070227.php>>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, subsistence economy, cultural production

Summary: The 'fibre problem' refers to the dominant prejudice of the western art market which sees Indigenous people's 'fibre' based works as 'craft' and not 'art'. Fibre and textiles have high cultural worth but are low value art on the art market and are difficult to sell due to global competition and market perceptions. The tension between the classifications of 'art' versus 'craft' sees art being associated with notions of the sacred and spiritual, whereas craft is associated with the profane. The authors outline reasons behind this perception of crafts in the global art market, the functional look of such artworks, and argue that their domestic connection may result in them being devalued. To address this problem, they turn to the important role of Indigenous art centres and the market imperatives behind their funding. Short-sighted funding decisions that limit the capacity for art centres to support unprofitable activities like 'craft' can have far reaching social and cultural implications. A range of strategies are currently being adopted by art centres in attempts to influence the market, as well as to adapt and market 'craft' in a manner than can attract the elite arts buyers. These include collaborating with non-Indigenous fibre artists, promoting links between contemporary 'crafts' and ceremonial knowledge, and educating the market about the cultural worth and integrity of all Indigenous art forms.

Koenig, J., Altman, J.C., Griffiths, A.D. and Kohen, A. 2007. '20 years of Aboriginal woodcarving in Arnhem Land, Australia: Using art sales records to examine the dynamics of sculpture production', *Forests, Trees and Livelihoods*, 17 (1): 43–60, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2007_ForestsTrees.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, economic development, Maningrida Arts and Culture

Summary: This paper outlines trends in the sculpture sector for artists in the Maningrida regional of central Arnhem Land. It is part of an effort to ensure that Indigenous economic livelihoods, which rely on arts production to earn an income, will be maintained for generations to come. Since the 1960s, the number of artists producing sculpture in the region has increased exponentially. The practice plays a significant role in the Indigenous hybrid economy and is one of the very few ways for people to engage with the market. The authors analyse a data set from 1985–2003 of art sales record from Maningrida Arts and Culture, a long-term community art centre. These data are used to examine the changes in production trends, the demographics of the main sculpture group producers including their age, gender and language group, and the elements of individual artist productions. The authors further outline the economic, ecological and social factors that have integrated with the dynamics of the arts market to produce changes in carving production in this region, noting the effects of seasonality in the availability of plant resources during the year. Given the social, cultural and economic potential for carving to contribute strongly to the local economy, they conclude that natural resource availability may govern the future dynamics of the industry. There is thus a need to gain a further understanding of how carvers harvest and manage their resources alongside the ecological realities in which they live.

Altman, J.C. 2007. 'Art business: The Indigenous visual arts infrastructure', in H. Perkins and M. West (eds), *One Sun, One Moon: Indigenous Art in Australia*, Art Gallery of NSW, Sydney, 43–49, available at <http://www.anu.edu.au/caepr-dev/sites/default/files/StaffProfiles/stafffiles/jon-altman//2007_OneSun.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, community art centres, hybrid economy

Summary: Community-controlled art centres are hybrids, consisting of cultural (customary) and commercial (market), Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal, and local and global components. Altman attributes much of the success of Australian Indigenous art to these organisations which collect, document and market Indigenous art. Since the 1970s, a debate has emerged over whether community-controlled arts organisations are fundamentally commercial or cultural enterprises. However this debate overlooks the innate hybridity and interculturality of such organisations. Aboriginal art centres, Altman contends, are critical brokering institutions, and arts advisors play a complex and multifaceted role within this work. An historical overview of the development of Aboriginal art centres is provided, as Altman advises against mainstreaming the Indigenous arts movement. He concludes that Indigenous arts are a successful instance of the culturally appropriate use of particular Indigenous expertise for economic development.

Altman, J.C. 2007. 'Inquiry into Australia's Indigenous Visual Arts and Craft Sector, Submission to the Senate Environment, Communications, Information Technology and the Arts Committee', *Topical Issue No. 04/2007*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2007TI4.php>>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, hybrid economy

Summary: This Topical Issue was provided as a submission to the first inquiry conducted under a new Indigenous affairs framework introduced in 2004. This was one based on a purported whole-of-government approach, mutual obligation, shared responsibility and mainstreaming. Much Indigenous art, Altman argues, relies on living 'on country', and this practice itself depends on land rights and native title, outstations, and access to income support (especially through CDEP). Altman continues that in spite of a 'whole-of-government' discourse, the interdependency and interconnectivity of the Indigenous visual arts sector with other sectors and conditions (such as those mentioned above) is generally overlooked in the Indigenous affairs policy environment. Such interconnectivity is readily acknowledged and illustrated by the hybrid economy model.

Altman, J.C. and Taylor, L. 2009. 'Too many Dreamings: Diversity and change in bark paintings from West Arnhem', in C. Chubb and N. Sever (eds), *Indigenous Art at the Australian National University*, Macmillan, Melbourne, 60–100.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, West Arnhem Land, inter-cultural relations

Summary: Through a discussion of bark paintings from West Arnhem Land, this chapter outlines developing prospects for Indigenous artists from the region to participate in the global high art market, while also recognising the important role of changing intercultural relations in this process. The authors depict the diversity, breadth and depth of these paintings through sub-regional groupings which cross Kakadu National Park and the Stone Country, Kunbalanya, the Mann River Valley, Lower Cadell River and the Glyde River vicinity. They further stress intercultural nature of bark paintings through a discussion of the social relations between artists, scholars and mediating institutions in Canberra and Arnhem Land, with bark paintings being exemplars of compatibility between Indigenous cultural values and western cultural aesthetics and economic prerogatives of the market. The symbiotic and evolving inter-relations among artists, scholars and institutions has enabled a clear role for university-based institutions, one which has been under-estimated in the art history of bark paintings from West Arnhem Land.

Altman, J.C. 2009. 'John Mawurndjul: Art and impact', *Art Monthly Australia*, 226, Summer: 22–5, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2009_J_MawurndjulArtandImpact.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, John Mawurndjul

Summary: This article is an edited transcript of the speech made in honour of John Mawurndjul at the 2009 Melbourne Art Foundation Awards for Visual Arts. Altman pays tribute to Mawurndjul, his thirty years of arts practice, and his impact on contemporary arts practice at local, national and global levels. The artist is celebrated both for his ability to embrace individual creativity encouraged by new global marketing frameworks for Indigenous art, as well as being able to retain techniques of image production which have enormous time depth links to rock art, ceremony and earlier generations of artists. Furthermore, Mawurndjul has opened up

pathways for Indigenous artists in the globalised contemporary art scene. Altman argues that beneath the discourse of despondency about remote Indigenous Australia in contemporary policy, the recognition and celebration of Mawurndjul is of someone who has fought for his rights, identity and livelihood through his exceptional artistic talent.

Altman, J.C. 2009. 'A brief social history of Kuninjku art and the market', in C. Volkenandt and C. Kaufmann (eds), *Between Indigenous Australia and Europe: John Mawurndjul*, Art Histories in Context Series, Reimer, Berlin, 19–28, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/A%20Brief%20Social%20History.pdf>>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, outstations, 'practical reconciliation', Maningrida Arts and Culture, Kuninjku/Gunwinggu Art, mainstreaming, centralisation

Summary: This paper traces and celebrates the social history of the Kuninjku community in Arnhem Land, and the development of Kuninjku art for the market over the last fifty years. This encompasses the cultural, political and economic success of this movement, as well as its revival and potential for Kuninjku futures. Altman argues that the Australian state has recently renewed pressures on Indigenous Australians like Kuninjku to be incorporated in the mainstream. This policy shift is taking place under the rhetoric of 'practical reconciliation', a project which Altman insists is failing in formal statistical terms. These pressures threaten the ability for Kuninjku to maintain their community, language, cultural values and art forms. Alternatively, Altman calls for the recognition and celebration of the Kuninjku art movement, and stresses the need to focus on its contribution to Australia's artistic and cultural heritage.

Altman, J.C. 2009. 'Brokering Kuninjku art: A critical perspective on the complex processes of mediating with the market', in C. Volkenandt and C. Kaufmann (eds), *Between Indigenous Australia and Europe: John Mawurndjul*, Art Histories in Context Series, Reimer, Berlin, 53–59, available at <[http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/Brokering Kuninjku-1.pdf](http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/Brokering%20Kuninjku-1.pdf)>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts market, Kuninjku/Gunwinggu art, outstation movement, John Mawurndjul,

Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation, Maningrida Arts and Culture, neoliberalism

Summary: Through an historical perspective of John Mawurndjul's art, this chapter outlines the complex processes of Indigenous artists' mediation with the market. Altman examines the social basis of Mawurndjul's art, the institutional frameworks that underpin the processes of mediation between Mawurndjul and the global fine arts market, and the role played by local institutions, arts advisors, and wider state policy settings. He argues that a neoliberal project for Indigenous people has little resonance with Kuninjku imperatives or lived artistic realities, and that recent market-based policies of governing fail to understand the complex processes which underpin the success of the Kuninjku arts movement. Emerging indicators further show that the conditions needed to ensure the ongoing vitality and reproduction of this art movement are in place in the new generation of young artists, many of whom are living on country.

Koenig, J., Altman, J.C., and Griffiths, A.D. 2011. 'Indigenous livelihoods and art income: participation, production and returns from woodcarvings in Arnhem Land, north Australia', *Australian Geographer*, 42 (4): 351–369, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2011_Indlivelihoodandartincome.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, cultural maintenance, subsistence economy, hybrid economy, Arnhem Land

Summary: This article addresses the commercialisation of the customary sector for Indigenous people in Arnhem Land and contributes to ongoing assessments of the importance of cash income from Indigenous arts and crafts practices in remote Australia. The authors argue that the significance of these practices to economic hybridity and associated interculturality is poorly understood in current Commonwealth and Northern Territory government policy frameworks. While recent government policies have aimed to enhance private-sector employment, the authors insist that this has resulted in limited improvements in Indigenous employment status. Indigenous participation in the visual arts sector, on the other hand, provides one of few opportunities for market engagement for Indigenous residents on remote lands, and this income makes an important contribution to people's livelihoods. Through a discussion of the sub-sector of carved wooden

sculptures, the authors examine the factors that influence such production as a positive example of Indigenous economic growth and development in northern Australia. When appropriate opportunities exist, they continue, Indigenous people residing in such localities are actively involved in productive activity and are able to engage keenly with the global capitalist market.

Altman, J.C. 2013. Submission to the Australian Government Department of Regional Australia, Local Government, Arts and Sport Review of the Resale Royalty Scheme, Submission No. 40, available at <<http://arts.gov.au/sites/default/files/consultations/Sub%2044%20Jon%20Altman.pdf>>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, art centres, Resale Royalty Scheme

Summary: This submission provides a brief series of recommendations for the review of the Resale Royalty Scheme. Altman expresses an aspiration conducive to those of the *Resale Royalty Right for Visual Arts Act 2009* (the *Resale Act*) to return a proportion of secondary sales of artworks to Indigenous artists and their heirs. In doing so, he addresses three concerns: Whether the law is conceptually sound; whether it has been effectively and efficiently implemented and administered; and whether it has led to any unintended consequences. Altman provides a number of recommendations here, notably on the taxation rate. Under the *Resale Act*, a 5 per cent tax is payable for any secondary sales sold over \$1000. Yet to some extent this is an arbitrary form of taxation, which returns an artist \$45 on a secondary sale of \$1000. A minimum threshold of \$10,000 for a resale tax is more realistic, given the cost of administering individual sales. The Resale Royalty Scheme also presents challenges to art centres who purchase works outright because this is deemed the primary sale – their subsequent retail or wholesale is deemed secondary and attracts a 5 per cent premium. Altman recommends that a resale tax exemption for three years after production be considered to allow for obfuscation between primary and secondary sales to be resolved.

5. Sustainable land-based Indigenous livelihoods

Altman, J.C. 1985. 'Aboriginal outstation communities: Some economic issues', (submission to the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal Affairs' Inquiry into Aboriginal Homeland Centre) in Official Hansard Report (Volume III) of the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal Affairs, Reference: Aboriginal Homeland Centres, Government Printer, Canberra, 20 November 1985, 476–495, available at <http://www.anu.edu.au/caepr-dev/sites/default/files/StaffProfiles/stafffiles/jon-altman/1986_OutstationCommunities.pdf>.

Keywords: Outstations, welfare, Community Development Employment Projects, Momega/Mumeka

Summary: The majority of this submission concerns economic issues at Momega outstation, notably the ability to generate income and the roles and responsibility of government. The submission stresses that while it is difficult to generate income on social security entitlements, people remain dependent on such payments to live at outstations. The main source of other income is derived from producing and selling artefacts. Social security payments are mainly provided as unemployment benefits, yet people on outstations are actually employed, just not in the formal economy. However, because these payments are income tested, they act as a disincentive for people at outstations to generate cash income above the minimum level allowed. Altman argues that if cash income generating schemes are to be established at outstations, then an income support scheme other than unemployment benefits will be required. The CDEP scheme is one such option here because payments generated through the scheme are not income tested, and a crucial 20 per cent capital component is provided with grants. Funding could also be provided to strengthen the subsistence base of outstations as this is the area in which people demonstrate particular knowledge and skill.

Altman, J.C. 1985. 'Aboriginal employment and unemployment at outstations', (submission to the Committee of Review of Aboriginal Employment and Training Programs) in Official Hansard Report (Volume III) of the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal Affairs, Reference: Aboriginal Homeland Centres, Government Printer, Canberra, 20 November 1985, 496–507, available at <http://www.anu.edu.au/caepr-dev/sites/default/files/StaffProfiles/stafffiles/jon-altman/1986_AboriginalEmployment.pdf>.

Keywords: Outstations, subsistence economy, hybrid economy, unemployment benefits, Momega/Mumeka

Summary: This submission concerns Indigenous employment and unemployment at outstations in remote regions of Australia where unemployment is estimated to exceed 50 per cent. Altman refers to situations in remote areas where people have chosen to reoccupy traditional lands and to re-establish productive subsistence activities for domestic use rather than for market exchange. The problem addressed here is that full time, or even part time employment would be incompatible with the land-extensive hunter-gatherer lifestyles that residents in outstation communities choose to pursue. Because the bulk of such production is earmarked for local use rather than market exchange, the significance of these activities is generally ignored by mainstream economists.

Drawing on data collected at Momega, Altman argues for recognition of the significance of such informal activities, and a minimum income support scheme that provides cash supplementation to the subsistence returns of outstations residents. His central argument is that people on outstations are only 'unemployed' according to the criteria of the Euro-Australian society. While it is essential that cash payments continue, a more appropriate payment should replace unemployment benefits. This could be an institution similar to the Income Security Program in Canada, which makes special cash payments to Cree Indians who demonstrate a commitment to living on and off their lands.

Altman, J.C. 1986. 'Aboriginal employment in the informal sector: The outstation case', in D. Wade-Marshall and P. Loveday (eds), *Employment and Unemployment: A Collection of Papers*, North Australia Research Unit, Darwin, 163–74, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1986_EmploymentAndUnemployment.pdf>.

Keywords: Outstations, subsistence economy, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: In this policy-oriented chapter, Altman argues that Indigenous people living at outstation communities are frequently fully employed, yet in the informal rather than formal economy. With the reoccupation of Indigenous lands through the 'outstations movement', a distinct revival in the Indigenous subsistence economy has occurred which is based primarily on hunting, fishing and gathering activities. Despite continued limited market dependence, the mainstay of outstation economies has remained subsistence ('informal' economic activities). Altman draws on data collected since 1979 at Momega outstation in central Arnhem Land, arguing that people living on outstations are in effect fully-employed, notably through the production of goods and services for local use. He uses time allocation, production and social accounts data to demonstrate that this informal economy is both significant and vibrant. In such contexts, unemployment benefits are an inappropriate means for making essential cash transfer payments to residents. Rather, the CDEP scheme, with its flexibility, is a more appropriate system for providing outstation people with minimum income support. Under this scheme, Indigenous definitions of 'work' could be recognised by the wider society and financially rewarded.

Altman, J.C. 1987. 'The economic impact of tourism on the Warmun (Turkey Creek) community, East Kimberley', *East Kimberley Working Paper No. 19*, Centre for Resource and Environmental Studies, ANU, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1987_EastKimberleyWP19.pdf>.

Keywords: Tourism industry, tourism impacts, East Kimberley, Warmun/Turkey Creek

Summary: This study of the economic impact of tourism on the Warmun/Turkey Creek community contributes to a wider assessment of the economic impact of tourism on Indigenous communities in northern Australia, and attempts to identify possible avenues for Indigenous

participation in this industry. Drawing on just a month's fieldwork in the East Kimberley in 1986, Altman examines the economic structure at Warmun, the scale and nature of the tourism industry in the Kimberley region, the economic spinoffs of tourism to the Warmun community, and the future of tourism in the Kimberley. A further range of economic policy issues are raised which Altman argues Indigenous community leaders must consider when contemplating involvement in the tourism industry. These include identifying and defining objectives of becoming involved in the industry, the commercial viability and corporate structures of tourism enterprises, the use of scarce capital resources, and the realistic supply of cultural tourism. The inability for tourism to provide a panacea for Indigenous economic development need is stressed, as is the awareness of Indigenous people in the Kimberley that their own priorities may differ from those of policy makers.

Altman, J.C. 1987. 'The Economic Impact of Tourism on the Mutitjulu Community, Uluru (Ayers Rock – Mount Olga) National Park', *Working Paper No. 7*, Department of Political and Social Change, Research School of Pacific Studies, ANU, Canberra.

Keywords: Tourism industry, sustainability, social costs, Indigenous enterprises, Mutitjulu, Uluru National Park

Summary: This working paper documents Anangu people's involvement in the local economy in the Uluru region and provides an analysis of the economic benefits derived directly and indirectly from participation in the tourism industry. The report contributes to a wider assessment of the economic and social impacts of tourism on the local Mutitjulu community by assessing the economic structure of the community at one moment in time (August 1985). Altman argues that the direct and indirect linkages between Mutitjulu people and tourism are almost exclusively limited to the cash nexus. This directs the central focus to the formal economy within the Mutitjulu community. The economic significance of four Indigenous-owned local enterprises are examined, with an emphasis placed on their functioning and the direct and indirect benefits that flow on to the community. Key findings show limited direct linkages between Anangu employment and income and the tourism industry. Anangu enterprises are highly dependent on the tourist trade even though the direct spinoffs from these businesses are not high. Anangu attitudes to tourism are further examined, as is the trade-off between Anangu economic interests and tourism's social costs.

Altman, J.C. 1987. 'Aboriginal outstation communities: Further economic issues', in Official Hansard Report of the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal Affairs, Reference: Aboriginal Homeland Centres, Government Printer, Canberra, 10 February, 1817–1838, available at <http://www.anu.edu.au/caepr-dev/sites/default/files/StaffProfiles/stafffiles/jon-altman/1987_OutstationCommunities.pdf>.

Keywords: Outstations, Indigenous enterprises, funding, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: This is a supplementary submission to be read in conjunction with Altman's previous submission 'Aboriginal employment and unemployment at outstations', in Official Hansard Report (Volume III) of the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal Affairs (Altman 1985). Seven questions posed by the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal Affairs are addressed here; Altman extends his analysis and argument for recommendations raised in the previous submission. These address the factors which make life at outstations more appealing, the long term future of the outstation movement, and the particular benefits of the CDEP scheme. Altman identifies enterprises suitable for financial support, which he divides into 'export enterprises' and 'import substituting enterprises'. The former involves manufacturing material cultural items for sale from artefact production to a wide range of services to tourists, while the latter refers to local production of goods and services otherwise procured via the market. Further analysis is provided on how, and from where such enterprises can be supported. Altman also considers how to resolve the complex and irregular situation of the Commonwealth Government funding outstations at the same time that the Northern Territory (NT) Government funds Indigenous townships, as well as the projected impacts of various proposed changes to this funding model for Indigenous people in the NT.

*Altman, J.C. 1988. *Aborigines, Tourism, and Development: The Northern Territory Experience*, North Australia Research Unit, Darwin, xvi+345pp.

Keywords: Tourism industry, Indigenous enterprises, Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act, Uluru National Park, Kakadu National Park, Gurig National, Melville Island, Bathurst Island

Summary: This monograph reports the results of a multi-site study of the economic impact of tourism on Aboriginal communities on Aboriginal-owned land in the Northern Territory. It remains the only study to date to assess the impact of tourism on the economic wellbeing of Aboriginal communities at key destinations like Uluru and Kakadu National Parks in the land rights era. The study has been foundational in Altman's associated research on similar tourism impact issues in the east Kimberley region and in the Torres Strait.

This study developed out of Altman's previous work on the social impact of tourism on the Mutitjulu community within Uluru National Park. In the former study, Altman stressed the absence of research on the effects of the growing and projected increase in tourism on Indigenous people, particularly in the Northern Territory (NT). In the present project, Altman finds these concerns to be strongly articulated by Indigenous participants. He stresses the heterogeneity of Indigenous populations and aspirations, and examines the potential economic impact of tourism and the role that the industry could play in changing Indigenous people's marginal socioeconomic status and state dependency, focusing on the NT.

There is an existing assumption that Indigenous ownership of important tourist destinations will constrain tourism growth. This assumption, Altman argues, has not been rigorously examined. A range of tourism policy issues are canvassed, particularly the need for Indigenous people to participate in this industry themselves. Altman further queries the limited direct Indigenous involvement in the tourism sector (is this a structural, cultural or economic issue?), and examines the correlation between people's rights to land and the extent of their involvement in the tourism industry. He assesses the capacity for Indigenous people to effectively control tourism development by participating in the commercial developments or management of the national parks they own.

These concerns are discussed through case studies of Uluru National Park, Kakadu National Park, Gurig National Park and Melville and Bathurst Islands. A number of specific and primarily inter-related policy issues are raised, with emphasis being placed on the political and economic leverage that the Federal Land Rights Act has bestowed on Indigenous land owners.

Altman, J.C. 1989. 'Support services for Aboriginal communities: Some economic and political considerations', in Official Hansard Report of the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal Affairs, Reference: the Effectiveness of Support Services for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Communities, Government Printer, Canberra, 21 March, 2213–24, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1989_sub%20Support%20Services%20for%20Aboriginal%20Communities.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous community self-government, education and training, funding

Summary: This submission concentrates on two aspects of the House of Representatives Inquiry into the effectiveness of support services for Indigenous communities – community management and control, and education and training for community administration, management and community development. A subsequent submission discusses resource services for Indigenous communities and mainstream local government. In this submission Altman examines a broad range of factors that impede Indigenous community self-government before focusing on the three specific issues: funding arrangements, community management, and education and training. The emphasis rests on northern and central Australia, with case study material drawn from Warmun (Turkey Creek), Mutitjulu and Maningrida, and primary attention being directed to the political economy of funding. Altman provides a number of recommendations that may enhance the effectiveness of support services for Indigenous communities.

Altman, J.C. 1989. 'Tourism dilemmas for Aboriginal Australians', *Annals of Tourism Research*, 16 (4): 456–76, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1989_AnnalsofTourismResearch.pdf>.

Keywords: Tourism industry, economic development, Uluru National Park, Kakadu National Park, Gurig National Park, Melville Island, Bathurst Island

Summary: There is an optimistic belief that tourism will become a leading economic sector and provide a substitute for the Territory's high dependency on federal funds. Altman argues that this optimism ignores two central paradoxes: Firstly, that tourism growth in the Northern Territory (NT) is dependent on Indigenous land and the environment, and the NT government is

dependent on Indigenous interests if its policies are to be implemented. Secondly, the definition of 'development' needs to be understood beyond cash and employment to include social and cultural issues, the potential for increased political power, and the possibility of widened future options for Indigenous people, as expressed by the Aboriginal Land Councils.

In this article, interactions between Indigenous people and tourism from empirical data collected at four NT locations – Uluru National Park, Kakadu National Park, Gurig National Park, and Melville and Bathurst Islands – are analysed. These data show that the economic significance of tourism and associated dilemmas of development are highly variable, with differences existing in land tenure, tourism management, Indigenous controls over tourism, the nature of access, and the nature of attraction. Altman assesses the current economic benefits of tourism across the four case studies in broad per capita terms. He divides the economic opportunities in the tourism sector into direct, indirect and induced forms, and notes that the greater economic impacts of tourism are frequently indirect or induced. The implication here is that where tourism is invited, Indigenous interests have great economic leverage – and associated benefit.

Altman further identifies three dilemmas of tourism engagement. First, while greater involvement in tourism provides access to cash and less dependency on welfare and government, it may still leave people living in poverty, and possibly poorer with tourism than without. The two main avenues for economic advancement are enterprise ownership and employment in the tourism industry, yet both options are complex and highly problematic. Second, there is a need to minimise non-economic costs to Indigenous people, which are extremely difficult to quantify. It is asked whether commercial involvement will provide Indigenous communities with greater regional leverage as well as the means to minimise social, cultural, environmental and economic costs associated with tourism. Indigenous people may face the dilemma of whether to get involved in commercial enterprises for non-economic reasons, or to allow non-Indigenous interests to run enterprises with the associated risk that they will experience all the social costs and none of the economic benefits of tourism. Finally, while the costs of tourism can obviously be reduced if tourism is discouraged, this will of course limit the possibilities for economic advancement.

Altman, J.C. 1991. 'The economic impact of tourism on the Mutitjulu community', in *Central Land Council, Pitjantjatjara Council and Mutitjulu Community Sharing the Park: Anangu Initiatives in Ayers Rock Tourism*, Institute for Aboriginal Development, Alice Springs, 73–112, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1991_MutitjuluTourism.pdf>.

Keywords: Tourism industry, Indigenous arts and crafts industry, Mutitjulu, Uluru National Park

Summary: In this chapter Altman details the complex ways in which Anangu people at Mutitjulu community have attempted to solve the tension between the cultural and commercial in the development of Indigenous tourism within Uluru National Park. Despite the high demand for cultural tourism, little research has been undertaken on demand for Indigenous culture, how it can be 'authentically' marketed, how many tourists will pay for it, and what type of product Indigenous people are willing to supply. Altman addresses these concerns through the Anangu experience. In this example, cultural tourism relies on the maintenance of Anangu culture. However Anangu, in ensuring the social reproduction of their culture, constrain the supply of labour for tourism in order to improve their marginal economic status. To address this paradox, Altman examines issues around Anangu attitudes to employment in tourist-related activities. He further considers the management structures required for Anangu commercial developments, the apparent Anangu preference for indirect involvement in tourism, and problems around restricted access to venture capital and the use of rental and gate monies. Although the Mutitjulu community still relies heavily on social security and other income from the public sector, Altman shows that Anangu involvement in tourism has gradually increased. Most of this involvement is indirect and takes advantage of tourists' interests in Anangu material culture.

Altman, J.C. 1991. 'The economic impact of tourism at Uluru National Park on other Aboriginal communities in Central Australia', in *Central Land Council, Pitjantjatjara Council and Mutitjulu Community Sharing the Park: Anangu Initiatives in Ayers Rock Tourism*, Institute for Aboriginal Development, Alice Springs, 113–136, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1991_UluruTourism.pdf>.

Keywords: Tourism industry, impacts, Maruku Arts and Crafts, Yulara, Uluru National Park

Summary: Following the chapter 'The economic impact of tourism on the Mutitjulu community' annotated above, this chapter outlines the extent to which Anangu enterprises at Uluru National Park have an economic impact on other Indigenous communities in central Australia. Altman shows that at the regional level, the Anangu run Maruku Arts and Crafts creates real economic benefits for Indigenous homelands and communities, and has stimulated overall production of Indigenous artefacts in South Australia, Western Australia and the Northern Territory. The regional impact of Yulara however is minimal. Tourism expenditure at the Yulara resort only generates minimal revenue for regional and Northern Territory interests, with the greatest benefits from this development flowing to the national economy. Altman further outlines a number of forms of Indigenous participation which are emerging in the regional tourism industry.

Altman, J.C. and Allen, L.M. 1992. 'Living off the land in national parks: Issues for Aboriginal Australians', in J. Birckhead, T. De Lacy and L. Smith (eds), *Aboriginal Involvement in Parks and Protected Areas*, Aboriginal Studies Press, Canberra, 117–136, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1992_AboriginalInvolvement.pdf>.

Keywords: Customary economy, resource rights, state and territories legislations, national parks, Aboriginal diet, income support options, political economy of resource exploitation

Summary: This chapter is a review of the Australian literature on the economic aspects of Aboriginal subsistence activities in national parks. It shows that Aboriginal subsistence rights in these parks vary greatly across the country's states and territories, and are intertwined in complex interplays between local Aboriginal and other interests (e.g. tourism and conservation). The review also proposes Aboriginal subsistence activities as an important alternative source of income, especially in remote and very remote areas where mainstream employment opportunities are limited.

The economic significance of Aboriginal subsistence activities in national parks has been poorly researched in Australia and is almost entirely limited to qualitative and anecdotal evidence. Aboriginal subsistence economy issues remain marginalised in policy and national park debates. In this context, the authors stress an urgent need for research which examines this sector of Aboriginal economies, coupled with studies looking

into the contemporary impacts of resource exploitation on wildlife.

Altman, J.C. and Allen, L.M. 1992. 'Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander participation in the informal economy: Statistical and policy implications' in J.C. Altman (ed), *A National Survey of Indigenous Australians: Options and Implications*, Research Monograph No. 3, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, 138–151, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/mono/1992RM3.php>>.

Keywords: Indigenous statistics, Royal Commission into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody, historic of socioeconomic data collection, collection challenges, definition of Aboriginality, nature of Indigenous population, cultural appropriateness, informal economy

Summary: Since the incorporation of data on Indigenous populations in the national census, statistics on employment have essentially focussed on mainstream paid employment. In this chapter, Altman and Allen argue that to accurately portray the economic circumstances of Indigenous peoples, particular those living in remote and very remote contexts, a National Survey of Indigenous Australian will need to use a definition of employment that includes Indigenous participation in the informal economy.

Altman, J.C. and Finlayson, J. 1993. 'Aborigines, tourism and sustainable development', *Journal of Tourism Studies*, 4 (1): 38–50, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1993_JofTourismStudies.pdf>.

Keywords: Tourism industry, tourism development, ecological sustainability

Summary: This article examines whether the development of an ecologically sustainable tourism industry is a viable means of increasing economic opportunities for Indigenous people in remote, rural and urban areas. The authors argue that the assumption that tourism can create jobs in areas of high Indigenous unemployment is problematic, questioning the compatibility of the demand side of the tourism industry with the supply of goods and services by Indigenous people themselves. The viability of such involvement, they continue, will depend on the successful integration of commercial success, cultural integrity and social cohesion, and the maintenance of the physical environment. Any successful

tourism development will also require an appropriate rate of development.

A previous version was published as Altman, J.C. and Finlayson, J. 1992. 'Aborigines, tourism and sustainable development', *Discussion Paper No. 26*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/DP/1992_DP26.pdf>.

Altman, J.C. 1993. 'Indigenous Australians in the National Tourism Strategy: Impact, sustainability and policy issues', *Discussion Paper No. 37*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/DP/1993_DP37.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous tourism

Summary: This discussion paper was written during the recession that occurred in the early 1990s, at a time where there was growing pressure to find employment niches for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples under the 1987 Aboriginal Employment Development Policy. The paper outlines a number of dilemmas, paradoxes and concerns facing both the tourism industry and Indigenous peoples which have arisen from the growing policy impetus for Indigenous people to participate in tourism. From a macro-policy perspective, 'Aboriginality' is one element that makes Australia a unique tourist destination. It is assumed therefore that increased Indigenous participation will result in greater potential for marketing the distinctiveness of the Australian experience. Altman assesses the demand and supply components of Indigenous cultures as a tourism destination, before outlining a series of impact and sustainability issues and policy considerations for the future. At the heart of his argument is the need to be realistic in policy development, and to supply various options for Indigenous people's industry participation. These options and their outcomes must also be gradual, rigorously evaluated and slowly nurtured, while also recognising that tourism will not provide an instant panacea for Indigenous economic disadvantage. Significant industry participation will only occur in the medium to long term following product development, testing and marketing. However, such a gradual approach may be unpopular with policy-makers.

Altman, J.C. 1993. 'Tourism and Aboriginal communities', in B. Faulkner and M. Kennedy (eds), *Australian Tourism Outlook Forum 1992*, Bureau of Tourism Research, Canberra, 79–88, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1993_AusTourism.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous tourism Industry, tourism sustainability, NT

Summary: Altman argues that despite a growing push to increase Indigenous participation in the tourism industry, discussion of how this involvement will take place frequently lacks policy and economic realism. The tourism sector has been identified as an important potential arena for greater Indigenous involvement, alongside growing pressure to find employment for Indigenous people under the Aboriginal Employment Development Policy. However, there is inconclusive evidence and little empirical research on both the supply and demand sides of this sector of the tourism industry and its long-term commercial viability. Nor is it clear whether projections of Indigenous tourism growth are sensitive to the level of Indigenous participation in the industry. Focusing on the Northern Territory experience, this paper outlines a number of the paradoxes, sustainability and policy issues which require both recognition and resolution, and which affect both the tourism sector and Indigenous people in the development of 'sustainable' tourism. Altman argues that a cautious, gradual and measured approach is essential if sustainable Indigenous tourism is to occur, alongside varied options for Indigenous industry participation. The great potential of indirect involvement in the industry, particularly through the sale of arts and crafts, is also frequently underestimated and deserves greater attention.

Altman, J.C. 1993. 'Where to now? Some strategic Indigenous tourism policy issues', in Office of Northern Development (ed), *Indigenous Australians and Tourism: A Focus on Northern Australia*, Office of Northern Development, Darwin, 86–90, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1993_IndigenousAustralians.pdf>.

Keywords: Tourism industry, economic development

Summary: In this chapter, Altman reviews central issues that were raised at the Indigenous Australians and Tourism Conference in Darwin, June 1993. He critiques aspects of the conference itself and maps out strategic

future directions for Indigenous involvement in the tourism industry in Northern Australia. The outcomes of this conference were submitted to the formulation of the National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Island Tourism Industry Strategy.

Several of the definitional issues that arose through the conference are discussed. These include the difficulties in defining and statistically delineating the tourism 'industry', itself a very complex series of inter-related industries; the over-emphasis on the 'cultural tour' in the supply side of the industry and neglect of the contribution of arts and crafts, as well as a wide range of small-scale Indigenous enterprises; the excessive attention directed towards cultural tourism and the problem of glamorising particular images of Indigenous Australia; and the tendency to overlook indirect tourism and its economic spin-offs. The full extent and diversity of the industry must be recognised when considering strategic issues.

Altman further emphasises two general policy concerns. Firstly, limited high quality research exists on the supply of Indigenous elements of tourism. Little is known about Indigenous views regarding, and aspiration for industry involvement. Crucial distinctions must be made between situations where tourism is imposed, invited, wanted, uninvited and not allowed. Altman stresses that this absence of research, or an unwillingness to use existing research, has resulted in enormous variations and errors in the estimation of tourism demand for Indigenous elements of the industry. Secondly, there are diverse and conflicting views on the role of government in the industry. Altman outlines a critical and positive role for government in tourism development, one which most likely needs to be indirect. Of equal importance, he insists, is the private sector's critical role to play if increased industry participation is to occur.

Altman concludes with three possible strategies: Establishing exclusive or non-exclusive contractual arrangements between tour operators and Indigenous people; attracting venture capital from the private sector for Indigenous or joint tourism enterprise; and exploring options for strategic regionalism and devolution.

Altman, J.C., Arthur, W.S. and Bek, H. 1994. 'Indigenous participation in commercial fisheries in Torres Strait: A preliminary discussion', *Discussion Paper No. 73*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1994DP73.php>>.

Keywords: Fisheries, marine resources, Torres Strait Regional Authority, Torres Strait

Summary: This paper details the regulatory framework for managing marine resources in the Torres Strait and the value and potential for expansion of the commercial fishing sector. The paper was written at a time where Torres Strait political leadership was pushing for the recognition of Islander property rights in fisheries. This push intensified following the establishment of the Torres Strait Regional Authority (TSRA) in 1994. The authors examine the aim of the TSRA to create a sustainable regional economic base, focusing on the commercial fisheries sector. The complex policy options available are explored before turning to focus on Islander participation in the industry and barriers and incentives which affect this participation. These include licensing arrangements, the uneven distribution of population and fisheries resources across the Torres Strait, infrastructure and skill requirement, and collateral and capital needs. The authors propose options for establishing well-defined Islander property rights and their policy implications. Longer term research is crucial to create a quantitative baseline for Indigenous involvement in the industry, and to engage Indigenous participation and performance over time.

Altman, J.C., Bek, H.J. and Roach, L.M. 1996. 'Use of wildlife by Indigenous Australians: economic and policy perspectives', in M. Bomford and J. Caughley (eds), *Sustainable Use of Wildlife by Aboriginal Peoples and Torres Strait Islanders*, Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra, 77–94, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1996_SustainableUse.pdf>.

Keywords: Customary economy, land rights and native title, Natural Resource Management, commercial and subsistence uses of land, freshwater and marine resources, income support, Aboriginal diet

Summary: Written only a few years after the landmark Mabo decision, this chapter emphasises the economic significance of Indigenous Australian customary uses of wildlife on their land and beyond. The authors argue

that official surveys continue to lack the necessary mechanisms required to estimate the economic value of Indigenous subsistence activities. However, examples from across the country demonstrate that in some situations where other economic opportunities are lacking, customary activities are the primary forms of work. In such contexts, these activities account for as much as 64 per cent of the total (cash and imputed) income. Based on this information, the authors urge policy makers to recognise Indigenous uses of wildlife as a worthy economic option and to put in place appropriate income support mechanisms to stimulate such activities.

Altman, J.C. 1996. 'Coping with locational advantage: Tourism and economic development at Seisia community, Cape York Peninsula', *The Journal of Tourism Studies*, 7 (1): 58–71, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1996_JofTourismStudies.pdf>.

Keywords: Tourism industry, Seisia community, Cape York Peninsular

Summary: This article continues Altman's analysis of tourism as a key driver of Indigenous economic development. Important limits and limitations to this development are assessed through a detailed case-study of the economic impacts of Indigenous tourism on the Seisia community, a Torres Strait islander community on the northeast coast of the Cape York Peninsula. The stated aim of the Seisia Island Council leadership is to develop tourism to a stage where the community is independent of government by the year 2000. Altman finds this aim to be overambitious as it requires considerable infrastructure, product development and aggressive marketing. In his detailed discussion of the Seisia community's existing relationship with tourism, he shows how the development potential that can be derived from tourism has both boundaries and restrictions. Particular to the Seisia case is a need for an overarching tourism development plan to allow the community to respond proactively. Also required are land management strategies to both monitor and control growing numbers of visitors in a fragile environment, the development of a marketing strategy and identity for the community, and realistic work experience and training for those who might find employment in the industry. Altman insists that policy realism and existing evidence shows that in the medium-term, a community goal of reduced government dependency might be more appropriate.

A version of this paper was published as: Altman, J.C. 1995. 'Coping with locational advantage: the economic

development potential of tourism at Seisia community, Cape York Peninsula', *Discussion Paper No. 98*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1995DP98.php>>.

Altman, J.C., Roach, L.M. and Liddle, L. 1997. 'Utilisation of native wildlife by Indigenous Australians: Commercial considerations', *Discussion Paper No. 135*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1997DP135.php>>.

Keywords: Indigenous uses of wildlife, subsistence economy, commercial development, Indigenous knowledge, Natural Resource Management

Summary: Indigenous Australians hold special interests in the commercial utilisation of wildlife. This stems from their own aspirations to use these species commercially, as well as the ability of such practice to impact on their subsistence use of, and religious connections with the targeted species.

This discussion paper is based on a submission made to the Senate Rural and Regional Affairs and Transport References Committee Inquiry into the commercial use of Australian native wildlife. It offers a research and economic-policy orientated perspective on Indigenous interests in customary and commercial uses and management of wildlife, including the participation in formulation of management plans. The authors recommend an enhanced role for Indigenous participation in management, possibly via joint management arrangements. This must be a participation driven by Indigenous aspirations based on existing local Indigenous organisations, such as Land Councils, and informed by both Indigenous and scientific knowledge. They further recommend an examination of the rights that Indigenous peoples have in relation to targeted species, and the need to explore the benefits of joint ventures (possibly with non-Indigenous partners) to improve Indigenous economic benefits from commercial utilisation of wildlife. It is acknowledged that in some circumstances, non-commercial uses of species may make greater economic sense than their commercial use.

The authors conclude by suggesting that given the limited mainstream economic opportunities on Aboriginal owned land, measures should be taken to ensure that expansion of non-Indigenous interests does not impede subsistence and commercial options available to Indigenous people.

Altman, J.C., Gillespie, D. and Palmer, K. 1998. *National Review of Resource Agencies Servicing Indigenous Communities*, ATSIC, Canberra.

Keywords: Outstations, homelands, housing, Outstation Resource Agencies

Summary: The authors were asked to review the operation and funding of agencies known as Outstation Resource Agencies (ORAs) that service outstations. Though this consultancy, they address areas of management, performance, cost effectiveness, cost recovery and other issues that relate to achieving the best results with the most efficient use of resources. The aim is to improve the delivery of services to outstation residents and enhance the quality of life in such environments, as alongside land rights and recognition of native title rights, outstations provide real opportunity for autonomy and self-determination. The review begins cautiously, with the authors stressing that the issues they witnessed around resource intensive practices, inefficiencies, lack of funding equity, poor planning and bad management must all be addressed systematically and strategically. They make considered recommendations in the areas of funding and accountability, staffing and training issues, resource management and cost recovery, and future directions for agencies with a range of implementation options. They note that these strategies cannot be at the expense of risking the entire outstations movement and Indigenous people's rights to live on their land.

Altman, J.C. and Schwab, R.G. 1998. 'Staffing and Training Issues', in J.C. Altman, D. Gillespie and K. Palmer (eds), *National Review of Resource Agencies Servicing Indigenous Communities*, 195–220, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1998_NationalReview.pdf>.

Keywords: Outstations, Outstation Resource Agencies, service delivery,

Summary: This discussion paper contributes to the National Review of Outstation Resource Agencies (ORAs) commissioned by ATSIC. ORAs are too diverse and complex to fit into simple geographic or structural typologies, and the authors focus on prominent broad and general issues. The diversity of ORAs makes it difficult to provide overarching directions on appropriate staffing levels or key staff competencies. Furthermore, while ORAs are funded by two ATSIC programs, their functions with outstations and homelands actually extend well beyond these stipulated roles and responsibilities.

The Review suggests that most ORAs would welcome rigorous scrutiny according to appropriate program and project performance indicators. However such assessments need a commitment to funding equity and an understanding of the crucial role that ORAs play in the long-term viability of outstations.

Altman, J.C., Whitehead, P. and Griffiths, A.D. 2003. 'Invasion of the rubbish frogs', *Nature Australia*, Spring: 44–51, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2003_NatureAustralia.pdf>.

Keywords: Natural Resource Management, Kuninju/Gunwinggu people, Arnhem Land

Summary: In this article, Altman et al. outline the urgent need to address the infestation of the introduced cane toad and its spread across some of Australia's most biologically diverse landscapes, including Arnhem Land. Native to Central and South America, these growing populations of cane toads are depleting the Australian native predators that attack them. In Australia, concerns for charismatic, rare and endangered wildlife have contributed to overlooking the threats imposed to the nation's commonplace wildlife and biodiversity, as well as to the livelihoods of local people who rely on these food sources, such as the Kuninju people of central Arnhem Land. Treating this issue seriously could be done by supporting the role that Kuninju and others already play in caring for large areas of land. The most difficult conservation problems in the north of the country stem from loss of human presence; unoccupied land invites other biological invaders, and reserve management does not mimic the effects of people moving through country looking for food and using fire to foster valued wildlife abundance. There is a need to better support existing organisations who undertake such practices already, and to recognise their national conservation role.

Altman, J.C. and Whitehead, P.J. 2003. 'Caring for country and sustainable Indigenous development: Opportunities, constraints and innovation', *Working Paper No. 20*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/WP/2003WP20.php>>.

Keywords: Indigenous uses of wildlife, Caring for Country, subsistence economy, commercial development, Indigenous knowledge, Cultural and Natural Resource Management

Summary: The outstation movement from the 1970s is characterised here as a form of community-based natural resource management that arose much earlier than the formalised 'Caring for Country' programs. The authors describe the extent of the challenge to manage remote and environmentally significant tracts of land on the Indigenous estate, and consider what is at stake if this challenge is not met. Indigenous Australians live in diverse situations and have various aspirations for managing their land and natural resources. This paper discusses the constraints or barriers faced by Indigenous land managers. These include poor public understanding and support of the role of Indigenous knowledge and practice in generating public benefit; a perception that Indigenous customary use of wildlife is a threat rather than being an effective form of environmental management and socio-cultural engagement; finding a balance between 'anti-use' and over-allocation of wildlife; and accessing firearms for feral animal management and subsistence hunting. The authors suggest that many of these obstacles, particularly those regarding regulations, have their origins in particular perceptions and values of the dominant society rather than having developed in light of evidence-based analysis. This paper calls for Landcare and Natural Heritage Trust funding in northern Australia to be reoriented towards combining Indigenous 'on country' natural resource management practices of various kinds with biodiversity conservation. The authors stress that Aboriginal people in northern Australia are uniquely equipped to work, in concert with others, towards the sustainable and equitable management of resources.

Altman, J.C. 2003. 'Aboriginal access to firearms for wildlife harvesting: A policy proposal', *Topical Issue No. 02/2003*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2003TI2.php>>.

Keywords: Indigenous uses of wildlife, access to firearms, Maningrida, Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation, outstations, customary economy

Summary: This Topical Issue is based on a research project examining wildlife harvesting by Aboriginal outstation residents in the Maningrida region in 2003, and draws on the comparative baseline of Altman's 1979–80 data. Findings from this research show that Aboriginal access to firearms has decreased over the past 20 years, and that when outstation residents do have access to firearms, they are of poor quality. Altman calls for this issue to be addressed, given that wildlife harvesting is an important element of the customary economy on outstations in Arnhem Land. He proposes, to this

end, that the Northern Territory Government creates a position for a person of relevant experience and expertise to assist Aboriginal adults in gaining a gun licence to purchase and use guns safely. The Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation is presented as an example of a group going down this path in broad terms, and Altman stresses that through this avenue the customary economy and the benefits it enables could be enhanced. This proposal was also covered in *Land Rights News* in March 2003.

Altman, J.C. 2003. 'People on country, healthy landscapes and sustainable Indigenous economic futures: The Arnhem land case', *The Drawing Board: An Australian Review of Public Affairs*, 4 (2): 65–82, available at <<http://www.australianreview.net/journal/v4/n2/altman.pdf>>.

Keywords: Cultural and Natural Resource Management, hybrid economy, caring for country, community-based ranger programs

Summary: Indigenous Australians living on and managing country generate local, regional and national economic, social and ecological benefits. In previous decades, it was assumed that outstation living presented both ecological and economic risks. However, recent scientific evidence indicates that unpopulated or unevenly populated landscapes are potentially a far greater environmental risk than populated landscapes. Customary economic participation is presented here as 'caring for country'. Challenges to successful Indigenous land management are outlined, particularly in Arnhem Land, and solutions are suggested. These include better institutional arrangements, more steady and reliable funding for key initiatives such as community-based ranger programs, more equitable support (compared with National Parks and World Heritage areas), and appropriate recognition of the benefits that Indigenous people living on country produces. Expanding the hybrid economy in Arnhem Land might also match local Indigenous desires and national policy goals. The 'People on Country' project develops and investigates many of the themes put forward in this article.

Altman, J.C. 2005. The governance of outstations in the Maningrida region, north-central Arnhem Land, and the challenges posed by the new arrangements, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/others/governance/Occasional-papers11-1190988000.php>>.

Keywords: Outstations, Maningrida, Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation governance, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: As part of the Indigenous Community Governance Project (ICGP), this paper examines how western (corporate) and customary (kin-based) forms of governance are balanced in the operations of the Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation (BAC), a successful Outstation Resource Agency (ORA). Over its 26 years of existence (to 2005), BAC has effectively addressed a number of management issues and adjusted to multiple challenges. New arrangements based on a Commonwealth and Northern Territory joined-up approach, termed by Altman as 'metropolitan managerialism', are posing new risks to the organisation. In this paper, Altman argues that this metropolitan management approach adopted by Canberra has generated interferences that are likely to undermine the capacity development and legitimacy of organisations such as BAC, and risk impacting negatively on the management of outstations.

Koenig, J, Altman, J.C., and Griffiths, A.D. 2005. "Too many trees!": Aboriginal woodcarvers in Australia', in A. Cunningham, B. Belcher and B. Campbell (eds), *Carving Out a Future: Forests, Livelihoods and the International Woodcarving Trade*, Earthscan, London, 135–146, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2005_CarvingOut.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous arts and crafts industry, sustainability, Maningrida

Summary: This chapter examines the historical aspect of Indigenous woodcarving in Australia within the development of the Indigenous art industry. It identifies a series of gaps which must be addressed in order to ensure the ecological, socio-cultural and economic sustainability of this practice. The authors examine the production of wooden sculpture for market sale through a case study from the Maningrida region of central Arnhem Land. In this area, the arts industry is often the only means by which individuals can increase their cash income levels. Wood carving, one of the fastest

growing sectors of local production in this region, is an innovative way of expressing regional cultural themes. The growth of this sector is not only a product of market demand, but stems from increased interest in producing sculpture and the diversification of production, as well as a growing number of carvers who are women. However, given the growth of carving in remote regions of Australia, combined with a lack of available data, it is unclear if there are established Indigenous processes to ensure sustainable species use in the face of growing market demand. The question yet to be resolved is how Indigenous knowledge systems will adapt to cope with competing demands and restrictions placed on the commercial exploitation of their natural resources. These local problems will require local solutions, enhanced access to appropriate natural resource management information, and planning and monitoring to ensure that this industry is sustainable both now and in the future.

Altman, J.C. and Buchanan, G. 2005. 'Some Comments on the MACC Taskforce on Dugong and Marine Turtle Populations, *Draft Sustainable and Legal Indigenous Harvest of Marine Turtles and Dugongs in Australia—A National Approach*, Submission to the MACC Taskforce on Dugong and Marine Turtle Populations, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2005TI8.php>>.

Keywords: Indigenous harvesting of wildlife, Native Title customary rights, Community-based natural resource management, Marine and Coastal Committee

Summary: Adopting the standpoints of Indigenous stakeholders, Altman and Buchanan identify and comment on a range of issues associated with the 'Sustainable and Legal Indigenous Harvest of Marine Turtles and Dugongs in Australia - A National Approach', proposed by the Marine And Coastal Committee (MACC) Taskforce on Dugong and Marine Turtle Populations. Among other issues, they question the strong focus on Indigenous harvesting of these species, given that the *Draft* acknowledged the absence of hard data and recognised that a wide range of human and non-human induced factors impact on these species mortality rates. The authors recommend that stronger support be given for Indigenous community-based management and Indigenous communities' involvement in planning and monitoring of these species.

Many of these recommendations were adopted by the task force. <<http://www.environment.gov.au/resource/>

[sustainable-harvest-marine-turtles-and-dugongs-australia](#)>.

Altman, J.C. and Dillon, M.C. 2005. 'Commercial development and natural resource management on the Indigenous estate: A profit-related investment proposal', *Economic Papers*, 24 (3): 249–62, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2005_EconomicPapers.pdf>.

Keywords: Land rights, Native Title, Cultural and Natural Resource Management, Innovation Investment Fund Program, hybrid economy

Summary: The changes in the institutional architecture of land tenure in remote Australia brought about by the Aboriginal Land Right Act 1976 (Northern Territory) and Native Title Act 1993 have created a policy gap, particularly with respect to commercial development and Cultural and Natural Resource Management (CNRM) on Indigenous land. With this gap comes the risks associated with under-investment in CNRM, and a lack of commercial opportunities likely to be detrimental to Indigenous future economic and social wellbeing, as well as to national and international interests in terms of ecological vulnerability. In this article, the authors further argue that failure to recognise the contemporary interplay between market-based and kin-based economies in Aboriginal Australia can lead to inappropriate and inadequate policy frameworks. Hence this article explores the role of government as risk manager and the possibility to put in place what they called the Innovation Investment Fund Program, a profit-related investment scheme designed to assist development and natural resource management on the Indigenous territory.

This paper was also published as Altman, J.C. and Dillon 2004. 'A profit-related investment scheme for the Indigenous estate', *Discussion Paper No. 270*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://search.informit.com.au/fullText;dn=200608995;res=APAFT>>.

Gray, M.C. and Altman, J.C. 2006. 'The economic value of harvesting wild resources to the Indigenous community of the Wallis Lake Catchment, NSW', *Family Matters*, 75: 10–19, available at <<http://www.aifs.gov.au/institute/pubs/fm2006/fm75/ja.pdf>>.

Keywords: Natural Resource Management, Customary sector, Wallis Lake

Summary: There are significant policy interests in the effects of the regulatory environment on the ability of Indigenous people to undertake customary harvesting of wild resources. This article presents research commissioned by the NSW Government Department of Environment and Conservation on the economic benefits accrued by Indigenous people living in the Wallis Lake catchment from the direct use of wild resources. Relatively little research exists at this time on the economic aspects of Indigenous peoples' use of wild resources, and this report develops and describes the early development and testing of a cost-effective methodology. The harvesting of wild resources for consumption makes an important contribution to these people's livelihoods, and it is hoped that the methodology and survey instrument pilot tested here will be used by local councils to sponsor future studies on the issue as part of the NSW government's ongoing Comprehensive Coastal Assessment process.

This paper was published previously as Gray, M.C., Altman, J.C., and Halasz, N. 2005. 'The economic value of wild resources to the Indigenous community of the Wallis Lake catchment', *Discussion Paper No. 272*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/DP/2005_DP272.pdf>.

Altman, J.C. 2006. 'Inconvenient facts: Denigrating Aboriginal outstations as "cultural museums" ignores the facts', *Arena Magazine*, 82: 9–10, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/2006_Arena82.pdf>.

Keywords: Evidence-based policy, ideology, policy realism, remote Australia

Summary: In this article, Altman calls for a shift from emotion and ideology to evidence-based policy making for Indigenous people in remote Australia. Altman writes in response to a speech by then Senator Vanstone, and the suggestion, picked up by the media, that outstations are not viable. Altman highlights what he sees as a broad inconsistency in Indigenous public policy which underpins this assumption. On the one hand, policies that facilitate land and native title claims, and associated land ownership, have underpinned the vibrant and internationally celebrated art communities at such Indigenous outstations. With land rights and self-determination, Indigenous people chose to return to live on the customary lands that they now 'own' under Australian law. Another set of policies and policy

proposals look to undermine the capacity of people to reside in, and make a livelihood from this land. Goods and services produced at outstations also generate benefits to people's livelihoods and the nation, notably the highly successful Indigenous art movement. In such circumstances, Altman advocates that this success must be celebrated rather than demeaned. He concludes that mainstream solutions to these unusual Indigenous circumstances are ultimately unsound and lacking in evidence.

Altman, J.C. 2006. 'The future of Indigenous Australia', *Arena Magazine*, 84: 8–10, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/2006_Arena.pdf>.

Keywords: Welfare dependency, responsibility, the Indigenous estate, value, Natural Resource Management, subsistence economy

Summary: In this piece, Altman pushes for the need to radically rethink the economic possibilities in regional and remote Australia. Growing public discourse, policy debates and media have focused on the issue of 'welfare dependency' in remote Indigenous communities. Yet the 1200 discrete communities across the Indigenous estate are a product of colonial policies and disregard, with considerable evidence showing that in any equitable needs-based criteria, such communities remain relatively neglected. To blame excessive welfare dependency for the social problems faced by such communities ignores the complexity of Indigenous marginalisation and disadvantage today. Altman stresses that any choice between market engagement and welfare dependency in such locations is a false one – many Indigenous people have little choice but to access welfare if they choose to live on the land they own or in the communities they have inhabited for decades.

Altman outlines and critiques what he sees as four broad options available for policy makers. In direct opposition to calls to depopulate remote communities, he argues for a new way of thinking which focuses on Indigenous livelihoods and the recognition of new forms of property. This requires a fundamentally different hybrid economy which consists of not only the free market but also includes state and customary sectors. Such a path would recognise the important role of the customary sector, particularly in areas of natural resource management and bio-diversity conservation. It would acknowledge the regional, national and global contribution of enhanced Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders activity in the areas of biodiversity conservation, species and

environmental management, as well as carbon abatement and sequestration that are associated with effective fire management and healthy landscapes. Altman stresses a need to shift the national imagination regarding the cost of Indigenous people living on and maintaining country, regions which comprise 20 per cent of the continent.

Whitehead, P.J., Gorman, J., Griffiths, A.D., Wightman, G. Massarella, H. and Altman, J.C., 2006. 'Feasibility of Small Scale Commercial Native Plant Harvests by Indigenous Communities', Rural Industries Research and Development Corporation (RIRRDC Publication No 04/149), Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Reports/2006_commerical-native-plant-harvest.pdf>.

Keywords: Development of small-scale enterprises, commercialisation of native plant products, NT, Community Development Employment Projects, economy

Summary: Drawing on five case studies from remote Indigenous communities of the Northern Territory, this report explores the social, commercial and ecological implications of small-scale and selective commercial harvesting of native plants. The authors find that continued government support of such practices at the development phase, such as through CDEP, is needed for such small-scale Aboriginal enterprises to succeed.

Several options for such support are outlined, each of which depends on pre-existing infrastructure and resourcing. The authors argue that commercial viability needs to embrace the legitimacy of a 'hybrid' economy in which enterprises of this sort can emerge and grow using state support on a number of fronts, particularly education and training. The report concludes by recommending an assessment of the market value of products with authenticated connection to Indigenous harvest and processing, and that overseas markets for botanical medicines linked with Aboriginal practices be explored. Further emphasis is placed on the need for continued government support during the enterprise development phase to help overcome the difficulties of remoteness, and to better match government regulation to the scale of native plant use.

Altman, J.C. and Kerins, S. 2008. Evidence to Senate Standing Committee on Rural and Regional Affairs and Transport Inquiry into Natural Resource Management and Conservation Challenges, Topical Issue No. 15/2008, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2008TI16.php>>.

Keywords: PoC, Working on Country program, State of the Indigenous estate, populated landscapes, abolishment of CDEP, payment for environmental services

Summary: Through their existing work, particularly their involvement in the action research project *People on Country*, Altman and Kerins have examined and documented the ecological and economic benefits generated by Indigenous groups living and working on country. In this submission, the authors critique the Australian government focus on mainstream economic forms of employment. Such option, they stress, are extremely limited in remote and very remote Indigenous communities, and will contribute to depopulation by pushing people and expertise away from these regions. Without diminishing the importance of mainstream employment, the authors call for a formal recognition of the local and national significance of populated landscapes, as well as the formal and informal land and sea management activities performed by Indigenous groups on country. They argue that such practices need to be considered seriously alongside the possibility of job creation in the land and sea management sector in regions where people reside. To achieve such aims, Altman and Kerins recommend the strengthening and improvement of programs such as CDEP and WoC and institutions like ORAs, which have all been affected to various degrees by the NTER, and to support community-based natural resource management efforts.

Altman, J.C. and Kerins, S. 2008. 'Submission to the Senate Standing Committee on Environment, Communications and the Arts inquiry into the operation of the Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999', *Topical Issue No. 13/2008*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2008TI13.php>>.

Keywords: PoC, Working on Country program, state of the Indigenous estate, populated landscapes, abolishment of Community Development Employment Projects, payment for environmental services

Summary: Altman and Kerins examine the first ten years of operation of the *Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999* (EPBC) as it relates to the nascent formalisation of Indigenous land and sea management programs. EPBC only weakly acknowledges native title rights, and this effectively leaves Indigenous wild resource users with 'passive' use rights and an absence of 'active' management rights. The authors argue that the failure to recognise Indigenous Australians' full rights to ecological management is leading to declining habitats of threatened species and ecological communities. One measure to counter this trend is for the Indigenous Protected Areas framework to include sea country. A more holistic approach to environmental programs more generally could also facilitate Indigenous land and sea management organisations to develop integrated plans for their regions in dialogue with one another, while also being informed by their own priorities for the management of critical habitats.

The authors further identify a shortfall in funding for Indigenous land and sea management governance. This situation often leaves traditional owner groups at a disadvantage, particularly as such groups do not generally have access to representative organisations and assistance in applying for grants. Moreover, caring for country activities should be linked to the school curriculum, particularly in Indigenous communities. This, in combination with changing the rhetoric about land and sea management on country as not being 'real' work, would affirm the importance of such work and the Indigenous people undertaking it. The threat of unpopulated landscapes on the Indigenous estate is further explained through the example of the Waanyi/Garawa Aboriginal Land Trust.

For a related submission, see Altman, J.C. and Kerins, S. 2008. Evidence to Senate Standing Committee on Rural and Regional Affairs and Transport Inquiry into Natural Resource Management and Conservation Challenges, Topical Issue No. 15/2008, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra.

Altman, J.C. and Jordan, K. 2008. 'Impact of climate change on Indigenous Australians: Submission to the Garnaut Climate Change Review', *Topical Issue No. 03/2008*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2008TI3.php>>.

Keywords: Climate change, commercial and customary use of natural resources, hybrid economy, carbon trading

Summary: This submission draws on research from CAEPR *Discussion Paper No. 286* (see p 22). The authors emphasise that Indigenous Australians could be especially vulnerable to the impacts of climate change, particularly given the reliance on customary activity within hybrid economies of remote Australia. They further note that there are also opportunities for Aboriginal people, especially in activities where they have comparative advantage, such as carbon farming. Australia lags behind other 'developed' countries in researching the effects of climate change on Indigenous people, and this submission describes the kinds of reliance that Aboriginal people in remote areas, and sometimes settled Australia, have on natural resources for cash income, food, wellbeing and cultural and spiritual life.

Altman, J.C., Kerins, S, Fogarty, B. and Webb, K. 2008. 'Why the Northern Territory Government needs to support outstations/homelands in the Aboriginal, Northern Territory and national interest', Submission to the Northern Territory Government Outstation Policy Discussion Paper, *Topical Issue No. 17/2008*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2008TI17.php>>.

Keywords: Citizenship entitlements, outstations, economic sustainability, biodiversity management, ecosystem maintenance, coastal surveillance, border protection and biosecurity, West Arnhem Land Fire Abatement Project

Summary: In this paper, the authors conceive of service delivery at outstations/homelands as a reciprocal process. This is one in which governments provide citizenship entitlements to Indigenous Australians in remote Australia, and subsequently reap the benefits that Indigenous Australians living on country provide. These benefits are in the critical areas of biodiversity management, ecosystem maintenance, coastal surveillance, border protection and biosecurity. This Topical Issue outlines these social, ecological and economic benefits of outstations/homelands. It positions people living on country (outstations/homelands) as a core element of economic sustainability, both in the Northern Territory and Australia more generally. Successful initiatives like the West Arnhem Land Fire Abatement (WALFA) Project have seen Indigenous ranger groups offset greenhouse gas emissions through active savannah fire management, and such programs depend on people living on outstations/homelands. While some Commonwealth Government support does acknowledge the importance of Aboriginal people living on and

managing country, such as the Indigenous Protected Area and Working on Country programs, this support is limited. The delivery of education to outstations/homelands through Homeland Learning Centres is also presented as an example of how a lack of equitable funding results from intergovernmental cost shifting. The authors stress that this is an area in which significant opportunities are available to build on existing success, and that this will rely on measured, carefully-planned outstations policy that is developed with adequate input from Indigenous people and organisations.

Hunt, J., Altman, J.C. and May, K. 2009. 'Social benefits of Aboriginal engagement in natural resource management', *Working Paper No. 60*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/WP/2009WP60.php>>.

Keywords: Climate change, Natural Resource Management, hybrid economy

Summary: This paper is related to Altman's CAEPR *Topical Issue No. 06* in 2004 (<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2004TI6.php>). It was originally produced as a report for the New South Wales Natural Resources Advisory Council in July 2009, and draws on research conducted by Janet Hunt with funding from the NSW Department of Environment and Climate Change. The authors document the wide variety of ways in which Aboriginal people in NSW are involved in natural resource management across the public, private and customary sectors. The authors stress that the hybrid economy in NSW is different to that described by Altman in northern Australia. In NSW, there is an increased engagement with the market through private sector employment and small business (relative to the numbers of people involved), and a much smaller customary sector than in the North. However, this paper also documents a strong will on the part of Aboriginal people, and to a lesser extent the NSW government, to develop the customary or cultural economy in NSW, and provides a number of recommendations as to how this might be achieved.

Jackson, S. and Altman, J.C. 2009. 'Indigenous rights and water policy: Perspectives from tropical north Australia', *Australian Indigenous Law Review*, 13 (1): 27–48, available at <http://www.ilc.unsw.edu.au/sites/ilc.unsw.edu.au/files/articles/AILR_13-1_Jackson_and_Altman.pdf>.

Keywords: Water rights, Indigenous commercial and customary interests in water, water management

Summary: This paper is based on a research project which sought to raise awareness of the implications of broad state goals of Aboriginal socioeconomic improvement (or 'Closing the Gap'), and the recent shift to a market-based approach in relation to water. Focusing on tropical northern Australia, the authors emphasise that imposing a Western water management frame onto Indigenous stakeholders will not result in either efficient or effective outcomes in water management and planning. Rather, there is a need to recognise that Indigenous intercultural interests in water are diverse, and that they combine commercial and non-commercial, sociocultural and environmental purposes and values. The authors further stress that management processes must create the space for the exchange of ideas and dialogue around differing cultural perspectives on the nature of water, its broader social meaning and value, and how to equitably share in its direct use and economic benefits.

Altman, J.C. and Arthur, W.S. 2009. 'Commercial water and Indigenous Australians: A scoping study of licence allocations', *Working Paper No. 57*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/WP/2009WP57.php>>.

Keywords: Water rights, natural Resource Management, National Water Commission, Indigenous commercial consumption of freshwater, freshwater governance, licence

Summary: This scoping study, commissioned by the National Water Commission (NWC), represents a first attempt to quantify the actual allocation of commercial water licences and entitlements to identify Indigenous users on a state-by-state basis. The study reveals a lack of information about commercial uses of water by Indigenous businesses, as well as the absence of a standard facility to identify Indigenous licence holders within each state. This highlights how little is known at this time about water usage by Indigenous businesses and how they will fare in the future, incidentally exposing

the absence of a sufficient database on Indigenous business. Altman and Arthur also discuss several issues associated with the use of an Indigenous identifier. They argue that an increased capacity to identify Indigenous users is essential to provide a baseline benchmark for the evaluation of policy initiatives that encourage both increased Indigenous participation in the water economy, as well as the inclusion of Indigenous people in planning processes.

Jackson, S., Tan, P-L., Altman, J.C. 2009. 'Indigenous Freshwater Planning Forum: Proceedings, Outcomes and Recommendations', Report for the National Water Commission, March, available at <http://www.nwc.gov.au/_data/assets/pdf_file/0017/11519/Outcomes_of_NWC_Indigenous_Fresh_Water_Planning_Forum_outcomes2.pdf>.

Keywords: Water resource management, Indigenous commercial rights in freshwater, water resource governance

Summary: In 2004, the National Water Initiative (NWI) agreement required that all Australian jurisdictions recognise Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders needs in relation to water access and management, and provide for Indigenous access to water resources through planning processes as well as the inclusion of Indigenous customary, social and spiritual objectives in water plans. This report draws on three background papers, as well as the National Water Commission's (NWC) first national Indigenous Water Planning Forum (February 2009), in its attempt to provide a concise, evidence-based summary of current water management arrangements. It summarises the key issues raised at the Forum and outlines a set of principles for improving access to water as well as Indigenous participation in water management. Among this proposed agenda, the authors stress the need to explicitly recognise and incorporate Indigenous hydrological and ecological knowledge; to recognise and protect Indigenous diverse interests in water (whether customary or commercial); to link the NWI with appropriate 'Closing the Gaps' objectives by enhancing Indigenous commercial rights in water; to create mechanisms to deliver Indigenous commercial allocation; and to promote capacity building by ensuring Indigenous participation in all stages of the planning process.

Feary, S., Kanowski, P., Altman, J. and Baker, R. 2010. 'Managing forest country: Aboriginal Australians and the forestry sector', *Australian Forestry*, 73 (2): 126–134, available at <<http://search.informit.com.au/fullText;dn=201010892;res=APAF>>.

Keywords: Sustainable forest management, hybrid economy, 'Aboriginal forestry'

Summary: This article is based on Sue Feary's doctoral work and examines the relationships and degrees of engagement between sustainable forest management and Aboriginal people. There is a tendency within the forest sector to see conservation and commercial ventures as oppositional, and to view mainstream conservation and Indigenous land management, or 'Caring for Country', as essentially similar. Both notions can be made more complex by using the hybrid economy framework. For example, the authors observe that Aboriginal 'Caring for Country' entails both resource exploitation and protection, which can be seen within and across the sectors of the hybrid economy. After canvassing three case studies, the paper concludes that 'Aboriginal forestry' encompasses a spectrum of diverse and varied economic and social activities and values. Forests remain a landscape where opportunities exist for reconciliation and for redressing disadvantage.

Koenig, J., Altman, J.C. and Griffiths, A.D. 2011. 'Artists as Harvesters: natural resource use by Indigenous woodcarvers in central Arnhem Land, Australia', *Human Ecology*, 39 (4): 407–419, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Artists-harvesters-Natural-resource-use-Indigenous-woodcarvers-central-Arnhem-Land-Australia.php>>.

Keywords: Natural Resource Management, Indigenous arts and crafts industry, subsistence economy, Maningrida

Summary: This article outlines cultural and socioeconomic factors that influence harvest practice and resource use by Indigenous wood carvers in the Maningrida region of central Arnhem Land. These site specific factors and mechanisms affect resource extraction all over the world, but have received little attention. For Indigenous people in the Maningrida region, there is minimal opportunity for commercial activity. However, there is an abundance of native plants, the harvest of which plays an important role in the customary sector of now hybrid economies. Plant

resources are primarily used, managed and conserved by local communities, and it is essential to understand the harvest and management strategies employed by local people so as to evaluate the sustainability of extraction. The authors argue that in the Maningrida region, cultural differences, socioeconomic factors, and the location of harvest sites all influence harvest production. These factors have significant implications for the ecological sustainability of timber harvesting in the region. There is a need to examine such localized factors when assessing the sustainability of Indigenous wildlife harvests so that culturally and economically important plant species are preserved and available for future generations for use in sustainable production and developments.

Altman, J.C., Kerins, S., Hunt, J., Ens, E., May, K., Russell S. and Fogarty B. 2011. 'Indigenous Cultural and Natural Resource Management Futures', *Topical Issue 9/2011*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2011TI9.php>>.

Keywords: Cultural and natural resource management, Informal and formal Natural Resource Management, funding of Natural Resource Management activities, two-way Natural Resource Management, perspectives on development, conservation, Closing the Gap, Indigenous Protected Area, Working on Country

Summary: This paper was initially provided as a submission to the Australian Government's discussion paper *Review of the Caring for Our Country: Australia's Natural Resource Management Investment Initiative* (<<http://nrmonline.nrm.gov.au/downloads/mql:2643/PDF>>). It lists seven recommendations for sustainable Indigenous Caring for Country management initiatives and draws on the lessons learnt from working with Indigenous peoples engaged in cultural and natural resource management (CNRM) projects in northern Australia and New South Wales. While the authors note that Indigenous Australians have interests across all six national priorities enumerated in the government's discussion paper, their focus here is placed specifically on the themes comprising the section *Engaging Indigenous Australians* (Discussion Point 4 of the discussion paper). They highlight the need for a whole-of-government approach to Indigenous development that reflects Indigenous aspirations, recognises and supports Indigenous CNRM activities, accommodates a two-way (western and Indigenous) approach to natural resource management and related training, and appropriately supports and resources Indigenous groups and local and regional Indigenous organisations. Acknowledging

the continuum between Indigenous land and sea territories, the authors further recommend an extension of the Indigenous Protected Area program to 'sea countries' in order to facilitate and integrate land and sea management strategies.

Annexed to this paper is an annotated bibliography of key CAEPR publications on CNRM written between 2007 and 2011.

Altman, J.C. 2012. 'Indigenous futures on country', in J.C. Altman and S. Kerins (eds), *People on Country, Vital Landscapes, Indigenous Futures*, The Federation Press, Sydney, 213–231, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2012_IndFuturesonCountry.pdf>.

Keywords: Emergence, Caring for Country movement, sustainability and success of Caring for Country, rangering

Summary: This chapter looks at the 20 years Caring for Country movement. It discusses the conditions underpinning the emergence and transformations of this movement, and analyses the numerous socioeconomic, political and environmental challenges encountered along the way while also making some predictions on how the movement might evolve in the future. Altman argues that Indigenous futures on country depend on multiple factors. While the case studies discussed throughout this book demonstrate the eagerness of Indigenous groups to manage their land, sea and resources in their distinct ways, the same groups acknowledge the advantages of the two-way approach, or at least of opting for a 'strategic interculturality' in their way of caring for country. However, these futures also depend on institutional innovations based on the recognition of the legitimacy of Indigenous form of CNRM, a productive negotiation of differences in this intercultural setting, and an associated reduction of power imbalance. Altman also emphasises the need for governance, accountability and capacity-building to follow the two-way model that privileges both corporate and internal or customary forms of governance.

Altman, J. and Jackson, S. 2014
'Indigenous land and sea management', in:
Lindenmayer, D.B., Dovers, S. and Morton,
S. (eds). *Ten Commitments Revisited*. CSIRO
Publishing, Melbourne. pp. 207-216.

Keyword: Land rights, native title, hybrid economy,
payment for environmental services, livelihoods,
alternate development, Cultural and Natural Resource
Management, climate-change

Summary: In 2014, the Indigenous estate covers over 20 per cent of Australia's territory. An examination of atlas resource maps reveals that the Indigenous land holding, while not in its pre-colonial state, nor exempt from various environmental threats, is relatively intact and includes some of Australia's most biologically diverse terrestrial and aquatic environments. Recognising the extent and current growth of Indigenous land ownership, and given Indigenous traditions of land and sea management, the authors argue for an increased role for Indigenous people in tackling national and global environmental challenges associated, most notably, with climate change issues. Such involvement, argue Altman and Jackson, is likely to contribute to the reduction of the vast difference in social outcomes between Indigenous and non-Indigenous Australians. This chapter includes a list of ten key recommendations which draw from Nancy Fraser's three dimensions of social justice: the recognition of land and resource rights; the redistribution of resources to reflect that Indigenous-owned lands comprise a rapidly growing share of the National Reserve System; and representation to ensure that there are institutional means established to provide minority Indigenous perspectives an effective voice on resource management.

This is an updated version of a paper published in 2008 under: Altman, J.C. and Jackson, S. 2008. 'Indigenous land and sea management', in D. Lindenmayer, S. Dovers, M. Harriss Olsen and S. Morton (eds), *Ten Commitments: Reshaping the Lucky Country's Environment*, CSIRO Publishing, Collingwood, 207-14, available at <http://www.anu.edu.au/caeprdev/sites/default/files/StaffProfiles/stafffiles/jon-altman//2008_TenCommitments.pdf>.

6. Employment and labour markets

*Altman, J.C. and Nieuwenhuysen, J.P. 1979. *The Economic Status of Australian Aborigines*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge (reprinted 2006 as Cambridge paperback).

Keywords: Socioeconomic status, policy development, youth, poverty

Summary: This book is Altman's first significant publication written with colleague John Nieuwenhuysen while a pre-doctoral researcher at the Department of Economics, University of Melbourne. This is the first study to examine Indigenous disadvantage nationally from an economics perspective; place Indigenous development in an international context; highlight regional diversity; and use 1971 Census data to document marginality. The book was written primarily from the existing literature while also deploying the theoretical lenses of development and institutional economics. It provided the foundation for much subsequent research in the 1990s on the utility and applicability of official statistics to assess Indigenous socioeconomic status, as well as on the need to recognise the diversity of Indigenous structural circumstances from metropolitan to very remote situations across the Australian continent. Commissioned by the then Commonwealth Department of Aboriginal Affairs, *The Economic Status of Aborigines* represents an early career engagement for Altman with the federal bureaucracy.

Focusing on the decade 1967 to 1977, this study addresses the significant gap in the data and analysis of the economic lives of Indigenous people throughout Australia. The authors mobilise and consolidate secondary information on general demographic and economic welfare indicators, as well as outline the economic status of people residing on government settlements, missions, pastoral stations, 'decentralised' communities, towns and cities. The study concludes with a range of central questions for economic policy: do the benefits of economic growth compare with the social and ecological costs in all circumstances? Can mining developments near missions and settlements counteract the cumulative processes that contribute to regional inequity? Several areas warrant further research, notably the need for comprehensive information on housing, education, employment, income and other aspects of Indigenous people's economic lives. Data

are also required on the social policy implications of the relative youth of Indigenous people compared with other Australian families, the economic prospects of decentralised communities, and how the cycle of poverty among Indigenous people operates.

Altman, J.C. and Dillon, M.C. 1986. 'Funding Aboriginal development in central Australia', in B. Foran and B. Walker (eds), *The Application of Science and Technology to Aboriginal Development in Central Australia*, CSIRO, Melbourne, 13–18, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1986_TheApplication.pdf>.

Keywords: Economic development, funding models, Indigenous diversity, entrepreneurs, development corporations

Summary: This paper addresses questions around the funding of Indigenous economic development, argues for increased funding in the sector, and makes suggestions for how such funding could be better targeted to match the diversity of Indigenous aspirations. A significant shift in indirect funding priorities towards Indigenous development over the last thirty years has seen the rise of public sector transfers (directly and indirectly) being based on locational disadvantage and 'need'. However, without specific allocation or targeting of such public funds, there is no automatic positive correlation between funding and improved economic status. Furthermore, rural Indigenous communities have been under funded when compared with non-Indigenous and urban populations in remote Australia. The authors argue that the Aboriginals Benefit Trust Account should also shift its emphasis from funding Aboriginal consumption to financing Aboriginal enterprises, particularly underwriting and guaranteeing commercial borrowing by Aboriginal entrepreneurs. Altman and Dillon further argue that current levels of funding earmarked for Indigenous development are too limited and inflexible, and that financial assistance should exist for individual entrepreneurs. Indigenous people need to devise their own institutions in order to take advantage of economic opportunities currently available in the Northern Territory.

An earlier version of this paper was published as Altman, J.C. and Dillon, M.C. 1985. 'Funding Aboriginal development in central Australia', *Working Paper No. 23*, Centre for Resource and Environmental Studies, ANU, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1985_CRESWP23.pdf>.

Altman, J.C. 1987. 'The potential for reduced dependency at Aboriginal communities in the East Kimberley', *Working Paper No. 18*, Centre for Resources and Environmental Studies, ANU, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1987_EastKimberleyWP18.pdf>.

Keywords: Poverty, poverty cycles, economic development, cultural plurality, aspirations, Warmun/Turkey Creek

Summary: In this paper, Altman assesses the effects of Commonwealth Government Indigenous policy on the economic situation at remote Indigenous communities. He finds a fundamental contradiction in contemporary policies which stress both cultural autonomy and economic assimilation. Drawing on 1981 Census data for the East Kimberley region, a case-study approach is employed to examine the economy of Warmun/Turkey Creek, where Indigenous poverty, unemployment and dependence on the public sector are high. Altman argues that culturally different material aspirations, divergent expenditure patterns, and access to mining money may all contribute to reducing this poverty. In his conclusion, he reiterates his key arguments that Indigenous funding must be systemically and strategically targeted. Simply augmenting the funding for Indigenous health, education, housing and employment programs will not somehow 'break' a 'cycle of poverty'. Government policy must also recognise that Indigenous people's economic development aspirations may be substantially different from mainstream Australia and other Indigenous groups.

Altman, J.C. 1988. 'Economic status', in J. Jupp (ed), *The Australian People: An Encyclopedia of the Nation, its People and their Origins*, Angus and Robertson, Sydney, 201–7, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1988_TheAustralianPeople.pdf>.

Keywords: Economic status, poverty alleviation

Summary: This is a concise overview of the economic status of Australia's Indigenous population and a discussion of viable pathways towards economic equality between Indigenous and other Australians. Altman defines 'economic status' here as relative material wellbeing, with reference to employment, occupation, income and housing status. He also outlines the pitfalls of 'status' as an index of cross-cultural comparison more generally. The causes and prevalence of Indigenous poverty are assessed outlining the impact of structural,

labour market and cultural factors on Indigenous people's lives. Altman provides an historical overview of government policy attention to Indigenous poverty alleviation from the 1950s onward. The absence of an economic base for many Indigenous communities, as well as the incredible heterogeneity of Indigenous lives and people's highly varied opportunities for employment between settled, rural and remote locations, makes Indigenous people's integration into the market economy substantially complex. This calls for a great deal of policy flexibility and increased government support, particularly ongoing and increased levels of government assistance in education, housing, employment and training programs, and towards establishing Indigenous-owned commercial enterprises.

This chapter was updated in 2001 (see annotation below) and published as Altman, J.C. 2001. 'The economic status of Indigenous Australians', in J. Jupp (ed), *The Australian People: An Encyclopedia of the Nation, its People and their Origins*, Cambridge University Press, Melbourne, 135–141, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2001_TheAusPeople.pdf>.

Altman, J.C. and Coombs, H.C. 1989. 'A livelihood', in H.C. Coombs, H. McCann, H. Ross and N. Williams (eds), *Land of Promises: Aborigines and Development in the East Kimberley*, Centre for Resource and Environmental Studies, ANU and Aboriginal Studies Press, Canberra, 83–107, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1989_LandOfPromises.pdf>.

Keywords: Poverty, economic development, land development, East Kimberley

Summary: In this chapter, Altman and Coombs argue for the need to change the present strategy of Indigenous economic development to a strategy which takes account of Indigenous people's priorities, their role in the region as consumers, and their market orientation and commercial skills. Focusing on the East Kimberley, the authors assert the central importance of greater Indigenous access to and control of land, and the transfer of responsibility for the provision of community, government and other public services and functions to Indigenous communities and their organisations as desired. Mechanisms also need to be set up to encourage accumulation of cash and capital, and to facilitate access to contemporary knowledge, technology, training and research. Furthermore, land cannot be seen as a guarantee of Indigenous economic

independence alone, as it requires a sustainable land use and management strategy. The establishment of a competent agency is also recommended to negotiate with mining, tourism and other business enterprises. Indigenous resource agencies and the Kimberley Land Council could also combine to invite an appropriate tertiary institution to establish an Aboriginal Research Advisory Service.

Altman, J.C. and Taylor, L. 1989. *The Economic Viability of Aboriginal Outstations and Homelands*, Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra.

Keywords: Miller Report, Blanchard Homelands Report, Aboriginal Employment Development Policy, outstations, homelands, hybrid economy, Income Support Program (Canada), Guaranteed Minimum Income for Outstations

Summary: This research report was commissioned by the Australian Council for Employment and Training in June 1987 in response to the *Committee of Review of Aboriginal and Employment Training Programs* (Miller Report 1985) and *Return to Country: The Aboriginal Homelands Movement in Australia* (Blanchard Homelands Report 1987). The authors were required to undertake several tasks: canvass options by which the government might provide cash to supplement income from traditional activities; assess the applicability of CDEP scheme for the purposes of paying unpaid productive activities; and outline similar programs operating with traditional hunter-gatherers in other countries as may be relevant to an Australia context. Focusing on the economic significance of hunter-gatherer activities, artefact manufacturing and unpaid productive work, the authors argue that the central means of reducing dependency and developing income generation at most outstations is through subsistence activities. There is an undeniable interdependence between access to cash and subsistence for the prosperity of outstations. The continued success of this movement depends on guaranteed access to social security entitlements and the limited accountability required for welfare expenditure. In dialogue with an analysis of the Income Support Program in Canada, the authors recommend that a new program, Guaranteed Minimum Income for Outstations (GMIO), without income and work testing, be established.

Altman, J.C. 1990. 'The economic future of remote Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander communities', *Australian Aboriginal Studies*, 2: 48–52, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1990_AusAboriginalStudies.pdf>.

Keywords: Economic development, public and private sector investment, self-determination

Summary: This article provides an overview of the economic circumstances of remote Indigenous communities at the start of the 1990s. It considers the public and private prospects for their economic development. The private sector, Altman argues, yields little opportunities for remote community economic development. These pathways are limited to export generation such as mining and tourism, and import substitution, primarily available through participation in subsistence. In the public sector however, economic advancement can occur in a number of ways. Altman discusses the current policy context that has evolved under the rubric of 'self-determination', and outlines the economic policy objectives of the Aboriginal Employment Development Policy (AEDP) which has attempted to grow Indigenous economic development in remote communities. A number of policy inconsistencies are highlighted alongside the entrenched problems of program implementation. These include the incompatibility of bureaucratic terms like 'economic equity' with Indigenous cultural autonomy, the need for internal and external accountability of program delivery in an era of economic rationalism, and the ability for remote community voices to be heard in regional council contexts.

Allen, L.M. Altman, J.C., Owen, E. and Arthur, B. 1991. 'Aborigines in the Economy: A Select Annotated Bibliography of Policy-Relevant Research', *Research Monograph No. 1*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/mono/CAEPR_Mono01.pdf>.

Keywords: Economic development, labour markets, Aboriginal Employment Development Policy

Summary: This resource directory provides an up-to-date information base for research on Indigenous economic development issues completed between 1985–1990. The focus is on the relevance of research for policy, with an emphasis on economic development and labour market issues. The authors sought to create a bibliography that

will assist ATSIC and the Department of Employment, Education and Training to make evidence-based decisions in the future allocation of research funds. It is also intended to provide a useful database for rigorous comparisons between research undertaken prior to the 1987 Aboriginal Employment Development Policy (AEDP) and after its implementation, especially on the effectiveness of programs, and to assist Indigenous organisations to identify research that is relevant to their particular needs.

Altman, J.C. and Sanders, W. 1991. 'Government initiatives for Aboriginal employment: Equity, equality and policy realism', in J.C. Altman (ed), 'Aboriginal Employment Equity by the Year 2000', *Research Monograph No. 2*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, 1–18, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/mono/1991RM2.php>>.

Keywords: Aboriginal Employment Development Policy, policy development, policy realism

Summary: In this chapter, the authors outline both the policy realism and failures of the Aboriginal Employment Development Program (AEDP) 1987, which sought to shift from the 'welfare dependence' approach of the past towards measures to enhance Indigenous economic independence. The chapter's emphasis is on 'equity' and the pursuit of statistical equality. While acknowledging equity as a reasonable policy goal, the authors argue that this interpretation fails to acknowledge the deeply rooted and structural causes of low economic status among Indigenous people, and sets goals and standards which will inevitably fail. Other aspects of the ADEP are seen here as being realistic. The policy earmarks increased financial assistance for Indigenous employment programs, represents responsive policy formation in the light of past experience, and provides a range of program options for people living in different geographic and cultural contexts.

Altman, J.C. 1991. 'Conclusion', in J.C. Altman (ed), 'Aboriginal Employment Equity by the Year 2000', *Research Monograph No. 2*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, 155–174, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/mono/1991RM2.php>>.

Keywords: Aboriginal Employment Development Policy, policy development, policy realism

Summary: In this conclusion, Altman outlines new policy insights generated through the workshop

'Aboriginal Employment Equity by the Year 2000'. The workshop sought to provide a current perspective on the economic situation of Indigenous people and their prospects for economic equality by the year 2000, as stipulated by the 'equity' goals of the Aboriginal Employment Development Program (AEDP). Altman notes the general concern from all participants that the policy realism evident in the establishment of the AEDP was not matched by equivalent realism in setting targets. However, the workshop's view was that the Federal Government's policy response in this field as a whole has been marked by healthy realism, as well as an acceptance that many economic problems faced by Indigenous people are structural and intractable. The challenge of the 1990s, Altman argues, is to broaden the notion of equity to concentrate on equality of opportunity, taking into account the rights of Indigenous people to self-determination as well as recognising the enormous cultural, social and economic diversity of the Indigenous population.

Tesfaghiorghis, H. and Altman, J.C. 1991. 'Aboriginal socio-economic status: Are there any evident changes?', *Discussion Paper No. 3*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1991DP3.php>>.

Keywords: Socioeconomic status, employment

Summary: In this paper the authors examine Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS) census data from 1971 to 1986 to provide a statistical overview of the economic and social deprivation of the Indigenous population in comparison to the total population of Australia. This comparative analysis is undertaken in the areas of labour force characteristics, employment and unemployment, education, and individual incomes. Indigenous employment status improved markedly in this timeframe, and Indigenous income status also improved, albeit from a low base. Levels of educational qualification, incomes and employment in this timeframe were substantially lower for Indigenous Australians, while the reverse was true for unemployment and dependency. These data also suggest that the broad thrust of the Aboriginal Employment Development Program (AEDP) has correctly targeted Indigenous employment as a crucial area in need of attention. The changing age structure of Indigenous people is also raised, as a rapid and projected growth in the working-age population will result in a quickly expanding working age population in need of employment and housing.

Altman, J.C. and Smith, D.E. 1992. 'Estimating the reliance of Aboriginal Australians on welfare: Some policy implications', *Discussion Paper No. 19*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1992DP19.php>>.

Keywords: Aboriginal Employment Development Policy, welfare, employment, statistical equity, income support, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: This paper addresses the reduction of Indigenous welfare dependency to levels commensurate with that of the total population by the year 2000, the least scrutinised of three objectives of the 1987 Aboriginal Employment Development Policy (AEDP) goals. The authors argue that for policy purposes, it is not completely appropriate to compare Indigenous households with the 'average' Australian household. A more appropriate comparison may be with poor Australians who display a greater reliance on government benefits and pensions in comparison with the average Australian household. When compared with low-income Australian households, Indigenous people in Australia are no more or less 'dependent' on welfare than other poor Australians, though this argument requires detailed data for further analysis. There may also be inverse and unintended trade-offs between the three AEDP goals. In particular, reduced welfare dependency in the current economic climate may hamper the goal of income equality. The pursuit of statistical equality between Indigenous and other Australians might also inadvertently result in greater inequities within the Indigenous population. Recent changes in the primary sources of income have occurred for many people through their participation in the CDEP scheme. Paying participants in such schemes a wage that is notionally tied to welfare entitlements may have the appearance of moving people off welfare and into wage employment. However, this distinction is cosmetic unless participation in such programs is used to generate additional income or employment.

Altman, J.C. 1992. 'Appropriate income support for Aboriginal Australians: Options for the 1990s', in P. Saunders and D. Encel (eds), *Social Policy in Australia: Options for the 1990s*, SPRC, UNSW, Sydney, 1–10, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1992_SocialPolicy.pdf>.

Keywords: Aboriginal Employment Development Policy, income support, statistical equality, social justice, policy realism

Summary: In this paper, Altman examines how closely income support options for Indigenous Australians can correlate with the major policy goals of the 1987 Aboriginal and Employment Development Policy (AEDP). These consist of ensuring employment and income equity between Indigenous and non-Indigenous Australians by the year 2000 at the same time as reducing welfare dependency for Indigenous Australians to levels commensurate with those for other Australians. Little analysis has looked at how this income equality or reduced welfare dependence might be achieved. Policy realism dictates it be recognised that the majority of Aboriginal people need income support, while equity goals stipulate that Indigenous and other Australians be treated equally. How, then, can income support be structured to open up opportunities and life chances for Indigenous Australians? Altman examines the limited opportunities that exist in the two major forms of income support for Indigenous people – the social security benefits that apply to all Australians, and the CDEP scheme. He stresses that a move towards income equality will only occur if appropriate income support schemes are put in place. These must provide the right incentives for people to seek work and enable new possibilities while still guaranteeing a minimum income.

This paper was previously published as Altman, J.C. 1991. 'Appropriate income support for Aboriginal Australians: options for the 1990s', *Discussion Paper No. 12*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/DP/1991_DP12.pdf>.

Altman, J.C. 1992. 'Statistics on Australia's Indigenous populations: Needs, problems, options and implications', in J.C. Altman (ed), 'A National Survey of Indigenous Australians: Options and Implications', *Research Monograph No. 3*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, 1–15, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/mono/1992RM3.php>>.

Keywords: Data inefficiency, social justice, equity, research methods and methodology

Summary: In this chapter Altman outlines the current absence of reliable Indigenous statistics and the social justice reasons behind the urgent need for these data. Shortages in accurate statistical information on Indigenous populations have been evident since the early 1990s, with a general decline in the collection of identifiable statistical information on Indigenous Australians since 1987. Current and frequent rigorous data collection is essential to make equitable and resource-efficient decisions on the division of Commonwealth and State resources earmarked for Indigenous people. This must be based on an objective and relatively unchallengeable definition of need so that it can be conceptualised with reference to issues of equity or social justice and efficiency. Broad methodological and conceptual issues that also affect collecting accurate statistics are further outlined, notably in the areas of self-identification, the nature of Indigenous populations, and the cultural appropriateness of standard social indicators.

Altman, J.C. 1992. 'Statistics about Indigenous Australians and the role of a national survey: where to now?' in J.C. Altman (ed), 'A National Survey of Indigenous Australians: Options and Implications', *Research Monograph No. 3*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, 152–167, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/mono/1992RM3.php>>.

Keywords: Data collection methods, methodology

Summary: The workshop, 'A National Survey of Aboriginal and Island Populations: Problems and Pitfalls', examined a range of issues relating to statistical requirements in Indigenous affairs since the 1990s. In this conclusion to the workshop's collection of papers, Altman highlights the urgent need for statistical information about Indigenous Australians beyond that collected in the five-yearly census and any that might be gathered in a one-off national survey. Consensus was reached on a three pronged approach to the collection of statistics,

possibly in tandem with the proposed national survey and existing census output. This would include an expansion of ABS special surveys, the coordinated development of administrative by-product databases, and greater effort by States and Territories.

Altman, J.C. and Gaminiratne, K.H.W. 1992. 'Establishing trends in ATSIC regional council populations using census data: A cautionary note', *Journal of the Australian Population Association*, 9 (1): 73–91, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1992_JoftheAusPopAssoc.pdf>.

Keywords: Regional councils, data limits, methodology

Summary: This article highlights some of the problems that regional councils face in finding statistical data to develop regional plans. Although regional councils broadly correspond to clusters of census collection districts used by the ABS, statistical information by regional jurisdictions is only available from the 1986 Census. Further problems stem from the census boundary changes over time, changes in special enumeration procedures and coverage, and the problems posed by self-identification and associated population growth. Because of data quality problems, a clear assessment of population growth patterns and labour-force participation is not possible. While census data can provide some useful social indicators at an aggregate level for analysis over time, as well as by broad state and section-of-state, they may be of more limited value when disaggregated to the ATSIC regional council level. Any broad patterns and trends established on the basis of disaggregated data at the section-of-state level, particularly from the 1976 Census, will need to be verified with 1991 Census data. The authors recommend reconstructing historical population trends when these 1991 data became available.

Also published as Altman, J.C. and Gaminiratne, K.H.W. 1992. 'Establishing trends in ATSIC regional council populations using census data: A cautionary note', *Discussion Paper No. 20*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1992DP20.php>>.

Altman, J.C. and Daly, A.E. 1993. 'Do fluctuations in the Australian macroeconomy influence Aboriginal employment status?', in A. Hodgkinson, D. Kelly and N. Verucci (eds), *Responding to Unemployment: Perspectives and Strategies, Labour Market Analysis Program*, University of Wollongong, Wollongong, 165–186, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1993_Responding.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous labour market, macro-economy, CDEP, economic equality

Summary: In this chapter, the authors make two analyses of the pattern of Indigenous employment compared with that of other Australians, showing that different factors affect Indigenous employment. Firstly, drawing on census data from 1971–1986, they compare changes in unemployment rates of the Indigenous and total populations and show evidence of a separate Indigenous labour market subject to different conditions of employment. Secondly, the authors focus on the 1986–1991 period and the role of the Aboriginal and Employment Development Policy (AEDP), which was launched at a time when the Australian market was buoyant (in creating work for Indigenous people).

The authors argue that broad evidence shows that Indigenous labour market status may have become relatively independent of fluctuations in the macroeconomy, if only owing to the impact of the AEDP. This can be partly explained in the past five years by the rapid expansion of the CDEP scheme. However, there is little evidence that the AEDP is achieving its major employment goal of statistical equity by the year 2000. A lack of private-sector employment, as well as excessive reliance on employment funded by the Commonwealth, leaves people extremely vulnerable to changes in government policy and the mainstream labour market. If equality means that Indigenous people need to be incorporated into the mainstream labour market in a similar manner to all Australians, people will be equally exposed to the fluctuations in the world economy with associated employment outcomes. However, if differences between Indigenous and non-Indigenous people are highlighted in policy, it is likely that a distinct segment of the labour market – an Indigenous labour market – will remain.

Versions of this chapter were published as Altman, J.C. and Daly, A.E. 1992. 'Do fluctuations in the Australian macroeconomy influence Aboriginal employment status?' *Economic Papers*, 11 (4): 32–48, available at

<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1992_EconomicPapers.pdf>, and Altman, J.C. and Daly, A.E. 1992. 'Do fluctuations in the Australian macroeconomy influence Aboriginal employment status?' *Discussion Paper No. 21*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1992DP21.php>>.

Altman, J.C. and Smith, D.E. 1993. 'The welfare dependence of Aboriginal Australians: Policy implications', *Social Security Journal*, March, 19–41, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1993_SocialSecurity.pdf>.

Keywords: Welfare, Aboriginal Employment Development Policy, unemployment benefits, statistical equality

Summary: This article examines the welfare-focused goal of the Aboriginal Employment Development Policy (AEDP) and the limitations of this in understanding and addressing Indigenous poverty. This goal has sought to reduce Indigenous levels of welfare dependency (dependency on unemployment benefit (UB)) to levels commensurate with that of the total Australian population by the year 2000. It is the third and least scrutinised of the three main objectives of the AEDP, comprising employment, income and welfare equality. The authors conclude that there may be unintended and inverse trade-offs between this and the other two AEDP goals, with reduced welfare in the current economic climate possibly hampering the objective of income equality.

There is a critical absence of official data on the numbers of Indigenous people receiving different types of social security payments. This means that little analysis can be made about the precise degree to which Indigenous reliance on social security payments is actually different to that of the total population. Altman argues that a more appropriate comparison could be made with poor Australians whose households display a greater reliance on government benefits and pensions in contrast to the average Australian household, and against whom Indigenous people appear no more or less 'dependent' on welfare. Pursuing this and other lines of comparative research can only advance when the ABS special surveys include a representative sample of Indigenous households and allow the use of an Aboriginal identifier.

Altman, J.C. and Hawke, A.E. 1993. 'Indigenous Australians and the labour market: Issues for the union movement in the 1990s', *Discussion Paper No. 45*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/DP/1993_DP45.pdf>.

Keywords: Unions, Aboriginal Employment Development Policy, socioeconomic status, disadvantage, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: This paper is concerned with central issues affecting Indigenous people in the labour market. It focuses on how unions can assist in increasing formal employment and attendant income levels for Indigenous Australians, and support the improvement of Indigenous people's performance in the formal labour market in a manner commensurate with the goals of the Aboriginal Employment Development Policy (AEDP). The broad aims of the AEDP are to achieve economic equality between Indigenous and other Australians by the year 2000 via employment equality, income equality, and commensurate levels of welfare dependence. In statistical terms, achieving employment equality for working-aged Indigenous Australians will require an increase in the employment rate from 27 per cent of those aged 15–64 years to 63 per cent. The relatively low labour force participation of Indigenous Australians will require a simultaneous policy focus. In 1991, only 57 per cent of the working-age Indigenous population was in the formal labour market compared with 71 per cent of the total population. The achievement of income equality will require an increase in the average annual individual income by over 50 per cent.

It is important for Indigenous Australians that their group-specific requirements, in all their diversity, be recognised by trade unions to ensure equity in centralised award negotiations. The authors outline how unions can have a role in working towards coverage of Indigenous people. This includes making sure that they are not discriminated against when they attempt to enter into the formal labour market; ensuring vigilance in award maintenance for employees of Indigenous organisations; attempting to ensure that an over-segregated labour market does not develop; and encouraging effective Indigenous participation in the formulation of union goals and objectives.

Altman, J.C. 1993. 'Indigenous Australians in the economy: An analysis of research output', in L.M. Roach and K-A. Probst (eds), 'Indigenous Australians in the Economy: Abstracts of Research, 1991–92', *Research Monograph No. 4*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/mono/1993RM4.php>>.

Keywords: Aboriginal Employment Development Policy, policy development

Summary: This paper introduces and updates the earlier monograph *Aborigines in the Economy: A Select Annotated Bibliography of Policy-Relevant Research 1985–90*. It focuses on the three principles of the original ATSIC consultancy: assessing research between 1985–90 relevant to the Aboriginal Employment Development Policy (AEDP); proving up-to-date information base to ATSIC for funding decisions; and highlighting areas requiring further research. Whereas the key policy focus of this first monograph was the AEDP, the 1991–92 update has been more widely constituted to include abstracts of research which extend beyond these strict boundaries. Altman introduces this monograph, situating it in the current policy context and outlining its intended audiences. The research scope is demarcated alongside the extent to which previously identified needs in *Aborigines in the Economy* have been met. Of particular note is the remaining requirement for better socioeconomic information and culturally appropriate statistics through multi-faceted data collection techniques. Further challenges include the need for regional studies based on primary data collection, and how to address new research demands within Australia's changing economic circumstances. This encompasses the need to undertake primary data collection within an appropriate economic policy research framework in the current economic and political climate.

Altman, J.C. 1994. 'Economy', in D. Horton (ed), *The Encyclopedia of Aboriginal Australia*, Aboriginal Studies Press, Canberra, 323–328, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1994_Encyclopaedia_Economy.pdf>.

Keywords: Colonisation, Indigenous economy

Summary: Altman traces the primary factors in the success of the Indigenous economy prior to European occupation, which was land and labour dependent, and describes how this economy was undermined and

radically transformed through European colonisation. The complex historical, demographic, social and cultural causes of economic marginalisation today are discussed alongside the policy initiatives developed to address these circumstances and their pitfalls and successes. Evidence is also provided of the re-emergence of a distinctive Indigenous economy.

Altman, J.C. and Gaminiratne, K.H.W. 1994. 'Employment implications of the growth of the Indigenous Australian working age population to 2001', *Australian Bulletin of Labour*, 20 (1): 29–44, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1994_AusBulletinOfLabour.pdf>.

Keywords: Aboriginal Employment Development Policy, equality, economic development, policy development, policy realism, Indigenous age structure

Summary: This article, prepared as a submission to the review of the Aboriginal Employment Development Policy (AEDP) in 1994, presents new projections of the Indigenous population of working age to the year 2001. The authors highlight the risks in making population forecasts in the Indigenous policy context through their reassessment of the goals of the 1987 AEDP. The AEDP statement sought statistical employment equity for Indigenous Australians by the year 2000. It was estimated that this would require the creation of 46,000 new jobs over 13 years. However, the basis on which these estimates were made was not provided, nor was a strong distinction established between Indigenous people's geographic locations and the effects of these circumstances on employment opportunities. The authors discuss work undertaken within CAEPR in 1991 which drew on 1986 Census data. This CAEPR research showed that the AEDP had underestimated the likely size of the Indigenous working age population by about 44,000. New projections of the Indigenous working age population are provided, raising policy issues that must be addressed if statistical equality is to be achieved. The authors argue that job creation goals need to be set at a regional level in a manner that accurately reflects the geographic distribution of the Indigenous population and the regional variations in employment opportunities. It may be more appropriate to redefine the notion of 'equity' in a way that more accurately reflects regional and local variations. Policy also needs to be flexible, with regional and location-specific goals, and must pay attention to the types of jobs created and their income limitations. Tailoring demand for Indigenous labour to supply also

requires ongoing and substantial government subvention, and a mix of these two broad approaches will be needed.

An earlier version of this article was also published as Altman, J.C. and Gaminiratne, K.H.W. 1993. 'Employment implications of the growth of the Indigenous Australian working-age population to 2001', *Discussion Paper No. 53*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1993DP53.php>>.

Altman, J.C. and Jin, L. 1994. 'Socioeconomic status at the ATSIC regional level, 1986 and 1991: Data for regional planning', *Discussion Paper No. 76*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1994DP76.php>>.

Keywords: ATSIC, ISA, regional planning and development, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: The data and analysis in this discussion paper were developed for ATSIC regional councils for the purposes of regional planning and bottom-up resource-bidding. Since its inception, a major component of ATSIC has been its regional structure, currently consisting of 36 jurisdictions. This paper examines 1986 and 1991 Census data disaggregated to these 36 regional council levels. It focuses on the three socioeconomic variables of employment, education and income, and combines these variables to generate an Index of Socioeconomic Advantage (ISA). Variations in this index between regions in 1986 and 1991 are examined and analysis is undertaken of changes during that five-year period. A central driver of change, especially in employment status, has been rapid expansion of the CDEP scheme. In some regions, the scheme has resulted in significant change in socioeconomic status as defined by these official social indicators. In other regions, expansion of the scheme has most likely ameliorated the full impact of the recession. Some potential policy issues are further considered, including both the negative and positive aspects of relying on census data for planning purposes. Significant areas for further research are outlined. These indicate the changes and additions needed to increase the current database, as well as some of the possible needs of regional councils when preparing a regional development plan.

Altman, J.C. and Sanders, W. 1994. 'From exclusion to dependence: Aborigines and the welfare state in Australia', in J. Dixon and R. Scheurell (eds), *Social Welfare with Indigenous Peoples*, London, Routledge, 206–229, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1994_SocialWelfare.pdf>.

Keywords: Disadvantage, welfare dependency

Summary: In this article the authors trace the history of Indigenous people's exclusion from, and gradual incorporation into the Australian welfare state through 'protection', 'assimilation', 'self-determination' and 'self-management' policies, up to the present era's retreat of welfare provisions. These developments, they argue, have changed the nature of Indigenous dependence on the welfare state, a dependence which remains heavily contested. Escaping from dependence on the welfare state is a legitimate and important goal for both Indigenous people and of Indigenous affairs policy in the future. However at the same time, Indigenous people have been included in a fragmented array of welfare state programs that have made additional resources available which have underwritten many positive developments towards greater Indigenous autonomy. There has been a recent trend towards greater mainstream welfare-state expenditure on Indigenous assistance, as well as proportionately lower Aboriginal Affairs Portfolio expenditure over the last twenty years. The authors predict greater mainstream provisioning of Indigenous services in the near future which will also have complex outcomes, though find it unlikely that separate programs will disappear altogether in the foreseeable future. The post-1980s general retreat from the welfare state in Australia more broadly raises the issue of how Indigenous people can break away from this dependence in these times of economic restructuring.

This paper was also published as Altman, J.C. and Sanders, W. 1991. 'From exclusion to dependence: Aborigines and the welfare state in Australia', *Discussion Paper No. 1*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1991DP1.php>>.

Altman, J.C. and Daly, A.E. 1995. 'Indigenous Australians in the labour market: Historical trends and future prospects', *Economic Papers*, 14 (4): 64–73, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1995_EconomicPapers.pdf>.

Keywords: Indigenous labour market, Aboriginal Employment Development Policy, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: In this article Altman and Daly compare national historical trends in Indigenous labour force statistics with those of all Australians between 1971 and 1991, drawing on results from the five-yearly Census of Population and Housing. Acknowledging several limits of the Census dataset for their purposes, the authors surmise that Government intervention under the Aboriginal Employment Development Policy (AEDP) has made some positive differences in the lives of Indigenous people during the recessionary intercensal years. They flag the possibility of intervening more directly in labour market programs targeting Indigenous people. However, if employment equality is to be achieved in any sense, there remains a need for rapid improvement in education status and work experience, and for greater employment in the private sector. While government sector, labour market program employment provides some protection for Indigenous people during recession, it leaves Indigenous people highly vulnerable to policy change.

Altman, J.C. and Taylor, J. 1995. 'Calculating Indigenous Australian employment in the private sector', *Labour Economics and Productivity*, 7 (1): 73–82, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1995_LabourEconomics.pdf>.

Keywords: Employment, labour markets, private sector, statistical equity

Summary: In this article Altman and Taylor argue that Indigenous people are possibly growing more reliant on employment which is dependent on continued and specialised government support, and that this fact is largely obscured in official statistics. Data from the 1986 and 1991 Censuses indicate intercensal growth in Indigenous employment in the private sector at a rate far greater than for non-Indigenous Australians. However, a large share of this growth has not occurred in the 'real' private sector and is actually associated with community organisations, or the 'public' sector. A high proportion of Indigenous people live in rural and remote locations with

limited possibility for market driven job creation, or where reliance on the public sector is the norm. The authors argue that the ability for private sector employment to be generated without substantial government intervention and subvention in such areas is highly questionable and would also imply a transfer into activities that might be perceived as assimilationist. Greater involvement of Indigenous people in labour markets would further require substantial labour migration to the major cities, which may not be feasible or desirable.

A version of this paper was published as Altman, J.C. and Taylor, J. 1994. 'Estimating Indigenous Australian employment in the private sector', *Discussion Paper No. 70*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1994DP70.php>>.

Altman, J.C. 1995. 'Indigenous Australians in the economy: 1993–94: an introduction', in L.M. Roach and H.J. Bek (eds), 'Indigenous Australians in the Economy: Abstracts of Research 1993–94', *Research Monograph No. 9*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/mono/CAEPR_Mono09.pdf>.

Keywords: National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Survey, macroeconomic context, regional development, policy development

Summary: Similar to the previous two monographs, this edition works on the objectives of the Aboriginal Employment Development Policy (AEDP) and provides a database for ATSIC, highlighting areas in need of research. This latest study also records many publications influenced by the 1992 High Court's Mabo Judgment, the passage of the *Native Title Act 1993*, and the implementation of recommendations from the Royal Commission into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody 1991. Altman highlights future research needs and flags the policy implications of this research, observing the research community to be reasonably responsive to Indigenous economic policy needs.

In terms of increasing data collection, key changes include the development of the National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Survey (NATSIS), as well as publications analysing the intercensal change in Indigenous economic status between 1986 and 1991 based on census data, and the greater involvement of the ABS. Areas in need of further research include the inter-relationship between the macro-economic and the economic and employment status of Indigenous

Australian; primary data collection and publications on the livelihoods of Indigenous Australians in urban areas; and an understanding of regional planning in the macroeconomic context. There is a continued lack of research on relatively well-off Indigenous Australians or people living in suburban areas. New research must reflect changing macro-economic circumstances as well as the impacts on, and opportunities for Indigenous Australians. This notably concerns Federal Government policy initiatives in three areas: regional development, long-term structural employment, and the emphasis on market-based policy.

Altman, J.C. 1996. 'The 1994 National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Survey: from conception to completion and beyond', in J.C. Altman and J. Taylor (eds), 'The National Survey of Indigenous Australians: 1994 Findings and Future Options', *Research Monograph No. 11*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, 1–12, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/mono/CAEPR_Mono11.pdf>.

Keywords: National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Survey, data, methodology

Summary: In 1992, Altman convened the workshop 'A National Survey of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Populations: Problems and Prospects', when it became apparent that the Commonwealth might implement this instrument. The workshop was driven by concerns over the lack of available statistical information to assess the effectiveness of Commonwealth Indigenous affairs policy, and the opportunity to attempt to inform and influence the ABS about the content of a national survey and implicit methodological issues. In this introductory chapter, Altman outlines options for determining what might be included and omitted from a repeat National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Survey (NATSIS) and its associated ramifications. He highlights the impacts of the current policy environment on data requirements, noting that the current Commonwealth Government language of managerialism is not matched by rigorous performance evaluation in Indigenous affairs. This data collection is further affected by the direction of Howard government policy and the contemporary fiscal environment, as well as the political economy of statistics and how they influence decision-making. Altman stresses the need for a strategic approach by the ABS for a future survey that generates some key intercensal data. This will provide both a snapshot on the socioeconomic status of Indigenous people in the current Indigenous

affairs policy arena, and a comparison with data from the 1994 NATSIS.

Altman, J.C. and Taylor, J. 1996. 'Statistical needs in Indigenous affairs: Future options and implications', in J.C. Altman and J. Taylor (eds), 'The National Survey of Indigenous Australians: 1994 Findings and Future Options', *Research Monograph No. 11*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, 193–202, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/mono/CAEPR_Mono11.pdf>.

Keywords: National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Survey, data collection, methodology

Summary: A repeat statistical collection of the 1994 National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Survey (NATSIS) is needed to provide comparative data and analysis over time. In this chapter, Altman and Taylor synthesise key arguments highlighting the positive and negative aspects of the NATSIS. These include its shortcomings, attitudinal questions, geographic issues, and the politics of Indigenous participation. Diverse academic opinions on finding an appropriate balance between data integrity, analytic amenability, and policy worthiness are discussed, and a series of general recommendations are made to be put forward to the ABS, ATSIC and the Commonwealth. These suggest that NATSIS be repeated in 1999, and that the insufficient availability of Indigenous statistics be addressed. Five-yearly census cycles cannot adequately inform broad policy and program monitoring and evaluation. There is a further need for more transparent debate on the issue, including a rigorous assessment of the financial trade-offs between a more targeted NATSIS and regular enhancement of sampling.

Taylor, J. and Altman, J.C. 1997. *The Job Ahead: Escalating Economic Costs of Indigenous Employment Disparity*, Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission, Canberra.

Keywords: Labour markets, unemployment, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: Despite considerable government intervention, Taylor and Altman argue that an underlying systematic trend could see the economic situation of Indigenous people worsen. Data from the 1991 Census suggest that unemployment rates will continue to rise due to Indigenous population growth, currently expanding at

a rate more than twice that of the total population. At the same time, the Indigenous age structure is shifting, with an increasing emphasis on persons of working age. However, there is an enormous disjunct between the population ratio and available jobs. The existing CDEP scheme will be unable to absorb this expanded labour supply. Government initiatives to free the Australian labour market and make it more competitive will also have limited positive impacts on Indigenous circumstances, particularly in regional and remote Australia.

Taylor and Altman argue that the cost of inaction on this issue is potentially huge, and that improving it will require an immediate and unprecedented expansion in Indigenous employment. On the direct cost side is the associated expansion in the cost to government for meeting basic income support. Indirect costs of long-term economic marginalisation and associated social problems are difficult to estimate, but will undoubtedly increase exponentially. Taylor and Altman stress the need to sustain investments in Indigenous economic policy measures into the medium-term for any chance of reaping benefits to governments and Australia more broadly. The crucial role of the CDEP scheme is also stressed in areas where mainstream labour markets simply do not exist, occupational as is the need for mechanisms that will encourage upward occupational mobility. Other policy recommendations include encouraging joint business ventures which productively use Indigenous owned land and Indigenous competitive advantage where it exists, and boosting resources aimed at improving the underlying determinants of poor Indigenous employment outcomes (education, housing, health, incarceration).

Altman, J.C. 1997. 'Economic participation', *Human Rights and Indigenous Australians, Proceedings of the Australian Reconciliation Convention: Book 3, The Council for Aboriginal Reconciliation*, 78–81, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1997_HumanRights.pdf>.

Keywords: Economic development, reconciliation, disadvantage, agency, private sector investment

Summary: This paper advocates for long-sighted strategic investment in Indigenous economic development as being essential to any vision for reconciliation. The underlying demographic trend of Indigenous people's population growth, and the enormous difficulties of catching up economically in a rapidly changing world, could see the economic

situation of Indigenous people worsen. This may lead to significant financial and social costs, and raises compelling arguments for immediate enhanced government economic intervention. Altman makes several recommendations to address this issue. These include the rapid and immediate investment in Indigenous human capital and economic development in areas of demonstrated success, notably the arts and culture, sports and tourism. In policy terms, it is essential to differentiate positive expenditure (investment) that will create new economic opportunities, from negative but necessary expenditure that provides unemployed Indigenous Australians with citizenship entitlements.

Altman, J.C. and Hunter, B. 1998. 'Indigenous poverty', in R. Fincher and J. Nieuwenhuysen (eds), *Australian Poverty: Then and Now*, Melbourne University Press, Melbourne, 238–57, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1998_AustralianPoverty.pdf>.

Keywords: Economic status, poverty trends, data, methodology, Henderson Report

Summary: This paper asks and examines four questions in relation to the Henderson Report and Indigenous poverty: Firstly, how has the extent of Indigenous poverty changed in the last 20 years in both relative and absolute terms? Secondly, in conceptual terms, should researchers and policy makers distinguish between Indigenous and other poor? Thirdly, has our broad understanding of the causes of Indigenous poverty changed? And fourthly, what has been the broad policy response to Indigenous poverty and has it been successful?

Despite the difficulty in ensuring the comparability of measures of Indigenous poverty, there is evidence of moderate improvement in economic status. However, these improvements are more likely to be the result of increases in the proportion of low-income non-Indigenous households, rather than due to reductions in the proportion of low-income Indigenous households. The authors further argue that conventional poverty methodology cannot adequately capture important aspects of Indigenous poverty. Any discussion of changes in Indigenous poverty over time must recognise emerging Indigenous priorities and capture important non-income sources of wellbeing such as hunting, fishing and gathering. They must also acknowledge differences in income-sharing arrangements and household family size among Indigenous and non-Indigenous

households, geographical variations in the cost of living, and the depth of Indigenous inequality and its distributionally-sensitive nature.

An earlier version of this paper was published as Altman, J.C. and Hunter, B. 1997. 'Indigenous poverty since the Henderson Report', *Discussion Paper No. 127*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1997DP127.php>>.

Altman, J.C. 2001. 'The economic status of Indigenous Australians', in J. Jupp (ed), *The Australian People: An Encyclopedia of the Nation, Its People and Their Origins*, Cambridge University Press, Melbourne, 135–141, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2001_TheAusPeople.pdf>.

Keywords: Status, economic marginality, exclusion, funding

Summary: This article provides a basic examination of the economic status of Indigenous Australians as a culturally distinctive self-identifying group, and outlines a broadly related set of interplaying factors that can explain Indigenous economic marginality. Altman addresses the highly complex and broad policy and program responses to Indigenous poverty over the last three decades, and highlights current research that shows no automatic positive correlation between funding and improved economic status. Much of this funding, he continues, comes out of the Indigenous affairs portfolio rather than from the appropriate state or federal government department. As a result, these resources often provide a range of services that other Australians already receive, with Indigenous people being under-funded despite their extremely low economic status. The projected growth rate of the Indigenous population also draws attention to the need for appropriately targeted funding and the merits of special versus mainstream funding.

An early version of this paper was previously published as Altman, J.C. 2000. 'The economic status of Indigenous Australians', *Discussion Paper No. 193*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/2000DP193.php>>.

Altman, J.C. 2001. 'Overcoming Indigenous poverty', *CEDA Bulletin*, March, 56–60, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/2001_CEDA.pdf>.

Keywords: Poverty, socioeconomic status, policy development

Summary: Over the last three decades, consistent research has sought to identify the extent and cause of Indigenous poverty. The area has received concerted government attention and a considerable allocation of funds. This response has broadly taken two avenues: directly addressing socioeconomic disadvantage in areas like health, housing, employment and education; and broadly facilitating Indigenous economic development with special measures to return land to Indigenous ownership and make special allocations of capital to facilitate ownership. However, addressing this issue and making progress, in both a real and statistically measurable sense, has proven extremely difficult. A comparison of the social indicators from the early 1970s and late 1990s suggests that little improvement has occurred. Altman insists that it is not so much the level of funding that is the issue. Rather, it is the philosophies guiding government policies, which he sees as having remained fundamentally assimilationist, and the main purpose to which such funds are directed.

Altman, J.C. 2001. 'Indigenous Communities and Business: Three Perspectives 1998–2000', *Working Paper No. 9*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/WP/2000WP9.php>>.

Keywords: 'Doing business' with Indigenous communities, community sector, IBA, Indigenous businesses

Summary: This paper addresses issues of Indigenous peoples' engagement with business and focuses on 'the community sector' in which people's lives are excessively dependent on the state. Altman situates the current economic and policy context in relation to 'doing business' with Indigenous communities, and questions what role businesses might play in Indigenous economic development in the future. He further examines what roles Indigenous businesses themselves may play in the expanding Indigenous economy, and highlights the need for a better understanding of Indigenous businesses.

Altman, J.C. 2002. 'Generating finance for Indigenous development: Economic realities and innovative options', *Working Paper No. 15*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<https://digitalcollections.anu.edu.au/bitstream/1885/40162/2/CAEPRWP15.pdf>>.

Keywords: Finance, corporate sector, economic development

Summary: In this paper Altman argues that the ability to access consumer and business banking services remains a fundamental need for enhancing the economic futures of Indigenous communities. Discerning the role of access to finance in delivering economic development opportunities to Indigenous Australia is a complex task, given the enormous diversity of this population. Yet there are many existing opportunities for development progress in the Indigenous sector. Altman examines how real development futures might be financed and delivered, especially to Indigenous people living in regional and rural areas where limited conventional development opportunities exist. In doing so, he considers how current institutions and statutory and non-statutory policy frameworks might be used by Indigenous interests to strategically influence development capital. This is critical under current circumstances, where governments appear reluctant to recognise communal Indigenous rights and interests. Altman suggests that corporate leadership by the banking sector, akin to that taken by key mining corporates in the native title era, is one possibility.

Altman, J.C. 2003. 'The economic and social context of Indigenous health', in N. Thomson (ed), *The Health of Indigenous Australians*, Oxford University Press, Melbourne, 25–43, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2003_TheHealthOfIndigenous.pdf>.

Keywords: Economic status, poverty, health

Summary: In this chapter Altman details some of the conceptual problems behind the methodology of calculating the 'economic status' of Indigenous people, before identifying why this measurement is crucial to addressing Indigenous poverty. Recent census data outcomes are discussed in the areas of employment, occupation, income, housing, education and health, before assessing the historical, structural, cultural and demand-side (prejudice and negative stereotyping) factors that underpin current levels of marginality. Many of the explanations for Indigenous marginality are also

considered, from an Indigenous perspective, in terms of continuity, identity, distinctiveness and cultural survival. Altman outlines the complex program and policy responses to this situation over the last 35 years, and stresses the need for policy flexibility and financial commitments in the future which are not delivered at the expense of equitable citizenship entitlements.

Altman, J.C. and Hunter, B. 2003. 'Evaluating Indigenous socioeconomic outcomes in the Reconciliation decade, 1991–2001', *Economic Papers*, 22 (4): 1–15, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Evaluating-Indigenous-socioeconomic-outcomes-Reconciliation-decade-1991-2001.php>>.

Keywords: 'Symbolic' and 'practical' reconciliation, socioeconomic status, statistical equity

Summary: The 1990s saw a shift in Indigenous policy attention from what has been called 'symbolic reconciliation' to 'practical reconciliation' under the election of the Howard government in 1996. In this paper, Altman and Hunter scrutinise the socioeconomic outcomes of Indigenous people in three different time periods: 1991–1996, 1996–2001, and over the decade from 1991–2001. They ask, how do the socioeconomic outcomes of 1991–1996, a period when symbolic reconciliation was dominant, compare with those of 1996–2001, a period when a change in government saw a greater policy focus on practical reconciliation? Outlining the pitfalls of census data for generating these results, the authors focus on five sets of variables – employment, income, housing, education and health. They conclude that there is no statistical evidence from census information that the policies and programs of the Howard government between 1996–2001 delivered better outcomes for Indigenous people at the national level than those under the previous administration.

A similar version of this paper was published as Altman, J.C. and Hunter, B. 2003. 'Monitoring 'practical' reconciliation: Evidence from the reconciliation decade, 1991–2001', *Discussion Paper No. 254*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/2003DP254.php>>.

Altman, J.C. 2004. 'The establishment of a corpus on Indigenous economic policy research: Lessons for Indigenous health economics research', in M. Otim, I. Anderson and I. Scott (eds), *Economics and Indigenous Australian Health Policy*, Centre for the Study of Health and Society, University of Melbourne, Melbourne, 174–186, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2004_EconomicsAndIndigenous.pdf>.

Keywords: CAEPR, research, Indigenous health economics

Summary: This is an ideas paper concerning the establishment of a corpus of Indigenous economic policy research in Australia which questions how lessons from this research might be transported to Indigenous health research. Altman discusses six issues he sees as being crucial to this field. These include the need for a better understanding of the causes of low Indigenous health status and the role that economic status might play in this, and a better conceptual framework which allows a cultural analysis of Indigenous health status variability. He further presents possible lessons from the CAEPR experience. These consist of the need for an effective multi-disciplinary approach; a combination of macro-statistical and micro-field research; partnering between university, public and Indigenous community sectors and being accountable to a diversity of stakeholders; multi-year funding; strategic research response capacity; and an overall emphasis on maintaining momentum under stringent circumstances. Altman concludes by highlighting potentially problematic trade-offs and tensions in the partnership between the university sector, bureaucracy and Indigenous stakeholders, and stresses the need to stay focused on core research business while being responsive to change.

Altman, J.C., Biddle, N. and Hunter, B. 2005. 'A historical perspective on Indigenous socioeconomic outcomes in Australia, 1971–2001', *Australian Economic History Review*, 45 (3): 273–95, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2005_AusEcoHistoryRreview.pdf>.

Keywords: Socioeconomic status, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: This article refutes the assertion that policy concerning Indigenous affairs over the last 30 years has been a failure. In order to avoid focusing on short-

term analysis that may be anecdotal, the authors look for historical depth and trends in outcomes. They build on findings by Altman and Hunter (2003), taking a longer-term perspective and constructing a corresponding set of variables that are comparable back to 1971. Socioeconomic trends in census data between 1971–2001 are examined using the social indicators of employment, income, housing, education and health, at the national level. Two extra variables are introduced to control for the influence of the CDEP scheme: the proportion of adults in private sector jobs, and those in full time jobs. They find evidence for a steady improvement in outcomes since 1971, especially after 1981, although all improvements have been slow. Furthermore, unlike the other socioeconomic trends measured, the long-term trend in formal education has seen an unequivocal improvement. The slow improvements over time are more indicative of broad policy settings being correct than of policy failure. The authors further insist that any radical changes in policy development processes at the national level might jeopardise a slow process of improvement that history suggests is under way. Policy refinement may be appropriate however at a sub-national level.

A previous version of this paper was published as Altman, J.C., Biddle, N. and Hunter, B. 2004. 'Indigenous socioeconomic change 1971-2001', *Discussion Paper No. 266*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/DP/2004_DP266.pdf>.

Altman, J.C. and Taylor, J. 2006. 'Statistical needs in Indigenous affairs: The role of the 2002 NATSISS', in B.H. Hunter (ed), 'Assessing The Evidence on Indigenous Socioeconomic Outcomes: A Focus on the 2002 NATSISS', *Research Monograph No. 26*, CAEPR, ANU E Press, Canberra, pp. 11–21, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Assessing-Evidence-Indigenous-Socioeconomic-Outcomes-Focus-2002-NATSISS.php>>.

Keywords: Socioeconomic status, data, methodology, statistical accountability

Summary: This paper, presented at the conference Indigenous Socioeconomic Outcomes: Assessing Recent Evidence in 2005, broadly examines the historical development, role, value and shortfalls of the 2002 National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Social Survey (NATSISS). The authors situate this discussion within the recent 'whole-of-government' approach to

Indigenous policy development, the broader strategy of the ABS to enhance the availability of statistics on Indigenous Australians, and the longer term role that the NATSISS instrument might play in Indigenous policy and program effectiveness. A number of methodological, practical and political dimensions to designing and using the NATSISS data collection are outlined. For example, sample instruments like the NATSISS are best deployed to inform high-level policy discussion about the broad nature of inter-relationships between social circumstances and outcomes. Yet for reasons of sample size and non-response error, such instruments are less well suited to establishing absolute levels of need and comparison over time. The usefulness of such data for regional community organisations and their members is also questioned, as the NATSISS is unable to capture cultural difference and the diversity of Indigenous circumstances.

Altman, J.C. and Hunter, B.H. 2006. 'Influencing Indigenous policy making with statistics', in B.H. Hunter (ed), 'Assessing The Evidence on Indigenous Socioeconomic Outcomes: A Focus on the 2002 NATSISS', *Research Monograph No. 26*, CAEPR, ANU E Press, Canberra, 311–9, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Assessing-Evidence-Indigenous-Socioeconomic-Outcomes-Focus-2002-NATSISS.php>>.

Keywords: Data, methodology, cultural plurality, difference, social sciences

Summary: In this concluding chapter, the authors discuss key issues that emerged from the 2005 conference Indigenous Socioeconomic Outcomes: Assessing Recent Evidence, and its focus on the 2002 National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Social Survey (NATSISS). Key concerns include the role of theory in data use, the need to stipulate the qualifications about data quality, and the necessity of theorising and contextualising data use. Further issues raised here concern the possibility of including an Indigenous identifier in other ABS Household Surveys (such as the Labour Force Survey and the Household Income and Expenditure Surveys), and the question of what policy questions are actually being addressed with the collection of social statistics. The authors stress that social science expertise is needed in deciding which such questions will be asked. The artificial distinction between 'evidence-based' and 'outcomes-based' policy is further discussed, as is the consequences of poorly defined outcomes, as seen in the CDEP scheme. The authors argue that the tension between equality and cultural plurality is a fundamental

complexity at the heart of policy development and its evaluation and outcomes, and that social science is crucial to addressing this issue.

Altman, J.C. 2008. 'The Indigenous "Employment Gap"', *Arena Magazine*, 97, Oct–Nov: 31–3, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/2008_Arena%2097.pdf>.

Keywords: Closing the Gaps, livelihoods approach

Summary: This paper stems from a presentation provided by Altman at the Inaugural Reconciliation Conference, where Altman was invited by ReconciliACT to discuss closing the employment gap between Indigenous and non-Indigenous Australians. Altman uses this opportunity to outline and critique the data collection tools available for assessing this socioeconomic criteria, and to highlight changes in these results to date. He then focuses on myths around Indigenous employment, stressing the misconceptions in public discourse on this issue. He questions what he sees as a speculative view that Indigenous people can be integrated into mainstream labour markets, despite an absence of statistics to support this approach, and reiterates his long-term argument that Australia continues to under-invest in Indigenous communities. Such environments face a backlog of neglect which necessitates greater investment in basic education, training and employment. The focus on mainstream labour markets under 'practical reconciliation', Altman further stresses, has also diverted attention from creating an economic base in remote areas where such labour markets rarely exist. A livelihoods approach would be better suited to this end, as this would better reflect a comprehensive suite of approaches which include both public and private sector strategies.

Altman, J.C., Biddle, N. and Hunter, B.H. 2008. 'How realistic are the prospects for 'Closing the Gaps' in socioeconomic outcomes for Indigenous Australians?', *Discussion Paper No. 287, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra*, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/DP/2008_DP287.pdf>.

Keywords: Socioeconomic status, Indigenous wellbeing, Closing the Gap

Summary: This paper uses census-based analysis at the national level to examine trends in Indigenous wellbeing since 1971. These results show consistent, albeit slow

improvement in most socioeconomic outcomes as measured by standard social indicators over 35 years, and this finding conflicts with the currently dominant discourse of 'failure' in Indigenous affairs. However, evidence of convergence between Indigenous and non-Indigenous outcomes is not consistent, and the authors develop best-case scenario trends to make preliminary estimates for when the gaps might be closed. They suggest that commitments to 'reducing disparities' rather than 'closing the gaps' might be a more realistic policy framework and goal for the Rudd Government.

An earlier version of this paper was published as Altman, J.C., Biddle, N. and Hunter, B.H. 2008. The Challenge of 'Closing the Gaps' in Indigenous Socioeconomic Outcomes', Briefing paper prepared for the Australia 2020 Summit, *Topical Issue No. 08/2008*, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2008TI8.php>>.

Altman, J. C. 2009. 'Indigenous communities, miners and the state in Australia', in J.C. Altman and D. Martin (eds), *Power, Culture, Economy: Indigenous Australians and Mining, CAEPR Research Monograph No. 30, ANU E Press, Canberra*, 17–49, available at <<http://press.anu.edu.au/wp-content/uploads/2011/05/ch0269.pdf>>.

Keywords: Mining, hybrid economy, paternalism, Indigenous economic development, statistical equality, mining

Summary: In this chapter Altman scrutinises the development situation faced by Indigenous Australians through a focus on such people's interactions with the mining industry. He considers the mediating, regulating and limiting role played by the state and state governmentality in these processes, and challenges what he sees as the state's persistent paternalistic and monolithic approach to Indigenous economic development. This approach focuses primarily on the mainstream development opportunities that mining presents to Indigenous communities. He then explores alternative development perspectives that emphasises choice as well as an institutional recognition of the inherent rights of Indigenous Australians to control the nature of development on their ancestral lands, self-determination, cultural continuity and economic hybridity.

In this analysis, Altman distinguishes between what he refers to as 'life projects' and 'development projects', with the former being based on the customary sector. The hybrid economy is presented as a development model

alternative to neoliberal models, and as being similar to livelihoods and community economy approaches. This engagement in a diversity of livelihood sources across all sectors of the hybrid economy is evidence of post-colonial adaptation. Altman argues for the applicability of the hybrid economy framework beyond the context of its creation (his fieldwork in Arnhem Land), highlighting that data from the 2002 NATSISS show Indigenous participation rates in hunting, fishing and the production of art for sale as being extremely high. Moreover, Altman advocates that a wealth of opportunities exist for increased Indigenous environmental management and thus enhanced engagement in the hybrid economy, including in the mining sector.

No. 287, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/DP/2008_DP287.pdf>.

Altman, J.C., Biddle, N. and Hunter, B.H. 2009. 'Prospects for 'closing the gap' in socioeconomic outcomes for Indigenous Australians?', *Australian Economic History Review*, 49 (3): 225–51, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2009_AusEconomicHistReview.pdf>.

Keywords: Disadvantage, Closing the Gap, life expectancy, policy realism

Summary: This paper speaks to the viability of the policy goal of 'Closing the Gap' between Indigenous and non-Indigenous life expectancies. This goal seeks to eliminate socioeconomic disparities between Indigenous and other Australians, and to abolish the 17 year life expectancy gap between Indigenous and non-Indigenous people within a generation. The authors document the historical progress in 'closing the gap' across a range of broad socioeconomic indicators associated with health outcomes which may explain differences in life expectancy. They find that Indigenous socioeconomic outcomes have improved at the national level, with unequivocal progress in the areas of household size and income, home ownership and education. However, these results are at odds with the dominant discourse of policy failure in Indigenous outcomes over the past 35 years. Emerging data trends are then used to extrapolate a possible and more realistic time frame for 'closing the gap', based on the continuation of these circumstances. The authors conclude that commitments to 'reducing disparities' rather than 'closing the gap' may be a more realistic policy goal.

A similar version of this paper was published as Altman, J.C., Biddle, N. and Hunter, B.H, 2008. 'How realistic are the prospects for 'Closing the Gaps' in socioeconomic outcomes for Indigenous Australians?' *Discussion Paper*

7. Land rights and native title

***Altman, J.C. 1983. *Aborigines and Mining Royalties in the Northern Territory*, Australian Institute of Aboriginal Studies, Canberra.**

Keywords: Mining royalties

Summary: This book is Altman's first substantial post-doctoral publication and represents the first study of the land rights era to both analyse the workings of new institutions established to distribute mining royalties under Aboriginal control as well as the development impacts of these financial resources. This research has been foundational in Altman's subsequent work on the Aboriginals Benefit Trust Account (now the Aboriginals Benefit Account), royalty associations, land councils, the economic leverage provided by land rights, and the taxation of mining payments.

In this book, Altman examines the issues related to the management and distribution of mining royalties in the Northern Territory. He highlights many of the shortcomings that impede the fair and efficient use and distribution of mining moneys. Among these are numerous inconsistencies and a lack of clarity regarding definition of beneficiaries (at the origin of dispute between Indigenous groups), as well as the role and nature of mining royalties (compensation or revenue?). Numerous administrative and legislative issues are also identified, such as the taxation of royalties and the lack of staff qualified to deal with royalties issues within the land councils. Altman also includes practical recommendations for a review of the Aboriginals Benefit Trust Account and related financial matters in the Northern Territory land rights legislation that saw the appointment of Altman a year later to chair a review of these issues for the Australian government.

Altman, J.C. 1983. 'The payment of mining royalties to Aborigines in the Northern Territory: Compensation or revenue?', *Discussion Paper No. 77*, Centre for Economic Policy Research, Research School of Social Sciences, ANU, 1–25.

Keywords: Mining royalties

Summary: In this paper Altman concludes that as long as the intended functions of Aboriginal royalty rights remained undefined in policy, potential shortcomings exist in the granting of these rights to Aborigines.

A subsequent version of this paper was also published as Altman, J.C. 1985. 'The payment of mining royalties to Aborigines: Compensation or revenue?', *Anthropological Forum*, 5 (3): 474–88 available at: <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1985_AnthropologicalForum.pdf>.

Altman, J.C. and Peterson, N. 1984. 'The case for Aboriginal access to mining royalties under land rights legislation', *Discussion Paper No. 89*, Centre for Economic Policy Research, Research School of Social Sciences, ANU, 1–37, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1984_CEPRDP89.pdf>.

Keywords: Mining royalties, wealth investment

Summary: This paper discusses the access and uses of mining royalties under land rights legislation. Altman and Peterson argue that there is a need to place constraints on the ways in which royalties are to be used and distributed, and that this may be done in two ways: by finding separate source of funding to cover the daily cost of land rights administration, and by setting aside a percentage of the royalties to create the wealth to invest, while also maintaining an eye on social and economic objectives.

Also published as Altman, J.C. and Peterson, N. 1984. 'A case for retaining Aboriginal mining veto and royalty rights in the Northern Territory', *Australian Aboriginal Studies*, 1984 (2): 44–53 available at: <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1984_AusAboriginalStudies.pdf>.

***Altman, J.C. 1985. *Report on the Review of the Aboriginals Benefit Trust Account (and Related Financial Matters) in the Northern Territory Land Rights Legislation*, Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra.**

Keywords: Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act, ABTA, land councils, mining royalties

Summary: This published report was authored by Altman as the ministerially-appointed chair of a major review of the Aboriginals Benefit Trust Account (ABTA). Alongside

the book *Aborigines and Mining Royalties in the Northern Territory*, this evaluative and evidence-based research has been foundational in a subsequent body of work by Altman which focuses on the economic implications of land rights and later native title for Indigenous Australians, as well as in his engagement with the formation and evaluation of Indigenous policy.

The report discusses the role, structure, functions and operations of the ABTA and the Trust Account Advisory Committee. It recommends a major restructuring of the ABTA and amendments to the 1976 Act, and suggests that the ABTA become autonomous from the Department of Aboriginal Affairs with complete Indigenous control of the ABTA as a long-term objective. A timetable is presented to establish some of the steps needed to be undertaken towards complete ABTA autonomy. It also suggests that a further review is needed to examine the progress of the proposed new ABTA structure after five years.

Altman, J.C. 1985. The impact of mining royalties on Aboriginal economic development in the Northern Territory', in P. Loveday and D. Wade-Marshall (eds), *Economy and People in the North*, North Australia Research Unit, Darwin, 61–72, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1985_EconomyAndPeople.pdf>.

Keywords: Mining royalties, ABTA, pre-land rights context, post-land rights context, assimilation policy, self-determination

Summary: This paper examines the role of mining royalty payments in Aboriginal economic development in the Northern Territory. In particular, it speculates on the role that such payments may play in the future to address the low structural position occupied by Indigenous people in the NT's political economy. Altman critically analyses the application of the recommendations contained in the Woodward's Aboriginal Land Rights Commission report, reminding readers that self-determination was Woodward's guiding principle.

Altman argues that the undefined roles of mining royalties opened the door for the NT and Federal Governments to use such payments to subsidise some of the normal government expenditures, that is, making Aboriginal groups pay for government responsibilities. Altman identifies mining royalties as one of the few relatively autonomous avenues for collective accumulation of capital. As such, he insists they should also be used to

increase Aboriginal political power and invested in ways which improve Indigenous people's long-term economic status and levels of self-sufficiency. Based on this reasoning, Altman insists, royalties should be utilised in creative ways which fund collective projects and not be distributed to individuals.

Altman, J.C. and Dillon, M.C. 1985. 'Land rights: Why Hawke's model has no backing', *Australian Society*, 4 (6): 26–9, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1985_AusSociety.pdf>.

Keywords: Land rights reforms, right to negotiate

Summary: In this article, Altman and Dillon summarise the saga surrounding the Hawke government proposition for a nation-wide Aboriginal Land Rights model. The initial preferred model proposed used the Northern Territory Aboriginal Land Rights model as a benchmark to which was added a right for Aboriginal groups to negotiate compensations for loss of lands. This first model was supported by Indigenous interests. Following an anti-land rights campaign, led by the mining industry and endorsed by the Western Australian government, the Hawke ministry removed three of the five principles which constituted the initial proposal. The remaining two principles stipulated that Aboriginal land be held under inalienable freehold title, and that sacred sites be protected, leaving aside any right to royalties, with limited Aboriginal control being possible over mining and the right to negotiate. In the end, the proposition was deemed unacceptable by all parties, including Aboriginal interests.

Altman and Dillon argue that it may be wise to abandon a uniform nation-wide model for Aboriginal Land Rights, partly because Aboriginal peoples' needs are not homogenous. They suggest examining variations of the Northern Territory formula, or a modified South Australian system, which would also incorporate the five principles initially proposed by the Australian Labor Party, and which would also recognise regional differences. The implementation of such systems, they continue, will require more determined Commonwealth commitment to national land rights and the use of constitutional power to override policies in States that are opposed to land rights.

Altman, J.C. and Dillon, M.C. 1988. 'Aboriginal land rights, land councils and the development of the Northern Territory', in P. Loveday and D. Wade-Marshall (eds) *Contemporary Issues in Development*, North Australia Research Unit, Darwin, 126–54, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1988_ContemporaryIssues.pdf>.

Keywords: Land councils, economic development, representative bodies

Summary: In this chapter Altman and Dillon analyse the functions and activities of the land councils, relatively new institutions at this time, and examine their potential role in the future of the Northern Territory. They foresee the economic development of the NT becoming increasingly predicated on greater co-operation between the NT government and Aboriginal land councils. This will require less conflict and a mutual recognition of each others' roles and domains.

Altman, J.C. and Smith, D.E. 1990. 'The Possible Economic Impacts of Mining and Tourism in the Kakadu Conservation Zone on Aboriginal People', Resource Assessment Commission Kakadu Conservation Zone Inquiry, Consultancy Series, Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra.

Keywords: Kakadu Conservation Zone, mining, tourism, development, employment, Jawoyn people, economic impacts

Summary: This report forms one of two parts of a consultancy contracted by the Resource Assessment Commission to assess the significance of the Kakadu Conservation Zone (KCZ) to Indigenous people. The report's major focus is the economic opportunities for Indigenous people, paying attention to gender and age differences. The impacts of these developments are assessed as being deleterious in the region, where the 'Aboriginalisation' of employment and training has proceeded at the expense of localisation of Indigenous employment. The authors separate and reintegrate mining and tourism spin-offs, distinguish between direct and indirect economic effects, and examine what may be speculative outcomes of the Jawoyn people's continual opposition to mining in the KCZ in a situation where development may be forcibly imposed.

Altman, J.C. 1991. 'The economic impact of Australian Aboriginal land rights', in M.A. Thompson and J. Whitwell (eds), *Society and Culture: Economic Perspectives*, New Zealand Association of Economists, Wellington, 5–22, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1991_SocietyAndCulture.pdf>.

Keywords: Land rights, economic development, economic impacts

Summary: The institution of Aboriginal Land Rights in the 1970s and 1980s carried the promise of economic advancement for Aboriginal people. However, the Northern Territory and New South Wales experiences to 1991 show that land rights has translated mainly into positive non-economic outcomes. These consist of providing Aboriginal land owners and residents on Aboriginal lands with political power and para-governmental institutions, as well as cultural benefits such as a land-based identity; the means to sustain their religious system; and insulation from wider society. In this paper, Altman argues that land rights has represented somewhat of a trade-off for Aboriginal people, leaving them with the difficult choice of opting for self-determined land-based cultural autonomy on the one hand, or urban-based socioeconomic equity through their integration into the mainstream economy on the other.

Altman, J.C. 1992. 'Land rights and land use in Aboriginal Australia, with a specific focus on the Northern Territory', in S. Henningham, R. May and L. Turner (eds) *Resources, Development and Politics in the Pacific Islands*, Crawford House Press, Bathurst, 206–222, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1992_ResDevAndPolitics.pdf>.

Keywords: Land rights, economic development, economic impacts

Summary: Using the Northern Territory as a case study, Altman argues that despite gains in political and economic leverage as well as cultural benefits, there is no straightforward or automatic correlation between land rights (often over land of little commercial value), access to associated resources, and economic development. Unfortunately, there is a trade-off between incompatible goals of cultural autonomy and economic equality, the latter being through incorporation into the mainstream economy.

Altman, J.C. 1993. 'Economic dimensions of the High Court's Mabo judgment', *Australian Economic Review*, 26 (3): 26–34, available at <<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1467-8462.1993.tb00794.x/abstract>>.

Keywords: Land rights, native title, economic development, economic impacts

Summary: This article critiques the lack of engagement by economists in the debate surrounding Aboriginal land rights and native title. In the absence of analysis based on rationality, optimality and first-best policy responses, there is a risk that decisions will be made on the basis of political expediency which vacillates between principle and pragmatism. In this article, Altman argues that the economic implications of the Mabo decision need sound economic assessments and advice on a range of issues. These include the equity and efficiency implications of poorly defined property rights; the impact of delays caused to native title claims and negotiations over resource development on business investments; and the need to establish institutional arrangements that will allow efficient utilisation of any land and resources that are to be acquired by Indigenous interests following recognition of native title, as well as a possible redistribution of factor endowments which will avoid inappropriate trade-off between economic efficiency and equity.

Altman, J.C., Ginn, A. and Smith, D.E. 1993. *Existing and Potential Mechanisms for Indigenous Involvement in Coastal Zone Resource Management*, Resource Assessment Commission, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Reports/1993_ResourceAssessment.pdf>.

Keywords: Natural Resource Management, Indigenous knowledge, roles of statutory land, sea and resources rights, informal mechanisms, representative structure, decision-making power

Summary: This report aims to identify practical options for coastal zone resources management involving Indigenous people. Through their examination of various cases across the states and territories, the authors identify several catalysts and hurdles for such participation.

Statutory land, sea and resources rights do not provide Indigenous interests with the means to participate in decision making over coastal management and development. However, these rights do provide people

with leverage and bargaining power, and thus some basis for participation in coastal management regimes. The authors note that financial resources and appropriate representative structures are needed to increase these opportunities. Such participation is also achievable through a range of other institutional forms, and informal mechanisms have been used by Indigenous groups to have a say in coastal zone management. These include community-based initiatives, informal re-occupation of sites of cultural significance, international treaty, and Commonwealth and State heritage legislations.

Drawing on cases in each of the states and territories, the authors demonstrate the role of local government authorities in facilitating or obstructing Indigenous participation in planning and decision making processes. Noting the interstate differences in circumstances, they call for the establishment of intergovernmental guidelines to Indigenous participation in coastal management.

Altman, J.C. 1994. 'Economic implications of native title: Dead end or way forward?', in W. Sanders (ed), *Mabo and Native Title: Origins and Institutional Implications*, *Research Monograph No. 7*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, 61–77, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/mono/1994RM7.php>>.

Keywords: Native title, land rights, mining, economic impacts

Summary: In this paper, Altman foresees that the Mabo decision will neither lead to an economic take-off of the Indigenous sector Australia-wide, nor prompt the collapse of the mining industry. According to the author, native title determinations are likely to represent both a way forward, primarily in regional Australian, and a dead end for metropolitan and urban Indigenous people holding no native title. In a similar way to land rights legislations, native title provides only a first step towards economic development. This step needs to be undertaken alongside strategies to enhance other factor endowments which aim to make Indigenous Australians competitive in the wider economy.

Altman, J.C. 1994. 'Economic implications of Australia's Native Title legislation', *Victoria Economic Commentaries*, 11 (2): 7–17, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1994_VictoriaEconomic.pdf>.

Keywords: Native title, economic development, Native Title Act 1993 and the ATSIC Amendment (Indigenous Land Corporation and Land Fund) Bill 1994,

Summary: In this paper, Altman explores the economic implications of the *Native Title Act 1993* and the ATSIC Amendment (Indigenous Land Corporation and Land Fund) Bill 1994. In the early days following the establishment of the Native Title legislation, Altman anticipated that the vast majority of land over which native title was to be recognised would be unalienated or vacant Crown land with limited commercial value. This would also preclude access to the potential value of minerals for which Indigenous people have no de facto property rights. Altman concludes that political expediency may be responsible for the *Native Title Act 1993* shortcomings which precluded the Act from being a more workable regulatory framework.

Altman, J.C. 1994. 'Economic implications of Native Title: Managing money effectively', in M. Edmunds, J. Fingleton and P. McRandle (eds), *Proof and Management of Native Title*, Native Title Research Unit, Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies, Canberra, 86–90, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1994_ProofAndManagement>.

Keywords: Mining royalties, Native Title Act

Summary: In this paper, Altman examines three potential options comprised within the *Native Title Act 1993*—which have precedents in land rights laws—for Indigenous Australians' economic development. These options for native title holders or claimants consist of: exercising the 'right to negotiate' (inside or outside the NNTT) to gain compensation payments for use of land; financial return or freehold land acquired through the surrendering of native titles; and purchasing of land for non-native title holders through the National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Land Fund. The focus here is on macro and micro-strategic issues associated with effective utilisation of financial resources. The author highlights a number of issues, such as the need for more statutory stipulation on the purposes to which compensation moneys can be applied and

distributed; how much money should be earmarked for the Land Fund; and over what time frame and what percentage of these moneys should be quarantined for investment purposes.

Altman, J.C. and Smith, D.E. 1994. 'The economic impact of mining moneys: The Nabarlek case, Western Arnhem Land', *Discussion Paper No. 63*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1994DP63.php>>.

Keywords: Native title, mining royalties, Nabarlek Traditional Owners Association

Summary: In this paper Altman and Smith use the case of Nabarlek Traditional Owners Association (NTOA) in western Arnhem Land to illustrate a number of policy, administrative and legislative shortcomings associated with land rights laws. The case of NTOA demonstrates the accountability problems faced by royalty associations, the difficulties and conflicts arising from imprecision regarding the nature and purposes of mining moneys (compensation or revenue), and confusion inherent in the absence of a clear definition of what is actually meant by 'affected area', which creates problems in terms of identifying beneficiaries. As the authors make clear, there are also problems associated with a lack of clarity around the role of external agencies such as land councils and government departments. This includes the extent of their responsibility to support royalty associations, monitor their performance, and the parameters determining when it is justified to intervene in order to address problems and difficulties faced by these associations. The authors suggest that a more formalised and constructive role for agencies such as the Northern Land Council may prove to be of considerable assistance to 'royalty associations'.

Altman, J.C. 1995. 'Land rights and Aboriginal economic development: Lessons from the Northern Territory', *Agenda*, 2 (3): 291–99, available at <<http://epress.anu.edu.au/wp-content/uploads/2011/05/2-3-A-3.pdf>>.

Keywords: Native Title, economic development mining royalties, right to negotiate, partnership with resource developers

Summary: In this article, Altman reemphasises his argument that land ownership alone does not guarantee economic development. Lessons learnt from decades of land rights laws in the Northern Territory suggest that the

prosperity of Indigenous people resides in their active participation as significant stakeholders in resource development. There is growing recognition among Aboriginal interests that new forms of joint ventures with non-Indigenous stakeholders are needed, ones which are based on Indigenous equity participation, employment and training opportunities as well as buy-back options. Altman argues that the *Native Title Act 1993* has provided a strong incentive to take this route.

A previous and longer version of this paper was published as Altman, J.C. 1994. 'Implementing native title: Economic lessons from the Northern Territory', *Discussion Paper No. 64*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1994DP64.php>>.

Altman, J.C. 1995. 'Native Title Act 1993: implementation issues for resource developers', *Discussion Paper No. 88*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1995DP88.php>>.

Keywords: Native Title Act, right to negotiate, partnership with resource developers

Summary: In this paper Altman takes a public policy perspective and utilises an economic framework to analyse the rationale and associated risks of the strategy of interested parties in challenging the effectiveness of the *Native Title Act 1993* (NTA). He concludes that while major changes to the NTA regime need to be considered, working within the limits of the NTA framework offers the potential to extract gains from trade. Based on key lessons learnt from nearly twenty years of the Northern Territory Land Rights Act, Altman argues that focusing on legislative amendment will take time, and that continuing strategic behaviour as well as associated avoidance behaviour by resource developers, is likely to result in net long-term losses for mining and petroleum industries.

Altman, J.C. and Smith, D.E. 1995. 'Funding Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander representative bodies under the Native Title Act 1993', *Land, Rights, Laws: Issues of Native Title No. 8*, Native Title Research Unit, AIATSIS, Canberra, 1–12, available at <<http://www.aiatsis.gov.au/ntru/docs/publications/issues/ip95n8.pdf>>.

Keywords: Native title, representative bodies, collaboration, financial resources

Summary: In this paper Altman and Smith argue that in order to ensure maximum benefit from native title for as many Indigenous Australians as possible, ATSIC and Representative Bodies must collaborate and avoid being adversaries over financial resources. For the same reasons, it is also essential that the ability of Representative Bodies to undertake their legislative functions is not eroded by organisational rivalry and competition for funds. Such organisations must be able to assert an orderly and strategic approach to their native title activities.

Smith, D.E. and Altman, J.C. 1995. *Review of Native Title Representative Bodies 1995*, Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission, Canberra, 142 pp. (for introductory comments on the report see Smith, D.E. and Altman, J.C. 1995. 'The Report of the ATSIC Review of Representative Bodies', in P. Burke (ed.) *The Skills of Native Title Practice: Proceedings of a Workshop*, Native Titles Research Unit, Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies, Canberra, 150–157, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1995_SkillsOfNativeTitle.pdf>).

Keywords: Native Title, representative bodies, accountability

Summary: This first Review finds Native Title Representative Bodies (NTRBs) to be significantly under-resourced, a situation which leaves them, and the Indigenous Australian they represent, at a disadvantage in negotiations with government and resource developers. The situation is in many cases the result of an unexpected workload, with growing evidence at this time that effective NTRBs are integral to the workability of the Native Title Act. It is recommended that mechanisms be established to see the NTRBs adequately resourced in light of this workload. It is also imperative that NTRBs are held accountable to both their Indigenous constituencies as well as the wider Australian public in terms of representativeness, performance of duties, and financial management. These issues will need to be addressed holistically.

Altman, J.C. 1996. 'Aboriginal economic development and land rights in the Northern Territory: Past performance, current issues and Strategic options', in Northern and Central Land Councils *Land Rights Past, Present and Future: 20 Years of Land Rights*, CMS Indigenous Consulting, Canberra, 54–62, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1996_LandRights.pdf>.

Keywords: Land Rights, land councils, customary sector, veto right, partnership with resource developers

Summary: No clear correlation can be shown to date between Aboriginal Land Rights and economic development. This is partly because of the failure of the census to take into account unorthodox commercial activities as well as economic activities located outside the market economy. Nevertheless, Altman argues that the transfer of land to Aboriginal interests will have long-term positive impacts for Aboriginal land owners and resident on Aboriginal land. For sustained economic development to happen, Altman emphasises that land councils need to maintain and possibly strengthen their focus on development. This may be possibly by engaging in commercial joint-ventures with non-Indigenous partners while also balancing the interests of constituents in all their diversity and development aspirations. Altman concludes that very positive steps have been taken over the previous twenty years, and that economic institutions created under the Aboriginal Land Rights Act, provided they are used efficiently, will lead to long-term positive outcomes.

Altman, J.C. 1996. 'Native Title and the petroleum industry: Options, risks and strategic choices', *APPEA Journal*, (2): 7–13, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/1996_APPEA.pdf>.

Keywords: Native Title Act, Right to Negotiate, petroleum industry, right to negotiate, rent-sharing

Summary: This article highlights some of the specific aspects of the *Native Title Act 1993* that are particularly problematic from the perspective of the petroleum industry, with the 'right to negotiate' (RTN) being a major factor of uncertainty for the industry. As Altman points out, there are important distinctions between the mining and petroleum industries, and there is a particular need in the petroleum industry for conjunctive exploration and production agreements. This is a result of the high costs

associated with the exploration phase, hence the problem of having the RTN at the production stage.

Altman argues that there is a need for a greater predictability within the negotiation framework so as to limit transaction costs, minimise the risk of future invalidity, and to ensure certainty of title. The industry could also facilitate the reform process by building alliances with both Indigenous interests and the Commonwealth. The paper provides four further recommendations. Firstly, it is important that peak bodies like APPEA take a leadership role in strategically representing industry participants. Secondly, there is a need for the industry to support statutory framework (NTRBs) as they offer greater certainty for the industry. Thirdly, rent sharing at production stage should present an incentive to native title parties to be pro-development, and lastly, rent-sharing should involve both the Commonwealth and industry.

Altman, J.C. 1996. 'Reforming financial aspects of the Native Title Act 1993: an economics perspective', *Discussion Paper No. 105*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1996DP105.php>>.

Keywords: Native title reforms, right to negotiate

Summary: This paper identifies elements of the Native Title Act framework that are likely to result in suboptimal outcomes for both the Indigenous parties and industry, with three central arguments emerging from the paper. Firstly, in 1996, there is a need for the law to be clear about its intent. The right to negotiate at exploration and production stages is a weak form of property and carries potential transaction costs, poor incentive structures and uncertainty for all parties. Secondly, Altman recommends the establishment of a statutory framework for Native Title Representative Bodies. Thirdly, there is a need to bring back governments into the Native Title Act framework in terms of its financial provisions.

Altman, J.C. 1997. 'Native title and resource development: A post-Wik economics perspective', *Development Bulletin, Special Issue: Public Policy and Development: In-country Perspectives*, 42, July: 44–46, available at <<https://crawford.anu.edu.au/rmap/devnet/devnet/db-42.pdf>>.

Keywords: Native Title Act

Summary: The early years of the *Native Title Act 1993* (NTA) were characterised by numerous uncertainties which generated concerns for governments and developers, particularly in terms of transaction costs. In this article, Altman stresses that despite this climate of uncertainty, government and developers will gain from working within the NTA framework. This is a framework that will be fine-tuned as more and more legal cases are tested, and with the looming emergence of regional approaches to resource access. Altman concludes by emphasising that only a cooperative and coordinated approach involving all stakeholders will result in the reduction of transaction costs and encourage government and developers to do business with Aboriginal communities.

Altman, J.C. 1997. 'Towards a more workable right to negotiate', Submission to the Parliamentary Joint Committee on Native Title and the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Land Fund, available at <http://www.anu.edu.au/caepr-dev/sites/default/files/StaffProfiles/stafffiles/jon-altman/1997_RightToNegotiate.pdf>.

Keywords: Native Title Act, right to negotiate

Summary: This submission addresses relatively long-standing problems with the Native Title Act's 'right to negotiate' process, and identifies potentially unintended outcomes and trade-offs of the proposed amendments to the framework. This includes the likelihood of a reduction in the opportunities for Indigenous interests to be able to draw economic benefits from mining. The emphasis of this article is placed on a property rights framework and the technical rather than ideological issues. Altman argues that both timeliness and certainty will most likely be delivered by working within, not outside the Native Title Act framework. Any amendments to the right to negotiate process should ensure that native title, grantee and government parties are provided the appropriate signals to operate within a more workable framework.

Altman, J.C. 1997. 'Fighting over mining moneys: The Ranger Uranium Mine and the Gagudju Association', in J. Finlayson and D.E. Smith (eds), *Fighting Over Country: Anthropological Perspectives, Research Monograph No. 12*, CAEPR, ANU, 175–86, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/mono/1997RM12.php>>.

Keywords: Mining royalties, Gagudju Association

Summary: This chapter examines the foundational shortcomings that led to a dispute over mining moneys within the Gagudju Association, a dispute which exemplifies the vulnerability of royalty associations to internal conflict. Altman argues that in an ever increasing number of situations, internal organisational and external statutory mechanisms must be modified or established in order to avoid or ameliorate conflict over mining moneys as well as associated economic, social, cultural and wider political costs. Drawing on Martin and Finlayson's 1996 review of ACAA 1976, he argues that such modification could stem from a combination of legislative change, alterations to the operations of incorporated groups receiving mining moneys, and modification of incorporations law.

Altman, J.C. 1998. 'Compensation for native title: Land rights lessons for an effective and fair regime', *Land, Rights, Laws: Issues of Native Title No. 20*, Native Titles Research Unit, AIATSIS, Canberra, 1–12, available at <<http://www.aiatsis.gov.au/ntru/docs/publications/issues/ip98n20.pdf>>.

Keywords: Aboriginal Land Rights Act, Native Title Act, mining royalties, compensation

Summary: In this paper Altman identifies a number of issues associated with the ALRA and NTA frameworks. Both frameworks have similarly problematic compensation regimes which are laden with ambiguities and inconsistencies regarding the nature (compensation or revenue), purposes, and distribution of mining moneys. These ambiguities and inconsistencies have been responsible for regional resentment and conflict between beneficiaries for mining moneys. Furthermore, royalty associations often use compensation payments for expenses unrelated to objectives and actions that aim to ameliorate the negative impacts of mining, or to finance services that the government would have provided anyway. Altman emphasises the need to document the nature of impacts on native title that may require compensation, as this would help determine the value that should be placed on native title. There is also a need to better define beneficiaries and the extent of affected zones in order to provide more clarity on how compensation moneys be managed and distributed. This would help to ensure effective outcomes and avoid negative social impacts and conflicts over mining moneys.

Altman, J.C. and Pollack, D.P. 1998. 'Native title compensation: Historic and policy perspectives for an effective and fair regime', *Discussion Paper No. 152*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1998DP152.php>>.

Keywords: Native Title Act, right to negotiate, native title reforms, Aboriginal Land Rights Act, compensatory framework

Summary: In this paper Altman and Pollack demonstrate that the compensation regime of the Native Title Act framework is suboptimal for a number of reasons. In particular, they stress that the NTA's 'right to negotiate' constitutes a weaker form of property rights than consent provisions included in the ALRA. Positively, the NTA ensures equal treatment of native title parties and other Australians (via the compensable interest test). Unfortunately, the NTA framework replicates the critical ambiguities which are embedded in the ALRA that confuse mining payments to regional Indigenous interests with compensation. These ambiguities also conflate the compensatory commercial components of these payments with the non-compensatory commercial payments. Altman and Pollack point out a lack of adequate documentation and supporting evidence on the nature of impacts on native title that may require compensation. They conclude that obtaining the appropriate compensatory framework is essential. It is important for policy makers and representative organisations to strike appropriate trade-offs in ensuring fair compensation regimes, to obtain appropriate checks and balances and guarantees enshrined in legally-binding agreements, to monitor these agreements, and to set up workable and accountable regional structures.

Altman, J.C. and Pollack, D.P. 1998. 'Financial aspects of Aboriginal land rights in the Northern Territory', *Discussion Paper No. 168*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1998DP168.php>>.

Keywords: Reeves Review, land right reforms, Aboriginals Benefit Reserve

Summary: Following the publication of John Reeves's *Building on Land Rights for the Next Generation: Report of the Review of the Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act 1976*, this paper argues that many of the institutions created under the legislation were operating at a suboptimal level. The review provided the potential to clearly define the role and objectives of

the financial institutions created in the Land Rights Act. The authors argue that some immediate amendments to the legislation are required, particularly in the area of accountability measures, clarification of the purpose of mining royalty equivalents, and the provision of mentoring services for the future development of royalty associations. There are further problems with the Aboriginals Benefit Reserve (ABR) (now the Aboriginals Benefit Account (ABA)), which is also considered to be operating at a suboptimal level owing primarily to an absence of an institutional vision and mission. Four options to address these issues are canvassed.

Altman, J.C. 1999. 'The proposed restructure of the financial framework of the Land Rights Act: A critique of Reeves', in J.C. Altman, F. Morphy and T. Rowse (eds), *Land Rights at Risk? Evaluations of the Reeves Report*, Research Monograph No. 14, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, 109–121, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/mono/1999RM14.php>>.

Keywords: Reeves Review, Aboriginal Land Rights Act financial framework

Summary: In this chapter on the proposed restructuration of the ALRA financial framework (in the Reeves Report 1998), Altman describes the recommended model as flawed. It represents an example of bad public policy and underlines the high risks associated with the adoption of an untested and poorly-constructed model. Altman insists that the proposed changes, which constitute an unnecessary institutional duplication, are likely to lead to Aboriginal disempowerment, as well as to the substitution of legitimate government expenditure by a new program funded by mining royalties, and to lower commercial investment on Aboriginal land.

While strongly opposing Reeves' recommendations, and also acknowledging both the inherent logic but imperfect character of the ALRA's financial framework, Altman suggests the need for a better statutory definition of the role of royalty associations. He stresses the need for greater accountability to existing land councils for their operations, for the ABR to strategically plan its granting operations, for land councils to maintain budgetary discipline so that they continue to operate cost-effectively, and for Northern Territory Aboriginal interests to decide if the fiscal base of the ABR should be enhanced.

A version of this chapter was submitted as Altman J.C. 1999. 'The proposed restructure of the ALRA financial

framework: A critique of Reeves', Submission to the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs Inquiry into the Recommendations of the Reeves Report, Submissions Volume 2, 430–441, available at <[http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1999_sub Inquiry into Reeves report recommendations.pdf](http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/1999_sub%20Inquiry%20into%20Reeves%20report%20recommendations.pdf)>.

Altman, J.C. and Levitus, R. 1999. 'The allocation and management of royalties under the Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act: Options for reform', *Discussion Paper No. 191*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1999DP191.php>>.

Keywords: Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act, mining royalties

Summary: This paper examines the financial framework of the *Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act 1976* following the publication of John Reeves' Review of this legislation. The Review called for 'radical reform' to the financial framework of the legislation, proposed the creation of new statutory authority (the Northern Territory Aboriginal Council), and to make the land councils and royalty associations redundant. Recommendations here are for incremental changes to the financial operations of the Act, while maintaining the established structures. For example, it suggests that payments to land councils be fixed at 50 per cent of mining royalty equivalents (MREs) in order to provide for an expansion of regionalisation and land management activities in the post land claims era. It also stresses that mechanisms should be set in place to ensure the accountability of royalty associations, and that services provided by these associations do not substitute for normal government programs.

Altman, J.C. and Pollack, D. 1999. 'Reforming the Northern Territory Land Rights Act's financial framework: a more logical and more workable model', *Working Paper No. 5*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/WP/1999WP5.php>>.

Keywords: Aboriginal Land Rights Act, Aboriginals Benefit Trust Account, mining royalty equivalents, Reeves Review, land right reforms, Aboriginals Benefit Reserve

Summary: In this Working Paper, Altman and Pollack re-examine the logic (or lack thereof) and historical policy legacies associated with the financial streams of monies

paid under the *Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act 1976*. The successive reviews of the Act and the Aboriginals Benefit Trust Account (ABTA) did not bring a satisfactory solution to the problem of clarifying the logic of the payment of MREs. However, the authors note that most reviewers have agreed that the concept of paying MREs to Aboriginal interests should continue, and that incremental change, rather than radical recasting, has been the mainstay of public policy developments within the ALRA's financial framework.

The authors insist that the resolution of these issues of logic will require a series of other questions to be addressed. These include whether the payment of MREs is compensation or rent, and whether the payments are public or private monies. The overdue resolution of such questions will provide a clearer framework for the appropriate usage of the mining payments derived from Aboriginal land, as well as a clearer framework through which to construct appropriate accountability mechanisms.

Altman, J.C. and Smith, D.E. 1999. 'The Ngurratjuta Aboriginal Corporation: A model for understanding Northern Territory royalty associations', *Discussion Paper No. 185*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1999DP185.php>>.

Keywords: Ngurratjuta/Pmara Ntjarra Aboriginal Corporation, Aboriginal Land Rights Act, economic development, mining royalties

Summary: This paper considers the type of organisation referred to as 'royalty associations' through an examination of the organisational history, objectives, and activities of the Ngurratjuta/Pmara Ntjarra Aboriginal Corporation (NAC). Altman and Smith develop a general model of royalty associations, and make a considered evaluation of the related public policy implications arising from the review by John Reeves QC (1998) into the ALRA and the subsequent inquiry by the House of Representatives Standing Committee into Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs. They recommend that royalty associations target their functions and service delivery to key financial activities in which they have a competitive niche, as well as service delivery agreements with ATSIC and government to ensure that their activities are part of a coordinated approach to regional service delivery. The authors conclude that royalty associations need to separately and collectively undertake a period of strategic planning, have their operations broadly

monitored by the land councils, and maintain diverse investment strategies.

Altman, J.C. and Pollack, D. 2001. 'The Indigenous Land Corporation: An assessment of performance five years on', *Australian Journal of Public Administration*, 60 (4): 67–79, available at <<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/1467-8500.00242/abstract>>.

Keywords: The Indigenous Land Corporation, representative bodies

Summary: The Indigenous Land Corporation (ILC) is an independent statutory authority created in 1995 by the Keating government in response to the Mabo Judgement 1992. Its aim is to assist Indigenous people to acquire and manage land in order to stimulate cultural, social and economic benefits, particularly those who do not hold native title to land. Five years after its establishment, the ILC appeared to have learnt many lessons from past programs and institutions, was on track to become financially self-sufficient, and was showing clear potential in terms of managing the tension between cultural and commercial considerations associated with its goal of restoring a land base for Indigenous ownership. In this article, Altman and Pollack argue that the tension between cultural and economic objectives could be reduced by establishing additional subsidiaries with land management functions at the regional level. The authors note favourably the strategic and proactive, yet cautious approach adopted by the ILC in order to deliver these cultural, social and economic benefits.

Altman, J.C. 2001. 'Economic development of the Indigenous economy and the potential leverage of native title', in B. Keon-Cohen (ed), *Native Title in the New Millennium*, Aboriginal Studies Press, Canberra, 105–115, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2001_NativeTitle.pdf>.

Keywords: Native Title, Native Title Act, native title representative bodies, Aboriginal Land Rights Act, right to negotiate, veto rights, partnership with resource developers

Summary: Throughout this chapter Altman questions the potential economic development impacts of land rights and native title laws for Indigenous people in the new millennium. Are these laws leading to a dead end or a way forward? The answer, Altman argues, partly resides in the

capacity of Indigenous interests to find the right balance between using the limited leverage provided to them by the right to negotiate future acts framework of the Native Title Act, and the option to become a stakeholder in development before this leverage dissipates. To these ends, Altman outlines the need to ensure an enhancement of factor endowments. He stresses that NTRBs need to rapidly evolve into institutional forms with a capacity to provide commercial advice to native title clients and beneficiaries. They must operate under a statutory framework akin to the land councils under ALRA, recognise the limited leverage offered by native title, and know when it is time to switch to seek alliance with developers.

Altman, J.C. 2001. 'Can quality independent research in Indigenous affairs be influential? Personal reflections on the Reeves Land Rights Inquiry and its aftermath', *Australian Aboriginal Studies*, 2001 (2): 12–17, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2001_AusAboriginalStudies.pdf>.

Keywords: Reeves Review, anthropology and policy making

Summary: The Reeves Review of the Aboriginal Land Rights NT 1976, and its dismissal, misinterpretations, and misuses of independent anthropological research, led Altman to consider the following: how can anthropologists can ensure that their research will have beneficial policy influence, and what level of engagement should academics in general, and anthropologists in particular, have with public policy-making? Altman concludes that academics can be fairly powerless when it comes to influencing policy reform processes that appear predetermined, and underlines the importance for research to remain scholarly impartial, transparent, of high quality and peer reviewed.

Altman, J.C. 2002. 'The political economy of a Treaty: Opportunities and challenges for enhancing economic development for Indigenous Australians', *The Drawing Board: An Australian Review of Public Affairs*, 3 (2): 65–81, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2002_DrawingBoard.pdf>.

Keywords: Property rights in commercial resources, land rights, native title rights, treaty framework, political leverage, Torres Strait Treaty, Canadian and New Zealand treaties

Summary: Focusing on the issue of Indigenous property rights in commercially valuable resources, Altman explores here the literature examining the opportunities and challenges associated with the 'treaty framework'. He draws from the domestic case of Torres Strait and two international cases (Canada and New Zealand), to examine which mechanisms could increase Indigenous Australians' leverage and ensure more equitable resource rights. Altman particularly questions the effectiveness of the treaty framework in regards to resource rights restitution, notably in relation to Woodward's early warning that land rights were only a first step to enhance Australian Indigenous self-sufficiency and possible parity with non-Indigenous Australians.

Altman, J.C. and Cochrane, M. 2003. **Indigenous Interests in Water: A Comment on the 'Water Property Rights—Report to COAG from the Water CEOs Group' Discussion Paper**, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/topical/AltmanCochranewaterrights11.pdf>>.

Keywords: Indigenous Interests in Water, water reform, native title and water rights

Summary: In this submission, Altman and Cochrane comment on the Water CEOs Group overseeing of Indigenous rights, practices and interests in, or associated with fresh and salt waters in the drafting of their water reform agenda. The authors argue that Indigenous stakeholders, whose interests in water are now recognised in the native title statutory framework and emerging case law, should be considered from the inception of any proposal for the creation of new property rights. Such people's rights need to be recognised and incorporated into water management planning. A failure to do so will risk such proposals becoming invalid and the creation of uncertainties and inefficiencies in any new water markets. This will potentially result in high transaction costs and large compensation expenses, while further alienating an already disadvantaged group from rights in valuable resources.

Altman, J.C. 2004. 'Indigenous interests and water property rights', *Dialogue*, 23 (3): 29–34, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2004_Dialogue3.pdf>.

Keywords: Water rights, customary, commercial and private uses of water

Summary: Altman argues that in order to create an efficient water market, COAG needs to adopt a property rights framework that recognises Indigenous legal customary rights in water in addition to general commercial and private utilisation of water. The author recommends that COAG fosters innovative approaches which include Indigenous commercial or quasi-commercial rights. Altman further highlights that the development of new property rights in water should consider Indigenous stakeholders from the outset, while also recognising and incorporating their diverse rights, interests, values and activities in water management planning. Ignoring Indigenous interests in water leads to inefficient and inequitable water management and markets. Drawing on the hybrid economy framework, Altman outlines possible tensions in the articulation of customary and commercial water interests.

This article further develops the submission by Jon Altman and Michelle Cochrane to the Chief Executive Officers' Group on Water, who in turn reported to the Council of Australian Governments. (See CAEPR *Topical Issue No. 01/2003*, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2003TI1.php>>.)

Altman, J.C. and Palmer, K. 2005. 'Land ownership and land use', in B. Arthur and F. Morphy (eds), *Macquarie Atlas of Indigenous Australia*, The Macquarie Library Pty Ltd, Sydney, 142–55, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2005_MacAtlas_Land.pdf>

Keywords: Native Title Act, Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act

Summary: This encyclopaedia chapter tells the story of loss, restitution process (Native Title Act 1993 and Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act) and progressive restoration of Indigenous Australians' ownership and control over parts of the Australian continent. Altman and Palmer argue that the new frontier is the restoration of resource rights associated with land and sea, and that this is crucial for attaining equitable economic futures as well as access to choices and opportunities for Indigenous people.

Altman, J.C., Linkhorn, C. and Clarke, J. assisted by Fogarty, B. and Napier, K. 2005. *Land Rights and Development Reform in Remote Australia*, Oxfam Australia, Melbourne, 30 pp. <<http://resources.oxfam.org.au/pages/view.php?ref=122&k=>>

Keywords: Aboriginal Land Rights Act, Native Title Act, Indigenous disadvantage, land privatisation and individuation, housing, economic development

Summary: 2004 saw a new approach in Indigenous affairs, with the previous 30 years of Indigenous policy being portrayed as a failure, and the ALRA and NTA held responsible for perpetuating Indigenous disadvantage. A new paradigm promulgated at this time was based on processes of mainstreaming and a perception that land privatisation and individuation might improve housing and economic development prospects for remote Indigenous peoples. In this report, commissioned by Oxfam Australia, the authors argue that there is no evidence that land privatisation and individuation will lead to better housing and economic development outcomes. Economic development on Aboriginal land has historically been blighted by initiatives that have not adequately recognised geographic, economic, social and cultural realities. This pattern will not be broken by reforms which are uncritically committed to particular forms of private ownership. The authors call for an evidence-based approach, drawing on analysis of the real achievements of the ALRA as well as international experience of the benefits derived from communal (or common property) land ownership.

See also Altman, J.C., Linkhorn, C. and Clarke, J. assisted by Fogarty, B. and Napier, K. 2005. 'Land rights and development reform in remote Australia', *Discussion Paper No. 276*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/2005DP276.php>>.

Altman, J.C. 2006. 'Amended Land Rights Law will be Bad Law', *Topical Issue No. 8/2006*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2006TI8.php>>.

Keywords: Reeves Review, Aboriginals Benefit Account, land rights reforms

Summary: This Topical Issue critiques proposed amendment of the ALRA, which—based on recommendations that emerged from the Reeves (1998),

HORSCATSIA (1999) and Manning (1999) reports—contains provisions for expediting and providing more certain processes related to exploration and mining on Aboriginal land; head-leasing and sub-leasing of Aboriginal township sites located on Aboriginal land; and changes in relation to the funding of land councils and the operations of the Aboriginals Benefit Account (ABA). Altman's critique of these proposed amendments was first published in the *National Indigenous Times* (15 June 2006), where he identified four major shortcomings of these reports. Firstly, the proposed amendment package was driven by a monolithic view of development which ignored Indigenous diversity of aspirations and cultural plurality. Secondly, the new ALRA would further erode already weak property rights that traditional owners held. Thirdly, these amendments would weaken land councils and curtail the role that the ABA could play in delivering diverse forms of economic development that accord with heterogeneous Aboriginal aspirations in the NT. Finally, the amendments would allow governments in Darwin and Canberra to avoid addressing the backlogs and historical legacies evident on remote Aboriginal lands. They would instead shift their fiscal responsibilities onto the ABA and its compensatory revenue stream raised on Aboriginal land.

This *Topical Issue* was also submitted as Altman, J.C. 2006. Submission to the Senate Community Affairs Legislation Committee Inquiry into Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Amendment Bill 2006.

Altman, J.C. 2007. The 'National Emergency' and Land Rights Reform: Separating fact from fiction (An assessment of the proposed amendments to the Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act 1976), Briefing Paper, Oxfam Australia, Melbourne, available at <<http://resources.oxfam.org.au/pages/view.php?ref=210&k=>>

Keywords: Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory) Act, Northern Territory Emergency Response, land rights reforms

Summary: In this report, commissioned by Oxfam Australia, Altman analyses the proposed reforms to the ALRA—namely the compulsory acquisition of five-year leases over prescribed communities in the Northern Territory and the partial abolition of the permits system—which were about to be debated in the Australian Parliament. He finds no evidence of any direct link between the compulsory acquisition of five year leases over prescribed townships and the problems of child abuse and dysfunction in Aboriginal communities in the

Northern Territory. Altman also raises some concerns that the abolition of the permit system may actually contribute to exacerbating any such problem. Based on these findings, as well as being concerned by the unwillingness shown by the government to submit these reforms to community consultation and given that the proposed changes to the ALRA were in no way associated with child sexual abuse in Aboriginal communities, Altman suggests that these two measures be vigorously opposed.

Altman, J.C. 2007. Access to Aboriginal Land under the Northern Territory Land Rights Act, Submission in response to the FaCSIA Discussion Paper on Access to Aboriginal Land, *Topical Issue No. 03/2007*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2007TI3.php>>.

Keywords: Aboriginal Land Rights Act, permit system and mainstream economy, control of access to Aboriginal land and resources

Summary: In this submission Altman challenges the Howard government argument for the need to abolish or amend the Permit System—used to control access to Aboriginal land and resources, and supported by most Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal interests, including the mining industry—based on the premise that this system hinders Indigenous participation in mainstream economy. Altman argues that this position is not supported by empirical evidence or theoretical justification. Rather, he insists that the permit system provides some form of protection of Aboriginal land and resources from unauthorised outsiders, and that the abolition of this system would weaken Aboriginal property rights and have possible negative impacts on resources on which Aboriginal land owners rely to sustain their non-market customary sector. Furthermore, Altman stresses that no evidence was provided by FaCSIA (on behalf of the government) that the abolition or modification of the permit system will increase Indigenous people's participation in the market economy.

Altman, J.C. and Jordan, K. 2009. 'A brief commentary in response to the Australian Government Discussion Paper "Optimising Benefits from Native Title Agreements" and the report of the Native Title Payments Working Group', Submission to FaHCSIA, *Topical Issue No. 03/2009*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2009TI3.php>>.

Keywords: Native Title, ownership of commercially valuable resources, mining monies,

Summary: This submission examined two reports – *Optimising Benefits from Native Title Agreements* and the *Report of the Native Title Payments Working Group*. Based on these reports, Altman and Jordan identify four concerns: the need to reflect on history and available evidence; the need to address threshold issues including the distinction between traditional owners and communities, whether payments are compensatory or a form of mineral rent sharing, and whether payments are public or private; the need to examine the proper role of multinational corporations (MNCs) and the state in deciding on the use of payments made to Aboriginal interests in commercial negotiations; and the need to focus on existing examples of best practice where local empowerment and performance are linked.

Altman, J.C. 2010. 'Native Title and taxation reform', *Topical Issue No. 04/2010*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, 9pp. Available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2010TI4.php>>.

Keywords: Taxation of native title payments, taxation reform, Indigenous economic development, Closing the Gap

Summary: This paper is adapted from a submission in response to the Australian Government's Consultation Paper 'Native Title, Indigenous Economic Development and Tax'. Altman notes that in spite of its title, the Consultation Paper says very little about Indigenous economic development, focusing mainly on the issue of taxation of native title payments. Overall, Altman is not sympathetic to the proposed use of the tax system to potentially realign incentives to ensure the more productive use of such payments according to some notions of 'productive', one which is defined by dominant mainstream social norms. Nor does he agree with the idea that a Native Title Withholding Tax should be modelled on the inequitable and inefficient Mining Withholding Tax. Altman stresses that he would welcome

any amendment to the income tax system which allows Indigenous organisations to carry out activities across multiple deductible gift recipient (DGR) categories.

This paper concludes with five recommendations: Vertical equity might be a useful principle to consider for the tax exemption of native title payments; horizontal equity for the similar income tax treatment of payments to individuals; there is an urgent need to review the Mining Withholding Tax so that it becomes clear that it is an unacceptable model for a new Native Title Withholding Tax; any proposal to tax native title payments must be based on proper negotiation and consensus building with native title groups and their representative organisations; noting the high degree of variability in the nature of native title agreements, and there is a strong case for native title payments to be granted an income tax exemption (approach 1 in the Consultation Paper). Granting native title payments an income tax exemption will also assist to close the gap, at least in monetary terms.

Altman, J.C. 2010. 'Wild Rivers', *Arena Magazine*, 106: 11–13, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/2010_Arena 106.pdf>.

Keywords: Queensland Wild Rivers Bill, Aboriginal Land Rights Act, land rights, ownership of commercially valuable resources

Summary: In this article, Altman stresses his support for the provision contained in the Wild Rivers Bill, on the grounds that the Bill looks to empower regional Aboriginal native title groups to have a right to commercial development and to have real power in negotiations. As Altman argues, the reduction of the wealth disparities between Aboriginal and other Australians can only be eliminated if land and native title rights are accompanied by resource rights. In order to close this gap, Indigenous Australians need to be enabled to utilise their lands in one of three ways: to use natural resources in the customary non-market economy; to utilise natural resources commercially through Aboriginal stand-alone or joint ventures; and to be in a position to trade away commercial advantage for financial benefit in the form of a compensatory benefit stream.

Altman adds however that the Wild Rivers Bill focuses on the wrong law—it is Native title law that divests Aboriginal title holders of ownership of commercially valuable resources such as minerals, fisheries and fresh water—and he recommends a bipartisan review of all land rights and native title laws Australia-wide. This will ensure that

the important resource rights and free, prior, informed consent issues being raised by this Inquiry into the Wild Rivers Bill are given appropriate national, rather than region-specific attention.

This paper is an edited version of a submission to the Senate Legal and Constitutional Affairs Legislation Committee's Inquiry into the Wild Rivers (Environmental Management) Bill 2010, also published as Altman, J.C. 2010. Wild Rivers and Informed Consent on Cape York, CAEPR *Topical Issue 2/2010*. Available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/topical/Topical_Altman_WildRivers_Rev.pdf>.

Altman, J.C. 2011. 'Equitable Treatment of Native Title Compensation and Benefits', *Topical Issue No. 02/2011*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2011TI2.php>>.

Keywords: Native Title Act, Native title benefits, Native Title Representative Bodies, Closing the Gap

Summary: This Topical Issue is adapted from a submission in response to the Australian government's discussion paper *Leading Practice Agreements: Maximizing Outcomes from Native Title Benefits*. In this paper Altman makes six recommendations. First, if the Australian government wants to improve the leverage power of native title groups so that they can achieve better financial outcomes in agreements, then it should make the Native Title Act agreement negotiation framework as powerful as that in the ALRA. Second, if the Australian government wants to exercise a legitimate regulatory role over the expenditure of agreement payments, then it should earmark a proportion of its royalties income for native title groups. Third, if the Australian government genuinely believes that agreements should generate a sustainable income stream for future generations, then it should demonstrate leadership by establishing a sustainable Australian Sovereign Wealth Fund based on the Norwegian precedent. Fourth, the Australian government should empower Prescribed Bodies Corporate, Registered Native Title Body Corporates and Native Title Representatives by ensuring that they are well resourced to engage independent and high quality commercial advice which is funded by the corporate sector or from the public purse. Fifth, the Australian government needs to recognise its difficult position as regulator of another interest group that is also seeking revenue in relation to mineral extraction on native title lands. Finally, it is important in any policy reform of native title agreement

making and implementation that the government maintains Australia's liberal democratic commitment to pluralism. This should allow native title groups to use their compensation payments in the manner they see fit.

Altman, J.C. 2011. 'Reforming the Native Title Act', *Topical Issue 10/2011*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2011TI10.php>>.

Keywords: Native Title reforms, right to negotiate, Native Title Representation Bodies

Summary: This topical Issue explores the ramifications of the Native Title Act Reform Bill introduced by Senator Rachel Siewert of the Australian Greens. The Bill seeks to amend the *Native Title Act 1993* (NTA) to effect reforms that target two key areas for native title claimants: the barriers that registered native title claimants experience in making the case for determination of native title rights and interests, and procedural issues relating to the complex future act regime. The Bill attempts to move the NTA in a direction that is more consistent with principles enunciated in the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP), and seeks more equitable and efficient processes for negotiating resource development projects on land where there is a registered native title claim or a determination of native title.

Altman argues that with some fine-tuning, if the Bill passed into law it will implement important and arguably long overdue reforms to the NTA that will enhance its effectiveness. He identifies three important issues that the Bill should also have considered. First, the precise nature of payments made to native title groups for future acts impairment of native title has never been clearly defined. Second, there is no legitimate role, in Altman's view, for either a mining company or the state in regulating the use to which moneys provided in benefit sharing agreements are applied. Third, Altman suggests the possible need to revisit this issue to consider the benefits of a statutory role for well-resourced and independent 'land councils' (Native Title Representative Bodies, or NTRBs) in assisting native title groups to negotiate with powerful mining companies, as well as to act as 'at-arms-length' advocates for native title groups with a statutory role as co-signatories of agreements.

See also Altman, J.C. 2011. Submission to the Inquiry into the Native Title Amendment (Reform) Bill 2011 [the NTA Reform Bill], available at <http://www.aph.gov.au/parliamentary_business/committees/

[senate_committees?url=legcon_ctte/completed_inquiries/2010-13/native_title_three/submissions.htm](http://www.aph.gov.au/parliamentary_business/committees/house_of_representatives_committees?url=economics/taxlawsno6/subs.htm)>.

Altman, J.C. 2012. Submission to the Inquiry into Tax Laws Amendment (2012 Measures No. 6) Bill 2012, House Standing Committee on Economics, Parliament House, Submission No. 2, available at <http://www.aph.gov.au/Parliamentary_Business/Committees/House_of_Representatives_Committees?url=economics/taxlawsno6/subs.htm>.

Keywords: Native title benefits

Summary: This submission is a short note that complements and accompanies Altman's August Submission to the Treasury Inquiry into the Tax treatment of Native Title Benefits.

Here, Altman reiterates that it is unfortunate that the compensation payments made under the Aboriginal Land Rights (Northern Territory Act) 1976 (Cth) do not receive the beneficial treatment proposed in relation to native title compensation payments. The mining withholding tax (MWT) represents double taxation in many situations (e.g. payments made out of the Aboriginals Benefit Account to land councils attract the MWT, the only statutory authorities to have their incomes taxed at the source, while their employees also pay income tax); taxation without representation (there was no consultation on this tax when introduced); and now a potential social injustice owing to the proposed inconsistency in the treatment of compensation payments made under land rights and native title laws.

Altman, J.C. and Markham, F. 2013. Submission to the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs Inquiry into the Native Title Amendment Act, 2012, Submission No. 25, available at <http://www.aph.gov.au/Parliamentary_Business/Committees/House_of_Representatives_Committees?url=atsia/native_title_bill/subs.htm>.

Keywords: Extinguishment of native titles, right to negotiate, native title reforms, Indigenous land holdings, hybrid economy, Natural Resource Management

Summary: In this submission, Altman and Markham make two recommendations: firstly, that the historical extinguishment of native title in parks and reserves for the

preservation of the natural environment be disregarded where there is agreement to do so between parties, Commonwealth and State/Territory environmental agencies and registered native title claimants; secondly, that the Bill strengthens Indigenous native title property rights by reinforcing native title holders and claimants' right to negotiate provision.

The authors suggest that these recommendations may appear conflicting in nature at first, as they simultaneously advocate for greater Indigenous involvement in natural conservation and resource extraction activities, which are often regarded as opposite options. However, once analysed through a hybrid economy framework (Altman 2001)—which considers Indigenous economies as being composed of three complementary and overlapping sectors (market, state and customary)—it becomes clear how the combination of these two proposals provides alternate pathways likely to deliver Indigenous regional and remote employment, enterprise and productive activities, and eventually improve socioeconomic circumstances. This will involve and stimulate both market and customary sectors as well as participation in a combination of extractive and conservation activities.

This submission is based on a series of maps which link spatial information on Indigenous land holdings, population distribution and natural and mineral resources. In doing so, these maps show both the high conservation value and relatively sound environmental condition of the Indigenous estate, as well as the proximity of mines or possible future mining sites to discrete Indigenous communities. As native title interests could be formally recognised as stakeholders in national parks and reserves, they would have added incentive to actively engage in the environmental management of these conservation areas. They would also have an enhanced possibility to deploy Indigenous labour in NRM in places that are often regional and remote, but where Indigenous people live. Strengthening Indigenous native title property rights would also reduce the possibility of strategic behaviour either by developers or native title holders and claimants that may have negatively impacts on both sides, as well as on the broader Australian community. This can lead to unfair compensations to Indigenous land owners and delays which may jeopardise the commercial viability of development projects.

Altman, J.C. 2014. 'The political ecology and political economy of the Indigenous land titling 'revolution' in Australia', *Maori Law Review*, 2014 Indigenous Law Speaker Series. <<http://maorilawreview.co.nz/2014/03/the-political-ecology-and-political-economy-of-the-indigenous-land-revolution-in-australia/>>.

Keyword: Land rights, native title, hybrid economy, Payment for environmental services, livelihoods, alternate development, neoliberal project

Summary: Since the early 2000s, Altman's political project has been to dilute over-bearing corporate and state power and inform Indigenous land owners of potential for alternative development on their land. One of the avenues taken by Altman to visually demonstrate these possible alternatives has been to overlay maps of re-possessed Indigenous territories with resource atlas maps which show the continental distribution of natural resources, mining exploitation and environmental status. This superimposition exercise gives some indication of how Indigenous Australians living in very remote regions can benefit from what he has coined the 'land titling revolution'. Drawing on his hybrid economy model, Altman argues that these alternatives reside largely where the market, state and customary sectors meet, a zone that he labels the *bliss point*. In this paper, Altman identifies three major obstacles for Indigenous hybrid economies to flourish in remote Australia. First, land titling generally excludes rights to commercially valuable resources such as sub-surface minerals. The second obstacle is the clash of expectations and ontologies about how repossessed land might be used, while the third concerns the conflict between the two competing frames of political economy and political ecology, one favouring resource extraction, the other resource conservation.

8. Neo-liberalism or the return of the guardian State?

Altman, J.C. and Sanders, W. 1992. 'Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander affairs', in P. Vintila, J. Phillimore and P. Newman (eds), *Markets, Morals and Manifestos: Fightback! and the Politics of Economic Rationalism in the 1990s*, Institute for Science and Technology Policy, Murdoch University, Perth, 125–136, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/1992_MarketsMoralsAndManifestos.pdf>.

Keywords: *Fightback!*, research funding

Summary: This chapter provides an assessment of the affects that the economic policy *Fightback!* would have on Indigenous affairs, as proposed by the Liberal party leader John Hewson in the early 1990s. The authors examine the proposed budget cuts to Indigenous affairs, namely to ATSIC, as well as the range of Indigenous specific programs administered by other commonwealth government authorities. Key proposed affected areas are housing loan schemes, the CDEP scheme, and the Aboriginal Student Assistance Scheme (ABSTUDY). *Fightback!* does not address a number of significant policy developments in Indigenous affairs, notably land rights and heritage protection, the Royal Commission into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody, reconciliation, Federal-State financial relations, and the Aboriginal Employment Development Policy (AEDP). This silence, the authors suggest, is a result of the high degree of bipartisanship in Indigenous affairs policy over the previous 20 years.

Altman, J.C., Arthur, B. and Sanders, W. 1996. 'Towards greater autonomy for the Torres Strait: political and economic dimensions', in Official Hansard Report (Volume 2) of the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs, Reference: Inquiry into Greater Autonomy for Torres Strait Islanders, Government Printer, Canberra, 199–213.

Keywords: Torres Strait, self-determination, political autonomy, economic autonomy

Summary: This paper was first submitted to the House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs for its inquiry into greater autonomy for 'the people of the Torres Strait'. It was published two years after the creation of the Torres Strait Regional Authority (TSRA). The authors explore the possible avenues for greater degree of political and/or economic autonomy for the region. This is based on an interpretation of the phrase 'the people of the Torres Strait' as one which incorporates both geographical and ethnic elements, as opposed to addressing the terms of reference solely on the ground of ethnicity (with a focus on separation). The authors concede that they are no ready-made solutions and that the case of the Torres Strait, without becoming a precedent, is likely to become a source of ideas for other groups of Indigenous Australians.

This paper was also published as Altman, J.C., Arthur, B. and Sanders, W. 1996. 'Towards greater autonomy for the Torres Strait: political and economic dimensions', *Discussion Paper No. 121*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/DP/1996DP121.php>>.

Altman, J.C. 2004. 'Indigenous Affairs at a Crossroads', *The Australian Journal of Anthropology*, 15 (3): 306–9. Available at: <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2004_TAJA.pdf>.

Keywords: Abolition of ATSIC, anthropology and Indigenous policy, mainstreaming, Indigenous representation

Summary: This commentary, written at a period of uncertainty for the future of ATSIC, revisits the policy and ideology changes that characterised what Altman described as the modern era of Indigenous affairs (from 1972 onward). Altman discusses the roles played by anthropologists over a period he divides in two; the 1972–1996 period of self-determination, and the subsequent return of a conservative viewpoint and 'practical recognition' adopted from 1996. Altman explains how the power of anthropology to influence policy makers was altered post 1996. He underlines the need for anthropologists to find a more strategic approach to such policy work, based on sound scholarship in the provision of advice to parties of all persuasions. Such an approach is needed to fill the gap left by the demise of ATSIC, which saw the loss of a key Indigenous representative voice.

Altman, J.C. 2004. 'Practical reconciliation and the new mainstreaming: Will it make a difference to Indigenous Australians?' *Dialogue*, 23 (2): 35–46, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Journal/2004_Dialogue2.pdf>.

Keywords: Mainstreaming, 'symbolic' and 'practical' reconciliation, Closing the Gap, social justice, policy development

Summary: In this article Altman examines Indigenous policy between 1996–2004, and the mainstreaming of Indigenous policies and programs which took place during this period under the Howard government through 'practical' reconciliation. This binary between 'practical' and 'symbolic' reconciliation, Altman argues, is a false dichotomy. However, it helps to explain the subsequent shifts in Indigenous policy development after 1996. The previous Labor government's approach favoured more complex policy which sought to deliver statistical equality *and* social justice. The Coalition, on the other hand, saw a direct trade-off between these two positions, moving to privilege 'practical' statistical equality. This era of mainstreaming also saw the re-allocation of Indigenous-specific Commonwealth programs to government departments that already administered Indigenous specific programs. However, Altman concludes that there is no statistical evidence that policies and programs around 'practical reconciliation' are delivering better outcomes at the national level than the previous government. While encouraging substantive forms of mainstreaming in terms of the equitable meeting of Indigenous citizenship entitlements, he insists that this must happen alongside Indigenous-specific programs.

Altman, J.C. 2005. 'Indigenous social policy and the new mainstreaming', *Topical Issue No. 01/2005*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2005TI1.php>>.

Keywords: Mainstreaming, social and policy research trends, responsibility, neoliberalism, economic development

Summary: This Topical Issue is informed by research conducted for an article in *Dialogue* (see above) in 2004. Altman looks at a speech that Senator Vanstone, then Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs, gave to the Bennelong Society, and the Howard Government's 'Opportunity and Responsibility' Election 2004 Indigenous Australians policy. He argues that these

two documents epitomise the 'new mainstreaming' approach to Indigenous affairs. The strengths and weaknesses of such an approach are discussed, with Altman concluding that Indigenous development, especially for remote and very remote Australia, will not be achieved with market-based visions alone.

Altman, J.C. and Rowse, T. 2005. 'Indigenous affairs', in P. Saunders and J. Walter (eds), *Ideas and Influence: Social Science and Public Policy in Australia*, UNSW Press, Sydney, 159–177, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2005_IdeasAndInfluence.pdf>.

Keywords: Social and policy research trends, responsibility, neoliberalism, economic development

Summary: This chapter tracks the evolution of trends in social and policy research in the field of welfare and economic development for Indigenous Australians, and the rise of Indigenous socioeconomic equality as a government policy goal. The wider collection in the volume concerns the overarching role of social science in public policy today, contributing to the development of a post-neoliberal agenda for policy-relevant social science research and outreach. Altman and Rowse examine the tension between the social science disciplines of anthropology and economics in their respective approaches to Indigenous public policy. The competition between the two disciplines, they argue, also offers a productive dialogue that can contribute positively to policymaking. They discuss the ability for anthropology to co-exist with some aspects of the Howard-era policy emphasis on 'shared responsibility' agreements, based on a community-by-community agenda, and the emphasis on community government. They further show how anthropology also critiques some of the deeper assumptions of current policy which deny the complex trade-offs between desire for cultural continuity and material prosperity that are embodied in economic development.

Altman, J.C. and Hunter, B.C. 2005. 'Rejoinder to 'Key Social and Economic Indicators for Indigenous Australia: A Comparative Analysis'', *Topical Issue No. 03/2005*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2005TI3.php>>.

Keywords: 'Practical reconciliation', research politics, research autonomy.

Summary: This paper is a response to a study prepared by Australasia Economics for the Australian Government Department of Immigration, Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs, which reviewed and critiqued research findings released from CAEPR (Altman and Hunter 2003). In 2003, Altman and Hunter published their peer-reviewed discussion paper, 'Monitoring 'practical' reconciliation': Evidence from the reconciliation decade 1991–2001', which attracted media coverage. Subsequent publications on the topic from both within and external to CAEPR questioned the efficacy of the 'practical reconciliation' approach of the current Australian government in improving Indigenous socioeconomic status. Australasia Economics, commissioned to assess the methodology of the Altman and Hunter paper, criticised the political motives of its authors as representing CAEPR as a whole. They cited the paper as 'CAEPR (2003)', failing to recognise that CAEPR Discussion Papers state explicitly that they do not reflect an official CAEPR position. Altman and Hunter discuss the critiques from Australasia Economics, which they see as trivializing and simplifying their argument. The other question arising here concerns the integrity of critiques that are not themselves independently peer-reviewed, and their value to the research and policy-making community.

Altman, J.C. 2006. 'Beyond Emotional Rhetoric to Evidence-Based Policy Making', *Topical Issue No. 04/2006*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2006TI4.php>>.

Keywords: Evidence-based policy, policy development, policy realism

Summary: In this Topical Issue, Altman presents his view on the emotional rhetoric surrounding the push to de-populate outstations, and the absence of both outstation residents and an evidence base in this public discussion. Arguing that such ideology is emotionally-driven, Altman calls for sound Indigenous policy formed by both pragmatic realism and evidence. This article was also published in the *National Indigenous Times* (23 February, 2006).

Altman, J.C. 2006. 'In search of an outstations policy for Indigenous Australians', *Working Paper No. 34*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/WP/2006WP34.php>>.

Keywords: Outstations, recentralisation, Indigenous mobility, hybrid economy

Summary: In this paper Altman speaks to the new administrative arrangements in Indigenous affairs and outlines a series of issues he argues must be addressed in any new policy development. Drawing on official secondary data, Altman insists that there is a lack of compelling evidence which supports recentralisation as a means by which to improve people's livelihood prospects. He further highlights a lack of research on the culturally distinct and evolving patterns of Indigenous mobility and migration in very remote Australia. Much of the current policy debate around outstations occurs with little input from outstations people themselves, and with limited reference to expert local and regional knowledge. Altman concludes that A House of Representatives Standing Committee on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs Inquiry into the outstations situation is necessary in order to explore non-mainstream options for very remote communities before too much new policy is developed.

Altman, J.C. 2007. 'The Howard Government's Northern Territory Intervention: Are neo-paternalism and Indigenous development compatible?', *Topical Issue No. 16/2007*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2007TI16.php>>.

Keywords: Northern Territory Emergency Response, hybrid economy, neo-assimilationist era

Summary: This Topical Issue is based on an invited keynote address delivered at the AIATSIS 'Forty Years On: Political transformation and sustainability since the Referendum and into the future' Conference. Altman sees the NTER as a return to the assimilation era and an unrealistic and unworkable approach that threatens livelihood-oriented Indigenous development initiatives and institutions (which are valued in the hybrid economy). He outlines former Prime Minister John Howard's ideological approach to Indigenous Affairs and the conditions that facilitated its implementation, first with the bipartisan abolition of ATSIC in 2004, then the Coalition Senate majority from July 1 2005.

Altman, J.C. 2007. 'Neo-paternalism and the destruction of CDEP', *Topical Issue No. 14/2007*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2007TI14.php>>.

Keywords: Community Development Employment Projects, Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation

Summary: This Topical Issue was first published in *Arena Magazine*. It discusses the announcement that CDEP would be abolished in the Northern Territory as the twelfth measure under the Northern Territory Emergency Response. CDEP in urban areas was dismantled mid-way through 2007. Altman argues that the 'passive welfare'/'real jobs' dichotomy, associated with Noel Pearson and adopted widely in public policy and commentary, is a false one. This dichotomy, and others, Altman insists, can be challenged by using the hybrid economy framework. NATSISS 2002 data analysis demonstrates the success of CDEP, and because CDEP participants are classified as employed, the end of CDEP will see a dramatic increase in Indigenous unemployment. Altman focuses here on the experiences of the Bawinanga Aboriginal Corporation, the largest CDEP organisation in the Northern Territory. He stresses the enormous effect that the closure of CDEP would have on the provision of services as well as individual, social and economic wellbeing in the Maningrida region. He further suggests that the NTER will create jobs for non-Indigenous bureaucrats rather than Aboriginal people living remotely, and will undermine other Government priorities and programs, such as Indigenous Protected Areas. The ultimate result of the abolition of CDEP, Altman concludes, will be increased state dependence.

This article was first published as 'Neo-paternalism and the destruction of CDEP', *Arena Magazine* 90, August–September 2007: 33–5.

Altman, J.C. 2007. 'In the name of the market?', in J.C. Altman, and M. Hinkson (eds), *Coercive Reconciliation: Stabilise, Normalise, Exit Aboriginal Australia*, Arena Publications Association, Melbourne: 307–21, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2007_CoerciveReconciliation.pdf>.

Keywords: Northern Territory Emergency Response, Neoliberalism, 'real' economy, hybrid economy, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: In this early critique of the Northern Territory Emergency Response Intervention, Altman explores the dominance of neoliberal principles in these unfolding circumstances. He argues that radical changes in land management, land use, welfare provision and community governance have all been undertaken ostensibly 'in the name of the child', but with a view to changing distinctive economic and social forms 'in the name of the market'. Altman challenges the language of 'viability' and the 'real economy' with regards to small and remote Aboriginal communities, and stresses that institutions like CDEP, and the community empowerment they can foster, are central to economic engagement. The hybrid economy is presented here as an alternative model for economic development in 'prescribed communities' in the Northern Territory.

Altman, J.C. 2007. 'Indigenous Affairs Today: The 'Influence Wars' and the attempt to silence the social sciences', *Topical Issue No. 01/2007*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/topical/Altman_IAT.pdf>.

Keywords: Censorship, neoliberalism, research autonomy, university sector

Summary: This is a version of a paper that Altman presented at the Academy of the Social Sciences Symposium 'Ideas and Influence: Social Science and Public Policy in Australia' in November 2005. The paper was referred to by Professor Stuart Macintyre in his chapter on 'Universities' in the 2007 book, *Silencing Dissent: How the Australian government is controlling public opinion and stifling debate*. Although this paper has not been published, its reference in *Silencing Dissent* aroused some interest and Altman decided to post this paper as a CAEPR Topical Issue to ensure transparency in access to the source material used by Professor Macintyre. Speaking reflexively about his time as Director of CAEPR, Altman argues that a specific form of 'radical neoliberalism' appears to be increasingly influencing Indigenous affairs. CAEPR, established in 1990 with significant public sector support, has consciously aimed to straddle the disciplinary tension between economics and anthropology in its approach. Yet an independent review of CAEPR in 2002, defining it as 'the only major grouping of researchers having expertise and producing sustained quality research' in the field, was challenged by the Office of Indigenous Policy Coordination (OIPC) in 2004 and 2005. Altman outlines the method by which OIPC sought to undermine the influence and credibility of CAEPR, and concludes that certain Indigenous voices are

being suppressed while others who share an ideological position with current policy makers are being privileged. He further sees an attempt to reduce the generation of ideas through conflict, intimidation and defunding.

Altman, J.C. 2007. 'Will the NT intervention now unravel?', *Arena Magazine*, 92, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/2007_Arena.pdf>.

Keywords: Northern Territory Emergency Response, income quarantining, Community Development Employment Projects

Summary: In this critique of the practices and ideologies behind the Northern Territory (NT) intervention into Indigenous communities, Altman raises concerns around its planning, consultation, implementation and evaluation methods. Writing on the cusp of the incoming Rudd government's term, Altman deconstructs a number of central components of the intervention under the Howard era, and the changes that lie ahead. Of particular note is the quarantining of Indigenous people's welfare payments and the abolition of the CDEP scheme. Altman argues that the intervention Task Force's lack of adequate consultation, as well as their reluctance to collaborate with effective community-based Indigenous organisations, has led to a profound degree of overall incompetence. With the intervention now unravelling, Altman asserts that a national focus and considerable goodwill and funding commitment remain. Five future requirements are outlined which are based on principles of participatory development, and which reflect Altman's commitment to sustainable Indigenous economic development in regional and remote Australia. These consist of recognising Indigenous difference as a positive benefit to Australia; the establishment of partnerships with communities; building local intercultural institutions and capabilities; investing realistically in supportive innovating programs that enable local livelihood opportunities; and planning for sustainable outcomes based on rigorous needs-based analysis.

Altman, J.C. 2008. 'From "After the Dreaming" to "After Land Rights": W.E.H. Stanner's legacy as Indigenous policy intellectual', in M. Hinkson and J. Beckett (eds), *An Appreciation of Difference: W.E.H. Stanner and Aboriginal Australia*, Aboriginal Studies Press, Canberra, 271–282, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2008_AnAppreciation.pdf>.

Keywords: W.E.H. Stanner's legacy, equity and sociocultural plurality

Summary: In this chapter Altman focuses on W.E.H. Stanner's legacy and influence over the development of Indigenous public policy, examining how Stanner's approach could shed light on recent policy debates in Indigenous affairs. Trained in both economics and anthropology, Stanner 'was comfortable with socioeconomic sameness, as long as this was based on Aboriginal choice'. He recognised the unavoidable tensions between the quest for equity and sociocultural plurality, as well as the inevitable outcome that policy frameworks and the state can only offer structured opportunities, to which a plurality of Indigenous agents will respond diversely depending on their aspirations and circumstances.

Altman, J.C. 2008. 'Submission to the Northern Territory Emergency Response Review', *Topical Issue No. 10/2008*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2008TI10.php>>.

Keywords: Northern Territory Emergency Response, hybrid economy, diverse livelihood options

Summary: Many of the blanket measures imposed on 'prescribed communities' to implement the Northern Territory Emergency Response are critiqued here. Altman departs from mainstream, indicators-based conceptions of economic development by defining it in terms of individuals and social groups improving their wellbeing through engaging in diverse livelihood options. He criticises the promotion of false binaries, such as the notion that Aboriginal Australians can participate either in the kin-based or the market-based economy and society. Instead, Altman argues that most Aboriginal people in the Northern Territory (NT) live in an intercultural zone between the customary and market economy, and engage in hybrid economies. Indigenous living on country precludes participating solely in the mainstream or market economy, or indeed any sector independently of

the others. The hybrid economy model, Altman stresses, reflects reality for many Indigenous people in the NT, and considerable advantages and possibilities could be derived from reframing economic thinking towards hybridity and diversity.

Altman, J.C. and Johns, M. 2008. 'Indigenous welfare reform in the Northern Territory and Cape York: A comparative analysis', *Working Paper No. 44*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Publications/WP/CAEPRWP44.pdf>>.

Keywords: Welfare reform, income management, Northern Territory Emergency Response

Summary: This paper comparatively addresses the complex welfare reforms and income management schemes in two jurisdictions — Northern Territory (NT) in 2007 and Cape York in 2008. Altman and Johns provide a theoretical analysis of these reforms, situating them within the historical and political context, and examining how they have aimed to restructure labour market activity in remote communities. They address these issues from a public policy perspective focusing on the unintended consequences that may arise for families as well as for the Federal and State Governments. Altman and Johns further stress the unprecedented development of this policy being based on the differentiation of location and ethnicity, and the lack of evidence-base supporting this enormous financial investment which is based on assumptions of a link between expenditure patterns and child wellbeing, school attendance, and earned and unearned income.

Altman, J.C. 2008. 'Closing the Gap rhetoric buys into Howard legacy', *Topical Issue No. 04/2008*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2008TI4.php>>.

Keywords: Closing the Gap, Northern Territory Emergency Response

Summary: First published in *Crikey*, this article contributes to Altman's sustained critique on the framework and rhetoric around 'Closing the Gap' in Indigenous policy development. Altman argues that the Rudd government had no plan to tackle Indigenous disadvantage Australia-wide, stressing the high cost of programs' 'governmentality' in the Rudd government's budget for government business managers and income

management. He further notes the paradox that the rate of child abuse in the Northern Territory, on which the intervention was based, is both about half the national Indigenous average and better than other states where no intervention is taking place.

Altman, J.C. 2009. 'Beyond closing the gap: Valuing diversity in Indigenous Australia', *Working Paper No. 54*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/WP/2009WP54.php>>.

Keywords: 'Closing the Gap', statistical equality, hybrid economy, remote Australia

Summary: Altman critiques the 'Closing the Gap' approach for having too great an emphasis on statistical equality between Indigenous and non-Indigenous Australians, and too little focus on diversity. Highlighting the employment gap, he suggests that technical endeavours to close this gap in remote Australia may actually widen it. He uses the Kuninju example to illustrate how Aboriginal livelihoods in remote Australia often occur within the hybrid economy but perhaps do not fit easily into a statistical framework seeking formal economic equality. Aboriginal people's unwillingness to rely on any single sector of the hybrid economy in isolation is further stresses, as is the wisdom of such an approach, especially given the vagaries of the market. Altman argues that the state should accept and value the diversity and flexibility evident in Aboriginal participation in hybrid economies, and calls for a balanced, broader and more inclusive conceptualisation of Indigenous development than that which is currently dominant in Australia.

Altman, J.C. 2009. 'Developing a national Indigenous policy framework that recognizes needs, rights and legacies and delivers results', *Topical Issue No. 02/2009*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2009TI2.php>>.

Keywords: Citizenship, social justice, participatory approach

Summary: This paper was delivered to the Australian Council of Social Service (ACOSS) National Conference, 'Building a Fair Australia in Tough Economic Times', in April 2009. Altman discusses the current national policy framework in Indigenous affairs and its outcomes for Indigenous Australians, statistics on 'Closing the Gap',

and criticism of the policy approach which privileges statistical equality and inevitably undervalues difference and diversity. He argues for a very different policy framework, one which looks to openly combine three interlinked elements of needs-based citizenship, special Indigenous rights, and compensatory 'social justice' rights in order to meet historical backlogs in welfare entitlements provided on a needs basis to all Australians. Recommendations are made for how ACOSS can better advocate for Indigenous Australians, such as supporting a diversity of delivery approaches including community-based or participatory approaches rather than top-down State intervention.

Altman, J.C. 2010. 'What future for remote Indigenous Australia?: Economic hybridity and the neoliberal turn', in J.C. Altman and Hinkson, M. (eds), *Culture Crisis: Anthropology and Politics in Aboriginal Australia*, UNSW Press, Sydney, 259–280, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2010_CultureCrisis_Altman.pdf>.

Keywords: Hybrid economy, National Indigenous Reform Agreement, Closing the Gap, neo-liberal approach to Indigenous development

Summary: In this essay Altman critiques the National Indigenous Reform Agreement (Closing the Gap) as a technical and managerial approach that does not allow for Indigenous difference and diversity, particularly in remote Australia. He challenges the use of neoliberal principles by governments to address Indigenous disadvantage, and proposes an alternate approach which he coins 'the hybrid economy'. This is presented as an 'approach that can encompass a wider set of economic forms and intercultural values'.

Altman argues that the most productive activity occurs where the customary, state and market sectors meet, what he describes as a 'bliss point'. This is where people may satisfy individual, family and kinship needs and obligations in both the market and domestic moral economy. Altman draws on the examples of art production and ranger activities in remote Australia to demonstrate such intercultural and inter-sectoral production. Altman further stresses that the hybrid economy might be a useful framework for Aboriginal people in remote Australia to mount political arguments for more equitable access to resources, with the model also being put forth as an alternative to pervasive centre/periphery thinking.

Altman, J.C. 2010. 'Income management and the right of Indigenous Australians to equity', *Topical Issue No. 03/2010*, CAEPR, ANU, Canberra, available at <<http://caepr.anu.edu.au/Publications/topical/2010TI3.php>>.

Keywords: Welfare, income management, Racial Discrimination Act

Summary: In this paper Altman addresses a number of specific questions raised by the Senate Committee's Statement of Reasons for Referral of the Bills, as well as the 'bigger picture' Policy Statement: Landmark Reform to the Welfare System, Reinstatement of the *Racial Discrimination Act* and Strengthening of the Northern Territory Emergency Response (the Policy Statement) released by the Australian Government in November 2009. The proposed welfare reforms under examination by this Senate Committee will fundamentally alter a citizenship rights-based approach to welfare and replace it with one that is skewed towards a far higher level of state governmentality of citizen subjects.

Altman has consistently opposed measures to quarantine the welfare incomes of people residing in prescribed communities since their enactment in law in 2007. While there have been a number of attempts to assess the impact of welfare quarantining measures, no unequivocal evidence has clearly demonstrated positive outcomes. Nor is there evidence of measurable improvements in the areas stipulated by the Committee, such as protecting women and children, reducing alcohol-related harm, improving nutrition and food security, promoting community engagement, and strengthening personal and cultural sense of value in all affected communities. Altman further argues that the proposed amendments will reinstate the *Racial Discrimination Act* (RDA) in a technical and legal manner by extending measures now targeting Indigenous people in the Northern Territory only (and possibly in Cape York) to other Australians. However, until the law is amended and applied more broadly, Australia remains in breach of the RDA.

Altman, J.C. and Fogarty, B. 2010. 'Indigenous Australians as 'No Gaps' Subjects: Education and development in remote Australia', in I. Snyder and J. Nieuwenhuysen (eds), *Closing the Gap in Education: Improving Outcomes in Southern World Societies*, Monash University E Press, Melbourne, 109–128, available at <https://digitalcollections.anu.edu.au/bitstream/1885/9738/1/Altman_IndigenousAustraliansNoGaps2010.pdf>.

Keywords: Education, Closing the Gap, hybrid economy, Warddeken Indigenous Protected Area, Djelk Indigenous Protected Area

Summary: Altman and Fogarty challenge the view that closing the gap in education will improve Indigenous socioeconomic outcomes. They stress the need for innovative education targeted to the various vocational needs in the hybrid economies of remote Australia, rather than a mainstream approach, and that the statistical focus of 'Closing the Gap' is inadequate. The case studies of ranger activities in Warddeken and Djelk Indigenous Protected Areas in western Arnhem Land (both groups being partners in the CAEPR 'People on Country' project) are deployed, and the authors urge that educational policy for remote areas of Australia provide support for Indigenous land and sea management skills transfer and vocational training. This will ensure that Indigenous engagement in hybrid economies are recognised and enhanced.

Altman, J.C. and Hinkson, M. 2010. 'Very Risky Business: The quest to normalize remote-living Aboriginal people', in G. Marston, J. Moss, and J. Quiggin (eds), *Risk, Responsibility and the Welfare State*, Melbourne University Press, Melbourne 185–211, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Chapters/2010_Risk_AltmanAndHinkson.pdf>.

Keywords: Risk society, Northern Territory Emergency Response, hybrid economy, Indigenous environmental stewardship

Summary: Beck and Giddens' notion of a 'risk society' is of an industrialised society geared towards specific constructs of the future and safety, and concerned with mitigating the perceived risks that modernisation itself generates. In this chapter, Altman and Hinkson draw on this theory of the 'risk society' to argue that the many measures of the Northern Territory Emergency Response embody an attitude of culture as risk. Individualisation,

they propose, is one state-sanctioned strategy mobilised to eliminate distinctly Aboriginal practices and modes which are construed as risky. Alternatively, the authors present the hybrid economy as being a creative adaptation on the part of remote-living Aboriginal Australians. Diverse economic activities occur in remote Australia, and engagement in productive activities such as hunting and art reduce risk, in that people do not solely rely on one sector of the economy. Altman and Hinkson draw attention to movement between sectors of the hybrid economy as well as between waged work and other forms of meaningful activity. They argue that the current state approach of advocating mainstream market engagement and little else for remote-living Indigenous people is risky. This chapter urges that the Australian state recognises and comprehensively supports the crucial role that Indigenous people can and do play in environmental stewardship.

Altman, J.C. 2011. 'A genealogy of 'demand sharing': From pure anthropology to public policy', in Y. Musharbash and M. Barber (eds), *Ethnography and the Production of Anthropological Knowledge: Essays in Honour of Nicolas Peterson*, ANU E Press, Canberra, 187–200, available at <<http://press.anu.edu.au/apps/bookworm/view/Ethnography+&+the+Production+of+Anthropological+Knowledge:+Essays+in+honour+of+Nicolas+Peterson/5581/ch13.xhtml>>.

Keywords: Demand sharing, distribution of resources, income quarantining, reciprocity, anthropology and policies

Summary: This essay consists of a survey of academic and public policy uses (and misuses) of the concept of 'demand sharing' introduced by Nicolas Peterson in 1993. The concept was initially aimed at grappling with the complexity of a particular mode of distribution which can be found in contemporary Australian Aboriginal societies. Yet, with time, some academics and policy makers have contributed to the oversimplification of the concept, which came to be mistakenly equated with the morally negative notion of 'humbugging' depicted as an explanation for slow Aboriginal integration into the mainstream economy. Furthermore, while demand sharing is only one of many institutions for distribution, it has been used at times to represent the only mode of distribution. According to Altman, this emphasis on the negative moral dimensions of demand sharing has served to justify neo-paternalistic and interventionist policies, and fuelled the rationale behind the NTER.

Altman, J.C. and Hinkson, M. 2012. 'Hopeless futures?', *Arena*, 118: 2–3, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/Altman/Other/2012_Hope_less_Future.pdf>.

Keywords: Northern Territory intervention, neoliberalism, mediated politics, spectacle

Summary: This essay compares what the authors call 'optical illusions' created by the language of policy and the media coverage of the Northern Territory (NT) Intervention with the realities experienced by people on the ground. Sketching this process, the authors examine the Intervention's damaging effects on people's lives and argue that this process has led to wholesale destruction of local institutions, loss of community-owned assets, and a dramatic decline in local control and governance. Looking to the Pilbara and citing the NT's rich mineral base, the authors further assert that securing territory for mining requires regulated territories and compliant populations in pursuit of individualistic materialist dreams. The NT, they insist, sought to establish these circumstances under the guise of 'normalisation', yet evidence shows no real expectation of bringing about structural change on the ground. Moves by communities across the NT to resist and subvert measures of the intervention are further discussed, alongside the need for public attitudes to alter if the stark divide between Indigenous people and the rest of Australia is to close.

Altman, J.C. and Russell, S. 2012 'Too Much Dreaming: Evaluations of the Northern Territory National Emergency Response Intervention 2007–2012', *Evidence Base*, Issue 3, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/announces/anc12_12_19_4860.php>.

Keywords: Northern Territory Emergency Response, evaluation of evaluations, neoliberal ideology, anthropology of policies

Summary: Five years after the implementation of the Northern Territory Emergency Response (NTER), Altman and Russell set themselves an ambitious task to 'evaluate the evaluations' of the controversial policy. In doing so, they employ an anthropological theoretical perspective on power and policy processes, and examine the role that the evaluations and evidence played in the NTER's political framing.

The authors conclude that a politically charged and culturally sensitive policy such as the one analysed in this paper cannot or should not be evaluated according

to conventional public policy terms. Evaluations of the Intervention have not led to greater transparency, accountability or monitoring of outcomes and outputs, and the authors stress that too little attention has been paid to the ethnocentric nature of the Intervention and the cross-cultural tensions inherent in defining its goals and evaluating its outcomes. Altman and Russell further argue that the government's 'evaluation fetishism' emerges as a technique of governmentality, and is a part of the very political process that it contributes to legitimating intervention.

Altman, J.C. 2013. 'Jon Altman: Arguing the Intervention', Special Issue of *Journal of Indigenous Policy*, (14): 1–155, available at <http://caepr.anu.edu.au/sites/default/files/cck_staff_publication/2013/09/JIP14_low_rez.pdf>.

Keywords: Northern Territory Emergency Response, abolition of CDEP, mainstreaming of Indigenous employment, 'Closing the gap', assimilation policy, self-determination

Summary: This special issue of the *Journal of Indigenous Policy* compiles 39 short essays written as opinion pieces by Altman between 2007–2012 on the Northern Territory Emergency Response (NTER). Covering this five-year period, corresponding to the initial proposed duration of the Intervention, these essays offer a critical take on successive governments' decisions regarding Indigenous affairs as they unfolded. Altman condemns the tendency of these decisions to be based in a neoliberal approach to Indigenous issues, the discursive obsession with closing statistical gaps, and the development of policy that is not informed by evidence while avoiding addressing the key systemic issues underlying Indigenous disadvantage and marginalisation. Altman has been adamantly opposed to the Intervention from its inception, failing as it did to understand the complex socioeconomic reality of remote Indigenous Australia. He continues to advocate for self-determination, recognition of Indigenous rights and difference, and evidence-based policy making.

CONTACT US

Centre for Aboriginal Economic Policy Research
Research School of Social Sciences
ANU College of Arts & Social Sciences

Copland Building #24
The Australian National University
Canberra ACT 0200
Australia

T +61 2 6125 0587

W caepr.anu.edu.au

ANU CRICOS Provider Number: 00120C