The influence of Arthur Benjamin’s film music on music he wrote for other genres

Wendy Faye Hiscocks

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy of The Australian National University

August 2009
Declaration

I confirm that this thesis contains no material that has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma at any university. Furthermore, this thesis contains no material previously published or written by any other person except where due reference is made in the text.

Wendy Faye Hiscocks
August 6, 2009
Acknowledgments

First and foremost I would like to thank Andrew Youdell for his steadfast support. Without his encouragement, this doctorate would not have been possible.

I am indebted to numerous people for additional support at various stages of the project: Dr. Roy Howat for financial and research assistance in the early stages, my initial supervisor Deborah Crisp whose help was invaluable in focusing the research into the current thesis topic and to Stephen Wild for seeing the thesis through to submission. I would also like to thank Dr. Paul Banks and Dr. Alexander Knapp for giving much needed critical feedback at a crucial time in the thesis’s development.

It would be impossible to thank all the people who have helped me locate information and have sent me material from all corners of the world on matters relating to Benjamin’s life and music. The following list is only the beginning: the heir of the Benjamin Estate for allowing me access to his collection of papers, Veronica Platts who generously gave her time and energy into researching Benjamin’s career in Canada, Laura Tanna who assisted with enquiries in Jamaica, the staff at the British Library, Peter Horton at the RCM Library, Marcus Caratelli, Reverend Clive Cohen, the librarians who drew my attention to information that would otherwise have been difficult to locate, and people who agreed to give interviews.

And finally, there are those individuals who provided support and a place to live and work which ensured completion of the thesis. These are my parents Robert and Doreen Hiscocks, Paul and Margaret Wright, and Caroline Knapp.
Abstract

The word 'eclectic' features in the few assessments describing Arthur Benjamin's compositions but a deeper study of the influences that shaped this man and his music has yet to be fully addressed. One of these influences was the world of the early talking pictures of which Benjamin was a pioneer film composer in Britain. Far from being inconsequential work conducted for purely financial gain, Benjamin considered film music to be an important job in which he immersed himself for a brief but intensive four year period 1934–7. The thesis argues whether his experience in this medium led him to new musical discoveries and techniques that he felt were beneficial in shaping his voice as a composer, not just in the area of film, but for other genres such as opera and orchestra as well.

After explaining the context of this film music period in Benjamin's life and why the nature of this work was likely to influence him at this stage of his compositional career, six of his film scores are analysed and the findings compared with a selection of pre-film and post-film orchestral and operatic scores. Based on the results of this comparison, it is possible to conclude that Benjamin's approach to composition in the areas of orchestration, counterpoint, form and interpretation of drama changed in response to the medium of film and these changes were quickly absorbed into the creative process for scores he subsequently wrote for other genres.
## Contents

**Declaration** ii  
**Acknowledgments** iii  
**Abstract** iv  
**List of figures** viii  
**List of tables** viii  
**List of music examples** ix  
**Abbreviations** xvii  

1 **Introduction** 1  

2 **Historical context** 17  

2.1 Introduction ................................................................. 18  
2.2 Benjamin's childhood in Australia and his early music education 1893–1914. .................................................. 18  
2.3 Benjamin's musical development during the war years 1914–8. ................................................................. 36  
2.4 Post war years, the 1920s and early 1930s. .................... 44  
2.5 Benjamin's career in the period 1934–9 and his introduction to the early British sound film industry. .................... 70  
2.6 The Canadian years 1939–46. .......................................... 91  
2.7 Benjamin's return to London. ........................................... 113  
2.8 Conclusion.......................................................... 152  

3 **The nature of film music** 156  

3.1 Introduction................................................................. 157  
3.2 Defining film music and its function................................. 157  
3.3 Production of film music................................................ 169  
3.4 Benjamin's work colleagues and the attitudes of other musicians and writers towards film music...................... 178  
3.5 Conclusion................................................................. 190
4 Film music 1934–7

4.1 Introduction. ......................................................... 194
4.2 The Man Who Knew Too Much (1934). .................. 195
4.3 The Clairvoyant (1935). ........................................... 209
4.4 Turn of the Tide (1935). ........................................... 216
4.5 Lobsters (1936). ..................................................... 233
4.6 Wings of the Morning (1937). .................................. 240
4.7 Under the Red Robe (1937). ..................................... 250
4.8 Conclusion. ........................................................... 257

5 Orchestration and counterpoint

5.1 Introduction. .......................................................... 261
5.2 Orchestration and counterpoint in Concertino and
the Violin Concerto. ................................................... 262
5.3 Orchestration and counterpoint in Benjamin’s 1930s film
scores with particular focus on Turn of the Tide. ........... 274
5.4 Orchestration and counterpoint in Romantic Fantasy and
Overture to an Italian Comedy. ..................................... 285
5.5 Conclusion. ........................................................... 292

6 Analysis of form in Benjamin’s orchestral compositions

6.1 Introduction. .......................................................... 296
6.2 Analysis of form in Concertino and Violin Concerto. .... 297
6.3 Analysis of form in Overture to an Italian Comedy and
Romantic Fantasy. ..................................................... 314
6.4 Conclusion. ........................................................... 331

7 Film and Opera

7.1 Introduction. .......................................................... 335
7.2 The Devil Take Her and Prima Donna. ...................... 336
7.3 Benjamin’s treatment of libretto and musical response
to drama in A Tale of Two Cities. ................................. 347
7.4 Conclusion. ........................................................... 366
8 Conclusion

Bibliography ................................................................. 374

Appendix A: Musical outline of main musical events in A Tale of Two Cities, act three, scene four, bars 199–463
Appendix B: List of Arthur Benjamin's scores
Appendix C: List of films for which Arthur Benjamin composed music
Appendix D: Glossary of names
Appendix E: DVD of The Man Who Knew Too Much (1934 version) and video cassette of Turn of the Tide
List of Figures

4.1 Wierzbicki's comparative analysis of the sections comprising both versions of the Storm Clouds Cantata .................. 198

4.2 Three sections of Storm Clouds Cantata (1934) ................. 201

List of Tables

4.1 Nine scenes accompanied by music in The Clairvoyant and their use of tonality and motifs ......................... 215

4.2 Use of key, motifs and themes in Benjamin's score for Turn of the Tide ................................................................. 231

4.3 Level 1 of Lobsters' structure ........................................ 235

4.4 Fourteen parts functioning on level 2 of the score Lobsters .................................................. 237

4.5 Use of key and musical material in Wings of the Morning .. 248

6.1 Basic components that create the form of the Concertino ................................................................. 299

6.2 Basic components that create the form of the Violin Concerto's three movements—Rhapsody, Intermezzo and Rondo ................................................................. 299

6.3 Tonality and aural resting points in Concertino and coinciding thematic material ............................................. 308

6.4 Tonality and aural resting points in Violin Concerto and coinciding thematic material .......................................... 310

6.5 Basic components that create the form of the Romantic Fantasy ............................................................. 314

6.6 Basic components that create the form of Overture to an Italian Comedy ......................................................... 316

6.7 Tonality in Romantic Fantasy ....................................... 323

6.8 Tonality in Overture to an Italian Comedy ..................... 326

7.1 Arias and interludes in Prima Donna ................................ 346

7.2 Three sections and use of leitmotif in A Tale of Two Cities, act three, scene four, bars 199–463 ......................... 364
List of Music Examples

2.1 Arthur Benjamin, *Calm Sea and Mist*, bars 2–3.........49
2.2 Arthur Benjamin, *Carnavalesque*, bars 80–84.........50
2.3 Arthur Benjamin, *Suite for Piano*, Prelude, bars 1–4....62
2.4 Maurice Ravel, *Le Tombeau de Ravel*, Prelude, bars 1–4...62
2.5 Arthur Benjamin, *Suite for Piano*, Tambourine, bars 1–6...62
2.6 Maurice Ravel, *Le Tombeau de Ravel*, Rigaudon,
   bars 37–42.........................................................62
2.7 Arthur Benjamin, *Suite for Piano*, Toccatas, bars 59–62...62
2.8 Maurice Ravel, *Le Tombeau de Ravel*, Toccatas,
   bars 29–34.........................................................63

4.1 Two-chord motif A, *Storm Clouds Cantata*, bars 2–3......203
4.2 Variation on Motif A in *Allegro agitato* section, *Storm
   Clouds Cantata*, bar 93.................................203
4.3 Motif B 'All save the child', *Storm Clouds Cantata*, bar 30..204
4.4 Motif C 'Finding release', *Storm Clouds Cantata*, bar 59...204
4.5 *Storm Clouds Cantata*, outline of motifs, rhythms and
   harmonies that build dramatic tension throughout the
   cantata over the stable tonal 'background'.....................207
4.6 Opening titles, *Storm Clouds Cantata*, bars 3–4.........208
4.7 Motif A as it first appears in the opening titles, *Clairvoyant*.212
4.8 Motif B as it first appears in the opening titles, *Clairvoyant*.212
4.9 Melodic outline of the overture and use of the two motifs,
   *Clairvoyant*.........................................................212
4.10 Variation on clairvoyant motif B in Thames scene,
   *Clairvoyant*.........................................................214
4.11 Variation on clairvoyant motif A in Thames scene,
   *Clairvoyant*.........................................................214
4.12 Dawn scene, *Turn of the Tide*.................................220
4.13 'Sea' motif, *Turn of the Tide*..................................221
4.14 Spring scene, *Turn of the Tide*.................................221
4.15 Brook theme from first episode, *Turn of the Tide*.......221
4.16 'Lovers' theme, *Turn of the Tide.* ............................................... 222
4.17 'Work' rhythm that accompanies the arrival of the boat
engine, *Turn of the Tide.* .......................................................... 222
4.18 'Triumph' motif, *Turn of the Tide.* .......................................... 223
4.19 Blending of music representing three 'harmonious' elements
in the closing moments of *Turn of the Tide.* .............................. 224
4.20 Isaac's motif as it first appears in the opening titles,
*Turn of the Tide.* ................................................................. 224
4.21 Variation on Isaac's motif as he watches the Lunns take
their lobster pots out to sea, *Turn of the Tide.* ........................... 224
4.22 Variation on Isaac's motif in the scene where he cuts
the lifebuoy lines to the Lunns' lobster pots, *Turn of
the Tide.* .................................................................................. 225
4.23 Musical outline of the score for the first episode of the
storm scene, *Turn of the Tide.* .................................................. 226
4.24 Musical outline of the build-up of tension in the second
episode of the storm scene, *Turn of the Tide.* ............................. 228
4.25 'High Barbaree', *Lobsters.* .................................................... 236
4.26 'Work' theme, *Lobsters.* ....................................................... 236
4.27 Lobster polka, *Lobsters.* ....................................................... 237
4.28 Segment A on level 3 of the score, *Lobsters.* ............................. 238
4.29 Segment B on level 3 of the score, *Lobsters.* ............................. 238
4.30 Repetition of 'High Barbaree' and two-chord transition,
*Lobsters* .................................................................................... 239
4.31 'Wishing well' theme, *Wings of the Morning.* ......................... 243
4.32 Mode used at the start of the opening titles, *Wings of the
Morning.* .................................................................................... 244
4.33 Theme one in opening titles, *Wings of the Morning.* ................ 244
4.34 Theme two in the opening titles, *Wings of the Morning* ......... 244
4.35 Part A of Gypsy dance, *Wings of the Morning.* ......................... 245
4.36 Part B of Gypsy dance, *Wings of the Morning.* ......................... 245
4.37 Part C of Gypsy dance, *Wings of the Morning.* ......................... 245
4.38 Mode for the gypsy violin solos, *Wings of the Morning.* .......... 245
4.39 Marie’s ‘hurt’ theme, *Wings of the Morning*. .................246
4.40 Irish theme’s first appearance after the opening titles,

*Wings of the Morning*. .........................................................247
4.41 Gil de Berault motif A, *Under the Red Robe*. ...............253
4.42 Gil de Berault theme, *Under the Red Robe*. ...............253
4.43 Gil de Berault motif B in its first variation, *Under the Red

Robe*. .................................................................................254
4.44 Gil de Berault motif B as Marguerite and Gil converse,

*Under the Red Robe*. ..........................................................254
4.45 Variations on Gil de Berault motif A after his betrayal of

Marguerite, *Under the Red Robe*. ...........................................256
4.46 First entry of Cardinal’s theme, *Under the Red Robe*. .........256
4.48 Theme for Marguerite’s remorse, *Under the Red Robe*. .......257

5.1 Concertino, bars 1–12. .........................................................263
5.2 Concertino, bars 115–9. .........................................................263
5.3 Concertino, bars 39–47. .........................................................264
5.4 Violin Concerto, Rhapsody, bars 63–9. .................................264
5.5 Violin Concerto, Rondo, bars 12–9. ...........................................265
5.6 Violin Concerto, Rondo, bars 150–3. ........................................265
5.7 Concertino, bars 151–66. .........................................................265
5.8 Concertino, Scherzo, bars 230–6. ..............................................267
5.9 Violin Concerto, Rhapsody, bars 70–85. .................................268
5.10 Violin Concerto, Intermezzo, bars 66–75. .................................270
5.11 Violin Concerto, Rhapsody, bars 57–60. .................................270
5.12 Violin Concerto, Rhapsody, bars 29–35. .................................271
5.13 Concertino, bars 72–5. .........................................................271
5.14 Concertino, bars 101–2. .........................................................271
5.15 *Turn of the Tide*, brook scene. ............................................278
5.16 *Storm Clouds Cantata*, bars 1–10. ........................................284
5.17 *Storm Clouds Cantata*, bars 58–61. .......................................285
5.18 *Romantic Fantasy*, Nocturne, bars 1–4. ...............................286
5.19 *Romantic Fantasy*, Nocturne, bar 39. ............................................. 286
5.20 *Overture to an Italian Comedy*, bars 43–6. ............................... 287
5.21 *Overture to an Italian Comedy*, bars 41–2. ............................... 287
5.22 *Romantic Fantasy*, Scherzino, bars 138–41. ............................ 288
5.23 *Romantic Fantasy*, Scherzino, bars 289–92. ............................ 288
5.24 *Overture to an Italian Comedy*, bars 140–4. .............................. 289
5.25 *Romantic Fantasy*, Sonata, bar 465. .......................................... 290

6.1 Themes and motifs in Concertino, SECTION 1, part A
   No. 1 Theme A and motif A, bars 5–13 ................................................. 301
   No. 2 Theme B, bars 21–5. ................................................................. 301
   No. 3 Theme C, bars 38–43. ................................................................. 301

6.2 Themes and motifs in Concertino, SECTION 1, part B
   No. 1 Motif B, bar 103 ........................................................................ 301
   No. 2 Theme D, bars 107–10. ............................................................... 301
   No. 3 Theme E, bars 110–5. ................................................................. 301

6.3 Theme and motifs in Concertino, SECTION 2 (scherzo & trio)
   No. 1 Theme F, part A, bars 230–2. .................................................... 302
   No. 2 Theme G and motif C, part B (Trio), bars 291–300. ................. 302
   No. 3 Motif D, part B (Trio), bars 300–1 ........................................... 302

6.4 Themes in Concertino, SECTION 3, part B
   No. 1 Theme H, part B, bars 457–60 .................................................. 302
   No. 2 Theme I, part B, bars 488–506 .................................................. 302

6.5 Themes and motifs in Violin Concerto, Rhapsody
   No. 1 Rhapsody motif A, SECTION 1, bars 1–2. ................................... 303
   No. 2 Theme A, SECTION 1, bars 22–9 ............................................... 303
   No. 3 Theme B, SECTION 1, bars 29–33. ............................................ 303
   No. 4 Theme C, SECTION 1, bars 33–5 ............................................... 303
   No. 5 Motif B, SECTION 1, bar 43 ..................................................... 303
   No. 6 Variation on theme C, SECTION 2, bar 57 ............................... 303
   No. 7 Theme D, SECTION 2, bars 63–6. ............................................ 304
   No. 8 Theme E, SECTION 2, bars 70–1. ............................................ 304
   No. 9 Theme F, SECTION 2, bars 74–5. ............................................ 304
No. 10 Motif C, SECTION 4, bars 130–1. 304
No. 11 Theme G, SECTION 4, bars 137–8. 304
No. 12 Motif D, SECTION 4, bar 156. 304
No. 13 Theme H, SECTION 5, bars 178–9. 304

6.6 Themes and motifs in Violin Concerto, Intermezzo
No. 1 Theme A, SECTION 1, bars 1–2. 304
No. 2 Theme B comprised of ‘Rhapsody motif A’ and motif B, SECTION 1, bars 3–5. 305
No. 3 Theme C, SECTION 2, bars 17–20. 305
No. 4 Theme D, SECTION 2, bars 26–34. 305
No. 5 ‘Rhapsody motif A’ (inversion), SECTION 3, bar 39. 305

6.7 Themes and motifs in Violin Concerto, Rondo
No. 1 Theme A, SECTION 1, bars 1–11. 305
No. 2 Theme B and motif A, SECTION 2, bars 14–6. 306
No. 3 Theme C, SECTION 3, bars 67–74. 306

6.8 Layering and juxtaposition of themes and motifs in the Concertino and Violin Concerto
No. 1 Motif A over theme B, Concertino, bars 21–4. 306
No. 2 Motif A in imitation with theme C, Concertino, bars 129–31. 306
No. 3 Theme C imitated at pitch, Concertino, bars 49–54. 307
No. 4 Themes A and B, Violin Concerto, Intermezzo, SECTION 3, bars 48–50. 307
No. 5 Layering of themes and motifs in Violin Concerto, Rhapsody, bars 140–4. 307

6.9 Themes and motifs in Romantic Fantasy’s Nocturne, Scherzino and Sonata-Finale
No. 1 Motif A, Nocturne, SECTION 1, bars 1–3. 316
No. 2 Motif B, Nocturne, SECTION 1, bars 3–5. 316
No. 3 Motif C, Nocturne, SECTION 1, 5–6. 316
No. 4 Motif D, Nocturne, SECTION 2, bar 24. 317
No. 5 Motif E, Nocturne, SECTION 2, bar 32. 317
No. 6 Ostinato A, Nocturne, SECTION 3, bar 37. 317
No. 7 Theme A and motif F, Nocturne, SECTION 3, bars 41–2. .......................... 317
No. 8 Motif G, Nocturne, SECTION 3, bar 43. .......................... 317
No. 9 Ostinato B, Nocturne, SECTION 4, bar 63. .......................... 317
No. 10 Theme B, Nocturne, SECTION 4, bar 72–3. .......................... 317
No. 11 Motif H, Nocturne, SECTION 5, bars 98. .......................... 317
No. 12 Theme C (part one and two), Scherzino, SECTION 1, bars 128–44. .......................... 318
No. 13 Motif I with accompaniment based on motif H, Scherzino, SECTION 2, part one, bars 289–90 .......................... 318
No. 14 Theme D and its two parts, Scherzino, SECTION 2, part one, bars 291–307. .......................... 318
No. 15 Theme E, Sonata-Finale, SECTION 2, bars 495–8. .......................... 318

6.10 Themes and motifs in Overture to an Italian Comedy.
No. 1 Theme A and motif E, SECTION 1, bars 1–6. .......................... 318
No. 2 Theme B, SECTION 1, bars 6–9. .......................... 318
No. 3 Theme C complete, SECTION 1, bars 44–8. .......................... 319
No. 4 Motif A, SECTION 1, bar 15. .......................... 319
No. 5 Motif B, SECTION 1, bar 17. .......................... 319
No. 6 Theme D and motif C, SECTION 1, bars 28–32. .......................... 319
No. 7 Motif D, SECTION 1, bars 39–40. .......................... 319
No. 8 Theme E, SECTION 3, bars 113–8. .......................... 319
No. 9 Motif F, SECTION 4, bars 142–3. .......................... 319

6.11 Layering and juxtaposition of themes and motifs in Romantic Fantasy and Overture to an Italian Comedy.
No. 1 Layering of motifs A, E and C, Romantic Fantasy, bars 33–4. .......................... 320
No. 2 First part of theme C with motif C, Romantic Fantasy, bars 166–7. .......................... 320
No. 3 Motif A and G, Romantic Fantasy, bar 528. .......................... 321
No. 4 Variation on motif B joining theme F, Overture to an Italian Comedy, bars 143–7. .......................... 321
6.12 Motif G with ostinato A, *Romantic Fantasy*, Nocturne, 
SECTION 3, bar 43...............................................................................321
6.13 Motif G extended with ostinato B, *Romantic Fantasy*, 
Nocturne, SECTION 4, bars 64–6.....................................................322
6.14 Extended ostinato A, *Romantic Fantasy*, Sonata-Finale, 
SECTION 1, bar 465............................................................................ 322
6.15 Extended theme A into parts 1 and 2, *Romantic Fantasy*, 
Sonata-Finale, SECTION 1, bars 467–8....................................... 322
6.16 Decorated pedal on E, *Overture to an Italian Comedy*, 
SECTION 1, bar 17.................................................................................323
6.17 *Overture to an Italian Comedy*, SECTION 3, bars 118–26 . . 328
6.18 Closing passage from the Trio, *Prima Donna*, bars 305–20 . 330

7.1 *The Devil Take Her*, bars 54–7.........................................................339
7.2 *The Devil Take Her*, bars 164–5.....................................................339
7.3 *The Devil Take Her*, bars 563–5.....................................................339
7.4 *Prima Donna*, bars 837–48.............................................................342
7.5 ‘Neighbour’ motif, *The Devil Take Her*, bar 70–1.................342
7.6 ‘Doctor’ motif, *The Devil Take Her*, bar 450.........................342
7.7 *The Devil Take Her*, bars 566–8.....................................................342
7.8 *The Devil Take Her*, bars 708–10.....................................................342
7.9 *The Devil Take Her*, bar 160–2.....................................................343
7.10 *The Devil Take Her*, bar 489–92.....................................................343
7.11 ‘Dumb wife’ motif, *The Devil Take Her*, bars 1–6.............343
7.12 *The Devil Take Her*, bars 147–50.....................................................343
7.13 *The Devil Take Her*, bars 204–6.....................................................344
7.14 *The Devil Take Her*, bars 663–5.....................................................344
7.15 *The Devil Take Her*, bars 1105–8.....................................................344
7.17 ‘Opera’ motif, *Prima Donna*, bars 180–2................................345
7.18 Title music from the film *The Scarlet Pimpernel* is reused 
in the introduction to *A Tale of Two Cities*, act one, scene one, bars 1–11..................................................350
7.19 Drum rhythm used in *Return of the Scarlet Pimpernel*.

7.20 ‘*Ah! ca ira*’, *A Tale of Two Cities*, act two, scene three.

7.21 *A Tale of Two Cities*, act three, scene five, bar 211–6.

7.22 *A Tale of Two Cities*, act three, scene five, bars 381–401.

7.23 ‘Death sentence’ rhythm, *A Tale of Two Cities*, act one, scene one, bars 300–2.

7.24 ‘A hundred and five North Tower’, *A Tale of Two Cities*, act one, scene one, bars 458–60.


7.26 Variation on the Marquis de Saint Evrémonde leitmotif, *A Tale of Two Cities*, act two, scene three, bar 103.

7.27 ‘Revenge’ motif, *A Tale of Two Cities*, act one, scene one, bar 1.


7.31 ‘Carton’ motif, *A Tale of Two Cities*, scene two, bar 482.

7.32 ‘Self-judgment’ motif followed by Sydney Carton motif, *A Tale of Two Cities*, act one, scene two, bars 582–90.


7.35 *A Tale of Two Cities*, act three, scene six, bars 278–90.

7.36 Musical outline showing use of leitmotifs, key, chromaticism and diatonicism, *A Tale of Two Cities*, act one, scene one, bars 529–81.
**Abbreviations**

ABC Australian Broadcasting Corporation  
ABRSM Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music  
BFI British Film Institute  
BBC British Broadcasting Corporation  
CBC Canadian Broadcasting Corporation  
CBRSO Canadian Broadcasting Radio Symphony Orchestra  
GPO General Post Office  
LSO London Symphony Orchestra  
LPO London Philharmonic Orchestra  
NSW New South Wales  
OUP Oxford University Press  
RAM Royal Academy of Music  
RCM Royal College of Music  
RPO Royal Philharmonic Orchestra  
VSO Vancouver Symphony Orchestra  
WWI World War One  
WWII World War Two
Chapter 1

Introduction
Introduction

Arthur Benjamin (1893–1960) was one of the most multi-talented musicians to have emerged from Australia in the early 1900s and yet his music has been neglected and largely unappraised since his death in 1960. The reasons for this are complex and are, to some extent, part of a more deep seated disregard by musicologists of Australia’s post colonial composers. Benjamin has not been the only composer to have experienced this treatment as it was a considerable amount of time before the music of his contemporary, Percy Grainger, began to attract the publicity it enjoys today.

Within Australia, more attention has so far been devoted to the generation of composers who came after Benjamin such as Peggy Glanville-Hicks, Margaret Sutherland and Don Banks. These composers did not exhibit such close ties with England, the mother country, and were therefore a more suitable study for Australian researchers who were living in a country that was seeking to establish greater independence and some form of cultural identity amidst its diversity. Like a rebellious teenager, Australia from the 1960s onwards was especially keen to distance itself from Britain, a perspective that was entirely alien to an aspiring musician such as Arthur Benjamin in the early 1900s. In 1967, a book titled Australia’s Music: Themes of a New Society was published and the words of its author, the Australian music critic and educationalist, Roger Covell, reflected some of these complex issues affecting Anglo-Australian relations only a few years after Benjamin’s death.

The colonial process between Britain and Australia was perhaps exemplified at its best in the influence exercised by Thomas Dunhill, from all accounts the quintessence of the minor composer and educator of early twentieth century English music, on Arthur Benjamin, one of the few Australian musicians to achieve an impressive fluency in composition...Neither Chambers¹ nor Benjamin nor any later writer or composer who has followed

¹ Roger Covell is referring to Haddon Chambers, an Australian playwright who achieved considerable success in London’s West End.
their example has any need to apologize for such an act of total identification with English artistic values—except, perhaps, to those super-patriots who regard a failure to produce music or drama bearing a recognizable 'made in Australia' label as a kind of treason.²

Australia’s insecurity about its colonial beginnings will lessen with time but the author was surprised to find on a few occasions, in Australian academic circles, an outright rejection of anything to do with Benjamin. On every occasion, the aggressor knew little about the subject, but still there pervaded a 'cringe' factor or, if you like, an element of fear that the author believes is connected with the deeper issues of the Australian psyche already discussed.

The neglect of Arthur Benjamin by musicologists is reflected in the limited scope of the few written articles currently available. Past researchers had yet to undertake a wide enough search of source material and the result has been the publication of many superficial judgements and inaccurate information. To do Benjamin justice, deeper and wider research is needed. This is very time and energy consuming because there is not one archive or collection, whether private or public, anywhere in the world, that remotely begins to house all his memorabilia in one place. Indeed, this study was only made possible because the author began gathering source materials from several geographically dispersed countries four years prior to commencement of the doctorate. This lack of readily available material, either in print or as source material, was reflected in Robert Barnett’s comment when he wrote: “Benjamin does not appear to have been the subject of even the briefest biographical study.”³

The breadth of Benjamin’s life and his musical versatility, which encompassed composition, performing, conducting and teaching, generated further challenges for any potential researcher. Analysis of his life and music has been mainly confined to entries in

dictionaries, encyclopaedias, journals, magazines and newspapers. These have usually focused on one aspect of Benjamin’s work such as an event (for example, the première of a new composition) or a single genre as in Andrew Youdell’s brief survey of the film music. All the musical disciplines that Benjamin was active in proved to be important outlets for his skill and creativity but it is necessary, because of the size of this study, to focus on the one field that meant the most to him—that of composition.

In the sphere of composition he was able to embrace both ‘light’ and ‘serious’ music. His receptivity to diverse styles and genres extended to an interest in jazz in the 1920s, a deep appreciation of French music—especially Franck, Debussy and Ravel, an ability to blend music of the ‘old’ with that of the ‘new,’ and a love of the stage. The latter orientation found a new mode of expression in the 1930s when he joined the ranks of some of Britain’s finest composers as a pioneer in film music for early British talking pictures. For some composers, work in the film industry was purely financially gratifying or it was simply an extra ‘sideline’ activity in their composing career. For Benjamin it was an exciting new environment offering new challenges.

Benjamin’s contribution to British film music has already been assessed by various writers over the years. Early film music writer Kurt London acknowledged Benjamin in 1936 as an “expert” in film music and qualified his judgement by saying:

[Benjamin] has proved his sense of film-musical forms, his artistic taste in composition, and his understanding of the needs of the microphone to an ever-increasing degree...he ranks to-day among the most experienced and skilful composers in the youthful British film industry.6

---

5 Benjamin wrote in a letter to Ralph Hawkes: “I must be one of the few who can live on composition. Damn lucky. It is what I want to do.” Letter dated August 2, 1949 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
Muir Mathieson, writing in the same year as London’s publication, listed Benjamin as among the English musicians to have played a part in “the perfection of film music”, who “in his own sphere” was “unrivalled” for “ingenuity of device, effectiveness of orchestration, and perfection of balance and timing”.7

Benjamin’s first intense foray into film music between the years 1934–7 was soon to cease and did not resume until after his return from Canada in 1947. With the time that had passed, judgements and perspectives of his film work began to alter. Vaughan Williams’s article in Huntley’s British Film Music (1947) called upon “distinguished musicians who have entered into the world of cinema”, of which Benjamin was listed alongside Bax, Bliss and Walton, “to realize their responsibility in helping to take the film out of the realm of hack-work and make it a subject worthy of a real composer”.8 And in the same year, Mathieson mentioned the names of Benjamin, Mischa Spoliansky, Miklós Rózsa and Richard Addinsell as belonging to a “school of experts” composing for feature films between 1936–9.9

Writers in the 1950s continued to confirm Benjamin’s place as a pioneer in British film music with Hans Keller pronouncing him “as one of the founders of the art in this country”, and Huntley and Manvell’s book The Technique of Film made the following evaluation of Benjamin’s contribution:10

By 1936 Benjamin Britten, Erich Wolfgang Korngold, George Antheil, Virgil Thomson, William Alwyn and Arthur Benjamin had all written film scores. In short, the symphonist had entered the motion picture business, and the contemporary style of composition for films had begun.11

---

During his second film music period, from 1947 to 1958, Hans Keller was his most enthusiastic and critical listener. Benjamin's film music output was not large but this was not seen as a disadvantage by Keller, who commented that he was not "one of those who produce more film scores than they are able to create".12 His range of reviews heralded Benjamin's score for Conquest of Everest (1953) as "among the best British film scores";13 he commented on the insightful, if unconscious, "musico-dramatic premeditation" in the score for Master of Bankdam (1947);14 he noted the quality and structure of the score for Storm Clouds Cantata in Hitchcock's 1956 remake of The Man Who Knew Too Much;15 and he observed "nobility run tame" in the music for Above Us the Waves (1955) which did "not live up to the same standard" as Conquest of Everest (1953).16

After Benjamin's death, his colleague Herbert Howells paid tribute to his musical qualities which included mention of him as "a pioneer composer of film music: perishable and short-lived it had to be, by the rules of that art, even when produced at his own distinguished level".17 With the further passing of time, an assessment of British film music and Benjamin's contribution to the genre has drawn a more mixed response. Tony Thomas's book Film Score. The View from the Podium published in 1979, rather arrogantly and debatably dismissed the contribution made by British composers in the realm of cinema by questioning "if British film music ever had a golden age", and marked Bliss's score for Things to Come as the foundation of the British school of film composition. A subsequent list of the most active British composers—Sir Arnold Bax, Anthony Collins, Benjamin Frankel, Malcolm Arnold, Richard Addinsell,

Constant Lambert and William Alwyn—failed to mention Benjamin despite his having been more active than many in this field.\textsuperscript{18}

Andrew Youdell is the only person other than Hans Keller to have written in any detail about Benjamin's film music, and he does so in the 1996 issue of \textit{The Journal of the British Music Society} with the explicit task of devoting some attention to this composer's much neglected film music. Youdell was full of praise for the film score for \textit{Turn of the Tide} (1935), which he regarded as a "richly effective musical counterpoint which enhances and not merely accompanies the action...thanks to the high invention of melody, orchestration and musical development".\textsuperscript{19} But similar praise was not forthcoming for the music in \textit{An Ideal Husband} (1947) where it was generally concluded "Benjamin's imagination failed him".\textsuperscript{20}

It is a shame that Youdell's article was not more widely read as is evident from a more recent book by Jan G. Swynnoe titled \textit{The Best Years of British Film Music}. Two short entries are the sum total of Swynnoe's account of Benjamin's contribution to British film music, summed up with the words: "[Benjamin] had little inclination for film composition" and "Arthur Benjamin found composing for films unrewarding".\textsuperscript{21} Such statements are not justified in the light of available documentation and Swynnoe appears to have based such a judgement on only one film, \textit{The Scarlet Pimpernel} (1934), and has unwisely ignored the remainder of Benjamin's output. The claim that Arthur Benjamin's contribution to film music was only "significant for the part he played in introducing Vaughan Williams to it"\textsuperscript{22} is again, a blind generalization for, as Andrew Youdell was quick to point out in a discussion with the author,\textsuperscript{23} it was the vision of the director Michael Powell (as told in conversation with Youdell) who was

\begin{flushleft}
\end{flushleft}

\begin{flushleft}
\end{flushleft}

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{20} \textit{Ibid.}: 24.
\end{flushleft}

\begin{flushleft}
\end{flushleft}

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{22} \textit{Ibid.}: 89.
\end{flushleft}

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{23} Andrew Youdell in conversation with the author on June 22, 2008.
\end{flushleft}
responsible for persuading Vaughan Williams to score the music for
49th Parallel (1941).

Some critics of Benjamin's music have discerned the influence
of film music on scores he was creating for other genres. Such an
observation was not always welcome as is evident in this critique of
the opera A Tale of Two Cities by the Australian writer, Fred Blanks.

Once or twice there is just a trace of that over-easy facility that we associate
with film-music—but these moments are very brief. One can perhaps
summarise the work by saying that it is one of the finest new melodramatic
operas in many years and that one can readily forgive it a few faults, in view
of its dramatic tension and musical sincerity.24

Fred Blanks's critique is interesting for it not only regarded the film
music influence as undesirable, but it also did not consider the fact
that the "dramatic tension" he so much admired in the opera was not
a technique that might have been inspired by, or developed in,
Benjamin's early work in film.

Yet another angle on Benjamin's involvement with film music
surfaced in a review by Alan Boustead after Benjamin's death. In
assessing Benjamin's skills as an opera composer, Boustead
concluded that the weakness in dramatic action displayed in his first
opera The Devil Take Her, was never fully overcome in his later works.
He then argued that this "major failing" was caused by Benjamin
never having worked "over a broad canvas with music per se as the
sole factor". Boustead's definition of 'music per se' did not, in his
opinion, include the following genres for the following reasons: "Opera
has considerations besides music: the concerto permits technical
display: the film score, of which he wrote many, needs direct impact
rather than thoughtful development."25 Such a statement is again
questionable as a three-act opera such as A Tale of Two Cities is a

24 Fred Blanks. 'Some Observations by Fred Blanks on Tale of Two Cities: A romantic
melodrama: Book by Cedric Cliffe—music by Arthur Benjamin', Canon, Vol. VI, No. 11 (June
709.
'broad canvas' even though it works in harmony with its libretto, and Bousted seemed to have completely forgotten Benjamin’s large scale Symphony. It also assumed that Benjamin’s film scores involved no “thoughtful development”.

Roger Covell, writing in 1967, summed up the general influence of Benjamin’s film music on his other genres by saying:

He was an ideal film composer in that his film music had elegance, an assured command of diverse styles and moods and because it was not particularly intrusive or memorable in its own right. Much of the same assessment could be made of many of his works for the concert hall.26

But in making such a statement, Covell appeared to be a odds with Youdell who, when discussing the music for the film Turn of the Tide (1935), noted the music for the dawn scene as “totally inspired” and for the brook scene as “enchanting to listen to and utterly memorable”.27

Another aspect of Benjamin’s approach to composition, seen as a source of weakness, was illuminated in words by Boustead and John Warrack who both reported the fact that Benjamin considered it “a composition rule” and “important” to maintain a certain fluency when writing and “not to struggle and scratch out endlessly but to keep going”.28 Much the same approach could be said of film music composition when the composer was required to write with speed owing to the restricted amount of time given to produce a score. But such a method was most likely developed before Benjamin entered the world of film music as he was noted from an early age as being a gifted improviser, a talent that would have been endorsed by, and highly useful for, film music which demanded spontaneity and a fluid technique.

28 The first of these quotations was from Alan Boustead. ‘Molière with Music’, Music and Musicians, [November 1964]: 27. The remainder were from John Warrack. ‘Arthur Benjamin’, Opera, Vol. II, No. 6 (June 1960): 434.
Benjamin was not the only composer whose concert works were accused of having been corrupted by film music. Jessica Duchen's book recorded a New York Times critic's response to Korngold's Violin Concerto:

This is a Hollywood concerto. The melodies are ordinary and sentimental in character, the facility of the writing is matched by the mediocrity of the ideas.29

Benjamin directly attacked such attitudes in his review of Menotti's opera The Consul when he drew attention to the quality of the music for Lo, Death's frontiers are open. In his opinion this music was "enough to refute any who sneer at Menotti's music as 'cinema'—the word upon which the lazy critic has come to fall back when in doubt".30 According to Benjamin, Menotti's talents were "his peculiar gift to apply an eclectic idiom with masterly effect to the characterization of his personages" and the ability for his music to communicate "at first hearing".31 These attributes were seen as a plus and indeed mirrored in Benjamin's own works, but were factors that often came under criticism by, as John Warrack expressed it, a country troubled "by questions of musical idiom".32 Tony Thomas openly questioned such off-handed condemnations of film music in relation to Rózsa's composition:

[O]nly a light-headed critic would suggest that Rozsa's chamber music and his symphonic works sound like 'movie music,' although there have been critics who have not been able to avoid this fatuous view.33

Other critics sought to qualify the influence of 'light' music or film music. Donald Mitchell quoted the names Arthur Benjamin and

---

31 Ibid.: 249.
Darius Milhaud as "two composers who work successfully in and out of films" who were capable of writing popular music that he favourably qualified as "to the public taste" rather than to the more inferior "of the public taste". For Keller, there was no problem when crossing what to others was a distinct divide between film music and other genres, as he declared Benjamin's score for *Conquest of Everest* (1953) to be "among Benjamin's best music, in or outside the cinema. Donald Mitchell has pertinently suggested to me that an excellent concert suite could be extracted from it".

These evaluations have led the author to question what impact Benjamin's work in the film industry had on his approach to composition and whether its influence was necessarily 'bad' for a composer. No text books or courses were available to prepare composers for work in this new medium of the talking picture which presented fresh challenges and, for those who were receptive like Benjamin, new stimulus for their creativity. The factor that makes this study unique is the timing of this experience: Benjamin's introduction to the world of sound pictures, when the industry was still in its infancy, coincided with a particular stage of development he had reached as a composer, that is, a musician with considerable skill still to find his mature voice. This matter of timing explains why it is the first film period 1934–7, and not the second 1948–58, that is the focus of this thesis.

Research into the influence of Benjamin's film music on works composed in other genres opens up the question of the speed with which such influences can be absorbed by a composer. Rebecca Leydon's article in *Music Theory Spectrum* alerted readers to what may well be one of the first recorded responses by a major composer to the early silent cinema when she quoted Debussy as having said:

---

There remains but one way of reviving the taste for symphonic music among our contemporaries: to apply to pure music the techniques of cinematography. It is the film—the Ariadne’s thread—that will show us the way out of this disquieting labyrinth. [SIM bulletin, November 1, 1913].

Leydon argued how editing techniques in the French silent films, such as the “fade”, the “dissolve” and the “cut-in”, were absorbed into the later style of Debussy’s compositions—\textit{Jeux} and the twelve piano etudes, and concluded the following:

I suggest that \textit{Jeux} might be understood more specifically as a cinematic rendering of the Prelude [\textit{L’après-midi}], for what \textit{Jeux} retains and greatly amplifies from the earlier Prelude is its qualities of formal discontinuity and its disorienting, over-abundance of motivic material—precisely the kinds of narrative modes that become possible and credible in the age cinema.

If a composer such as Debussy was receptive to and able to readily absorb the influence of film which was, after-all, one of the most exciting new art forms at the turn of the twentieth century, it is not unreasonable to surmise that other composers responded to film. The nature of their interaction with film though would vary depending on the nature of the film world (silent or sound), the composer’s relationship with film (whether as an audience or as a film composer) and the non-film scores they were creating.

In observing the effect of Benjamin’s early film music on his other genres, opera and orchestra were selected as suitably rich areas for study. This is not to say that smaller scale works, such as the songs and chamber music, were not capable of showing a film music influence but their inclusion would make the study too broad and would not yield any important new insights that the orchestral and operatic genres could not cover. To determine changes in Benjamin’s approach to composition in these genres and the immediacy of those

\begin{itemize}
\end{itemize}
changes, a select number of scores have been chosen for comparative analysis. These have been narrowed down to be as close as possible, chronologically, to the first film period, and form two groups—pre-film and post-film. Pre-film compositions are defined as compositions created as near as possible but prior to the start of Benjamin’s involvement in film in 1934, and post-film compositions are works produced towards the end of, or after, his film music activity in the 1930s. In the orchestral genre, Benjamin’s Concertino (1927) and Violin Concerto (1931) have been chosen together with the operas *The Devil Take Her* (1931) and *Prima Donna* (1933), to represent the pre-film scores. The *Romantic Fantasy* (1936) and *Overture to an Italian Comedy* (1937), and *A Tale of Two Cities* (1950) constitute the respective orchestral and opera genres in the post-film category. A substantial body of film scores—twelve in total—were composed in the first four year period and from these, the following six titles have been selected: *The Man Who Knew Too Much* (dir. Alfred Hitchcock. Gaumont-British Picture Corporation. 1934), *The Clairvoyant* (dir. Maurice Elvey. Gainsborough. 1935), *Turn of the Tide* (dir. Norman Walker. British National Films. 1935), *Lobsters* (dir. John Mathias and László Moholy-Nagy. Bury Productions. 1936), *Wings of the Morning* (dir. Harold Schuster. New World Pictures. 1937) and *Under the Red Robe* (Dir. Victor Sjöström. New World Pictures. 1937).

The comparative analysis of the above works focuses on compositional techniques that exhibited significant change after Benjamin’s immersion in the world of film. These include the use of key, leitmotif, harmony, orchestration, counterpoint and the interpretation of drama. Issues concerning form, in which the above techniques are addressed, are studied in both the orchestral and opera genres but the study of orchestration and counterpoint is confined to the orchestral works. The reason for doing this is because the opera scores, unlike the orchestral music, revealed no significant changes in the area of orchestration and counterpoint.
The ensuing chapters of this thesis set out to prove that techniques Benjamin developed in his film music between the years 1934–7 influenced the orchestral and operatic compositions which were written in the period immediately after. Chapter two addresses the wide range of factors that influenced Benjamin’s composition throughout his life whether they were of an economic, personal or intellectual nature. Such a study is complex and sizeable owing to the range of material covered and the lack of detailed information available elsewhere, but it is necessary in order to establish why it is the first film music period of the 1930s that is addressed in this debate and not the second film music period from 1947–58. It also serves to clarify why his work in film at this particular time in his life had the impact that it did thereby justifying its place in this study in preference to other factors that played a part in shaping his music.

Chapter three introduces the world of British film making in the 1930s and takes into consideration the many components that created and influenced this field of work. These included the practical side of film making as well as the mindset of the personnel responsible for film production. With these criteria established, six of Benjamin’s film scores are analysed in chapter four to identify the trends or compositional patterns that emerged as part of his response to the medium of film.

Chapter five links back to findings in the third chapter by examining how practical issues regarding the production of films influenced Benjamin’s orchestration and use of counterpoint in his orchestral works. A similar process is applied in chapter six where the analysis centres on the use of form in Benjamin’s film music and scores from the orchestral genre.

Chapter seven examines the genre of opera in relation to film and draws again on information and conclusions reached in chapters three and four. This material is integrated with the results of the comparative analysis to establish whether significant differences in
Benjamin’s approach to form in his operas were first applied to his film scores.

As dictated by the small number of published articles of any quality or depth on the subject of Arthur Benjamin’s music, many source materials have been created or consulted by the author. These have included recorded interviews conducted by the author, either by telephone or in person, with twenty-eight people, most of whom knew Benjamin as a friend or relative, or in some musical capacity. Letters, diaries and personal memorabilia in the possession of individuals living in Britain and as far afield as Australia, South Africa, Jamaica, Canada, America and France have been gathered as well as archives and government records in Britain, Australia and Canada. In addition, contact was established with the heirs of the Estate in Devon, UK who have allowed the author access to private papers and memorabilia. They have asked not to be identified and will therefore simply be referred to as the ‘Benjamin Estate’.

Accessing Benjamin’s films from the 1930s for viewing was achieved through the resources of the British Film Institute, commercially available DVDs and from the private libraries of independent film enthusiasts. No scores, with the exception of the Storm Clouds Cantata from The Man Who Knew Too Much (1934), have survived and so it has been necessary for the author to recreate the scores in as much detail as possible from repeated hearings of the films themselves. When the films were being made, cue sheets would have assisted production. This paperwork registered all the musical selections used in the film and acknowledged whether they were original compositions by the film’s composer or existing material from an alternative source. These would have been valuable documents for the six films chosen for analysis but unfortunately, none of them are extant. It was therefore necessary for the author to prepare detailed tables registering a brief description of the music that acknowledged elements such as the use of leitmotif and key, together with the action on the screen.
Essentially, the goals of this study are focused specifically on the music Benjamin composed for early sound pictures, and whether or not his work for this new medium resulted in new developments in his composition that were transferred directly to music he was composing for other genres. In the orchestral genre, modification in his approach to orchestration and counterpoint is studied, and a comparative analysis of his use of leitmotif, key, harmony, form and perception of drama in music is undertaken in his scores in orchestral and operatic genres before and after his first film period. The results of these findings against the analysis of the film music reveals how film provided the opportunity and the stimulus for Benjamin to trial new methods that were then implemented immediately afterwards in works for other genres. This thesis is part of a wider ongoing re-assessment of the value of film music, its influence on composers, and how, in the case of Benjamin, it provides a vital key in understanding the factors that shaped his music. It is the author's hope that this study will be a catalyst in reviving and stimulating interest in one of Australia's most talented and yet neglected composers.
Chapter 2

Historical Context
2.1 Introduction

In order to assess the impact of Benjamin's early film music on the music he wrote for other genres, it is first necessary to consider the wide range of influences affecting his musical development at different stages of his life. Such research is diverse and broad, and is required to cover a range of topics: his early life in Brisbane, Australia in the late 1890s, the impact of WWI, the world of film, and a variety of events during his residencies in England and Canada. Other factors such as Benjamin's own character and personal tastes, and the economic environment that determined conditions under which the arts functioned, are included in this study. This chapter is therefore the first comprehensive account of the factors shaping Benjamin as a creative artist.

The sections of this study are ordered chronologically. Section one discusses the period from early childhood to the start of the First World War, 1893–1914; section two encompasses Benjamin's experiences in the War until the beginning of his first film period, 1914–34; section three surveys the years 1934–9 and includes Benjamin's introduction to, and work in, the British film industry; section four examines his musical career in Canada during the years 1939–46; and the final section covers the latter part of Benjamin's career including music written for the stage and a second film music period, until his death in 1960. The breadth of this study explains and validates why the first film period from 1934–7 is important in understanding the factors that shaped Benjamin's voice as a mature composer.

2.2 Benjamin's childhood in Australia and his early music education 1893–1914

A small suitcase full of papers, letters and documents in the Benjamin Estate is all that survives of Arthur Benjamin's personal memorabilia. There are very few photos and no letters relating to his
early years, even from people closest to him, such as his mother Amelia, otherwise known as Millicent. This important source material may have been lost or destroyed over the years in the numerous moves of house and country in Benjamin’s life. His mother’s possessions most likely suffered a similar fate when she moved house within Australia. Amelia relocated to London some time after her husband’s death in 1921 before living with her son in Canada from the late 1930s. She then returned with Benjamin to London where she remained until her death in 1948. More material may have been dispersed in the thirty-five years after Benjamin’s death while it was in the care of Benjamin’s younger partner Jack Henderson who had inherited the estate.

According to Vernon Duker, executor of Henderson’s Estate, the American relatives of Henderson only took possession of items they viewed as valuable. These included antique furniture—pieces from the late Georgian, Regency and Victorian periods, and Benjamin’s Steinway boudoir grand piano, together with a selection of paintings. Vernon Duker bought and retained a number of paintings and drawings that Benjamin had purchased from the Australian artists Donald Friend and Kenneth MacQueen, and Canadian painter Eric Freifeld. Music manuscripts were deposited in the British Library and Royal College of Music (RCM) Library. Only letters, newspaper clippings and two photos (both of Larry Adler, Benjamin and Grock), all relating in some way to Benjamin’s career, together with receipts for English antique glassware and papers connected with select investments, remain in the small suitcase. Any material that might enlighten us about Benjamin’s private life has

38 Death certificates for Amelia and Abraham Benjamin.
39 Jack Henderson was born September 9, 1921 in Canada and died November 27, 1994 in London (Henderson’s death certificate with Benjamin Estate).
40 An inventory of items sent to Massachusetts, USA is with the Benjamin Estate.
41 See the list of manuscripts in the Appendix.
been removed or destroyed. It may be argued that Benjamin was careful about any material that might incriminate himself and others, as laws against homosexuality were still in force in Britain, but it still does not explain why not even one photo of the two men together survives amongst Henderson's belongings, especially if it is true, as two sources claim, that Benjamin had taken the precaution of adopting Henderson as his son.\textsuperscript{43} In the light of the limited amount of documentation, one suspects that some sort of 'clean-up job' was initiated after either Benjamin's or Henderson's death but it is difficult to identify where, when or by whom.

Despite the lack of source material, an account of Benjamin's early childhood in Australia can be pieced together, largely helped by the fact that Benjamin began writing an unfinished autobiography in 1949 while on holiday.

I'm writing my memoirs. Started them lying sunbaking in Italy, just for something to do. An Author Friend says they are quite fascinating. They are to be strictly musical memoirs showing how a composer was built up, starting with my earliest musical impression.\textsuperscript{44}

Two of the chapters titled \textit{Schooldays in Brisbane} and \textit{Student Life in Kensington}, were published separately in different music magazines in Britain during the 1950s.\textsuperscript{45} Other memories of these early years were recorded by Benjamin later in life in Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC) and British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC) interviews as well as casual comments transcribed by journalists for newspapers and magazines. Even though these sources give only

\textsuperscript{43} The first source comes from a relative of Benjamin called Nancy Arlen (daughter of his cousin), who wrote in her memoirs: "Arthur Benjamin came with his 'adopted son' Jack Henderson." Nancy Arlen. \textit{Memoir—The Black Sheep of the Brown Family: a Magic Life!} Toni McRae (ed.). Mudjimba Beach, Queensland: Pixstories Unlimited, 2001; no page numbers in this publication. The second was from Antony Poole, an employee of Boosey & Hawkes and Ralph Hawkes's nephew, who recollected in an interview with the author on January 7, 2003: "I know that Arthur did adopt Jack as his son."

\textsuperscript{44} Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Don Adams dated November 26, 1949 (University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard File 1-3).

Benjamin’s perspective, we are still able to gain some idea of the influences that shaped the thinking and development of this young musician.

The strongest and perhaps most lasting influence in a person’s life is their immediate family and early family life. Arthur Benjamin was born into a Sephardic Jewish family and a reference in an aerogram to Donald Friend enlightens us further about the family’s origins: “Years ago Norman Lindsay suddenly pointed at me & asked ‘Are you Greek?’ In my innocence I said ‘No, I have [F]rench, [D]utch, English & Jewish blood and I was born in Australia.”46 Nancy Arlen, who was the daughter of Benjamin’s cousin Rita Brown, provided information that Benjamin’s grandparents had migrated to Australia in 1848. The great-grandparents (on his grandmother’s side) Joseph and Sarah Weiller, had emigrated from Holland to England in about 1825.47

Arthur Benjamin’s birth certificate recorded his birth on September 18, 1893 at 158 Victoria Street, Sydney.48 His mother’s maiden name was Amelia Menser, born in Sydney, who was aged twenty-five at the time of his birth. She had married Abraham Benjamin on January 11, 1893 in Sydney, a commission agent,49 nine years her senior, born in Melbourne, Victoria. Martin Long’s interview with Arthur Benjamin on his last visit to Sydney in 1950 made note of the family’s move to Brisbane when Arthur was around the age of three.50

46 Nancy Arlen, when asked if Benjamin’s family were Jewish replied: “Yes, the family was Jewish—Sephardim in origin—but not Orthodox.” This was in response to a questionnaire from the author. Nancy Arlen’s replies were e-mailed to the author on September 22, 2003 from Ken and Grace Fraser who delivered the questionnaire to Arlen and recorded her answers. The quotation was from an undated aerogram but one can surmise it was written in 1957 as it is enquiring, like an earlier aerogram dated August 20, 1957, about a holiday in Ceylon (Australian National Library, MS 5959-38). Friend’s diary entry dated February 11, 1958 (Australian National Library MS 5959-38) further supported this year of identification by saying: “AB & JH have been here since the 29th”.
47 As related by Ken Fraser in conversation with Nancy Arlen in an e-mail to the author on September 22, 2003.
48 Arthur Benjamin’s birth certificate (Benjamin Estate).
49 Ibid. A commission agent is more commonly known as a ‘bookmaker’.
The professions of the men on Arthur’s father’s side of the family can be traced back to his great-grandfather Mozes Benjamin, who was a fishmonger born in Holland. Mozes’s son, Lazarus, followed the same trade in England but changed his profession to that of a commission agent after emigrating to Australia. This was a profession shared by his fourth child out of ten, Abraham Benjamin. Abraham was opposed to his son choosing the profession of a musician as he was not convinced there was much money to be made. But he had, if unknowingly, nurtured his son’s interests by exposing him at an early age to the music making which was very much a part of their family life. The following extract is quoted from the composer's autobiography by a journalist in The Sun-Herald:

We had an upright piano and I can remember crawling beneath the keyboard while my mother played, and pressing my ear against the wooden case, all the time fascinated by the movement of her feet on the pedals...By that time I had learnt my first piano piece: Nelly Bly...The first of my aural memories of Brisbane is of the tremendous thunderstorms, with their fascinating lightning, which in summer used to burst upon us nearly every night. It was the era of the musical party, the musical at home. Everyone who could play or sing was invited with a bidding to bring his music. The convention was that one’s music was left with the coats, and was never produced until the hostess had overcome a show of reluctance on the performer’s part.

The musical ‘at home’ and the music hall dominated Benjamin’s early music education. Jan Piper informed the author

---

51 As related to the author in an e-mail dated April 13, 2005 by Jan Piper, wife of Colin Piper who is a descendant of the Benjamin family. Jan Piper has researched into the family history and has stated her information came from the marriage certificate of Lazarus Benjamin.
52 Jan Piper, in the same e-mail detailed in footnote 16, stated Abraham was the fourth of ten children.
53 Abraham Benjamin’s death certificate.
55 Alex Mitchell claimed these extracts were from “The 70-odd pages of typed and hand written manuscript...unpublished but safely stored in the archives of Booseys & Hawkes” that he viewed when writing his 1993 article for The Sun Herald. These extracts were not published with the other two chapters by various magazines and journals in the 1950s and there is no trace of the original manuscript in the Boosey & Hawkes archives. Alex Mitchell. ‘Pacific Overtures’, The Sun-Herald, August 29, 1993.
that some of the members of Abraham’s side of the family changed their name to Barrington or Barrington-Benjamin after a well-known English performer.\(^{57}\) This was Rutland Barrington (1853–1922), an Edwardian musical comedy star who was particularly known for his performances in Richard D’Oyly Carte’s opera company and productions of Gilbert and Sullivan.\(^{58}\) The following newspaper extract relates to a performance by Harry Barrington, the brother of Abraham, for a Queen’s birthday programme on May 24, 1887:

Old theatregoers will recollect many of the contributors to the programme. It was in the days when the Minstrel Show was in vogue, the performers sitting in a semi-circle on the stage under the chairmanship of the Interlocutor.

This was Harry Barrington. His end-men, or corner men as they were known, were Teddy Shipp and George Adamson, and they replied with wisecracks to queries posed by the Interlocutor.\(^{59}\)

Benjamin appeared to have been mainly self-taught in his early years, learning by example from those around him such as his mother, who played the piano, and other amateur music makers in the family circle rather than from professional tutors. Later on, he summed up his own family’s musical talents in a 1929 interview for *The Australia Handbook*. He described a couple of his father’s brothers as “opera singers—probably duds” and his father’s voice as “good...though untrained.”\(^{60}\) In Benjamin’s opinion, his mother’s father Morris Menser,\(^{61}\) had managed to compose a “good old ‘Early-Victorian’” waltz entitled *The Southern Cross*.\(^{62}\) Even though the

---

\(^{57}\) As told by Jan Piper, married to Colin Piper, a descendant of the Benjamin family, in her e-mail to the author dated April 13, 2005.


\(^{59}\) Percy Hunter. ‘Yesterday’, *Turn of the Century*, date unknown [newspaper clipping from Jan and Colin Piper, descendants of the Benjamin family].


\(^{61}\) Benjamin’s parents marriage certificate.

\(^{62}\) Benjamin’s idea to re-use it “with variations some day” came to fruition as a theme for the wedding reception scene in the 1947 film *Master of Bankdam*. Ernest Irving. ‘News of the Day’, *Tempo*, New Series, No. 18, [March 1947]: 29. No manuscript or copy of this waltz has been found.
young Benjamin was relatively untrained, he was obviously talented. This is evident from his first public piano performance at the age of six where he performed Chopin’s C-sharp minor Waltz, op. 64, no. 2 even though, it was claimed, he was not yet able to read music.63

Economic factors played a part in shaping Brisbane’s cultural life which could really only support an amateur level of music making. Visiting musicians of professional or international standing were rare. The Brisbane Courier advertised vaudeville acts, piano “vamping” lessons (“no previous musical knowledge required”) were on offer, and Jamaican rum was selling at the Oriental Hotel for 5 shillings per quart or 3 shillings per bottle.64 Benjamin recalled being asked by a pretty lady in a doorway to play something on an old piano for her, a story he followed in hindsight by saying: “Nearly every house in Albert Street framed a pretty lady in its doorways, so I found out years afterwards. Brisbane was the terminal port for big ships, and sailors will be sailors.”65 Part of the port’s business was supported by the lucrative Queensland sugar cane trade which, in the 1890s, employed as many as nine thousand South Pacific Islanders known as the Kanaka.66 During most of Benjamin’s childhood the Kanaka enjoyed much improved work conditions until

63 Martin Long. ‘Benjamin as Composer’, Sydney Morning Herald, September 2, 1950. (Australian Music Centre’s biographical file)
Benjamin recalled having learnt his first piano piece Nelly Bly by the time the family had moved to Brisbane in 1893. His mother played the piano and his father sang regularly at their ‘musical parties’ at home and in doing so were providing their son with performing experience in front of small audiences from an early age. It is also highly likely that they were his first teachers considering there is no mention of formal lessons with a teacher before he was aged nine and his inability to read music at the age of six. The latter suggests he was taught by ear and by copying the actions of his mother at the keyboard. (Alex Mitchell. ‘Pacific Overtures’, The Sun-Herald, August 29, 1993.) The shortage of qualified piano teachers at this time was highlighted in Benjamin’s interview for the ABC: ‘I can remember when Brisbane had only horse-drawn trams. And the teaching of music there was almost as primitive...There was no wireless in those days; we had to make our own music.’ (Arthur Benjamin. Radio script for ‘ABC Guest of Honour’. Broadcast on October 15, 1950 on 2FC (National Archive of Australia, series no. SP369/1).)
64 Brisbane Courier, January 9, 1899.
‘Kanaka’ is the Hawaiian word meaning ‘person’ or ‘man’. In the late 19th and early 20th century this word came to represent any of the South Pacific Islanders employed in Queensland on the sugar plantations, farms or as domestic servants. (Unacknowledged author. ‘Kanaka’, The New Encyclopaedia Britannica. Chicago: Encyclopaedia Britannica, Inc., 1992, Vol. VI: 709.)
the Government’s White Australia policy made December 31, 1906 the last day whereby it was lawful to employ a Kanaka.67 By 1907, most of the Kanaka had been repatriated, a process which Benjamin may have witnessed first-hand, as the Islanders were collected at the ports of Cairns and Brisbane.68

Looking back on his early childhood many years later, Benjamin didn’t hide the fact that he enjoyed growing up in such exotic surroundings. He counted himself lucky to have escaped the gruelling training imposed on the average European child prodigy.69 Instead, he was able to enjoy “lovely days when we ran about like little naked savages on the Pacific beaches — and the risks we took, sharks and ‘Portuguese men-of-war’. A couple of months during the summer holidays without a pair of shoes on our feet!”70

On Benjamin’s own admission, his later life between the years of seven to thirteen was “boring in the extreme” and it is during this time that exact dates of events are more difficult to pinpoint.71 According to Alexander Mitchell’s article in The Sun-Herald, the young Benjamin played with varying success for the visiting European pianists Ignacy Jan Paderewski and Ignaz Friedman.72 His ABC talk in 1950 gave listeners some idea of Australia’s isolation from Europe by saying: “Every city in Australia today has a regular procession of the world’s greatest performers. In the old days, we were lucky if we heard one a year.”73 From the age of seven he attended Bowan House School whose advertisement in the Brisbane Courier included the wording: “Special attention given to delicate and backward boys”.74

68 Ibid.: 96.
70 Ibid.
74 Brisbane Courier, January 9, 1899.
The school curriculum included rudimentary group music lessons and Benjamin learnt by ear the repertoire his mother played:75

Chopin, Liszt, Mendelssohn, with an occasional modernity such as the 'Pizzicato' from the Delibes ballet or a Nocturne by somebody, all on the black keys . . . I knew nothing of Bach, Mozart or Beethoven. But I knew a lot of Sidney Jones and his kin; and I could play a few of the more mellifluous tunes from 'Elijah,' for that was the sort of music I heard.76

Hans Keller,77 in his appraisal of Benjamin's career much later in 1950, was able to enlighten readers further about Benjamin's early music education by saying the boy at this stage “had no idea that there was any possible difference in quality between Beethoven, Grieg, Ethelbert Nevin, Chopin, and Sidney Jones. 'Difference in style, yes; but not in value.'"78 Such a comment is significant as it explains the ease with which Benjamin was able to embrace both popular and serious genres in his compositions.

At the age of nine Benjamin began studies with the organist George Sampson.79 It is surprising that there is no mention of Sampson's name, character or teaching methods in Benjamin's autobiography. A Fellow of the Royal College of Organists from 1882, Sampson held the post of organist at St James' in Bristol and St Alban's in Holborn as well as music master at Brighton College in Sussex before emigrating to Brisbane in 1898. His compositions included an Ave Verum and Mass in D for Men's Voices which received performances in St Paul's Cathedral, and in 1894 he wrote A Text

Book of the Pianoforte: for use in Schools and Students generally.\(^{80}\) His contribution to Brisbane's musical life was significant, for, amongst many other activities, he was organist of St John's Cathedral and founder of the Sampson Orchestra in 1907.\(^{81}\) His approach to teaching was documented in publications such as the *Queensland Teacher's Manual of Music* (1912)\(^{82}\) and a lecture titled *Shape in Music* (1920),\(^{83}\) both of which clearly illustrate the importance he placed on rhythm. Benjamin's confident rhythmic language was very likely a credit to Sampson's teaching and there are other areas where his teacher's influence can be felt.\(^{84}\) Sampson, like Benjamin, gravitated to French music in his own compositions, with his *Ave Verum*, according to one critic writing for the *Bourne Echo* in 1885,\(^{85}\) having a particular affinity with Gounod's music—a composer whose works Sampson performed regularly as organist at St Alban's.\(^{86}\) And his lecture *Shape in Music* revealed some familiarity with Camille Saint-

---

\(^{80}\) The *Ave Verum* and Mass in D were published by Spottiswoode & Co. of London [circa 1885] and *A Text Book of the Pianoforte: for use in Schools and Students generally* was published by J. & W. Chester in Brighton and E. Donajowski in London. Reference to Sampson's music being performed at St Paul's Cathedral can be read in the article by Christine Petch. 'George Sampson'. www.stalbans-holborn.com Site last updated on December 7, 2008 and viewed by the author on January 6, 2009.

\(^{81}\) Sampson was also instrumental in restoring the four-manual Willis organ as well as lecturing at the Teachers' Training College (1914–30), acting as the inaugural president of the Music Teachers' Association of Queensland and as musical adviser to the University of Queensland. Betty Crouchley. 'George Sampson (1861-1949)', *Australian Dictionary of Biography: online edition*. Melbourne: Melbourne University Press, 1988: 514–5.

\(^{82}\) Published by Novello & Co. Ltd. (London).

\(^{83}\) George Sampson. *Shape in Music*. Lecture delivered by George Sampson, F.R.C.O., Musical Adviser to the University of Queensland, under the auspices of the Public Lecture Committee of the University, on October 6, 1920. Brisbane, Sydney, Melbourne: Edwards, Dunlop & Co. Ltd., 1920.

\(^{84}\) Rhythm was considered of vital importance to Sampson as was so clearly indicated in his own words reproduced from an instruction manual for Queensland teachers:

> Rhythm is the most important thing, musically speaking, in the Art. A bad timist is synonymous with a bad musician. The whole of the Universe is rhythm, our health is rhythm, light is rhythm, colour is rhythm...The whole life of music is written in this one word rhythm, and hence the real artist knows that where the music lacks rhythm its audience will be cold and unresponsive. All real artists spend their lives in struggling after a perfection of rhythm.

(george sampson. *the queensland teachers' manual of music*. london: novello and company, ltd., 1912: 39.)

\(^{85}\) Christine Petch. 'George Sampson'. www.stalbans-holborn.com Site last updated on December 7, 2008 and viewed by the author on January 6, 2009.

\(^{86}\) Ibid.
Saëns's and Vincent D'Indy's theories on rhythm even if he was in disagreement with the latter.87

Sampson, as the anonymous teacher, was acknowledged by Benjamin as having introduced him to Bach, Mozart and Beethoven.88 It is also extremely likely that Benjamin's interest in composition, particularly in works involving melody and the voice, was influenced by Sampson who was primarily a choral composer. A love of beauty was another factor that Benjamin shared with his teacher. Sampson believed music had a "nobler and higher" purpose whose "business [was] to create Beauty" which was "the greatest power for good in the world."89 Such a perspective was reflected throughout Benjamin's own life and in 1929, on a return visit to Australia, he was reported by a journalist to have urged the education authorities to develop a "closer association between the arts, and a more vigorous campaign to influence children towards the beautiful.90

Soon after commencing studies with Sampson, Benjamin's reading skills were sufficient enough for him to notate his own compositions which he recalled in an article written many years later.

I wrote my first song when I was nine. The words were very sentimental and I set them very badly—I put some words on high notes which were unsingable at that dizzy altitude, and I accented wrong syllables. But here and there a little twist in the harmony showed that perhaps the small boy who wrote it showed some talent, and the melody was not bad.91

---

90 'Decline in Culture: Composer's Charges', *The Argus* (Melbourne) November 19, 1929.
This he showed to Thomas Dunhill (1877–1946), a visiting examiner to Bowan House School for the Associated Board. After Dunhill conducted some tests and heard Benjamin play and improvise on the piano, he recommended the boy come to England to study harmony and counterpoint with him.92 From this moment on, the mind of the young Benjamin was fiercely focused on London. This was further fuelled by a visit to England in 1907 when he was tutored by Frederic Cliffe (1857–1931), the husband of his father's cousin, who taught at the RCM. In an interview given by Benjamin on his last visit to Australia in 1950, he explained what the prospect of study in London meant to him as a child: "My only hope was to get to London. In order to do so I had to raise some money, because my father was against my going, and I was determined to go."93

Benjamin's cousin, Nancy Arlen, recalled the comfortable lifestyle of the Benjamin family. Millicent wore furs and loved to gamble, and even bought Nancy designer dresses to help her in the early stages of her singing career.94 But because Abraham was against his son entering the music profession, the fifteen-year-old had no other way of paying for his hoped-for tuition in London than to secure a job playing pianos in a music store in 1909. Benjamin regarded his two years' employment in the store as beneficial, as it not only enabled him to save £200 but also helped him to develop insight into dealing with people. It also gave him plenty of time to play the piano and explore music when there was a lull in customers. The music included ragtime, which was the new craze, as well as a score of Debussy's *Jardins sous la pluie* that had arrived "among the 'new' things out from England".95

---

93 Arthur Benjamin. Radio script for 'ABC Guest of Honour'. Broadcast on October 15, 1950 on 2FC (National Archive of Australia, series no. SP369/1).
Benjamin’s earliest surviving manuscript from this period was a set of *Four Pieces for Piano* dated November 1910.96 Although the overall title of the work is in English, the movements were given French titles—*Berceuse, Miniature, À la Romance* and *Moment Dansant*. The titles reveal the influence of France, a factor that, judging from the following reminiscence, began prior to his contact with Sampson.

[From the age of 6 I was in constant demand at concerts. I once sang for instance, sitting on a swing surrounded by Brisbane’s most glamorous little girls, all of us dressed in Watteau style, the ‘Swing’ song from ‘A Child’s Garland’—the poems by Robert Louis Stevenson, the music by Liza Lehmann.97

French art and history of the 16th to 18th centuries, continued to fascinate Benjamin. As a youth, Benjamin had a “good knowledge of French” and used French phrases and expressions in his letters to Herbert Howells as both a student at the RCM and during the First World War:98

Dear lil’Erb,

What do you think of me? I managed to get five days extension of leave & ‘herewith please find one surprise’—as we would put it in the Army.

I composed it for organ long ago & suddenly bethought me of orchestrating it. Musically, it is not startling, I know; but I think it has charm & it is certainly ‘champêtre’ & Watteauesque.99

The Savile Club, which Benjamin joined in 1935, boasts an exquisite décor and the dining room exhibits a distinctly French influence with Watteau-like paintings framed by a cartouche that would have

---

96 The manuscript is lodged with the British Library (MS MUS 263).
98 As recorded on Benjamin’s war record (National Archives, Kew, WO 339/41134).
prevailed in Benjamin’s time. Benjamin’s later choice of subject matter for films, his operas, his own dining room décor, his love of French music—particularly Ravel’s, and his honorary title of Chevalier Gastronomique, awarded for an original cold soup recipe consisting of cucumber, crème fraîche and chives, all reflect French tastes.

By 1911, the limitations of Brisbane’s cultural life gave way to a kaleidoscope of new challenges and the stimulus offered by London’s musical life. Abraham, on hearing his son had managed to procure a job as steward on a ship bound for England, finally relented and paid the passage for both Benjamin and his mother. Once in London, Benjamin received tuition at the RCM. Thomas Dunhill tutored him in harmony and counterpoint, and in his capacity as editor for a publisher, gave his student his first commission—two children’s piano pieces, for the price of two guineas.

The Royal College of Music was founded in 1833 as a successor to the National Training School for Music. George Grove was its first director followed by Sir Hubert Parry and students either gained admission through the award of a scholarship through a competitive selection process or were required to pay fees. In 1912, at the age of eighteen, Benjamin won a Foundation scholarship at the RCM in the principal studies of composition and piano. This marked a real

100 As told to the author on a personal tour of the Club given by one of its members Donald Franke. A more detailed discussion of matters relating specifically to Watteau can be read on page 50.
101 Letter from Serge Depouilly to the author, June 7, 2005.
103 Arthur Benjamin. ‘A Student in Kensington’, Music & Letters, Vol. XXXI, No. 3 (July 1950): 196–7. These appeared in two Ascherberg, Hopwood & Crew Ltd. publications in 1913 as supplementary compositions to the Ascherberg Pianoforte School and were given the titles Romance Impromptu (No. 12c, Series II, Elementary Division) and Novelette (No. 14b, Series II, Elementary Division).
105 Scholars Register No. 2, 1893–1913 (RCM Archive).
watershed in his musical training and where, in his own words, “the work really began”.106

At the RCM, Benjamin enjoyed the company of fellow students such as Eugene, Leon and Adolphe Goossens, Ivor Gurney, Herbert Howells, Arthur Bliss, René Caprara, Ernest Hall and Aubrey Brain. He received training in the following subjects: composition with Sir Charles Villiers Stanford (1852–1924), piano with Frederic Cliffe, harmony and counterpoint with Thomas Dunhill, music analysis with Walford Davies and fugue with Sir Frederick Bridge. Benjamin’s financially comfortably position, owing to his personal savings of £200, the support of his family and the benefit of a scholarship, was illustrated in his autobiography when he wrote: “I was lodged in comfort in Bayswater” and in the following:

Life was good. By careful budgeting I was able for the next three years to live comfortably, attend concerts, sit mutely admiring over a drink at the old Café Royal such illustrious frequenters as Augustus John and Epstein, back my fancy in the Derby or Grand National, and now and then entertain fellow-students from the Royal College of Music to sandwiches and drinks and music-making.107

During Benjamin’s student years in London he attended performances featuring famous artists such as the dancer Nijinsky and the singer Chaliapin,108 and recalled hearing Vaughan Williams’ Sea Symphony and seeing Diaghilev’s Ballets Russes perform Stravinsky’s The Firebird at Covent Garden.109 His excitement as he tried to absorb such events in his first year of residence in London is summed up with these words:

That 1911 summer I bought a season ticket for Henry Wood's Promenade concerts. Sixty concerts for sixty shillings! What introductions were there for a young Queenslander! Practically all the symphonies were new to me. My first Tchaikovsky, my first Franck! And then the concertos, many of which I had read but had never heard before. My first 'Flying Dutchman' overture sent shivers down my spine. Then there were arias, suites and numbers of charming lighter pieces—for in that happy time the Promenade programmes had not taken on the unmitigated earnestness of today. I do not suggest that I grasped everything in that wondrous spate of music. But still there lives with me the thrill of hearing 'L'Après-midi d'un faune' for the first time, and the Strauss tone-poems. And the Russians bowled me over.\textsuperscript{110}

Benjamin's progress as a composer and pianist involved hard work but he was in a fertile environment. He summed up his situation by saying:

Small wonder that, as a composer, I developed late! In Australia I had had no instruction; in England everyone at first took it for granted that I, like himself, had grown up in intimacy with such technicalities as sonata-form, fugue, invertible counterpoint, 16th-century polyphony and so on. While other students discussed such things I held my tongue. I had merely revelled in music—never thought about it. How could I ask for information? How could pride or conceit permit? And such things are hardly to be learnt from books. But to keep one's ears open at the R.C.M. in those days was instructive.\textsuperscript{111}

On his own admission, Benjamin had no trouble with counterpoint, orchestration or certain forms of variation but did have difficulty developing musical ideas. One particular counterpoint exercise given by Stanford was the composing of a Mass modelled on Palestrina's \textit{Missa Brevis} which Benjamin judged as "Correct and lifeless" when

\textsuperscript{111} Ibid.: 199. This quotation in some ways negates George Sampson's influence but it must be borne in mind that Benjamin's autobiography was, to a degree, a publicity venture designed to sell himself as a self-made man whose early musical education was intuitive and in exotic surroundings rather than the result of academic study.
he heard it sung.\textsuperscript{112} This practice of copying or imitating other composer's works was used again by Stanford to address Benjamin's difficulties in development. The instruction this time, was to compose a work that corresponded with the form, but not the style, of a Mozart sonata bar by bar.\textsuperscript{113} Benjamin admitted that these exercises, together with the detailed music analysis classes conducted by Walford Davies,\textsuperscript{114} strengthened his awareness of architecture in his own compositions.\textsuperscript{115}

Another influence readily absorbed by Benjamin was the music he was performing at the time. He recollected that "chunks" of César Franck's \textit{Piano Quintet} were absorbed into a Violin Sonata he was working on, and his ease with orchestration had resulted from his own study of scores at concerts and from participating in the College orchestra as percussionist.\textsuperscript{116} The College orchestra, which Stanford trained and conducted during these years, was of an exceptional standard and featured Eugene Goossens as lead violinist, Leon Goossens as first oboe, René Caprara as first clarinet, Ernest Hall as first trumpet, and Aubrey Brain amongst the horn section. Benjamin noted the orchestra being conducted on one occasion by Richard Strauss who "was moved to say that he had never before met with such excellence in an orchestra of students".\textsuperscript{117}

Stanford exerted considerable influence on his students and was not shy in voicing his likes and dislikes, musical and otherwise. But he was also a man of contradictions. For example, a student, who had "indulged in a spice of 'modern' harmony", was shown the door with the words: "Leave the room, me b'oy, and don't come back till ye can write something beautiful!", only to be greeted in the

\textsuperscript{112} Ibid.: 202.
\textsuperscript{113} Ibid.: 203.
\textsuperscript{114} Ibid.: 199.
\textsuperscript{115} Ibid.: 203.
\textsuperscript{116} Ibid.: 203, 204.
\textsuperscript{117} Ibid.: 205. Benjamin's reference to Strauss's comment was based on other people's account of the event as, according to Jeremy Dibble's book, Strauss's visit to the RCM took place in 1903 (\textit{Stanford: Man and Musician}. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002: 346).
corridor a few days later with “And how is the masterpiece going?”

Benjamin, with his natural love of all things French, remembered Stanford regarding Debussy and Ravel as composers of “eunuch music.”

Brahms’s music was favoured by Stanford and compositions by Berlioz and Richard Strauss featured regularly in programmes performed by the College orchestra, even though Stanford was critical of the latter.

Benjamin’s fellow composition students, Howells and Gurney introduced him to “the sacred groves of English poetry”. Whether it be poetry or a libretto, text was especially important to Benjamin in his early compositions as it presumably helped to shape and stimulate his musical responses. An early orchestral song titled Captain Stratton’s Fancy was performed at the RCM on November 13, 1914, sung by Samuel Mann and conducted by Stanford. The music does not survive but the words are by the English poet John Masefield which, interestingly enough, conjure up images of a Brisbane seaport rather than the England of the Elizabethan revivalist trend familiar to Howells and Gurney and many other English composers at this time.

Oh some are fond of red wine, and some are fond of white,

And some are all for dancing by the pale moonlight;

119 Ibid.: 201.
122 Concert programme [RCM Library].
But rum alone's the tipple and the heart's delight
Of the old bold mate of Henry Morgan.

Oh some are for the lily, and some are for the rose,
But I am for the sugar-cane that in Jamaica grows;
For it's that that makes the bonny drink to warm my copper nose,
Says the old bold mate of Henry Morgan. ¹²³

Benjamin never completed his three year scholarship at the
RCM. War was declared in 1914 and his hurry to enlist was explained
later in life: "many of us volunteered immediately, in case the war
should be over by Christmas! Weren't we little optimists?" ¹²⁴ His
musical education up until this point had helped to shape a young
musician showing considerable natural talent whose progress was
delayed because of the lack of professional training in Australia. The
three years at the RCM and the riches of London's musical life were
fruitful years but not long enough for him to learn the necessary
skills to give him the confidence to launch a successful composing
career. For composition was where Benjamin's heart really lay and he
was able to sum up such a career many years later in an ABC
interview: "I can say that my progress to success was not sensational
—no ballyhoo—but it has been gradual and continuous." ¹²⁵

2.3 Benjamin's musical development during the war
years 1914–8

For this period of Benjamin's career, documentation is more
abundant and diverse than in his early years, allowing for a more
detailed assessment of an evolving musical life. Material considered
in this assessment includes his earliest manuscripts, which survive
from the war years onwards, scores which were taken up by various
publishers, printed articles by critics and journalists, and personal

¹²³ Ibid.
¹²⁴ Arthur Benjamin. 'ABC Guest of Honour' (radio script) transmitted on October 15, 1950
on 2FC (National Archive of Australia, series no. SP369/1).
¹²⁵ Ibid.
correspondence through letters. Other important influences such as the effects of World War One, political and social movements of the twenties, musical trends in England and France, Benjamin's childhood love of the stage and theatre, and his performing career, complete the picture necessary to fully understand developments in his composition.

As a robust and gallant-minded young man, there was a side of Benjamin that identified with chivalry and heroism for which World War One seemed to offer the perfect platform for expression. In 1915, in the last of five orchestral musical portraits of his fellow RCM students titled The B's, Howells musically summed up Benjamin's character in the form of a march. According to Guy Warrack's study on the RCM, the director Hubert Parry had "applauded the spirit of Collegians" who had enlisted and he was quoted as having said they were "honourably inspired to go and chance the risks of military life". Millicent, sensing her son's impetuousness, wrote to Parry from Brisbane in the hope of his being able to persuade Benjamin not to enlist, but Parry, in recalling the exchange, had written in his diary: "the letter came too late. His [Benjamin's] impulse to join the war was too strong."

The Scholars Register at the RCM recorded Benjamin's enlisting date as February 3, 1915 but his war records in the National Archives registered him in the Court Officers Training Corps from January 29 to April 28. During his months of training, Benjamin continued some involvement in the musical life of the College. On February 16, 1915, he performed César Franck's *Symphonic Variations* with Parry conducting the College orchestra. Parry noted that Benjamin "played them superbly" dressed in his

---

126 Students' names with their corresponding movements and titles were: Herbert Howells - Overture 'Bublum', Gurney - Lament 'Bartholomew', Bliss - Scherzo 'Blissy', Warren - Mazurka 'Bunny' and Benjamin - March 'Benjee'.
128 Hubert Parry's diary entry for February 4, 1915 (Shulbrede Priory, Sussex).
khaki uniform and he was also awarded the Dannreuther Prize of £9 in the Easter of that year.\textsuperscript{130} Benjamin’s compositional output during 1915 was not prolific but he did manage to complete the first movement of an orchestral work called \textit{Three Dance-Scherzos} on November 14 which he dedicated to his parents.\textsuperscript{131} Parry’s diary recorded the work’s première at the College on December 13 as well as one of the first references to Benjamin as a conductor of his own work, again dressed in khaki. Parry described the music as “very genial”,\textsuperscript{132} a comment that was further expounded upon by a critic for \textit{The Times} who wrote:

The music and the uniform reminded one of a now departed recruiting poster which bore the legend ‘He’s happy and satisfied, are you?’ It is a thoroughly genial piece with no cares [or] problems, full of bright orchestration, in which the xylophone and the piano pick out the high lights.\textsuperscript{133}

This luxury of being able to compose and perform while ‘at war’ changed when Benjamin received a temporary commission as second lieutenant to the 32\textsuperscript{nd} Battalion of the Royal Fusiliers on May 4, 1916.\textsuperscript{134} His Battalion arrived in Le Havre for duties the very next day and by May 28,\textsuperscript{135} Benjamin’s war record noted some kind of casualty from which he was “returned to duty and taken on strength” some two months later.\textsuperscript{136} No detail was given of his injury but this period of time seems to have been spent constructively with the completion on July 4 of the third of his \textit{Three Dance-Scherzos} which he dedicated “To F. G. L & H. N. H in remembrance of the Russian seasons at

\textsuperscript{130} Reference to Benjamin’s RCM concert can be read in Hubert Parry’s diary entry for February 16, 1915 (Shulbrede Priory, Sussex). The Dannreuther Prize was recorded in the Scholars register No. 2, 1893–1913 (RCM Library).

\textsuperscript{131} The manuscript is lodged with the British Library (MS Mus. 260).

\textsuperscript{132} Hubert Parry’s diary entry for December 13, 1915 (Shulbrede Priory, Sussex).

\textsuperscript{133} Unacknowledged author. ‘A Composer in Khaki’, \textit{The Times}, December 14, 1915.

\textsuperscript{134} Arthur Benjamin War record (National Archives, Kew, WO 339/41134).

\textsuperscript{135} As recorded in the War diary of the 32\textsuperscript{nd} Battalion Royal Fusiliers (National Archives, Kew, WO 95/2644) and Arthur Benjamin War record (National Archives, Kew, WO 339/41134).

\textsuperscript{136} War diary of the 32\textsuperscript{nd} Battalion Royal Fusiliers entered July 27, 1916 (National Archives, Kew, WO 95/2644).
Drury Lane, and of happy evenings spent there. Flanders 1916". Although he obviously found enough energy to compose during this time, his duties as a soldier were not completely suspended. "In the field" was written on the final page of the manuscript and a letter to Howells commented on his struggle with composition a few days later.

I can’t write much or intelligibly. I would say much on what I have written but my brain is muzzy today. I was out until 3 o’c. this morning working. Very eerie.

For the next few months, the 32nd Battalion of Royal Fusiliers continued to endure frontline trench warfare subject to gas attacks and hostile aircraft and artillery fire. In one day alone the dead, wounded and missing could number as high as 588. Parry wrote in his diary about the effect of war conditions on Benjamin who had just visited him on leave: “after being in the hottest of the fighting. He was quiet and natural. Said after a big and terrible advance he could not remember what he had been doing.” Concentration on composition was understandably difficult and may account for Parry’s comment on what must have been a ‘play through’ of Benjamin’s third Scherzo whilst he was in London on leave: “the orchestra played Benjamin’s new movement, written at the front. Very extraordinary feat. But wanting a lot of revision”. It is not possible to prove whether Benjamin found time to revise the movement before its première by the College orchestra on December 12 that same year, but a critic for The Times made the following observations which hinted at possible difficulties in the development of musical material:

137 The manuscript is lodged at the British Library (MS Mus. 260).
139 War diary of the 32nd Battalion Royal Fusiliers (National Archives, Kew, WO 95/2644). For report on casualties refer to entry on September 18, 1916.
140 Herbert Parry’s diary entry for October 30, 1916 (Shulbrede Priory, Sussex).
141 Ibid. Diary entry for October 31, 1916.
There is such an echo in the hall that it is impossible to speak with any confidence of what one hears there; the inner parts are completely lost at mezzoforte and nothing is distinct at forte. In the lucid intervals of this welter it could be noticed that Mr. Benjamin's Scherzo has a firmly knit Gregorian-like theme, which comes when it is wanted and does not stay too long, and that it is supported by the right sort of orchestral manoeuvres. But just when one is wondering what is going to be done with it, a sort of carillon on the horn leads in a coda which sweeps everything away with a few impatient gestures 142

Benjamin's special leave to Paris in January 1917 coincided with a second scherzo for orchestra dedicated on the manuscript “To Jeanne, England—on furlough 1917” which was performed by the Bournemouth Municipal Orchestra that same month conducted by Dan Godfrey.143 The music for this Scherzo shows three distinct sections; the first introduces a theme which undergoes variation; the second is a brief developmental section where counterpoint and countermelodies intensify; the third simplifies the texture and the opening melody is reinstated.

The remaining time spent by Benjamin in the service of the 32nd Battalion was not conducive to composition. Short musical scribblings incorporated within a letter and an orchestrated organ

142 'A Scherzo from the Trenches', The Times, December 12, 1916.
Benjamin was homosexual for most of his adult life but this is the first reference to Jeanne Casus for whom he expressed a special fondness in letters to Herbert Howells who also corresponded with her. (Jeanne's name features in Benjamin's letters to Howells on December 11, 1917 (RCM Library, Herbert Howells papers) and in Benjamin's letter to Howells on April 15, 1918 he thanked him and Dorothy for writing to Jeanne who acknowledged having received their letters (RCM Library, Herbert Howells papers). Benjamin last referred to Jeanne in a letter to Howells dated June 1, 1918 telling him she was now in the Sanatorium de Belligueux par Hauteville where she hoped to get better soon (Letter from Benjamin to Howells June 1, 1918 (RCM Library, Herbert Howells papers). Howells's daughter Ursula, in an interview with the author on July 1, 2002, clearly remembered her father saying Benjamin (who was her godfather) “during the First World War...was madly in love with a girl who died of TB.” Ursula was able to confirm that her father had met the girl whom he regarded as “very beautiful” (Ursula Howells in interview with the author on July 1, 2002).
piece (composed “long ago”), were penned to Howells who appeared to have been Benjamin’s chief confident in musical matters at this time. Indeed, Benjamin expressed his lack of confidence regarding his musical education at one point by writing: “If ever I do get back to the old coll. there will be such a big gap.”

By November 4, 1917 Benjamin had transferred to the Royal Flying Corps. Earlier in April, while he was still serving with the 32nd Battalion, a Captain Theare had landed his plane in their camp owing to engine failure and had flown away the next morning, an incident that would have fuelled Benjamin’s fascination for flying. The relative comfort of his new life in the Royal Flying Corps did not produce much creativity in the field of music. Benjamin appeared to have been totally absorbed in the whole experience of flying, and this proved to be a source of inspiration from which he would draw from at a later date for more than one composition. His next letter to Howells is interesting, as it gives an insight into conditions for Benjamin as a gunner-observer in a two-man bomber with the 99th Squadron, alongside his ideas for an opera.

Well, I am enchanted with my new life. And when one thinks of the infantry this is Heaven. (of course it is!) Nothing is more exhilarating than a scrap in the air & if only the Hun had more guts [quel langage mon cher!] we should bring more down. Moral:- breed your children without intestines. I have started composing a ‘Cyrano’ overture. Perhaps it will be a miniature tone-poem. I shall use themes which, if ever I write the opera, I shall make use of them. In the overture there will be (1) the themes suggestive (& not illustrative) of Cyrano the braggart, the incorrigible lover of jokes & the perfect poet lover; (2) the theme, or motif for his nose, (3) the theme for Christian & (4) the theme for ‘les Precieuses.’ Part of the work will represent the exquisite scene in the 2nd act where Roxanne tells Cyrano that she loves

---

144 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Herbert Howells September 10, 1917 (RCM Library, Herbert Howells papers).
146 National Archives, Kew, War record WO 339/41134.
147 War diary of the 32nd Battalion Royal Fusiliers (National Archives, Kew, WO 95/2644). For report on Captain Theare refer to entry on April 22, 1917.
148 It appears no serious progress was made on the composition and no sketches survive.
a man who does not seem to know it & at length when she says he is 'beau'
he realises that he is not the man of whom she is talking. Then I will make
the 'working out' section illustrative of the Moon journey.149

As discussed in chapter four's study of the film music for *Under the Red Robe* (Dir. Victor Sjöström. New World Pictures. 1937),
Benjamin's fascination for Rostand's *Cyrano de Bergerac* was long-
lived, but neither a score nor any sketches survive if, indeed, they
ever materialized.

Benjamin's squadron history reported that on July 31, 1918,
he and his pilot Papenfus, crossed enemy lines as part of a bombing
mission and were attacked by forty hostile planes.150 A massacre
ensued and seven out of the nine participating bombers were shot
down with Benjamin and Papenfus taken prisoner.151 Benjamin's
incarceration as a prisoner of war in Karlsruhe gave him time to
compose a three movement violin sonata during the months of
August and September. A later review in *The Christian Science
Monitor* showed the extent to which Benjamin's war experiences
inspired the music.152

[Many of the themes had already come to him when flying. This gives a very
distinctive character to the work. Other composers have already expressed
the sea, forests, and the countryside in music. Arthur Benjamin is the first

149 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Herbert Howells June 1, 1918 (RCM Library, Herbert
Howells papers).
150 Diary entry for July 31, 1918 in History of No. 99 Squadron RAF (National Archives, Kew,
AIR 1/694/21/20/99).
151 The violist William Primrose, recorded a story connected with Benjamin's capture in his
memoirs saying:

"The Germans followed them to earth, got out of their plane, and came forward, as they did in those days, to
shake hands with their prisoners. The leader of the German squadron was, of course, at that time Goering—
Hermann Goering. I complained to Arthur, 'Why didn't you shoot the bastard right then? You would have
saved the world an awful lot of trouble!'"

University Press, 1978: 170-1.)
152 Benjamin writes the word 'Karlsruhe' on the final page of each movement on the
manuscript of the Sonata in E minor for violin and piano (British Library, MS Mus 263).
Herbert Howells also refers to the Sonata in E minor saying "The work was composed in
Cologne (part in Karlsruhe) in the last days of the War" [Christopher Palmer. *Herbert
who has written from personal experience of the glories of the upper air —
the rush of the wind, the great spaces, the exultation of flight.\footnote{153}

Flying was not the only factor influencing this work, one can still hear the presence of Brahms and under the title of the middle \textit{Intermezzo} movement, Benjamin has inked the words "On a Negro folk-hymn". This is the first of his surviving work to use an African-American folk-hymn, a source that was popular in Benjamin's compositions in the years to come. A piano arrangement of the song \textit{Nelly Bly},\footnote{154} which was based on an African-American melody and played by Benjamin as a small child, may have been his earliest memory of such music. Minstrel acts were common in the vaudeville-style entertainment in which his uncle Harry Barrington, participated, and Benjamin's account of an impromptu concert "in the field" in France on December 6, 1916, mentioned an officer who performed "some ragtime".\footnote{155} Gunther Schuller, in his chapter \textit{Jazz and Musical Exoticism}, noted that "for most Frenchmen, the discovery of Ragtime, as brought to Europe by John Philip Sousa in three successive tours starting in 1900, was a culture shock".\footnote{156} He explained that some people regarded ragtime "as the product of the musically illiterate but innately musically gifted Negro 'Noble Savage'". This image of the 'noble savage' was reflected in Percy Grainger's review titled 'The Unique Value of Natalie Curtis' Notations of American Negro Folksongs (1917/18)' for the \textit{New York Times Book Review}, April 14, 1918, where he wrote: "How lucky she to have found such noble material".\footnote{157} Although Benjamin made no documented reference to his source for the African-American folk-hymns, one can assume they were easily accessible if only in the form

\footnote{153} Marion M. Scott. 'British Violin Sonatas', \textit{The Christian Science Monitor} (Boston), February 7, 1920: 34.
\footnote{154} Alex Mitchell. 'Pacific Overtures', \textit{The Sun-Herald}, August 29, 1993.
of publications such as the one just described by Grainger. Groups such as The Fisk Jubilee Singers were also publishing arrangements of better-known spirituals in America as early as 1875.\(^{158}\) The subject of Benjamin's use of African-American spirituals returns in this chapter as well as his broadening interest in folk music from a variety of sources, including Jamaica and Canada.

Later in March 1919, Howells' diary noted Benjamin's own doubts about the value of the Violin Sonata. Howells responded by encouraging Benjamin to "take into account his exile from music and Beauty during the War".\(^ {159}\) All throughout the rest of Benjamin's life, his feelings about the war were mixed and his autobiography appeared to cease at this point in his life story.\(^ {160}\) Many years later, on his arrival in Canada, where he spent the duration of World War Two, he is reported to have said to a journalist: "I have had enough war for one man's lifetime"..."Not good for a pianist's hands but (I found) not bad for the character."\(^ {161}\)

### 2.4 Post war years, the 1920s and early 1930s

By the end of 1918, Benjamin was once again on British soil. Confidence in his composing during the war and immediately afterwards, was low and he recalled, even though his memory about the Violin Sonata wasn't completely accurate,\(^ {162}\) that "When I was in prison I wrote a violin sonata which, like most of my early works, has been torn out. In fact I tore up everything I'd written before the war, in case I was killed, and I didn't want [it] to be left behind."\(^ {163}\)

---


\(^ {160}\) This observation was also commented on in Alex Mitchell's article 'Pacific Overtures', *The Sun-Herald*, August 29, 1993.

\(^ {161}\) The two references about war can be read in the article 'Composer Sees Vancouver as Music Centre', *Vancouver Sun*, August 11, 1939 and in a letter from Arthur Benjamin to Reed College October 12, 1944 (Reed College Archives). Benjamin makes the latter comment after having heard his piano student Lamar Crowson, had joined the army.

\(^ {162}\) The manuscript of the Violin Sonata is lodged with the British Library (MS Mus 263).

\(^ {163}\) Arthur Benjamin. 'The Composer Speaks' (radio script) transmitted June 23, 1957 on unidentified BBC programme (BBC Written Archives).
With his war service completed, Benjamin was faced with the challenge of establishing a musical career founded on knowledge and experience gathered from his early years in Australia, and from his unfinished studies at the RCM. His musical activity in London immediately after the war was limited but the highlights included the first song publication of *Man and Woman* for Elkin & Co. Ltd. in 1918 and the première of his Violin Sonata at the RCM on March 20, 1919. The song setting uses a modern translation of Peter Anthony Motteaux’s text (1660–1718) and the music is short and concise, rhythmically vigorous and influenced by Elizabethan dance music. Benjamin was one of many British composers rediscovering England’s musical heritage at this time. Scott Goddard in his article ‘The roots and the soil: nineteenth century origins’ explained the creative process whereby scholars “were busy handing on” resources of English folk and Tudor music, to “creative musicians of the day”, of whom Ralph Vaughan Williams was such a strong example.164

In 1919, Benjamin made the decision to leave England and return to Australia. His reasons for doing so are not completely clear but he admitted in his later years that there was some attempt at reconciliation with his father whom he hadn’t seen for many years.165 Another factor may have been his monetary concerns considering that he was still a student musician with his training interrupted by four years of war.

Once back in Australia, the direct influence of Elizabethan music waned and Benjamin looked once more to alternative folk song material of African-American origin. Antonin Dvořák, while resident in America in 1892, had encouraged musicians to take an interest in the music of native Americans and African-Americans. Dvořák’s ideas proved to be catalytic and Gunther Schuller in his chapter ‘Jazz and Musical Exoticism’ summarized the effect as “immediate results in

the first waves of ‘Indianist’ movements and new awareness of Negro musics—spirituals, embryonic forms of Blues and gospel music, secular (work, street, children’s) songs, and soon thereafter, Ragtime.” The concept of ‘modernism’, along with other new trends in social and political thinking, from fascism to hygiene in the post war years, caught the imagination of many artists seeking to distance themselves from the past which had become associated with the causes of the war. New music from the New World suited such a vision resulting in the musical embrace of African-American music from spirituals and ragtime to early jazz.

Benjamin’s *Negro Rhapsody*, completed in Brisbane on August 20, 1919, is a single movement orchestral work based on several African-American spirituals. The harmonies and rhythms in the settings of these melodies reflected traditional European influences and could not be described in any sense as jazz; each setting is short in duration and simple in structure and counterpoint with some attempt in the final section to interweave material from more than one spiritual. Some of the spirituals selected for this work were later repeated in *Five Negro Spirituals* referred to later in this chapter.

Brisbane’s musical life was not developed enough to hold a musician of Benjamin’s calibre for long. Some indication of the level of music making was given by Benjamin regarding a concert:

> When I was demobilised and returned to Brisbane in 1919, even as late as that, I played with the local orchestra the Choral Fantasia of Beethoven—not one of his best efforts. As well as playing the solo piano, I had, from time to time, to add in the bassoon part (on the piano, of course!) because Brisbane didn’t possess a bassoonist.

Sydney Conservatorium was thriving under the directorship of the Belgian violin virtuoso Henri Verbruggen (1873–1934), a man of

---

167 The manuscript is lodged with the British Library (MS MUS 260).
energy and vision who was keen to recruit a musician of Benjamin’s
talent.\textsuperscript{169} He twice conducted Benjamin’s \textit{A Negro Rhapsody} to whom
he was the dedicatee,\textsuperscript{170} with the New South Wales Conservatorium
Orchestra in 1920. Benjamin’s name appeared as solo pianist in the
Conservatorium concert programmes performing such works as
Moszkowski’s Piano Concerto in E major, op. 59.\textsuperscript{171} Verbruggen
initiated an imaginative series called the Director’s Lecture Concerts
in which Benjamin participated as soloist and as chamber music
musician with fellow professors Cyril Monk (violin) and Gladstone
Bell (cello). Together they performed such works as John Ireland’s
Piano Trio No. 1 and Benjamin’s own composition \textit{Rhapsody for
Violin, Cello and Piano}.\textsuperscript{172}

Benjamin was registered as a piano professor in the
Conservatorium prospectus for the year 1921 but it is clear from a
letter published in the RCM Magazine that his involvement as a
teacher had commenced the previous year:

\begin{quote}
I am a Professor...at the State Conservatorium, Sydney....The S.C., for an
institution only five years old, is a veritable marvel...I rather miss the type of
student who seems to go through life peering for the words ‘vox celeste,’ for
we have no organ; but we can see a fiddle student sliding his left hand with
incredible rapidity up and down the finger board and then gazing ‘avec
emprèssement’ at his victim (probably a younger student technically less
developed). Also our tenors try their voices in the corridors...In short, as I
said, we have an atmosphere, an excellent orchestra and—a wonderful
director. Mr Verbruggen is a great artist and a great organist and business
man. He has his hand on the pulse of the whole administration. He has
attracted a musically educated audience. He leads a splendid quartet. He is
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{169} John Mansfield Thomson. \textit{A Distant Music: The Life and Times of Alfred Hill 1870–1960.}
\textsuperscript{170} These concerts took place on July 31 and September 25, 1920 (Sydney Conservatorium
Archives, Concert scrapbook).
\textsuperscript{171} Benjamin performed the Moszkowski Piano Concert with the NSW State Conservatorium
of Music orchestra conducted by Verbruggen in Sydney Town Hall on August 27, 1921
(Sydney Conservatorium Archives, Concert scrapbook).
\textsuperscript{172} Cyril Monk was a key figure in violin pedagogy and the dedicatee of the violin and piano
work \textit{Humoresque} published in 1926. The \textit{Rhapsody for Violin, Cello and Piano} was
performed at the Conservatorium on July 22, 1921 but the score does not survive. This was
part of the Director’s Eleventh Lecture Concert in conjunction with the British Music Society
(Sydney Conservatorium Archives, Concert scrapbook).
loved by his professors and pupils...As for myself, I have made a great success in recitals and concerts. I won't bother to send you critiques. Musical criticism is in a peculiar condition out here. It is everywhere, but more so out here.173

According to John Docker's book *The Nervous Nineties*, Sydney had benefited from continuous expansion of urban communications networks, and the existence of the *Bulletin* which could support, and therefore attract, artists in the visual and literary disciplines.174 The artist Norman Lindsay (1879–1969) and writer Hugh McCrae (1876–1958) were active figures in this emerging intelligentsia and Benjamin's involvement with both men was illustrated in this letter written in 1951.

I have two songs published to poems of his [McCrae]—The Mouse' and 'The Moon'. These were pretty youthful but I still think 'The Moon' one of my best songs. Yes, indeed, I did know the Lindsays, and spent an amusing weekend at Norman's...So long ago! It seems like another life.175

Hugh McCrae, in a letter to Lindsay, referred to a private performance organised by Benjamin at Lindsay's Springwood home which may account for the "amusing weekend".176 In the same paragraph he mentioned the attractions of Lindsay's wife Rose: "Like everybody else, he [Benjamin] is in raptures about Rose". Despite considerable encouragement from Lindsay for an artistic collaboration between Benjamin and McCrae, the two songs *The Mouse* and *The Moon* were the only works completed. Plans for a larger project, a light opera

---

called *The Ship of Heaven* were abandoned by Benjamin soon after his return to England.\textsuperscript{177}

Benjamin’s composition in his first year in Sydney included two songs *The Wasp* and *Calm Sea and Mist*, both using texts by William Sharp. The settings are short and to the point with the piano accompaniments full of sound painting responding directly to the nature images in the texts. For example, the buzzing sound of *The Wasp* is captured by a trilling piano, and the words “darting suddenly from high” elicit a downward flourish. The sound world of *Calm Sea and Mist* saw a return to Benjamin’s French connections and is indebted to Debussy. A one-bar ostinato in the piano accompaniment portrays the words of the opening line: “The slow heave of the sleeping sea With pulse-like motion swells and falls”. A change of Example 2.1 Arthur Benjamin, *Calm Sea and Mist*, bars 2–3.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{example2_1.png}
\caption{Example 2.1 Arthur Benjamin, *Calm Sea and Mist*, bars 2–3.}
\end{figure}

texture responds to the image of “a stray gull” or “grey mist” before the all-pervading ostinato resumes. In contrast to the songs, Benjamin is reported to have composed a miniature symphony inspired by the sounds at a nearby Savings Bank to celebrate the close of the second year of the Conservatorium’s student union but no manuscript of this work survives.\textsuperscript{178}

\textsuperscript{177} McCrae and Benjamin’s plans to collaborate on this opera was reported in *The Home*, June 1922: 8. The opera was set to music by Alfred Hill (1869–1960) and performed by the Independent Theatre Company at the Savoy Theatre, Sydney on October 7, 1933. Harry F. Chaplin. *A McCrae Miscellany*. Georgina Huntly McCrae, George Gordon McCrae and Hugh Raymond McCrae: their Books, Manuscripts, Letters and Drawings in the Library of Harry F. Chaplin. Sydney: Wentworth Press, 1967: 67.

The middle section of a short work for violin and piano titled *Carnavalesque*,\(^{179}\) composed in Sydney in 1921, experimented with jazz resulting in a gutsy and jaunty interlocking of rhythms.

**Example 2.2 Arthur Benjamin, Carnavalesque, bars 80–7.**


*Humoresque*—another violin and piano work most likely composed around the same time,\(^{180}\) blended the physical robustness and folk music world of Stravinsky’s *Petrushka* with the sentiments captured in Watteau’s paintings of the *Fête Galante*. The figures in these paintings, inhabited an idealized world of beautiful gardens, music, dance and lovers, and is explained in more detail by Paul Roberts in his book *Images: The Piano Music of Claude Debussy*.

Often Watteau presents his characters at a masquerade, a kind of high-class fancy-dress party that was popular in eighteenth-century leisureed society. Revelers would dress in the costumes and masks of the old Italian comedy, the *commedia dell’arte*—the world of the comic Harlequin and Pierrot and the amorous Colombine and Leander—in which buffoonery and love, joy and pathos, went hand in hand.\(^ {181}\)

Benjamin’s stay in Australia was short lived and his decision to return to England in 1922 was most likely influenced by two incidents. In November 1921, Abraham Benjamin died of a cerebral haemorrhage and Verbrugghen resigned as Director at the Sydney Conservatorium.\(^ {182}\) Diane Collins’ book *Sounds from the Stables*

---

\(^{179}\) *Carnavalesque* was published by Stainer & Bell Ltd. in 1925 but the words “Sydney 1921” appear on the final page.

\(^{180}\) *Humoresque* was published by Stainer & Bell Ltd. in 1925.


\(^{182}\) Abraham Benjamin’s death certificate.
neatly summed up the level of art and culture in Australia at this time.

Anguish surrounded Verbrugghen’s resignation... But what stands out in the overflow of emotion surrounding Verbrugghen’s departure from the Conservatorium is less a sense of personal loss than a kind of social grief—a recognition that this was a defining moment in Australian culture. Australia in the 1920s was too materialistic, too under-educated, too thinly populated, too new to support a high culture of depth, quality or vigour. It was not that it was too bourgeois; it was not bourgeois enough.183

Between the years 1923–5 Benjamin took up residence at Top o' the rise in Beare Green, Surrey where he concentrated his energies on composition and piano.184 His comments in an ABC radio interview revealed how mindful he still was at this stage of his career of the shortfalls in his musical training.

Four years of war made a terrible hiatus in my musical life, especially as I had had so little good tuition, and it took me years to get to that pitch where I felt fitted to launch myself before the great public.185

Benjamin’s compositional output during his residence at Beare Green focused on song and chamber music. The publisher Elkins & Co. Ltd. was quick to print a succession of songs—The Moon, The Piper, Hey Nonny Non!, The Mouse, Before Dawn, Diaphenia and To Phillis, Milking her Flock. Stylistically, Benjamin’s song setting of Hugh McCrae’s poem The Mouse continued in the same Debussian sound world as the Sydney composition Calm Sea and Mist. Hey Nonno Non! returned to English folk song and Tudor influences, and used a text from a 16th century Christchurch manuscript, as did To

185 Arthur Benjamin. ‘ABC Guest of Honour’ (radio script) transmitted on October 15, 1950 on 2FC (National Archive of Australia, series no. SP369/1).
Phillis, Milking her Flock with words by William Drummond (1585–1649).

A string quartet Pastoral Fantasy, completed in 1923, received a Carnegie award the following year and was subsequently published by Stainer & Bell Ltd. Composed around the same time as Arabesque for violin and piano, both works have a strong pastoral sense which may be linked to the surroundings of Beare Green. Nancy Arlen, Benjamin's second cousin, who as a girl lived in the adjacent property, described the countryside around them as “a revelation of all I had imagined fairyland would be like. The hazelnut woods, the oak and chestnut trees, the blue-bells, primroses, cow-slips, wild roses and all the other flora and fauna the poets have eulogised about, all right there on our doorstep.” A music critic's description of the quartet after a Sydney performance resonated with similar sentiments by saying: “The magical beauty, the lazy charm of the English countryside in summer, have been transformed very delightfully in the composer's imagination into a web of magical music.”

For a composer who took every opportunity to paint nature into the sounds of his song accompaniments, it comes as little surprise that Benjamin continued to be attracted to pastoral subjects into which he incorporated dance music. In effect, he was creating his own Watteau-esque 'fête galante' set in the English countryside. Hans Keller, in a later appraisal of Benjamin's music, noted the prevalence of pastoral forms, styles and rhythms as well as the gavotte, musette and siciliana, in works as wide ranging as the Pastoral Fantasy, the close of his opera Prima Donna (1933), the Violin Concerto (1931) and the piano solo Pastorale, Arioso and Finale (1943). The film music

186 Arabesque (The Muted Pavane) was published by Stainer & Bell Ltd. in 1925. On the final page of the music the words "Beare Green 1924" appear.
is no exception, with the spring pastoral scene in *Turn of the Tide* (1935) employing a gentle 6/8 siciliana.

*Five Negro Spirituals* for cello and piano, was another chamber music work published in 1924. It returns to the same vein of inspiration as his earlier orchestral work composed in Brisbane, *A Negro Rhapsody*. The two works share the same spiritual *Gwine to Ride up in the Chariot* and both scores are a compilation of variations on a succession of spirituals. *Five Negro Spirituals* differs by separating the melodies into separate movements to form a suite and the nature of the settings is more sophisticated in their use of harmony and counterpoint.

Benjamin’s attraction to African-American music at some stage extended to the people of African descent, although it is difficult to determine exactly when. His visits to Jamaica as an examiner for the Associated Board began in the 1930s and Donald Friend’s diary entry for October 28, 1943 documented the fact that Benjamin had bought a rare oil painting of Ladipo, a Nigerian model and lover of Friend.¹⁹⁰ Friend kept a beautifully illustrated diary whose entry on April 12, 1953 referred to an evening spent entertaining a visiting singer. His account hinted at the extent of his and Benjamin’s interaction with people of African origins as well as the need to conceal such a fact:

Chloe was from the Deep South, and had the personality of a wet scone. After a few drinks we drove to some wonderful Club of Arthurs, where the food was superb. It was not until half way through dinner that I realised that Arthur, faced with the impossibility of getting any sensible conversation out of Chloe, was entertaining himself by teasing her very subtly. I didn’t think anyone else noticed, it was done so subtly and indirectly, by asking me, about my models, by talking about the delightful stay he had had in Jamaica, in fact in glancing off the subject of negroes all the time, without mentioning them directly, but at the same time letting it be understood that

all of us dined, wined, and lived and worked in a world in which negroes, in some fantastic way, were all dining, wining and living merrily with us.\textsuperscript{191}

Another chamber music work completed in 1924, while Benjamin was resident at Beare Green was the \textit{Violin Sonatina}.\textsuperscript{192} Benjamin's performance of this work on his last tour to Australia in 1950 was accompanied by his own programme notes which informally summed up the influences at play in each of the three movements.\textsuperscript{193} He explained that the work was called \textit{Sonatina} rather than \textit{Sonata} because "it is music of charm and gaiety rather than of philosophical import". In this respect, the 'lightness' of the music that Benjamin was referring to, was the grace, charm and wit that he inherited naturally from the French music of an earlier age. His programme notes described the first movement as being in sonata form with much irregular bar-rhythm; as in the 20's, young composers were determined to get away from the tyranny of the four-bar phrase! The middle movement \textit{Scherzo and Trio—Di Stile Antico} is a dainty 'jeu d'esprit.' In the old style? Well, it is in very quick three-four rhythm and in very strict form.

The programme notes described the \textit{Rondo} in the following way: "Everyone in the 20's tried their hand at jazzy rhythms, from Stravinsky and Ravel, to Walton and Lambert. So Benjamin had to have a go." Benjamin's now well established tendency to blend old musical influences with the new did not escape the attention of the \textit{Sydney Opinion} critic A. L. Kelly who reviewed a performance of the \textit{Violin Sonatina} in 1929.

This recital showed us that to Benjamin, to be modern simply means to be free—free to pour old wine into new bottles, and new wine (though not

\textsuperscript{191} Donald Friend diary entry for April 12, 1953 (National Library of Australia, MS 5959-36).
\textsuperscript{192} Published by OUP in 1924 then taken over by Boosey & Hawkes, 1957.
\textsuperscript{193} Arthur Benjamin's notes for ABC chamber music recital programme on September 18, 1950 (National Archives of Australia, SP 1011/2, Item 208).
heady) into old bottles, and entirely novel vintages into flasks of unusual, though shapely, contours.194

Another important influence on Benjamin’s composition during the 1920s was his career as a pianist. Like his composing, his piano technique appeared to have been mainly self-taught in his very early years and his studies with Frederic Cliffe as a student at the RCM resulted in Benjamin yet again drawing on his own resources.

My fare for a couple of terms consisted of Pisna exercises (in which I got no guidance; and my forearm muscles suffered unbelievable agonies), studies by Clementi, Czerny and Cramer, sonatas by Clementi and Dussek, the Variations from Mozart’s K. 331 (no other Mozart and no Haydn), Bach’s English Suites and an early Beethoven sonata. Anything requiring agility or endurance caused out-and-out pain; and, as Cliffe had given up hearing exercises or studies or scales or arpeggios, I conceived that only through suffering could perfection be attained. Not till years later did I find my own way to an easy technique.195

Benjamin’s première of Herbert Howells’s Piano Concerto in Queen’s Hall before Queen Alexandra and the Dowager Empress of Russia on July 10, 1914 and his performance of César Franck’s Symphonic Variations,196 indicated he had achieved a certain degree of fluency at the piano while still a student. On his return to England in the early 1920s, he “practised steadily for six hours a day perfecting his technique”.197 Then in May 1925, he launched his performing career with a daring move. He hired the New Queen’s Hall Orchestra and the conductor Sir Henry Wood, with whom he performed three concerti in

195 Arthur Benjamin. ‘A Student in Kensington’, *Music & Letters*, Vol. XXXI, No. 3 (July 1950): 198. Speaking from the author’s own experience as a pianist and teacher of piano, the tightness in Benjamin’s forearms is usually the result of a student who has not yet learnt to use the natural weight in his arms and body to depress the piano keys. The reasons for this may be complicated but usually involve fingers that are as yet too weak to take the weight and too much tension in the shoulder, wrist and elbow. A pushing action becomes a substitute that overworks the muscles of the forearm and will result in discomfort and even trigger a spasm.
one evening's programme—Mozart's No. 23 in A (K. 488), Beethoven's No. 4 in G and Rachmaninoff's No. 3. When he was asked by a BBC interviewer in 1957 the reason why he chose such a programme, he replied "purely economical reasons. I couldn't afford more than one concert." This comment raises again the question of Benjamin's finances at this time of his life. His focus on composition and piano practice would not have been lucrative studies but he was able either to rent or buy his own property in Beare Green, indicating he had most likely inherited some money from his father.

A promotional leaflet, produced soon after his Queen's Hall performance, quoted a number of reviews from which two have been selected. The first referred to the concerto performance just mentioned, and the second to a Wigmore Hall recital that same year. Both press comments hinted at a composer's mind at work behind the performances.

He is a pianist of the first rank, and, what does not always follow, a great concerto player. Rhythm, phrasing and touch all showed the acute musical sensibility of the creative mind. *Time and Tide*

His playing was always cool and imperturbable, always conditioned by a logical mind and a musicianly outlook and most important of all, gave the impression that he was discovering beauties in what he played. *The Daily Telegraph*

Benjamin's concert venture paid off, for not only did Benjamin make a seventy-five pound profit but concert engagements ensued. The time and energy needed to support a performing career was

---

198 Performing three concerti in the one evening was an unusual but not innovative event. For example, Eugène Ysaye's recital in the Queen's Hall on October 16, 1909 with the Queen's Hall Orchestra under Mr. Henry Wood featured concerti by Vivaldi, Emmanuel Moór and Brahms (Music: M. Ysaye's Concert', *The Times*, October 18, 1909), and Fritz Kreisler performed concerti by Vitali, Viotti and Beethoven in a programme at Queen's Hall with Mr. Landon Ronald and the Royal Albert Hall Orchestra on May 3, 1921 ('Kreisler's Return: Triumph at Queen's Hall', *The Times*, May 5, 1921).

199 Arthur Benjamin. 'The Composer Speaks' (radio script) transmitted June 23, 1957 on unidentified BBC programme (BBC Written Archives).

200 Promotion leaflet from the personal memorabilia of Reverend Clive Cohen, Cornwall.

201 Arthur Benjamin. 'The Composer Speaks' (radio script) transmitted June 23, 1957 on unidentified BBC programme (BBC Written Archives).
substantial, but it would have brought in increased revenue, valuable contacts and publicity beneficial to his composing career. Prior to his Queen’s Hall debut, Benjamin’s name was appearing on the programmes at performing venues such as the Wigmore Hall as the composer of Pastoral Fantasy and the Violin Sonatina.202 The première of Pastoral Fantasy on June 6, 1925 was part of a concert that was second in a series of three called the Moeran Chamber Concerts promoted by E. J. Moeran. Other works featured in this series were Arnold Bax’s Piano Quintet with Harriet Cohen as pianist, string quartets by R. O. Morris and Van Dieren, piano trios by Moeran and John Ireland, and Peter Warlock’s The Curlew.203 By 1926, Benjamin’s name was appearing as concert pianist. On February 2, in the first concert of a new chamber music series titled Concerts Spirituels, he premièred Arthur Bliss’s piano suite Masks. These concerts were held at the Faculty of Arts Gallery in Golden Square, London and were inspired by concerts given in Paris from 1725 up until the Revolution.204 He also partnered Harriet Cohen in a performance of Bach’s C major Concerto for two pianos for an all-Bach programme in Queen’s Hall conducted by Henry Wood on February 6.205 Work as piano professor at the RCM had commenced earlier in 1925,206 and other highlights of his performing schedule in the 1920s included further collaboration with Henry Wood as conductor in a performance of Grieg’s Piano Concerto in the 1926 season of Promenade Concerts,207 and the première of Gordon Jacob’s Piano Concerto at the Wigmore Hall on May 30, 1927.208 And in March 1929, an interview with Benjamin for The Australia

202 Violin Sonatina was performed at the Wigmore Hall on June 13, 1925 (RCM Archives, Concert programme).
204 ‘Concerts: Queen’s Hall’, The Times, February 1, 1926.
206 Annual report to the Corporation 1925 (RCM Library).
207 ‘Week-end Concerts’, The Times, October 18, 1926.
208 ‘Recitals of the Week’, The Times, June 3, 1927.
Handbook advertised his forthcoming Australian première of Rachmaninoff’s Piano Concerto No. 3.209

Benjamin’s focus on his piano performing career inevitably resulted in compositions for the piano, the first being Odds and Ends for the Pianoforte, Book 1 written in 1924 which, along with many of his early works, bore the place name “Beare Green”. These are short works, not simple enough for beginners to play but nor do they require virtuoso standards. Out of the three pieces that comprise this set, the outer two reveal the influence of Debussy and Ravel. The middle movement is a setting of the spiritual March On, the same tune that appears in the second of the Five Negro Spirituals for cello and piano. This set, together with Odds and Ends for the Pianoforte, Book 2, were published in 1925 by Stainer & Bell Ltd. The second set followed a similar layout to the first with three short pieces, simple in form and development, with an African-American spiritual used again for the middle movement.

It was only a matter of time before Benjamin wrote a work that utilised his dual skills as composer-pianist.210 Concertino for piano and orchestra was written at the request of the publisher Schott & Co. Ltd. in 1927.211 In early 1928, Benjamin gave the work’s world première in Düsseldorf and the British première at a Promenade Concert with Henry Wood conducting on September 1, 1928.212 Benjamin later recorded the work for the Everest label in the late 1950s with himself conducting the London Symphony Orchestra and

---

210 Benjamin confided to Mr Streeker in a letter dated March 27, 1928 that he hoped “most that the Concertino will help to make me known abroad as a pianist as well as a composer” (Schott Archive).
211 Paul Affelder. Programme notes on Everest recording of Quasi una Fantasia and Concertino (SDBR-3020).
212 Reference to the German première can be found in Paul Affelder. Programme notes on Everest recording of Quasi una Fantasia and Concertino (SDBR-3020). Benjamin’s memory of the première taking place in early 1928 may be not quite accurate as his comment in a letter to Mr Streeker on March 27, 1928 (Scott’s Archive) suggested the performance had yet to take place: “I had rather set my heart on a first performance in Germany, because our critics here are so biassed, and seem to run down anything youthful and English.” Arthur Jacobs claimed the London performance was the première but this would appear to be incorrect (Henry J. Wood: Maker of the Proms. London: Methuen, 1994: 444).
Lamar Crowson (1926–98) as soloist. Paul Affelder’s programme notes for the record sleeve stated the source of inspiration for the Concertino as being a Paul Whiteman performance of Gershwin’s Rhapsody in Blue, which evidently had a “profound” effect on Benjamin. An older programme note, this time written by Benjamin for the Henry Wood performance in 1928, revealed exactly what it was about jazz that he found both attractive and unattractive.

The Concertino...will be recognized as having something of jazz in its makeup. (I consider) that apart from the nauseating noises and the blatant rhythmic devices which are the unpleasant side of modern jazz music, there may be detected something more which may definitely become a valuable addition to our music—something more than mere syncopation: rather, (I think), a widening of the possibilities of combining rhythms and rhythmical counterpoint.

Like most composers, Benjamin was experimenting with, as the critic A. L. Kelly pointed out, the pouring of “old wine” into “new flasks”. The Concertino was the most ambitious work yet attempted by Benjamin, in terms of duration. Composed in one continuous movement, the Concertino brings together a sequence of changing tempi—Allegro non troppo e ritmico; Andante poco lento (con il sentimento ed il d’un “Blues”); Scherzo and Trio; Come primo ma poco meno allegro. One can hear a blend of jazz harmonies and rhythms, and modal melodies subjected to fugues, canons, imitation and complex counterpoint (this work is analysed in greater detail in chapters five and six). Reception of the work’s London première in
1928 appeared to have been mixed as is illustrated by the following two reviews:

The Concertino, recently played with such success at the Queen's Hall under the baton of Sir Henry Wood (the composer was recalled six times), is modern in form with an attempt to employ jazz idiom. It received a great reception from the public and it also aroused enthusiasm in Germany when it was played at Dusseldorf.\textsuperscript{217}

The critic for \textit{The Times} was less enthusiastic, saying: “Mr. Benjamin has combined some of the idioms of jazz with the idiom derived from English folk-music, and it cannot be said that the result is very successful.”\textsuperscript{218}

It would appear that Benjamin's own feelings about the Concertino were mixed as registered by his comment on the sleeve notes for the Everest recording.

'Fearing that my little work would become dated', recalls Benjamin, 'I asked Schott's to let it go out of print, although it had a good success on its first appearances. Was I too modest? I am beginning to wonder!'\textsuperscript{219}

His fears about the work in 1931, though, were considerable, with the following condemnation issued in a written letter to Adrian Boult whom he was seeking to interest in the newly completed Violin Concerto: “I can assure you that it is nothing like that silly Piano Concertino in which you and I collaborated”.\textsuperscript{220}

Benjamin's interest and experimentations in jazz were commonplace with British composers in the 1920s. William Walton (1902–83) completed his second version of \textit{Façade} (1923) for mixed ensemble and voice, and had composed an overture entitled

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{218} 'Promenade Concerts', \textit{The Times}, September 3, 1928.  
\textsuperscript{219} Paul Affelder. Sleeve notes on Everest LP recording of \textit{Quasi una Fantasia} and Concertino.  
\textsuperscript{220} Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Adrian Boult March 1, 1931 (Benjamin Estate). Benjamin is referring to his performance of the Concertino with Boult conducting the BBC Symphony Orchestra on December 6, 1930.
\end{flushleft}
Portsmouth Point (1925). Both works clearly showed the composer’s immersion in the jazz idiom between the years 1923–4 where his work had included the writing of fox-trots for the Savoy Orpheans Band.\textsuperscript{221} Another jazz influenced work that shared a similar use of cross rhythms in the piano textures as the Concertino, was Constant Lambert’s (1905–51) \textit{The Rio Grande} for piano, chorus and orchestra which was premiered by Lambert on February 27, 1927.\textsuperscript{222}

Benjamin continued to compose more piano solos with \textit{Suite for Piano} printed the same year as the Concertino,\textsuperscript{223} followed by the publication of \textit{Saxophone Blues} and \textit{Three Little Pieces} in 1929.\textsuperscript{224} Established influences such as blends of jazz, folk music elements, and French and English musical forms and rhythms from the 16\textsuperscript{th} to 18\textsuperscript{th} centuries remained. It has already been mentioned that Debussy’s music had an influence on some of Benjamin’s early songs, but the other French composer for whom Benjamin openly expressed admiration, and whose influence was deeper and more lasting, was Maurice Ravel.\textsuperscript{225} Similarities between the \textit{Suite for Piano} and Ravel’s \textit{Le Tombeau de Couperin}, composed in 1914–7, include the use of a triplet theme in both opening Prelude movements (examples 2.3 and 2.5); the rhythmic accompaniment of Benjamin’s \textit{Tambourin} parallels that of the middle section of Ravel’s \textit{Rigaudon} (examples 2.5 and 2.6) and certain passages in Benjamin’s \textit{Toccata} resonate with those in Ravel’s \textit{Toccata} (2.7 and 2.8).

Benjamin’s skill as a pianist penetrated the very nature of his composition. In an interview with Murray Schafer he explained the


\textsuperscript{222} Benjamin and Lambert’s relationship further extended to Benjamin’s premiere of Lambert’s Concerto for piano in the Aeolian Hall on December 18, 1931 with Lambert conducting. Benjamin scheduled \textit{The Rio Grande} in his programmes with the Canadian Broadcasting Radio Symphony Orchestra (CBRSO), to which reference will be made later in this chapter.

\textsuperscript{223} Published by OUP in 1927.

\textsuperscript{224} \textit{Saxophone Blues} was published by Schott & Co. Ltd. in 1929 and \textit{Three Little Pieces} was published by Oxford University Press in 1929.


Not too fast


Vif

Example 2.5 Arthur Benjamin, *Suite for Piano*, Tambourine, bars 1–6.

Quick and very rhythmic


Moins vif

following: “I get my ideas away from the piano, but I find that by going to the piano and improvising around them I can formulate them more successfully. There is nothing to be ashamed of in composing at the piano.”

One can therefore expect that much of the harmonic, melodic and rhythmic movement in Benjamin’s scores lies comfortably under the pianist’s hands in relation to the keyboard. He recalled being able, around the age of ten or eleven, to improvise at the piano for Thomas Dunhill, and this prodigious talent as a youth thus ensured a ready flow of notes, making it easy to compose and sustain works of short duration. However, it may also have masked the need for more careful and considered planning required by music of a greater architectural span.

Benjamin appeared to have undergone a period of serious reassessment of his compositions in the early 1930s, which resulted in an almost outright rejection of the Concertino (see page 60). Another earlier composition from his years in Australia seemed to have suffered a similar fate according to his letter to Victor Hely-Hutchinson at the BBC (probably written at about this time), where he commented: “Having taken some time to find my Negro Rhapsody I decided on looking through it that it had better stay in a well-merited

---

& honourable obscurity!" Around this time, Benjamin was working on a large-scale work, the Violin Concerto, which he mentioned as complete in a letter to Adrian Boult dated March 1, 1931. The purpose of the letter was to secure a first performance from Boult, who was Director of Music at the BBC. From an observer's point of view, it revealed a composer who was simultaneously hopeful of his prospects but still lacking confidence in his work.

I have written a Violin Concerto which according to a few musicians whom I have shown it, seems to be a work that matters—or so they say. I feel rather like a billiard player who aims at a modest cannon and pockets all three balls! At any rate no one is more surprised than the striker...I am writing to you 'ex officio' so that if the work is not worthy you can easily ignore it. Should you find it good it is naturally to you that I look to give it a good send off.

Benjamin's hoped-for public performance of the Violin Concerto would have to wait a few years but the score of his first one-act opera The Devil Take Her, fared better with Sir Thomas Beecham conducting the première at the RCM on December 1 that year. Paired as a double bill with Gustav Holst's Savitri, the performance was sponsored by the Ernest Palmer Opera Study Fund in the RCM, which was established in 1925, and whose guidelines stated that British opera was to be given preference.

According to a journalist's account in The Australian Handbook, Benjamin had completed the score in the summer of 1931 at "a quiet hotel in the mountains, with the Rhine flowing beneath its balconies" near Koblenz, Germany, where he was vacationing with his

---

228 The date of this letter is unclear as it only stated "Saturday 31" but there is another letter from Victor Hely-Hutchinson to Benjamin enquiring about the Negro Rhapsody on January 8, 1930 (BBC Written Archives, Composer: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1927–39).
231 Published by Boosey & Co. Ltd. in 1932.
mother. He had composed and orchestrated the work with relative ease "in six weeks, the first four of which he was carrying out his usual tuition duties at the Royal College of Music". As will be mentioned in chapter seven's study of Benjamin's operas, reception of the work as a light-hearted comic opera was mostly positive with criticism coming from those looking for greater structure and dramatic planning. The reviewer for *The Times* summed up the shortcomings of the opera by commenting:

The stage business seemed all a little over-elaborate as a means of establishing a point foreseen from the outset. Mr. Aveling insisted on our foreknowledge of the point by explaining it in a witty speech before the curtain rose. Moreover, when the woman had packed off all the minor characters and sent her husband (a willing victim) to the Devil, there was nothing left for her to do but make her bow, and let the orchestra achieve such ending as it could. However, Miss Fischer got over this difficulty with becoming grace, and when the curtain had closed in on her it was withdrawn again for a final scene in which Sir Thomas Beecham, patting the composer on the back, made good that sense of climax which the opera itself had lacked.

Another impression of the opera came from Benjamin Britten, who was studying piano with Benjamin at the RCM and had developed something of a friendship with his teacher. Britten was invited "for tea at [Benjamin's] house" where he was shown "more of [Benjamin's] very clever & amusing opera 'Devil Take Her'" and he in turn showed his teacher his own "songs & quartet". Britten's sister Beth, expressed the view that her brother enjoyed the relationship both professionally and personally with his teacher and stated Benjamin "was sympathetic" to her brother. As a measure of Benjamin's skill as a piano teacher, Peter Evans wrote the following

---


234 'Music this Week', *The Times*, November 30, 1931.


of Britten: “It was as a piano student of Arthur Benjamin that he seems to have gained most from the RCM”.\textsuperscript{237} Britten also attended the opera’s première about which he commented: “Brilliantly done. Marvellous little work—every note comes off—charming & witty to a degree”.\textsuperscript{238} Benjamin himself was much encouraged by the general support of the opera, and said to a colleague at the BBC: “I am so glad you think my show was all right. The criticism and the congratulations are rather bewildering. It is lovely to feel that I have had such a genuine success.”\textsuperscript{239}

The performance and reception of \textit{The Devil Take Her} was a turning point in Benjamin’s composition career. Beecham openly praised the opera and the successful staging of a larger scale work had given Benjamin considerable publicity in London’s musical circles.\textsuperscript{240} Other works composed in the early 1930s were the completion of a ballet \textit{Poultry} or \textit{Love in E.C.3} in November 1932,\textsuperscript{241} a one-act opera \textit{Prima Donna}, completed in August 1933,\textsuperscript{242} short educational piano solos entitled \textit{Fantasies Books 1 & 2},\textsuperscript{243} and the songs \textit{Three Greek Poems},\textsuperscript{244} all of which continued compositional trends already established. But it was \textit{The Devil Take Her} that was to open new horizons for Benjamin’s creativity.

Opportunities for Benjamin himself to conduct were not plentiful but on January 29, 1933 he conducted the BBC Symphony Orchestra in a studio performance of his Violin Concerto, with

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{239} Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Kenneth Wright, December 6, 1931 (BBC Written Archives, Composer: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1927–39).
\item \textsuperscript{240} Beecham’s intention to distribute the score throughout Germany was reported in the article ‘Winter-Garden Causerie’, \textit{The Australia Handbook} Vol. VII, No. 3 (December 1931): 3.
\item \textsuperscript{241} This work was never published and the manuscript in a piano duet version is lodged with the British Library (MS Mus 250). There is a record in \textit{The Times} of a performance of \textit{Poultry or Love in E.C.3} for the Jubilee of the RCM conducted by Constant Lambert on May 10, 1933, attended by the College’s President, the Prince of Wales (‘Jubilee of R.C.M.’, \textit{The Times}, May 11, 1933).
\item \textsuperscript{242} Published by Boosey & Co. Ltd. in 1935. This opera is discussed in greater detail in chapter seven. Although it was completed in 1933, the work wasn’t staged until 1949.
\item \textsuperscript{243} \textit{Fantasies} for Piano Solo, Book 1 and Book 2 were published by Hawkes & Son (London) Ltd. as a Winthrop Rogers Edition in 1933.
\item \textsuperscript{244} First published as a Winthrop Rogers Edition by Boosey & Co. Ltd. in 1934.
\end{itemize}
Antonio Brosa as soloist. The broadcast gave others the chance to pass judgement on the work with an internal circulating memo from Hely-Hutchinson to Kenneth Wright noting that the work had "decidedly more ‘stuffing’ than Benjamin’s earlier works and “the orchestration will definitely ‘come off’.”\textsuperscript{245} Benjamin’s letter to Boult soon after the broadcast was considerably more confident in tone than his earlier missive about which Benjamin reminded him, saying:

\begin{quote}
This was two years ago; and now that it has been broadcast and musicians such as Vaughan Williams and Bax have expressed their admiration of it to me (even the critics have treated it with some respect) I write to ask you if you will give me the chance to see how the public will take to it.\textsuperscript{246}
\end{quote}

Boult eventually gave the first public performance of the Violin Concerto, again with the BBC Symphony Orchestra and Antonio Brosa, as part of a series of \textit{Six Concerts of British Music} in Queen’s Hall organised by the BBC on January 5, 1934. Sheena Cleaton’s thesis drew attention to the political significance of this festival conceived by Boult, that was designed to appease hostility towards the BBC and claims that it was not doing enough to support British music and musicians.\textsuperscript{247} The edition of the \textit{Radio Times} on February 5, 1934 made a special feature of British music which incorporated six articles, two of which were written by Herman Klein ‘Modern British Music in the Making’, and Percy Scholes ‘British Music in our Century’ in which the latter praised the concerts as a “Renaissance of

\textsuperscript{245} Internal circulating memo May 15, 1931 (BBC Written Archives, Composer: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1927–39). Kenneth Wright (1899–1975) held a number of positions in the BBC from as early as 1922. These included Assistant Director of Music (1937), Overseas Music Director (1940), Deputy Director of Music (1944) and Acting Director of Music (1947). Lewis Foreman. \textit{From Parry to Britten: British Music in Letters 1900–1945}. London: B. T. Batsford Ltd., 1987: 311.

\textsuperscript{246} Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Adrian Boult February 11, 1933 (BBC Written Archives, Composer: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1927–39).

British Music".248 Judging by this critique in The Musical Times, the event was a success for the BBC:

The BBC opened the New Year [of 1934] with a grand gesture of charity on behalf of living British composers, thereby fortifying itself against the accusation ... of not doing enough for British music in general249

With conductors such as Beecham and Boult supporting his music, Benjamin's reputation as a composer was steadily increasing. In 1933, a young student conductor at the RCM named Muir Mathieson (1911–75) joined his list of supporters by conducting two performances of The Devil Take Her, again sponsored by the Ernest Palmer Opera Study Fund.250 Mathieson had enrolled at the College on February 18, 1929 where he studied piano with Benjamin and conducting with Malcolm Sargent.251 Shortly before graduating in 1933, he was offered the post of Assistant Director of Music at London Films by the producer Alexander Korda,252 a position that was to have implications for Benjamin and one that consolidated within two years Mathieson's position as Britain's foremost film music director.253

In summary, by the end of WWI Benjamin was twenty-five years of age and showing considerable gifts as both pianist and composer, with only a few years of incomplete formal training at the RCM. His short stay in Australia gave him some opportunities to develop as a composer, performer and teacher but it was to England's musical circle that he eventually returned to forge and establish his career. A variety of publishers printed his early compositions in the

---

250 Unacknowledged author. 'Royal College of Music: Opera in the Jubilee Celebrations', The Times, June 5, 1933.
song and chamber music genres, and his Queen’s Hall debut launched a performing career. From this point on, both sides of his musical life steadily progressed and patterns in compositional thinking were repeating themselves and becoming established. These patterns included the use of baroque forms, texts and rhythms from France and England; the influence of English folk music; settings of African-American hymns and spirituals; and experimentation with jazz. Benjamin’s attraction to French artistic sentiments drawn from the time of Watteau, while embracing the modernist trends of ragtime and jazz, was an approach he shared with other French composers such as Debussy and Ravel.

Most of Benjamin’s compositional output between 1914–33 used a small canvas in terms of duration and even his longer works such as A Negro Rhapsody and Concertino connected a string of smaller musical episodes to create a single continuous movement. The Violin Concerto and the one-act opera The Devil Take Her, composed in the early 1930s, were his most adventurous works in terms of scale, and the first movement of the Violin Concerto, the Rhapsody, reached new heights of contrapuntal complexity as a means of development (discussed in detail in chapters five and six). The Devil Take Her (see chapter seven), was a series of musical episodes connected by sung or spoken dialogue that, although attractive from moment to moment, did not fully realise the dramatic potential of the story. In effect, Benjamin had gained a certain fluency in his writing by the early thirties but was still coming to terms with larger scale structures which he acknowledged was “the last thing that even the most gifted composer masters”.254 He had yet to conceive a method of developing, and holding, a dramatic line.

2.5 Benjamin's career in the period 1934–9 and his introduction to the early British sound film industry

During the years 1934–9, Benjamin's activities as a performer and teacher continued in much the same vein as before, but his composing career showed steady signs of progress. This was aided by a contract with the noted publisher Boosey & Hawkes, Ltd., an outstanding success with *Jamaican Rumba* and good performances by noteworthy musicians. In addition to this, Muir Mathieson invited Benjamin to compose music for sound films, a relatively new art form which brought fresh challenges to Benjamin's compositional thinking. While the art world felt the economic restrictions of the depression, the British film world enjoyed a short-lived period of expansion and prosperity which offered a musician such as Benjamin not just financial rewards in difficult times, but the chance to experiment with sound, orchestration and opera-related ideas.255

In order to fully understand the working conditions which created the demand for composers like Benjamin to write for film, a brief study of economic and political factors affecting the industry is helpful. In 1927, an act was passed in the House of Commons to protect British films from American dominance. This required distributors and exhibitors to fulfil a 5% quota of British films, rising to 20% by 1936. Under this act, American productions could still operate and qualify as British if they employed a British producer or British registered company, used British studios and paid 75% of the wages and salaries to British subjects.256

On September 27, 1927 the first talking feature film *The Jazz Singer* (dir. Alan Crosland. Warner Bros.), made in America, opened at the Piccadilly Theatre in London. Linda Wood's *British Film Institute* publication registered the public's response in both America and Britain to the 'talking' film phenomenon which "led to a rush for

---

255 This would have been particularly attractive to Benjamin who was eager to compose for the stage but had been unable to procure throughout the 1930s a first performance of his second one-act opera *Prima Donna* which had been completed in August 1933.

installations of the Western Electric System". The songs in The Jazz Singer sung by Al Jolson, were diegetic and many of the silent film conventions still persisted such as the use of intertitles. According to Mervyn Cooke, Tchaikovsky’s Romeo and Juliet also featured in the film, not because of its relevance to the film’s plot but simply because it was a popular tune at that time. Alfred Hitchcock directed Britain’s first talkie Blackmail (British International Pictures) with music by Hubert Bath. This was released on June 21, 1929, almost two years after the American’s initial venture, and was followed by a rush of film production in Britain of extremely variable quality.

Alexander Korda, a film producer of Hungarian origin, had arrived in Britain, and by February 1932 had established his own company, London Films. An influential figure in British cinema, and one with whom Benjamin would work frequently, Korda quickly became a celebrity with his production The Private Life of Henry VIII (dir. Alexander Korda. London Films. 1933). This film went on to achieve something highly unusual—a box office success in America with a British film and a British subject, making over £7000 in its first week of showing.

Perhaps encouraged by the success of The Private Life of Henry VIII, a journalist splashed the line ‘Britain and America are at War!’ on the pages of the Daily Dispatch and then proceeded to claim that “from a weak and puny infant the British film industry has grown into a strong and sturdy David that is ready and able to carry the battle into the Hollywood Goliath’s camp”.

257 Ibid.: 15.
259 Linda Wood quoted the following:
“During the year ended September 30th, no fewer than 118 British films were presented to the trade in London. A critical analysis revealed that of these, 23 judged by generally accepted standards of entertainment value, were of a quality which marked them as good to very good. Of the rest, 35 were of average appeal, ranking as fairly good; 23 were so far below the desired standards as to rank as ‘poor’, while the somewhat alarming number of 37 were definitely bad. (Bioscope, November 5, 1930).” Linda Wood. British Films 1927–39. London: BFI, 1986: 21.
260 Ibid.: 33.
261 Ibid.: 32.
Hollywood, though, was extremely fierce and Linda Wood's appraisal of the British film industry points out that American films were genuinely popular with the British public. This, coupled with keen business sense, saw America gain a monopoly throughout the British Empire, and made it very difficult for British productions to generate income overseas.

Into this creative furore entered the young conductor Muir Mathieson, who was still in his early twenties when he began working for Korda's London Films. Mathieson was a musician with a mission, as was spelled out in his article 'Background Music in British Films' in *Cinema and Theatre Construction*.

During the last few years I have had the interesting duty of introducing many of our leading composers to the film studio...In every way, the cinema is making more efficient and experimental use of music, while the better production standards and world-wide distribution facilities make it imperative that our music should grow, taking in all the best of this country's composers (of whom we have every reason to be proud), in order to ensure that every British film sound-track is an ambassador of the great revival of interest in the musical composition of this country that is to-day beginning to have its effect upon the music of the world.262

The leading composers of whom he spoke included William Walton who worked on the films *As You Like it* (dir. Paul Czinner. TCF/Inter-Allied. 1936) and *Henry V* (dir. Laurence Olivier. Rank/Two Cities. 1944), Vaughan Williams who wrote music for *49th Parallel* (dir. Michael Powell. GFD/Ortus. 1941), Arthur Bliss's film score for *Things to Come* (dir. William Cameron Menzies. London Films. 1935) and even the young Benjamin Britten who composed imaginative accompaniments for a number of General Post Office (GPO) Film Unit productions of which *Coal Face* (dir. Alberto Cavalcanti. 1935) and

---

Night Mail (dir. Basil Wright and Harry Watt. 1936) are two of the best known.263

Mathieson’s work with Benjamin, firstly as his student at the RCM and as a conductor of the opera The Devil Take Her, obviously convinced him of Benjamin’s suitability to compose music for film to the artistic standards he was setting. Their first collaboration was on a fifteen minute film titled Wharves and Strays (dir. Bernard Browne. London Films. 1934).264 Only one page of this score survives and is reproduced in Kurt London’s book Film Music.265 This offers a small window into the colours of the instrumentation which calls on the resources of woodwind, glockenspiel and two male voices with support from the strings.

Most of Benjamin’s compositional output seems to have been absorbed by film work in 1934 with the production of The Man Who Knew Too Much (dir. Alfred Hitchcock. Gaumont-British Picture Corporation) and The Scarlet Pimpernel (dir. Harold Young. London Films), which were all scheduled for shooting that year.266 Benjamin also signed a contract with London Films to write a song number for The Private Life of Don Juan (dir. Alexander Korda. London Films. 1934), but he is not credited as the film’s composer in John Huntley’s book British Film Music, nor in Karol Kulik’s Alexander Korda: the Man Who Could Work Miracles.267 For The Scarlet Pimpernel, again a Korda production, Benjamin once more teamed up with Muir Mathieson as music director.268 Music in The Scarlet Pimpernel was

263 Other experimental films included Fairy of the Phone (dir. William Coldstream. 1936) with music by Walter Leigh and Tocher (dir. Lotte Reiniger. 1938) with Benjamin Britten’s score based on themes by Rossini.
264 The film followed a day in the life of a stray dog called Scruffy in London’s Docklands (information from Andrew Youdell of the British Film Institute on February 18, 2009).
268 Muir Mathieson, as music director, was the person employed by the studio to supervise the production of music for the films.
restricted to mainly diegetic purposes to accompany the musicians marching with a company of soldiers or to provide dancing music for the extended ballroom scene over which the main characters played out the drama. Extracts of Mozart’s *Marriage of Figaro* and *Eine Kleine Nachtmusik*, a setting of a Minuet composed by Benjamin as a teenager and some other unidentified music suitable for this period of history, were allocated to these scenes.\(^{269}\)

For the films *The Man Who Knew Too Much* and *The Clairvoyant* (dir. Maurice Elvey. Gainsborough. 1935), Benjamin worked with Louis Levy as music director. As will be discussed in chapter four, Levy’s work in sound film was an extension of his work from the silent film era. Although the use of music in British sound films in the early 30s was very restricted in terms of quantity and duration (unlike their American competitors who realised and utilised music’s full potential earlier), both these films enabled Benjamin to branch out into music that heightened or supported the action on screen in ways that were not just simply diegetic. Working with Hitchcock who was director for *The Man Who Knew Too Much* (1934) was a highlight in Benjamin’s film music career, as noted in his article for *The Musical Times* in 1937.

Film directors and producers in England (one excepted) show little feeling for the music in films...The intelligent film-goer will remember the use of music in...the Albert Hall sequence in 'The Man Who Knew Too Much,' the discord when the murdered man fell on to the organ keys in ‘Secret Agent’ (Hitchcock understands music in films)\(^{270}\)

Under Hitchcock’s directorship, Benjamin was to learn the fine art of timing and pacing needed to hold and develop a dramatic line, and

\(^{269}\) Benjamin claimed to have written the Minuet when he was aged nine (The Composer Speaks', [radio script] transmitted June 23, 1957, unidentified programme (BBC Written Archives). The music survives as a movement of his early Suite for Piano dated 1917. Mervyn Cooke drew his reader’s attention to an interesting point in the film *The Scarlet Pimpernel* by noting that, according to the library clock, the band has been playing the same piece of music for the last ninety minutes or more. 'Film Music'. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008: 228.

the controlled use of symbols or references to interpret and develop the psychological drama of a film; these were skills that he would later fully utilise in his next opera *A Tale of Two Cities* (see chapter seven).

Compositions other than film at this time included a handful of publications produced in 1934. Éditions de L'Oiseau Lyre published *Piper's Music: The Dancing Schoole*, a collection of five arrangements for bamboo pipes of tunes that are acknowledged on the score's title page as having been taken from *The Dancing Master*, London in 1719.271 In France as well as Britain, music for bamboo flutes gained popularity in the 1930s and was part of a movement that sought to return "back to nature".272 Vaughan Williams was another composer to create works for this instrument.273 And in France, Louise Dyer, of Éditions de L'Oiseau Lyre, commissioned further works for bamboo flute under the titled *Pipeaux 1934* from composers such as Milhaud, Roussel, Auric, Ibert and Poulenc.274

Benjamin signed his first contract with the publisher Boosey & Hawkes Ltd., in April 1932 for his opera *The Devil Take Her*.275 Boosey & Hawkes Ltd. was the amalgamation of Boosey & Co. and Hawkes & Son effected on September 30, 1930. It brought together the skills and talents of Leslie Boosey and Ralph Hawkes in a powerful partnership whose dynamic was described by Leslie Boosey as: "He was the engine, I was the brakes".276 Helen Wallace's book on the history of the company explained there was an active focus on developing its serious music catalogue following the merger.277 Elgar, Delius, Ireland, Holst and Vaughan Williams were already being

---

271 *The Dancing Master* was first published by John Playford in 1651 and Benjamin's 1719 edition was one of the subsequent editions produced at a later date by John Young. Jeremy Barlow (ed.). *The Complete Country Dance Tunes* from Playford's Dancing Master (1651–ca.1728). London: Faber Music, Ltd., 1985: preface.


273 In 1939, he added his *Suite for Pipers* to the repertoire and became president of The Piper's Guild in Britain.


275 Information given to the author in an e-mail from Mike Wood, an employee of Boosey & Hawkes, on December 3, 2004 after having consulted the relevant file.


published by Boosey & Hawkes and the company was soon to sign more composers.

In 1934, Boosey & Hawkes published Benjamin’s *Light Music* for orchestra, a work which employed again the often frequented structure of a dance suite—March, Pastorale, Viennese Waltz, Introduction and Final Dance—and the well-crafted setting of an attractive melody. *Three Greek Poems* were published the same year and, as the title suggests, comprised song settings for voice and piano of Greek poetry; ‘The Flower Girl’ (Dionysius 2nd Century B.C.), ‘On Deck’ (Theognis 6th Century B.C.) and ‘A Wine Jug’ (unknown author), whose renditions into English by A. C. Benson offered an alternative ‘ancient’ source material for Benjamin.

The emphasis on film music continued throughout 1935 with Benjamin’s involvement in four more films, *The Clairvoyant, Turn of the Tide* (dir. Norman Walker. British National Films), *The Guv’nor* (dir. Milton Rosmer. Gaumont-British) and *The Reign of King George V* (dir. unknown. London Films).\(^\text{278}\) *Turn of the Tide* is of particular interest as this was the only film for which Benjamin was credited as both music director and composer. It was also the first feature film of a newly formed company, British National Films, of which one of the directors was J. Arthur Rank (1888–1972). Rank had inherited a fortune in the form of his father’s flour milling company and was also an ardent Methodist Sunday School teacher. In 1933, he formed his first film company named The Religious Film Society with a view to using film as a medium through which Christian teachings could be conveyed; in April 1934 the Society’s first film, a twenty minute short titled *Mastership* (dir. Aveling Ginever. Religious Film Society), was screened.\(^\text{279}\) *Turn of the Tide*, discussed in greater length in chapter four, was a film considerably enhanced by Benjamin’s score. It

---

\(^{278}\) Benjamin signed contracts with London Film Productions Ltd. to compose music for *The Reign of King George V* for a fee of £200 on January 7, 1935 and for a “short animated cartoon provisionally entitled ‘The Hunt’” for a fee of £75 on February 21, 1935 (BFI library, special collection). The latter film was most likely *Fox Hunt* (dir. Anthony Gross and Hector Hoppin. London Film. 1935) but Michael [Mischa] Spoliansky’s music was credited.

offered the composer further opportunity to explore more dissonant and abstract musical thought for the disharmonious elements of the film such as the storm scenes, resulting in sounds he had never before submitted to manuscript paper.

During the two year period spanning 1934-5, Benjamin scored music for seven films but the economic stability of the British Film industry, which had initially attracted substantial investment under the seemingly beneficial quota scheme, was heading for troubled times. In 1935 it appeared the film industry could do no wrong with one reporter for the *Evening News* writing: “The British film business is growing so fast that it is finding itself short of nearly everything it requires—except money!” But such an extravagant claim was illusory and by November of that same year, Gaumont-British announced it was releasing several of its leading directors from their contracts (Hitchcock remained). Throughout 1936, a number of film studios suffered serious damage or were completely destroyed by fire. The continued heavy losses by film companies eventually led to friction between the banks which had granted them loans to make productions, and the insurance companies which had acted as guarantors. Linda Wood’s research published an extract from a report to the Board of the Commercial Union which stated:

As a result of a very thorough and careful investigation the Committee ascribed the cause of the debacle as follows:- 1) Pictures when produced were not exploited to the best advantage owing to the distributors being more interested in American products than they were in British products. 2) The incapacity of those directors who were in control of the various film companies. 3) The prodigal waste of money in production which resulted in the cost of many of the pictures produced being much higher than originally budgeted for. 4) This in turn caused money to be misused as, if the producers had not sufficient money to make Picture No. 1, they utilised part of the money intended for Picture No. 2. The net result of this method was that a number of the pictures intended to be produced, and for which

---

indeed the insurance companies guaranteed the banks were never in fact produced at all.281

Many film companies did not survive the financial crisis, but Korda weathered the storm and registered a new company by the name of Alexander Korda Productions in 1939 with a backing loan from the Prudential Insurance Company. J. Arthur Rank had developed a strategy of his own which involved gaining greater control over film distribution circuits by either buying or building new cinemas. The following quotation from James Limbacher’s seminar paper gave some idea of Rank’s success as a businessman in the British film industry.

By 1945, it was estimated that Rank owned 60 per cent of the British Film Industry...Rank had created a monopoly which finally caused a protest to be lodged with the British Board of Trade. The accusation slowly abated, however, when it was discovered that there was no law in Great Britain against a monopoly282

Whether it was due to the instability of the British film industry or as a matter of choice on Benjamin’s side, his involvement in film halved to just two films in 1936, a short documentary/educational film, Lobsters (dir. John Mathias and László Moholy-Nagy. Bury Productions) and the first British feature film in technicolor, Wings of the Morning (dir. Harold Schuster. New World Pictures). His compositional output in other genres increased with a song Shepherd’s Holiday, and a clutch of piano solos which were all published by Boosey & Hawkes, Ltd.—Chinoiserie, Scherzino, Siciliana and Let’s Go Hiking: Five Pieces for Youngsters. The first three piano solos were marketed in Boosey & Hawkes’s ‘Concert Series for Piano’ with the dedicatees bearing the names of Benjamin’s

281 *Ibid.*: 56.
more advanced piano students: Irene Kohler’s name appeared on the scores of *Chinoiserie* and *Scherzino*, and Lance Dossor, to whom *Siciliana* was dedicated and who subsequently premiéred the work at London’s Aeolian Hall in 1937.283

A letter from Kenneth Wright at the BBC to Benjamin on May 5, 1936, indicated that the *Romantic Fantasy* for violin and viola solo and orchestra (referred to as “Double Concerto”) was ready for an advisory panel at the BBC to listen to.284 Although it appeared the violist Lionel Tertis had requested the work from Benjamin and was willing to give the première,285 poor communications between the composer and the BBC resulted in the work’s planned for première on April 4, 1937 failing to materialize with Benjamin eventually being informed the disappointing news that “It looks, therefore, as though the Conc. must drop out entirely from this season’s Promenade Concerts”.286 Another orchestral work was completed in January 1937 titled *Overture to an Italian Comedy*, of which Muir Mathieson was the dedicatee and whose première was given by Sir Henry Wood and the Queen’s Hall Orchestra in the Queen’s Hall on March 2, 1937.287 Both these works showed the influence of Benjamin’s film music thinking and have been selected for analysis in chapters five and six.

Nineteen thirty seven saw Benjamin’s temporary exit from film music after the completion of *Under the Red Robe* (dir. Victor Sjöström. New World Pictures) and *Return of the Scarlet Pimpernel* (dir. Hans Schwartz. London Films). It would be another ten years

---

286 See the following items of correspondence: letter from J.H. to Arthur Benjamin March 4, 1937; message from J. H. to Kenneth Wright undated; internal circulating memo from Mr Herbage to D. D. M. March 8, 1937 (BBC Written Archives, Composer: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1927–39). The quotation was recorded in a letter from person unknown to Arthur Benjamin June 17, 1937 (BBC Written Archives, Composer: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1927–39).
287 The completion date for this work was recorded on the final page of the manuscript lodged with Boosey & Hawkes Ltd. Information about its première can be read in Alan Poulton. *Dictionary Catalogue of Modern British Composers*. Vol. I. Westport, Connecticut & London: Greenwood Press, 2000: 206.
before he was to resume work again as a film composer. As discussed in chapter four, this brief but intense period of work as a film composer gave him the chance to explore and experiment in the following ways: he could develop his use of leitmotif to interpret and shape a drama, the knowledge from which could be applied to his later operas; he was given the opportunity to write for orchestra albeit mostly of chamber dimensions because of restricted budgets; he acquired a greater technical understanding of the limitations of the microphones in studio recordings which led to an adjustment in his approach to orchestration; he learnt how to pace and build the music towards a point of climax that coincided with an important turning point in the film’s drama; he was given greater freedom in film scores to be more experimental with his composition.

Almost as a summing up of this film music period, Benjamin wrote one of the first film music critiques for The Musical Times which sought to address the lack of acknowledgement of composers’ work in this field.288 The article is not long in length but is broad enough in perspective to refer to the use of music in French, American and British films and included an analysis of how a composer responded to the visual stimulus of a film and how he went about preparing his work for recording. A more detailed discussion of this article will be included in the following chapters.

Another important extension of Benjamin’s work as a teacher was his employment as an adjudicator and as an examiner which eventually lead to his residency in Canada. In 1937, he made two overseas journeys as an adjudicator at the Annual Music Festival in Saskatoon, Canada,289 for which he set sail on March 25,290 and for the Fifth Jamaica Music Festival.291 His visit to Canada brought him

290 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Kenneth Wright undated (BBC Written Archives, Composer: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1927–39).
291 Robert Fleming, who was studying piano with Benjamin at the RCM, mentioned in a letter to his parents dated October 10, 1937, that his teacher was going away to adjudicate a festival and named the destination as Jamaica in his letter dated October 20, 1937
into contact with a number of talented young musicians such as the cellist Lorne Munroe whom he brought back to London to help further his studies. Benjamin looked after Munroe in his own home and an account of this arrangement is explained further in a letter from Benjamin to Kenneth Wright.

I had a marvellous time in Canada and have brought back a little lad of 12 to live with me. He is an amazing cellist and is going to the College to learn from Ivor James who says he has never had such a wonderful pupil. You must hear him. It will be a great joy for me to watch him grow into a fine artist.292

As Benjamin predicted, Lorne Munroe fulfilled an illustrious career which included positions of Principal Cello with the Philadelphia Orchestra and the New York Philharmonic.293

Benjamin stated in a BBC interview in 1949, that the children's choirs performing at the Winnipeg Festival, where he was adjudicating, “must be heard to be believed—they are so beautiful”.294 That same year Boosey & Hawkes Ltd. published the Kate Greenaway Songs (Bell Song, Margery Brown, Prince Finikin) for children’s choir. This work and others that will be named later in this chapter, were published from the late 1930s into the 50s as part of the company’s Festival Series. Such a publication proved to be mutually beneficial for composer and publisher, with evidence suggesting that Benjamin, at times, had the ability to decide the choice of music for some Festivals.295

Benjamin’s involvement in the Fifth Jamaican Music Festival in November, 1937, extended beyond examining duties. He appeared as soloist in a concert with the Jamaica Symphony Orchestra on

---

293 Lorne Munroe telephone interview with the author on February 5, 2003.
295 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, February 6, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file). An extract from this letter is referred to on page 103-4.
November 10 and took time to sight-see and socialise. Lloyd Hall, as a teenager, recalled how he played and sang at the piano for Benjamin such songs as Mango Walk, Mattie Rag, Cookie and Linstead Market at an informal home gathering. Benjamin never acknowledged Lloyd Hall's renditions when asked how he found or came to write his most famous composition Jamaican Rumba, which was based on the tune Mango Walk. His version tells of his having heard the tune for Mango Walk coming from a distance one night as he lay in his bed in Kingston. He elaborated further by saying: "I'm afraid the words are rather rude. I won't sing it to you." The young Lorne Munroe, living with Benjamin at the time, explained the reason behind this in an interview with the author many years after the event:

This was in the summer, I'm sure it was and he came back and I found out he wrote this Jamaican Rumba which became quite popular. He told me how he'd go down the road and he'd see these people who were roadworkers, you know singing and doing things on the road, so he picked up this tune for the Rumba. He was telling me, I was a very young boy, but he was telling me that they use very very improper language. They have their own words for the tune. He didn't tell me what they were but they were off-colour words.

Whether it was Benjamin's love of the Jamaican vernacular or the fact that Jamaica's climate and landscape reminded him of Brisbane, Benjamin developed an affection for the Jamaican people and their music.

According to a time-worn paper clipping dated 1939 found amongst the papers of the Benjamin Estate, a Jamaican group called The Cudgoe Minstrels was reported to have said: "Mr Arthur Benjamin

---
297 Lloyd Hall interview with the author September 14, 2003.
300 Lloyd Hall interview with the author September 14, 2003.
301 Ibid.
and Mr Philip Sherlock are regarded by us as our godfathers. Mr Benjamin for his kind words of encouragement spoken at a time when we were in a very early stage of development." And the young Jamaican Lloyd Hall, referred to earlier, won a scholarship that enabled him to study piano with Benjamin in London from September 1946. This relationship continued and a surviving programme correlated Hall's memories of a recital given by the Musical Competition Festival Council in Kingston, Jamaica. On that occasion, Benjamin and Hall performed the two-piano works—*Caribbean Dance, Two Jamaican Street Songs* and *Jamaican Rumba*, and Joan Trimble's *Buttermilk Point* and *The Bard of Lisgoole*, as well as Benjamin's *Nightingale Lane* for choir and piano.

Benjamin's account of the vernacular used in the rendition of *Mango Walk* had links with Walter Jekyll's descriptions of Jamaican music in his book published in 1907. The following quotation was an example of a 'digging-sings' which resonated with Benjamin's experience of 1937:

> To the other class of songs belong the 'digging-sings' used, together with rum, as an accompaniment to field labour...The Negro is cheery at all times, but when well primed with liquor he is hilarious. Nothing more joyous can be imagined than a good 'Digging-sing' from twenty throats, with the pickers—so they call their pickaxes—falling in regular beat...The chief singer is usually the wag of the party, and his improvised sallies are greeted with laughter and an occasional 'hi,' which begins on a falsetto note and slides downwards, expressing amusement and delight very plainly.

The improvised words Benjamin most likely heard will never be found but the common lyrics for this folk tune are the following:

---

302 Student register (RCM Library).
303 Benjamin Estate. The concert took place at the Ward Theatre with an appearance by the Shortwood Training College Choir on November 3. Although the year is missing, one can judge by the repertoire chosen that the concert must have taken place some time after 1946. *Caribbean Dance* was the latest work on the programme to be published by Boosey & Hawkes Ltd. in 1949 but the completion date of June 1946 was written on the manuscript with Boosey & Hawkes.
Mi bred-da di a tell mi dat yuh go man-go walk.
Yuh go man-go walk, yuh gi man-go walk,
Mi bred-da di a tell mi dat yuh go man-go walk
an tief out de Num-ber Eleven.
Tell me Joe do tell mi fi true,
Of tell me fi true do tell mi,
Yuh nev-er go a no man-go walk
an nev-er tief Num-ber Eleven.305

Jamaican Rumba’s popularity was instant but it was not the
first rumba to be marketed in England: Billy Mayerl, the British piano
virtuoso of syncopation, released his piano solo in rumba rhythm in
1933 called Balloons: Who’ll Buy My Nice Balloons? The marketability
of the Jamaican Rumba though, was international and its popularity
spawned a demand for numerous arrangements of the work.
Benjamin was only responsible for the two-piano, piano solo and
orchestral versions. With obvious amusement, he was quoted by a
journalist for the Australian Musical News and Digest in 1950 as
having commented: “now that my ‘Jamaican Rumba’ has been heard
on a barrel organ I feel I have attained real fame.”306 By 1949, the
publication by Boosey & Hawkes of Jamaican Rumba for violin and
piano, together with further Caribbean inspired works composed by
Benjamin in the 1940s, elicited the following review which gives us
some insight into the listening public’s attraction to music that was
then associated with the exotic Caribbean:

305 From Ouida Hylton-Tomlinson’s collected transcriptions titled Mango Walk. Jamaican folk
version as sung over the phone to the author in an interview on September 14, 2003 was not
an exact word match but closely paralleled the words in this publication.

In order to gain some idea of what a lead singer might do with such a song it is
useful to know that mango walk means a mango plantation. The author does not know when
mangos were picked but it is known that bananas were gathered during the night. According
to Lloyd Hall, a variety of mangos were grown in the plantation, for example the Duly and the
Bombay, but the “Number ‘leven” was the biggest and juiciest of them all (Lloyd Hall
interview with the author September 14, 2003).

306 ‘Only the Creation of Music can make us a Musical Nation’, Australian Musical News, No.
41 (October 1950): 34.
Is there a recipe that mixes passion-fruit, cayenne pepper, pineapple, limes, and a dash of rum? Ask Arthur Benjamin—he has one...To adhere to terms culinary: two grand pianos are the ideal vessels—hard, cool, big and clanky—in which this heady draught should be served. But if we get it bottled for export by Boosey & Hawkes, in small, shapely violin-flasks—we cannot complain.307

The folk song Mango Walk was, like Jazz, a fusion of African and European musical influences. Marilyn A. Rouse pointed out in a 1906 recording of the folk song Linstead Market, how many of the folk songs with their syncopated rhythms were a result of a synthesis between West African and West European music.308 With regard to Jazz, Gunther Schuller doubted whether people around 1920 would have applied the term ‘exotic’ but suggested their perspective would have been the following:

[People] viewed these ‘foreign’ languages with much the same feelings with which the Viennese viewed ‘Turkish’ music in the 1700s, or as Parisians saw African art, sculptures, and handicrafts in the late 1800s: a mixture of captivation, allure, fear, mystery, incomprehension—and sheer fascination, especially with their perceived erotic overtones.309

This European fascination and assimilation of art from ‘foreign’ or ‘exotic’ sources was the subject of discussion in Ralph P. Locke’s article ‘Cutthroats and Casbah Dancers, Muezzins and Timeless Sands: Musical Images of the Middle East’ where he explored new kinds of musical exoticism after the attraction of the alla turca fashion of the 18th century had begun to wane.310 Another writer,

---
Mervyn Cooke, shifted the geographical focus to south-east Asia whose gamelan music was infiltrating the orchestration of western compositions such as Ravel’s ‘Laideronette, Impératrice des Pagodes’ from *Ma Mère l'Oye* (1911); Poulenc’s *Concerto for Two Pianos* (1932) and Britten’s *The Prince of the Pagodas* (1956). Jamaica, like these other foreign lands was yet another source of exotica for colonialist Britain. John Carmichael, the Australian composer and friend of Benjamin, explained one of the reasons why Caribbean music was considered attractive to the British in the 1950s: “The rhythms were still new to us—we were all pretty stiff.”

The *Jamaican Rumba* was music that was attractive and well crafted with Benjamin believing part of its sustained international success was on account of its being “liked not only by low brows but high brows”. But *Jamaican Rumba* was also attractive and useful for those wishing to foster tourism under colonial rule. Its popularity in Jamaica under British rule did not wane in Benjamin's lifetime and he reported from Kingston on what may have been his last or one of his last visits in a letter to Bob Holton, an employee of Boosey & Hawkes:

Naturally, the interest here in my setting of their Rumba is enormous, I hear from Radio Jamaica that it has reached the Hit Parade and they tell me it has been also recorded by Woody Herman. (?)

Of course I can’t wait to hear it on Accordeon Band!! It opens the Radio session every morning here at 6am. But SIX A.M. Gawd! I hope we collect.

It is likely that Benjamin felt he had rendered the Jamaican people a favour in making ‘their Rumba’ so popular and, as explained

---

312 John Carmichael interview with the author on September 12, 2001.
313 BBC Interview by Denys Gueroult September 21, 1959 (National Sound Archive, BBC reference LP24707).
later in this chapter, he continued to base compositions on Jamaican folk song. A journalist as late as 1959 reported his ambition to write another opera “set in Jamaica in the 1830s with a part specially written for the coloured singer, Muriel Smith”.315

During the years 1938–9, Benjamin’s activities focused primarily on his composing and teaching, together with some recital work as a pianist. *Shepherd’s Holiday* featured in a programme sung by Miss Nora Gruhn on February 8, 1938 in the Wigmore Hall together with songs such as *Highland Funeral* by Freda Swain, and *Under the Greenwood Tree* by Herbert Howells.316 *Wind’s Work* was performed on the same night as part of a concert of modern English songs organised by The Contemporary Music Centre at Cowdray Hall.317 In this programme, his songs were heard alongside Italian arias, German lieder and songs by Peter Warlock in a Grotrian Hall recital given by the singer Miss Ruth Packer on March 10, 1938.318 Benjamin composed and dedicated a Cello Sonatina to Lome Munroe who premiered the work with Joan Trimble at the RCM in November 17, 1938.319 As pianist, Benjamin was performing and broadcasting solo piano programmes of Sonatas by Scarlatti, Preludes by Debussy and music by Bach together with his own works such as the *Siciliana, Scherzino* and *Suite for Piano*.320 On May 11, 1938, he gave another performance of the Concertino with the BBC Empire Orchestra which indicated that his prior lack of confidence in the work was temporary,321 and on July 18, he accompanied the tenor Steuart Wilson in a rendition of Ivor Gurney’s song cycle *Ludlow and Teme*.322 The orchestral works *Two Jamaican Pieces* received a studio

---

315 A staff correspondent in London. 'Composer Benjamin is Wary of Fame', *Sydney Morning Herald*, August 1, 1959 (AMC biographical file).
316 Unacknowledged author. 'Miss Nora Gruhn’s Song Recital', *The Times*, February 9, 1938.
318 Unacknowledged author. 'Concerts: Miss Ruth Parker and Miss Georgette Petit', *The Times*, March 12, 1938.
319 Concert programme (RCM Library, Concert Programmes).
320 Performance on July 3, 1938 (BBC Written Archives, Programme Index-Composers 1945–54).
322 Ibid.
performance under Sir Anthony Lewis' baton with the BBC Symphony Orchestra on October 31, 1938, and *Cotillon*, a suite of English Dance Tunes from *The Dancing Master 1719*, was given a studio première by Clarence Raybould and the BBC Symphony Orchestra on February 3, 1939.

One of the compositional highlights of these years was the première of *Romantic Fantasy* on March 24, 1938 for the Royal Philharmonic Society with Benjamin conducting, and Eda Kersey and Bernard Shore the respective violin and viola soloists. Immediately after the performance, Benjamin wrote to his BBC colleague Kenneth Wright:

> It was good to get your note. I really had begun to think that my friends had forgotten my existence. Many thanks for your wishes. The 'Romantic Fantasy' certainly received a lovely performance, both soloists & orchestra were first-rate and, in spite of my having only 1½ hours rehearsal, everything went perfectly.

A common romantic sentiment was shared between Benjamin and Arnold Bax whom Benjamin had first met at a 1920s cocktail party. Benjamin dedicated the *Romantic Fantasy* to Bax and Lewis Foreman's book *London: A Musical Gazetteer*, drew the reader's attention to Benjamin's use, in the *Romantic Fantasy*, of a motif from Arnold Bax's tone poem *In the Faery Hills* (1909). Herbert Howells, in his 1960 tribute to Benjamin, neatly summed up the relationship between the two composers by writing: "His facility was Baxian—but

---

324 Letter from Ralph Hawkes to Clarence Raybould on December 16, 1938 (BBC Written Archives, Composer: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1927–39).
with strangely un-Baxian results".\textsuperscript{328} Benjamin’s tribute to Bax in *Music and Letters* highlighted a reference made by Bax about Benjamin’s Violin Concerto which the composer acknowledged as romantic but Bax had initially found not quite romantic enough.\textsuperscript{329}

I want Arthur Benjamin, who is a new discovery to me, and about whom I am rather excited, not to care a damn about being a modern composer, but (as Sir Philip Sidney said) ‘look in his heart and write’. I am absolutely certain that the only music that can last is that which is the outcome of one’s emotional reactions to the ultimate realities of Life, Love and Death. (All damned romantic, but I believe true.\textsuperscript{330})

Another connection between the two men appeared in *The Times* where Benjamin and the cellist Sheridan Russell are recorded as having performed Bax’s Sonata alongside works by Debussy, Bach and Beethoven in a Wigmore Hall recital on December 6, 1927.\textsuperscript{331} Of Bax’s style as a composer, Anthony Payne’s writings in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* concluded with the following words: “[H]is chief strength lay in the precision with which he characterized moods and soul states, and this is as true of the symphonies and abstract music as of the tone poems”.\textsuperscript{332} But “speaking a naturally romantic language in anti-romantic times” was, in John Warrack’s opinion, partly responsible for Benjamin’s music being “condemned to a steady neglect”.\textsuperscript{333} Herbert Howells likewise observed that Benjamin’s naturally romantic language would not resonate well with certain influential music critics:

Arthur Benjamin endured two serious disabilities. He had conquered a large part of the listening world with an enchanting brevity (*Jamaican Rumba*).\textsuperscript{334}

\textsuperscript{330} Ibid.: 3.  
\textsuperscript{331} ‘Music this Week: Operas and a New Symphony’, *The Times*. December 6, 1927.  
\textsuperscript{333} John Warrack. ‘Obituary, including a Personal Appreciation of Arthur Benjamin’, *Opera* (June 1960): 434.
And he was an unashamed Romantic. By these two circumstances, rather than on evidence of greater validity, he was assessed. The first enormously extended his popular fame but reduced his stature in the view of high-powered criticism. The second appeared to make him an anachronistic figure.\textsuperscript{334}

A further performance of the \textit{Romantic Fantasy} with Constant Lambert conducting, took place on January 1, 1939. Despite these successes,\textsuperscript{335} which included a forthcoming performance of his opera \textit{The Devil Take Her} by The Sadler’s Wells Company,\textsuperscript{336} Benjamin sailed again to Canada on February 10,\textsuperscript{337} this time with the intention of emigrating. A number of factors may have contributed to this decision: Benjamin’s initial connection with Canada as an adjudicator had quickly developed into the possibility of his opening a new School of Music in Vancouver; the immediate success of \textit{Jamaican Rumba} had furthered his general financial independence; despite having composed a second one-act opera \textit{Prima Donna} in 1933, there were no opportunities for performances; the film music industry was in recession owing to the period of economic uncertainty; and the threat of war was becoming a very real possibility. Benjamin’s career had already suffered considerable ‘set backs’ with the First World War. Robert Fleming’s letter to his parents on October 2, 1938 revealed the extent of Benjamin’s anxiety concerning the outcome of the meeting of the “four powers” and the possibility of another war: “Poor old Benny was in a terrible state about world matters. Howells said he had never seen him so nervy in

\textsuperscript{335} Letter from person unknown to Chapman on November 16, 1938 (BBC Written Archives, Composer: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1927–39).
\textsuperscript{336} ‘British Opera: the Risk and the Reward’, \textit{The Times}. April 22, 1939. The opera was also performed at the Sydney Conservatorium early in 1938 (A. L. Kelly. ‘Festival Music’, \textit{The Australian Musical News}, February 1, 1938: 12–3).
\textsuperscript{337} Letter from Arthur Benjamin to person unknown on January 8, 1939 (BBC Written Archives, Artists: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1938–59).
all his life and they've grown up together...But he was so relieved after the great news".338

Despite the economic hardship of the depression, the 1930s were productive years for Benjamin in all areas of work. The introduction of sound film in Britain brought new stimulus for his creative energies and scope for him to experiment with orchestration, dissonance and more abstract musical thinking. Film developed his understanding of the psychological drama, the importance of timing and build-up towards a designated climax, and the skilful application of leitmotif to clarify and interpret a story. Benjamin’s love of theatre and stage had no outlet during 1934–9, but techniques learnt in this first intensive period of employment as a film composer were soon to influence the orchestral works Romantic Fantasy (1936) and Overture to an Italian Comedy (1937), and his third opera A Tale of Two Cities.

As a performer, Benjamin’s career had effectively reached a plateau in the 1930s, but his gifts as a teacher of piano were flourishing at the RCM and elsewhere as examiner and adjudicator. With another World War soon to impinge on the already economically hindered arts in 1930s Britain, Benjamin made the decision to follow a career opportunity in Canada involving him as director of a new music school in Vancouver. Here he believed his wide range of skills as composer, pianist and teacher could make a valuable contribution to what he considered “one of the most amazing musical patches anywhere in the globe”.339

2.6 The Canadian years 1939–46

By July of 1939, Benjamin’s intention to live in Vancouver was being openly publicised by an eager press in The Vancouver Sun.340 The subsequent role he was to play in Vancouver’s music life was a vital

338 Letter from Robert Fleming to his parents November 2, 1938 (memorabilia of Margaret Fleming). The ‘great news’ Fleming referred to was Chamberlain’s return to England with the words ‘peace in our time’.
339 ‘Composer Sees Vancouver as Music Centre’, Vancouver Sun, August 11, 1939.
one that would have a significant impact in areas of music education, conducting, performing and composition. His involvement in film music and stage works ceased with his residency in Canada, but working relationships as composer and pianist developed with prominent musicians such as William Primrose and John Barbirolli, as well as the publishing partners Leslie Boosey and Ralph Hawkes. Towards the close of the Second World War, new opportunities were presenting themselves to Benjamin but it was the connection forged with his publishers, along with work conditions in Vancouver, that eventually influenced his decision to return to London.

Canada's musical environment in 1939 was summed up by Benjamin ten years later as "quite dead, or should I say quiet, in those days", but he was nonetheless very aware of the enormous talent amongst its young musicians being exhibited at the various Festivals for which he had been adjudicator. When Benjamin arrived in Vancouver to take up residency, he had a vision of establishing a music academy along the same lines as the Royal Academy and Royal College in London. He believed such an institution could contribute music that was more than just "a luxury, a veneer, a façade—but rather an essential part of a country's makeup". The Vancouver press coverage in support of Benjamin's vision was encouraging, but by the following year he had relinquished the cause, explaining to Leslie Boosey in a letter that the "coming of the war made it impossible".

The idea of establishing a music academy was only one of the attractions Vancouver had for Benjamin; it also offered him an

---

341 By the late 1930s, the Canadian film industry, unable to compete with Hollywood, had virtually collapsed. In response to this dilemma, the National Film Board of Canada was created in 1939. Under John Grierson's guidance as its first Film Commissioner, the industry achieved a certain degree of early success with animation and documentaries. (Jill McGreal. 'Canadian Cinema', The Oxford History of World Cinema. Geoffrey Nowell-Smith (ed.). New York: Oxford University Press, 1996: 731, 733.)


343 Unacknowledged author. 'City's Musical Status Lauded', Vancouver Province, January 26, 1942.

344 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Leslie Boosey, October 6, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
environment in which he could continue to work on his music. No doubt mindful of the hiatus the First World War had caused in his musical career, Benjamin was openly reported to have said:

I am not ashamed of running away from Europe's gloom...No artist can turn out creative work of value in such a distracting atmosphere of uncertainty, fear and hatred. I fell in love with Vancouver's natural beauty and air of peaceful liveliness when I was last here in 1937. The memory has remained with me through the darkening days since then, until now I am proud to become a citizen of this fresh new country with its eyes on the future.345

By December of the same year, Benjamin wrote: “I can say I have already made something of a mark here” in a letter to Ralph Hawkes.346 This indicated the speed with which he had been absorbed into the musical network of Vancouver. Benjamin was busy giving recitals,347 radio presentations,348 piano tuition (in Victoria as well as Vancouver), and at short notice,349 conducting the Vancouver Symphony Orchestra (VSO) when its regular conductor Allard de Ridder, fell ill.350 Benjamin's letter to Leslie Boosey revealed exactly what these opportunities with the Canadian Broadcasting Corporation (CBC) and VSO meant to him.

It took the Canadians to discover two things about me. Firstly, it would appear that I have a flair for talking on the Radio so, besides giving recitals on the air I also do talks and last night started the first of a series of twelve chamber-music programmes (preceded by short explanatory talks) which the C.B.C. have asked me to supervise.

345 'Composer Sees Vancouver as Music Centre', Vancouver Sun, August 11, 1939.
346 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes on December 29, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
347 Millicent referred to his having given a recital in Victoria with a quartet in a letter to Leslie Boosey & Ralph Hawkes on November 23, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
348 Benjamin mentioned giving a series of recitals and talks on CBC Radio in a letter to Leslie Boosey on November 20, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
349 Reference to Benjamin's teaching in Vancouver and Victoria can be found in his letter to Ralph Hawkes on December 29, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
350 When it was announced that Benjamin would take de Ridder's place, the concert subsequently sold out and was heralded as a great success as related in a letter from Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes on December 29, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file). Also see Stanley Bligh. 'Symphony, Led by Benjamin, Scores Big Hit'. Vancouver Sun, November 20, 1939.
Then, secondly, as you will see by the fulsome critiques, I have broken out as a conductor! I honestly did get good performances from an orchestra which would rank with the best amateur orchestras in England, with only 6 hours rehearsal, as I stepped in at the last moment owing to the illness of the permanent conductor.

But the thing is that I had to come abroad to get these chances. Can you imagine the B.B.C. even giving me a chance to talk or to conduct?351

Although the BBC, according to Leslie Boosey, operated like a "magic circle" for which you needed to be on the "inside",352 the CBC and America readily offered Benjamin new opportunities as both composer and conductor. A letter from the New York branch of Boosey & Hawkes informed him that the orchestral work *Cotillon* had been performed in seven different cities in America. Perhaps encouraged by the interest shown in his orchestral music,353 Benjamin announced in a letter to Ralph Hawkes: "I have started a Symphony. Writing that sentence caused me to have shivers up the spine. What an undertaking!"354 The Symphony was to be Benjamin's most ambitious and longest orchestral project with the writing process lasting more or less the entire duration of WWII.

Soon after his appearance as conductor with the VSO, Benjamin branched out as Artistic Director of the Promenade concerts with the sponsorship of *The Vancouver Sun* newspaper.355 The first series was comprised of four concerts and according to the Canadian composer Jean Coulthard, the orchestral members were

---

351 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Leslie Boosey, November 20, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
352 Letter from Leslie Boosey to Arthur Benjamin, December 5, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
353 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes on December 29, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file). Benjamin also programmed *Cotillon* in his second concert conducting the Vancouver Symphony Orchestra in February 11, 1940 in which he also appeared as soloist in the Grieg Piano Concerto (Vancouver Symphony Archives, Concert programme).
354 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, December 29, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
355 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, April 11, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
partly comprised of VSO players.\textsuperscript{356} The success of these concerts secured sponsorship for a further six Promenade concerts commencing in November of that year.\textsuperscript{357} Such activities did not escape the notice of the CBC which then offered Benjamin the conductorship of the newly formed Canadian Broadcasting Radio Symphony Orchestra (CBRSO) and an inaugural season of thirteen orchestral programmes in 1941.\textsuperscript{358} The public's response to this series was overwhelming with every concert sold out and radio listeners spread throughout Canada's west.\textsuperscript{359}

During Benjamin's five years association with the Orchestra as principal conductor, he exerted considerable power over programming and proudly stated in a BBC interview in 1949 that he had given "about fifty first performances, mostly of British works."\textsuperscript{360} His support for contemporary composers, regarded by Benjamin as crucial in the cultural life of any country,\textsuperscript{361} naturally extended to those living in Canada to whom he threw out this challenge shortly after his arrival in Vancouver:

\begin{quote}
The compositions I have met with up to date in this country show no distinctively Canadian character; they are just as compositions in England or Ireland. Yet there must be something in the great freedom here that can be put into music.\textsuperscript{362}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{356} Interview with Jean Coulthard by William Bruneau, February 2, 1994 (University of British Columbia Archives, 'Coulthard Papers,' West Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada, 1994-8).
\textsuperscript{357} Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Leslie Boosey on October 6, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
\textsuperscript{358} Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Leslie Boosey on October 6, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
\textsuperscript{359} 'CBR Symphony Orchestra Opens its Second Season Presenting World Famous Violist as Guest', \textit{CBC Programme Schedule}. Week of October 11, 1942.
\textsuperscript{360} 'British Composers—Arthur Benjamin', Recorded April 27, 1949 (National Sound Archive, reference ICE0000 559 and 560). He was also to give the première of such works as the \textit{Fantasy Concerto for Two Pianos and Orchestra} by Australian composer Frank Hutchens with the CBR Symphony Orchestra concert on November 9, 1945 (\textit{Fifth Season of CBR Symphony Orchestra}, \textit{CBC Programme Schedule}. Week of November 4, 1945).
\textsuperscript{361} See quote on page 128 from the report 'Only the Creation of Music can make us a Musical Nation', \textit{Australian Musical News and Digest}, October 2, 1950.
\textsuperscript{362} Unacknowledged author. 'School of Music for West Vision of noted Pianist', \textit{Victoria Colonist}, January 24, 1940.
For Canadian composers such as Jean Coulthard, Benjamin provided instruction in orchestration and gave her the rare opportunity to hear her works performed. Coulthard explained in an interview “the regular Vancouver Symphony wouldn’t touch a Canadian work for love nor money” and referred to her “first big orchestral piece”, *Canadian Fantasy*, which Benjamin performed. Coulthard remembered Benjamin commenting on her music’s affiliation with Canada:

Arthur Benjamin said to me one time, 'You know, your music makes me think of British Columbia, makes me feel British Columbia.' Now that was interesting, and I was very pleased with that at the time...Well, he picked out the piano sonata, and said... (I wish he were alive to tell us why he said that) There’s something about it that makes me think of the west, here.

Another Canadian composer to receive support from Benjamin was his former student at the RCM Robert Fleming, who had now returned to Canada and was posted to Vancouver in 1943 for training in the war. As well as supporting compositions by contemporary British and Canadian composers, conductorship of the CBRSO provided Benjamin with opportunities to programme his own orchestral works which were gaining popularity in both the UK and in the USA.

---

363 In 1943, Benjamin programmed Coulthard’s *Ballet Excursion* with the CBRSO.
367 This questions John Warrack’s rather pessimistic and perhaps narrow view that Benjamin was, at this stage, “condemned to steady neglect” (see page 89).
These included *Cotillon*, a work that was also performed by Barbirolli and the New York Philharmonic in February 1940, *Overture to an Italian Comedy* and *Concerto for Oboe*. He also scheduled in the première of his *Suite for Flute and Strings* on March 8, 1946, prior to his leaving Canada. His publisher Ralph Hawkes reported the latter was being performed continually by the BBC in 1940, and on January 17, 1941, Fabien Sevitsky, who had reportedly been "very impressed" with *Cotillon*, premièred a new work entitled *Prelude to Holiday* with the Indianapolis Symphony Orchestra. Other orchestras, such as the Boston Symphony Orchestra, the VSO under Beecham and the Los Angeles Philharmonic Orchestra with Werner Janssen, were quick to programme the work, and it represented Britain at a concert for the International Society of Contemporary Music in San Francisco, again conducted by Janssen. Across the Atlantic in war-time Britain, *Prelude to Holiday* received its British première at a Henry Wood Promenade Concert at the Royal Albert Hall on August 6, 1942 with Sir Henry Wood conducting the BBC Symphony Orchestra.

---

368 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Leslie Boosey on November 4, 1942 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
369 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Leslie Boosey on November 20, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
370 *Overture to an Italian Comedy* was performed on April 12, 1943 ('CBR Symphony Orchestra Opens its Second Season Presenting World Famous Violist as Guest', *CBC Programme Schedule*. Week of October 11, 1942) and the *Concerto for Oboe* was programmed on November 9, 1943 with Fernie Quinn as soloist ('CBR Symphony Orchestra Opens its Second Season Presenting World Famous Violist as Guest', *CBC Programme Schedule*. Week of October 11, 1942).
372 Ralph Hawkes's report on performances of *Suite for Flute and Strings* can be read in his letter to Arthur Benjamin, December 20, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file) and his reference to Fabien Sevitsky's comment about *Cotillon* appeared in a letter to Arthur Benjamin, February 19, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
373 ‘Benjamin Work to be Given at next Symphony Concert’, *Vancouver Sun*, November 7, 1942.
375 News of Beecham's performance of *Prelude to Holiday* with the VSO was recorded in Benjamin's letter to Leslie Boosey, November 4, 1942 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file) and Werner Janssen informed Benjamin of his performance in a letter dated June 10, 1943 (Benjamin Estate).
376 ‘Benjamin Work to be Given at next Symphony Concert’, *Vancouver Sun*, November 7, 1942.
The *Concerto for Oboe and Strings* (otherwise known as *Cimarosa*) was based on themes by the baroque composer Cimarosa and was inspired by the oboist Evelyn Rothwell [Barbirolli] to whom it was dedicated.\(^{378}\) John Barbirolli, as conductor of the New York Philharmonic-Symphony Orchestra, had, in the summer of 1940, accepted an invitation to conduct the VSO for a charity concert in which Arthur Benjamin was to be the piano soloist in César Franck's *Symphonic Variations*.\(^{379}\) He and his wife Evelyn, continued their friendship with Benjamin the following year when they returned to Vancouver for a summer holiday.\(^{380}\) Evelyn eventually performed the concerto in 1944, but it was Leon Goossens's performance with Basil Cameron conducting the London Philharmonic Orchestra that launched the work at a Promenade Concert in London's Royal Albert Hall on July 22, 1942.\(^{381}\)

Benjamin's music and in particular, his orchestral music, was now being regularly performed by some of the most famous musicians of the day. Ernest Chapman, from the London offices of Boosey & Hawkes, was to write with the news: “it is really splendid how these orchestral works of yours keep such a prominent place in the wireless repertory”.\(^{382}\) Benjamin had collaborated with William Primrose early in their acquaintance when they performed his Violin Sonatina in London.\(^{383}\) They continued performing together on various projects in 1942 which included radio concerts and chamber music recitals for venues in Montreal, Quebec, Ottawa and Detroit.

---

\(^{378}\) The *Concerto for Oboe* is a free arrangement of keyboard sonatas nos. 23, 24, 29 and 31 by the Italian composer Domenico Cimarosa (1749–1801).

\(^{379}\) See letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes on February 22, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file) and mention of the concert in programme March 17, 1942 (Vancouver Symphony Archives).

\(^{380}\) Evelyn, in an interview with the author, recalled her memory of Benjamin delivering the manuscript of the concerto to them on the train platform just prior to their departure (Lady Evelyn Barbirolli, recorded interview with the author, January 28, 2003).


\(^{382}\) Letter from Ernest Chapman to Arthur Benjamin on May 29, 1941 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).

\(^{383}\) Unacknowledged author. 'Two New Compositions', *The Times*, July 16, 1925.
many of which featured the recently composed Viola Sonata. He also conducted a CBRSO concert in which Primrose and Jean de Rimanoczy appeared as soloists in Mozart’s *Sinfonia Concertante* in E flat, K364 and participated as guest conductor in Montreal for a three-quarter hour programme of his own orchestral works—Concerto for Oboe (in Primrose’s viola arrangement), *Cotillon*, *Overture to an Italian Comedy* and the orchestral version of the *Cello Sonatina*.

Commercial recordings around this time included Frederick Stock conducting *Overture to an Italian Comedy* with the Chicago Symphony Orchestra for RCA, followed by Leon Goossens’s performance of the Concerto for Oboe with Dr Malcolm Sargent conducting the Liverpool Philharmonic Orchestra for HMV in 1944 and Primrose’s interpretation of the Viola Sonata with Vladimir Sokoloff (piano) for Victor in 1945. These recordings were an indication of Benjamin’s success as a composer and would have been invaluable in generating and supporting the growing interest in his music. By 1946, Boosey and Hawkes’s publicity statement for Benjamin in the magazine *Tempo* stated: “100,000 records of the *Jamaican Rumba* have been sold in the United States between January and September this year.”

As well as his composing and conducting, Benjamin was in demand as a pianist and teacher. In addition to his work with Primrose and Barbirolli, he performed with artists such as the McGill Quartet and for organisations that included the Vancouver

---

384 Primrose lists these recitals in a letter to Benjamin on August 4, 1942 (Benjamin Estate).
385 The CBRSO concert took place on October 12, 1942. ‘CBR Symphony Orchestra Opens its Second Season Presenting World Famous Violist as Guest’, *CBC Programme Schedule. Week of October 11, 1942*. Benjamin referred to the Montreal concert in a letter to Leslie Boosey on November 4, 1942 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
386 American Victor 11-8157.
387 HMV CLP 1698 and Victor 11-92101-1.
Women's Musical Club, the Vancouver *Nine O'Clock* series and the University of British Columbia. Benjamin’s own feelings about his performing capabilities are summed up in a letter to Leslie Boosey written in 1944: "I have never played the piano as well as at this period of my life." 

Benjamin’s impact on his new musical community was felt soon after his arrival in 1939 with one newspaper article claiming he was “stimulating musical effort in Vancouver to a high degree”. He was consistent in collaborating with various professional musicians resident in Vancouver—Jean de Rimanoczy (violinist) and Phyllis Schuldt (pianist) to name but two, and was always actively involved in supporting and promoting young artists. The youngest of these was most likely the eleven-year-old pianist Tana Bawden who was invited by Benjamin to perform Beethoven’s second Piano Concerto with the CBRSO on April 5, 1946.

---

390 Benjamin accompanied baritone John Goss, in a recital for the Vancouver Women’s Musical Club at the Hotel Vancouver on May 29, 1942 (*Vancouver Sun*, June 3, 1942).


392 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Leslie Boosey, August 30, 1944 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).

393 Stanley Bligh. 'Symphony Orchestra Acclaimed', *The Vancouver Sun*, February 12, 1940 (Vancouver Symphony Archives).

394 Benjamin’s collaboration with Jean de Rimanoczy included ‘An evening of Chamber Music’ concert for The Vancouver Woman’s Musical Club on April 29, 1940 (Vancouver Symphony Archives. Mentioned in programme on March 17, 1940). Rimanoczy was involved as concert master and soloist in both Benjamin’s Vancouver Sun Pomenade concerts (*Vancouver Sun*, November 1, 1940) and CBRSO concerts (‘CBR Symphony Orchestra Opens its Second Season Presenting World Famous Violist as Guest’, *CBC Programme Schedule*. Week of October 11, 1942). Phyllis Schuldt performed Mozart’s Two Piano Concerto with Mary Munn with the CBRSO on April 12, 1943 (‘CBR Symphony Orchestra Opens its Second Season Presenting World Famous Violist as Guest’, *CBC Programme Schedule*. Week of October 11, 1942). According the Carol Jutte, Benjamin tutored Phyllis Schuldt and many of the other piano teachers (Interview with the author on November 22, 2002). Benjamin was presenter of a free concert for service men and women in which Phyllis Schuldt and Mary Munn performed together with the soprano Annabelle McKenzie-Edwards (‘Sunday Concert for Armed Forces’, *Vancouver Province*, April 10, 1943). The youngest artist to collaborate with Benjamin was most likely the eleven-year-old pianist Tana Bawden whom he invited to perform Beethoven’s second Piano Concerto with the CBR Symphony Orchestra on April 5, 1946 (‘Arthur Benjamin Directs Farewell Concert’, *CBC Programme Schedule*. Week of March 31, 1946).

395 Unacknowledged author. 'Benjamin in Final Symphony Concert', *Vancouver Sun*, March 30, 1946.
According to Beatrice Rogers Zack, one of Benjamin's piano students, her teacher had met a promising young pianist named Jack Henderson at the 1939 Winnipeg Festival. Jack became Benjamin's secretary, before moving permanently into the household as a lifelong partner. While in Canada, Benjamin supported Henderson's performing career in a number of ways: he conducted the CBR SO with Henderson appearing as soloist in Constant Lambert's *The Rio Grande* on October 11, 1942; he accompanied Henderson on the piano in Beethoven's Piano Concerto no. 3 in C minor in a concert featuring three of Vancouver's promising young artists for the Vancouver Women's Club on November 11, 1942; he composed and dedicated as 'A twenty-first birthday gift for Jack Henderson', a piano solo called *Prelude, Arioso and Finale* which Henderson gave in a studio performance for the CBC on January 29, 1943; and perhaps as the culmination of their collaborative efforts in Canada, Benjamin conducted Henderson's performance of the Beethoven Piano Concerto No. 4 in G major with the CBR SO on January 16, 1945. He also composed a cadenza for the first movement of Beethoven's 3rd Piano Concerto for which the manuscript survives and is dedicated 'For Jackie, Vancouver 1941'.

Lamar Crowson was another promising student whom Benjamin first met in 1942 while adjudicating in Canada. In a South African Broadcasting Corporation talk, Crowson related how in 1942, his teacher Nellie Tholan, in Portland, Oregon was "disillusioned by the American contest scene" and had brought him "to Victoria to

---

396 Notes made by the author during a telephone interview with Beatrice Rogers Zack on November 25, 2002, and a letter from Jack Henderson to Beatrice Rogers Zack on June 2, 1940 acknowledged Henderson was acting as Benjamin’s secretary (memorabilia of Beatrice Rogers Zack).

397 Concert on December 14, 1942 ('CBR Symphony Orchestra Opens its Second Season Presenting World Famous Violist as Guest', *CBC Programme Schedule. Week of October 11, 1942*).

398 Unacknowledged author. 'Musical Club Rare Program', *Vancouver Sun*, November 7, 1942.

399 The performance was broadcast on January 29, 1943 and in this article, Henderson was referred to as the "pupil and protégé of the well-known Vancouver musician Arthur Benjamin" ('Jack Henderson is on "Pacific Pianoforte"', *CBC Programme Schedule. Week of January 29, 1943*).

400 Concert programme and cadenza (British Library, MS MUS 260).

sample the English public adjudication system". When Benjamin returned to London, he wrote to Crowson inviting him to come and study at the RCM and predicted that his new student would become "a fine artist". Crowson was to record a number of Benjamin's piano compositions—Pastorale, Arioso and Finale, Scherzino and the unpublished Études Improvisées for Lyrita in February 1960. He also recorded the two piano concerti—Concertino and Concerto quasi una Fantasia—for Everest with Benjamin conducting the London Symphony Orchestra, recorded in the late 1950s.

Portland, Oregon was to develop an even closer connection with Benjamin during his Canadian years in the form of a lectureship at Reed College. By Christmas 1944, Benjamin gave some indication of his work orientation by writing the following in a letter to Howells:

My work is taking me more & more down into the U.S.A. They want me to take a seven-week class at Reed College in Portland in the Spring when I can lecture on any subject I choose. And after I conducted the orchestra at the University of Washington in Seattle they offered me five weeks in the Summer to conduct the orchestra at the Summer School there.

Benjamin's work schedule during the Canadian years was increasingly diversified and demanding, and his correspondence with his publishers Leslie Boosey and Ralph Hawkes revealed how influential they were in guiding and shaping his musical decisions. Boosey & Hawkes's growth since the amalgamation in 1930 was due to a number of factors. An exodus of skilled and talented men from European publishing houses prior to WWII had found employment

403 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Jean Coulthard, August 17, 1948 (University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard File 1–3). Crowson registered with the RCM in September 1948 (Student register at RCM Library).
404 Information taken from the booklet for the recent CD release (Lyrita Ream.2109) in 2008 by Lyrita Recorded Edition.
405 Everest Records SDBR-3020.
with Boosey & Hawkes. Hans Heinsheimer was forced out of Austria in 1938 after the Anschluss and was to give "new gravitas to the New York operation". This had included an American edition of the company's inhouse magazine *Tempo* in 1939.407 Other men included Ernst Roth, Erwin Stein and Alfred Kalmus from Universal Edition. Kalmus was retained as director of Universal when Boosey & Hawkes bought all the shares of Universal's London branch.408 By the end of the war, the company's list of achievements was impressive; it represented such composers as Aaron Copland and Béla Bartók; by the autumn of 1941 it had initiated its own concert series at the Wigmore Hall;409 in 1943 it had taken over the lease and some of the expenses of running Covent Garden to rescue it from being leased to Mecca as a Dance Hall for a further five years;410 it began publishing Soviet works under the name Anglo-Soviet;411 it had begun negotiations with Édition Russe who published works by Stravinsky, Rachmaninoff and Prokofiev, and was to see the Sydney branch "boom" in the war years.412

Boosey & Hawkes's Covent Garden venture and its world rights to the operatic works of Richard Strauss (excluding Germany and Italy) placed the company in an ideal position to promote new operatic works. The composer who benefitted the most from this situation was Benjamin Britten. Helen Wallace, in consulting the Boosey & Hawkes hire library records, noted that in the proceeding eighteen months after the premiere of Britten's *Peter Grimes* at Sadler's Wells on June 7, 1945, the opera "had been performed in Stockholm, Antwerp, Basle, Milan, Brno, Vienna, Berlin, Copenhagen and Tanglewood".413 In Wallace's opinion, Ralph Hawkes was a driving force who, had he "lived longer and employed more staff of

409 *Ibid.*: 33.
411 *Ibid.*: 57.
412 *Ibid.*: 58, 163.
413 *Ibid.*: 53.
Heinsheimer's calibre, it is likely he would have achieved his vision of a musical monopoly".414

Benjamin was to play his small part in the making of this Boosey & Hawkes publishing empire, as his involvement in Festivals and as a conductor served a useful function: "In the concert I am conducting next Sunday we are doing pieces by me, Saint-Saëns and Borodine, all from Boosey & Hawkes publications...There is a lot of your stuff in the Festival programme this year. I helped to set the piano syllabus—nuff sed."415 This business trend established in the early 1940s continued with Benjamin consulting the Boosey & Hawkes Toronto catalogue "to make up interesting programmes" at a time when he was guest conductor with the VSO, when he was inaugurating his series of Promenade concerts,416 or when deciding repertoire for the CBRSO.417 Benjamin’s teaching connections were also utilised to the benefit of the company and Ralph Hawkes was quick to send him a set of Bartók’s Mikrokosmos shortly after they had been issued.418

Ralph Hawkes was a strong guiding factor in Benjamin’s musical career. For example, Benjamin’s early interest in setting Negro Spirituals persisted into the 1920s but when he wrote to Ralph Hawkes in 1940 about his Negro Rhapsody (1919), he was told, “a great many of these Spirituals are rather miserable in character and the result does not provide the exciting quality which, I think, Orchestras want here in Rhapsodies”.419 Hawkes then cited Jaromir Weinberger’s Under the Spreading Chestnut Tree as an example of a

414 Ibid.: 47.
415 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, February 6, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
416 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, April 11, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
418 Letter from Ralph Hawkes to Arthur Benjamin, April 16, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
419 Letter from Ralph Hawkes to Arthur Benjamin, February 8, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
"tremendous success" with music that was "never deep but light, inventive and exciting".\textsuperscript{420}

Such correspondence indicated that Benjamin's marketability relied on him being a composer of 'light' music, which was after all, probably based on sound business sense after the international success of \textit{Jamaican Rumba} in the 1930s.\textsuperscript{421} In a letter dated February 19, 1940, Ralph Hawkes requested Benjamin write a new overture for Fabien Sevitsky and the Indianapolis Symphony Orchestra's next season of concerts. The instructions Benjamin received were very precise—a "type of commercial piece we should do very well with" whose "duration should not be longer than eight to nine minutes" and whose character "should be fairly robust", so that if it were successful, it could be "done for Band". Hawkes had identified a market for band and orchestral music in America, and even went so far as to "strongly recommend" Benjamin attend the Music Educators National Conference in Los Angeles on April 1 to assess the potential for himself.\textsuperscript{422} Such communication between composer and publisher was quite frank and to the point with Ralph Hawkes being able to make the following comment about the British première of the above work: "'Prelude to a Holiday' did not go down anything like so well and the notices were rather poor. Quite frankly I do not think this is one of your best pieces".\textsuperscript{423} Hawkes's feelings, however, did not prevent publication and performances of the work,

\textsuperscript{420} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{421} For example, in 1940 he wrote: "It ought to be a 'best-seller'" with regard to the Oboe Concerto and in 1945, news of the completion of an orchestral work \textit{The Red River Jig}, was accompanied with the words: "I really think that it will be a winner, especially on this continent". (Benjamin's comment about his Oboe Concerto appeared in a letter to Leslie Boosey, October 6, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file). \textit{Red River Jig} was published by Boosey & Hawkes Ltd., in 1947 and the quotation was drawn from a letter from Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, December 25, 1945 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file). The \textit{Jamaican Street Songs, Caribbean Dance}, and \textit{From San Domingo}, all published between 1940-6, followed in the wake of \textit{Jamaican Rumba}'s success.

\textsuperscript{422} Letter from Ralph Hawkes to Arthur Benjamin, February 19, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).

\textsuperscript{423} Letter from Ralph Hawkes to Arthur Benjamin, August 12, 1942 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file). Ralph Hawkes was comparing the performance of \textit{Prelude to Holiday} with the recent reception of Leon Goossens's performance of the \textit{Oboe Concerto}. The British première of \textit{Prelude to Holiday} was conducted by Sir Henry J. Wood in the Royal Albert Hall on August 6, 1942 (Arthur Jacobs. \textit{Henry J. Wood: Maker of the Proms}. London: Methuen, 1994: 444).
which had been well received in America and Canada (see footnotes 373–6, page 97).

Boosey & Hawkes managed to publish a steady stream of new works by Benjamin during the war years. Other works published in the Canadian years included educational pieces for piano, *Rainy Day* and *Haunted House* and choral music, *Dirge, Spring* and *Sir Christemas*; the latter compositions may well have been inspired by the high standards of choral singing in competitions such as the Winnipeg Festival that Benjamin described in a BBC interview after his return to England. *Elegiac Mazurka* was written for a collection of piano solos titled *Homage to Paderewski* and was published under the auspices of the New York Public Library and Boosey & Hawkes, with Benjamin’s music appearing alongside piano works by Bartók, Milhaud, Martinu and Eugene Goossens. As well as the orchestral compositions already discussed, Benjamin composed *Praeludium* based on a transcription of Mendelssohn’s *Prelude in B minor, op. 7*. He also composed a *Suite for Flute and Strings by Domenico Scarlatti*, and *The Red River Jig*, that was completed shortly before Christmas 1945 and dedicated to Clare Hawkes. Benjamin informed Ralph Hawkes in a letter dated January 9, 1946 that his arrangement of the jig was based on two versions as performed by a Mr Mulligan and a “country fiddler from Manitoba, one Bob Goulet, who turned out to be half Indian and half French Canadian”. These

---

424 *Rainy Day* was published by Boosey & Hawkes in 1945 and *Haunted House* published by Boosey & Hawkes (Canada), 1945. *Spring* was published in Boosey’s *Modern Festival Series No. 480 in 1942 and Dirge appeared in Boosey’s *Modern Festival Series No. 481 in 1942; Sir Christemas* was published in Boosey & Hawkes’s *Winthrop Rogers Edition of Choral Music for Festivals* in 1943.


426 Ralph Hawkes wrote to Benjamin informing him of the publication and requesting the completion of *Elegiac Mazurka* within a month. Letter from Ralph Hawkes to Arthur Benjamin, July 31, 1941 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file). *Elegiac Mazurka* was published by Boosey & Hawkes Inc. in 1942.

427 Reference to this is made in Ralph Hawkes’s letter to Arthur Benjamin, January 12, 1942 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).

428 The première was given by Benjamin and the CBR Symphony Orchestra on March 8, 1946 (‘CBR Symphony to Premiere Benjamin Work’, CBC Programme Schedule. Week of March 3, 1946).

were all works composed with the demand for melodious, attractive and entertaining music of a certain duration in mind.

When Benjamin wrote to Ralph Hawkes informing him he had started a Symphony, Hawkes replied:

So you have started a Symphony! Well don’t let me deter you but ‘times is ard’. However, I don’t suppose you will complete it for some little time, and I have no doubt that we can swallow it quite effectively when it comes along. I shall look forward to hearing from you as to its progress.430

The Symphony and Viola Sonata stand apart from the other compositions written in Canada with regard to mood and duration. Unlike The Red River Jig, which Benjamin confessed was written “in a very short time” with the last two-thirds completed in four hours,431 progress on the Symphony spanned the years 1939–45. The result was a four-movement work of some forty-four minutes’ duration and his most demanding orchestral composition in terms of large-scale architecture. Benjamin neatly summed up the mood of both works with the words: “neither my Symphony nor my Viola Sonata could be described as witty!”432 On his own admission, the Viola Sonata was “anything but a happy work. The War got into it!”433

The majority of compositions written in Canada fulfilled the demand of his publisher for short, entertaining works that were easily programmed, had a ready market and were attractive to the ear. There were times when this expectation surprised even Benjamin as is evident from his letter to Ralph Hawkes about Prelude to Holiday:

---

430 Letter from Ralph Hawkes to Arthur Benjamin, February 1, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).


432 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Leslie Boosey, August 30, 1944 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).

433 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Leslie Boosey, November 4, 1942 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
“How I have found time, what with having market and house-keeping during my Mother’s illness, and teach and perform, to write a work lasting eleven minutes, I don’t know—and a jolly work too, when one feels so depressed about the news.”

Benjamin was aware that the more serious nature of the Symphony and Viola Sonata would challenge the image of his music so far presented to the public. This concern, however, was not shared by his publishers and Leslie Boosey wrote the following reassuring words regarding the Viola Sonata:

Your surprise at the success of your Sonata amuses me, because so often a composer does not realise the effect that his work will make on the public. Things that appear simple and straightforward to him do not appear in the same way to the public and vice versa. I always think it is a good sign if a composer thinks that his work will not be popular!

This pattern of Benjamin’s reserve and Boosey and Hawkes’s confidence persisted the following year with Benjamin’s fears about the Symphony’s reception expressed in this letter:

Actually, I should like the Symphony to have its first performance in Moscow. Don’t laugh at this. I feel that there it would have an absolutely unprejudiced hearing whereas in London, I have the idea that they always expect me to be funny after the success of The Devil Take Her.

---

434 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, July 2, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).

435 Letter from Leslie Boosey to Arthur Benjamin, March 24, 1943 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).

436 By this stage Benjamin related to Leslie Boosey in a letter dated August 30, 1944 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file) that the third movement was finished and he had hopes of completing the final movement soon though he was yet to find time to score the entire work.

437 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Leslie Boosey, August 30, 1944 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
Leslie Boosey's response again brushed away Benjamin's concerns by disagreeing with his choice of Moscow and saying: "I would like to see it have its first performance at the 'Proms.' or at any rate some outstanding London concert." 438

Despite Benjamin's success as conductor, composer, performer, lecturer and teacher in Canada, his residency there was limited to the war years. By the close of 1944 his work was taking him "more & more down into the U.S.A." and he had received "tentative enquiries from Sydney, Australia, to know if I would consider the Directorship of the State Conservatorium". 439 Benjamin Britten had, like Benjamin, travelled overseas in 1939 but returned to England in 1942 and by the following year had, in Ralph Hawkes words, "gone right to the top". 440 Boosey and Hawkes were obviously optimistic about business in the post-war years and Benjamin's letter of reply dated January 9, 1946 indicated his publisher had decided his future for him by suggesting he return to London. This quotation from the letter indicated the willingness with which he embraced such a suggestion: "Your letter caused much excitement and both Jack and I are still a bit dizzy at its implications. But it is a wonderful feeling to know that I'm still wanted in London". By September, he had once again resumed a teaching position as Piano Professor at the RCM. 441

Canada's response to Benjamin's departure was mixed according to certain sources. Ira Dilworth, the British Columbia Regional Representative of the CBC, wrote to Benjamin expressing both gratitude for work accomplished with the CBRSO and regret at his departure:

438 Letter from Leslie Boosey to Arthur Benjamin, October 25, 1944 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
439 The first quotation was from a letter by Benjamin to Herbert Howells, December 29, 1944 (RCM Library, Herbert Howells papers) and the second from a letter by Benjamin to Leslie Boosey, August 30, 1944 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
440 Letter from Ralph Hawkes to Arthur Benjamin, October 23, 1943 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
441 Letter by Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, January 9, 1946 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file). Student Register (RCM Library).
I realize that you have brought to your work all the wealth of your musical experience. This has shown itself in the skill and sensitiveness with which you have planned your programmes bringing to our listeners beautiful and not often heard selections both from the established classics and from the newer music. You have also shown great discrimination in your choice of assisting artists and you have helped the CBC to give encouragement to many ambitious young musicians.442

As a personal thank you, Ira Dilworth gave Benjamin a late oil sketch by the Canadian artist Emily Carr saying: “I wanted you to have it because during your stay in Canada you have come to understand and love my country.”443 The music critic for the Vancouver Sun, Stanley Bligh, paid tribute to Benjamin’s musical contribution to the city on news of his death in 1960. “Many of the city’s successful piano teachers received advanced training from him. He was the outstanding authority to whom teachers were able to take their problems” as well as being responsible for raising the standards of piano performance and nurturing “the appreciation and understanding of symphonic music”.444

Jean Coulthard voiced her opinion about another factor that may have contributed to Benjamin leaving when she talked of the threat Benjamin’s Promenade concerts posed to the powerful society women who governed the affairs of the VSO:

He got a good orchestra together and many members of the Symphony in it, and many others too. The [Promenade Concerts] were a tremendous success...He did Canadian works, you see, as well. And of course the regular Vancouver Symphony wouldn’t touch a Canadian work for love nor money...And so it became so popular that the Symphony girls, old Amy Buckerfield, and she herself was a perfect dear, but they couldn’t stand Benjamin...they were absolutely death on him because the Symphony was evidently feeling that he was taking away from the Vancouver Symphony and the town wasn’t big enough for two, which of course it would have been,

442 Letter from Ira Dilworth to Arthur Benjamin, April 9, 1946 (Benjamin Estate).
443 Letter from Ira Dilworth to Arthur Benjamin, June 20, 1946 (Benjamin Estate).
plenty big enough in a few years, as the place was growing so fast...but they made it so miserable for him.\textsuperscript{445}

Benjamin's own feelings about the matter seemed to support Coulthard's account. Almost a year before his departure, the conflict, which was described by the \textit{Vancouver Sun} as "long-smouldering differences", saw Benjamin openly accuse the directorate of the VSO of "snobbishness" whose "chief interest seems to be that silliest of symphonies—the society page."\textsuperscript{446} Even years after his return to London, an interesting reference to such differences surfaced in a letter to Coulthard's husband Don Adams:

I laughed when I read that the die-hard goils Buckfield, Rogers & Fell had as you put it 'buried the hatchet'. As you can imagine, I couldn't care less. Anyhow it takes two to bury a hatchet! But you can give them my love and tell them I still think they know damn-all about music.\textsuperscript{447}

The dispute with the Vancouver Symphony was unlikely to have been the sole reason for Benjamin's decision to leave Canada, but it is evident from his penned words to Ralph Hawkes that from as early as Christmas 1945, his mind was already made-up to leave: "I just feel I can't stay on here, as lovely as the surroundings are, and as splendid as the friends I have made are".\textsuperscript{448} Later in life, in an interview with Murray Schafer shortly before his death, he proffered the following explanation: "I wrote practically no works for the stage during my residence in Canada, and this is why I have persisted in returning to London. I am addicted to the stage."\textsuperscript{449}

\textsuperscript{445} Interview with Jean Coulthard by William Bruneau, February 2, 1994 (University of British Columbia archives, 'Coulthard Papers', West Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada, 1994-8).
\textsuperscript{446} Unacknowledged author. 'Tilt at Symphony Here Creates Stir', \textit{Vancouver Sun}, May 31, 1945.
\textsuperscript{447} Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Don Adams, November 26, 1949 (University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard File 1–3).
\textsuperscript{448} Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, December 25, 1945 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
\textsuperscript{449} Murray Schafer. \textit{British Composers in Interview}. London: Faber & Faber, 1963: 49.
When Benjamin emigrated to Canada in 1939, he expected the hardship of the war to cease Boosey and Hawkes's publication of his music. Contrary to his expectations, his publisher maintained a steady stream of new publications and promotions of his music that proved particularly successful in the United States. Most of these were written in response to his publisher's request for works that were short and entertaining, and therefore easy to promote and commercially beneficial to all parties concerned. The other reason why Benjamin may have complied with such requests was because so much of his energy was taken up with new pursuits. Work in areas of film and stage ceased during his residency in Canada, but he had branched out in new ways as conductor, broadcaster and lecturer. His schedule, which also included teaching and piano performance, was, in his own words “Constant—and usually hard-work.” Despite this, he still managed to find time to compose and considerably extended the number of orchestral works in his catalogue. The Symphony stands as a landmark in Benjamin's output, displaying music that is mature in terms of his ease with orchestration, form, the ability to express a wide range of human emotion, dramatic sensibility and timing. His own thoughts on the developmental stages of a composer, which indicated Benjamin felt he had achieved a certain level of experience, were summed up in the following words written in 1944:

Am I right do you think, in believing that composers start out by being influenced by some favorite composer; then they deliberately experiment, want to be clever, smart and original, want to astonish the natives. Eventually they find themselves (if there is anything to find) and both the

---

450 In a letter from Arthur Benjamin to Leslie Boosey on November 20, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file), Benjamin explained that if he were to find time to compose he would “save it up for you until after the war as I don't suppose you are printing anything now.”

influences of the past and their experimentation are eventually sublimated into something which is their very own.\textsuperscript{452}

2.7 Benjamin's return to London

In 1939, Leslie Boosey predicted in a letter to Benjamin that "there will be a great difference between the world you left behind when you went to Vancouver and the one that replaces it all at the end of this war".\textsuperscript{453} While resident in Vancouver, Benjamin had enjoyed a position of prominence in the musical world and his compositions, particularly his orchestral works, had been well received in the USA. Musical life in post-war London was not the easy option for a creative artist who could have maintained a successful and comfortable career as an all-round musician based in Vancouver. To do so was not in Benjamin's nature, as was so clearly explained in his letter to Ralph Hawkes in 1947. "Hell! I wish I had no ambition. I would make an A.1. beachcomber in Bermuda or Jamaica, that is if I didn't like work so much."\textsuperscript{454} The Benjamin who returned to London in 1946 was not the same man who had left in 1939; his confidence had grown, his expectations were higher and London would now prove to be the testing ground for his career as a mature composer.

During the war years, the British musical world may have been aware of Benjamin's developing career as a composer through the increased broadcasting of his compositions and through whatever reading material was available.\textsuperscript{455} He would otherwise have been remembered for his pre-war achievements that included the success of his one-act opera \textit{The Devil Take Her} and the \textit{Jamaican Rumba}. Benjamin's large-scale orchestral work, the Symphony, was yet to receive a première and even before leaving Canada, Benjamin was again voicing his concerns to his publisher about how the music,

\textsuperscript{452} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{453} Letter from Leslie Boosey to Arthur Benjamin, October 20, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
\textsuperscript{454} Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph & Clare Hawkes, August 27, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
\textsuperscript{455} This would have included Boosey and Hawkes's magazine \textit{Tempo}, which began publication in 1939.
with its drama and pathos, would challenge British listeners’ perception of him as a composer of ‘light’ music. Barbirolli’s première of the Symphony at the Cheltenham Festival was still a few years away, leaving Benjamin with time to battle with his fears as is illustrated in this extract from a letter:

It is quite a milestone in my life and will decide me whether I can do the big stuff or not. I don’t mean by what the critics say but by what Barbirolli, and I, myself think.

It is obvious that one is not allowed to be versatile in this country—that is to be able to write both light and serious music—as one can in the States. I am afraid that here I am branded with ‘Jamaican Rumba’ and ‘Devil Take Her’. We shall see.456

The above quotation revealed not only the level of importance he placed on the Symphony, but also the comparisons he was now able to make between music making in Great Britain and America. For the first years of his residency back in Britain, he was not only aware of a possible mindset that was likely to pre-judge his Symphony but was obviously encountering very set views concerning music from the “other side” of the Atlantic. Having already affronted the ignorance and “snobbery” of the social ladies affiliated with the VSO openly in the press, he now set about educating the ignorant British. This he did in an article for the RCM magazine entitled ‘Some Aspects in Canada and the U.S.A.’, specifically written for those “who take a supercilious, snooty attitude to music “over there”. They, as a rule, have never crossed the Atlantic. They are too many.”457 His account was by no means written with rose-coloured glasses, but it did single out the quality of the children’s choirs in Winnipeg and “piano classes, especially in Winnipeg and Vancouver, which compare

456 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph & Clare Hawkes, August 27, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence File).
more than favourably with any I have heard in the 'old country'. Of America, he acknowledged "certain aspects" that he considered "unstable and still in the melting-pot" but were nonetheless "vastly outweighed by a splendid enthusiasm for and a sincere love of good music". He ended with the closing prophecy: "It will be crowned one day with the arrival of a great American composer."

Benjamin’s new musical life in London was full of challenges and inevitable comparisons between music making in America and Britain. In a letter written to Heinsheimer of the New York branch of Boosey & Hawkes in 1946, he made the following complaint: "The orchestral playing in London is disappointing. The soloists in the orchestra are super but the team work is not like one gets in the U.S.A." And of the violist Frederick Riddle, who performed the Viola Sonata with Benjamin at the Wigmore Hall recital organised by Boosey & Hawkes on October 9, 1946, he wrote: "Riddle played it quite well but, like most English players is frightened to put enough sentiment into Music. So the critics found it 'clever and effective.' I think it is a bit more than that." Benjamin’s frustrations in the same letter spilled over to Ralph Hawkes, saying, "I still love London—the grandest place in the world—but, oh God, what a lot of stick-in-the-muddery one comes up against. And there is quite a lot at B.&.H. when you are not there." Benjamin’s grievances during these early years surfaced strongly again in a letter to Ernest Chapman of Boosey & Hawkes, London dated March 8, 1947, who had failed to make any mention of his Viola Sonata in a Tempo review of a concert:

---

458 Ibid.: 90.
459 Ibid.: 94.
460 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Heinsheimer, November 17, 1946 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
462 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, December 3, 1946 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
463 Ibid.
Diplomacy would not appear to be one of your attributes or accomplishments, nor is it one of mine. So I will come to my point. No one is more aware than myself that the Bloch quartette played on that occasion was quite overwhelming, and, indeed, made that concert a real occasion. But I still do not think that my work is quite so insignificant as to warrant its being ignored by even so eminent a critic as yourself. Perhaps if I tell you that Primrose has given it about 60 performances on his tours of Canada, N. America and S. America, and, in view of the success he had with it, made it the centrepiece of his first Carnegie Hall (that is in New York) recital—Mr Ralph Hawkes was present at that recital—you will realise why I have the temerity to wonder at your ignoring it. Unless, like so many others here in London, you also think that there is little activity outside the British Isles, or that, if there is, it has little significance musically.464

The restrictions Benjamin felt from his casting as a ‘light music’ composer was once again referred to in his closing remarks in this rather forthright letter.

As to an article on my work, I really do not know whom to suggest to write it. But you should know. As long as it is someone who realises that I do not only write Comedy Overtures and Jamaican Rhumbas!!

Although Benjamin’s new life back in London obviously had its frustrations, his composing career was not without its successes. By December 1946, Benjamin was able to inform Ralph Hawkes that Primrose’s recording of the Viola Sonata had sold eight thousand copies and only a few months later, Tempo magazine reported “twenty-nine leading American orchestras” were performing his orchestral works that season.465

Jamaican Rumba’s popularity

Benjamin’s indignation over his music having been ignored by the Boosey & Hawkes employee’s article in Tempo, touches on what he perceived as a ‘snobbish’ attitude by certain people in British music circles of events in North America and elsewhere. This opinion was more fully voiced in his article ‘Some Aspects of Music in Canada and the U.S.A.’, The Royal College of Music Magazine Vol. XXXIV, No. 3 (October 1948): 89–94.
continued unabated and Benjamin seemed ever hopeful of producing more Jamaican folk-song arrangements that could sell.

I anticipate quite a success for 'The Red River Jig' the new 'Caribbean Dance' and for a song I have just done 'Creole Lullaby'. The melody of which I took down from the singing of the same young Jamaican from whom I got the Rhumba tune & who is now in London...I am sure, if it is well handled (as I am confident it will be) that it can 'go places' on your side.466

The phrase "on your side" in the above quotation revealed Benjamin was not simply writing with the British or European market in mind. In August 1947, he reported to Ralph Hawkes that he had almost completed a new orchestral work *North American Square Dance*.467 This was composed along much the same lines as *Cotillon*—another suite of folksong arrangements, but this time using “Canadian and American fiddle tunes”. Benjamin predicted the music "ought to go down very well in the States and I suggest that it would be better to issue it there rather than in England".468

Immediately upon his return, Benjamin's collaboration with Muir Mathieson was re-established and he commenced work on music for two films: *The Cumberland Story* (dir. Humphrey Jennings. Crown Film Unit. 1947) and *Master of Bankdam* (dir. Walter Forde. Holbein. 1947).469 The first was a documentary on coal mining, with limited use of music. The second film was an adaptation of Thomas Armstrong's novel tracing the lives of a Yorkshire family's ownership of a mill in Victorian times. Benjamin's score attracted the notice of

---

466 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Mr Heinsheimer, May 4, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).

467 Published by Boosey & Hawkes Ltd. in 1951.

468 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph & Clare Hawkes, August 27, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).

469 Humphrey Jennings (1907–50) specialized in documentaries where his experimental approach to montage cinema revealed his early interests in literature, poetry, painting, photography, modern art theory and theatre design. He directed films for the GPO Film Unit and the Crown Film Unit, and the commentary-less film *Listen to Britain* (1942) is often noted for its imaginative use of sounds and images. (Julian Petley, *Jennings, Humphrey [1907–1950]*, *Directors in British and Irish Cinema*. Robert Murphy (ed.). BFI Publishing, 2006: 325.)
Hans Keller, one of Britain's first serious critics of film music, whose writings will be examined more closely in chapter three. Benjamin's score for this film was similar in technique and approach to his scores written in the earlier pre-war film period. The addition of an aria *The Fire of Your Love* sung by Maria Var, was, according to Andrew Youdell, "an attempt to provide a hit tune of the type then in vogue in 1940s melodramas".\(^{470}\)

Working in the film industry brought its trials and tribulations, as was so clearly expressed by Benjamin with regard to the film *Master of Bankdam* in this letter: "I'm at work on a big film, but oh! the politics and prima-donnaism of that world. Still it's a good way to make some money. But it's hard to take."\(^{471}\) Despite the difficulties encountered, Benjamin was to conclude that this was "a good score, but they don't 'dub' as well as they do in the States".\(^{472}\) Work on his next film was not a particularly gratifying experience, judging from his correspondence with Ralph Hawkes. *An Ideal Husband*, a 1947 London Film Productions release, was an adaptation of Oscar Wilde's play, produced and directed by Sir Alexander Korda. Korda focused on creating a lavish feast for the eye in terms of costumes and sets but Benjamin proved to be at odds with him regarding the music.\(^{473}\)

I'm having my troubles with Korda, who has no knowledge or feeling for music. It looks as though I shall have only 15 minutes of music to write, for which I get £800. That's all very nice, but had I had my way I could have made a grand score. I wanted to use my own Waltzes, Polkas, Galops etc of

\(^{471}\) Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, December 3, 1946 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
\(^{472}\) Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph & Clare Hawkes, August 27, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
\(^{473}\) The visual lavishness of the costume design was used as the focus for one promotion venture reported in *Today's Cinema*, Vol. LXIX, No. 5571 (November 14, 1947): 8. "What has proved a traffic-stopping innovation has been arranged between London Film Productions and Marshalls and Snelgrove's of Oxford Street. The whole of the Oxford Street front of this store has been devoted to an exhibition of the gowns specially designed by Cecil Beaton for Korda's Technicolor production of 'An Ideal Husband'."
the period—ideal for an artificial comedy—but K. insists on using Johann Strauss. We have however dissuaded him from using the 'Blue Danube'!!474

Benjamin’s language, when referring to Korda, deteriorated as work progressed on the film until we have the words: “Korda is a fair cow (as we say in Australia) to work with”.475 It would also appear that the time spent composing “some very stylish ‘pastiches’ of Johann Strauss, Offenbach, Mendelssohn and Sullivan, which seemed to suit the Oscar Wilde artificiality very well”, was wasted, as they were never used in the film.476 Korda’s wish to use the music of Johann Strauss, was fulfilled, with the film’s grand ballroom scene featuring Johann Strauss’s *Voices of Spring* and *Tales from the Vienna Woods*. Andrew Youdell drew attention to the additional use of a rare work by Elgar, a minuet from the stage play *Beau Brummell* (1928).477 A music box arrangement of a well known Edwardian tune *After the Ball* accompanies the film’s opening titles and is followed by a *Hyde Park Galop* for the opening scene. Boosey & Hawkes published two extracts from the film score—*Waltz and Hyde Park Galop* (1947) which was performed in concerts of ‘light music’ orchestral programmes.478 Benjamin’s difficulties with Korda may account for this rather unremarkable film score of which Youdell was particularly critical and said: “On the whole it appears the composer is more concerned with space filling and pastiche than making an attempt to match the author’s epigrams or comment on the twists in the plot.”479

Ralph Hawkes, sensing Benjamin’s frustration with the film world, encouraged him to write a new work for the celebrated American oboist Mitchell Miller. Miller, he explained, had just

---

474 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph & Clare Hawkes, August 27, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
475 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, September 21, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
476 Ibid.
478 Benjamin was invited to conduct these in a programme of light music by the BBC on December 31, 1947 with the Theatre Orchestra. (BBC Written Archives, Artists: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1938–89.)
recorded Cimarosa for Keynote recordings, and a new composition would act as "a diversion from the film music writing, in which you seem so deeply engaged." As a result, Benjamin turned again to 18th century sources by arranging music for oboe and string orchestra, which was eventually completed in 1950 under the title *Divertimento on Themes by Gluck*. Benjamin's compositional output for concert use between his arrival back in England until the première of his Symphony in June 1948, was not substantial. It amounted to the completion of the orchestral work *North American Square Dance*, whose manuscript bore the inscription "London 1948"; a string orchestra work titled *Ballade*, finished in August 1947, whose first performance by the Boyd Neel Orchestra was broadcast on the BBC on February 6, 1948; a set of ten *Études Improvisées* for piano that were never published (written by March 1947); and a couple of Jamaican folk-song arrangements (see page 117). Another reason for Benjamin's small compositional output was the energy he had devoted to his now ailing mother. Millicent, a staunch supporter of her son's career, had, between the years 1942–8, suffered five strokes before she died on March 20, 1948 of a cerebral haemorrhage.

Benjamin composed music for one more film during the period 1946–8, entitled *Steps of the Ballet* (dir. Muir Mathieson. Crown Film

---

480 Letter from Ralph Hawkes to Arthur Benjamin, September 29, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
481 Published by Boosey & Hawkes Ltd. in 1952.
482 Manuscript with Boosey & Hawkes Ltd. London.
483 Ballade was published by Boosey & Hawkes Ltd. in 1951. Benjamin wrote the following in a letter to Ralph and Clare Hawkes dated August 27, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file): "I have written a 'Ballade' for Strings. Boyd Neel asked me for a work. He wanted me to send it to him to play in Australia, but I couldn't finish it. Also I am on the verge of finishing the 'North American Square Dance'". Details of the work's première can be read in the Programme Index-Composers 1945–54 (BBC Written Archives).
485 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, April 5, 1948 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file). Millicent Benjamin's death certificate. Benjamin explained to Ralph Hawkes that he "spent as much time with her as possible, which made life for me pretty hard going". The substantial fees he was now able to command from writing film music were evidently much needed, as was the request to Ralph Hawkes in the same letter for his remaining dollars to be sent to London, to help pay for his mother's "pretty staggering" nursing expenses (Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, April 5, 1948 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
Unit. 1948). This was a thirty minute educational film produced by the Crown Film Unit with funding from The British Council, and was to be the second of a trilogy. Two years earlier, Muir Mathieson had secured support from The Ministry for Education to make the first film of the series *Instruments of the Orchestra* (dir. Muir Mathieson. Crown Film Unit. 1948). Benjamin Britten completed the score which was performed by Dr Malcolm Sargent conducting the London Symphony Orchestra. A third film was planned for the series, *Voices of the Opera*, but because of a funding shortfall it was never made.

John Huntley, part of Muir Mathieson’s team working on *Steps of the Ballet*, described his main job as being a “liaise between the film world...and people who weren't very familiar with the film side.”

Huntley considered this film important from a musical perspective because it featured approximately twelve minutes of uninterrupted ballet music and filmed the composer at the piano during a few brief seconds of the rehearsal. Performed by the Philharmonia orchestra, the score is simple in construction and described by Benjamin as “a bright Suite of six short dances”. It is beautifully orchestrated like many of his other orchestral works of similar length, for example, *Cotillon* and *North American Square Dance*.

Huntley worked closely with Benjamin on editing the piano recordings needed in the first part of the film where the ballet was being rehearsed. He recalled in his interview that Benjamin, in the film world, was “very much part of the team...and he and Andrée Howard [choreographer] worked closely together”. Of other composers working in the film industry, Huntley was not always so complimentary.

---

486 John Huntley interview with the author, February 14, 2002. This would often involve showing a composer cuts of the film and helping him measure the sections requiring music.

487 The film started with Robert Helpmann introducing viewers to the various positions and steps learnt by dancers which are the components of the various sequences that create a ballet. Helpmann then explained the roles that others—the costume and set designers, the choreographer Andrée Howard (1910-68) and the composer, played in the ballet production.

488 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, June 12, 1948 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
There were two categories of people in those days. There were people very much established in the concert hall who were being almost persuaded by Muir, cajoled by Muir into writing for movies and who wanted a lot of backup and a lot of explanation about how it would work and how it would fit in with the sound effects and the music and what would happen and so on. People like Walton, Bliss, Arnold Bax—who was very difficult and hated every minute of it really. John Ireland who didn't like it either. I would have been very much a sort of buffer between them and the studio in those days...There were these concert guys who didn't know anything about movies...and then there were a team of what I'd call professional film music people who understood everything about the technique of movies and film and Arthur Benjamin was one who I would say totally embraced film technique and understood it completely whereas a man like Arnold Bax or John Ireland didn't have the foggiest idea, they didn't know what they were doing.489

The experience of working on a film such as *Steps of the Ballet* (1948) seemed to have been an agreeable one for Benjamin. He related, in a letter to Ralph Hawkes, how the dancers were "delighted with my stuff" and indicated his willingness to compose more for dance seeing as he appeared to "have a flair for Ballet music".490 He wasted no time in putting his enthusiasm into action by informing Hawkes in the same letter that he had begun a *Passacaglia Drammatica* for orchestra. This was being written partly on the advice of Jack Henderson, who was now working at Boosey & Hawkes, to fulfill a need for a sixteen or seventeen minute work in their catalogue, and partly to create "an abstract ballet, with the hope that Fred Ashton will do something with it on the lines of his 'Symphonic Variations' which is so fine."491

On June 30, 1948, the long awaited premiere of the Symphony took place at the Cheltenham Festival in Gloucestershire, performed by Sir John Barbirolli and the Hallé Orchestra. Benjamin had already referred to the work as a "milestone", and the public’s response was

490 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, April 5, 1948 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
491 Ibid.
to challenge the musical world’s perception of Benjamin as a composer of only ‘light music’. For here was a large-scale four movement work lasting some forty-four minutes, canvassing a wide range of human emotion from despair and tragedy to compassion and elation. Benjamin summed up the music’s reception at its première in a letter to Jean Coulthard.

My Symphony had a real resounding success. Critics & musicians both old & young seemed very moved by it and the audience really went to town. It is down for performances in Manchester (twice) Liverpool, Sheffield, Sweden & Holland already. Vaughan Williams wrote me a marvellous letter the next day and has accepted the dedication.

John F. Russell’s programme notes for the première described the work as “amazingly well-knit, with a plan that arises from inner necessity”. Just exactly what that ‘inner necessity’ was is never fully spelled out by Benjamin and the following lines from the programme notes only give the audience a general indication of the inspiration behind the work.

[The Symphony is not in any way to be regarded as ‘programme’ music. By this he obviously means that it is not to be related to any specific incident or event: he qualifies his declaration by observing that: ‘I only mean my music to be moods, and I hope that the Symphony reflects the feelings—the despairs and hopes—of the times in which I live.’

We do know, though, that Benjamin’s labours on the Symphony lasted more or less the entire length of WWII and he was not known to have ever talked with any degree of intimacy about his experiences in the Great War during his life. Months after the première he gave
some insight into the emotional intensity that guided the Symphony by saying to Jean Coulthard: "One can but put sincerely onto paper that which one feels deep down". Such sentiments meant something to people in post-war Britain, with one friend, the film producer Basil Wright, confessing he was "deeply and profoundly upset". For Benjamin, these performances were a time of serious self-assessment of himself as a composer and he travelled to Manchester and Liverpool to hear subsequent performances of his work by Barbirolli and the Hallé in the February of 1949.

I was disappointed in certain passages when I heard them in Cheltenham & wondered if I had lost my usual cunning in scoring for a big orchestra. Well, to my great relief, on hearing it in the north I found it came off completely, so that it was the bad acoustic in the Cheltenham Hall which caused the trouble. The press was excellent, but what gave me great pleasure was the fact that that work says something to an audience, for on all the occasions I had a real ovation and prolonged cheering. Still better many of the players went out of their way to tell me how much they liked playing it.

Others, such as the critic for the Manchester Guardian, made the effort to hear the Symphony on more than once occasion and part of his evaluation was reproduced in the *Vancouver Sun*:

> His symphonic thinking is genuine; it comes naturally, is distinctive, and suggests future far-reaching possibilities when his inspiration will have burned with still more intensity. He shows that he has the gift of melodic invention. His picturesque passages have a wide scope, and his climaxes arise spontaneously out of the dynamic energy of the music.

This intense re-assessment of Benjamin as a composer carried through into Scott Goddard's article 'The Music of Arthur Benjamin',

---

496 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Jean Coulthard, April 25, 1949 (University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard file 1-3).
497 Letter from Basil Wright to Arthur Benjamin, July 1, 1948 (Benjamin Estate).
499 Unacknowledged author. 'Arthur Benjamin is Acclaimed in Britain', *Vancouver Sun*, April 2, 1949.
written as a prelude to the Symphony's first London performance scheduled for broadcast on August 6, 1954. In this article, Goddard regarded the Symphony as a crucial work in defining Benjamin's own "individual style" for which "a single hearing was not enough". He continued on to say: "It gives the impression of being the work of a man deeply involved in considerations of great import, aware of the human dilemma and striving to come to some feasible, helpful conclusion about it."  

The première of Benjamin's second one-act opera Prima Donna followed closely after the success of his Symphony. The score of Prima Donna had been awaiting performance since its completion in August 1933, and Benjamin himself was now to conduct the première at the Fortune Theatre, London on February 23, 1949. A preview of the opera was given at an event called the Opera Circle where Benjamin made a record of a brief conversation with the author and critic Edward Dent:

[O]ld Dent asked me why 'Prima Donna' had had no performance. I said 'You tell me'. He asked me if I was 'in the Sadler's Wells set'. I told him that if it were necessary to be in a 'set' to get a work performed, then God help British composers. What an old dolt he is—very gaga these days!  

Benjamin's indignation over Dent's comment revealed the extent of his own naivety concerning musical politics in London. Dent was most likely having a slight 'dig' at those belonging to the circle dominating British opera at that time which largely centred on the success and further promotion of Britten's operas.

Prima Donna was well received with Benjamin able to report back to his publisher about "a very definite success. The public adored it and there is not a dissenting voice in the press". It is

501 Date of completion was written on the manuscript at Boosey & Hawkes Ltd. London.
important to note too, that Kenneth Wright of the BBC was very warm in his praise and said "I loved every minute of 'Prima Donna'...BRAVISSIMO!"504

The success of the Symphony and *Prima Donna* was a turning point in Benjamin’s composing career in England and the disgruntled comments surfacing in his earlier letters soon after his return, start to modify. He conceded to Ralph Hawkes “that the promotion Department do not so badly for me on the whole!!”, and by August of 1949, was sounding quite satisfied with his achievements:505

My Symphony was broadcast last night, conducted by Charles Groves from Manchester, and it had an astonishingly good performance. Listening, as I did, in cold blood, for the fifth time, I have decided that it is quite a work and quite exciting.

I know you will be interested to hear that my last P.R.S. cheque was for £858 while the largest previously was £343. And the B&H royalties £252 (previous one £91). Not so bad. In fact my income this year on music alone was £2100. I did no films. I must be one of the few who can live on composition. Damn lucky. It is what I want to do.506

True to the above letter, Benjamin had completed *Steps of the Ballet* by April 1948 and would not work in the film industry again until 1953, when he scored *Conquest of Everest* (dir. Thomas Stobart. Countryman Films).507 His energies were focused on composing for the stage and concert hall, and he was soon to become absorbed in his third opera, *A Tale of Two Cities*.508

The idea to adapt Charles Dickens’s novel *A Tale of Two Cities* into a three-act opera was that of Benjamin’s friend Sidney P.

---

504 Letter from Kenneth Wright to Arthur Benjamin, March 5, 1949 (Benjamin Estate).
506 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, August 2, 1949 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
507 Benjamin wrote in a letter dated April 5, 1948 to Ralph Hawkes: “I have finished my music for the ballet film” (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
508 Published by Boosey & Hawkes Ltd. 1954.
Waddington (1869–1953). Benjamin highly valued Waddington’s advice and described him as a “very important person behind the scenes at Covent Garden, in the great singing days of Melba, Tetrazzini [Tetrazzini] and Caruso. And what he doesn’t know about opera is not worth knowing”.

Cedric Cliffe, Benjamin’s second cousin, was responsible for the libretto which fired the composer’s imagination to the point that he admitted “I can’t keep away from it”. Indeed, Benjamin seemed to live and breathe the lives of his stage characters, writing the line “excuse me while Sydney Carlton [Carton] drugs Charles Darnay in the prison cell!” at the end of a letter to Jean Coulthard.

Work progressed quickly on the score and when Benjamin was close to its completion date on February 17, 1950, he explained the reason for his speed was that “never before have I felt so impelled to write, and it is not ‘hurried’. Would you call me conceited? Perhaps you will think I am if I tell you that I am quite sure that this opera is ‘the goods’.”

Benjamin’s confidence would appear justified when only a few months later, *A Tale of Two Cities* was one of four operas to receive a British Arts Council award with the promise of a performance at the Festival of Britain the following year.

The news understandably filled his publishers with high hopes for the opera with Ralph Hawkes’s responding letter saying:

the publicity will be excellent and there is no knowing just what will come as a result of it...It seems strange that you should crack the nut with an

---

509 As mentioned in the ‘notes for broadcasting news’ at the BBC (BBC Written Archives, R27/395 Music General, Opera: A Tale of Two Cities 1952–3).
511 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, August 2, 1949 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
512 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Don Adams, November 26, 1949 (University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard File 1–3).
513 This is written in ink on the last page of the manuscript (British Library, deposit 1996/13, Box 1, Packets 1–4).
514 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, January 8, 1950 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
515 Benjamin wrote to Ralph Hawkes with the news on May 27, 1950 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file). The other three operas awarded a prize were *Dido and Aeneas* by Karl Rankl, *Wat Tyler* by Alan Bush and *Beatrice Cenci* by Berthold Goldschmidt.
opera when we have been trying for two or three years to get you in with the ballet.\footnote{Letter from Ralph Hawkes to Arthur Benjamin, June 6, 1950 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).}

Benjamin’s composing career was reaching new heights. In addition to these events already mentioned, his Viola Concerto (an orchestrated version of the Viola Sonata) was premièred at the 1949 Cheltenham Festival.\footnote{Frederick Riddle replaced William Primrose as the soloist on this occasion. Benjamin wrote of Primrose’s forthcoming performance in a letter to Jean Coulthard, January 16, 1949 (University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard File 1–3). Donald Mitchell’s review of the Cheltenham Festival referred to Mr. Riddle’s performance. Donald Mitchell. 'The Cheltenham Festival', Music Survey Vol. II, No. 2 (Autumn 1949): 96.} His music was regularly broadcast by the BBC for which he gave the occasional interview and he was about to embark on a tour of Australia.\footnote{The BBC broadcast cards showed that for the years 1949–50 the following works were broadcast the following number of times in this order of appearance: \textit{Jamaican Street Songs} 2; \textit{Light Music Suite} 4; \textit{Nightingale Lane} 1; \textit{From San Domingo} 2; \textit{Red River Jig} 1; \textit{Jamaican Rumba} 15; \textit{Caribbean Dance} 5; \textit{Mattie Rag} 2; \textit{Oboe Concerto} 1; \textit{Symphony} 1; \textit{Jan} 1; \textit{Linstead Market} 1; \textit{Prima Donna} 3; \textit{Cotillion} 3; \textit{Before Dawn} 2; \textit{Shepherd’s Holiday} 2; \textit{Wind’s Work} 1; \textit{Overture to an Italian Comedy} 2; \textit{Sonata for Viola} & \textit{Piano} 1; \textit{Siciliana} 1; \textit{Man} & \textit{Woman} 1; \textit{Praeludium} 1; \textit{The Devil Take Her} 1. (BBC Written Archives, Programme Index-Composers 1945–54).}

When Benjamin’s ship arrived in Sydney on August 20, 1950, he was treated with celebrity-like status, as explained in his letter to Ralph Hawkes: “I have just managed to come up for air after the not-so-tender administration of the publicity hounds! Really it is worse here than in the U.S.A. But I have had a wonderful welcome since I got here on Aug 24.”\footnote{Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, September 2, 1950 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).} He faced a challenging schedule organised by the ABC. A piano concerto \textit{Concerto quasi una fantasia} had been commissioned for a total of four performances in Sydney and Melbourne with Benjamin as pianist and Eugene Goossens, his fellow student from RCM days, conducting.\footnote{Concerto \textit{quasi una fantasia} was published by Boosey & Hawkes Ltd. in 1952. Concerts were listed in an undated note concerning fees for the ABC concert engagements on Benjamin’s 1950 tour by R. G. Gifford (Australian National Archives, SP 613/1/0).} A chamber music recital, coinciding with Benjamin’s birthday on September 18, was organised

---

\textit{British Composers — Arthur Benjamin}, Recorded April 27, 1949 (National Sound Archive, reference ICE0000 559 and 560) and ‘Me, the Composer and You’ - interview with Robert Tredinnick. Transmitted May 6, 1949 on London - General Overseas Service (BBC Written Archives).
by the ABC in the Sydney Town Hall. Details of the programme and artists, which included Musica Viva Players, were as follows:


Sonatina for Violin and Piano. Solo violin: Edward Cochman

Songs with Piano - mezzo soprano: Muriel Luyk
   a) To Phillis, Milking her Flock......Poem: William Drummond
   b) Before Dawn ......................Poem: Walter de la Mare
   c) Shepherd's Holiday................Poem: Elinor Wylie
   d) Wind's Work........................Poem: T. Sturge Moore

Sonata for Viola and Piano
Elegy: Waltz: Toccata       Solo viola: Robert Pikler

*********Interval*********

Sonatina for 'cello and piano
Preamble: Minuet: March Solo cello: Theo Salzman

Three Impressions—Voice and String Quartet
Hedgerow
Calm Sea and Mist.............Poems by William Sharp
The Wasp
Mezzo Soprano: Muriel Luyk

Pastoral Fantasy—String Quartet

Caribbean Pieces for Two Pianos—
   a) Caribbean Dance
   b) Mattie Rag............
   c) Cookie....................Two Jamaican Street Songs
   d) From San Domingo
   e) Jamaican Rhumba
Benjamin’s music was, in general, well received in Australia, though there were a few voices of dissent such as the critic for *The Canon* who conceded: “the music of the evening was certainly not bad”, then added: “I could sense little more than contrivance and artifice, even in the lovely songs with string quartet.”

The Concerto likewise met with both praise and criticism with Martin Long making this observation:

> Benjamin is never at a loss for a piquant touch of colour to keep interest alive, yet when one looks behind the showmanship, one cannot help feeling that each of the concerto’s movements outruns its staying power. The theatrical introduction, the broad slow section, the airy scherzo and the final passacaglia (the best movement) all start arrestingly but tend to lose grip as they proceed.

Benjamin gave a number of interviews while he was in Australia. In an article for the *Australian Musical News and Digest* he complimented the musical advances of his homeland but left them with a challenge to do more to support its living composers: “to be a mere music-loving nation is not enough—it is only through the creation of fine music that the world will learn to rank us as a musical nation.”

His personal level of confidence and belief in himself as a composer at the time of this tour appeared to have been considerable, judging from the opening comments made in an ABC radio interview.

> To be a failure as a musician is one of the worst things that can happen to a man. There is something about a musician who’s failed which makes me

---

521 ABC chamber music recital programme (Australian National Archives. SP 1011/2, Item 208).
524 ‘Only the Creation of Music can make us a Musical Nation’, *Australian Musical News and Digest*, October 2, 1950: 34.
uncomfortable when I meet and talk with one. They are so bitter, so jealous. And they put on a façade; never admit they've failed. On the contrary, they talk of quite imaginary successes. But to be a success, even a near success, is grand. Even if you don't get to the absolute top, there are a couple of layers underneath the top which give you a pleasant life and a good living.525

While Benjamin was on tour in Australia, his friend and colleague, Ralph Hawkes died suddenly at his home in Connecticut, U.S.A. The importance of this relationship has already been referred to earlier in this chapter, but perhaps no correspondence summed it up better than the two simple lines written by Benjamin only months before Hawkes' death: "So you will see that your young protégé is gaining in fame. I wish you were here to 'protéger' him."526 Ralph Hawkes had indeed been a crucial factor in shaping and building Benjamin's musical career which was gradually going from strength to strength, and it is interesting to note that Benjamin's Australian tour was to be his "swan-song as a pianist" with his energy thereafter focused on composition.527

The Boosey & Hawkes publishing empire continued to grow with the annexing of the Edition Russe catalogue in 1947. In the years immediately following Ralph Hawkes's death, Helen Wallace explained Leslie Boosey's need to reorganise the office, "hinting that Ralph had been over-investing", and Geoffrey Hawkes's (Ralph's brother) instrument manufacturing side of the company was in financial trouble.528 Despite these problems, Boosey & Hawkes's future seemed assured during the 1950s. Andrzej Panufnik had joined their list of published composers that now included works by Shostakovich, Prokofiev and Stravinsky, and younger emerging

525 Arthur Benjamin. Radio script for 'ABC Guest of Honour'. Broadcast on October 15, 1950 on 2FC [National Archive of Australia, series no. SP369/1].
527 Paul Affelder. Notes on Everest LP recording of Concertino and Quasi una Fantasia by Crowson and Benjamin.
composers such as Messiaen, Boulez, Stockhausen, Ligeti, Henze, Berio, Nono and Dallapiccola. Britten in the 1950s was producing *The Turn of the Screw, The Prince of the Pagodas, Gloriana* and *A Midsummer Night's Dream*. By 1954, Helen Wallace noted that Boosey consulted Britten for “practical suggestions in writing”; a measure of the esteem Boosey held for this composer and the degree of Britten’s influence in company matters.\(^{529}\)

Between the years 1950–2, Benjamin composed the *Divertimento on Themes by Gluck* on the long sea voyage to Australia.\(^{530}\) He also completed a collection of educational piano pieces for children called *Brumas Tunes*, the orchestral works *North American Square Dance* and *The Red River Jig*, and *Heritage* for voice and piano.\(^{531}\) Benjamin’s planned *Passacaglia Drammatica* for orchestra never materialised and it would be natural enough to surmise that these sketches were absorbed into the *Piano Concerto*’s Passacaglia movement.

Another work completed at this time was the ballet *Orlando’s Silver Wedding*, which was premièred in the Amphitheatre of the Pleasure Gardens, Battersea Park at the Festival of Britain in May 1951.\(^{532}\) Andrée Howard, who had collaborated with Benjamin for the film *Steps of the Ballet*, again acted as choreographer. Décor and costumes were by the author and creator of the then famous *Orlando the Marmalade Cat* children’s books, Kathleen Hale, and the principal dancers Harold Turner (Orlando) and Sally Gilmore (Grace), appeared by arrangement with Sadler’s Wells and the Theatre Royal respectively.\(^{533}\) Hans Keller complimented the composer for being “at his most brilliant and wittiest”, and for writing music “which only some Frenchmen could have produced with equally economical

\(^{529}\) *Ibid.*: 94.

\(^{530}\) This was composed “between Bombay and Sydney” as indicated on the manuscript which is lodged with Boosey & Hawkes, London.

\(^{531}\) Boosey & Hawkes published *Brumas Tunes* in 1950 and *Heritage* in 1952.

\(^{532}\) The ballet is unpublished and a manuscript of the vocal score is lodged with the British Library (MS MUS 253).

\(^{533}\) Programme (Personal memorabilia of Joseph Horowitz).
wealth". Accounts of the commercial success of the ballet appeared to vary. Kathleen Hale’s autobiography claimed attendance was practically nil resulting in the production’s closure after “only three or four performances”. Joseph Horovitz’s memories though, are at odds with Hale’s. Horovitz conducted most of the performances, of which there were two daily, and he remembered a much longer run of about ten weeks with only two shows cancelled because of rain. His memories of the ballet, recalled in an interview, included a rough account of the musical forces employed:

There was just sheer joy from beginning to end you know—as soon as the first note. And the orchestra consisted of marvellous players that had somehow been handpicked, I don’t know why. Cecil Aronovitz was leading the violas. When I say leading the violas, there were probably only two violas, but you know, it was a band of twenty-four which is nice. You can make a nice noise. Alan Civil who’s the greatest English horn player...but he was playing the tuba.

Nineteen fifty three was to be another important year in Benjamin’s composing career for a number of reasons. None of the four operas to win the Arts Council award in 1950 was performed at The Festival of Britain but three broadcast performances of A Tale of Two Cities were now scheduled for the BBC’s Third Programme on April 17, 18 and 20. Dennis Arundell, who was involved in the first production of Prima Donna, was employed again as producer for A Tale of Two Cities with Benjamin conducting the Royal Philharmonic Orchestra. Benjamin’s own feelings about the approaching broadcast were expressed by the words: “I am looking forward with trepidation to this first hearing of our opera. One never knows if an opera is a success until the curtain falls on the final note, and even then only

534 Keller’s critique also drew attention to the unfortunate use of a loudspeaker—deemed necessary for the outdoor setting of the performance, that had compromised clarity and quality of sound. (Hans Keller. ‘Ballet at Battersea. Arthur Benjamin’s ‘Orlando’s Silver Wedding”, Music Survey Vol. IV, No. 1 (October 1951): 360.)
time and posterity decide." Interest in this opera appeared to have been far-reaching and RTF Paris requested a live relay for the final performance on April 20. Ralph Vaughan Williams attended the rehearsals and wrote to Benjamin after the broadcasts, saying: "I listened with extraordinary interest to the broadcast of your Opera. It will be a scandal if it is not now put on the stage." Ernest Newman, critic for the *Sunday Times*, wrote: "All in all, *A Tale of Two Cities* is an event of major importance in the development of modern British opera, the work of a composer with undeniably the root of the operatic matter in him." Benjamin indicated in a letter to the Australian music critic Fred Blanks, that there had been "no fewer than fourteen Opera houses" from overseas enquiring about the work, but there would still be a four year wait before his dream of seeing the opera staged was realised.

In the summer of 1953, Benjamin completed an unusual score titled *Concerto for Harmonica and Orchestra* for the well-known harmonica player Larry Adler (1914–2001). While still writing, Benjamin sent part of the Concerto to Adler for comments on its playability. Adler replied that there were no playing problems: "Matter of fact you have so well understood the workings of the instrument that I fear that small boys will be playing your concerto and the slogan 'Every man a virtuoso' will sweep the country." The Concerto was premiered at the London Proms on August 15 and a commercial recording for Columbia was made two days later with the London Symphony Orchestra conducted by Basil Cameron.

---

537 Arthur Benjamin. Radio script transmitted April 13, 1953 on BBC Third Programme (Benjamin Estate).
538 Undated internal memo from Mr. JMG Best, European Liaison Office to unknown persons (BBC Written Archives, R27/395 Music General. Opera: A Tale of Two Cities 1952–3).
539 Letter from Ralph Vaughan Williams to Arthur Benjamin, May 13, 1953 (Benjamin Estate).
541 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Fred Blanks, July 1, 1953 (memorabilia of Fred Blanks).
542 "June–July 1953" is written on the manuscript (British Library, MS MUS 261).
543 Published by Boosey & Hawkes Ltd. in 1957.
544 Letter from Larry Adler to Arthur Benjamin, June 12, 1953 (Benjamin Estate).
545 Columbia 33S 1023. Adler continued to perform the Concerto in places such as the New York Town Hall in December the same year and on tour in Australia in 1957 where he was able to report back to Benjamin: "Your concerto is a big fat success here." (Peggy Glanville-
Nineteen fifty three was an important year in British history. Princess Elizabeth was crowned as Queen and a British-led expedition had climbed to the summit of Mount Everest. Benjamin had last worked in the film industry on *Steps of the Ballet*, five years previously, and had now accepted a commission to compose his longest and most impressive film score. *Conquest of Everest* (dir. Thomas Stobart. Countryman Films. 1953) was a seventy-five minute documentary produced by John Taylor, Grahame Tharp and Leon Clore. The three men were directors of Countryman Films founded in 1951 with the express purpose of producing films involving location photography. Narration was added to live film footage by Thomas Stobart, who participated in the expedition, and the numerous extended scenes, without dialogue, gave ample opportunity for the composer to score music. The music’s prominence drew comment from the American press, according to Hans Heinsheimer’s letter to Benjamin: “Rarely has a musical score been singled out by the press here—in fact, most movie scores are never mentioned. But yours received such acclaim that it made me go and see the film!”\(^5\)\(^4\)\(^6\) Not every film critic was so appreciative, with Janet Adam Smith finding the “music sometimes distracting—we could be trusted to recognise the summit without that banshee crescendo every time” but the mere fact she had commented on the music implied that it was imposing and dramatic enough to be noticeable.\(^5\)\(^4\)\(^7\) Hans Keller’s critique was more scrutinizing and perceptive:

> The formal problem for the composer was not simply how to sustain the widely stretching climax of the protracted assault, but also how to deal with the various suspensions of the ascent,—how to suspend without

---

\(^5\)\(^4\)\(^6\) Letter from H. W. Heinsheimer to Arthur Benjamin, December 29, 1953 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).

\(^5\)\(^4\)\(^7\) Janet Adam Smith. 'Filming Everest', *Sight and Sound*, Vol. XXIII, No. 3 (January–March 1954): 139.
interrupting...I would not suggest that Benjamin has succeeded all the way: sometimes his economy of intensification is not quite sufficiently stringent, while, on the other hand, there are places, especially during the first seven entries, where for the very reason of its initial economy of tension, the music indulges in mere parallels to the visual events. Nevertheless, the total structure is imposing at its best and tasteful at its worse; it takes its place not only among the best British film scores but even among Benjamin's best music, in or outside the cinema.  

In some respects, *Conquest of Everest* could be viewed as a British propaganda film. It made a conscious effort at the beginning of the film to parallel the crowning of Everest with the crowning of a new Queen, and the implication that Britain was at the start of a new golden era. Although India had gained independence in 1947 and the Commonwealth of Nations had been established, the British Empire still encompassed dominions such as Australia, New Zealand and Canada, and the man to stand at the summit of Mount Everest was a New Zealander named Sir Edmund Hillary. The film also portrayed human struggle and perseverance striving against all odds for a noble purpose, an angle that would have had great appeal to the Benjamin who had once described himself as a “socialist” and had affiliations with the ‘Musician’s Organization for Peace’ founded in 1951.

Throughout this eventful year of 1953, Benjamin had been engaged in negotiations with the BBC to write Britain’s first television opera. America had been the first to commission such a work in 1951, *Amahl and the Night Visitors* by Gian-Carlo Menotti (1911–2007), and this extract from a letter to Benjamin made clear that Kenneth Wright, acting as Assistant Head of BBC Music and Television, was anxious that the British venture was a success:

---


I have had your draft examined both by script experts and by 2 experts on T.V. opera, because neither you nor we want any sort of mis-fire for our first commissioned work...I want, as does Chotzinoff in New York, to start on the soundest basis of which we can assure ourselves. It would be too heart-breakingly late after you’d toiled for many weeks at the score for someone to warn us that we had together ignored some fundamental points of T.V. technique and presentation. Remember too, this must be a work interesting to, but not aimed at, Conoisseurs, who, so far as Television is concerned, are probably in a minority of 1 in 1,000. Our public is, alas, much more moronic than Radio had in 1930, or even in 1925.550

Mañana was adaptated from Caryl Brahms's story Under the Juniper Tree for a fifty-minute one-act opera for television by Brahms herself,551 with George R. Foa and Cedric Cliffe assisting with the libretto.552 The opera was set in a Spanish village and when a Wise Man prophesies that the end of the world will come tomorrow, the village inhabitants have a few conflicts and dramas to resolve hurriedly. Benjamin's progress on the writing of the television opera was quick, or in his own words: “I had a positive frenzy”, with the first stage of composition complete by August 1954.553 By doing so, Benjamin was well ahead of the opera's première, scheduled for broadcast on February 1, 1956.

During the intervening years, 1954–5, Benjamin’s name was now well enough known for him to enjoy a certain degree of celebrity status. His resignation as Professor from the RCM in 1953 gave him more time to indulge in other pursuits such as being one of a four member team on BBC’s Music Quiz on December 17 and 27, 1954.554 He also enjoyed a considerable reputation as a gourmet cook and was invited to give a talk reviewing cookery books for the BBC Third

550 Letter from Kenneth Wright to Arthur Benjamin, January 6, 1953 (Benjamin Estate).
551 'Mr. Arthur Benjamin's 'Manana': Opera Commissioned for B.B.C.', The Times, January 18, 1956.
552 Letter from Kenneth Wright to Arthur Benjamin, January 11, 1954 (Benjamin Estate).
Compositionally, two more films were completed—*Under the Caribbean* (dir. Hans Haas. Institut für submarine Forschung. 1954) and *Above us the Waves* (dir. Ralph Thomas. Rank Productions. 1955). The latter film told the WWII story of how British mini submarines sank the German warship *Tirpitz*, but the musical contribution was sparing. The critic Hans Keller, when comparing it with the score for *Conquest of Everest*, wrote that it “does not live up to the same standard.” In addition to these film scores, two works for choir and piano were published by Boosey & Hawkes: *Our Mr. Toad*, published in 1954 as part of the Winthrop Rogers Edition of Festival Series of Choral Music, and *Endeavour*, published in Boosey’s Modern Festival Series No. 179 in 1954.

Compared with Benjamin’s productivity as a composer since his return to England, there was a period in 1955–6 that was relatively fallow. One explanation for this can be found in a brief reference to an illness by Benjamin in a letter: “Can’t believe that just two years ago I was in hospital with a coronary.” This may also account for why Benjamin did not modify the *Storm Clouds Cantata* for Hitchcock’s 1956 remake of the film *The Man Who Knew Too Much*.

Bernard Herrmann had been employed to score the majority of the music for the remake of *The Man Who Knew Too Much*, and Jay Livingstone and Ray Evans contributed the songs *Whatever will be* and *We'll love again*. For the climactic scene in the Royal Albert Hall where the assassination attempt takes place, Hitchcock had decided, on Hermann’s recommendation, to re-use Benjamin’s music from

---

557 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Frank Hutchens, November 25, 1957 (National Library of Australia, MS 2066 Series 1/28 (Folio). Such a statement was supported by Leon Lovett’s interview where he remembered Benjamin having “to take things very easily” and “receiving guests but in his bedroom”. (Leon Lovett interview with the author, June 11, 2004.)
the original 1934 film. Paramount began efforts to trace the composer's score and settle copyright issues with Gaumont-British Picture Corporation Ltd. and Gainsborough Pictures Ltd. early in 1955.\footnote{Night wire from unknown person to unknown recipient sent March 24, 1955 (Margaret Herrick Library, Hitchcock Collection/The Man Who Knew Too Much/Arthur Benjamin).} Benjamin was successful in locating a full score of the original cantata and was then informed that "Mr. Hitchcock wishes to elongate the playing time of this composition about 1½ minutes, and naturally we would be pleased if you would accept the assignment to compose this additional material."\footnote{Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Roy Fjastad, February 25, 1955 (Margaret Herrick Library, Hitchcock Collection/The Man Who Knew Too Much/Arthur Benjamin). Letter from Fjastad to Arthur Benjamin, March 11, 1955 (Margaret Herrick Library, Hitchcock Collection/The Man Who Knew Too Much/Arthur Benjamin).} The reworked Cantata was scheduled for recording in England "some time early in May", and it was clear from correspondence that Benjamin had replied accepting the assignment.\footnote{Letter from Fjastad to Arthur Benjamin, March 11, 1955 (Margaret Herrick Library, Hitchcock Collection/The Man Who Knew Too Much/Arthur Benjamin). Night wire from unknown person to unknown recipient, March 24, 1955 (Margaret Herrick Library, Hitchcock Collection/The Man Who Knew Too Much/Arthur Benjamin). At one stage,\footnote{Straight wire to New York from Rosenstein, April 27, 1955 (Margaret Herrick Library, Hitchcock Collection/The Man Who Knew Too Much/Arthur Benjamin). Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Paramount Pictures Corporation, May 24, 1955 (Margaret Herrick Library, Hitchcock Collection/The Man Who Knew Too Much/Arthur Benjamin).} he was even being considered for the role of conductor alongside other notable musicians such as Sir Thomas Beecham and Sir Malcolm Sargent for the Royal Albert Hall scene. (Night Wire from Meiklejohn, April 4, 1955 (Margaret Herrick Library, Hitchcock Collection/The Man Who Knew Too Much/Arthur Benjamin)). But by April 27, a shift in perspective could be detected in the correspondence. In a wire from Rosenstein there were the words: "quotation should cover rights to rearrange order of Benjamin's music" and Benjamin confirmed in a letter to Paramount: "I understand that it is your desire to alter the music and also to alter the words of the lyrics...to which I have no objection".\footnote{Straight wire to New York from Rosenstein, April 27, 1955 (Margaret Herrick Library, Hitchcock Collection/The Man Who Knew Too Much/Arthur Benjamin). Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Paramount Pictures Corporation, May 24, 1955 (Margaret Herrick Library, Hitchcock Collection/The Man Who Knew Too Much/Arthur Benjamin).} Whatever the details and timing of Benjamin's illness may be, Bernard Herrmann ultimately undertook the necessary adjustments to the original cantata. This chiefly involved the use of greater forces, the repetition of certain sections and a slower tempo to increase the duration of the cantata. The decision was also made for Herrmann to appear in the film conducting a performance of the Cantata with the
London Symphony Orchestra, the Covent Garden Chorus and Barbara Howitt as the mezzo-soprano soloist.

The cessation of Benjamin's compositional activity in 1955 was relatively brief and he was able to report by February of the following year: "I have made a very good recovery & will soon be writing again, but for the rest of my life I am going to take things easier, whether it be gardening, cooking, or writing music!" And it would appear that Benjamin did indeed take life easier judging by his activities and compositional output over the next five years.

Mañana was broadcast, as scheduled, by the BBC on February 1, 1956. In general, Mañana was judged to be a failure. Hans Keller admitted the work was "a generally obvious disappointment" and he identified what he regarded as the chief weakness by saying:

[A]ny dissociation (as distinct from possible integrated contrasts) between musical and simultaneous visual movements (such as is regularly produced by the antics of the camera in filmed stage operas, not to speak of the antics of choreographers and ballet dancers) has a piercingly anti-musical effect.

The BBC film of this production survived and on viewing the opera, one can see the uneasy marriage between the camera and the music, with the flow of the drama particularly stagnant in the first half of production. It is worth noting that many of the notated comments in the score connected with the camera movement and angles were, in general, carried out by the cameraman, but are increasingly treated with greater freedom or disregard in the latter part of the opera as the climax of the story approaches. The writer for The Times sensed

566 A copy of a hand-written score can be viewed in Fisher Library, Sydney University, Australia. One cannot prove the annotated camera instructions in the score are solely
problems with the dramatic flow by saying: "Dramatically the opera had a fine climax when the villagers, preparing for the end of the world, greet instead a sunny new day, but the story takes too long to gather impetus." And Donald Mitchell's review for *The Musical Times* similarly discerned the gap between opera and film that was yet to be successfully bridged:

TV is still at the stage where its Spanish villages looks like the models they are, not to speak of the cruel exposure of canvas and wood effected by close-ups. 'Mañana', in other words, was a piece of make-believe, very much so a romantic, costumed effusion, conceived for a medium which punctures make-believe as swiftly as a pin pricks a balloon.

Benjamin's compositional output between 1955–60 included the String Quartet no. 2 (the first being the *Pastoral Fantasy*) and *Le Tombeau de Ravel* for clarinet or viola and piano. Although these were published by Boosey & Hawkes late in Benjamin's life, there is evidence to suggest that sketches for these works survived from his earlier, more productive years. In recognition of Benjamin's contribution to chamber music, The Worshipful Company of

---

569 String Quartet No. 2 was published in 1959 and *Le Tombeau de Ravel* was published in 1958 by Boosey & Hawkes.

The Boosey & Hawkes catalogue card in London enters the information "1952-revised 1956" for String Quartet No. 2. *Le Tombeau de Ravel* must be the same as or based on the score composed at the request of Frederick Thurston (1901–53) and referred to in a letter to Jean Coulthard in 1949 as *Waltz-Caprices*. (Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Jean Coulthard, January 16, 1949 (University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard File 1–3). In support of this theory, a Boosey & Hawkes publicity brochure for Benjamin printed in October 1957 duly acknowledged the title *Valse Caprice* in parenthesis after the main title. When interviewed by the author, the clarinettist Gervase de Peyer wished it to be known that he assisted in the preparation of the clarinet version of *Le Tombeau de Ravel* before it was submitted for publication but was never acknowledged in the score. (Gervase de Peyer interview with the author, May 21, 2002.) This could imply two things: either Benjamin did not work on the clarinet part with Frederick Thurston or the music for *Le Tombeau de Ravel* was sufficiently different or reworked enough to make it necessary for another clarinettist to review the writing.
Musicians wrote to him on October 10, 1956 asking him to accept the Cobbett Medal for services to the Art of Chamber Music.⁵⁷⁰

Caribbean folk songs still held an attraction for the composer with a Jamaicalyposo for two pianos and Song of the Banana Carriers for voice and piano published by Boosey & Hawkes Ltd. in 1957. Again, there is evidence to suggest an earlier version of the song might already have existed and was premiered at a charity concert on November 27, 1951 to raise money for victims of a hurricane in Jamaica. This took place in the Royal Festival Hall but the journalist does not make it absolutely clear if the song arrangement was by Benjamin.

Jamaica itself was represented by Mr. Rudolph Comacho, whose voice, unsuited to operatic arias in Italian, falls more easily on the folk-songs of his country. He sang three of these in arrangements, with piano accompaniment, by Arthur Benjamin; the most haunting of them, a song of the banana carriers, had been set expressly for the concert.⁵⁷¹

On July 23, 1957 a staged première of Benjamin’s opera A Tale of Two Cities took place at Sadler’s Wells. A young twenty-two year old by the name of Leon Lovett conducted the New Opera Chorus and the Goldsbrough Orchestra.⁵⁷² Lovett’s visionary sense of the opera’s staging potential had been awakened after hearing Benjamin’s studio broadcast performances in 1953. Lovett, in an interview,⁵⁷³ related how he then went on to study music at Cambridge University and had founded The Cambridge University Opera Group. Their repertoire included Ralph Vaughan Williams’ Sir John in Love and when Lovett explained his desire to produce A Tale of Two Cities was impossible owing to the orchestra pit being too small, Vaughan Williams

---

⁵⁷⁰ Letter from Brigadier H. A. F. Crewdson to Arthur Benjamin, October 10, 1956 (Benjamin Estate).
⁵⁷¹ Unacknowledged author. ‘Festival Hall: Jamaica Relief Fund Concert’, The Times, November 28, 1951.
⁵⁷² Principal roles were sung by the following artists: Madame Defarge-Ruth Packer, Lucie Manette-Heather Harper, Sydney Carton-John Cameron, Doctor Manette-Hedle Nash, Charles Darnay-John Kentish (Opera Programme in the memorabilia of Rev. Clive Cohen).
suggested they bring the production to London. Benjamin's seven year wait to see his opera staged was, according to an account given by the critic for the *Daily Express*, "rewarded with the greatest ovation given to a new opera since the war." Some critics such as Harold Neden criticised the opera for being too lengthy in parts but Felix Aprahamian, writing for the *Sunday Times*, did not agree: "The impact of the opera exceeded expectation...Their [Benjamin and librettist Cedric Cliffe] joint effort, although long, lacks any longeurs."Kenneth Wright of the BBC was in agreement with Aprahamian's review and was of the opinion "that dramatically it is Arthur Benjamin's most effective opera". In a more informal letter addressed to Benjamin he praised Lovett's work and added: "Bravo! I hope we don't have to wait long for a revival. The trouble is, that in the operatic powers-that-be there is no 'shame'." Opera companies in Britain were indeed slow to respond but Benjamin attended a performance of *A Tale of Two Cities*, sung in French, in Metz on October 19 of the same year. Benjamin drew attention to the international nature of his career in a letter to Donald Friend by claiming: "I am now among the first five British composers whose works are most performed abroad, except, of course, in my native Australia!" Benjamin accepted commissions to score music for two more films in his final years—*Fire Down Below* (dir. Robert Parrish. A Warwick Film Productions. 1957) and *The Naked Earth* (dir. Vincent Sherman. Foray Films. 1958). The first film featured the big names of Hollywood—Jack Lemmon, Robert Mitchum, Rita Hayworth and was set in Jamaica, an easy-going island where the world's white misfits and petty crooks could fit in with a bohemian lifestyle under the sun.
Hayworth danced erotically to music composed by Vivian Comma, the 'Stretch' Cox Troupe, portrayed as happy-go-lucky natives performed a Limbo Dance and Arthur Benjamin contributed musical numbers for a small number of select scenes.\textsuperscript{579} Work on \textit{The Naked Earth}, on what proved to be his last film, was in progress by November 1957.

I am kept with my nose to the grindstone at the moment writing music for a film—a very good one 'The Naked Earth' (20\textsuperscript{th} Century Fox). I am doing it to pay for an extravagant holiday. I am going to leave the horrid winter here in Jan and Feb. and am going to Ceylon. Donald Friend is there painting black boys like mad I believe.\textsuperscript{580}

Finding a balance between rest and work was not easy for Benjamin. He enjoyed work and his expensive lifestyle its love of gourmet cooking, beautiful merchandise and comfortable hotels, all needed funding. This relationship between work and rest was illustrated in an aerogram to Donald Friend in which Benjamin indicated a wish to experience the exotic naturalness of Ceylon with the natives as much as possible, then added: "By January I hope to have a second symphony partly composed and so I shall bring it out and begin to score the full orchestral version. I always like to have something to do."\textsuperscript{581}

The above mentioned second symphony was never composed and only four more works were added to the list of compositions written in Benjamin's last five years: \textit{For Amusement Only} for orchestra, premiered in Nottingham October 7, 1958;\textsuperscript{582} an orchestration of the two-piano work \textit{Jamaicalyso}, first performed by the BBC Concert Orchestra with Vilem Tausky conducting at the

\textsuperscript{579} Information consulted from viewing the film's publicity folder (BFI Library, Special Collection) and the commercial Sony DVD (purchasable on the Amazon website).
\textsuperscript{580} Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Frank Hutchens, November 25, 1957 (National Library of Australia, MS 2066 Series 1/28 (Folio)). The author is unable to comment further on the film because she was unable to locate a copy for viewing.
\textsuperscript{581} Undated aerogram from Arthur Benjamin to Donald Friend inserted in Donald Friend diary (National Library of Australia, MS 5959-38).
\textsuperscript{582} Note by unknown author in BBC Written Archives, Composer file 2 1940-60.
Royal Festival Hall, London on October 7, 1958; Divertimento for Wind Quintet and a three-act opera Tartuffe. The Divertimento for Wind Quintet, also known as Divertissement for Wind Quintette, was begun in August 1958 “at the behest of a big American firm of publishers” and was premiered by the Melos Ensemble at Cheltenham Town Hall as part of the Cheltenham Festival on July 5, 1960 but was never published.

The year of 1958 began by spending “a lot of time on the beach, sunbathing”, but it was to be an important year for Benjamin with another performance of A Tale of Two Cities. Such was the success of the previous year’s staged performances that the BBC had engaged Leon Lovett to conduct and Rudolph Cartier to produce, at great expense, a television adaptation of the opera. Publicity for the broadcast was considerable and this quote from the publicity department of the BBC gave some idea of the scale and complexity of the operation.

This is probably the most ambitious musical production ever undertaken in the history of British Television. ‘A Tale of Two Cities’ involves three studios. The cast which consists of narrator, twenty-two singing or speaking parts and about one hundred extras, will be in the BBC Television studios, Riverside 1 and 2, in Hammersmith, W 6., along with eight sets and five cameras. The orchestra will be some seven miles away in the Camden Theatre in Camden Town, NW1. It will be out of vision, but conductor and singers will be in simultaneous sight of each other throughout the two hour opera by means of monitors.

---

584 The libretto for Tartuffe was adapted by Cedric Cliffe from Molière’s play of the title L’Imposteur or Tartuffe. Copies of the manuscript for the vocal score by Benjamin and the full score of only the overture of Tartuffe can be viewed at the British Library (MS MUS 254-57).
585 Benjamin referred to the quintet in a letter to Donald Friend, August 27, 1958 (National Library of Australia, MS 5959-36). Details of the work’s première can be read in Alan Poulton’s publication Dictionary Catalogue of Modern British Composers. Vol. 1. Westport, Connecticut & London: Greenwood Press, 2000: 214. The author has so far not been able to locate the manuscript of Divertimento for Wind Quartet.
587 Publicity statement written October 2, 1958 by unknown person (BBC Written Archives, T13/419/1 Opera: Tale of Two Cities).
The cost of such a production was so considerable that special permission needed to be obtained from the Board of Governors.588

The televised version of *A Tale of Two Cities* was broadcast on October 2, 1958, and unlike *Mañana*, was heralded as a brilliantly successful television opera.589 Rudolph Cartier's contribution was duly acknowledged in John Warrack's critique: "The opera gave him ample opportunities; his resources were lavish."590 Another reviewer for the *Glasgow Herald* qualified the reasons for the production's success.

There are few luscious solos to impose rigidity on the production and the tendency is towards the use of such vibrant, polyphonic music to thrust on the action, thus allowing and encouraging the variation of frames on which television drama depends, while the chorus, gaining from the cameras increased individual dramatic significance, give still further range.591

With such a response, the BBC felt justified in having lavished its resources on such a production and was, in Benjamin's words: "like a dog with two tails about its success". Lionel Salter, from the BBC's Head of Music Production (Television), wrote to Benjamin informing him that three million people had tuned in to the broadcast.592 Boosey and Hawkes, were likewise buoyed by the opera's success with Bob Holton from the Opera Department in New York making the

588 An inquisitive journalist working for the *Evening Standard* tried to extract an exact figure of production costs from an evasive Rudolph Cartier but had to be content to inform readers that "The publicly-financed BBC doesn't answer money questions like that." (Unacknowledged author. 'How Costly', *Evening Standard*, September 24, 1958.) Some indication of the amount of money needed to finance such a project was estimated by Benjamin, in a letter to his Australian colleague Joseph Post, as £60,000 (Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Joseph Post, December 22, 1958 (National Archives of Australian, SP827/2).

589 Artists participating in this production included Rudolph Cartier as producer, Leon Lovett conducting the Royal Philharmonic Orchestra, sets by Norman James, Amy Shuard as Madame Defarge, Heather Harper as Lucie Manette, Heddle Nash as Doctor Manette, John Cameron as Sydney Carton and Alexander Young as Charles Darnay. Letter from Lionel Salter to Leon Lovett, August 13, 1958 (BBC Written Archives, T13/419/1 Opera: Tale of Two Cities).


following bold claim:

The reviews of Tof 2C are simply wonderful! Looks as though the Benjamins (Arthur and Britten) have the English opera field monopolized, with a slight edge going to A.B. —not for quantity but for quality and appeal.593

But John Klein, in his article *Some Reflections on ‘A Tale of Two Cities’*, disagreed with such comparisons between the two composers and added his own thoughts.

Nevertheless, to rank it—as Ernest Newman has done—above *Billy Budd* and *Gloriana* seems to me lacking in a sense of proportion. Benjamin's opera does not possess the pronounced individuality of Britten's works; yet—though it may be more derivative—it remains a vital and exciting creation594

In exploring the relationship between Benjamin and Britten further, the following statement by Hans Keller in a review of Benjamin's piano solo *Pastorale, Arioso and Finale* in 1948, gave some idea of the power Britten's name commanded in the music world.

Is there anyone interested in 'British Music of Our Time' who thinks that the only point worth mentioning about 'the distinguished musician' Arthur Benjamin is that he was one of Britten's teachers? If not, why doesn't the Pelican Book of that title say anything else about him?595

Britten had invited Benjamin to perform his Sonata for Viola with William Primrose at the Aldeburgh Festival in June 1950 and Benjamin's correspondence with Ralph Hawkes had alluded to

Britten’s career on a professional basis from time to time. For example, he wrote: “I am especially pleased for Britten as I was one of the first to realize his great talent” on having read a good critique in The New Yorker for Britten’s Violin Concerto. But when commenting on Britten’s opera Albert Herring (1947), he was more critical saying: “I feel Ben is not careful enough about his librettos, and the faults are largely those of the librettist”.

Leslie Boosey had given the chair of the company over to Geoffrey Hawkes in the late fifties and Helen Wallace noted that Boosey & Hawkes “was on the brink of disaster” by 1960. As an indication of Britten’s control over not just music in Britain but the affairs of the company as well, Lesley Boosey was forced to reorganize the business when Britten refused to sign a contract. This highlighted the fact that, in Helen Wallace’s words: “Britten’s power over the Board was by this time much greater than LAB’s”. It would not have been in Benjamin’s professional interest to write or express anything too disparaging about Britten, but Richard Stoker who visited Benjamin on July 24, 1957, recalled him having said: “Benjamin Britten is enormously talented, but unfortunately he has had a far too early success...it’s rather gone to his head. He’s been a trifle ungrateful to the many musicians who’ve helped him”.

Soon after the televised production of A Tale of Two Cities, the promotions department of Boosey & Hawkes was able to report expressions of interest from sources such as Victor Alessandro of San

---

596 Britten wrote twice to Benjamin concerning the Festival on February 23 and July 6, 1950 (Benjamin Estate). See also ‘Arthur Benjamin to Visit Australia’, Australian Musical News and Digest, July 1, 1950.
597 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, April 11, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
598 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, June 22, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
600 Ibid.: 106.
Antonio Opera,\textsuperscript{602} Kurt Herbert Adler of San Francisco, Nicholas Goldschmidt, music director of the Vancouver Festival and the Elizabethan Opera Trust in Australia.\textsuperscript{603} Benjamin’s early one-act operas were also receiving a fair share of attention that same year with performances of \textit{The Devil Take Her} taking place at Otterbein College in Westerville, Ohio on April 30 and the Cosmopolitan School of Music in Chicago on May 26.\textsuperscript{604} \textit{Prima Donna} was performed at the Aspen Music Festival in Colorado on August, 16 and 17 and the Denver Lyric Theatre, Colorado, from December 3–6.\textsuperscript{605} In January of 1959, \textit{Prima Donna} was televised by the ABC and a performance was planned for the Cheltenham Festival as well as a broadcast on the BBC’s Third Programme.\textsuperscript{606}

Only six months after the success of the BBC’s production of \textit{A Tale of Two Cities}, Benjamin was able to write to his publisher with the news: “I am well on the way to finishing my new opera ‘Tartuffe’ and musicians to whom I have played it say it is the best thing I have ever done. Time will tell.”\textsuperscript{607} But even though Benjamin had high hopes for his latest creation, opportunities to stage new operas were not plentiful. This he had already experienced first-hand with the long awaited première of \textit{Prima Donna}, and despite the favourable response of the public and critics to \textit{A Tale of Two Cities}, the expected level of demand for further performances did not materialise. Benjamin blamed some of this on the promotions department of Boosey and Hawkes, and made no attempt to hide his frustration by saying in one letter:

\begin{footnotes}
\item[602] The San Antonio Opera enquired as to whether Schwarzkopf would be suitable for the role of Lucie Manette. Letter from Bob Holton to Arthur Benjamin, October 7, 1958 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
\item[603] Letter from David Adams to Arthur Benjamin, April 20, 1959 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file). Arthur Benjamin mentioned the hoped for Australian performances as part of a tour in 1960 but this never eventuated. Letter from Arthur Benjamin to David Adams, April 23, 1959 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
\item[604] Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Robert Holton, February 13, 1959 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
\item[605] Ibid.
\item[606] Letter from Joseph Post to Arthur Benjamin, December 16, 1958 (National Archives of Australia, SP827/2) and letter from Arthur Benjamin to Joseph Post, December 11, 1958 (National Archives of Australia, SP 827/2).
\item[607] Letter from Arthur Benjamin to David Adams, April 23, 1959 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
\end{footnotes}
B&H. Europe seem to have lost all influence. It does seem ridiculous that when they are presented with an opera such as mine, which had such resounding success, they cannot get a European performance.608

An even more strongly voiced missive was written a few months later.

What is dead is the promotion department of B&H, London! After 4 years my String 4tte is not out. I corrected proofs about 9-12 months ago. Do you wonder I am in despair? I have myself spent $300 dollars on photographing 'The Imposter' and am doing a spot of promoting on my own account. There are possibilities in Paris & Spoleto...HELL!609

Such frustrations did not deter Benjamin from work on Tartuffe (formerly referred to as The Imposter) and he proceeded to orchestrate the score while on holiday with Jack Henderson.610 The grand scale of this holiday gave some indication of the amount of time and material wealth at Benjamin’s disposal. An itinerary scheduled a departure from London on February 23, 1960,611 and encompassed eight weeks of travel through Ceylon, Indonesia, Singapore, Thailand, Hong Kong, Japan and America. The journey involved fifteen flights and included a visit to San Francisco to attend the final stages of production and the American première of A Tale of Two Cities to be given by The State College of San Francisco.612

Upon reaching Ceylon, Benjamin and his partner resumed contact with the residing Australian painter Donald Friend who gave an account in his diary of the beginning of Benjamin’s fatal illness.

610 In a letter from Arthur Benjamin to Bob Holton dated October 7, 1959, he referred to the opera as 'The Imposter' (alias Tartuffe) (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file). Donald Friend’s diary entry for March 16, 1960 (incorrectly written as April) noted Benjamin “jotting in a few notes on the orchestral score of ‘Tartuffe’.” (National Library of Australia, MS 5959, Item 39).
611 Intinerary of Arthur Benjamin’s journey sent some time before March 30, 1960 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
612 Bob Holton was able to confirm the College’s intention of giving four performances of the opera on April 2, 3, 9 and 10, 1960. Letter from Bob Holton to Arthur Benjamin, October 9, 1959 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
On a sight-seeing trip by car with Friend, Benjamin “looked unwell” and had an “ache in his side”. When Friend visited Benjamin in hospital in Colombo for the last time, he was told “one of the doctors diagnosed an operable cancer”. His last impression of Benjamin was of him being “cheerful enough” and how he had been writing “in a few notes on the orchestra score of Tartuffe”. On preparing to leave for London, he had said to Friend: “I’d like to live five more years”. Upon his arrival in London, Benjamin underwent surgery but the cancer proved too advanced. He died in Middlesex Hospital, St. Marylebone, London, on April 10, of kidney and liver failure, and cancer of the pancreas at the age of sixty-six.

Benjamin’s years based in London from 1946 until his death in 1960 were highly productive and saw his composing career reach new peaks. Performances of his largest orchestral work, the Symphony and his first three-act opera A Tale of Two Cities changed British audience and critic’s perception of him as a composer of ‘light music’. He was now a composer who had proven himself skilled enough in musical form to focus and pace larger-scale dramatic works. Benjamin succeeded in winning the BBC’s trust to the extent of being offered a commission to compose the first British film-opera, and for his three-act opera A Tale of Two Cities to be selected for an expensive adaptation as a televised opera. His relationship with Ralph Hawkes, whose support and advice had been so crucial in shaping his musical career, came to a sudden end with Hawkes’s death in 1950 but Benjamin’s confidence in himself as a composer was established enough for him to continue and eventually make the

Benjamin never finished orchestrating the entire piano score of Tartuffe. Alan Boustead, who was a member of staff at Boosey & Hawkes for a number of years, undertook the task of completing the orchestration in 1961 based on Benjamin’s pencilled markings on the piano score and his orchestration of the overture completed in Ceylon with the exception of the last twelve bars. Boustead gave two accounts of his work in the articles ‘Molière with Music’ in Music and Musicians, (November 1964): 27 and ‘Arthur Benjamin and Opera’, Opera (November 1964): 709–13, which were part of the advance publicity for the opera’s premiere conducted by Boustead for the New Opera Company at Sadler’s Wells on November 30 and December 7, 1964.
615 Arthur Benjamin’s death certificate.
decision to devote his energies solely to composition. Indeed, by the
time of his death, it is worth noting that despite the many musical
roles Benjamin played throughout his life, “composer” is entered as
the occupation of the deceased.616

Benjamin’s relationship with the world of film in the second
film period differed from that of the first in the 1930s. He was now an
experienced composer and orchestrator, and from the late 1940s was
earning a living that enabled him to concentrate purely on
composition for the concert hall had he so wished. No new major
compositional developments emerge in the film music written in the
1940-50s. Even the impressive score for Conquest of Everest referred
back to techniques in orchestration and dramatic pacing learnt in
earlier film work, and these were then well established in his mature
orchestral work, the Symphony.

America continued to be a valuable supporter of his music for
the rest of his life but there was a noticeable falling off in Benjamin’s
creative powers after his illness in 1955. No mention of his physical
condition in these later years entered documented sources, but it is
clear he anticipated quite a few more years of composition ahead and
had every intention of producing more works for the stage. His last
operatic work Tartuffe, was performed in 1964 after his death in
1960. The music and stage conception had certain strengths, but
lacked the same level of dramatic focus found in his Symphony and
earlier opera A Tale of Two Cities. This may have been the result of a
man whose physical wellbeing was compromised. Nor did time allow
him the luxury of being able to revise problematic passages that a
first performance would have drawn to his attention.

2.8 Conclusion
As a focus for this Chapter’s conclusion, we need to examine in closer
detail the meaning of a quotation referred to earlier on page 112.

616 Ibid.
Am I right do you think, in believing that composers start out by being influenced by some favorite composer; then they deliberately experiment, want to be clever, smart and original, want to astonish the natives. Eventually they find themselves (if there is anything to find) and both the influences of the past and their experimentation are eventually sublimated into something which is their very own?  

Benjamin had written this paragraph in his early fifties to his composer colleague Herbert Howells at a time when he was composing his Symphony, a work which was to establish his mature voice as a composer and display his prowess with large-scale dramatic forms for the first time.

For Benjamin, "the influences of the past" had their roots in dance rhythms and forms, such as the suite from the Baroque and Classical music periods, especially those from France. The other musical source was folk music in which Benjamin's interest never waned. Although *Jamaican Rumba* was the most famous and financially lucrative of all these works, folk song and dances from France, England, Caribbean and North America were used to focus the suites and variations for a number of chamber, vocal, orchestral and film scores over the entire span of Benjamin's composing career.

The other early influence defined by Benjamin as "some favorite composer", would have been an area that fluctuated. Upon reflection, Benjamin, in his interview with Schafer, acknowledged the influence of Ravel and his admiration of Brahms, César Franck and Richard Strauss in his early years of composition. This process of absorbing other people's music was ongoing and many more musical echoes can be detected such as Vaughan Williams's influence in the hymn-like section of the Symphony's first movement, and that of Debussy in the early songs. The list is extensive, as is the case with most composers.

The third ingredient regarded by Benjamin as a necessary  

---

617 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Herbert Howells, December 29, 1944 (RCM Library, Herbert Howells papers).
component in the process that would enable a composer to “eventually find themselves” was “experimentation”. Like many composers in the 1920s, including some of his favourites such as Debussy and Ravel, Benjamin saw attractive possibilities in experimenting with jazz, particularly in the area of rhythm. The most blatant examples of this can be found in *Carnavalesque* (violin and piano), *Saxophone Blues* (piano solo) and *Concertino* (piano and orchestra). All these works were composed in the 1920s and their rhythms were quickly assimilated into Benjamin’s broader rhythmic language that already encompassed Elizabethan and Baroque dance.

Film music for sound pictures was an entirely new experience for Benjamin in the 1930s and involved a four year period where most of his creative energy was immersed in film. Because of the novelty of film music, experimentation was essential from composers for whom there was no formal school of training. Until this opportunity arose, Benjamin’s first-hand experience at working with theatre had been with his first one-act opera *The Devil Take Her*. Now he was exposed to working with a variety of producers and directors and dramatic plots. In this brief film music period, Benjamin’s dramatic perception changed; the ability to hold a line and continuity developed as did a much finer sense of pacing, and the use of dissonance and resolution to heighten and resolve a drama was realized.

The timing and placing of this first film music period proved to be the last of the most essential ingredients necessary in shaping Benjamin’s voice as a composer. His summing up of this process in the 1944 quotation, reproduced at the beginning of this conclusion, was indicative of a certain level of maturity as a musician. This was also fully borne out by the score he was working on at the time—his *Symphony*, composed between 1939–45. Although Benjamin’s creativity could be said to have peaked with his Symphony and *A Tale of Two Cities* in terms of duration and dramatic weight, the ingredients essential for his mature voice had already entered his life,
and had been assessed and absorbed musically towards the close of the first film period. These were already finding expression in works such as *Romantic Fantasy* (violin and viola solo with orchestra, 1936) and *Overture to an Italian Comedy* (orchestra, 1937). Benjamin’s years in Canada provided him with a suitable environment away from the conflicts of WWII, which, together with the interest and support in his music from America, allowed him time to consolidate his craft and establish enough confidence in himself as a creative artist to support a decision to return to London. The successful performances of his Symphony and *A Tale of Two Cities* in Britain that followed, signalled his emergence as a composer of not only ‘light music’ but of ‘dramatic’ music as well, and it was only his failing health from the mid-1950s that restricted a creative outpouring in the last fourteen years of his life.
Chapter 3

The nature of film music
3.1 Introduction

Chapter three takes a closer look at a number of factors influencing Benjamin’s work as a film composer in the early 1930s. This involves a consideration of film music theory, from the beginning of Benjamin’s film music career to the present day and will encompass a range of views and definitions of film music and its function. Practical issues guiding the production of a film will be discussed together with the impact they had on the creative process of composition. Although Benjamin was one of the first sound film composers in Britain, he did not work in isolation and would have sought the advice and instruction of others working in the film industry. In order to understand the expectations and attitudes that conditioned a film composer’s work, this chapter conducts a brief survey of the music directors, film directors, contemporary composers, film critics and the audiences themselves with whom Benjamin would have come into contact. As is evident from the study, there were many composers and critics who did not consider film music a serious art. It was, however, regarded by others as an important part of a dynamic and emerging new creative process that was challenging established patterns of musical thought, and this shift in musical perspective was not considered negligible by all composers.

3.2 Defining film music and its function

Benjamin was one of the first composers in Britain to write a film music critique that not only discussed the work of other composers but also explained issues of film production that affected the art of composition.618 His article, printed in 1937, indicated that he was extremely practical and familiar with film music articles from Europe and America, so one can at least assume that he was equally

interested in, and had access to British publications from the early 1930s.

One of the first articles focusing on the use of music in talking films was Alfred Hitchcock’s interview with Stephen Watts, printed in *Cinema Quarterly* in the winter of 1933–4. Hitchcock was still involved at the time with the cutting of his latest film *Waltzes from Vienna* (Tom Arnold. 1933). He admitted his attraction to this film, which was based on the rise to fame of the younger Johann Strauss, was the chance to explore the blending of “film and music together in an artistic entity”, an area which had so far been “overlooked” or “left undeveloped”.619 To put this study into historical perspective, Hitchcock referred back to the role of music in silent films:

The arrival of talkies, as you know, temporarily killed action in pictures...but it did just as much damage to music. Producers and directors were obsessed by words. They forgot that one of the greatest emotional factors in the silent cinema was the musical accompaniment. They have gradually realized that action should still come first that, talkies or not, they are still making motion pictures. But music as an artistic asset of the film is still sadly neglected.620

The Hungarian writer on film and librettist for Bartók’s early stage works, Béla Balázs, was of a similar opinion to Hitchcock. He predicted in his 1930 publication *Der Geist des Films* that sound film “would destroy the already highly developed culture of the silent film” and such an event would be temporary “until expression by means of sound would have developed to a higher level”.621

In order for music’s potential to develop to this ‘higher level’, Hitchcock believed “every film should have a complete musical score before it goes into production”,622 in other words, early planning

---

concerning the visual elements were to be scripted simultaneously with any musical decisions.\textsuperscript{623} Such a belief was put into practice with the film \textit{The Man Who Knew Too Much} where Benjamin's music for the \textit{Storm Clouds Cantata} was inseparable and sensitively blended with the screen action in the film's climactic Royal Albert Hall scene, as will be discussed in chapter four.

Film makers in Britain were also aware of the early film music theories of the Russian director Sergei Eisenstein. Eisenstein's theories, penned as early as 1929, expounded the concept of "audio-visual counterpoint",\textsuperscript{624} a "dramatic principle" involving "a synthesis of two counterpoints—the spatial counterpoint of graphic art, and the temporal counterpoint of music".\textsuperscript{625} Even though Benjamin is unlikely to have read the original essays in Russian, translations of Eisenstein's theories were finding their way into English and its influence was perceived in Herbert Read's article for the autumn issue of \textit{Cinema Quarterly} in 1934. This was entitled 'Experiments in Counterpoint' and involved a discussion of Eisenstein's theories as well as Rudolph Arnheim's sympathetic theories from which he quoted: "sound film demands that picture and sound shall not do the same work simultaneously".\textsuperscript{626}

By the mid-1930s, the first books on film music, such as Leonid Sabaneev's \textit{Music for the Films} (1935), began to appear in Britain. These were written in response to the need for reference books offering experience and practical advice not so much for the general public, but for "the composer and conductor of music for the sound film" to "enable them to assimilate without loss of time the methods, generally simple, to be adopted."\textsuperscript{627} Sabaneev gave a general definition of sound film as "a combination of visual and aural

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{623} \textit{Ibid.}: 82.
\item \textsuperscript{624} Sergei Eisenstein (ed. \& translated by Jay Leyda). \textit{Film Form: Essays in Film Theory}. London: Dennis Dobson Ltd., 1951: 55.
\item \textsuperscript{625} \textit{Ibid.}: 49, 52.
\item \textsuperscript{626} Herbert Read. 'Experiments in Counterpoint', \textit{Cinema Quarterly}, Vol. III, No. 1 (Autumn 1934): 18.
\item \textsuperscript{627} Leonid Sabaneev (translated by S. W. Pring). \textit{Music for the Films}. London: Sir Isaac Pitman \& Sons Ltd., 1935: v (forward).
\end{itemize}
impressions” and acknowledged it as a “species of synthetic art, approximately of the same type as opera and drama”. But unlike Hitchcock and unlike opera, Sabaneev regarded music’s role as very much secondary to events on the screen, still able to preserve “its individuality and its independent nature” with a “musical form of its own, in some way subordinated to the rhythm of the screen, but not destroyed by them”. This approach suggested to some degree, the separation existing in Sabaneev’s mind between music and film, a separation he hoped could one day be bridged by the creation of a new genre “cinema opera” whereby “music would be organically blended with drama”. Kurt London’s book *Film Music* (1936) was similar to Sabaneev in that it offered practical advice to those composing for film. As with Hitchcock, London felt the sound film offered music the chance to say far more than it could in the silent film era, believing that it was now capable of penetrating “to the depths of the plot which it accompanies”.

More publications followed in the 1940s including John Huntley’s informative and highly practical book on *British Film Music* (1947). Perhaps in response to the growing interest in film music criticism, Huntley, when writing for *Penguin Film Review* (1947), urged people to study film music “at the cinema” so as not to isolate the music. Balázs had given the same instruction many years earlier and offered a detailed explanation by saying:

> [W]e never perceive reality by means of one sense alone. What we merely hear or merely see, etc. has no three-dimensional reality for us.

The conclusion to be drawn from this is that music in the film has not only an artistic part to play—it is required in order that the pictures may give the impression of being alive and natural; music gives the pictures atmosphere

---

and represents, as it were, a third dimension. The music provides an acoustic background and perspective. It must never become music for music’s sake—as soon as this happens the music detaches itself from the picture and destroys its life.633

When talking pictures were introduced, it sparked an ongoing debate over the relationship between music and dialogue with even Hitchcock admitting in his 1933 interview that he had yet to make up his mind about music’s function in this respect.634 For Sabaneev the solution was clear-cut—music must cease altogether or be subdued in the presence of dialogue.635 One of the reasons for the difficulty of this relationship was the unsophisticated film sound recording process termed ‘dubbing’. This will be discussed in further detail in 3.3 of this chapter and again in chapter five, but in short, the poor quality of ‘dubbing’ in the early days of film sound often resulted in a problematic balance in sound levels between dialogue, noise or natural sounds and music. For purely practical reasons it was therefore deemed undesirable by many film directors for music to offer competition to dialogue. This problem, together with the sporadic use of music in general, and especially so in British films, fuelled another debate lasting well into the 1940s about musical form in film scores which, for the most part in concert hall and in operatic productions, had always been continuous.

In some of the earliest writings on the subject of film music forms, London concluded that the restricted lengths of time allocated to music meant there was “little time in which to develop” a musical idea, and “therefore each single bar must have its logical justification”.636 He regarded the existing form of a theme and variation as particularly suitable for use in films and warned

composers against writing music that followed “normal organic growth” as it was bound to be “cut” and “mutilated” by the director.\(^\text{637}\) Benjamin had first-hand experience of the latter problem and his 1937 article suggested that he had found ways of composing that minimized the effects of a director’s cut.

Sometimes a director (if he is not certain about his job) will cut a scene even after the music has been recorded. This leads to some unpleasant shocks to the composer, who finds that a bar or so of his music is missing and the resultant modulations rather surprising! But he need not worry. The public does not notice such little mishaps.\(^\text{638}\)

Ralph Vaughan Williams, like Benjamin, had found his own solutions to restricted time frames and “producer’s rough Hewings” and added his own ideas about film music forms:

Its form must depend on the form of the drama, so the composer must be prepared to write music which is capable of almost unlimited extension or compression; It must be able to ‘fade-out’ and ‘fade-in’ again without loss of continuity. A composer must be prepared to face losing his head or his tail or even his inside without demur, and must be prepared to make a workmanlike job of it.\(^\text{639}\)

The art of variation in film music, as already touched on by London in 1936, was highlighted by Adorno and Eisler in the 1940s. Again, the elements of improvisation and fantasy, as part of this technique, were regarded as essential in order for a composer to accommodate the speed with which moods and characterizations changed on screen.

\(^{637}\) \textit{Ibid.}: 157, 158.


To achieve such changes without sacrificing musical continuity one must resort to a highly evolved variation technique. Each musical form accompanying a motion picture is a kind of variation.  

Muir Mathieson commented on musical composition for film by saying it was "a fascinating problem to follow the dramatic ebb and flow of a sequence and at the same time to attain a musical continuity and a musical logic" within a strict time frame determined by the picture. Adorno and Eisler created an image of the composer basically being asked to provide musical "fill in" at specific moments of a film. They regarded such an act of 'filling-in' as the "Achilles heel of composing for motion pictures", and that it was in danger of degenerating into "mere padding" if not approached with sufficient imagination and intuition. Benjamin alluded to the importance of these latter talents in his 1937 article when he wrote:

'Flair' is essential. That is, the successful film-composer must have the gift of summing up the atmosphere of a scene quickly. He will then find that the rhythm of any scene will get into his subconscious memory, and so, when the music is recorded, the rhythms fall to certain actions in the picture where, had he consciously tried, he would have failed.

Adorno and Eisler once again raised the question of film music form with the admission that "the composer is confronted with problems of form that hardly ever occurred in traditional music". Examples of these challenges included the demand for sudden climaxes, often with very little preparation; the need to achieve a sense of development by relating one segment of film music to

---

643 Ibid.: 95.
another; and music capable of dissolving into noises or vice versa “as though they were dissonances”.646

Hans Keller, one of Britain’s first serious film music critics, assessed in considerable and thoughtful detail what he regarded as “new experiments in form and craftsmanship” in film music.647 He concluded that the “academic principles of leisurely formal development” were unsuitable for film music and the “problems of the architecture of the entire film and its music, and the structure of each of the various parts supported by music, have so far—a few distinguished instances apart—very rarely been solved to any appreciable extent”.648 Such problems of coherence he acknowledged to be common in art forms involving several collaborators and in his article entitled ‘Tonal Structures; The Documentary Approach; The Function of ‘Featured’ Music’, he offered the following advice:649

[A] score for a sound film or a play has to be more cautious so far as tonal structure is concerned than any continuous piece of music, because the episodical character of widely separated entries has to be counteracted by ever-alert methods of unification: if progressive tonalities must always make sense, they must make double sense in ‘talkies’.650

The call for music’s integration in the initial planning and scripting of a film never lost momentum, which in itself indicated that problems of cohesion and unity between these elements continued to exist. When Adorno and Eisler addressed this issue in their 1947 publication Composing for the Films,651 they objected strongly to the use of leitmotif in film music as a means of achieving coherence. They

---

646 Ibid.: 102.
argued that the latter's use in film only allowed a restricted use of leitmotif on barely more than a signposting level. This was because of the limited length of a film's constantly changing scenes, and that such a use fell seriously short of the breadth and complexity displayed in Wagner's operas.652

Kathryn Kalinak, a more recent film music theorist and writer, observed that, although not on the grand level of a Wagner opera, the early use of leitmotif was well suited to the silent film scores that were, like Wagner's operas, continuous and aligned to the text and the dramatic function. She further illustrated this connection between film and opera by citing W. Stephen Bush's comment in *Moving Picture World* (1911): “every man or woman in charge of music of a moving picture theatre is, consciously or unconsciously, a disciple of Richard Wagner”.653 Kalinak argued the continued use of leitmotif in sound pictures helped to counteract problems of continuity and unity, as her analysis of Erich Korngold's application of leitmotif associated with Peter Blood in the film *Captain Blood* (dir. Michael Curtiz. Warner Bros. 1935) revealed: “the leitmotivic score depended upon the principle of repetition as a means to structure diverse and discontinuous musical cues and the principle of variation as a means to clarify the visual text”.654

Applying techniques of opera composing to film music was, in Roy Prendergast's eyes, a completely natural thing to do.

The assertion...is that in opera the music is of primary importance and in films the music is nearly always a secondary factor to the total dramatic framework. This attitude reflects a fundamental misunderstanding of the dramatic function of music. The functional similarities between music in opera and music in films are fundamental and indicate a direct link between the two.655

654 *Ibid.*: 105
This direct link, according to Prendergast, led three influential film music composers living in Hollywood—Erich Korngold, Max Steiner and Alfred Newman, to draw from the operatic works of composers such as Wagner, Puccini, Verdi and Strauss to solve musical problems in film music scoring.\textsuperscript{656} Prendergast offered another reason why operatic techniques were so readily adapted to film as he answered the following question:

So why have film composers for the most part been content to use the old solutions, however valid, for dealing with the dramatic problems film presents? The answer is quite simple. Film is an extremely commercial form of art and, as such, must always pay its own way. While directors of films have had the chance to experiment and make serious but instructive errors, composers, because they are usually the last contributors to the corporate art of film, have had little opportunity to experiment with their art form.\textsuperscript{657}

Prendergast took into account the long-lasting debate on film music form and said that the common criticism that film music “lacks cohesive form” indicated “a total lack of understanding concerning the function of film music and its intimate relationship with other elements of the film”.\textsuperscript{658} He then asked the following question:

What of the entire picture? Is there some sort of cohesive form at work within the picture as a whole, and, if so, should the music reflect this underlying formal structure of the entire film?...Unlike the visuals of a film, which are ever-present and, as a result, have the opportunity for smooth organic growth, music is not one of the ongoing elements of a film.\textsuperscript{659}

This larger-scale perspective on a film’s joint visual and musical development was to some degree, reflected in Adorno and Eisler’s writings in 1947, when they acknowledged there was a different kind

\textsuperscript{656} Ibid.: 39.
\textsuperscript{657} Ibid.: 41.
\textsuperscript{658} Ibid.: 227.
\textsuperscript{659} Ibid.: 231.
of development possible in film music created by the relationship between the separated musical segments.660

Terminology evolved as written material on film music and various theories continued to develop. London, in 1936, categorised film music into two types, the first of which he defined as “the musical number based on rhythm” and the second “the detached item for a wordless scene”.661 Benjamin’s article, printed a year later, also defined two types of film music—realistic and background.662 He qualified the latter by saying background music should “take the colouring either of the surroundings or the emotion of the scene” and be “psychologically apt”.663 This was a point over which he was in disagreement with Honegger’s choice of music in Mayerling (dir. Anatole Litvak. Nero Film. 1935) where he felt the “rather sinister quality” of the music for Marie’s first visit to the palace unnecessarily pre-empted the tragic outcome of the story.

John Huntley, in his article for The Penguin Film Review in 1947, still felt the term ‘film music’ was vague and in need of further definition. These definitions fell yet again into two main categories—“Featured film music” and “Background music”. They paralleled both London and Benjamin’s definitions by respectively qualifying them as “music that in any way, either because of its familiarity or on account of its method or presentation, is not an integral part of the film itself but emerges as a unit of its own” and “a score specially written to fit the film”.664

The first of these film music categories, as defined by London, Benjamin and Huntley has become known as ‘diegetic’ music. This is the term given to ‘natural’ music that is performed on screen such as an actor singing, a piano being played or an orchestral performance

662 Benjamin is referring to diegetic music when he uses the word ‘realistic’.  
being listened to on the radio. Mary Hunter’s article ‘Opera in Film’ observed that the function of both diegetic music and use of quotation has largely been ignored in film music. Other music scholars such as Robbert Van der Lek defined the function of diegetic music in opera and film as resembling “that of a stage prop, in view of its status, function and stylistic features”.

Michel Chion created an impressive list of new terminology with which to analyse film music in his book *Audio-Vision. Sound on Screen* (1994). His discussions were detailed and focused on the differences in how visual and aural information is received by audiences. However, it is striking how often other scholars have felt it necessary to define Chion’s terminology for their readers. One example of this can be found in Roger Hillman’s publication *Unsettling Scores: German Film, Music, and Ideology*, where he lucidly explained Chion’s word ‘synchresis’ as the “internal combustion effect when sound and image impact on each other”. Such a fusion of audio and visual worlds is the best perspective from which to analyse film music and is an awareness that writers such as Balázs and Huntley encouraged. Even Chion’s use of the word *Audio-Vision* in his book’s title is a well-used term and has also appeared in the 1951 translation of Eisenstein’s early theories in *Film Form: Essays in Film Theory* (refer to page 159). As a further tribute to the creative thinking and imagination of these early film music theorists who were voicing their ideas at a time when Benjamin was developing his art, contemporary author on film, Elisabeth Weis, paid her respects to one of the earliest British film music theorists and in doing so brings us

---

full circle as she says Hitchcock’s films “prove that sound can be an equal partner to the image.”

### 3.3 Production of film music

Practical issues concerning the actual process of film making created new guidelines and conditions for composers to work under. There were many technical difficulties to negotiate and a new work force, in which Benjamin played only a part with considerably less control over the final outcome.

Benjamin neatly summed up the hierarchy of power that existed in the film world by saying: “Publicity is God and the box-office the Ark of the Covenant” for film directors and producers in England. The composer’s position in this hierarchy, as observed by Adorno and Eisler, was below that of the producer, script writer or film director; he was answerable to the music director and paid to fulfil a specialist job, and his position on this lower level of the employment ladder meant he was dispensable. A composer was ultimately answerable to the film’s director and producer who for the most part, according to Huntley in his 1947 publication *British Film Music*, did not accept the importance of music and the need to plan a film’s soundtrack with care equal to that lavished on the visuals. Indeed, as Hubert Clifford observed, not all film directors were actually “capable of designing imaginatively a soundtrack in terms of its constituent elements of effects, music and speech.” And Benjamin related with humour the limitations of some film director’s musicality:

---


An amusing story is told of a film-director who, on hearing the music-director turn to the composer and say, during a 'play-back,' 'That was a lovely modulation!', broke in with: 'O.K., boy. If you like that one, get a lot like it and have 'em put in the library.'

There are a few exceptions in early British sound pictures where the role of music was elevated to a level of greater importance. The score for *Things to Come* (dir. William Cameron Menzies. London Films. 1935) was, in Muir Mathieson's opinion, something of a milestone in British film music. For this production, the film's producer Alexander Korda, gave the author H. G. Wells virtual control and Wells had approached Arthur Bliss, who had never before written for film, to compose the score. Christopher Frayling, in his BFI Film Classics publication, recorded the differences between Korda's and Wells's view of film music by quoting from Wells's letter to Bliss dated October 17, 1934.

I am at issue with Korda and one or two other others of the group on the question of where and when you come in. They say—it is the Hollywood tradition—'We make the film right up to cutting. Then when we have cut, the musician comes in and puts on his music.'

I say 'Balls!' (I have the enthusiastic support of Grierson who makes Post Office films in that). I say 'A Film is a composition and the musical composer is an integral part of the design.'

Shortly before production of *Things to Come*, Benjamin had worked with Hitchcock on *The Man Who Knew Too Much* (1934). As a film director, Hitchcock was unusual in that, like Wells, he regarded music as an integral part of the film and was to cut the visuals for the Albert Hall scene after, and not before, Benjamin had composed the

---

music for *Storm Clouds Cantata*. This was part of a method Hitchcock admitted to using in his earlier films where he would “select the background first, then the action”.

But these instances where music was planned and composed in the early stages of a film’s conception were an exception rather than the rule. In most cases, as was told by Benjamin, the composer first viewed a film with the music director, and sometimes the film director, once it had reached the “rough-cut” stage. After having decided where music should be placed and the film cutting process was completed, the composer was given “actual footage” to which he composed music that was timed within fractions of a second to fit exactly. Time given to create a score was not a luxury of the film composer, with Benjamin remarking: “As much as thirty-five minutes (almost the length of a symphony) of music has been composed and scored for full orchestra in six days!” When Ralph Vaughan Williams was approached on a Saturday evening by Muir Mathieson to write music for what was to be his first film, *49th Parallel* (Dir. Michael Powell. Ortus Productions. 1941), he asked how much time he would have, to which Mathieson replied: “till Wednesday”. This was regarded by Vaughan Williams as one of the less advantageous sides to composing for film as the time restriction did not allow a composer the time and space in which to perfect a score.

Preparation of the score for recording could involve more than one process, depending on the film company and the industrial rules of the country hosting production of the film. Prendergast explained this part of the process by describing the industrial plant-like organisation of Hollywood music departments prevailing in America. Here, work was “compartmentalized” and comprised of “executives

---

680 Ibid.: 596.
and their secretaries; bookkeepers, librarians; rehearsal pianists; composers, arrangers, and orchestrators; copyists, proofreaders, and orchestral musicians" who all worked to the American Federation of Musicians rules. In the Hollywood production line, it was commonplace for a composer not to orchestrate his own music unless he could exert enough power and influence to insist upon it. This was the case with Korngold and Steiner, or if, as Lawrence Morton noted, he worked for a smaller, independent producer where different conditions brought about by economic restrictions ruled. In Britain, it was generally accepted that composers would undertake their own orchestration. To illustrate the differences in approach, the following quotation comes from Miklós Rózsa, a composer who wrote for film in both England and America:

[All my English films—ten of them—I orchestrated myself...The only man to have an orchestrator was Richard Addinsell. He was a dilettante. But otherwise, everyone—Arthur Bliss, for instance, or the Australian composer, Arthur Benjamin—all orchestrated themselves. But then I came to Hollywood with The Thief of Baghdad, which I had not finished. The war had broken out, Korda had no more money, and the stars, the chief editor came to Hollywood...I did not want to use an orchestrator. But the union said, 'It has to be a union member,' and I was not a union member. However, they understood that the film was done in England, and that I had already orchestrated 75 percent in England, and so they allowed me to orchestrate it here, but that was it.

Once a score was ready for recording, the conductor's and musicians' task was to synchronize a live performance with the visuals. Kalinak summed up three basic methods used in studios to facilitate synchronization. The first was a click track that provided a metronomic beat that was audible through headphones. The other

---

683 Ibid.: 86.
two devices, designed to prepare the conductor for the approach of an imminent visual event, included a 'punch'—a flashing light discernible while studying a score, and a 'streamer' which could be detected as a vertical line moving across the screen.686

When it came to the hiring of musicians for the recording sessions, Huntley, in 1947, drew attention to the fact that there were virtually no permanent orchestras in Britain devoted specifically to film and the musicians were hired according to the needs of each individual film; these could vary greatly from small chamber groups of twenty to thirty players to sizeable orchestras of sixty to seventy players.687 British musicians were, in Benjamin's own words: "a sort of miraculous being. Not only are his sight-reading and accuracy astounding, but also his ready understanding and his never-failing good-humour, under most trying conditions".688 One contributor to the 'trying conditions' was expressed in an article by violinist Edward Silverman, who quoted a colleague's remark during a recording session: "This boredom is not worth it, however much they paid us".689 Musicians often had long periods of time with little to do as the sound technicians were occupied with the challenging task of determining the best position of the microphone in relation to the instruments in order to achieve a good sound balance. Once this stage was completed, at least two good takes of every scene needed to be recorded.

Yet another perspective on the synchronization process was recorded in the writings of Adorno and Eisler. In order to time the music precisely with certain events on the screen, "a certain amount of planned improvisation" was a necessary skill on behalf of the conductor and composer, for even at this stage cuts and additions to the score and variations of tempo in performance could be

required. The musicians were well paid for recording sessions which attracted a high standard of performer, but Adorno and Eisler were critical of the effects such work induced on players:

[T]hey have to pay a high price for the money they earn...Short periods of inhuman strain are often followed by weeks of idleness...The gifts of the musicians are wasted and ruined.

The "short periods of inhuman strain" referred to in this quotation was reflected in a comment made by Benjamin in a 1956 radio talk on *The Man Who Knew Too Much* where he compared the difference between contemporary and early 1930s film recording sessions; for the 1956 remake of the film, musicians had been hired for three days to record ten minutes worth of music whereas "In the old days we recorded the entire music for the film in one 6-hour day in the old Kingsway Hall". Benjamin gave further insights into the pressures of recording sessions by writing:

[O]ften with a rush job the recording goes on until the early hours of the morning. The difficulties are enormous. It needs but little imagination to understand that it is no easy matter to record a scene lasting four or five minutes with, perhaps, points 'en route' which have to be perfectly synchronized in music and action. The whole job is an extremely 'nervy' affair. Tempers become a little frayed.

Recording music for film involved a different process from recordings for commercial gramophone companies. Huntley referred to the equipment used as a "sound camera" because the music, or audio signal, was photographically recorded in analogue form on the "sound track"—a strip that ran parallel to the sequence of frames on

---

691 Ibid.: 112-3.
692 Arthur Benjamin. 'The Man Who Knew Too Much' (radio script), recorded October 9, 1956, BBC North American Service (Benjamin Estate).
the film. This technology had difficulty in maintaining quality of sound in the higher and lower registers, and its sensitivity with the recordable range had limitations. Both Sabaneev and London alerted composers to these problems and gave detailed advice on which instruments fared best in such recording conditions. They also offered instruction on counterpoint and voice spacing, in order to attain the best quality of sound in film music recordings.

Mathieson, in an article 'Film Music' for the Royal College of Music Magazine, commented on the “lucid fashion” in which London had explained the requirements of the microphone, and discussed Eric Sarnette’s work, who, gifted with skills as a sound-engineer and composer, was one of the first to adjust his scoring for recording purposes. Mathieson noted that Sarnette fully utilised the woodwind and brass (instruments well disposed to recording), as well as his invention of new instruments specifically suited to the microphones such as a sax-trombone and a tuba-saxhorn with adjustable bells.695

Adorno and Eisler in 1947 assessed this period of film music recording which they considered had adverse affects on composing: “the experience of the radio showed long ago that the creation of compositions ‘adequate’ to the microphone led in practice to an unjustifiable over-simplification of musical language”.696 They considered composing with an awareness of the microphone’s limitations as something “still fashionable in 1932”, but now “obsolete” as great improvements had since been made in recording techniques. Whether composers were being fashionable or practical, Benjamin’s written article on film music in 1937 and his scoring for films in the 1930s, indicated his own level of awareness of the technical restrictions imposed on composers and this is discussed in greater detail with regard to Benjamin’s orchestration and counterpoint in chapter five.

695 Muir Mathieson. 'Film Music', Royal College of Music Magazine, Vol. XXXII, No. 3 (December 1936): 84.
Once the recording sessions had ended, the composer's involvement in the film's production usually ceased and the sound engineer, film and music director guided the film process through the final stages. One of these stages was called 'dubbing', a complicated procedure involving the integration of three sound tracks—music, dialogue and effects—to create a re-recording which was then synchronised with the visual images. This final stage created the sound-picture strip on the film which, when amplified through a loudspeaker, reached the ears of the audience.

Huntley openly admitted that even by 1947, there were still problems with this procedure.

|T|here is not the same degree of co-operation between the departments handling the sound-track as there is between the picture technicians, with the result that every now and then the dubbing completely destroys an effect which the composer planned with great care, or similarly the sound department is faced with a great swelling mass of music at the point where the dialogue needs special emphasis.697

These results often gave rise to disappointment for many composers, as noted by Benjamin.

The dubbing, as has been mentioned, completes the film. Dubbing, in this country, is not yet good. There seems to be a timidity lest the music should cover up any other sound. But they have mastered this abroad.

Walton's lovely pastoral music in 'As You Like It' was almost completely lost every time a sheep said 'Ma-a-a.' One day it will be an essential part of a sound-engineer's training to be able to read a music score.698

The composer Rozsa described the dubbing as an “unhappy process”, the fault of which lay not with the composer but “mostly in

---

the producer's musical taste, since it is the primary job of the composer to satisfy him.\textsuperscript{699} Huntley recounted an incident whereby the composer, whose name was not mentioned but judging from the information given, must have been John Ireland, "left the cinema in disgust on finding that the apple of his musical eye had been placed in competition with the thunder of stampeding cattle during a sequence in an Australian film."\textsuperscript{700}

The cutting process of a film has already been referred to at an earlier stage in a film's development but the director and producer were liable to continue cutting in the very late stages as well, regardless of the effect this had on the logical flow of the music. Composers, Benjamin included, composed in such a way as to minimise unpleasant surprises from unforeseen late cuts. John Riley noted that Shostakovich "completely changed his way of film scoring, producing small pieces that could be easily cut, altered and shuffled around" to compensate for cuts and altered lengths of film footage that might be incurred in the earlier stages of production for the film \textit{Alone} (dir. Grigori Kozintsev and Leonid Trauberg. Feks. 1931).\textsuperscript{701} This ability on behalf of the composer was described by Adorno and Eisler as the practice of "planned improvisation" whereby the music was written in such a way that could accommodate such treatment.\textsuperscript{702}

Perhaps the most remarkable illustration of the extent of producers', directors' and sound technicians' lack of musicality was the account given by Rózsa.

Very often, after having recorded the music, they find that the picture is too long, and then the music will be handled as merchandise sold by the yard,


\textsuperscript{700} John Huntley. 'Film Music', \textit{The Penguin Film Review}, No. 4. London & New York: Penguin Books, 1947: 18. Based on the information given by Huntley, the film could only have been \textit{The Overlanders} (Dir. Harry Watt. Ealing Studios. 1946).


to be cut to the required length... You can imagine how surprised I was to hear a composition of mine after the sound cutter, in order to fit the music to the new length of the scene, had cut out every second bar. The effect was indeed astonishing.\textsuperscript{703}

The film music director Hubert Clifford tried to bring attention to this “irritating waste” of music in films, and his suggestion to do “the intelligent thing” and bring the composer and music director together with the director and editor earlier in the film’s conception “while the film is still in a plastic condition” was, by 1944, a familiar cry in musical circles.\textsuperscript{704}

3.4 Benjamin’s work colleagues and the attitudes of other musicians and writers towards film music

Although Benjamin classed himself as “one of the pioneers in film music”, he was obviously not working in isolation and was subject to the ideas and advice of a number of people. Experience as a film music composer involved ‘hands on’ work as there were no official training courses available. Film directors and music directors, together with other film composers, writers and critics, were the people he would have learnt his craft from.

As far as reading material was concerned, there were, at that time, only a small number of publications available. These were not necessarily of British origin, as indicated by Benjamin’s reference to Louis le Sidner’s article ‘L’importance du Cinématographe’ in Mercure de France.\textsuperscript{705} Benjamin’s readiness to access resources outside Britain was further illustrated in his article’s discussion of not only the British films The Private Life of Henry VIII (dir. Alexander Korda. London Films. 1933) and Secret Agent (dir. Alfred Hitchcock.


\textsuperscript{704} Hubert Clifford. ‘British Film Music: Documentary Films’, Tempo, No. 8 (September 1944): 14.


Within Britain, the Cinema Quarterly began production in the early 1930s. Film directors Paul Rotha and John Grierson respectively reviewed French and American films—*La Maternelle* (dir. Jean Benoit-Lévy. Photosonor. 1932) and *Mayor of Hell* (dir. Archie Mayo. Warner. 1933). 706 Russian film was featured in articles such as ‘Pudovkin on Sound’ in which the celebrated Soviet director Pudovkin challenged the “occidentals” failure to use sound dramatically. 707

Other articles in the Cinema Quarterly included one by the composer, Walter Leigh, entitled ‘The Musician and the Film’. Leigh’s advice to the novice film music composer was “to abandon many musical conventions” when approaching “this new problem of film-sound as a fresh art with many unexplored possibilities” and to be aware that one of the most important factors was the virtue of economy. 708 Leigh had recently completed scoring for the documentary film *Song of Ceylon* (dir. Basil Wright. Ceylon Tea Board. 1934) and his article elaborated on one particular experiment in the recording sessions where a microphone had been swung up close to a struck gong to pick up its vibrations. 709 These early articles, unlike the later publications by the authors London and Sabaneev, would have been easily available to Benjamin from his earliest pioneering days in film music.

---

709 Ibid.: 74.
One of the most influential people in direct contact with Benjamin was the man responsible for his introduction to film music, Muir Mathieson. As explained in chapter two, Mathieson’s vision was to supply high quality music for films by recruiting the best possible British composers. Part of his job would therefore have been to guide and instruct such novices in this new art. Much of his advice was drawn from first-hand experience but his knowledge was also sourced from the latest publications. In his article titled ‘Film Music’, written for the RCM Magazine in 1936,\textsuperscript{710} he reviewed Kurt London’s recent publication \textit{Film Music} and surveyed a range of composers’ approaches to the challenge of scoring for the limitations of the microphones—Eric Sarnette, Giuseppe Becce, Hanns Eisler, Karol Rathaus, Tibor von Harsany, Walter Leigh, George Auric, Arthur Bliss and Arthur Benjamin.\textsuperscript{711}

Mathieson had always believed that film music would be valued not just as a component of a film but “as an entity in itself”. The scores would eventually take their place in concert hall programmes, as had been the case with the best of theatre music, for example, the suites of \textit{Peer Gynt} and \textit{A Midsummer Night’s Dream}.\textsuperscript{712} His own concerts in which he had conducted programmes of British film music “all over the country” had, in his opinion, met with “tremendous enthusiasm” and he had recently performed a programme in Prague with the Hraje Filmo Symposium Orchestra consisting of music for \textit{Henry V} (William Walton), \textit{49th Parallel} (Ralph Vaughan Williams), \textit{Things to Come} (Arthur Bliss) and \textit{Malta G.C.} (Sir Arnold Bax) and \textit{Instruments of the Orchestra} (Benjamin Britten).\textsuperscript{713}

By 1944, Mathieson boldly claimed that “the standard of music in British films is at the present time as high, if not higher, than any

\textsuperscript{710} Muir Mathieson. ‘Film Music’, \textit{Royal College of Music Magazine}, Vol. XXXII, No. 3 (December 1936): 83-5.
\textsuperscript{711} Ibid.: 84.
\textsuperscript{712} Muir Mathieson. ‘Aspects of Film Music’, \textit{Tempo}, No. 9 (December 1944): 7.
other country'.\textsuperscript{714} This, he believed, was developing the listening abilities of audiences and training them to recognise and "demand" quality music in films.\textsuperscript{715} Such a 'demand' for better music had already been voiced by a Miss Elizabeth Cross, who attended a Film Music Forum as early as 1935,

We hate the music, or most of it. Not only is it painfully loud, but equally painfully obvious. Even when someone fresh is allowed to write the 'incidental' music to a so-called serious film, they are so cowed that they do it in their sleep and merely cough up the good old phrases that indicate 'came the dawn' or 'a gallant ship sailed on to her doom', etc., etc.,...But surely, after all these years, we can grow up just a bit...No, on the whole we think a lot of the music is plain lousy.\textsuperscript{716}

Although Mathieson "would not for a moment suggest that writing for films should be the one aim of any composer", he asserted that composing for film held certain benefits for composers.\textsuperscript{717}

Film music has already opened up many new fields in the use of dramatic music; indeed, the composer of to-day who has a leaning towards opera can often find an outlet in films at a time when the production of native works in this country can offer only a very limited opening.

Benjamin’s working relationship with Muir Mathieson was an agreeable one which spanned from their first film \textit{Wharves and Strays} until Benjamin’s last years with \textit{Fire Down Below}. Mathieson’s knowledge of the workings of film even extended to the joint role of film and music director for \textit{Steps of the Ballet} for which Benjamin composed a short twenty-minute ballet and briefly appeared on-screen talking and playing the piano.

Other film directors were another influential factor on the music Benjamin was composing. The most important of these was

\textsuperscript{714} Muir Mathieson. 'Aspects of Film Music', \textit{Tempo}, No. 9 (December 1944): 9.
\textsuperscript{715} Ibid.: 8.
\textsuperscript{717} Muir Mathieson. 'Aspects of Film Music', \textit{Tempo}, No. 9 (December 1944): 8.
Hitchcock, whose understanding and use of music in films has been much commented on. Most composers, as Benjamin stated in writing, had “not met the film-director” before shooting the film. But as is borne out in Hitchcock’s 1933 interview with Stephen Watts for *Cinema Quarterly*, and in the words of the American composer Bernard Herrmann who worked closely with Hitchcock in the 1950s, Hitchcock was able to work with composers “through the shooting of a film”. Jack Sullivan’s recent study of music in Hitchcock’s films neatly summed up the extent of this film director’s involvement with composers by saying:

Some of the richest scores were written the most quickly, under fantastic pressure, but only after Hitchcock made the concept forcefully clear...Using detailed notes, Hitchcock plotted sounds, effects, musical emotions, and even technical devices, then let the composer ‘figure things out for himself.’ This legendary control addict knew when to get out of the way.

When interviewed in 1933, Hitchcock already believed music was a powerful component in the film making process and regarded the appeal of both cinema and music as essentially emotional. He believed film music was able “to create excitement”, “to heighten intensity”, “to express the unspoken” and could offer “great possibilities” if it was used to comment in a psychological capacity on the screen action. Many years later in another interview with François Truffaut, Hitchcock again referred to the focus on the emotional content of his film making and its importance in creating suspense which he regarded as “the most powerful means of holding on to the viewer’s attention”. In Hitchcock’s opinion, “the screen rectangle must be charged with emotion” and constant clarification.

---

and simplification were also considered important disciplines if a
director were to “make a point, or get to the point”. Hitchcock also
acknowledged one of his past methods that was applied to The Man
Who Knew Too Much (1934) which involved the selection of
“backgrounds or events that would lend themselves to a colourful,
melodramatic motion picture”.724

Alexander Korda was the founder of London Films, for which
Benjamin scored several films. Although Korda only personally
directed one film—An Ideal Husband (1947)—in which Benjamin was
composer, his influence over musical decisions in his company’s films
is still worth mentioning. It was very clear from Benjamin’s letters to
Ralph Hawkes (referred to in chapter two) that he and Korda were
incompatible on music matters.725 And Benjamin wasn’t the only
composer to have such difficulties. Arthur Bliss, who had composed
the score for Things to Come (1935), recalled in a 1974 interview that
“Alexander Korda wasn’t musical in any sense”.726 Another incident,
recorded in Paul Tabori’s book entitled Alexander Korda: A biography,
recounted how Korda, in the making of The Thief of Baghdad (dir.
Michael Powell, Ludwig Berger, Tim Whelan, Zoltan Korda. London
Films. 1940), had to rely upon Miklós Rózsa’s verdict and subsequent
rejection of the original score for the film before taking action to avert
what Mathieson and Rózsa foresaw as an artistic disaster.727

The genre of film could affect conditions under which
composers worked. Benjamin mainly wrote for feature films but he
also wrote for a number of documentary-like films, namely Wharves
and Strays (1935), Lobsters (1936), Cumberland Story (1947) and
Steps of the Ballet (1948). This category in itself had implications for
composers as the 1930s documentary had developed close ties with

725 Footnote 235: Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph & Clare Hawkes, August 27, 1947
(Boosey & Hawkes New York correspondence file) and footnote 236: Letter from Arthur
Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, September 21, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes New York
correspondence file).
the later emergence of modernism. Experimental writers involved in documentary films included Charles Madge, David Gascoyne, W.H. Auden, and E.M. Forster. And names such as Humphrey Jennings, Julian Treveleyan and Len Lye were bringing new perspectives through modernist art and photography. Tyrus Miller argued that the modernist documentary freshened viewers minds "through 'defamiliarizing' means", and the montage effect and radical reportage favoured by Lye and Jennings "detoured out of the documentation of 'daily doing' onto the pathways of mind and thought."  

A number of articles appearing in *Cinema Quarterly* between 1933 and 1934 were written by directors of documentaries, such as John Grierson and Paul Rotha, who drew a clear dividing line between "story film" and documentaries—as is illustrated by Rotha's statement:

[T]hree demands must be made by the documentary director; the right to theorise, the right to experiment (time and footage), and the right to attempt to satisfy his conscience...But if it is not to go the way of story-film, documentary must be protected against exploitation for commercial profit alone. Its directors must retain freedom for their ideals.  

In 1933, the General Post Office had founded a new film unit, headed by John Grierson, that produced short informative documentaries about post office, telephone and other services provided to the public. Mathieson described their work by saying: "In this country the 'documentary' film makers have always been the adventurers". Although his stay in Britain was brief, László Moholy-Nagy (1895–1946) was typical of the kind of artist working in the documentary genre; a Hungarian professor at the Bauhaus design

---

731 Muir Mathieson. 'Aspects of Film Music', *Tempo*, No. 9 (December 1944): 9.
school who had fled Nazi Germany in 1935, *Lobsters* was the first of two films he made in Britain before moving to America in 1937.

Grierson considered the documentary film a “new art” and the young Benjamin Britten was to create imaginative scores for such films as *Coal Face* (dir. Alberto Cavalcanti. GPO Film Unit. 1935) and *Night Mail* (dir. Basil Wright and Harry Watt. GPO Film Unit. 1936). Both films assimilated an array of inventive sound effects within the musical score together with poetry by W. H. Auden.\(^{732}\) Huntley noted that the music for the documentary *Song of Ceylon* was composed by Walter Leigh before the film had been cut, an approach that Huntley described as “unheard-of at that time” and one that was shortly afterwards used by Hitchcock when he cut his film to Benjamin’s pre-composed score for the Royal Albert Hall scene in *The Man Who Knew Too Much*.\(^{733}\)

Other individuals influencing Benjamin’s work on the six films chosen for study in this thesis are discussed further in chapter four, leaving one other set of less direct influences deserving mention. These include other composers’ attitudes towards film music, the opinions of his publisher Ralph Hawkes and the film theorists and critics writing at the time. In a BBC interview in 1949, Benjamin was recorded to have said: “film music to me is a very important job”.\(^{734}\) It is therefore disappointing to find that very few manuscripts of his film music scores survive. Only the *Waltz and Hyde Park Galop* from *An Ideal Husband* (1947) and a song *The Fire of Your Love* from *Master of Bankdam* (1947) were published by Boosey & Hawkes. It is possible that Benjamin lost the scores in his many moves over the years, or that they were destroyed by the studios themselves or in the occasional studio fire. This also suggests the fact that Benjamin did not compose film music with the concert hall in mind, or he would have at least kept copies of the scores and presumably sought to have

---


\(^{734}\) ‘British Composers—Arthur Benjamin’, Recorded April 27, 1949 (British Library Sound Archive, reference ICE0000 559 and 560, label BBC X 13318).
them published. There were occasions in Benjamin's lifetime when his film scores were performed in concerts conducted by Muir Mathieson. One such programme featured a suite extracted from the score for *Wings of the Morning* (1937) and two dances from *The Scarlet Pimpernel* (1934). These were performed and broadcast prior to 1939 on the BBC National Programme alongside works by other composers such as Arthur Bliss (suite from *Things to Come* and *Conquest of the Air*), Miklós Rózsa (*The Divorce of Lady X*) and William Walton (*Escape Me Never*) but again, the scores do not survive.

The monetary rewards of writing for films were an attraction acknowledged by many composers. Bliss admitted that "to be brutally frank" the lure of film music was financial reward, and Adorno and Eisler were equally matter-of-fact when they said: "No serious composer writes for the motion pictures for any other than money reasons". This financial aspect surfaced twice in Benjamin's letters to Ralph Hawkes and Frank Hutchens (see chapter two). Ralph Hawkes, when writing for *Tempo* in 1946, saw film music as a valuable source of income for composers with remuneration reaching as high as £1,500 for a full-length feature film. But he tempered such advantages by listing several drawbacks: the music being "mutilated by the film director", disappearing with the film, disadvantaged by the restricted time given for composition, seldom "put to any other use afterwards" and rarely successful in the concert hall.

Opinions such as those voiced by Adorno, Eisler and Hawkes were indicative of another perspective prevalent in the 30s and 40s, which viewed film music as an inferior art. Adorno and Eisler offered one explanation for this:

---

735 A *Wings of the Morning* suite is wrongly attributed to Arthur Bliss in Huntley's *British Film Music*.
739 Footnotes 479 and 600 of chapter two.
Motion-picture music, however, suffers from a particular handicap: from the very beginning it has been regarded as an auxiliary art not of first-rank importance. In the early days it was entrusted to anyone who happened to be around and willing...This created an affinity between inferior ‘hack’ musicians, busybodies, and motion-picture music.741

A. L. Bacharach noted the separation in Arthur Bliss’s own mind between film music and concert hall music by observing: “the popular note found in his film music finds no place in his major works”,742 a comment that is further supported by the following statement by Bliss:

[W]hile I was writing my Things to Come music, I felt that I was to some extent surrendering my musical individuality to the needs of the film itself; so, as a kind of mental purgative, I wrote my ‘Music for Strings,’ which, of course, is absolute music.743

Miklós Rózsa’s opinions of the quality of film music in the mid-thirties led him to believe composing for films was not a suitable medium for a serious composer. This, at the time, resulted in his refusal of an offer by French director Jacques Feyder to write for a film, and when he became engaged in a conversation with Feyder he was surprised to learn the director was not interested in the habitual “fox-trot”.744 Rózsa soon became immersed in the world of film music, first in Britain and then in Hollywood, and he recalled a story of the struggles he encountered when collaborating with film personnel whose music appreciation and skills were limited. After enduring serious criticism of his score from the music director of Double Indemnity (dir. Billy Wilder. Paramount. 1944), Rózsa decided to

stand his ground and not change a note, a decision which ended up rewarding him with praise for his original score.

The story gives one some idea how difficult it was to maintain any decent level of musical integrity in the Hollywood of those days. People with a ‘serious’ musical upbringing such as Herrmann, Korngold and myself were the exception rather than the rule.745

Others like Arnold Bax, were frustrated with the technical difficulties encountered, particularly problems with dubbing, which he felt compromised the music too much and thus rendered the medium unsatisfactory from the composer’s point of view.746

Kurt London succinctly described the position of film music at a Film Music Forum in 1935 with these words: “The music which accompanies the film is still struggling for its place in the sun”.747 Benjamin was obviously part of that struggle, which he expressed in fairytale imagery in the opening statement of his 1937 article: “If music be the Cinderella of the arts, cinema music is one of the Ugly Sisters”.748 Benjamin’s solution was to raise the quality of cinema music through intelligent and perceptive criticism.

Many others equally believed the worth of film music criticism. Hans Keller’s critiques encountered “vicious” opposition and he was advised his reputation as a music critic would be endangered if he insisted on encompassing film music as well.749 But Keller was passionate about the need to raise the quality of film music through competent criticism for two reasons: he believed in film music as a serious art-form and saw its potential either to become “a weapon of mass destruction” or to enhance the musical education of the general

---

747 Ibid.: 156.
Adorno and Eisler, in their own way, also sought to raise standards of film music through criticism, by complaining in print that music was treated like "an outsider who is somehow regarded as being indispensable". But film music criticism itself was in need of education, as pointed out by Ernest Irving who deemed some of the criteria for judging film music as inappropriate when he wrote: "it is not fair [n]or indeed practicable to criticize film scores as pure music, as the final criterion of their value is the closeness of their fitting and the help they give to the film".

From the standpoint of a highly gifted composer writing for film, Benjamin Britten saw "great possibilities in music for the films" and reinforced the very familiar call for closer collaboration between the director and composer in order for music to become an integral part of a film. Vaughan Williams, like many musicians, was of the same opinion and although he began writing later for film, his first being 49th Parallel (dir. Michael Powell. Ortus. 1941), he recognised both the limitations and the potential of this art.

At present I still feel a morning blush in my art, and it has not yet paled into the light of common day. I still believe that the film contains potentialities for the combination of all the arts such as Wagner never dreamt of.

Film music, as an art-form, was evolving and in Erich Korngold's opinion, there already existed film scores of quality that, long after the picture had been forgotten, would "be long remembered by musicians as containing some rare musical writing" and "some of the finest examples of orchestral music which our age has

---

750 Ibid.: 22.
produced”. Such optimism led him to make the following prediction for film music as an art-form.

I feel certain that this picture starts the transition period. We no longer have to lean on Puccini, Verdi or Mascagni. Producers have realised that public taste in music has risen, and we are now conducting a test which will eventually lead to the writing of entire modern operas for the screen. When that day comes, composers will accept the motion picture as a musical form equal to the opera or the symphony.

Muir Mathieson was equally optimistic about film music’s future and John Huntley, on a more practical level, had written about the gradual evolution of British film music that, in his opinion, had culminated in 1945. He believed, like Mathieson, that film music could offer a “good composer” who was able to enter “into the spirit of the thing” many advantages—financial gain, experience, “rigid discipline”, an outlet for dramatic sensibilities and “a substitute for the almost dead art of Opera”—without him losing his artistic integrity.

### 3.5 Conclusion

When Benjamin began employment in the film industry in 1934, he was entering a vibrant and experimental new work environment. Although publications at this time were limited in number, the quality of those, such as the *Cinema Quarterly*, were up-to-date with the latest theories and film releases, and international in their coverage. What he could not learn from written sources, he learnt first-hand from a team of experts such as Muir Mathieson, Alfred Hitchcock and a small handful of other composers, either directly, or by viewing their work in films.

---

756 *Give us this Night*. Dir. Alexander Hall. Paramount, 1936.
759 Ibid.: 19.
British composers expressed mixed feelings about the medium of film music. Bax and Bliss believed their musical standards were compromised by the nature of film and its production methods, but others like Benjamin and Vaughan Williams accepted it as an evolving new art form and were prepared to be flexible and imaginative in the way they applied their skills according to the demands of film. Vaughan Williams, an older composer already established in terms of recognition and musical maturity, initially saw writing for film as an opportunity to contribute to the war effort and subsequently discovered it to be "a splendid discipline".\textsuperscript{760} Benjamin, as a younger composer who from childhood had been fascinated by the stage, was most likely drawn to the medium because it offered opportunities to explore drama, to experiment with sounds and instrumentation, and to develop his command of operatic techniques. Muir Mathieson observed these advantages for composers and still more when he wrote the following:

I have also found in the case of most composers, that the very encouragement to be prolific, while writing for the films, is an incentive to shake themselves free from any of the weaker stuff of which even the best composers have to rid themselves at some time or other. All this can be corrected, and then there is room for the better musical thoughts to find their way through.\textsuperscript{761}

Despite the inferior treatment and regard of film music from many quarters, Benjamin devoted considerable time and energy to this discipline between the years 1934–7 at a stage when his own compositional voice was still being defined and at a time when film music was still highly experimental and subject to much debate. It could be argued that Benjamin resumed scoring film music, albeit more sporadically, on his return to London in 1947 because of the


\textsuperscript{761} Muir Mathieson, 'Aspects of Film Music', \textit{Tempo}, No. 9 (December 1944): 8.
shortage of work in post-war Britain. But this would not account for his continued involvement until a couple of years before his death when he was enjoying considerable success financially and career-wise. The money, no doubt, would have been a bonus, especially for the odd "extravagant holiday", but one presumes he genuinely enjoyed working with his long-time collaborator on film Muir Mathieson,\textsuperscript{762} music director for the greater majority of Benjamin’s films, and with whom he shared a basic belief in the intrinsic value of film music as an art form.

\textsuperscript{762} Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Frank Hutchens, November 25, 1957 (National Library of Australia, MS 2066 Series 1/28).
Chapter 4

Film Music 1934–7
4.1 Introduction

Benjamin’s career as a film music composer is divided by a ten year interval into two time periods, 1934–7 and 1947–58. For the purpose of this thesis, only music from the first film period is analysed in this chapter. Benjamin is credited with having composed music for twelve films in the course of these four years from which a selection of six have been chosen for closer study—The Man Who Knew Too Much (1934), The Clairvoyant (1935), Turn of the Tide (1935), Lobsters (1936), Wings of the Morning (1937) and Under the Red Robe (1937).

Practical considerations have determined this selection, such as the availability of the film material itself. For example, it has not been possible to view the following films: Wharves and Strays (1934), The Private Life of Don Juan (1934), The Guv’nor (1935) and The Reign of King George V (1935). Two other films, The Scarlet Pimpernel (1934) and Return of the Scarlet Pimpernel (1937), have been omitted because the use of music is limited in terms of frequency and duration.

As was common practice with early film scores, the majority of Benjamin’s works were destroyed and the only surviving manuscript is for the Hitchcock film The Man Who Knew Too Much. It has therefore been necessary to transcribe the music examples for the remaining five films from repeated listening to the soundtracks themselves. The author encountered many problems with this task, mostly arising from the compromised sound quality of these early films resulting from the limited recording techniques of the day. This, together with the age of the films, all of which are now over seventy years old, add to the unclear and often “muddy” recordings, making it difficult to distinguish every small detail in instrumentation and dynamic level. Another aspect affecting these recordings is the equipment on which films are shown. Different machines ‘run’ the film at different speeds and this alters not only the speed of the visuals on screen but the pitch of the music as well. The normal

763 The manuscript is lodged with Paramount Music Library.
running speed for sound films is 24 frames per second but when screened on television the speed increases to 25 frames per second and the author has been informed that some of the study material available may have been sourced from the latter. This means that without a score to show the composer’s original choice of key, caution needs to be exercised regarding any arguments placing special significance to one particular key or pitch, but it is possible to study the relationship of keys and pitches within a single film score as these will still be relative.

The other factor influencing Benjamin’s film scores were the demands arising from the very nature of film music itself, as discussed in chapter three. These will be taken into consideration in this analysis of the six films to see if Benjamin’s compositional thinking involved adapting and responding to the challenges presented by this new medium.

4.2 *The Man Who Knew Too Much* (1934)

In a radio talk given by Benjamin in 1956, he acknowledged the 1934 production of *The Man Who Knew Too Much* as his first feature film. He explained that his “only other experience of writing for film had been a ‘short’ in which that adorable dog ‘Scruffy’ starred, showing a day in his life on the London docks”. When working on the Hitchcock film, Benjamin felt himself “lucky that in my first big film the director cut the film to my music”, an approach that was not to be repeated by any other director he worked with. Benjamin’s musical contribution to this film was the main title music lasting twenty-eight bars, the hymn *Praise we Apollo’s Beams* sung in the Tabernacle of the Sun, and a *Storm Clouds Cantata*. The latter was scored for mezzo-soprano solo, choir and orchestra, which was

---

765 *Ibid*. Benjamin was referring to *Wharves and Strays* which was released the following year.
766 *Ibid*. 
performed in London’s Royal Albert Hall in the climactic scene where an assassination is attempted.\textsuperscript{767} Other music in the film was credited to Louis Levy, Harry M. Woods and Charles Williams.\textsuperscript{768} Louis Levy, the film’s music director, had distinguished himself arranging and performing music in the silent film era during which he was credited with the development of the idea of the theme song which was then taken up by Hollywood.\textsuperscript{769} Levy was known to arrange and commission music from other composers, even though the credits only acknowledged Levy’s name as music director.\textsuperscript{770} In John Huntley’s opinion, Levy was instructed by Hitchcock to engage a composer of considerable skill for \textit{The Man Who Knew Too Much}—one who was capable of writing for full symphony orchestra or as Huntley expressed it, somebody who could do better than “little twiddly bits you know, the sort that you’re used to. It’s got to be good”.\textsuperscript{771}

Hitchcock’s use of music in films was already attracting attention as early as 1933, as discussed in chapter three, and his daughter Patricia, in an interview with Jack Sullivan, explained that even though he had no musical training or aptitude, he regularly attended classical concerts.\textsuperscript{772} Hitchcock’s clarity of thought and methods of working suggest Benjamin would have received a certain amount of instruction before composing the music. For example, Herbert Coleman, associate producer for many of the Paramount films, recounted: “We liked to plan everything. Hitch didn’t like surprises on the set or during the production of a film”.\textsuperscript{773} And Louis Levy, in his book \textit{Music for the Movies}, explained that although Hitchcock was obviously not a trained musician, he still had “a way

\textsuperscript{768} \textit{Ibid.}: 219 footnote 12.
\textsuperscript{771} \textit{Ibid.}
of expressing himself so clearly that I always left our musical
cconferences with a tune written clearly in my mind, almost as though
Hitchcock had written it". Hitchcock was therefore able to
communicate to his colleagues, regardless of their discipline, that
degree of planning and attention to detail that was required for their
part in the making of his films. Sullivan summed up this creative
collaboration with the following words:

Some of the richest scores were written the most quickly, under fantastic
pressure, but only after Hitchcock had made the concept forcefully
clear...Using detailed notes, Hitchcock plotted sounds, effects, musical
emotions, and even technical devices, then let the composer 'figure things
out for himself.' This legendary control addict knew when to get out of the
way.775

Benjamin, who described himself in 1934 as a "young composer" in
terms of experience,776 gave his own account of working with
Hitchcock by saying:

I consider that to have been a part of such a striving after perfection and
such care for artistic endeavour was a privilege I shall not forget, and one
which happens all too rarely to a composer of film music.777

Music scholars James Wierzbicki, Murray Pomerance and Jack
Sullivan have contributed relatively recent publications on
Hitchcock's use of music. Their analysis brings another dimension to
this film, as Hitchcock's 1956 revision of the work resulted in a
second score for the Royal Albert Hall scene that was based on the
original. James Wierzbicki's article 'Grand Illusion: The 'Storm Cloud'
Music in Hitchcock's The Man Who Knew Too Much', explained the
differences between the two scores for the Royal Albert Hall scene
such as the duration—four minutes and twelve seconds in the 1934

---

776 Arthur Benjamin. 'The Man Who Knew Too Much', (radio script) recorded October 9, 1956
(Benjamin Estate).
777 Ibid.
score, and nine minutes and seven seconds in the 1956 score, a
difference that is considerably longer than the one and a half minute
extension originally requested by Hitchcock for the remake.778 Figure
4.1, taken from Wierzbicki's article,779 illustrated the 'cut and paste'
job based on the original 1934 cantata score and title music that,
together with slower tempi, resulted in the extra duration Hitchcock
required.

Figure 4.1 Wierzbicki's comparative analysis of the sections comprising both versions
of the cantata.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Order and durations of sections in the 1934 and 1956 versions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>of Arthur Benjamin's &quot;Storm Cloud Cantata&quot; *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1934</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1956</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tempo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lento</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allegro agitato</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Wierzbicki argued the compositional structure of the 1934
score was superior to the 1956 reworking and claimed the latter
"severely diminishes the music's potential for suspense" especially
with the repeat of material at the start of the Allegro agitato.780 The
words "grand illusion" in his article's title referred to the cantata's
ability to be perceived as a "large-scale work", despite its brevity in
time, owing to the wealth of musical material presented and "from its
structural solidity" and seemingly organic "growth from within", an
attribution often associated with large-scale compositions.781

Other scholars such as Elizabeth Weis were in disagreement
with Wierzbicki by believing the 1956 version to be "a decided
improvement on the first" and better suited to Hitchcock's purpose.782

778 Letter from Fjastad to Arthur Benjamin, March 11, 1955 (Margaret Herrick Library,
Hitchcock Collection/The Man Who Knew Too Much/Arthur Benjamin).
779 James Wierzbicki. 'Grand Illusion: The 'Storm Cloud' Music in Hitchcock's The Man Who
780 James Wierzbicki. 'Grand Illusion: The 'Storm Cloud' Music in Hitchcock's The Man Who
782 Elisabeth Weis. The Silent Scream: Alfred Hitchcock's Sound Track. London & Toronto:
The debate extended to the text by D. B. Wyndham-Lewis where, for reasons that are not clear, the line which Benjamin chose to repeat in the 1934 version ‘All save the child’, was replaced with the much less specific words ‘Yet stood the trees’. Pomerance argued these words gave the scene greater potency than the original text, which he claimed would be “irritatingly pat, maudlin, and then thin”. Sullivan made the additional observation that the hand that wrote these changed words on the manuscript was not, as some believe, Herrmann’s and claimed it to be Benjamin’s, based on the advice of Christopher Husted of Bernard Herrmann Music. Although I do not feel qualified to comment on Herrmann’s hand-writing, I doubt that the hand is that of Benjamin as the writing on the cantata manuscript is squarer and more controlled than Benjamin’s, whose hand is more flowing and elaborate. Benjamin’s account of his writing skills learnt as a child reinforced this impression: “We all learnt to write ‘copperplate’—a rather pleasing accomplishment I retain to this day”.

Hitchcock made the following comparison between the two versions of the film in an interview with François Truffaut: “Let’s say that the first version is the work of a talented amateur and the second was made by a professional”. But as Sullivan pointed out, this statement was not to be taken too seriously when one realises it was made during an interview in which Truffaut persistently “belittled the original and praised the remake”, and described as “far superior” the Cantata’s additional length and Herrmann’s changes in the orchestration. Yakowar added another perspective to Hitchcock’s comment by quoting another statement

which revealed just how aware and how adaptable Hitchcock was to certain audience tastes.

The old one is fairly slipshod structurally. Still, around that 1935 period, the audience would accept more, the films of the period were full of fantasy, and one didn't have to worry too much about logic or truth. When I came to America, the first thing I had to learn was that the audiences were more questioning. I'll put it another way. Less avant garde.  

The author, though, is in agreement with Wierzbicki's findings, and the following analysis of the 1934 cantata reveals a highly focused score whose form responds directly to the film's drama. Benjamin's own understanding of the music's function for this scene was expressed in a 1956 radio talk:

[The climax of the plot actually revolves around the music in that exciting scene in the Albert Hall when the gangsters, knowing that at the height of a climax in the work being performed there is a clash on the cymbals, use this clash to cover up the shot fired to assassinate the Ambassador.  

As an example of the unusual musical forms demanded of composers arising from the nature of film, Hitchcock would have indicated to Benjamin the need for a single cymbal crash in the closing moments of the performance. Dialogue for this scene was limited to only three short sentences spoken by the conspirators as the camera twice cuts away from the concert hall to their headquarters. Hitchcock's visuals were timed to, and inspired by, the emotional power of the music as dictated by his decision to cut the film after the recording was made. Hitchcock's concept demanded a keen sense of planning and timing from the composer and Benjamin responded on a number of levels, including the structuring of the score. The music is composed


791 Arthur Benjamin. 'The Man Who Knew Too Much', (radio script) recorded October 9, 1956 (Benjamin Estate).
of three sections that are distinguished by changing tempi and mood, as outlined in Figure 4.2.792

**Figure 4.2 Three sections of Storm Clouds Cantata.**

Their durations are 2'19", 1'26" and 27" with the length of each section, as it were, closing or telescoping in on the climax in bar 122 of a work totalling 126 bars. Perhaps the following parallels are fanciful, but this structure is not unlike looking down a gun-barrel or the feeling of a gunman focusing his shot or closing in on his target with the third section of the music with its slower tempo almost, as it were, holding its breath before the shot is fired.

The telescopic structure imposed on a score associated with an assassin's gun-shot shows a musical thinking paralleling Hitchcock's use of symbols or visual references. Hitchcock's use of these references was so plentiful that he urged audiences to see a film "at least three times—in order to pick out all the details and the intention behind them, and in order to get deeper into things".793

Yacowar's book *Hitchcock's British Films*, devoted a number of pages to identifying such detail and the opening four and a half minutes of the film, set in the skiing resort, is particularly rich.794 For example, there is a brooch that the heroine Jill, gives to her step-daughter Betty. From here-on the brooch is connected with Betty and appears three more times in the film, once to initially identify her as the person being carried off in a sleigh at night through a forest, another

---

792 The *ritenuto* marking enters at bar 110, two bars before the third section. In the 1956 version, the third section has a tempo indication of *Molto meno mosso quasi maestoso* (Conductor's score of *The Storm Clouds*, The Bernard Herrmann Collection, Davidson Library, University of California, Santa Barbara).


time to communicate to Jill that she is in the hands of the conspirators when Ramon quickly slips it into her hand in the foyer of the Royal Albert Hall before the start of the concert, and one last time to indicate Jill is thinking of Betty when the brooch is filmed in Jill’s hand as she sits in the audience listening to the *Storm Clouds Cantata*. A further example of Hitchcock’s ‘detail’ involves Abbott, the leader of the conspirators who, early on in the film, is connected with the sound of his chiming pocket-watch. This connection resurfaces in the closing moments as we hear the chime once again, this time indicating Abbott’s hiding place behind a door.

The development of a psychological drama was an aspect, Yakowar claims, that was already of interest to film directors such as Fritz Lang in Germany; Hitchcock’s interest in this subject has already been discussed in chapter three.795 Sullivan’s following comment makes an interesting observation of Hitchcock’s influence on music in his films:

Although Hitchcock’s musical designs often depict an outer world of action and drama, providing a rhythm for his kinetic images—the sounds commonly associated with the ‘master of suspense’—the deepest, most original kind of Hitchcock music evokes inner turmoil and ambivalence, pitting subconscious desires and anxieties against behaviour enacted on the screen.796

With a Hitchcock eye for dramatic detail, Benjamin introduces three motifs in the first section of the cantata that prove to have a particularly poignant or deeper meaning in relation to the film. These are then emphasized through repetition, at specific points in the score. The first of these is motif A (example 4.1) comprised of two chords which appears five times in the first half of the *Poco Lento* section.

---


Four of these appearances are in the home-key of A minor—twice in the instrumental introduction to the cantata, then after the lines of text ‘There came a whispered terror on the breeze and the dark forest shook’ and ‘And on the trembling trees came nameless fear and panic overtook each flying creature of the wild’. The adherence of this motif to A minor, regardless of even the remote chord of B major in which the second line of text ends, feels like some sort of steadfast presence or an issue that will not go away. If this motif was intended to be connected with the development of Jill’s psychological state, the oscillating nature of the two-chords may be representative of her questioning and searching state in the early stages of the performance at the Royal Albert Hall. Only in the motif’s fifth appearance does it move from A minor to C major which acts like a gateway through which the music and other events can move on. In the *Allegro agitato* section the motif reappears but, like Jill, has undergone a transformation (example 4.2).

Here the motif has lost its questioning and searching aspect and is transformed by a livelier tempo and a more decisive rhythm, almost heroic in character, to indicate Jill has moved into a more decisive frame of mind as she pieces together the assassination attempt about to take place and consequently makes her decision to intervene. In a scene where Jill has no dialogue and Hitchcock was yet to include the visuals, Benjamin’s decision to include this motif
and its variation helped the audience to gain some sense of Jill’s psychologically altered state during the cantata’s performance.

Motifs B and C relate to two short phrases from the cantata’s text—‘All save the child’ and ‘Finding release’.

(Section 1: Poco Lento)
There came a whispered terror on the breeze.
And the dark forest shook.
And on the trembling trees came nameless fear,
And panic overtook each flying creature of the wild.
And when they all had fled,
All save the child, around whose head, screaming,
The night-birds wheeled and shot away,
(Section 2: Allegro agitato)
Finding release from that which drove them
onward like their prey.
Finding release the storm clouds broke and
drowned the dying moon.
(Section 3: ritenuto)
Finding release the storm clouds broke.
Finding release.797

Motif B, ‘All save the child’ (example 4.3), is introduced by the mezzo-soprano soloist and motif C ‘finding release’ (example 4.4) is first heard on the trombone without the words from the text ‘finding release’, that it is later associated with.

Example 4.3 Motif B ‘All save the child’, Storm Clouds Cantata, bar 30.

\[ \text{Motif B: } \text{Mezzo-soprano solo} \]

\[ \begin{array}{c}
\text{J} = 72 \text{ approx.}
\end{array} \]


\[ \text{Motif C: Trombone 1} \]

797 As indicated in the manuscript (Paramount Music Library).
save the child', is directed at Jill, the heroine, who struggles throughout the performance with her decision of whether to stay silent and allow the assassination to take place, thus ensuring the safety of the child Betty, or to intervene in some way. Motif C and its connection with the words ‘finding release’, is on one level a direct reference to the assassin’s shot, aimed at the ambassador, that is to be timed with the single cymbal crash. This motif is performed sixteen times in the second section of the cantata (Allegro agitato) and a further six times in the slower third section (ritenuto). The presence of these two motifs represent the dramatic tension played out between the two most important characters in this scene—Jill and the assassin.

Another parallel in the thinking of the director and the composer comes from Hitchcock’s admission of having consciously chosen a ‘background’ when constructing this film.

I try to do without paper when I begin a new film. I visualize my story in my mind as a series of smudges moving over a variety of background. Often I pick my backgrounds first and then think about the action of the story. This was the case in The Man Who Knew Too Much.798

Benjamin’s 1937 article on film music repeatedly referred to the use of ‘background music’ in film and James Wierzbicki’s article outlined the Storm Clouds Cantata’s movement “through a succession of tonal centres” which he identified as i-III-VI-V-I and described as “simple as well as musically logical”. He continued to say that over this “background’s smooth flow of tonal centers, however, is a seemingly disjunct series of foreground musical episodes”.799 ‘Seemingly’ is a very apt word, for Benjamin skillfully weaves his repeated motifs, rhythmically varied textures and controlled use of dissonance over a tonally secure base to create a Hitchcock-like carefully paced

dramatic curve right through to the highest point of the action, the single clash of the cymbals.

This pacing of the drama reflected Hitchcock's own legendary sense of timing and dramatic pacing which he discussed with François Truffaut:

> Sequences can never stand still; they must carry the action forward, just as the wheels of a ratchet mountain railway move the train up the slope, cog by cog. A film cannot be compared to a play or a novel. It is closer to a short story, which, as a rule, sustains one idea that culminates when the action has reached the highest point of the dramatic curve...[T]here must be a steady development of the plot and the creation of gripping situations which must be presented, above all, with visual skill.800

Hitchcock's concept of dramatic cogs can also be applied to Benjamin's score which likewise uses musically dramatic 'cogs' to consistently focus and propel the music forward to the climactic cymbal crash at bar 122. Example 4.5 outlines the musical motifs, rhythms, tempi, harmonic language and attention to text that shape and pace the music over its 'background' of tonal centres. Section one *Poco Lento* (bars 1–57) begins with a brooding quality and introduces motif A, representing Jill's questioning and searching state of mind, which repeatedly draws the music back to the home key of A minor. At bar 24 the music opens out into C major to the words 'and when they all had fled', and motif B and its consequent repeats is introduced for the first time in bar 30.

Section two *Allegro agitato* (bars 58–111) changes in tempo and mood. F major darkens to F minor and motif C is introduced by the orchestra within the first two bars, quickly engaging the listener with a new sense of urgency. The musical energy is pushed forward by the rising figure of the four-note motif, the decorative semi-quaver figures (first entry at bar 62) and a steady crotchet pulse propelled by the

---

Example 4.5 Outline of motifs, rhythms and harmonies that build dramatic tension throughout the cantata over the stable tonal 'background'.

Motifs B and C begin to appear in succession from bar 75 over a pedal point on E. The psychological tension created by their simultaneous use indicates their texts of 'finding release' and 'all save the child' relate to Jill's emotional and
psychological dilemma as well as the assassin's release of the trigger. As the line of text 'the storm clouds broke and drowned the dying moon' is sung, a variation on motif A begins to be repeated from bar 93 in more remote harmonies based on the triads of F-sharp major and G-sharp major, and a new driving rhythmic ostinato is introduced on the E pedal point. These elements contribute to the heightening of tension and gathering of energy necessary to sustain the final climax in the slower, section three of the score.

This begins with a shift to A major and motif C is repeated at the slower tempo with a weight and grandeur that is, to an extent, supported by the build-up of energy from the previous Allegro agitato section. The pedal point on E temporarily gives way to a moving bass line but returns in bar 115 and in the three bars leading to the heroine's scream in bar 121. Bar 122 is the beginning of the plagal cadence that signals the close of the performance, the D minor chord coinciding with that all important cymbal crash. The tonic major, A major, is reached at bar 124 and is sustained for the final three bars.

Music for the film's opening titles focuses on motif A from the Storm Clouds Cantata, and the subsequent melodic line as shown in Example 4.6. The key and time signature are the same as the cantata but the first five bars of music in 4/4, heard while a hand on screen peruses through a selection of Swiss travel brochures, is the Gaumont-British Pictures signature tune that Andrew Youdell at the British Film Institute believes is attributable to the film's music director Louis Levy.801

Example 4.6 Opening titles, Storm Clouds Cantata, bars 3-4.

801 Andrew Youdell in conversation with the author September 8, 2008.
Hitchcock’s decision to use Benjamin’s *Storm Clouds Cantata* from 1934 again in 1956 was supported by Bernard Herrmann, who was in charge of music matters for the remake and was recorded as having said: “I didn’t think anybody could better what [Benjamin] had done”.802 In responding to the challenges of this film and to Hitchcock’s influence, Benjamin showed a marked development in his compositional technique. This involved the use of motifs to express the development of a psychological drama, and the capacity to respond to a request for an unusual new form that demanded a structured build-up of musical tension towards a climax in the closing moments of a work. The result was the most focused composition he had written to date.

4.3 *The Clairvoyant* (1935)

_The Clairvoyant_ was a Gaumont-British Picture adapted from a novel of the same title written by Ernst Lothar and adapted for screen by Charles Bennett and Bryan Edgar Wallace.803 Claude Rains and Fay Wray acted the lead roles respectively as Maximus and his wife Rene, and shooting began at Islington studios in February 1935.804 The plot of the film centres on the struggle of Maximus, a music-hall entertainer whose fake clairvoyant act suddenly becomes real when his inherent powers are activated by the presence of a woman called Christine. Such a ‘gift’ proves to be a mixed blessing and threatens his marriage and his sanity.

_The Clairvoyant_ was directed by Maurice Elvey (1887–1967), a prolific film maker who began his career in his early twenties as a producer of stage plays by writers such as Shaw, Strindberg, Chekhov and Gorky. With over three hundred films to his credit by the close of his career, Elvey had gained experience as producer of film in Hollywood for Fox and MGM prior to his return to England to

---

803 Information taken from the film’s opening titles.
head production for Gaumont. Ian Christie's assessment of Elvey's work in *Film Studies*, singled out the film *Comradeship* (Stoll Film Company. 1919) as an example of exciting pre-Hitchcock British cinema and proclaimed another silent, *Hindle Wakes* (Gaumont-British. 1927) as Elvey's "masterpiece of the twenties". He validated this claim by writing the following:

From this film alone, we can see Elvey's virtues: confident casting and direction of actors; deft use of decor and detail in performance; an ability to fuse quite different registers of emotion and setting in a convincing whole. In a 1947 article, he was reported as comparing the job of film director to that of the conductor of a symphony orchestra—'somebody else has written the music, and the technicians are going to play it'—but drew a sharp distinction between hack and creative conductors. [Maurice Elvey. *The Task of the Film Director*, *The Cine-Technician*, May–June 1947: 67.]

Louis Levy, with whom Benjamin had already collaborated on *The Man Who Knew Too Much*, fulfilled the role of music director. As with Alexander Korda's 1934 production *The Scarlet Pimpernel*, directed by Harold Young, Maurice Elvey's films in the early 1930s revealed a like tendency to restrict the use of music. This rather cautious and sparse use of music was adopted by many British directors at this time.

In keeping with Elvey's limited use of music, Benjamin's score accompanies only ten scenes in *The Clairvoyant* ranging from seventeen seconds to two minutes and thirty seconds in duration. The music mostly portrays the action on the screen, an approach used earlier by Benjamin in his two one-act operas *The Devil Take Her* (1931) and *Prima Donna* (1933) as will be discussed in chapter seven. One example of this in *The Clairvoyant* can be found in the horse racing scene, lasting only thirty-eight seconds, which is accompanied by a suitably energetic galop. Use of existing musical

---

806 Ian Christie. 'Mystery Men', *Film Studies*, No.1 (Spring), 1999: 78, 80.
807 Ibid.: 80.
styles such as dance suites from past centuries was a well established practice in Benjamin's music and the lively 2/4 dance inspired by the galloping movement of horses was obviously deemed an appropriate match for the action on the screen. His decision to use this dance music followed in the footsteps of many composers before him as the exuberant nature of the galop had found particular favour with 19th-century composers such as Franz Liszt's *Grand galop chromatique* (1838) and the finale of Georges Bizet's *Jeux d'enfants* (1871).\(^{808}\)

Other examples of the music portraying the action on screen include the simulation of train-like sounds, complete with whistle, when Maximus starts to foretell Christine's train journey; a seventeen second scurry of music accompanies Max's mother as she runs down the stairs, ending abruptly before she cries out; and when Rene and Max walk along the Thames at night, the theme for Big Ben is worked into the score, stopping just before Big Ben chimes twice to indicate it is two in the morning.

Benjamin chose two motifs (examples 4.7, 4.8) to represent the state of clairvoyancy and these dominate the music for the opening titles (example 4.9) as they appear over an image of Maximus's face. These motifs are the only material to be repeated, and three of the scenes in which they feature signify that Max is visibly in a clairvoyant state. In this respect, the music is still linked to a specific action on the screen. Dramatically, there is little to indicate why one clairvoyant motif is used in preference to the other for these scenes and the motifs do not develop in any significant way to indicate a change or development in the story. The unchanging nature of these motifs though, may simply express Benjamin's view of the clairvoyant state as belonging to a timeless, unchanging 'other' world. It would

appear that Benjamin’s music makes no comment on the full drama of the film, the crux of which is Max’s struggle with the ‘power’ which threatens to destroy his life and happiness, and a ‘force’ dark enough for his wife Rene to suggest that it is a gift of the devil in their conversation by the Thames. It would be easy to assume that Benjamin completely ignores this dimension of the drama until we notice two brief and somewhat tentative references to the motifs in scenes not relating to a visible clairvoyant state.

The first example appears in the very first scene of the film. As a short coda to the overture, which has just finished in F major, the first clairvoyant motif is alluded to by a solo horn in D minor to
accompany the image of a boat sailing into harbour (example 4.9). At this stage of the story, no real clairvoyant state is about to be portrayed and the music bears no direct relationship to the action on the screen. The motif played in D minor takes on a darker, more foreboding and contemplative quality, and could therefore be Benjamin's comment on the troubled times that lie ahead for Max.

The second example is harder to identify because it involves a variation on the first and second clairvoyant motif in the scene by the Thames. This scene is an important turning point in Max’s life; his mother has just died in her exerted run down the stairs in an attempt to prevent his wife Rene, from leaving him and Rene, as she now talks to him by the riverside, tries to persuade him to give up the ‘gift’ which she perceives as something evil. Max’s thoughts as he ponders his dilemma are interrupted by the sight of a man about to throw himself into the river. As to be expected, Benjamin accompanies Max's action of rushing forward to save the man with a sudden surge of music. This quickly subsides as the two men begin a dialogue and we hear an interesting variation on the second clairvoyant motif woven into the score (example 4.10). The saved man identifies Max as the famous clairvoyant and during the course of their discussion, Max reaches a decision and announces 'I'm putting this gift out of my life once and forever'.

The variation on motif B is not strictly chromatic as is the original and this intervallic ‘loosening’ may reflect on Max’s decision to abjure the ‘power’. Soon after this, a horn weaves in a reference to motif A (example 4.11) as the music builds to what feels like a triumphant ending in A-flat major but stops short of the final chord. Again, denying this section a concluding, decisive chord and key reflects Benjamin's musical comment on the drama as Max's decision to return to his old life with Rene proves not to be so resolute and final.
Chapter three discussed the degree of awareness shown by musicians regarding problems of coherence and unity in film scores arising from the episodical nature of film. The repeated presence of the clairvoyant motifs makes an important contribution towards some sense of unity or continuity in *The Clairvoyant* which otherwise consists of separate segments of musical accompaniment responding to moments of screen action further dispersed by long sections of dialogue.809 Another device used by Benjamin to counteract the potential fragmentation is the use of closely related keys. For example, the overture begins in a mode on F and ends in F major before the horn solo’s shift into D minor for the short coda. Some of the other scenes, such as those using the chromatic second clairvoyant motif and mother’s run down the stairs, are more dissonant and tonally obscure but the remainder gravitate towards A-flat major or A-flat minor. This is regardless of whether they relate to a horse race or the all-important scene by the river Thames. Although this use of key is not so sophisticated or as developed as in his score for *Turn of the Tide* written soon afterwards, it shows a restricted tonal palette to achieve a sense of unity and stability within the score as illustrated in table 4.1.

Drones are used in certain scenes as a stable background or anchor while passages of a more dissonant or chromatic nature are explored in the upper voices. An example of this is heard in the scene where Max’s mother runs down the stairs; a timpani sustains a drone

---

809 This is not a criticism of the film whose script was written by Charles Bennett, the same writer for Hitchcock’s *The Man Who Knew Too Much* (1934).
on C over which is layered scurrying semiquavers focused on D-flat,

Table 4.1 Nine scenes accompanied by music in *The Clairvoyant* and their use of tonality and motifs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key or tonality</th>
<th>Description of Music or theme</th>
<th>Screen description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mode on F—F major—D minor</td>
<td>Clairvoyant motifs A &amp; B.</td>
<td>Opening titles: Maximus's face in clairvoyant state, then a ferry pulling into harbour (D minor).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-flat major—D-flat minor</td>
<td>Clairvoyant motif A leading to train music.</td>
<td>Maximus tells of the contents of a man's letter and begins to prophesy about a train journey involving Christine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-flat major</td>
<td>Music in style of lively 'galop'.</td>
<td>Derby race.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-flat major over B-flat drone</td>
<td>Clairvoyant motif B.</td>
<td>When Max looks at Christine he suddenly sees an image of his mother.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chromatic music over C drone</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>Mother runs down stairs to stop Rene leaving.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-flat minor</td>
<td>Use of drone on A-flat and 'Big Ben' theme.</td>
<td>Max &amp; Rene talk by the river Thames. She wants him to give up 'the gift to see'.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-flat minor</td>
<td>Music as Max walks along Thames which then includes variations on the clairvoyant motifs. Music ends abruptly.</td>
<td>Max walks along Thames in thought then sees a man about to throw himself into the Thames. He rescues him then enters into a conversation. Max decides to give up the clairvoyant gift &amp; return to his wife.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-flat major</td>
<td>Clairvoyant motif B then motif A.</td>
<td>Maximus foretells that 110 survivors are about to reach the surface during his trial concerning the Humber shaft disaster.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-flat major</td>
<td>Fairground music.</td>
<td>Music hall introduction to a clairvoyant act that Maximus &amp; Rene are watching.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

G-flat and B-flat. Another example can be heard in the brief musical accompaniment to the scene where Max sees a vision of his mother; here the clairvoyant motif B returns in A-flat major but its presence is more disturbing with the B-flat drone sounding underneath.

Apart from the use of the two principal motifs, Benjamin's score for *The Clairvoyant* takes a perfunctory role in portraying the action on the screen. His use of two motifs, repeated keys and closely
related tonalities help to achieve continuity and focus in the dispersed nature of the score for this film.

4.4 Turn of the Tide (1935)

Turn of the Tide was the first feature produced by British National Films, a company founded in 1934 and funded by Lady Yule and J. Arthur Rank.\textsuperscript{810} Michael Wakelin explained how Rank's decision to produce Turn of the Tide was the result of a "Methodist Times" assault on the low moral standard of the films of the day. This criticism was noted by a reporter for the Evening News who then challenged the editor of the Methodist Times, R. G. Burnett, to produce a film suitable for family viewing and suggested Three Fevers by Leo Walmsley as a potential text.\textsuperscript{811} Wakelin claimed that Rank and Lady Yule, who wanted "to raise the standard of British movies and present a good image of Britain to the world",\textsuperscript{812} decided to accept the challenge, and the setting of Walmsley's novel in a Yorkshire fishing village no doubt appealed to Rank, who was himself from Yorkshire.

Rank was able to provide secure funding and moral vision for his productions but was ready to admit: "The trouble really was that I didn't know anything about producing films. I only took it on because there was nobody else to do the job."\textsuperscript{813} Wakelin believed this gave rise to positive and negative results as it granted not only "freedom to his creative workforce" but also the freedom to produce "failures".\textsuperscript{814}

Personnel involved in the making of the film included John Corfield as producer and Norman Walker as director. Walker had already directed several films specializing in location settings at a time when most camera work was still confined to the studios. Examples of this included Mr Bill the Conqueror (British International Pictures. 1931), set in the Sussex countryside, and Fires of Fate

\textsuperscript{812} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{813} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{814} Ibid.
(British International Pictures. 1932), which was largely filmed in Egypt. In Andrew Youdell’s opinion, this specialization “in location photography and matching exterior scenes to scenes shot in studios” made him the “ideal person” for *Turn of the Tide*. David Lean, who at that time was editing newsreels for Gaumont-British, helped to create some of the storm scenes and Arthur Benjamin enjoyed greater artistic control than usual as both the film’s composer and music director with the British National Film Symphony Orchestra. The cast, a number of whom were making their screen debut, included John Garrick, Niall MacGinnis, Geraldine Fitzgerald, Joan Maude, Wilfrid Lawson and Moore Marriott.

Having had the privilege of collaborating with Hitchcock on *The Man Who Knew Too Much*, Benjamin was no doubt aware of the comparative dramatic vagueness of *Turn of the Tide*. A review for *Film Weekly* shortly after the film’s release acknowledged its portrayal of British life by saying: “This vivid glimpse of life in a North-of-England fishing village has all the authenticity of a ‘documentary’”; but the review also alluded to the film’s short-comings—“there are no ‘big moments,’ and the pace is somewhat slow”. The film ultimately succeeded in winning third place in the Venice Film Festival, but it was a box-office failure with Rank making a substantial loss on his initial investment of some £30,000.

When Benjamin first viewed *Turn of the Tide* he had to come to terms with the many layers of the film’s plot before he could decide his musical response. On one level the plot is simple and centres on the lives of two opposed Yorkshire fishing families who eventually join

---

815 Andrew Youdell. Sleeve note for a 1991 Connoisseur Video release of *Turn of the Tide*.
816 Andrew Youdell interview with the author, February 10, 2005.
forces to solve the economic difficulties threatening their survival. The author of the novel, Leo Walmsley, was employed by British National Films as a technical adviser and he described in his autobiography the drawn-out and somewhat fraught process of script revision which was begun before and continued on after filming had begun. Walmsley and director Walker rejected the first draft of the script, which Walmsley described as “a melodrama with a sugary love affair settling the almost bloodthirsty feud between Fosdyck's and Lunns”. A decision was then made for Walmsley and Walker to rewrite the script but their collaboration was not an easy one with John Monk eventually being brought in to help complete it. Walmsley described the task as having “to make the best of a bad job”, which required an attempt to “pitch up the drama”. This resulted in more emphasis being given to the Romeo and Juliet-like love interest played out by Ruth Fosdyck and John Lunn, each a member of the opposed fishing families, and the introduction of the character Isaac Fosdyck, who attempts to drive the Lunns out of the bay by unfair means and creates friction in the fishing fraternity. These additional elements were perceived as insufficient to sustain the interest of the film audience and further dramatic touches were introduced after filming had begun, such as the fight scenes between the character of Steve and the other boys of the village. The effectiveness of these later attempts to ‘pep up’ certain isolated scenes in order to raise the dramatic impetus of the film as a whole is debatable and highlights the director’s lack of overall creative vision and dramatic pacing.

Norman Walker's expertise in location photography combined with the producer's interest in portraying the British way of life in a Yorkshire fishing village resulted in numerous dialogue-free shots of fishermen in the act of baiting lines and fishing, watching fish auctioned at market, the making of lobster pots and even signing their names with a cross to receive the money from a salvage job.

822 Ibid.: 298.
823 Ibid.: 302.
These scenes succeed in informing the audience of what life was like in a Yorkshire fishing village and involve many shots of the local fishermen, but they contribute very little, if anything, to the dramatic impact of the film. In this respect, Walker's film was a continuation of the pre-War Griersonian documentary and its images clearly echoed those already seen on screen in the silent film *Drifters* (dir. John Grierson. Empire Marketing Board. 1929). So engrossed was Walker in location shots that he decided to omit music from one extended scene sequence where a grounded steamer is rescued by the fishermen's lifeboat crew. Only natural sounds such as a fog horn, waves and oars, and some dialogue accompany the action, which is weighed down by the technical aspects of the rescue rather than the potential drama of the scene. By this stage of the film's production, Walmsley had resigned as technical adviser but gave an account in his autobiography of the difference in opinion between himself and Walker regarding treatment of this scene.

Besides the real drama of the incident was psychological. For a salvage tug comes on the scene. The master of the tug plays on the young steamer's nerves, warns him not to rely on the lifeboat but to engage the tug. I had suggested to Norman that it would be far better not to worry about the technicalities. To show the steamer in distress, then resolve the action into a race between the lifeboat and the tug, the one that gets to the steamer first being the one to win the salvage prize. But Norman had rejected this suggestion. He thought he must do it just as I had got it in the book.

When Walmsley first viewed the film he felt "the salvage scene was rather slow" and as such relinquished the opportunity to heighten the drama towards the close of the film.

Benjamin was faced with the challenge of choosing which layers of the plot should be highlighted and dramatically heightened by music, and how best to create whatever threads of continuity he

---

824 Andrew Youdell interview with the author February 10, 2005.
826 Ibid.: 315.
could through the collage of influences represented in the film. This was an essential challenge for him to address if the audience was to gain any sense of order or coherence in the film. His decisions needed to comply with the wishes of Walker, who often chose to authenticate his location shots with recordings of natural sound in preference to musical accompaniment. Various sounds of wind and water feature in at least twenty-one scenes whilst others make a feature of bird sound, such as those set in Isaac’s house where dialogue is often accompanied by the twittering of a canary. Two short outdoor scenes, where John Lunn smokes a cigarette while mentally plotting his imminent confrontation with Isaac over Ruth’s hand in marriage, are accompanied only by the sound of chirping birds, and a twenty-second dialogue-free scene early in the film showing Isaac feeding the seagulls is accompanied by the sound of squalling sea-birds.

Benjamin’s music accompanies a variety of scenes without dialogue such as the spring scene complete with gambolling lambs and tolling church bells, the Lunns launching their boat at dawn (example 4.12), and shots of the sea in the film’s opening (example 4.13) and closing scenes. The transcription of these ‘nature’ scenes are all in F major, the key of Beethoven’s *Pastoral* Symphony. Benjamin’s music for the Spring scene (example 4.14) follows the long standing trend for lilting pastoral melodies in triple time,\(^\text{827}\) in this instance 6/8, and a solo for flute, the instrument often associated with Pan and shepherds.

**Example 4.12 Dawn scene, *Turn of the Tide.***

Example 4.13 ‘Sea’ motif, *Turn of the Tide*.

\[ J = 63 \text{ approx.} \]

\[
\text{woodwind & piano}
\]

orchestral tutti accompaniment

Example 4.14 Spring scene, *Turn of the Tide*.

\[ J = 69 \text{ approx.} \]

\[
\text{flute}
\]

\[
\text{strings & woodwind}
\]

The two salmon catching episodes complete the ‘nature’ scenes accompanied by music but although Benjamin uses a 6/8 time signature again, the two episodes are in the keys of B flat major (example 4.15) and E flat major.

Example 4.15 ‘Brook’ theme from first episode, *Turn of the Tide*.

Creating a thread of continuity appears to be a strong guiding factor in Benjamin’s decision of where to place music. In order to do so, he interprets the drama by identifying important themes which he then links to certain keys and leitmotifs. B flat major remains the steadfast key for five of the love scenes, even in the title music, with Benjamin further aiding the identification and therefore connection between these scenes by the use of a ‘love’ theme (example 4.16). Each of the scenes is faithfully represented by the string section; in the scene where Ruth and John first reveal their feelings for each other, the variation on the ‘lovers’ theme is played by the string section unaccompanied; when Ruth and John talk while John is
cutting hazel for lobster pots the ‘lovers’ theme is played by a string quartet; John and Ruth’s embrace is accompanied by strings with the addition of a solo horn.

Example 4.16 ‘Lovers’ theme, *Turn of the Tide*.

Another theme selected by Benjamin for musical representation was that of ‘work’. Some of the film’s extensive network of scenes depicting fishermen at work are accompanied by natural sound (usually wind and water) and seven others are selected and bound by Benjamin to the tonality of D-flat. A simple ‘work’ rhythm (example 4.17) is employed with this tonality to link the wide range of work scenes.

Example 4.17 ‘Work’ rhythm that accompanies the arrival of the boat engine, *Turn of the Tide*.

Take for example, the scene portraying the arrival of the mysterious crate containing the Lunns’ new boat engine: the music is composed in two repeated sections which begin with a pedal-point on D-flat and proceed to G-flat major before the coda returns to D-flat major. Other examples employing this rhythm include John Lunn’s visit to bustling Burnharbour set in D-flat major, the launch of the lifeboat by the fishermen to rescue a steamer that has run aground, scored in D-flat minor, and a further four scenes depicting the Lunns’ fishing and sinking their lobster pots, all set in D-flat major.

A third theme interpreted by Benjamin’s music is that of triumph. This aspect of the film is represented by a ‘triumph’ motif (example 4.18) that is easily recognisable and mostly allocated to the trumpets and horns.
Example 4.18 The ‘Triumph’ motif, *Turn of the Tide*.

\[ J = 63 \text{ approx.} \]

Trumpet with string & woodwind accompaniment

\[ \text{\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{example4.18}} \]

In relation to key, the motif is more flexible as it is applied to a number of small dramas relating to the struggles of the fishermen. For example, it often appears in the key of D-flat major simply because of its connection with the fishermen and their key of ‘work’. An example of this relationship can be found in the scene in which a crate arrives in the village accompanied by the ‘work’ rhythm and concludes with the ‘triumph’ motif as the Lunns open the crate to reveal their new engine. Its application to a variety of scenes demands flexibility with regard to key and so we hear its introduction in the title music in C major and its appearance in F major, the key related to nature, for the film’s closing scenes of the two fishing families who have combined forces and are sailing triumphantly out to sea in their new fishing boat. The ‘triumph’ motif makes further appearances in the steamer rescue scene where it coincides with the sound of the fishermen’s ‘ahoy’ as the ship pulls herself free, and in a fishing scene connected with the Lunn’s first pot that yielded a lobster.

Benjamin’s dramatic interpretation of the film extended to the identification of the ‘good’ and ‘bad’, or ‘harmonious’ and ‘disharmonious’ elements played out on the screen. The harmonious elements and their musical representation have already been identified and Benjamin’s selection of three of these—sea motif, the ‘lovers’ theme and the ‘triumph’ motif—are woven into the score in the film’s closing moments as an indication that ‘good’ has triumphed over disharmony (example 4.19).

Benjamin’s music identifies the character of Isaac, the elder
Example 4.19  Blending of music representing three 'harmonious' elements in the closing moments of Turn of the Tide.

\[ J = 63 \text{ approx.} \]

\[ \text{Lover's theme} \]

\[ \text{orchestral tutti (incl. piano) accompanying} \]

\[ \text{Triumph motif} \]

\[ \text{Sea motif} \]

member of the Fosdycks, and the storm as the disharmonious elements of the film. Smaller dramas played out by Steve's dispute with the other boys in the village, Amy's chiding of her husband Marney, and the Burnharbour tug-master who tries to take work away from the fishermen, go unacknowledged by Benjamin. The seven scenes featuring Isaac are identified by a five-note motif (example 4.20) which is repeated at original pitch each time it appears; only the rhythm undergoes variation.

Example 4.20 'Isaac' motif as it first appears in the opening titles, Turn of the Tide.

\[ J = 56 \text{ approx.} \]

\[ \text{strings & woodwind with orchestral tutti accompaniment} \]

This motif's more chromatic character incorporating the tri-tone interval contrasts with the melodious nature of motifs and themes representing harmonious elements of the story. Scenes as short as seven seconds make use of Isaac's motif (examples 4.21, 4.22) and are always an indication that he is active as a disruptive element in the story whether it be cutting the buoy's line to the Lunns' lobster pots or telling Ruth and John to get out of his house after refusing their decision to marry.

Example 4.21 Variation on Isaac's motif as he watches the Lunns take their lobster pots out to sea, Turn of the Tide.

\[ J = 132 \text{ approx.} \]

\[ \text{horn accompanied by staccato strings} \]
Example 4.22 Variation on Isaac’s motif in the scene where he cuts the lifebuoy lines to the Lunns’ lobster pots, *Turn of the Tide*.

\[
J = 120 \text{ approx.}
\]

horn with clarinet & string accompaniment

The storm sequence is one of the longest episodes in the film and is an isolated piece of drama depicting the approach of a storm whilst the Lunns are fishing at sea. Adorno and Eisler observed that in film “music can dissolve into noises, or noises can dissolve into music, as though they were dissonances” but also concluded:

[Recording of noises has done away with program music. The musical reproduction of a storm cannot compete with the recording of a real storm. Tone painting has become strikingly superfluous—in fact it always has been.]

Benjamin’s score for the storm scene is divided into two episodes by a brief period of dialogue and the entire sequence is accompanied by the natural sounds of wind and waves with or without the presence of music. The scoring imitates these natural sounds in the chromatic winding figures played by the woodwind and strings or by the wave-like splashes on the cymbals, in order to create a unified sound world for the complete storm sequence. By dissolving into and out of the recorded natural sounds by this use of imitation, he illustrates Adorno and Eisler’s point about the relationship between noise and music but also proves that some aspects of nature painting in music can still be effectively integrated in film to create continuity.

Unlike the more harmonious use of melody and harmony for the elements of love, work and nature, the first episode of the storm music (example 4.23) makes greater use of dissonance, chromaticism and smaller, more fragmented motifs. A low drone on C, played *tremolando* on the piano and periodically swelled by the roll of the

---

Example 4.23 Musical outline of the score for the first episode of the storm scene, *Turn of the Tide*.

Maraey: Afraid of John: Sea's getting worse, a drop wave? winding chromatic figures piano & timpani

No. But I want to feed my hens tonight, not a lot of crabs. trumpet (storm cone is hoisted)

They're making for the shore. We'd better start hauling.

Father: Why, what's up?
John: That's why. Look! Storm cone's up. Father: We're alright yet.

Father: Why, what's up?
John: That's why. Loud! Storm cone's up.
Father: We're alright yet.

Break for dialogue.
timpani, underpins the first musical episode and offers Benjamin a
tonal anchor or background over which he is free to explore more
abstract and fragmented sounds in the upper voices. The motifs,
which are often repeated at pitch, feature more dissonant intervals
such as tri-tones, seconds and sevenths, and the woodwind and
strings provide a fairly constant stream of chromatic decoration in
their imitation of the wind. Dramatically, the musical result is one of
foreboding, the C drone providing a sense of holding back while the
unstable fragmented elements above, like the storm, have time to
gather momentum. The energy of the storm immediately gathers
impetus at bar 27 with a change of time signature, a marked increase
in tempo and stronger dynamics.

By the time the second musical episode enters, the intervening
scenes with dialogue have established everyone’s concern for the
Lunns’ safety and their determination to continue fishing in the face
of danger. The prevailing sound of recorded wind and waves is
merged skilfully with the sounds of the second musical episode as it
re-enters and Benjamin continues to pace the dramatic tension. Like
the *Storm Clouds Cantata* of *The Man Who Knew Too Much*, the
second episode of the storm music in *Turn of the Tide* moves through
various ‘cogs’ that propel the suspense or dramatic level onwards to a
climactic point where silence has been employed, followed by a coda
that quickly unwinds the build-up of tension (example 4.24).

In the second episode of the storm, the drone on C has been
replaced by a bass note anchor on B-flat that oscillates with a tri-
tone interval to F-flat. The tempo remains the same as at the close of
the first storm episode but the opening motif is more uplifting in
energy. At bar 26, a two-chord *ostinato* is introduced in the tonality of
B-flat and a volley of short heroic-like fanfares accompany the
fishermen as they run to the lifeboat shed. This *ostinato* and fanfare
is then repeated a tone higher to further increase tension. The film
then breaks for a short dialogue between the boy Steve and his
mother and when the music resumes at bar 41 we hear a return to
Example 4.24 Musical outline of the build-up of tension in the second episode of the storm scene, *Turn of the Tide.*

[Sheet music image]

Text:

1. Fire the gun!

Fishermen's voices hauling out the hakeboat.

(Shark's notes. Recorded with extra voice to continue.)

Mark Mother, buy that big hakeboat gun.
Mother I heard it:
That's it for hake
It's good enough for a hakeboat in any old
It's good enough for your hakeboat to get a

(brass & strings)
the opening material. This is once again centred on B-flat but dramatic tension is held because of the noticeable increase in the dynamic level of the natural sound recording. Responding to the
visual stimulus on the screen, the music gives way to a chromatic free-falling passage at bar 51 as Father instructs Marney to cut the line. This brief relaxation in tension is soon gathered as the bass shifts to a drone on A-flat and a more compressed volley of rising fanfare like motifs lock into a repeated, strongly rhythmically driven pattern as the Lunns prepare to cross the treacherous bar. A transposition of a semitone upwards of this material intensifies the drama and the music reaches a climax on a B major chord followed by three beats of silence. Reminiscent of a similar moment of silence in the *Storm Clouds Cantata*, we hear, instead of the heroine's scream, Amy cry ‘They've crossed!’ before the music resumes and sweeps away the audience's concern by establishing, for the first time in the storm sequence, a clear key—E-flat major. This is followed by a two-chord *ostinato* accompaniment that rocks the music to its final rest for another twelve bars to shots of the Lunns safely mooring their boat.

The storm scene creates a clear dramatic peak in the early stages of the film that is neither matched nor rivalled by any other. There was opportunity to create greater suspense in the scene where the fishermen rescue the grounded steamer towards the end of the film but this potential was unrealised by the director. Benjamin’s score momentarily heightened the drama of these scenes by providing sixteen seconds of heroic fanfare music for the fishermen running to the lifeboat shed and a more dramatic depiction of the ‘work’ rhythm in a minor key to accompany them as they haul the lifeboat down to the sea at the start of this sequence. This snippet of drama is then lost in the five minute and forty-one seconds that focus on the technical aspects of the steamer’s rescue which is quite a dry account of the fishermen instructing the Captain to give them the anchor, when to haul and when to take a drop of whisky to keep the cold out. No music is used for this sequence and the only accompaniment to the sporadic dialogue is the natural sound of waves, oars and a fog horn. Walker’s partial awareness of the lost dramatic potential of this
episode may account for the introduction of music in the closing twenty-nine seconds of the rescue. Here Walker noticeably speeds up the camera shots in a bid to achieve some sort of climax whilst Benjamin introduces a dominant pedal point on A-flat. The roll of a side drum synchronizes with the ship’s propellers as they start to turn and a flute holding a high trill on A-flat leads to the ‘triumph’ motif in D-flat major to the cries of the fishermen’s ‘Hurrah!’ This whipping up of tension though is all too brief to create any real sense of drama and feels more like a concluding sentence to the scene.

Table 4.2 reveals a musical structure revealing Benjamin’s interpretation of the essential elements shaping the film. Techniques used to achieve this involved the use of key, motifs, themes and orchestration to aid the film viewer’s recognition of related scenes and important aspects of the drama. The storm sequence, with its more dramatic content and reasonable length of film footage, offered Benjamin the only real opportunity to utilise the element of suspense through skilful use of dissonance and musical pacing. Although certain weaknesses in the director’s dramatic planning could not be changed by the composer, Benjamin’s musical response did help to counteract problems of fragmentation and loose dramatic pacing and in doing so enhanced the audience’s understanding of, and involvement in, the story.

Table 4.2 Use of key, motifs and themes in Benjamin’s score for Turn of the Tide.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key or tonality</th>
<th>Description of Music or theme</th>
<th>Screen description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A, G-sharp, F, B, G first appearance in C major then recurring throughout opening titles transposed</td>
<td>Isaac’s 5-note motif.</td>
<td>Opening titles:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-flat major</td>
<td>Triumph motif.</td>
<td>Shots of Burn harbour &amp; Bramblewick.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F major</td>
<td>Lover’s theme.</td>
<td>Shots of the sea &amp; graves of Fosdycks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D-flat major</td>
<td>Work rhythm.</td>
<td>Lunns &amp; Fosdyks take their boats out to sea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical Event</td>
<td>Musical Composition</td>
<td>Notes/Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Going out fishing.</td>
<td>Variation on Isaac's 5-note motif.</td>
<td>Isaac gives the warning 'You'd best keep close in'.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D-flat major</td>
<td>Work rhythm.</td>
<td>Lunns &amp; Fosdyck's fishing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C drone under dissonant, chromatic music</td>
<td>Natural sound of wind &amp; waves continue as the music re-enters. B-flat drone under dissonant, chromatic music which moves through the bass tonalities of A-flat, A and B.</td>
<td>Storm brewing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural sound of wind &amp; waves continue as the music re-enters. B-flat drone under dissonant, chromatic music which moves through the bass tonalities of A-flat, A and B.</td>
<td>Natural sound of wind &amp; waves continue as the music re-enters. B-flat drone under dissonant, chromatic music which moves through the bass tonalities of A-flat, A and B.</td>
<td>Lunns cut their lines and make their way towards the shore as the villagers watch.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-flat major</td>
<td>Two-chord ostinato accompaniment.</td>
<td>Silence as the boat crosses the treacherous bar, Amy cries 'They've crossed!'.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-flat major</td>
<td>Lover's theme.</td>
<td>John Lunn &amp; Ruth Fosdyck talk to each in the street &amp; begin to show their feelings for each other.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D-flat major</td>
<td>Unidentified tune. Waltz theme. 'Eternal Father' hymn tune.</td>
<td>John plays accordion while his brother &amp; father work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-flat major</td>
<td>Lover's theme.</td>
<td>John &amp; Ruth converse while he cuts hazel to make lobster pots.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D-flat major</td>
<td>Work rhythm.</td>
<td>Lunns make lobster pots.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D-flat major</td>
<td>Work rhythm.</td>
<td>Lunns throwing lobster pots into the sea.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A, G-sharp, F, B, G</td>
<td>Variation on Issac's motif.</td>
<td>Isaac looks at Lunns in their fishing boat at sea.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A, G-sharp, F, B, G</td>
<td>Variation on Issac's motif.</td>
<td>Isaac rows out to sea with the intention of cutting the line to the Lunns' lobster pots.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-flat drone under dissonant, chromatic music</td>
<td>Identification as the boat crosses the treacherous bar, Amy cries 'They've crossed!'.</td>
<td>Storm blows up over night.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A, G-sharp, F, B, G</td>
<td>Variation on Isaac's motif.</td>
<td>Marney holds up the lobster pot rope and says 'That's been cut'.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D-flat major</td>
<td>Jazz influenced music (variation on work rhythm).</td>
<td>Scenes of Burnharbour fishing boats bringing in their catch.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F major—C major</td>
<td>Dawn scene music.</td>
<td>Lunns set sail at dawn to take their new lobster pots out to sea.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D-flat major</td>
<td>Triumph motif.</td>
<td>The Lunns make their first haul of lobster.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
F major  |  Spring music.  |  Scenes of spring.  
---|---|---
B-flat major  |  Lover's theme.  |  John & Ruth embrace.  
B-flat major  |  Brook music.  |  Marney & Steve at the brook.  
E-flat major  |  Salmon catching music.  |  They attempt to catch a salmon.  
A, G-sharp, F, B, G  |  Variation on Isaac’s motif.  |  Isaac phones the master of the Burnharbour tug to inform him of the grounded steamer. This he hopes will prevent the fishermen from receiving money for the ship’s rescue.  
D-flat minor  |  Work rhythm.  |  Fishermen launch the village lifeboat.  
pedal point on A-flat  |  —  |  The steamer’s propellers start to turn and the fishermen shout ‘Ahoy’.  
D-flat major  |  Triumph motif.  |  Ship is rescued.  
B-flat major  |  Lover’s theme.  |  John asks Ruth to marry him.  
A, G-sharp, F, B, G  |  Variation on Isaac’s motif.  |  Isaac refuses to accept John & Ruth’s decision to marry.  
F major  |  Sea motif.  |  The Lunns and Fosdyks sail their new fishing boat out to sea.  
D-flat major  |  Reference to Lover’s theme.  
F major  |  Triumph & sea motif combined.  

4.5 *Lobsters* (1936)

*Lobsters* was a documentary film jointly directed by John Mathias and László Moholy-Nagy for Bury Productions. Moholy-Nagy was also responsible for the film’s photography and editing, and Muir Mathieson acted once again as musical director. *Lobsters*, as explained in chapter three, belonged to that somewhat different world of the 1930s documentary which was, in general, less restricted by commercial concerns and allowed greater freedom for experimentation. This would have been attractive to an artist such as

---

829 Information taken from the film’s opening titles.  
Moholy-Nagy who was described by Richard Kostelanetz as “the great adventurer of modern art”.831 Multi-talented in a wide range of disciplines, Moholy-Nagy was an experimentalist in photography, painting, sculpture and abstract film as well as book, industrial and theatre design. In Berlin, he had been a co-founder of Constructivism, and in 1923 was invited by Walter Gropius to teach the foundation course and run the metal workshop at the Bauhaus in Weimar. Threats from Nazi rule brought him to London in 1935 where he managed to make his living from book design, commercial displays and film. Even though Lobsters could not exactly be described as a radically abstract or avant-garde film, its stark play of light and dark in many of the shots (filmed in black and white), together with the skilful editing, are testimony to the artistic touch of Moholy-Nagy. With occasional silences for the script reader, Alan Howland, to speak unaccompanied, this documentary afforded Benjamin the rare luxury of a virtually non-stop fifteen minute film score.

Lobsters’ visuals and script instruct and inform the audience about fishermen in their boats, the making of lobster pots, lobsters crawling around on the sea bed, lobster larvae flitting around a slide under a microscope and some stormy skies and sea, but offers no dramatic story-line for the composer to interpret. On an immediate level, Benjamin’s music helps to broaden or condition the viewer’s emotional response, for example the inherent humour of a scherzo considerably enlivens the dialogue about the various stages of lobster larvae and a polka, scored for xylophone, piano and woodwind, is an imaginative accompaniment to shots of lobsters walking on the ocean floor. Dramatic music for the short-lived storm scene, lasting just over a minute, suddenly provides a momentarily darker side to the film, and the light and breezy scoring for the fishermen’s work scenes gives their routine a lift.

Benjamin uses themes and keys to produce a structured score on three levels. The first level divides the film into three sections with two connecting bridges. Section one relates to the world above the sea involving the fishermen preparing the lobster pots and taking them out to sea; section two relates to the lobsters’ underwater world; section three deals once again with the fishermen’s lives above the waves. A storm scene interlude enlivens the film’s flagging drama in section three before the closing coda. In terms of time (approximate durations are given), the three sections and two bridges form the overall symmetry of level 1 as shown in Table 4.3.

On the second level of structuring, the broader sections of level 1 break down into further parts. Some of these feature the repetition of certain themes, for example humour once again colours Benjamin’s choice of material that opens the score—a sea shanty titled ‘High Barbaree’ which is both sung and played instrumentally (example 4.25). Sea shanties evolved as an accompaniment to hard physical labour manning ships and the sung rendition in the film score is faithful to the tradition of a soloist or ‘shantyman’ leading the song followed by the chorus singing a refrain—‘Blow high, blow low, and so say we’.832 Appearing only in the two sections that relate to the two sections that relate to the fishermen’s world, ‘High Barbaree’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Musical structure</th>
<th>Screen description</th>
<th>Duration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Section One</td>
<td>Opening titles. Fishermen’s world: making of lobster pots and taking them out to sea</td>
<td>4'40&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bridge One</td>
<td>Lobster pot lowered into the sea</td>
<td>17&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section Two</td>
<td>Lobsters’ world: lobsters on the sea bed, a description of how a lobster grows, how they fight &amp; enter the lobster pots</td>
<td>6'46&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bridge Two</td>
<td>Ascending lobster pot</td>
<td>9&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section Three</td>
<td>Fishermen’s world: hauling up the lobster</td>
<td>4'16&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

is not a song about fishermen but, as the text depicts, a song about the captain of a gallant English ship searching for a pirate enemy. The film’s closing scene is a shot of a bandit-like looking lobster (and remember, lobsters have previously been referred to in the script as ‘pugnacious creatures’ whose ‘manners are thoroughly unpleasant’) cutting its way through a menu and on towards the audience in a menacing manner. It is with this closing shot that the viewer fully

Example 4.25 ‘High Barbaree’, Lobsters.

begins to comprehend Benjamin’s interpretation of the lobsters as the pirates in the song.

A ‘work’ theme (example 4.26) for the fishermen is another repeated theme used again exclusively in the fishermen’s world. Its rhythm makes reference to the ‘work’ rhythm in Turn of the Tide (example 4.18) and is also in a 2/4 time signature with an accompaniment moving in semi-quavers.

Example 4.26 ‘Work’ theme, Lobsters.

Another theme to be repeated on level 2 of the work’s structure is identified as the ‘lobster polka’ (example 4.27) with which Benjamin
creates a neatly balanced musical symmetry by using it to introduce and conclude the world of the lobster.

**Example 4.27 Lobster polka, *Lobsters*.**

These themes contribute to the building blocks of the fourteen parts that function on level 2 of the score (table 4.4), their character and positioning largely determined by Benjamin’s response to the visual and narrative stimulus. The parts that create the lobster world are, unlike that of the fishermen’s world, often defined by a clear start and finish or as Adorno and Eisler described it, a film music “filling in” that demanded imagination on the composer’s behalf if it was to avoid being “mere padding”. The exception is part four where the music leads to the lobster polka instead of concluding with a musical ‘full-stop’ in the form of a cadence or chord.

Benjamin’s musical thinking in clearly defined sections and parts, takes one step further to create a level 3 in the score’s structuring, but this last step, unlike the previous ones, is much less

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section &amp; parts</th>
<th>Main Key or Tonality</th>
<th>Description of Music and screenplay</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Section 1:</strong> Fishermen’s world</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bridge:</strong> Part 5</td>
<td>Drone on A with descending melodic line.</td>
<td>Music: See middle column. Screenplay: Descending lobster pot.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

833 See page 163 of chapter three.
influenced by the visual and narrative stimulus of the film. Take for example, part three of the lobster’s world—‘lobster music’. This scene imparts information about how the lobster feeds, grows and sheds its shell. Musically, the score contributes a general ambience rather than directly respond to or parallel the action on the screen and is constructed from a segment A and a segment B (examples 4.28, 4.29). Repetition of these smaller segments at their original pitch builds the symmetry A B A B A for this two minute and thirty eight second length of film score.

**Example 4.28 Segment A on level 3 of the score, Lobsters.**

**Example 4.29 Segment B on level 3 of the score, Lobsters.**
Most of the fourteen musical parts identified in Table 4.4 break down into similar repeated segments and a further illustration can be found in part four of the lobsters' world. Here segment A undergoes an exact repeat before a one bar ostinato figure is introduced and repeated ten times as a bridge or fill-in before the re-entry of the lobster polka in part five.

Repetition of themes at original pitch and use of key are devices used by Benjamin to structure and unify the score, and table 4.4 reveals the key or tonal centre of D-flat emerging as the dominating tonality with B-flat a subsidiary tonality. Movement between the keys noted in the table involve no elaborate transitions as can be heard by the various transpositions of 'High Barbaree' connected by a simple two-chord changing of the 'points' in part three of section one into the beginning of part four (example 4.30).

Benjamin's extensive film scoring for Lobsters reflects the segmented nature of film. All three levels of the score's architecture reveal clearly defined sections that respond to the structure of the film itself, that is, the first level clarifies the world of the fishermen and the lobsters; the second level identifies fourteen parts that again clarify and categorize the visual and narrative material being presented; the third level responds less to the film's visual and narrative content but is still of a segmented nature. Such an approach allows for the easy repetition or re-ordering of musical material, a bonus for any film composer who may have to make impromptu cuts and additions to a score at short notice, and the presence of repeated themes and closely related keys aids cohesion
and continuity in a score showing a clear sense of structure and symmetry.

4.6 Wings of the Morning (1937)

Wings of the Morning began shooting in Denham studios in May 1936 and was released by 20th Century-Fox in 1937 as Britain's first technicolor film. Adapted for screen by Tom Geraghty from the stories of Donn Byrne, John Huntley explained that "many people might think it was a British film but it wasn't. It was almost entirely American financed and backed...American technicians on it and so on". An American sponsored film would naturally embrace American interests and Henry Fonda was engaged to play one of the lead roles as Carey, alongside Annabella as both Marie and Maria, and Leslie Banks as Lord Clontarf. Other personnel involved in the making of the film included the producer Robert T. Kane, the American director Harold D. Schuster and music director Muir Mathieson. John Huntley remembered Wings of the Morning as having "a great deal of scoring in it", a factor that may also have been American influenced and may therefore have encouraged Benjamin to score for a greater number of musical episodes than were usual for the average British production at this time.

An interview with the director Harold D. Schuster, revealed Glenn Tryon was originally employed as the film's director. Schuster had been sent over from America by New World Films as an editor but when Tryon suddenly became ill and the production of the film faced stagnation, the leading lady Annabella, stepped in and exerted her influence. Wings of the Morning was Annabella's opportunity to broaden her cinematic exposure beyond French boarders and into

---


that of Hollywood. These ambitions, coupled with those of Schuster's to direct a film, resulted in Annabella persuading New World Films to allow Schuster to replace Tryon, at least as an interim director. Schuster was therefore very much a novice and according to the interview, he closely collaborated with Annabella to complete the picture.\footnote{J. Danvers Williams. 'Success for Two', \textit{Film Weekly}, Vol. 19, No. 466 (September 18, 1937): 16.} The actress's approach took inspiration from the French film director René Clair, who was responsible for training Annabella in cinematic acting.\footnote{Annabella appeared in René Clair's film \textit{Le Million} (Tobis. 1931).} She was reported to have said that the camera was "so sensitive to human expressions that the old theatrical style of acting...is of no use. You must act a part with your eyes and with the slightest movements of your face—and to do that you must really play your part from within". And of Clair she believed the following:

[H]is penetratingly human situations by going into the story very thoroughly with his cast. He never puts an actor in a posture and then orders him to register 'hate' or 'fear' or something; but very carefully explains what effect he is striving after, and how the situation will appear in relation to the rest of the picture.\footnote{J. Danvers Williams. 'Success for Two', \textit{Film Weekly}, Vol. 19, No. 466 (September 18, 1937): 17.}

\textit{Wings of the Morning} was a lavishly American financed production with its eye on not only the British but the American market as well. With this in mind, two celebrities made an appearance onscreen—John McCormack (1884–1945) about whom the opening titles read 'Introducing the world famous tenor', and Steve Donoghue (1884–1945). The latter was a leading English flat-race jockey in the 1910s and 1920s and John McCormack was,\footnote{Unacknowledged author. 'Steve Donoghue: A Great Jockey' (obituary), \textit{The Times}, March 24, 1945.} at the time, enjoying the enthusiastic support of audiences in America.\footnote{www.mccormacksociety.co.uk} Neither celebrity's appearance contributed to the film's drama with John McCormack singing three Irish folk songs—\textit{Believe
me if all those endearing young charms, Killarney and The Dawning of the Day, lasting over seven minutes at a party Carey gives Annabella, and Steve Donaghue being asked by Carey to ride 'Wings of the Morning' in the Derby.

The film's plot begins in Ireland in 1890 where Lord Clontarf meets and falls in love with the gypsy princess Marie, whose people have set up camp on his lands. It is here she also meets Lord Clontarf's young cousin Valentine. Marie and Lord Clontarf marry, much to the opposition of his fellow noblemen and women, but Marie soon returns to her gypsy family when Lord Clontarf is killed in a riding accident. Fifty years elapse and viewers suddenly see an older Marie now living in Spain. She tells her friend Angelo that she intends to return to Lord Clontarf's lands which, unknown to her, are now under the ownership of Valentine. Angelo is instructed by Marie to escort her great-grand-daughter Maria to join the gypsy camp in Ireland where Marie plans to enter her horse Wings of the Morning in the Derby to raise the dowry money necessary for Maria's marriage to Don Diego. To make a winding story short, Maria and Carey, Valentine's Canadian horse-training nephew who is visiting his Uncle in Ireland, end up marrying instead.

Benjamin's musical response, as in Turn of the Tide, is highly selective as it interprets and emphasizes certain themes in the film. As appropriate for a film named after Marie's race horse Wings of the Morning, music is duly scored for a variety of scenes involving horse riding. These scenes include the entries of both the Irish constabulary and Lord Clontarf on horseback, and Maria's wild ride on Wings, but Benjamin omits the scene where Lord Clontarf, while out riding, falls from his horse and is killed. Instead of music, we hear the innocent sound of birds against which the event of his death comes as a shock and is free from any musical pre-empting. Benjamin also chooses to leave the Derby race scenes to the accompaniment of the sounds of crowds, the fairground, the race announcer and the horses' hooves. The presence of live recordings of
actual band music and street performers featured in these scenes may have been influential in Benjamin’s decision to leave this musically ‘authentic’ account of the Irish Derby unaccompanied by studio-recorded music. The theme of horse racing is therefore not considered important enough for musical representation by Benjamin and the scenes involving horses that he does score for are musically unconnected and exist as purely one-off musical episodes composed to enhance the action on the screen.

Even the love interests in the film, of which there are two, are not given significant musical representation by Benjamin. The first of these, between the gypsy Marie and Lord Clontarf, is void of a love theme, as is the second love interest involving Maria and Carey. More music is specifically scored for the scenes featuring Maria and Carey but, like the horse riding episodes, are unrelated and form isolated musical events. Only one musical theme is repeated to connect a key point in their romance, which is heard after Carey says to Maria at the wishing well: ‘I hope we both wished the same wish’. The ‘wishing well’ theme (example 4.31) in the same key is then repeated in the final scene when Maria tells Carey she wants to marry him, thus making a connection between the two scenes and confirming the two lovers did indeed make the same wish.

Example 4.31 ‘Wishing well’ theme, Wings of the Morning.

Benjamin’s musical focus helps to bridge a potential rift in the flow of the film’s drama, which encompassed a fifty year time lapse in the storyline. The solution he offered was to select the contrasting worlds of the gypsy and the Irish as the real drama that was worthy of interpretation. This aspect was highly suitable to musical characterization and had the added advantage of being able to supply
a thread of interest capable of connecting both parts of the story on either side of the time lapse.

The opening title music features two themes connected with the world of the gypsy. Example 4.32 shows the mode on B-flat that Benjamin uses in the opening melody of the title music which features both a major and minor third (example 4.33); this is followed by a second theme in G-flat major (example 4.34). A variation on the first theme next appears at the start of the film’s second part as Marie, now fifty years older, briefly recounts her life and announces her intention to return to Ireland. The placing of this theme both acknowledges and forms a connection between the two sides of the time lapse.

Example 4.32 Mode used at the start of the opening titles, Wings of the Morning.

Example 4.33 Theme one in opening titles, Wings of the Morning.

Example 4.34 Theme two in the opening titles, Wings of the Morning.

Another episode, identified as ‘gypsy dance’, accompanies a gypsy dancer who is entertaining Lord Clontarf’s dinner guests at the castle. Written in B-flat minor, it is composed of three parts that form the pattern A A B B C B C A A with a coda (examples 4.35–4.57). A shortened version of this dance, constructed from the segments described above, is played in the episode at the gypsy camp when Marie’s father warns her that ‘only gypsies are proud of gypsy blood’.
Example 4.35 Part A of Gypsy dance, *Wings of the Morning*.

strings & w.w. with guitar & castanet accompaniment

\[J = 144-52\]

Example 4.36 Part B of Gypsy dance, *Wings of the Morning*.

strings & w.w. with guitar & castanet accompaniment

\[J = 144-52\]

Example 4.37 Part C of Gypsy dance, *Wings of the Morning*.

clarinet solo with guitar & castanet accompaniment

\[J = 144-52\]

It makes one last appearance towards the end of the film when the gypsies are instructed by the great-grand-daughter Maria to gather together in the form of a procession. They parade triumphantly past the Irish Derby officials with the dying Marie to prove the owner of the winning horse is still alive, a crucial factor in her eligibility for the prize.

The world of the gypsy is once again musically represented by another mode on F (example 4.38) on which a solo violin plays, accompanied usually by guitar, and whose performances display considerable *rubato* and are improvisatory in feel.

Example 4.38 Mode for the gypsy violin solos, *Wings of the Morning*.

These solos are connected specifically with Marie for a number of situations throughout the film: when Lord Clontarf first converses with Marie; when she hides in one of the castle rooms after having been rejected by the ladies of nobility; as she has her future read by a gypsy woman; when she reads a telegram from Don Diego; and in her final scene as she lays dying. This mode connects Marie and her identification with the gypsy world and serves in one particular episode to distinguish her life from that of the Irish. In the scene where she is rejected by the Irish ladies of nobility, she says to Lord
Clontarf: 'They are right. I don’t belong here’. He disregards her fears by asking her to marry him. Music representing the Irish theme (soon to be discussed) is played as he removes an old Spanish ring from his finger, but when he tries to put it on Marie’s wedding finger it doesn’t fit, at which point the music suddenly changes to the gypsy solo violin which emphasizes Marie’s dilemma of not fitting into Lord Clontarf’s world. The modes and themes Benjamin uses for the gypsy element of the film could not be regarded in any way as authentic gypsy music, but the sounds and choice of instrumentation, such as castanets, violin and guitar, are enough for film audiences to associate with gypsies and succeed in conjuring up an exotic other world that is easily distinguished from the other elements of the story represented in the score.

One more repeated theme that adds a minor third and seventh to Marie’s gypsy mode (example 4.38), is used in connection with Marie’s feelings of rejection and hurt in the first part of the film. The theme is played when Marie is snubbed by the ladies’ of nobility after dinner at Lord Clontarf’s castle with the words: ‘I would love you to tell my future but unfortunately I have no silver’. The same theme (example 4.39) is repeated and elongated when Marie is insulted a second time by Lord Clontarf’s lawyers, who in dealing with matters of the estate after his death make the remark ‘Fortunately for the Clontarf name there is no heir as a result of this union’.

Example 4.39 Marie’s ‘hurt’ theme, Wings of the Morning.

Events and people associated with Ireland are represented by one simple theme (example 4.40) that is easily recognised and used in a number of situations and in a number of keys. Benjamin first establishes its connection with Ireland by introducing it amidst landscape shots of a bay after the film’s opening titles and its musical
qualities are akin to the lyrical and diatonic nature of the love songs in Irish folk music traditions according to Breandán Breathnach.  

Example 4.40 Irish theme's first appearance after the opening titles, *Wings of the Morning*.

The next few references to the theme, which is often played on the horn, occur when Lord Clontarf's young cousin Valentine, enters the room, when Lord Clontarf offers the Spanish ring to Marie and when Valentine says goodbye to Marie when she leaves Ireland. When we see the gypsy wagons leaving the estate, the Irish theme is played again and its presence this time could be interpreted in two ways: firstly to indicate Marie is leaving Ireland physically, and secondly as a reflection on the words she has just spoken to Lord Clontarf's lawyers in the scene prior to this suggesting Marie has left her heart in Ireland:

You took it for granted I would make an effort to keep what is mine and you took it for granted that your inventory was complete but you forgot to mention one small item called a heart. I will leave it here with my dowry.

Later in the film, when the older Marie returns to Ireland, the Irish theme is once again referred to and develops its connection with Valentine who has now grown up and is Lord of the estate. The music serves to remind us again of the film's beginnings when Valentine shows the great-grand-daughter Maria a small painted portrait of a gypsy he once knew (Marie). It reappears one last time when Valentine and Marie meet at the gypsy camp where, after a brief period of non-recognition, they exchange fond greetings.

Table 4.5 outlines the major musical episodes in the film that show a rich tapestry of closely related keys, many of which link to a repeated musical theme representing some aspect of the drama.

---

Table 4.5 Use of key and musical material in *Wings of the Morning*.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key or tonality</th>
<th>Description of Music or theme</th>
<th>Screen description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mode on B-flat—G-flat major—B-flat major</td>
<td>Gypsy music.</td>
<td>Opening titles to painted illustrations of countryside, horse racing and gypsy life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-flat major</td>
<td>Variation on Irish theme.</td>
<td>Scenes of Irish countryside.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D-flat major</td>
<td>Riding music in 6/8 &amp; music for Marie playing with the children.</td>
<td>Arrival of Royal Irish constabulary &amp; scenes of gypsy camp at Destiny Bay.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-flat major</td>
<td>Riding music in 6/8 but different from above.</td>
<td>Arrival of Lord Clontarf.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gypsy mode on F</td>
<td>Gypsy solo violin music.</td>
<td>Lord Clontarf admires <em>Wings</em> and converses with Marie.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-flat minor—B-flat major</td>
<td>Gypsy dance music.</td>
<td>Gypsy band and dancer entertain at Lord Clontarf’s dinner.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode on F</td>
<td>Marie’s ‘hurt’ theme leading to gypsy violin solo.</td>
<td>Marie’s rejection from Irish noble women.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>transition arriving in E-flat major</td>
<td>Irish theme.</td>
<td>Lord Clontarf introduces Marie to Valentine. He proposes to Marie &amp; offers her the old Spanish ring.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode on F</td>
<td>Gypsy solo violin music.</td>
<td>The ring does not fit Marie’s wedding finger.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-flat minor</td>
<td>Gypsy dance music.</td>
<td>Scenes at gypsy camp.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D-flat major</td>
<td>Mendelssohn Wedding March.</td>
<td>Wedding of Lord Clontarf &amp; Marie.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode on F</td>
<td>Marie’s ‘hurt’ theme leading to gypsy solo violin music.</td>
<td>Marie is insulted by the estate lawyers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-flat major—E-flat major</td>
<td>Irish theme.</td>
<td>Valentine says goodbye to Marie.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-flat major</td>
<td>Irish theme.</td>
<td>Gypsy wagons leave Ireland.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode on F</td>
<td>Gypsy violin music.</td>
<td>Marie is told it will take three generations to remove the curse of her having mixed gypsy blood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode on F</td>
<td>Variation on gypsy music from opening titles.</td>
<td>Fifty years have past &amp; Marie declares she will return to Ireland.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-flat major</td>
<td>Irish theme.</td>
<td>Destiny Bay.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music accompanied by a drone on G-flat which finishes in F major</td>
<td>Non themed music with varied textures.</td>
<td>Spanish civil war: Maria says goodbye to Diego with the sound of gunfire in the background and flees Spain with Angelo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-flat major</td>
<td>Music of a galop.</td>
<td>Maria’s wild ride on <em>Wings of the Morning</em>.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| D minor | Valentine’s wife Jennifer can be heard playing Chopin’s *Waltz in C-sharp* | Servants talk & Jennifer stops playing to enquire if anyone is there. This is to
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Events/Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A-flat major</td>
<td><strong>Believe me if all those endearing young charms played on piano.</strong></td>
<td>Piano played in the background while Marie &amp; Valentine talk.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chromatic</td>
<td>Irish theme.</td>
<td>Valentine shows Maria a hand portrait of Marie.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode on F</td>
<td>Melody.</td>
<td>Fog scene where Carey &amp; Maria search for <em>Wings of the Morning.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-flat major</td>
<td>Dawn music.</td>
<td>Dawn breaks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D-flat major</td>
<td>Irish theme.</td>
<td>scenes of morning in Irish countryside.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-flat major</td>
<td>Irish theme.</td>
<td>Lord Valentine meets Marie again.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F major</td>
<td>Melody.</td>
<td>Carey admires Maria when he sees her in evening dress for the first time.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode on F</td>
<td>Gypsy solo violin music.</td>
<td>Marie reads telegram from Don Diego informing her of his imminent arrival.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-flat major</td>
<td>Two appearances of the Wishing well theme.</td>
<td>Carey &amp; Maria visit the wishing well and both make a wish.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-flat major</td>
<td><strong>Vienna Blood</strong> Johann Strauss waltzes.</td>
<td>Music played &amp; sung at the party Carey throws for Maria.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F major</td>
<td>John McCormack sings <strong>Believe me if all those endearing young charms.</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A major</td>
<td>McCormack sings <em>Killarney.</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-flat major</td>
<td>Ballroom music from Benjamin's score for <em>The Scarlet Pimpernel.</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F major</td>
<td>McCormack sings <em>The Dawning of the Day.</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G-flat major</td>
<td>Band music played at the Derby.</td>
<td>Voice of Commentator at Derby.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode on F</td>
<td>Gypsy solo violin music.</td>
<td>Marie instructs the gypsies to gather together &amp; parade their wagons with Marie to show the Derby officials Marie as owner of the winning horse, is able to claim the prize money.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-flat major</td>
<td>Gypsy music from opening titles.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-flat major</td>
<td>Wishing well theme.</td>
<td>Maria tells Carey she</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-flat minor</td>
<td>Gypsy dance music</td>
<td>wants to marry him.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Compositional trends emerging from his previous film scores are consolidated in *Wings of the Morning*. This includes the composition of music in clearly defined sections amenable to repetition, and re-organisation and use of closely related keys capable of providing a logical and secure tonal background. Benjamin’s sense of drama contributes significantly to the interpretation of the film, and his use of leitmotif to identify characters, heighten dramatic themes and to indicate the development of a psychological drama give valuable insights into the thoughts and feelings of the main characters.

### 4.7 Under the Red Robe (1937)

*Under the Red Robe* began shooting at Denham studios in December 1936 and was the penultimate picture Benjamin scored music for before leaving Britain to live in Canada in 1939. Produced for New World and distributed by 20th Century-Fox, the film was well cast with actors such as Conrad Veidt, Annabella, Raymond Massey and Romney Brent in the leading roles. Victor Sjöström (1879–1960) was director and Muir Mathieson acted as music director.

Sjöström enjoyed a long career as an actor and it was in this capacity that he made his final film with Ingmar Bergman in *Wild Strawberries* (AB Svensk Filmindustri. 1957). Work as a film director began in 1912 and in the 1920s he travelled to America where he enjoyed a certain degree of success directing silent cinema productions. The watershed in film created by the arrival of sound pictures saw Sjöström’s popularity as a director wane and he returned to Sweden where he resumed work in acting. Alexander Korda’s offer of a film about the Christ based on Mary Borden’s novel *King of the Jews*, succeeded in luring Sjöström back into the

---

director’s chair in 1935 and Bengt Forslund explained the appeal this film would have had for Sjöström.

It was a subject far removed from the provincialism of Sweden in the 1930s, but the material suited Sjöström and contained several links with Sjöström’s own thematic domain: strains of degradation and atonement, the problem of guilt, the role of women in a man’s world845

Sjöström was known to have worked with detailed directing scripts but all of these, with the exception of King of the Jews, no longer exist. Forslund’s examination of this surviving script revealed that Sjöström, who appeared to work so intuitively, was, in fact, very well prepared and knew what he wanted from lighting and editing details through to dialogue and pictorial composition. Forslund also claimed that Sjöström had a particular interest in psychological states and the study of people’s behaviour under certain situations.846

Production on King of the Jews ceased for economic reasons resulting in Sjöström being offered Under the Red Robe in exchange. A team led by Lajos Biro adapted the screenplay from a novel by Stanley J. Weyman and the play by Edward Rose.847 Sjöström’s lack of empathy with the film was well expressed in this letter to his wife where he said: “I am so disappointed—I certainly think that it’s a terribly old-fashioned and conventional film in the worst sense—Perhaps if the dialogue had been written by a craftsman, it could have been different—but, no, I don’t believe so.”848 All seems to have ended reasonably well with Sjöström admitting he was “not quite so badly disappointed” when he viewed the finished product which was at least “fairly entertaining and fast-moving”.849

847 Taken from the film credits.
849 Ibid: 245.
Under the Red Robe, as an entertaining ‘swashbuckling’ adventure set in 17th century France, was in tune with Benjamin’s romantic spirit and his personal interest in this period of the country’s history. The only other two films touching on a similar subject were The Scarlet Pimpernel (1934) and Return of the Scarlet Pimpernel (1937), but Benjamin’s scoring for these was restricted to mainly diegetic purposes. Under the Red Robe provided him with a vehicle through which he could more fully explore a subject matter especially close to his heart. It also revealed subtle new developments in the use of thematic material. To explain just how special this film was to Benjamin, the written text on the screen following on from the opening titles is reproduced below.

The massacre of Saint Bartholomew in 1572 had swilled the gutters of Paris with Huguenot blood. 50 years later, Protestant die-hards in the south were still a thorn in the side of Cardinal Richelieu. It was a period of plot and counter-plot, of reckless gallantry and ruthless oppression...the time of D’Artagnan[,] of Cyrano de Bergerac, of Gil de Berault, the ‘Black Death’

Benjamin carried one book in his rucksack throughout his WWI service—Edmond Rostand’s Cyrano de Bergerac, and his own ‘heroics’ during the war reflected the recklessness of his much admired predecessor as illustrated in this letter, written only weeks before he was shot down and taken prisoner.

Well, I am enchanted with my new life. And when one thinks of the infantry this is Heaven. (of course it is!) Nothing is more exhilarating than a scrap in the air & if only the Hun had more guts (quel langage mon cher!) we should bring more down. Moral:- breed your children without intestines.

Opera was a life-long passion of Benjamin’s and in a BBC talk on his opera A Tale of Two Cities given in 1953, he revealed his early

850 Taken from the film’s opening moments.
851 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Herbert Howells, June 1, 1918 (RCM Library, Herbert Howells papers).
aspiration to set Rostand’s text as a full-length opera.\textsuperscript{852} “I told myself that when I felt mature enough as a composer it would be the foundation for my ‘big’ opera. Over thirty years later I found that I had missed my chance”;\textsuperscript{853} the Italian composer Franco Alfano (1875–1954), had succeeded in securing copyright permission and the opera \textit{Cyrano de Bergerac} had been premiered in Rome in 1936.\textsuperscript{854}

Although \textit{Under the Red Robe} pre-dates Benjamin’s foiled operatic hopes, it proved to be, in the end, the only vehicle through which Benjamin explored his passion for this particular subject. He would have immediately identified with the character of Gil de Berault whom he musically represents in the motifs shown in examples 4.41, 4.42. This music is introduced in the film’s opening

\textbf{Example 4.41} Gil de Berault motif A, \textit{Under the Red Robe}.

\begin{verbatim}
\textbf{Example 4.42} Gil de Berault theme, \textit{Under the Red Robe}.
\end{verbatim}

\textit{J} = 112 approx.

\begin{verbatim}
\textit{J} = 126 approx.
\end{verbatim}

\begin{verbatim}
oboes & strings
\end{verbatim}

\begin{verbatim}
\end{verbatim}

\begin{verbatim}
titles in the key of B major and remains in connection with Gil de Berault throughout the score. Benjamin extracts a motif B from the first bar of the theme which reappears immediately after the opening titles to accompany the explanatory text (reproduced earlier) and takes on a more menacing quality, without losing any sense of courageousness, in the key of G minor over a drone on F (example 4.43).

Later in the film, the use of motif B is more subtle and responsive to the film’s script. For example, in the scene where

\textsuperscript{852} Arthur Benjamin. ‘A Tale of Two Cities’, (script) transmitted April 13, 1953 on BBC Third Programme (Benjamin Estate).

\textsuperscript{853} Ibid.

Marguerite lies in the arms of Gil shortly after they have both declared their love for each other, the second motif is heard as she talks about him and he explains more about himself. The motif makes two brief appearances in G-sharp minor when Marguerite says: 'I thought you were all kinds of horrible things'; and when Gil reveals he has taken on the name of 'de Barte, the name of my mother’s family'. The scene concludes with Marguerite declaring: The past is past. It's...your hands, your eyes, your courage—they belong to me’ to which the motif gains momentum and strength with each transposition as it makes its way into the related key of B major (example 4.44). Another episode sees Gil whistle the first motif in F-sharp major just after his capture by the Cardinal's troops who are marching him through the forest before his daring escape. All these variations on the two motifs in various keys confirm and explore the courageous and noble side of his character.

Further insight into Gil de Berault's character is brought to light in the scene where he appears to have betrayed Marguerite's
trust by arresting her brother Edmond, Duke of Foix. This he does in the name of the Cardinal in order to save the Duke from being taken prisoner by the Cardinal’s troops who have just stormed the castle, but it is his intention to release him later on. The music’s entry coincides with Marguerite’s angry striking of Gil’s face with a riding whip. In an effort to comfort him, Marius, Gil’s accomplice acting as his manservant, points out that their work for the Cardinal is done and they can go home. He further attempts to lighten Gil’s despondent mood by saying: ‘I’d like to see the Cardinal’s face when he hears the news’. In Gil’s darkest moment, the first motif is played in B minor by the strings. He replies to Marius ‘You shall’ after which a horn repeats the first motif in a more decisive and brighter guise in the relative major—D major, as he instructs Marius to ‘saddle up your horse’ and ride on ahead of him to inform the Cardinal of the Duke’s arrest. These brief and subtle variations on Gil’s motifs in this scene and in a later scene where Gil sets Marguerite and her brother free, give intimate insights into Gil’s thoughts and feelings, and his relationship with courage which so defines his personality (example 4.45). Other main characters are also assigned themes and Cardinal Richelieu’s (example 4.46) is used to indicate his influence even when he is not on screen. The nature of the theme reflects the Cardinal’s position of power, second only to the King’s, which sees him ordering the execution of countless men suspected of treason or, as in the case of Gil de Berault, having disregarded his new law forbidding duelling.

The Cardinal’s theme first announces his arrival at his palace in the key of F-sharp minor. It appears a second time in the same key when he himself is not present, but we see the arrival of his guards to arrest Gil for duelling. Again, the Cardinal is not visible in the scene where Gil sets Marguerite and her brother free; the theme is played as Gil says ‘I redeem my honour’ and again when he rides off in the direction of Paris. The presence of this theme clarifies the drama by alerting the audience, through music, to the fact that Gil’s
Example 4.45 Variations on Gil de Berault motif A after his betrayal of Marguerite, *Under the Red Robe*.

\[ J = 88 \text{ approx.} \]

Example 4.46 First entry of Cardinal's theme, *Under the Red Robe*.

\[ J = 126 \text{ approx.} \]

destination is the Cardinal's palace even though he knows the Cardinal will hang him for failing to deliver the Duke as prisoner.

A simple four-note motif is woven into three scenes, representing the love interest between Marguerite and Gil. The first appearance is in the two minute and thirty-one second scene where Marguerite perceives Gil's real feelings for her (example 4.47).

Example 4.47 Four-note 'love' motif, *Under the Red Robe*.

\[ J = 69 \text{ approx.} \]

This motif shares the rhythm of the opening four notes of Gil de Berault's first motif with only the pitches of the first two notes altered. The love motif makes two more appearances, firstly in the scene where Marguerite thinks Gil has been shot by the Cardinal's troops in the forest and she confesses both her love and remorse to her sister-in-law, and secondly, in the scene where Gil reappears unharmed, much to Marguerite's relief, and she finally shows her love for him. In all these scenes, the love motif is not restricted to any particular tonality and is freely transposed. Marguerite's remorse is explored by Benjamin through use of a theme in the key of B-flat minor for both these scenes (example 4.48).

In addition to these themes and motifs which develop and give insight into the feelings of the main characters, Benjamin scores appropriate music for various other scenes. Some examples include
the storm episode where he captures the sound of the wind, the duel scene which explores more dissonant sounds (especially the tri-tone), and diegetic music composed for the Cardinal as he plays his flute and for the tavern song where the locals, accompanied by either a lute or guitar, sing a ballad about the Cardinal's orchard 'where dead men hang on every tree'.

The music for Under the Red Robe continues to use a focused range of keys and tonal centres to cohere the score and reveals a sophisticated use of themes and motifs to explore the thoughts, feelings or presence of the three main characters—Gil de Berault, Marguerite and Cardinal Richelieu. The motifs for Gil de Berault are especially dominant and this material is subject to numerous, subtle variations that make free use of transposition and do not strictly adhere to certain tonal centres or keys as is the case in some of Benjamin's earlier film scores. As a result, the feelings or the psychological development of the main characters, particularly that of Gil de Berault, are explored in more intimacy. Although this is speculative, it is highly probable that the film may well have been viewed by Benjamin as an opportunity to develop material for later possible use in an opera on the subject of Cyrano de Bergerac.

4.8 Conclusion

Benjamin's first film music period spans a relatively short period of time but the six films analysed show specific trends in his compositional approach that were in direct response to the challenges and stimulus of the medium of film. One of the challenges facing film music composers of the early sound pictures was the episodic and potentially fragmentary nature of the score as determined by the supremacy of dialogue in most director's minds—a result, to some degree, of problems with dubbing. Benjamin was fortunate to come
under the instruction of Hitchcock for his first feature film, a director who was known for his adventurous and imaginative use of music. *Storm Clouds Cantata* coincided with a request for a musical form capable of considerable building power that would lead to a climax in the closing moments. It demanded of Benjamin new levels of awareness regarding dramatic pacing, timing and development of the psychological drama.

In response to the inherent problems of fragmentation in film music scores, Benjamin evolved compositional techniques designed to aid cohesion within a score and support the dramatic focus of a film. One of these techniques involved extensive use of the leitmotif. By creating easy-to-identify motifs capable of being recognised upon repetition, Benjamin was able to select and connect certain themes in a film to develop a dramatic line. The motifs were of a simple melodic and rhythmic nature, often identifying with one key or mode or select instrumentation; they were not unduly long (some being only five notes) and were contrasted enough with other motifs to avoid confusion.855

Repeated use of keys and pitches representing dramatic themes and characters in a film would have had extra significance to a composer such as Benjamin, who had a reputation from early childhood for a phenomenal sense of perfect pitch.856 Such structuring would admittedly have been largely lost on the untrained ears of most film audiences but would still have had appeal to a film composer conscious of creating a score that was, despite being at times widely dispersed, as coherent as possible when viewed as a whole.

Use of related keys, tonal centres, decorated drones and ostinati created stable backgrounds, much like the visual backgrounds Hitchcock admitted to using in his early British films. Again, like Hitchcock, the film's action or the music's action over this

855 Counterpoint and orchestration issues are discussed in chapter four.
background had the freedom to be dissonant, chromatic or more fragmented, as in the *Storm Clouds Cantata* or the storm scene in *Turn of the Tide*. Dramatic tension in the music could also be controlled through changes in rhythm, tempi, texture and intervallic tension between the movement of the upper voices against the stability of a drone.

Film directors required music to be shortened or lengthened at short notice prior to or during a recording session, and further cuts were often made even after recording was complete. In response to this and to the brevity of scenes with juxtaposing moods, Benjamin's scores avoid needless development or complex transitions. Musical ideas composed in segments were easily repeated or re-arranged at original pitch or transposed in order to fill-in the allocated scene. This approach resulted in musical scenes that were symmetrically constructed from clearly defined segments.

Some of the compositional techniques displayed in Benjamin's film scores were adaptations to the physical and practical demands of film making. Others were in response to the psychological content of film. Common elements portrayed in the feature films of the 1930s involved harmony and disharmony or conflict and resolution, and themes involving the struggle of truth and goodness triumphing over bad. As a film composer, Benjamin was required to clarify and interpret these elements of a drama through music for film audiences. To distinguish them in a signposting capacity was only the beginning: it was also the skill of a good film composer to produce a score that clarified for the audience, the process of transformation or resolution of the psychological drama in a film. These compositional techniques developed to serve the needs of film were then applied to music written for other genres, especially works of greater duration such as orchestra and opera, whose forms extended beyond the simpler demands of the suite and song settings.
Chapter 5

Orchestration and Counterpoint
5.1 Introduction

This chapter studies Benjamin's orchestration and counterpoint in his orchestral compositions to determine whether his work in film influenced his approach in these areas. As part of this assessment, six works have been chosen for comparative analysis and have been divided into three sections. The first section begins with the analysis of orchestration and counterpoint in two orchestral scores from the pre-film period. Orchestration and counterpoint is then studied in a second section comprised of music from two films. This is then compared with the results of the pre-film scores. The third section completes the study by analysing the orchestration and counterpoint in two orchestral scores that follow on from this first film period, the results of which are compared with the findings from the two previous sections.

Two orchestral works that clearly date before his film music have been selected: the Concertino (1927) and the Violin Concerto completed in January 1931. Benjamin composed very little orchestral music before he commenced work in film and the other pre-film orchestral music which may have qualified for inclusion in this study has been omitted for the following reasons: Light Music for orchestra is acknowledged in a Boosey & Hawkes catalogue printed in 1986 as having been composed between 1928–35, which makes it difficult to place as a pre-film work or one that is on the cusp of his early film work; two unpublished orchestral compositions Three Dance-Scherzos (1915–7) and Rhapsody on Negro Folk Tunes (1919) date very early in Benjamin's career (as discussed in chapter two) and as such have not been given preference for reasons of chronology and maturity of style. The scores for the film Turn of the Tide (1935) and Storm Clouds Cantata (1934) form the focus for his film period for practical reasons: they are important film scores, a manuscript was available for the study of the Cantata and both pre-date the two

---

857 "London January 1931" is printed on the last page of the piano score published in 1932 by OUP.
orchestral works that follow. The *Romantic Fantasy* (1936) and *Overture to an Italian Comedy* (1937) were composed at the close of Benjamin’s first film music period and will represent works from the post-film years.

5.2 Orchestration and counterpoint in Concertino and the Violin Concerto

Benjamin’s account of his student days at the RCM mentioned the influence of composers such as Brahms and Franck, the first being favoured by his composition teacher and conductor of the College orchestra Sir Charles Villiers Stanford,858 and the second whose work he absorbed through his own performances.859 Brahms and Franck are two composers referred to in G. W. Hopkins’s article in the *New Grove* on orchestration as having used the dominating presence of the strings as a “centre of gravity”.860 Such a perspective was echoed in published texts that may have been available to Benjamin at the time, such as Rimsky-Korsakov’s *Principles of Orchestration* in which he can be quoted as saying, in an early preface dating from 1891, that the student of orchestration in “the more advanced period” would “come to recognise that the string group is the richest and most expressive of all”.861

An analysis of the orchestration in the Concertino for piano and orchestra and Violin Concerto reveals that Benjamin shared a similar view and the strings are used extensively throughout both works either as a dominant force or in an accompanying mode, making them the cohering factor in the orchestral timbre. The following examples illustrate the marked presence of the strings

859 *Ibid.:* 203. See also Hubert Parry’s diary entry for February 16, 1915 (Shulbrede Priory, Sussex).
whose sound is often used purely without blending or support from other sections of the orchestra. In example 5.1 they introduce the Concertino with *pizzicato* chords, perhaps deliberately imitating the strumming of a dry banjo-like sound, and are joined by a trumpet solo.

**Example 5.1 Concertino, bars 1–12.**

*Example 5.1 Concertino, bars 1–12.*

Examples 5.2 and 5.3 reveal the degree of independence shown by the string section when used either in isolation or in conjunction with other sections of the orchestra. Similar use of the strings can be found in the three movements of the Violin Concerto—Rhapsody, Intermezzo and Rondo. These are illustrated in example 5.4 in bars 63–9 of the Rhapsody and in bars 12–31 of the Rondo in example 5.5. Because the strings are used virtually non-stop in this movement, their colour becomes the common denominator in the scoring and example 5.6 sees them in an accompanying role providing a simple *pizzicato* backing for the woodwind soloists.

**Example 5.2 Concertino, bars 115–9.**

*Example 5.2 Concertino, bars 115–9.*
Benjamin's orchestration often keeps the woodwind and string sections separate, as illustrated in one substantial passage from the Concertino in bars 151-66 where only the woodwind feature (example 5.7). This separation of the instrumental sections is common throughout the Concertino and can be further observed in the ethereal sounding orchestral accompaniment of the piano solo in the
Example 5.5 Violin Concerto, Rondo, bars 12–9.

Example 5.6 Rondo, bars 150–3.

Example 5.7 Concertino, bars 151–66.

Scherzo section. Muted strings dominate the scoring and the woodwind is reserved almost as a decoration for the close of each musical sentence, together with a touch of brass (example 5.8). A
passage from the Violin Concerto's Rhapsody shifts the emphasis in accompaniment from the strings to the woodwind, which again shows some degree of separation in Benjamin's mind when using these sections of the orchestra (example 5.9). This tendency to separate instrumental sections persists in the Intermezzo movement as can be seen in example 5.10.

Just as the strings can be used in isolation, it is not uncommon for the woodwind section to perform independently as already shown in example 5.7 of the Concertino and in example 5.11 of the Violin Concerto's Rhapsody where they pass a short motif from one instrument to another.

As well as making use of contrasting string and woodwind colours, Benjamin blended orchestral sections. Example 5.12 taken from the Rhapsody sees the main theme taken by the flute and trumpet moving in unison an octave apart. This is accompanied by the harp and piano with the violin soloist adding decorative counterpoint before a typically woodwind dominated accompaniment enters. The woodwind is used to aid the voicing in sections dominated by the strings. For example, the bassoon duplicates a double bass line in bars 154–5 of the Rhapsody and in bars 39–47 of the Concertino (example 5.3), and in example 5.9 the cor anglais and oboe take turns to reinforce the first violins.

Benjamin limits the brass section to two trumpets and two horns in the Concertino but expands these forces in the Violin Concerto to encompass two extra horns, two tenor trombones, bass trombone and tuba as well. Following well set traditions for use of the brass, both orchestral works allocate the majority of the important solos and melodic lines to the trumpets and horns. When employed beyond the role of soloist, the brass section is used to emphasize rhythm and give weight and sonority to orchestral tutti especially when the dynamics are above mezzo forte.

For the most part Benjamin's use of percussion is bold and simple. His selection for the Concertino consists of three timpani,
bass drum, side drum, cymbals, tambourine and triangle, and this choice is repeated in the Violin Concerto with the omission of the tambourine. In both works, the percussion emphasises the beat or a catchy rhythm that needs support. It often marks the beginning of a musical section or the close of a musical sentence. This can be seen in the Concertino in example 5.13 where the side drum rounds off the latter with a volley of four semi-quavers, much like a musical full stop or exclamation mark. Use of the percussion in the Concertino’s blues section Andante poco lento at the start of bar 101 creates a subtler yet distinct colour that reminds one of similar orchestration used in the opening bars of *Action Rituelle des Ancêstres* from Stravinsky’s *Le Sacre du Printemps*. Here the bass drum marked *pianississimo* plays on the beat giving warmth of colour and depth to the string *pizzicato*, and the tambourine, played with a wire brush, marks the off-beats with the piano soloist for one bar, followed by the violas playing *molto spiccato* (example 5.14). The Rhapsody of the Violin Concerto focuses on the use of the timpani in the first half of the movement before the side drum, triangle, cymbal and bass drum add to the percussion colour. Use of the percussion is not always a subtle art, as the six
Example 5.9 Violin Concerto, Rhapsody, bars 70–85.
Example 5.10 Violin Concerto, Intermezzo, bars 66–75.

Example 5.11 Violin Concerto, Rhapsody, bars 57–60.
bars worth of quavers thumped out by the timpani from bar 190 amidst an exuberant orchestral *tutti*, serves to remind the listener. Their chief role in the Rhapsody seems to be in reinforcing rhythms such as those played by the side drum and strings in bars 221–7 as well as marking the start or finish of a section. An example of the latter can be found at bar 207 where the timpani’s quavers, doubled
by the piano and *pizzicato* on the cello and double bass, prepare for
the start of the recapitulation. And at bar 176, the first note of a
falling string passage marked *vigoroso* and its subsequent repeats are
marked by the single strike of a side drum and triangle. Other
examples of the typical bold, rhythmic use of the percussion may be
found in another of Benjamin's pre-film scores, his first opera *The
Devil Take Her*. This one-act opera, first performed in 1931, features
a thirty-one bar percussion *tour de force* in a passage where the
doctor performs an upstairs operation on the dumb wife to restore
her voice. Xylophone, glockenspiel, cymbal, Chinese wood block, side
drum and rasp combine forces to create an exuberant workshop of
sound.

Other instruments used in an orchestral capacity in the Violin
Concerto include the piano. Its use is sporadic and is, for example in
the Rondo, given moments for its distinct colour to shine through the
orchestral sound without being blended with other instruments.
When it is blended with other instruments or with an orchestral *tutti*,
its percussive qualities give the sound extra rhythmic punch and
definition, especially in the extreme registers and at any dynamic.

Counterpoint in these early orchestral works can vary from
the simpler use of melody against a chord accompaniment to complex
counterpoint where six, and sometimes more, independent melodic
voices are sounding at once, some of which are doubled in unison in
an upper or lower octave. This variety of counterpoint is well
illustrated in the examples already provided which show how the
layering of themes and motifs, often together with decorative runs
from the soloist, add to the complexity of these contrapuntal textures.
They also reveal the range over which these melodic lines are spread,
with considerable voicing not only in the higher but in and below the
tenor region as well, which create a sonorous and at times, thick
body of sound. In the Violin Concerto's Rhapsody, Benjamin
reinforced the lower voices by adding the bass trombone and tuba to
the bassoon and bass clarinet lines. This heavier and richer
orchestral colour was needed to bring into relief lower bass-lines which might otherwise have been lost in a score involving such complex use of counterpoint.

Benjamin’s choice of orchestration supports and clarifies the structure of his orchestral works up to a certain point. Certainly the distinct colour blend of percussion and strings helps to identify the start of the blues section in the Concertino as already discussed and illustrated in example 5.14. Passages of repeated musical material sometimes include the repetition of the original orchestration as well. For example, the form of the Violin Concerto’s Intermezzo is supported by the muted strings’ consistent identification with the memorable theme first introduced in bar 17, its repeat at bar 35 and an echo in bars 71 and 75 near the close of the movement (example 5.10). Another example can be heard in the Violin Concerto’s Rondo where the decorative flourish of the solo violin against the string section in bar 94–104 is repeated for music that is almost identical for the same ten bar length in bars 231–41. A further example of repeated blocks of orchestration, this time of twenty bars duration, can be found in bars 65–85 and 202–22 where the violin solo is accompanied by three horns under which an E-drone is played by the celli and the first note of the bar is marked by a single note on the piano an octave lower.

These examples of repeated blocks of orchestration help to give the listener some sense of form in an orchestral sound which can at times, sound like endlessly layered themes in a sea of intricate counterpoint and changing instrumentation. With the exception of the strings’ identification with a theme in the Intermezzo, Benjamin’s orchestration does not consistently serve to characterize or clarify his use of themes and motifs. One could argue in the Concertino that the brass identifies more with the punchier jazz rhythms in the work and the strings with the English pastoral themes but this impression is a generalization that does not draw a parallel with the careful choice of instrumentation that serves to define and characterise the leitmotifs
developed in his film music. His orchestration may be well balanced and attractive in these early orchestral works but the scoring does not aid the listener in discerning and remembering crucial musical material, a necessary process in being able to detect or sense any development in the unfolding musical drama.

5.3 Orchestration and counterpoint in Benjamin’s 1930s film scores with particular focus on Turn of the Tide

As explained in chapter three, sound film in the early 1930s was experimental and pioneering work, especially so for composers and sound technicians striving to produce the best quality of recording with the limitations imposed by the technical equipment and recording processes of the day. Some composers wrote as they pleased regardless of the microphone’s restrictions but others such as Benjamin responded to these challenges by adapting their scoring as circumstances dictated. His 1937 film music article indicated his level of awareness when scoring for the microphones.

The composer should put away any idea of using an orchestra in the Straussian, Elgarian, or even in the Debussian sense. Concert scoring and microphone scoring are vastly different. And although the latter would ‘come off’ in the concert-room, the former would often be muddy and dull through the ‘mike’ (Americanisms are de rigeur in the film studios!).

Composers have had to sit up all night re-scoring work which the microphone refused to take—waste and expense for the producing company.862

Kurt London’s Film Music, published in 1936, explained the microphone’s difficulty in recording frequencies in the higher and lower instrumental registers and warned composers of the poor quality of the recorded string sound, particularly the violins, as well

862 Arthur Benjamin. 'Film Music', The Musical Times, July 1937: 596.
as the pitfalls of certain percussion instruments such as the timpani and bass drum. When discussing improvements that could be made in the recording of percussion, London suggested experimenting with the position of the instrument in relation to the microphone. Adjusting the position of instruments around the microphone was a popular solution not only for problems of sound quality but for problems of instrumental balance as well. Violinist Edward Silverman, wrote an account of a film recording session in the 1940s which testified to the amount of time and importance given to achieving the best possible balance between instrumental sections. Both his account and a photographic testimony reproduced in Muir Mathieson's biography indicate the presence of more than one microphone present at these sessions, and the photo shows the strings physically separated to the left of the conductor from the woodwind who are seated to his right. Sabaneev testifies to there being as many as four microphones for more complex recordings involving a soloist and orchestra spread over a considerable studio space. Benjamin's first hand experience of this particular problem and its solution is obvious from his comment in his 1937 article: “often it is necessary to place certain instruments nearer to or farther from the microphone for the sake of balance.”

The fact that Benjamin was aware of the technicalities of recording for film was illustrated in London's citing of his film scores for The Man Who Knew Too Much, The Clairvoyant, The Guv'nor, The Scarlet Pimpernel, Wharves and Strays and Turn of the Tide, as being ideally suited for the microphone’s recording capacity of the day.

An excellent orchestrator, he [Benjamin] very soon realised that microphone scores must differ from traditional symphonic tone-combinations. He had the courage to give effect to his conclusions in action: he dared to depose

the strings from their supremacy, reducing them to the level of mere filling-in-parts, and no longer, or only very seldom, allowing them the melody (see musical facsimile). He uses saxophones for the *ripieno* of the horns, avoids the use of the kettle-drum wherever possible, and renders the pizzicato of the double-basses on the piano or on the tuba. He regards the flute as a real solo instrument for the microphone. He considers it unnecessary to use an orchestra of more than about twenty players, and he is right: well-orchestrated music needs no mammoth body of players.868

Kurt London’s observations are a useful starting point for a more detailed discussion of Benjamin’s orchestration and counterpoint. *Turn of the Tide*’s score supports his claim with regard to the strings which are allocated numerous fill-in parts with very few scenes featuring an independent, pure string sound. Contrary to his claim, they do continue to play melodic lines but rarely without support or doubling by other sections of the orchestra.

London described the manner in which the sound quality of recorded strings was affected by writing: “the overtones of violins are cut off and so distort the sound”.869 To balance this lack of clarity Benjamin often chose to reinforce and define their sound by blending them with the brass and woodwind. Strings used as a fill-in also create the perfect *sotto voce* balance against other instruments as their sound is less distinct and duller through the microphone. For example, the ‘lovers’ theme, where the strings are most prominent, is easily dominated by the sound of a solo horn in its first, third and fourth appearance. Other examples include the storm scene where the strings bind the woodwind and brass together in a weaving, winding *ponticello tremolando* accompaniment (see examples 4.24 and 4.25). Another example is the brook scene where bowed and *pizzicato* string accompaniment in the lower voices, support the virtuosic runs on the woodwind which command the higher register (example 5.15). Violins are sporadically used in the upper register but are reinforced by either the woodwind or piano. This doubling and blending of the

strings with other sections of the orchestra became necessary when their sound was not sufficiently defined or strong enough to balance with the power and clarity of the brass and woodwind in recordings.

The more focused sound of the recorded solo strings fared much better than a section of strings, and Benjamin used this colour sparingly for particular moments. In Turn of the Tide, a solo violin accompanied by woodwind is employed for a serene dawn scene (example 4.14) and a string quartet renders the 'lovers' theme in its second appearance. Benjamin also employed the solo violin in his score for Wings of the Morning (1937) for its association with the gypsy element of the story, as discussed in chapter four.

Unlike the strings, woodwind and brass instruments recorded well in the 1930s. London singled out Benjamin's use of the flute as a solo instrument but he also gave a prominent place to the trumpet and horn. Although London warned composers of potential problems when recording the horn and claimed Benjamin replaced them at times with the saxophone,\(^870\) the sound quality of these 1930s films makes it difficult to establish his point beyond doubt and there are numerous examples of horn solos employed in Benjamin's film scores.

Recordings of woodwind retained their clarity in agile passages and so we find Benjamin giving the woodwind the lion's share of sustained solos as well as virtuosic filigree work (see examples 5.15 and 4.13). This dominance of the woodwind is even apparent in the early film Wharves and Strays, where a glimpse of two extracts from the score can be viewed in London's book.\(^871\) The first shows scoring for flute, clarinet, bassoon, glockenspiel and two male voices, and the second for two flutes, oboe, clarinet and bassoon with supportive string accompaniment.

\(^{871}\) Ibid.: 215.
Example 5.15 Turn of the Tide, brook scene.
The clarity of the recorded string sound was compromised most in the bass and upper voices so it is not surprising that other instruments replaced or supported the strings in these registers. Again in the musical example for the brook scene, woodwinds dominate the upper register and in the second part of the same scene, involving the failed attempt to catch the salmon, a sprightly bass line in 6/8 time is given to the bassoon in a rare solo moment — rather than the cello, because of the superior clarity of sound and attack of the woodwind in this register. Another example of the woodwind being used for passages requiring agility can be found in the portrayal of wind and lightning in the storm scene involving fast chromatic runs and a high two-note motif on the flute and piccolo (see example 4.25).

British film composers other than Benjamin focused on the woodwind. John Huntley discussed Walter Leigh’s scoring for the 1935 film, Song of Ceylon, using the following quote from Kurt London’s book:

Leigh has realised that the sound-film, a new art, requires a new musical technique. His music departs from tradition, not only in its form but in connection with the tonality of the whole film; his instrumentation also
displays in its transparent economy, a striking understanding of the special requirements of the microphone. Wind, above all wood-wind, dominate in delicate contrapuntal sound-texture, even in combination with strings, used solo. 872

Composers found the use of woodwind and brass provided solutions for problems encountered with the dubbing process. At moments when the dubbing process pushed the music into the background whenever dialogue and/or natural sound was present, it was still possible to hear the woodwind and brass even though the strings were often lost or indistinct. Miklos Rózsa, said the following about music he had written for a battle scene.

I once wrote a fugato for a battle scene, and the result was that the contrapuntal lines were completely swallowed up by the battle noises and one heard nothing of my brilliant counterpoint. A simpler, chordal music with a heavy brass instrumentation would have cut through and served the purpose considerably better. 873

Having reached the same conclusion as Rózsa, Benjamin brought the brass forward in scenes where music had to compete with dialogue and natural sound. Two scenes, involving the storm and the hauling out of the rescue boat when a steamer runs aground, rely upon the woodwind and brass, not only for the latter's inherent weight of sound that was able to penetrate all manner of non-musical sounds present in the scene, but to supply the action with the necessary energy and drama; this he expresses in chord movement and fanfare-like scoring. In selected places Benjamin also echoed and incorporated natural sounds into his score such as in the storm scene where the actual sound of the wind is skilfully merged with the musical depiction of wind when the music re-enters (examples 4.24 and 4.25).

Rózsa's reference to inaudible 'brilliant counterpoint' highlights another problem that presented itself to composers. Benjamin touched on the same subject in his article when he referred to orchestration in the Straussian, Elgarian or Debussian sense as sounding 'muddy' through the microphones. One presumes he was partly referring to not only the choice of instruments but to the sometimes complex and intricate counterpoint so characteristic of these composers which would be lost through the microphones and in any dubbing process. He clarified this statement in the same article by saying: "Elaborate counterpoint or 'symphonic' writing is entirely lost. Counterpoint, if used, should be extremely simple and clearly scored". Subsequently, Benjamin's film scores are stripped of all unnecessary counterpoint, especially so in the lower voices. The variations on the 'lovers' theme feature some of the most developed counterpoint but as soon as the solo horn enters, the ear and the microphone gravitate to the solo line. Counter-melodies, if they exist at all, are kept very simple and melodic lines in the lower voices are exceptionally rare with all melodic movement focused in the tenor and upper voices. The storm scene provides the most abstract and complex musical counterpoint but even here the music is well spaced and underpinned by the use of fixed or slow moving drones defined by the timpani and piano (examples 4.24 and 4.25).

London made the observation that "well-orchestrated music needs no mammoth body of players" and the decision to compose for chamber music dimensions was no doubt affected by the restricted economics of the 1930s. Many of the British productions that Benjamin worked on at this time were labelled 'quota quickies': low budget productions which fulfilled exhibitors' needs to satisfy the imposed quota of British film content. Often these films were supplementary to the main feature film and therefore the box office returns were modest.

874 Arthur Benjamin. 'Film Music', The Musical Times, July 1937: 596.
875 Ibid.: 596.
London described the sound produced by a small body of orchestral players combined with the limitations of microphone technique, as having "neither a genuine pianissimo nor a good fortissimo".\textsuperscript{877} This demanded economic use of instrumental tone colour and imaginative use of texture. \textit{Turn of the Tide} is a miniature exhibition of sound paintings in terms of contrasting instrumental tone colour and texture. The brook scene features transparent running figures on the flute and clarinet with light sparse accompaniment; the storm scene is more abstract in its depiction of nature and is held together by the \textit{sotto voce} constantly chromatic moving figures on the strings and woodwind while the brass and woodwind dominate the fragmented motifs and fanfares over timpani rolls and splashes of the cymbal. Another scene involving the arrival of a boat engine introduces a sustained melody on the woodwind accompanied by a short motor-like rhythmic \textit{ostinato} played on a side drum which is doubled by a wind instrument that could be either a clarinet or saxophone (example 4.17). The colours created for this scene, yet again, contrast with the legato, soft colours and textures of the strings and solo horn used to depict the 'lovers' theme or the ethereal violin solo heard in the dawn scene. In effect, Benjamin's choice of instrumentation created textural dimension by assigning the tone of the strings, whose sound was light and less defined, to \textit{sotto voce} or supportive roles, and bringing to the fore the solid and weightier sound of the brass or the more clearly defined tone of the woodwind to compensate for the less expressive range of dynamics at his disposal.

This heightened awareness of instrumental colour in sound-film scoring also affected Benjamin's use of percussion in subtle ways. London's book warned composers about percussion saying they were "the most problematical, from the point of view of the microphone technique", with the side drum and glockenspiel being

\textsuperscript{877} \textit{Ibid.}: 181.
the exception. Benjamin’s energetic scoring for the cymbals in the storm scene where the Lunn’s lobster pots are destroyed is one example of how easily the microphones could overload and distort the sound. For the most part though, Benjamin’s use of percussion became more imaginative in his film scores. Examples include the use of the side drum to evoke the sound of a motor boat engine when a large crate containing such an object is wheeled along the village streets. Cymbal splashes, suggestive of splashing waves, and timpani rolls ebb and flow amongst the varied and colourful instrumental palette of the storm scene. Benjamin developed the use of leitmotifs in his film scores to aid identification of characters and themes. These he reinforced with his choice of instrumentation such as scoring the strings for all five entries of the ‘lovers’ theme. The woodwind feature in numerous variations of the ‘work’ theme and share Isaac’s chromatic motif with the trumpet. The ‘triumph’ theme which appears throughout the entire film score is consistently linked with the trumpet or horn.

Benjamin’s approach to orchestration and counterpoint in these film music scores extended to his best known score for the Hitchcock film *The Man Who Knew Too Much*, the *Storm Clouds Cantata*. Examples 5.16 and 5.17 further illustrate his tendency to integrate the strings, give important themes to the brass or woodwind and to simplify counterpoint.

This study, focused on Benjamin’s scores for *Turn of the Tide* and *Storm Clouds Cantata*, reveals certain trends in orchestration and counterpoint that are consistent with his other film scores from the 1930s. Conditions imposed by the recording and dubbing processes directly influencing the quality of the music recorded for film, resulted in Benjamin’s practical adaption of his orchestration and counterpoint in order to achieve the most satisfactory results. In short, this involved the reduced role of the strings and the increased role of the woodwind and brass, more subtle and imaginative use of

---

878 *ibid.*: 174–6.
Example 5.16 The Man Who Knew Too Much, Storm Clouds Cantata, bars 1–10.
percussion, and the use of piano to provide clarity in the high and low registers. Counterpoint was simplified often to the point of being a solo melodic line with accompaniments that could be as simple as a drone or ostinato. Small instrumental forces required Benjamin to savour what contrasting texture and instrumental colour was available to him. He chose to develop the use of leitmotifs in his film scores with their associated instrumental colours to help audiences interpret the drama.

5.4 Orchestration and counterpoint in Romantic Fantasy and Overture to an Italian Comedy

The two orchestral works selected for this study were written towards the close of Benjamin’s first film music period. By May 1936, the Romantic Fantasy for violin and viola soloists and orchestra was being considered for performance by the BBC. In 1938, Benjamin reported his intention to revise “and cut the end” after having heard a performance. The final page of the manuscript of Overture to an Italian Comedy registers in ink the completion place and date ‘London

880 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Keith Douglas April 11, 1938 (MS 335 f.95, British Library).
January 1937. It is a work particularly interesting for this study as it is dedicated to Muir Mathieson, the conductor with whom Benjamin worked closely on almost all his film music projects.

Despite the title of the work, all three movements of the *Romantic Fantasy* (Nocturne, Scherzo and Sonata-Finale) employ the strings in a purely supportive role. A range of examples can be cited beginning with the opening chord accompaniment in the Nocturne (example 5.18) to the *pizzicato* supporting the bassoon and clarinet *ostinato* in bar 39 (example 5.19). These examples illustrate a string sound that is well integrated with other instruments of the orchestra.

**Example 5.18 Romantic Fantasy, Nocturne, bars 1–4.**

![Example 5.18](image)

**Example 5.19 Nocturne, bar 39.**

![Example 5.19](image)

Other examples of the strings’ integration with other instruments can be found in bar 9 where the harp adds brightness and definition as it doubles the first and second violins’ high, repeated *staccato* notes played at *pianissimo*. The closest the strings come to achieving independence occurs in a passage from bar 63 of the Nocturne where

881 Manuscript is lodged with Boosey & Hawkes.
they play a muted, a light, lilting accompaniment to the string soloists, aided by sustained notes on the bassoon.

One could argue that the reduced role of the strings in *Romantic Fantasy* was in order to give precedence to the violin and viola soloists, but the orchestral work which followed in 1937, *Overture to an Italian Comedy*, sustained the trend established in the film music. Once again, strings are allocated a mainly supportive role with one rare exception at bar 44, a section marked *quasi lontano*, where more delicate orchestral colours are invoked. The divided first violins are given a major theme with an accompaniment dominated by the woodwind (example 5.20).

**Example 5.20 Overture to an Italian Comedy, bars 43–6.**

Other infrequent examples of the strings being allocated a theme include the first violins at bar 15 where they play a subsidiary theme and at bars 41–2 where the second violins, viola and cello share a short ornamental run which releases or ‘winds down’ the music (example 5.21).

**Example 5.21 Overture to an Italian Comedy, bars 41–2.**
The woodwind in *Romantic Fantasy*, as in the film music, continue to dominate the solo lines and often work in partnership with the violin and viola soloists. They also continue to dominate passages requiring agility and clarity as is clearly illustrated in bars 138–41 and 289–92 of the Scherzo (examples 5.22, 5.23). This is a trend further supported in Benjamin’s scoring for *Overture to an Italian Comedy* which also uses woodwind for filigree work and virtuosic passages (example 6.17).

**Example 5.22 Romantic Fantasy, Scherzino, bars 138–41.**

![](image)

**Example 5.23 Scherzino, bars 289–92.**

In addition to their solo work, the individual timbre of the woodwind instruments is consistently linked with and used to help identify and develop the character of certain themes and motifs. For example, the sound of the flute (and also the clarinet from bar 11) in the Nocturne becomes linked with the downward flourish of the second part of theme A (example 5.18, bars 3–4). The oboe, which is not as prominent as the flute, identifies, like the trumpet and horn, with the first part of theme A (example 5.18, bars 1–2) in its repeated appearance in the Nocturne and Sonata-Finale movements. Further
examples can be found in *Overture to an Italian Comedy* where the flute's sound forms an association with theme A (example 6.10 No. 1), and the horn consistently gives various renditions of theme B (examples 6.10 No. 2).

The film music tendency to place leading themes and motifs in the middle to upper registers naturally placed emphasis on instruments such as the horn, trumpet, flute, oboe and clarinet. Flutes played a particularly active role in Benjamin's film scores and continued to do so in *Overture to an Italian Comedy*, whether it was used for main themes, motifs or accompanying figures. Example 5.24 illustrates how theme B in *Overture to an Italian Comedy* is passed from the horn to the trumpet throughout bars 140–8.

**Example 5.24 Overture to an Italian Comedy, bars 140-4.**

---

The imaginative and refined use of percussion encountered in *Turn of the Tide* continues in *Romantic Fantasy*, where instruments such as the timpani, are used not just for rhythmic impetus. Take for example the Nocturne where in bars 32 and 53 a timpani roll is combined with *tremolando* on the strings; in bar 39 the timpani joins the lower string *pizzicato*, the clarinet *chalumeau* register and bassoon to give a subtle warmth and depth of colour to an *ostinato*; in bar 95, a five-bar timpani roll marked *pianissimo*, provides an unaccompanied pedal point beneath an oboe solo and horn
accompaniment. More examples of subtle blends of timpani colour can be found in the opening bars of the Scherzino where timpani, playing *pianissimo*, quietly blend with the viola and cello *pizzicato*.

Touches of triangle, tambourine and cymbals are at times very delicately scored for, with one typical use illustrated in bar 176 of the *Romantic Fantasy*’s Scherzino. Here the sound of the cymbal, given the instruction ‘roll with soft sticks’, combines with a triangle and a chord on the piano. Another delightful use of the triangle is in the trio section of the Scherzino where it marks the first beat of every second bar, beautifully balanced with the delicate colours of the alternating woodwind and *pizzicato* cello accompaniment. Tambourine is used sparingly as illustrated in example 5.25 which also shows a subtle blend of string *pizzicato*, woodwind, piano, triangle and tambourine in the opening bars of the *Romantic Fantasy*’s Sonata-Finale movement.

**Example 5.25 Romantic Fantasy, Sonata-Finale, bar 465.**

![Score example](image)

The use of counterpoint and main themes sounding in the middle to upper voices result in fewer opportunities for the lower brass and woodwind instruments to shine as soloists in both orchestral works. This fact is reflected in the greatly reduced number of brass instruments in the *Romantic Fantasy* where the entire brass section is limited to four horns and two trumpets. *Overture to an Italian Comedy* broadens its brass section to encompass trombones and bass trombone but these are used very sparingly, mostly to
support orchestral tutti and cadences. Although the counterpoint is much less complex than in the Violin Concerto's Rhapsody, Benjamin's skill in varying textures and instrumental colour as demonstrated in his film music, is applied to his two post-film scores. In fact the brook scene of *Turn of the Tide* and the trio section of the *Romantic Fantasy* 's Scherzino share some interesting parallels. In both scores, the flute and clarinet alternately play a descending run; the single note on the percussion—triangle in Scherzino and piano in *Turn of the Tide*—consistently marks a particular beat of the bar; a single, sustained note features in the tenor register with a string *pizzicato* accompaniment in the bass or tenor voice. To compare scores, refer to example 5.15 for *Turn of the Tide* and example 5.23 for the Scherzino.

As an example of this use of contrasting texture and colour, the sound world of the Scherzino as a whole is infused with delicate supporting string colour finely integrated with agile woodwind, horn solos and percussion—triangle, cymbals, timpani and glockenspiel (the latter introduced for the Scherzino only). The overall effect results in music of a lighter, more ethereal quality which complements and contrasts with the outer two movements.

It has been suggested that Benjamin may have maintained the changes he was making in orchestration and counterpoint in his film scores in order to produce music that would be of interest to the thriving commercial recording industry. Despite the Depression, a market for serious classical music recordings was well established by the early 1930s with the lure of lucrative contracts and royalties for musicians who could sell well. For example, the recording company Velvet Face had worked with conductors such as Eugene Goossens, Hamilton Harty, Sir Dan Godfrey and Sir Adrian Boult during the years 1920–7.\(^{882}\) Works such as Elgar's *The Dream of Gerontius* were recorded and in 1927, Columbia launched a project to record no less

---

than one hundred works by Beethoven to mark the centenary of his death. Artists such as the singer John McCormack (who featured in the film *Wings of the Morning*), received £50 for recording two titles for Edison Bell in 1904 and was to sign a contract with Columbia at £150 per annum for six years. As noted in chapter two, opportunities for Benjamin to record his music did present themselves in the 1940s. But the commercial recording procedure of the time must not be confused with the method applied to film music whereby the sound was effectively photographed (this has been explained in more detailed in chapter three). With this technical difference in mind, one can only conclude that the adaptations Benjamin made to his orchestration and counterpoint in the instrumental music of his film scores was to his liking or at least produced results that he wished to explore further in his orchestral music for the concert hall.

5.5 Conclusion

Benjamin's two instrumental pre-film scores for *Concertino* and the Violin Concerto reveal certain tendencies in his use of orchestration and counterpoint. Generally speaking, the strings dominate the score and frequently appear as a separate orchestral section with very little integration with other instruments of the orchestra. Their sound prevails like a base canvas on which other instrumental colour could be applied and from which passages of pure woodwind offered relief. The use of counterpoint reached complex levels over a wide voice range with the lower voices well supported by rich orchestral colour. The use of orchestration to aid the identification of important themes and motifs which then clarified and supported the architecture of the music, was not as clearly or as consistently used as it soon would be in film music where simplicity and clarity in scoring was essential if

---

883 *Ibid.*: 68, 111.
the audience was to connect musical leitmotifs with aspects of the film’s drama.

The technical difficulties encountered in early sound picture recordings challenged a dependence on the strings because compromised sound quality resulted in poor definition. A narrow dynamic range, inaudibility of complex counterpoint and poor sound quality of the instruments in their outer ranges were limiting factors in these recordings. Benjamin responded to these restrictions by deposing the strings from their supremacy and developing them in an accompanying and supportive role where he could exploit their naturally softer *sotto voce* recorded sound. Counterpoint was simplified, important themes were placed in the middle to upper voices and the potential of the woodwind and brass were more fully explored. Economic and specific use of individual instrumental colour was employed to vary the tonal palette and aid the identification of leitmotifs.

Both of Benjamin’s post-film orchestral works maintained the well integrated and supportive role of the strings as well as the increased importance of the woodwind and brass. Counterpoint remained simple, and a more masterly use of instrumental colour and textures continued to be used with skill and economy. This suggests that Benjamin’s film music work had been of value and had challenged him to try new methods in his approach to orchestration and counterpoint that he discovered were beneficial. On a more practical level, Benjamin had written a relatively small amount of orchestral music prior to his first film music period, and the film studio provided him with quality orchestral musicians and conductors to both learn from and work with. Scoring for film also encouraged his development of leitmotif to interpret drama in a score usually unhindered by the need to set text, and the lessons learnt in reinforcing the character and identification of a leitmotif through select orchestration in film music later became useful when aiding a concert audience’s identification of themes and motifs in his
orchestral music. This clarification of important musical material for
the listener enabled Benjamin to use this material to build and pace
the dramatic content of his post-film orchestral scores.
Chapter 6

Analysis of form in Benjamin's orchestral compositions
6.1 Introduction

On his own admission, in an interview with Murray Schafer, Benjamin found form the most difficult aspect of musical composition to address. Such a challenge was even greater in larger works and greater still for works with no “text or stage-action to help one out of trouble”. In these later years shortly before his death, Benjamin believed that the mark of a mature composer was a mastery of form that was instinctive and capable of building and sustaining the music’s energy towards designated points of climax.

With these views in mind, this chapter revisits the four instrumental works from the pre-film and post-film periods previously selected for analysis of orchestration and counterpoint in chapter five: Concertino for piano and orchestra (1927), Violin Concerto (1931), Romantic Fantasy (violin and viola solo with orchestra, 1936) and Overture to an Italian Comedy (orchestra, 1937). These scores fall into the category Benjamin regarded as the most challenging to write as they do not involve the musical setting of words and are the larger scale works from this period of his career. For these reasons, they have been selected in preference to other text-focused works such as his songs and opera, and also his chamber and other orchestral music, many of which favoured suite-like forms involving settings of text-orientated melodies, for example, Rhapsody on Negro Folk Tunes (1919), Cotillon (1939) and North American Square Dance (1948).

As discussed in chapter three, lively debate existed amongst musicians and film music theorists on the subject of form, with most parties agreeing that film stimulated and demanded a new approach. This can be seen in the shape of a score such as Storm Clouds Cantata with its climax ultimately focused on a single cymbal crash seconds from the work’s close. Although this particular composition

---

885 Ibid.
involved the setting of text, most film music gave Benjamin the opportunity to develop the dramatic potential of orchestral writing in which the setting of words to music was not central to its creation. Such an opportunity witnessed the emphasis on, and development of, certain compositional skills suitable for film music as defined in the analysis of his early film scores in chapter four. These involved his use of leitmotif, repeated pitches and keys to represent important characters and themes in the drama; segments that were easy to repeat and re-arrange; the ability to control the increase or dissipation of the music's energy when building towards a designated climax. The following analysis will determine whether these devices were then applied to his post-film orchestral works.

6.2 Analysis of form in Concertino and Violin Concerto

Benjamin was a prodigious improviser at the piano in his early years growing up in Brisbane and he believed that it was the strength of this skill that won him a scholarship to the RCM in 1912.886 This particular talent would have given him great facility when composing musical forms such as fantasies and rhapsodies and would have influenced the way he constructed his musical ideas. Hans Keller noted that the form of the fantasy featured in an early work, the string quartet Pastoral Fantasy, and was to remain significant throughout the composer's development. Shortly before Benjamin's death,887 in his interview with Murray Schafer, the composer made the following remark:

Of course, there are no rules to form...It's all accident. It's all subconscious. When I begin a work I never know what form it's going to take. I never say: This will be my second subject, here I'm going to build a bridge, or it's now

---

time for the recapitulation.' I feel these things instinctively when the proper
time arrives.\textsuperscript{888}

Hans Keller believed "Benjamin's early 'wild' musical environment" in
Australia to be partly responsible for the degree of spontaneity and
creativity on a "preconscious level" in his compositions and
acknowledged that,\textsuperscript{889} as part of this instinctive feel for musical order,
Benjamin's "wider structures employ cyclic designs as a means of
unification". As a general observation, he elaborated further saying:

The ease with which he achieves extended unity springs partly from his
exceptional sense of tonal coherence and yet more from his gift for melodic
generation, for the growth of one tune out of another, or of several shapes
out of an original motif.\textsuperscript{890}

Benjamin's claim that musical form was accidental is questionable.
Constant Lambert described the Violin Concerto as "clear, logical,
slick and well turned out" and said of the first movement: "though
written in rhapsodic form, [it] convinces us by the firm lines of its
construction".\textsuperscript{891}

Both the Concertino and the Violin Concerto are composed in
continuous or joined-movement forms. Tables 6.1 and 6.2 indicate
the further breaking down of these forms into sections and parts
determined by a combination of factors primarily influenced by the
use and character of themes and motifs, and by changes in time
signature and tempo. Themes are distinguishable from motifs by
being more substantial in length. Because of their abundance in the
first movement of the Violin Concerto, the identification of themes
and motifs in table 6.2 starts at the beginning of the alphabet for
each movement. For example, the reappearance of motif A from the
Rhapsody in the two movements that follow is identified as Rhapsody

\textsuperscript{889} Hans Keller. 'Arthur Benjamin and the Problem of Popularity', \textit{Tempo}, New Series, No. 15,
(Spring 1950): 7.
\textsuperscript{890} \textit{Ibid.}: 9.
\textsuperscript{891} \textit{Ibid.}: 6, 9.
motif A and not to be confused with motif A in the Intermezzo and Rondo. The tables show at a glance the cyclic use of themes and motifs as described by Hans Keller to achieve a sense of unity, especially with the reappearance, albeit briefly, of the Violin Concerto’s Rhapsody motif A in the subsequent Intermezzo and Rondo movements.

Table 6.1 Basic components that create the form of the Concertino.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section &amp; smaller parts</th>
<th>Theme &amp; motif</th>
<th>Tempo</th>
<th>Dominant time signature</th>
<th>Bar number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 1 (229 bars)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part A</td>
<td>Theme A, motif A</td>
<td>Allegro (crotchet ca 108)</td>
<td>2/4 time</td>
<td>1-100 (100 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theme B, C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part B</td>
<td>Theme D, E motif</td>
<td>Andante (quaver ca 120)</td>
<td>4/4 time</td>
<td>101-33 (33 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part C</td>
<td>Theme C, motif A</td>
<td>Tempo 1 (crotchet ca 108)</td>
<td>2/4 time</td>
<td>134-229 (96 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 2 (200 bars)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part A</td>
<td>Theme F</td>
<td>Presto scherzando (ca 66 per bar)</td>
<td>9/16 time</td>
<td>230-90 (61 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part B</td>
<td>Theme G, motif C</td>
<td>Trio: L’istesso tempo giocoso</td>
<td>9/16 time</td>
<td>291-354 (64 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>motif D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part C</td>
<td>Theme F</td>
<td>repeat of Presto</td>
<td>9/16 time</td>
<td>355-419 (65 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part D</td>
<td></td>
<td>Andante quasi improvisatore (crotchet ca 63)</td>
<td>4/4 time</td>
<td>420-29 (10 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 3 (93 bars)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part A</td>
<td>Motif C (variation)</td>
<td>Come primo, ma poco meno Allegro (crotchet ca 96)</td>
<td>2/4 time</td>
<td>430-54 (25 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>motif B, theme C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part B</td>
<td>Theme H, I motif A</td>
<td>Molto giusto (crotchet ca 88)</td>
<td>2/4 time</td>
<td>455-565 (111 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part C</td>
<td>Motif A</td>
<td>Tempo 1 (crotchet ca 108)</td>
<td>2/4 time</td>
<td>466-612 (47 bars)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* As seen in example 6.1 No. 1, Motif A is extracted from theme A.

Table 6.2 Basic components that create the form of the Violin Concerto’s three movements—Rhapsody, Intermezzo and Rondo.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Movement &amp; section</th>
<th>Themes &amp; motifs used</th>
<th>Tempo</th>
<th>Dominant time signature</th>
<th>Bar number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhapsody</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 1 (56 bars)</td>
<td>Motif A, B Theme A, B, C</td>
<td>Allegro giusto</td>
<td>2/4 time</td>
<td>1-56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 2 (29 bars)</td>
<td>Theme C (variation) Theme D, E, F</td>
<td>Pochettino meno mosso</td>
<td>3/2 time</td>
<td>57-85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 3</td>
<td>Motif A, B (variation)</td>
<td>Tempo 1</td>
<td>2/4 time</td>
<td>86-129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(44 bars)</td>
<td>Motif A, C, D</td>
<td>Allegante ed appassionato</td>
<td>4/4 time</td>
<td>130–69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 4 (40 bars)</td>
<td>Theme B, C, G</td>
<td>Largamente come sopra (first four bars) then Allegro con brio</td>
<td>4/4 time</td>
<td>170–95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 5 (26 bars)</td>
<td>Motif A, C</td>
<td>Come primo then molto allegro at bar 258 and più lento at bar 282</td>
<td>2/4 time then settling in 4/4 time</td>
<td>196–296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 6 (101 bars)</td>
<td>Theme B, G, H</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Intermezzo**

| SECTION 1 (16 bars) | Rhapsody Motif A  | Andante piacevole | 9/8 time | 1–16 |
| SECTION 2 (22 bars) | Motif B  | Theme A, B | | |
| SECTION 3 (19 bars) | Theme C, D | | | |
| SECTION 4 (30 bars) | Rhapsody Motif A (inverted)  | | | |
| | Theme A, B | | | |
| | Theme A, B | | | |

**Rondo**

| SECTION 1 (11 bars) | Theme A | Allegro vivace | 3/4 time | 1–11 |
| SECTION 2 (24 bars) | Theme B (motif A) | | | |
| SECTION 3 (11 bars) | Theme A | | | |
| SECTION 4 (20 bars) | Theme B (motif A) | | | |
| SECTION 5 (37 bars) | Motif A | con sentimento intimo and Poch. meno mosso at bar 86 | | 67–103 |
| | Theme C | | | |
| SECTION 6 (86 bars) | Motif A  | Tempo 1 | | 104–89 |
| | Theme B | | | |
| SECTION 7 (13 bars) | Motif A  | | | |
| | Theme A | | | |
| SECTION 8 (38 bars) | Theme C | Poch. meno mosso at bar 222 | | 203–40 |
| | Theme B | | | |
| SECTION 9 (35 bars) | Motif A  | Tempo 1 and Poco più mosso from bar 268 | | 241–79 |
| | Theme B | | | |
| SECTION 10 (17 bars) | Motif A  | | | |
| | Rhapsody motif A | | | |
| | Theme A | | | |

*SECTION 6 is substantially longer than others in the Rhapsody but keeps its coherence by remaining focused on the tempo primo while revisiting so many pre-existing themes and motifs.*

Because the themes and motifs are such an important component in shaping the form of these works, some space needs to
be devoted to observing their nature, even though the list is long. Example 6.1 registers the themes and motifs as they are introduced in SECTION 1, part A of the Concertino:

**Example 6.1 Themes and motifs in Concertino, SECTION 1, part A.**

No. 1 Theme A and the extraction of motif A, bars 5–13.

No. 2 Theme B, bars 21–5.

No. 3 Theme C, bars 38–43.

SECTION 1, part B introduces motif B and two new themes—D and E (example 6.2).

**Example 6.2 Themes and motifs in Concertino, SECTION 1, part B.**

No. 1 Motif B, bar 103.

No. 2 Theme D, bars 107–10.

No. 3 Theme E, bars 110–5.

SECTION 2 (Scherzo and Trio) of the Concertino similarly breaks down into four smaller parts of which theme F shapes parts A and C. Part B is defined by the introduction of theme G and motifs C and D (see example 6.3).
Example 6.3 Themes and motifs in Concertino, SECTION 2 (scherzo & trio)

No. 1 Theme F, part A, bars 230-2.

[Presto scherzando (J, ca 66)]

No. 2 Theme G and extraction of motif C, part B, bars 291-300.

L'istesso tempo Giocoso (J, ca 66)

No. 3 Motif D, part B, bars 300-1.

L'istesso tempo Giocoso (J, ca 66)

SECTION 3 further divides into three parts. Part A sees the return of existing material such as motif B and theme C as well as a variation on motif C. Part B is distinguished by the introduction of a new theme H and I together with motif A (example 6.3). Motif A then dominates the final forty-seven bars of Part C.

In general, the motifs and themes created for sections one and two share enough similarities in modal colour (particularly the Aeolian and pentatonic) to make them highly compatible with one another and capable of blending with the numerous variations based on the same pentatonic colouring. Themes prevail over motifs with the length of theme I (example 6.4 No. 2) being exceptionally long and, like some of the other themes, capable of shifting in tonality.

Example 6.4 Themes in Concertino, SECTION 3, part B.

No. 1 Theme H, bars 457-60.

No. 2 Theme I, bars 488-506.
Material introduced in the middle section shares a similar modal language but is rhythmically more easily distinguished by the change from 2/4 and 4/4 times to 9/16 and 3/8. And the rhythmic content of motif D and theme H is sufficiently different to provide fresh new material in SECTIONS 1 and 2.

The abundance of thematic material in the Violin Concerto’s Rhapsody provides a challenge for the musical memory. Because of the numerous variations, only the most important themes and motifs that affect the structure of the Rhapsody are acknowledged in this analysis; these are represented by eight themes and four motifs and are listed in example 6.5 in the order that they appear.

Example 6.5 Themes and motifs in Violin Concerto, Rhapsody.

No. 1 Rhapsody motif A, SECTION 1, bars 1–2.

No. 2 Theme A, SECTION 1, bars 22–9.

No. 3 Theme B, SECTION 1, bars 29–33.

No. 4 Theme C, SECTION 1, bars 33–5.

No. 5 Motif B, SECTION 1, bar 43.

No. 6 Variation on theme C, SECTION 2, bar 57.
No. 7 Theme D, SECTION 2, bars 63-6.

Ancora Meno Mosso (ma non lento)

No. 8 Theme E, SECTION 2, bars 70-1.

[Ancora Meno Mosso (ma non lento)]

No. 9 Theme F, SECTION 2, bars 74-5.

[Ancora Meno Mosso (ma non lento)]

pp quasi senza espressione

No. 10 Motif C, SECTION 4, bars 130-1.

Largamente ed Appassionato

No. 11 Theme G, SECTION 4, bars 137-8.

[Largamente ed Appassionato]

No. 12 Motif D, SECTION 4, bar 156.

Largamente ed Appassionato

Am succino

No. 13 Theme H, SECTION 5, bars 178-9.

[Allegro con Brio]

The Intermezzo's list of themes and motifs is more economical, as indicated in example 6.6.

Example 6.6 Themes and motifs in Violin Concerto, Intermezzo.

No. 1 Theme A, SECTION 1, bars 1-2.

Andante Piacevole

bassoon

pp
No. 2 Theme B comprised of Rhapsody motif A and motif B, SECTION 1, bars 3–5.

[Andante Piacevole]
violin solo

p con sord.  
Rhapsody motif A

motif B

No. 3 Theme C, SECTION 2, bars 17–20.

[Andante Piacevole]
strings

pp con sord.

No. 4 Theme D, SECTION 2, bars 26–34.

[Andante Piacevole]
violin solo

mf espressivo

No. 5 Rhapsody motif A (inversion), SECTION 3, bar 39.

[Andante Piacevole]
violin solo

The final movement is more economical still with the rondo form, from which it takes its title, largely shaped by repetitions of the extended passage first introduced in bars 1–11 and forthwith identified as theme A. Example 6.7 illustrates the main themes and motifs that define this movement.

Example 6.7 Themes and motifs in Violin Concerto, Rondo.
No. 1 Theme A, SECTION 1, bars 1–11.

Allegro vivace (ma non troppo presto)
No. 2 Theme B and motif A, SECTION 2, bars 14–6.

No. 3 Theme C, SECTION 3, bars 67–74.

The number of themes again outweighs the number of motifs, as well as the favouring of modes with pentatonic leanings, especially in the Rhapsody. Example 6.8 nos. 1–5 illustrates the practice of juxtaposing, layering, transposing and varying the thematic material in both pre-film scores.

Example 6.8 Layering and juxtaposition of themes and motifs in the Concertino and Violin Concerto.

No. 1 Motif A over theme B, Concertino, bars 21–4.

Chapter five has already discussed the levels of complex counterpoint arising from this treatment of thematic material with accompaniments that can range from homophonic textures to the addition of countermelodies and decorative runs. Thematic material, in combination with these accompaniments, build up complex harmonies resulting from the chromatic nature of the music and use of polytonality. As a result, the sense of a single tonality is difficult to determine and could, at times, be described as suspended altogether.
This aspect is partly reflected in Benjamin's decision not to use key signatures in the Concertino or the Rhapsody and Intermezzo of the Violin Concerto. In contrast with his film scores and two post-film orchestral works, this complexity does not aid easy identification of themes and motifs and it could not be said that an audience would be capable of remembering and distinguishing the thematic material on first hearing.

An example of unclear or suspended tonality in the Concertino can be found in bars 39–47 (example 5.3) where theme C begins and settles in an Aeolian mode by its close; this links with the layering of theme B and motif A that begin in a Dorian mode, with theme B ending in a key sounding like B flat major in orientation (but only briefly). The combined effect of this material sounding in conjunction with the chromatically inclined orchestral accompaniment, makes it difficult to define an overall clear key or mode. Another example of tonal complexity is heard in the polytonal passage played by the woodwind in the Violin Concerto's Rhapsody (example 5.11). In this sea of shifting tonality, the ear finds aural resting points in a transitory key or mode, a pedal point, a chord or single note that may act, though not always, as a tonic towards which the chromatic colourings and polytonality gravitate. Tables 6.3 and 6.4 respectively list only bars or passages where it is possible to identify such elements in the Concertino and Violin Concerto alongside sections and thematic material already identified in tables 6.1 and 6.2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section &amp; part</th>
<th>Tonality or pedal point</th>
<th>Thematic material</th>
<th>Bar</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part A: Allegro</td>
<td>note A</td>
<td>Theme A, Theme A &amp; B</td>
<td>5–26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note G</td>
<td>Motif A</td>
<td>29–36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note A</td>
<td>Motif A</td>
<td>54–6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note G</td>
<td>Motif A</td>
<td>61–3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note/Codition</td>
<td>Motif</td>
<td>Time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note C (pedal point)</td>
<td>Motif A, motif A &amp; theme B, motif A &amp; theme B</td>
<td>72–100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part B: <em>Andante</em></td>
<td>note C &amp; C pedal point</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Motif B</td>
<td>101–6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F minor over C pedal point</td>
<td>Motif B &amp; motif A</td>
<td>121–4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A flat minor over C pedal point</td>
<td>Motif B</td>
<td>125–8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E flat major</td>
<td>start of theme C</td>
<td>129</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part C: Tempo I</td>
<td>note G</td>
<td>134–6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note F</td>
<td>140–2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note B flat</td>
<td>151–8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B flat minor over G flat pedal point</td>
<td>Motif A</td>
<td>172–9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E flat pedal point</td>
<td>Motif A</td>
<td>180–8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F pedal point</td>
<td>Theme C</td>
<td>196–201</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note B flat &amp; B flat pedal point</td>
<td>Motif A</td>
<td>202–28</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SECTION 2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part A: Scherzo</td>
<td>note E flat (brief)</td>
<td>230–2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theme F</td>
<td>237–8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theme F</td>
<td>260–2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theme F</td>
<td>267–8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>—</td>
<td>284–90</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part B: Trio</td>
<td>Dorian on F sharp</td>
<td>291–9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theme G (incorporating motif C)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note G sharp</td>
<td>Motif D</td>
<td>300–1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dorian on F sharp</td>
<td>Theme G</td>
<td>306–14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note of B flat</td>
<td>Motif D</td>
<td>316–7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note of F</td>
<td>Motif D</td>
<td>340–6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note of F</td>
<td>reference to Theme F</td>
<td>354–7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part C: Scherzo</td>
<td>repeat part A ending on note on B flat</td>
<td>359–419</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part D: <em>Andante quasi Improvisatore</em></td>
<td>note of B flat (reference to aeolian)</td>
<td>420–3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note E</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>424–8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### SECTION 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part A: <em>Come Primo</em></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>note A (suggestion of A major)</td>
<td>Motif D, motif C</td>
<td>430–3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note B</td>
<td>Motif D</td>
<td>437–9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E flat pedal point</td>
<td>Theme C</td>
<td>443–8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D pedal point</td>
<td>Theme C</td>
<td>449–52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G pedal point</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>453–4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part B: <em>Molto giusto</em></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>note C (C major &amp; Mixolydian references)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>455–6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot; &quot;</td>
<td>Theme H</td>
<td>457–60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot; &quot;</td>
<td>Theme H</td>
<td>461–8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note E</td>
<td>Theme H</td>
<td>469–72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note C</td>
<td>Theme H</td>
<td>477–86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note E</td>
<td>Theme I</td>
<td>488–506</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E pedal point</td>
<td>Theme I</td>
<td>507–22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E pedal point</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>525–32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E pedal point</td>
<td>Motif D</td>
<td>533–5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note B flat</td>
<td>Motif D</td>
<td>539–42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D major</td>
<td>Motif D</td>
<td>558–63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part C: Tempo I</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>note A (suggestion of A major)</td>
<td>Theme A</td>
<td>566–73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note A</td>
<td>Theme A</td>
<td>574–85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>note A</td>
<td>Motif A (repeated)</td>
<td>586–612</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Table 6.4 Tonality and aural resting points in Violin Concerto and coinciding thematic material.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section &amp; part</th>
<th>Tonality or pedal point</th>
<th>Thematic material</th>
<th>Bar</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rhapsody</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SECTION 1: Allegro giusto</strong></td>
<td>note C (brief)</td>
<td>Motif A</td>
<td>1–9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E flat pedal point</td>
<td>Motif A, Theme A</td>
<td>10–8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F pedal point</td>
<td>Motif A, Theme A</td>
<td>20–8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 2: <em>Pochettino meno mosso</em></td>
<td>note C (brief)</td>
<td>Beginning of theme C &amp; D</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F sharp pedal point</td>
<td>Theme C, theme C, theme C</td>
<td>78–85</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 3: Tempo I</td>
<td>F sharp pedal point</td>
<td>Motif B, motif B</td>
<td>86–110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note E</td>
<td>Motif B, motif B</td>
<td>111–20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note E</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>118–9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 4: <em>Largamente ed appassionato</em></td>
<td>note E &amp; E pedal point</td>
<td>Motif A &amp; C &amp; D</td>
<td>130–5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G pedal point</td>
<td>Motif D</td>
<td>156–9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 5: <em>Largamente</em> leading to</td>
<td>E pedal point</td>
<td>Motif A, motif A, motif A, motif A</td>
<td>170–3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Allegro con brio</em></td>
<td>note E</td>
<td>Motif A</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 6: <em>Come Primo</em></td>
<td>note A (brief)</td>
<td>Motif A</td>
<td>196–8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F sharp pedal point</td>
<td>Theme A (variation), motif A, motif A, Theme A</td>
<td>206–7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note E flat</td>
<td>Theme B, motif A, motif B, motif B</td>
<td>243–57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G pedal point</td>
<td>Motif A, Theme C</td>
<td>282–7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G pedal point moving to a held C</td>
<td>Motif C</td>
<td>289–94</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>minor chord</td>
<td>G minor chord</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>295–6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Intermezzo**

<p>| SECTION 1: <em>Andante piacevole</em>      | note D         | Theme A, Theme A &amp; B (incorporating Rhapsody motif A) | 1–5 |
|                                      | E pedal point  | Rhapsody motif A, Theme B, motif B | 12–5 |
| SECTION 2                            | B minor chord  | Theme C       | 16–8 |
|                                      | B pedal point  | Theme C cont. | 19–20 |
|                                      | B minor chord  | Theme C       | 21–3 |
|                                      | B pedal point  | Theme C cont. | 24–5 |
|                                      | B minor chord  | Theme C       | 34–6 |
|                                      | B pedal point  | Theme C cont. | 37–8 |
| SECTION 3                            | D flat pedal point | reference to motif B | 43–5 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Note(s)</th>
<th>Details</th>
<th>Measures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 4</td>
<td>note C (brief)</td>
<td>Theme D (start of)</td>
<td>58-9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note D</td>
<td>Theme D (start of)</td>
<td>62-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G pedal point</td>
<td>Theme A (start of) &amp; Rhapsody motif A, Theme A (start of) &amp; motif B, motif B</td>
<td>66-9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D pedal point</td>
<td>Theme C</td>
<td>71-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D pedal point</td>
<td>Theme A &amp; B, motif B</td>
<td>73-80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A pedal point</td>
<td>Rhapsody motif A, Rhapsody motif A, Theme A</td>
<td>81-5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A major chord</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>86-7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Rondo**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Note(s)</th>
<th>Details</th>
<th>Measures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 1: Allegro Vivace</td>
<td>note A</td>
<td>Theme A</td>
<td>1-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 2</td>
<td>note A</td>
<td>Theme B, theme B</td>
<td>12-9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note C sharp</td>
<td>Theme B, theme B</td>
<td>32-5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 3</td>
<td>note B</td>
<td>Theme A</td>
<td>36-48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 4</td>
<td>note B</td>
<td>Theme B</td>
<td>49-54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E pedal point</td>
<td>Motif A, motif A</td>
<td>63-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 5: con sentimento intimo</td>
<td>E major &amp; E pedal point</td>
<td>Theme C</td>
<td>67-85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 6: Tempo primo</td>
<td>note G sharp</td>
<td>Theme B</td>
<td>105-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note C</td>
<td>Theme B, theme B</td>
<td>123-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note F</td>
<td>Theme B, theme B</td>
<td>187-90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 7: [Tempo primo]</td>
<td>note E flat &amp; E flat pedal point</td>
<td>Theme A, motif A, A</td>
<td>191-203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 8: [Tempo primo]</td>
<td>note E flat &amp; E flat pedal point</td>
<td>Theme C, theme C</td>
<td>204-22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 9: Tempo primo</td>
<td>note G &amp; G pedal point</td>
<td>Theme B, theme B</td>
<td>242-72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note C &amp; C pedal point</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>278-80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 10: [Tempo primo]</td>
<td>note C &amp; C pedal point</td>
<td>Theme A (part of)</td>
<td>281-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G pedal point</td>
<td>Rhapsody motif A</td>
<td>287-90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>note C</td>
<td>Motif A</td>
<td>291-3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Generally speaking, the Concertino and Violin Concerto display a sense of tonal restlessness which Benjamin could have regarded as stimulating for his listeners. Themes and motifs do not consistently identify with any particular tonality or pitch but the use of repetition contributes to the structure of the music such as the Concertino's exact repetition of theme F in parts A and C of the Scherzo, even though any sense of tonality is still fleeting. With regard to any tonal sense, table 6.3 indicates a focus on the note of A with a shift to B flat in the middle of the work. A similar observation can be made of the linked movements of the Violin Concerto that, generally speaking, centre on the note of C for the first movement, D for the middle movement and a return to C by the close of the final movement. In analysing the use of tonality in these early orchestral works, one could not completely agree with Hans Keller's earlier statement in which he remarks on Benjamin's "exceptional sense of tonal coherence" but then again his comment, made in 1950, did not specify which works he was referring to.

In both the Concertino and Violin Concerto, definite single points of climax or drama are either non-existent, such as in the siciliana-like lilting Intermezzo, or they emerge out of the general web of sound, as seen in other movements. Neither orchestral work could be described as having a form displaying 'building-power' but the energy does intensify in passages where the counterpoint reaches greater complexities which could be regarded as a form of development. There is also the tendency in both works to simplify counterpoint and to allow the dissipation or easing of musical energy as a way of preparing for the beginning of a new section or before new thematic material is introduced. For example, in the Concertino, Benjamin noticeably simplifies or thins the counterpoint in bars 85–101 after the more energetic Allegro when preparing for the slower tempo of the Andante poco lento section. A similar process is repeated through bars 210–28 in preparation for the leggiero start of the Presto scherzando. As if conscious of the absence of any real climax or
drama, Benjamin tries to build tension or energy in the final forty-seven bars of the Concertino, even though tone-wise, the aural resting point has already been established on the home note of A. This leaves the composer working with the simple rhythmic repetition of motif A together with various crescendi and an accelerando towards the end to achieve some sense of final climax.

6.3 Analysis of form in *Overture to an Italian Comedy* and *Romantic Fantasy*

The following analysis in section 6.3 establishes whether Benjamin’s use of form in the two film scores composed in 1935 was then applied to the orchestral works—*Romantic Fantasy* and *Overture to an Italian Comedy*. The *Romantic Fantasy* comprises three continuous movements—Nocturne, Scherzino and Sonata-Finale lasting approximately twenty-three minutes. To avoid confusion to the reader, identification of themes, motifs and bar numbers is continuous. Table 6.5 discerns the basic components that define the sections and parts of the entire work.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Movement, section &amp; parts</th>
<th>Theme &amp; motif</th>
<th>Tempo</th>
<th>Dominant time signature</th>
<th>Bar number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nocturne</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 1</td>
<td>Motif A, B, C</td>
<td>Lento</td>
<td>4/4 time</td>
<td>1–21 (21 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(crotchet=63)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 2</td>
<td>Motif A, C, D, E</td>
<td>Più mosso e rubato</td>
<td>* *</td>
<td>22–36 (15 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(crotchet=80)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 3</td>
<td>Ostinato A, Motif A, B, C, E, F, G</td>
<td>Allegro ma non troppo</td>
<td>* *</td>
<td>37–62 (26 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theme A</td>
<td>(crotchet=112)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 4</td>
<td>Ostinato B, Motif A, B, F, G</td>
<td>Molto lento e rubato (dotted crotchet=46)</td>
<td>12/8 time</td>
<td>63–88 (26 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theme B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 5</td>
<td>Motif A, B, C–E, H</td>
<td>Come primo</td>
<td>4/4 time</td>
<td>89–111 (23 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(crotchet=63)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Scherzino</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theme C</td>
<td>(crotchet=132)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part B</td>
<td>Motif C, H</td>
<td>* *</td>
<td>* *</td>
<td>200–64 (65 bars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theme C</td>
<td>* *</td>
<td>* *</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Overture to an Italian Comedy is approximately six and a half minutes in length and is subjected to similar analysis in Table 6.6.
As concluded in the analysis of the earlier orchestral compositions, the sections and parts are likewise determined by factors such as thematic material, tonal organisation, time signature and tempo. But as can be seen in the table for Overture to an Italian Comedy, its form is less reliant on changing time signatures and tempo.

Themes and motifs remain an important element in the construction of these scores, so, as before, a list is provided of these components on which the Romantic Fantasy is based (example 6.9).

Example 6.9 Themes and motifs in Romantic Fantasy's Nocturne, Scherzino and Sonata-Finale.

No. 1 Motif A, Nocturne, SECTION 1, bars 1–3.

No. 2 Motif B, Nocturne, SECTION 1, bars 3–5.

No. 3 Motif C, Nocturne, SECTION 1, 5–6.
No. 4 Motif D, Nocturne, SECTION 2, bar 24.

[Piu mosso e rubato (J=80)]
violin solo

No. 5 Motif E, Nocturne, SECTION 2, bar 32.

[Piu mosso e rubato J=80]
violin solo

No. 6 Ostinato A, Nocturne, SECTION 3, bar 37.

Allegro ma non troppo (J=112)
brass

No. 7 Theme A and motif F, Nocturne, SECTION 3, bars 41-2.

[Allegro ma non troppo (J=112)]
viola solo

No. 8 Motif G, Nocturne, SECTION 3, bar 43.

[Allegro ma non troppo (J=112)]
violin solo

No. 9 Ostinato B, Nocturne, SECTION 4, bar 63.

Orch.

No. 10 Theme B, Nocturne, SECTION 4, bar 72-3.

[Molto lento e rubato (J=46)]
violin solo

No. 11 Motif H, Nocturne, SECTION 5, bars 98.

[Come primo]
violin solo
No. 12 Theme C (part one and two), Scherzino, SECTION 1, bars 128-44.

Presto leggiero e fantastico (J-132)

violin solo

No. 13 Motif I with accompaniment based on motif H, Scherzino, SECTION 2, part one, bars 289-90.

[Meno presto]

Orch.

No. 14 Theme D and its two parts, Scherzino, SECTION 2, part one, bars 291-307.

[Meno presto] part 1

violin solo

No. 15 Theme E, Sonata-Finale, SECTION 2, bars 495-8.

[L'istesso tempo, ma senza rigore]

Example 6.10 nos. 1-9 register the main themes and motifs appearing in Overture to an Italian Comedy.

Example 6.10 Themes and motifs in Overture to an Italian Comedy.

No. 1 Theme A and motif E, SECTION 1, bars 1-6.

No. 2 Theme B, SECTION 1, bars 6-9.
On reading through this material, one notes the greater number of motifs than themes, the presence of ostinati, the prevalence of a single tonality from start to finish, and the greater diversity of melody.
and rhythm that contrasts and distinguishes each theme and motif. As will soon be discussed, this material is clearly presented and easily identified on first hearing, with accompanying textures and harmonisations that preserve and enhance the individual qualities, or, if you like, personality of each theme and motif. This is particularly apparent in *Romantic Fantasy* where the prevailing motif A could well have been a lover’s leitmotif in a film score and other material could equally represent a variety of subjects and personae in a drama.

Benjamin’s use of this thematic material shares some common ground with its application in the pre-film compositions. Material is once again juxtaposed and layered as shown in example 6.11 Nos. 1–4.

**Example 6.11 Layering and juxtaposition of themes and motifs in *Romantic Fantasy* and *Overture to an Italian Comedy.***

**No. 1 Layering of motifs A, E and C, *Romantic Fantasy*, bars 33–4.**

**No. 2 First part of theme C with motif C, *Romantic Fantasy*, bars 166–7.**
Existing motifs are subject to being combined and extended. For example, in bar 93 of the Nocturne, motifs C and E combine to create a new motif memorable enough for subsequent repeated use. Another example sees motif G, first heard in bar 43 with ostinato A (example 6.12), later extended and transformed into a theme of a more expressive and romantic character at bar 64 to the accompaniment of ostinato B (example 6.13).


In the final movement of the *Romantic Fantasy*, ostinato A and theme A are extended as shown in examples 6.14, 6.15.

These examples also show the simplification, both texturally and harmonically, of the accompaniments, making it easier for the listener to identify each theme and motif. Simplified settings of
leitmotif were a common practice in all of Benjamin's film scores and was an approach supported by Sabaneev in 1935. Sabaneev warned film composers against "the piling-up of notes within a restricted space, particularly in the lower registers" and advised them not to use complex harmonies by informing them they would sound "blurred in reproduction" and "out of tune". Ostinati, as an accompaniment, were another common feature of Benjamin's film scores, and their presence in the Romantic Fantasy, with some enduring for as long as twenty bars, provide a tonal anchor with their rhythmic repetition and uncomplicated harmonies. The use of drones and pedal points contribute to tonal stability and in the score for Overture to an Italian Comedy, the twenty-two bar dominant pedal point on D from bar 153 functions in a similar manner to the build-

---

up of energy over the extended dominant pedal point in *Storm Clouds Cantata*. Another brief two-bar example of a pedal point on E in bars 17–8 from the *Overture* is played by the first violins in example 6.16.

**Example 6.16** Decorated pedal on E, *Overture to an Italian Comedy, SECTION 1, bars 17–8.*

Wierzbicki noted the simple and musically logical progression of tonal centres upon which *Storm Clouds Cantata* was based, and both the *Romantic Fantasy* and *Overture to an Italian Comedy* likewise play out their musical action against a tonally secure base. In the *Romantic Fantasy* they adhere to the following clear plan:

- **Nocturne**: E major—G minor—C major—G minor—E major.
- **Scherzino**: C major—A major/minor—C major.
- **Sonata-Finale**: E minor—B major—E major—E minor—C major—E major—E minor.

Tables 6.7 and 6.8 list the main tonalities and subsidiary tonalities in relation to themes or motifs, and the repetition of ostinati, themes, motifs and sections of music at original pitch, to give the reader an idea of the unity and symmetry that shapes these musical forms.

**Table 6.7** Tonality in *Romantic Fantasy*.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section &amp; part</th>
<th>Tonality or pedal point</th>
<th>Thematic material</th>
<th>Bar</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nocturne</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 1: <em>Lento</em></td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>Motif A</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Motif B</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Lento</em> (crotchet=63)</td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>Motif A (original pitch)</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Motif B (original pitch)</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 2: <em>Più mosso e rubato</em> (crotchet=80)</td>
<td>transition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 3: <em>Allegro ma non troppo</em> (crotchet=112)</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>Ostinato A introduced. Motif C &amp; E.</td>
<td>37–52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Theme A

- Motif G introduced.
- Motif A, B.

- Pedal point on G

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>C major</th>
<th>Motif B</th>
<th>53–8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### SECTION 4: Molto lento e rubato

- C major
- Ostinato B introduced.
- Motif G extended

- Motif A, B, B

### SECTION 5: Come primo

- E major
- Motif A (repeated twice at original pitch).
- Combined Motif C-E introduced.
- Motif H introduced.

### Scherzino

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION 1: Presto leggero e fantastico</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme C introduced.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part A</th>
<th>C major</th>
<th>repeat of above bars 128–46 at same pitch</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C major</td>
<td>repeat of above bars 112–46 at same pitch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part C</td>
<td>C major</td>
<td>Theme C (part of). Motif H at same pitch as at the beginning of Scherzino. Motif I introduced.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C major</td>
<td>Theme C (part of). Motif H at same pitch as at the beginning of Scherzino. Motif I introduced.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION 2: Trio: Meno presto</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A major/minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motif I. Theme D introduced.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>289–306</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A major/minor</th>
<th>repeat of above bars 289–99 at same pitch</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A major/minor</td>
<td>repeat of above bars 289–306 at same pitch</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION 3: Tempo del Scherzino</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C major</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Sonata-Finale

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION 1: Allegro, tempo giusto</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme A, theme A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| 465–70 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION 2:</th>
<th>B major</th>
<th>Motif G extended into ostinato. Theme E introduced.</th>
<th>493–8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>L'istesso tempo, ma senza rigore</td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>Motif G, motif G</td>
<td>513–6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>Motif G repeated. Motif A (four times at original pitch).</td>
<td>521–31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>pedal point on B</td>
<td>Motif B twice (starting at original pitch)</td>
<td>542–9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 3: Allegro (crotchet=126)</td>
<td>pedal point on B</td>
<td>Motif G &amp; Theme E. Ostinato A &amp; Motif F.</td>
<td>565–73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 4: Allegro, tempo giusto</td>
<td>E minor</td>
<td>Ostinato A &amp; theme A,</td>
<td>574–8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>Motif G &amp; theme E</td>
<td>593–7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 5</td>
<td>C major</td>
<td>Theme A (part 2) Motif D, motif A</td>
<td>619–38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part A: Come sopra</td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>Motif A (original pitch) Motif B (original pitch)</td>
<td>639–44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part B: Come il Notturno</td>
<td>E minor</td>
<td>Motif H repeated at the same pitch as bars 116–119 of Scherzino</td>
<td>653–6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part C: Come il Scherzino</td>
<td>E minor</td>
<td>Motif H repeated at the same pitch as bars 116–119 of Scherzino</td>
<td>661–4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The same tonal clarity is maintained in *Overture to an Italian Comedy* that corresponds to the following layout:

G major—E major—C major—G major.

Table 6.6 and 6.8 also refer to the presence of a quotation from Benjamin’s opera *Prima Donna*. The quotation is almost identical with the passage from the opera as can be seen by comparing examples 6.17 and 6.18. The use of this quote from the opera as well as the title of the work, confirms that the music for *Overture to an Italian Comedy* has operatic or dramatic implications and this is further supported by Benjamin’s inclusion of a subtitle on the orchestral score of ‘Ah, Perdona se ti inganno’ which may be translated as
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section &amp; part</th>
<th>Tonality or pedal point</th>
<th>Thematic material</th>
<th>Bar</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>SECTION 1:</strong> <em>Allegro, sempre vivo e gaio</em></td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>Theme A introduced. Theme B introduced.</td>
<td>1–8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>pedal point on E</td>
<td>Motif A, motif B introduced</td>
<td>15–8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>pedal point on E</td>
<td>Motif A, motif B repeated at original pitch as in bars 15–18</td>
<td>19–22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theme A (original pitch)</td>
<td></td>
<td>23–7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>pedal on G</td>
<td>Theme D introduced</td>
<td>28–32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SECTION 2:</strong></td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>Theme C introduced.</td>
<td>43–7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>Theme C (original pitch) interrupted by motif E</td>
<td>48–58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>Theme C at different pitch &amp; motif E</td>
<td>59–64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>pedal point on A</td>
<td>Theme D</td>
<td>73–7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>pedal point on C</td>
<td>Theme D Theme A</td>
<td>78–81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SECTION 3:</strong> <em>Poch. meno mosso</em></td>
<td>C major</td>
<td>Motif E inverted. Motif B in variation. (reference to <em>Prima Donna</em> from a passage that is quoted below in bars 118–27)</td>
<td>87–112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C major</td>
<td>Theme E introduced</td>
<td>113–8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C major</td>
<td>quote from <em>Prima Donna</em> (see examples 6.78 and 6.79)</td>
<td>118–27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SECTION 4:</strong> <em>Tempo primo</em></td>
<td>pedal point on E</td>
<td>Motif A, motif B repeated at original pitch as in bars 15–18</td>
<td>128–31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>pedal point on E</td>
<td>Motif A, motif B repeated at original pitch as in bars 15–18</td>
<td>132–5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theme A (first part is at original pitch &amp; to same accompaniment as in bars 23–25)</td>
<td></td>
<td>136–41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Motif F introduced</td>
<td></td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motif F (original pitch)</td>
<td>147</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar of silence</td>
<td>152</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pedal point on D Theme B</td>
<td>153-4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pedal point on D Theme B &amp; theme F (part of)</td>
<td>156-7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pedal point on D Theme B</td>
<td>158-9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pedal point on D Theme B &amp; theme F (part of)</td>
<td>160-1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pedal point on D Theme B</td>
<td>162-3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pedal point on D Theme B</td>
<td>164-5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pedal point on D Theme B extract repeated twice</td>
<td>166-7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pedal point on D part of Theme A</td>
<td>168-71</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pedal point on D variation on motif B</td>
<td>172-5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pedal point on D Theme C</td>
<td>176-82</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 5: Unpochettino meno mosso</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G major (I-V bass) Theme C interrupted by motif E</td>
<td>185-94</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motif F</td>
<td>195</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motif F</td>
<td>200</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G major Theme A (original pitch)</td>
<td>205-10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>part of the Prima Donna quote from section 3 but at a different pitch</td>
<td>210-6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

'Forgive me if I deceive you'. This subtitle draws parallels with Prima Donna's storyline in which Florindo and Alcino deceive the rich Count (Florindo's uncle) to the good of all in the end, thus justifying the use of a musical quotation from the operatic work.

Benjamin's use of counterpoint and the harmonisation of his thematic material is simple and clear, and equally clearly defined are the sections that build the work's overall form and the points of climax. Richard Stoker, a young composer who visited Benjamin with his scores in 1957, had his attention drawn to the fact that he fell away from a musical climax. "Have as many as you like" said
Example 6.17 Overture to an Italian Comedy, SECTION 3, bars 118–26.
Benjamin "but you must reach each one in the end, then the listeners are not left unsatisfied".893 The score for the Overture, like the Violin Concerto’s Intermezzo, does not make use of changing time signatures and tempi in its structure but, unlike the Intermezzo, the Overture leaves the listener in no doubt as to where the points of climax lie. Benjamin carefully prepares each one: by building up chromatic tension; by gradually increasing the dynamics to levels of forte to triple forte; by increasing tension through the upward transposition of thematic material (that is, the eight transpositions of theme B over the dominant pedal point in bars 153–67); and by accelerandi. These techniques parallel those used in the scores for Storm Clouds Cantata and the storm scene in Turn of the Tide. The major points of climax in these film scores culminate in an abrupt silence (bar 152), peak at dynamics between forte and triple forte, or announce the arrival of a theme or new key. Even the Overture’s main climax at bar 176 is preceded by a build-up of energy over an extended pedal point on the dominant, another feature in common with Storm Clouds Cantata.

Benjamin’s awareness of musical stability, tension and release is more developed than in his pre-film orchestral works, with his scores displaying his ability to either gather or dissipate tension

through more finely paced and economical use of dynamics, thematic material, orchestral texture, contrast, dissonance and resolution. These were skills Benjamin practised as a film composer where he learnt the art of being able to direct the flow of the music's energy towards dramatic climaxes or from moments of sunny calm into whirlwinds of change.

6.4 Conclusion

Benjamin's pre-film and post-film scores share some common ground in their use of form. These include continuous or linked movements and a preference for forms such as the fantasy and rhapsody alongside stricter forms such as the scherzo and trio. Themes and motifs are juxtaposed and overlapped to create continuity of sound, and changes in time signature and tempo play a part in helping to define sections within a work.

For the practical reasons already discussed, film music demanded the simplification of counterpoint and harmony. The obscuring of tonality, harmonies rich with chromaticism and the use of polytonality together with the thick textures and complex counterpoint that persist in the pre-film works, were abandoned in favour of a clear and logical tonal base upon which the musical action could take place. Leitmotifs of contrasting character were used in the film scores to allow aspects of the drama to be easily identified. Similarly contrasting themes and motifs were used in his post-film orchestral works where they are of sufficient character to 'speak for themselves' without the addition of highly decorative and chromatically complex countermelodies which were so prevalent in the earlier orchestral scores. The use of tonality in both his film and post-film music is harnessed to help clarify the identification of leitmotif or thematic material, the start of musical sections and points of climax.

The clarity with which these elements are presented creates, if you like, a more visually memorable picture of the music's structure
as a whole. This concept of a visual memory of musical form was not completely foreign to Benjamin who said: "large works are always more difficult. They require more mental planning; one's vision must be broader and one's memory must be stronger."\textsuperscript{894} The visual elements of a film naturally acted as a considerable stimulus on a composer and the music often needed to be extremely versatile in its ability to change mood and character. Once again, the clarity and simplicity of leitmotif, textures and use of key served to identify and clarify such contrasts whether it is a storm scene juxtaposed with a lover's meeting or a scene where the villain causes conflict before a humorous escapade. Benjamin's \textit{Romantic Fantasy}, with only a little imagination on the listener's behalf, introduces different characters in a musical drama. Motif A, first played at the start of the Nocturne, is typical in sentiment to what he would have penned for a lover's leitmotif in a film score; and the entrance of ostinato A with theme A at the start of the second section marks the arrival of a different character or mood that is coarser and more jocular in feel than the lover's theme. In going further afield than the two post-film orchestral compositions included in this study, there can be no better example of the dramatic use of contrasting musical elements than those provided in the Symphony's second movement. The first section to be introduced is characterized by an ethereal, weightless theme which is followed by a second that is rhythmically energetic and more violent in nature. And it is the speed with which Benjamin could control the build-up or dissipation of musical energy to make dramatically memorable shapes in the music's form that was a noted feature of his orchestral writing in the later 1930s and beyond.

Benjamin also learnt to interpret the subtleties of the psychological drama through film composing whose scoring needed to reflect the transformation of energy that occurs in this kind of development. For example, the rhythm of Jill's motif in \textit{Storm Clouds Cantata} becomes more energetic and decisive in the middle section as

\textsuperscript{894} Murray Schafer. \textit{British Composers in Interview}. London: Faber & Faber, 1963: 50.
her mind pieces together the fact that something terrible is about to take place about which she decides to act. And Gil de Berault’s motifs are subject to subtle variations involving rhythm, pitch and key that reflect his unseen psychological state. In the *Romantic Fantasy*, one can detect similar subtle changes. For example, the work’s primary motif A (the lover’s leitmotif) makes a bold statement at bar 531 of the Sonata-Finale in a sudden *forte* outpouring of feeling over a harmonically transitory accompaniment; and its second last appearance, again at original pitch and in the original key (E major) in bar 639, feels it has reached a final point of resolution and rest. As already argued in previous chapters and in those to come, Benjamin’s sense of drama developed to new levels as a direct result of his work as a film composer and it was only natural that this new sensibility was to influence a composer who claimed to have acted “instinctively when the proper time arrives” with regard to form.895

---

Chapter 7

Film and Opera
7.1 Introduction

An awareness of the similarities between the new art of film music and the older established art of opera stimulated much interest and controversy as discussed in section 3.2 of chapter three. From the earliest pioneers in sound pictures such as Mathieson who advocated film music as suitable work for a composer with a leaning towards opera, to theorists of today such as Prendergast who argue there are direct links between opera and film music, there is a consensus of opinion that these two worlds meet even though the detail of exactly how is still open to discussion. In short, these arts have two elements in common—drama and music—and it is interesting to note that 'melodrama' was a term used to describe the opera *A Tale of Two Cities* but one that had fallen into disregard in some quarters as is evident in Benjamin's review of Menotti's *The Consul*.  

I have heard sneers from the superior that 'The Consul' is 'melodrama, mere melodrama'. (Incidentally I would invite the superior person to think twice before descending to the vulgarism of using 'melodrama' in a disparaging sense. Superior persons should know better. 'Melodrama' is the right and proper term for the combination of music and drama).  

For a composer working with art forms created from the partnership of music and drama, one would expect to see similar compositional techniques or the adaptation of techniques applied to both genres. This study takes the findings from chapter four on Benjamin's film music and compares them with a study of his operas to determine whether his work as a film composer influenced his approach to opera. For this purpose, the two early one-act operas have been selected, *The Devil Take Her* (1931) and *Prima Donna* (1933). The third opera is *A Tale of Two Cities* begun in 1949 and

---

896 Cedric Cliffe refers to *A Tale of Two Cities* sub-title of 'A Romantic Melodrama' in the following article: 'Arthur Benjamin's Operas—A Librettist's Eye View', *The Composer* No. 5 (October 1960): 5.

completed in 1950, some considerable time after Benjamin's first film music period but none-the-less chronologically the next opera in line.

### 7.2 The Devil Take Her and Prima Donna

Benjamin's two one-act operas, *The Devil Take Her* and *Prima Donna*, were completed within three years of each other and it is therefore not surprising that the composer's musical approach to text and drama share many similarities. Unlike his first opera which he was fortunate enough to hear Sir Thomas Beecham conduct at the RCM on December 1 and 2, 1931 soon after its completion, Prima Donna had to wait another sixteen years before its première at the Fortune Theatre in London under the composer's baton.

Both works were well received at their premières but observant and constructive criticism was made concerning the composer's dramatic sensibilities. For example, when reporting on the audience's response to *The Devil Take Her*, Benjamin wrote that they "seemed to agree upon the sense of the theatre and the fact that the action never flagged" but Kenneth Wright was more aware of the opera's shortcomings.

Where the Devil as a result of his reception by the new termagant wife prefers to take the husband instead, I felt the whole thing rather missed the mark and came to an anti-climax, and I am prepared to believe that on further acquaintance, I would find rather a lack of continuity in the musical thought right through the work.

Alan Boustead's article was to find fault in the "moments of dramatic action" which he claimed had less spontaneity and were more

---

899 Arthur Benjamin wrote: "I am conducting 'Prima Donna' myself on Feb 23 at the Fortune Theatre and am in the thick of 'music'—and 'production'—rehearsals". Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, February 7, 1949 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
901 Internal circulating memo from Mr. Kenneth Wright to Music Director, December 8, 1931 (BBC Written Archives, Composer: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1927–39).
contrived. Prima Donna was, in general, perceived as an attractive work with Benjamin describing it as a “gay little opera”. The Vancouver Sun reproduced an excerpt from the Daily Express by quoting: “One of the smoothest and gayest of light operas...spiced with colourful orchestral noises and catchy tunes”. But Hans Keller, in Music Review, commented on flawed dramatic sensibilities that resulted once more in a sense of anti-climax.

Except for two—musically critical—sections, Arthur Benjamin’s comic oper(ett)a (1933) is a strong resuscitator of what one believed to be a dead tradition. The quasi ballet music that makes up the interlude is disputable; the end of the opera is impossible...all we get is the Count’s protracted sicilianizing and the maid’s “Tiou, tiouee” which, funny at first, soon becomes a bore. I implore the composer to do something, if not about the entr’acte, at least about the end.

To appreciate just how perceptive these criticisms were, a closer study of Benjamin’s treatment of libretto and his musical response to the dramatic potential of the story is needed.

The following words by Benjamin give us some insight into his relationship with the libretti of his first two operas:

[T]he audience should hear those of the words essential to the unfolding of the story, and that on no account should any character stand still on the stage and sing for the mere sake of singing. Also, I am convinced that the Libretto of an Opera should be capable of being represented as a play and that the Music should point and enhance that play. To carry this out I tried to set the words (in the non-lyrical passages) as near spoken speed and inflection as it was practicable for the singers to enunciate. In this I seem to

---

903 The first quotation is from a letter written by Arthur Benjamin to Jean Coulthard, April 25, 1949 (University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard File 1–3) and the second from 'Arthur Benjamin is Acclaimed in Britain', Vancouver Sun, April 2, 1949. Article attributes the quote as being from the Daily Express.
have been successful for there is no doubt that the words did get over to the audience.\textsuperscript{905}

When creating the libretto for \textit{The Devil Take Her}, Benjamin enjoyed a close collaboration with the poet Alan Collard, opera producer John Gordon and Cedric Cliffe.\textsuperscript{906} The story-line of the opera is neatly summed up in a section of the opening prologue.

\begin{verbatim}
First you'll see the Poet at work
Making songs for other people's sweet-hearts.
Then comes a wealthy neighbour –
He thinks himself a master of the Arts –
Must have a song to woo a wealthy widow.
Then you'll see the poet's wife;
She has youth and beauty–but alas
She's been dumb all her life.
Next morning, with much pomp and circumstance
Comes a great Doctor, renowned from East to West
He operates and............
\end{verbatim}

To complete the plot, the wife turns out to be a vicious nag against whom the poet finally cries 'the Devil take you!' When the Devil decides life would be unbearable with her in hell, the poet asks to take her place.

Benjamin consciously admitted his music served to 'point' and 'enhance' the words of a 'play'. His use of the word 'play' is quite revealing as it indicates a theatrical, rather than film, thinking with regard to these early libretti. Word-painting in sound was one technique that he had already applied in his early songs and used again in \textit{The Devil Take Her} to enhance the text. An example of this can be found in bars 54–7 where the bell-like sound of the piano

\textsuperscript{905} Arthur Benjamin. 'Notes on Two Operas in English', \textit{Tempo}, Vol. I, No. 3 (September 1940): 6.

\textsuperscript{906} Ibid.
chords accompany the words ‘O London bells be clear and soft’ (example 7.1).

Example 7.1 The Devil Take Her, bars 54–7.

In example 7.2 semi-quaver triplet figures marked pianississimo accompany the words ‘like the reeds that whisper in the wind’.

Example 7.2 The Devil Take Her, bars 164–5.

A less subtle example in bars 97–8 has the poet sing ‘show her your hoard of ducats’ to the sounds of a glockenspiel and piano mimicking the sound of jingling money.

This last example leads to another technique used by Benjamin whereby music emphasised or paralleled the action on stage and this may well be the ‘sense of theatre’ and unflagging action that he credits The Devil Take Her having satisfied (noted on page 336). To illustrate this point, the subject of ducats once again returns in bars 563–5 and when the dumb wife insists on paying the doctor only five ducats for the operation, she is instructed in the score to synchronize the pointing to her five fingers with the sound of five rising notes quickly played pizzicato on the violins (example 7.3).

Example 7.3 The Devil Take Her, bars 563–5.

Dear Ma-dam, make it ten!

Well, five it shall be. But with a

The wife points to her five fingers.
Another example of music directly involved in the action on stage can be found in bars 690–4. Now that the operation is over, the poet begs his wife to speak. She points to the wine and the glass fills to the sounds of a chromatically rising accompaniment; she then drinks the wine to the sound of falling semiquavers. These passages involving word painting and music paralleling the action on stage and in the text, produced a fairly literal interpretation and uncomplicated response to the libretto from the composer. This straightforward interpretation of the text is even applied to the character of the Devil, whom one would think had terrific dramatic potential in the opera. Instead, Benjamin allows the Devil to come and go in a flash with no motivic representation and very little music of any character to shape his persona. He basically gets to sing a few lines in dialogue with the Poet and his wife before exiting the stage.

*Prima Donna* was described by its creator as a ‘gay little opera’ and is really a party piece on a bigger scale than *Jamaican Rumba*. Benjamin was known to be a *bonhomie* with plenty of *joie de vivre* and works like *Jamaican Rumba* reflected his talent at writing party pieces. He was also renowned for his skills as a gourmet cook, so one imagines the fun he had when composing the arias devoted to food and drink in *Prima Donna*. The opera is composed with a light touch and humour even for the lines of the libretto where Florindo despairs or contemplates suicide. Like the arrival of the devil in *The Devil Take Her*, these darker or potentially dramatic moments pass by with the general flow of words set to music with little dramatic impact.

The plot of *Prima Donna* is simple and involves six singing roles with no chorus. Florindo receives a letter from his rich Uncle, the Count, announcing his imminent arrival and request to be

---

907 Letter to Jean Coulthard, April 25, 1949 (University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard file 1–3).
909 Vernon Duker interview with the author, June 12, 2002 and letter from Serge Depouilly to the author, June 7, 2005 to name but a few of the sources.
entertained with food and wine and the singing talents of La Filomela. Despite his bankrupt state, Florindo, his friend Alcino, and the servant girl Bellina, hurriedly make preparations in the hope that they can entertain the Count to his satisfaction and thus remain in his good favour. Seeing as La Filomela is no longer on close terms with Florindo, the men independently arrange for each of their girlfriends, Olimpia and Fiammetta, to sing to the Count instead. Confusion and chaos reign as both sopranos arrive determined to sing and so begins the battle of the divas. As they compete on stage, the Count is convinced he is seeing (and eventually hearing) double because he is drunk but nonetheless he has a good time and loudly applauds at the end of the recital. Florindo and Alcino then think all is lost when the Count demands La Filomela to be brought to him but the servant Bellina suddenly appears in opera costume and wins over the heart of the Count.

As with The Devil Take Her, the text for Prima Donna is interpreted quite literally and is often acted out through the music. Take, for example, the upward flurry of triplets when Florindo rushes out onto the balcony or the downward winding line on the bassoon as the Count twice downs a glass of wine in bars 837–48 (example 7.4). Elementary use of leitmotif is used in both operas. These function on a signposting level to announce the arrival of a certain character or to draw the audience's attention to a recurring line of text or action. For example, in The Devil Take Her the Neighbour's motif (example 7.5) suggests a livelier character with a sense of humour and the Doctor's fanfare-like motif (example 7.6) indicates he and others consider him to be someone of importance. Occasionally a melodic line is echoed elsewhere in the score when the same subject matter is referred to. For example, the Doctor's request for a kiss from the wife as part payment for the operation in bars 566–8 (example 7.7) is echoed, though not exactly, in bars 708–10 (example 7.8) when he then tries to claim his kiss. Another example appears in bars 285–7 when the
Poet sings the words ‘Could I but know your thoughts so deep’. This melodic phrase and rhythm is repeated almost identically in bars 793–5 as the poet sings ‘And now I’ll know your thoughts so deep’.

A number of melodic phrases of similarly rounded shape and character partly owing to the lack of a seventh degree in the scale, are
usually sung by the poet. They appear in a number of situations but do not make any significant comment on the character of the poet or on the drama. For example, the phrases in examples 7.9 and 7.10 are also heard in the Poet's opening song about Susan from bar 33 as well as the drinking song that is sung by the Doctor, his attendants, the Poet and the Neighbour from bar 601 to the words: 'The Devil made woman, the Devil made care'.

Example 7.9 *The Devil Take Her*, bar 160-2.

The motif for the 'dumb wife' characterised by two intervals of a fourth, is the most repeated and arguably the most memorable and is heard in the opening bars of the opera (example 7.11).

Example 7.11 *The Devil Take Her*, Dumb wife motif, bars 1-6.

Judith Auer's article described the repeated use of this motif as part of the opera's 'cyclic design' and argued that it represented the Poet's idealized version of his wife. She rightly observed how the motif was sung by the Poet, the Neighbour, how it accompanied the Wife's entrance, but was never sung by the Wife herself as shown in examples 7.12 and 7.13.910

Example 7.12 *The Devil Take Her*, bars 147-50.

---

Example 7.13 *The Devil Take Her*, bars 204-6.

The wife enters, young, beautiful. She places her arm about his shoulder and lays her hand on his

The motif's function, though, is less sophisticated than Auer's interpretation and simply makes reference to the dumb wife on more of a signposting level. As example 7.12 reveals, each time either the Neighbour or Poet refers to her dumbness, the motif is heard and makes no reference to any sort of idyll. An inversion of the motif (example 7.14) dominates the instrumental interlude performed during the doctor's operation to signify that the wife's state of dumbness is being reversed and she will soon be able to speak.

Example 7.14 *The Devil Take Her*, bars 663-5.

Interestingly enough, the 'dumb wife' motif in either its original or inverted form, disappears once the wife finds her voice and can now rant and rave. It makes one last appearance in its original form in the instrumental lines at the close of the opera when the wife, now all alone, addresses the audience (example 7.15).

Example 7.15 *The Devil Take Her*, bars 1105-8.

Apart from the motif providing a closing 'signature' at the end of the opera, this last appearance serves no dramatic function and the motif has ceased to appear in a large part of the drama. It is this very lack
of coherence and planning that contributed to Kenneth Wright's
criticism of "anti-climax" and "lack of continuity" in the quotation
cited on page 336.

*Prima Donna* employs leitmotif not so much to signal the
presence of the players on stage but to highlight certain lines of text.
For example, there is a letter motif (example 7.16) which is
introduced in the instrumental accompaniment at bar 226 as
Florindo gives Bellina a letter to deliver.

**Example 7.16 ‘Letter’ motif, Prima Donna, bars 226-9.**

When Alcino requests Bellina to deliver another letter, his words are
again accompanied by the ‘letter’ motif. The motif is repeated two
more times in bars 276 and 281 (page 20 of vocal score) as Bellina
refers to each man’s request for her to deliver a letter. The second
instance is the ‘opera’ motif (example 7.17) which is introduced in
bars 180-2 as Florindo refers to his girlfriend Olimpia, who sings at
the opera ‘a little’.

**Example 7.17 ‘Opera’ motif, Prima Donna, bars 180-2.**

The ‘opera’ motif returns twice more to accompany both Olimpia’s
(bar 560)’ and Fiammetta’s (bar 601) onstage arrival.

Use of these leitmotifs is not a major factor in shaping the
operatic drama. Indeed, *Prima Donna* is composed of a series of sung
texts which link together the arias and instrumental interlude. As
Hans Keller’s earlier criticism noted, there are problems with the lack
of relationship between these musical numbers as they do not share any noticeable motif or musical aspect, whether it be melodic or rhythmic. It may well be possible to surmise that Benjamin intended this music to be independent so the songs could be easily extracted from the opera for recital purposes.

Benjamin’s decision to use a select number of keys for the main arias and interlude may have been in order to address problems of coherence in the score. Table 7.1 shows how emphasis is placed on major and minor keys centred on A, C, E and G (A minor seventh chord). But apart from providing a limited tonal scheme, this choice of keys fails to comment on any aspect of the text or drama and the shift from the opening tonality of A to the final key of G minor for the closing ‘Nightingale’ aria leaves a feeling of non-resolution even though it is a happy ending for everyone in the story.

Table 7.1 Arias and interludes in Prima Donna.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bar &amp; page no. of vocal score</th>
<th>Description of Music</th>
<th>Key</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>bar 147 (page 11 of vocal score)</td>
<td>The sun may shine, I have no eyes to see’ (Florindo)</td>
<td>A minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 300 (page 21)</td>
<td>‘To serve both God and Mammon’ (Bellina)</td>
<td>E minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 347 (page 23)</td>
<td>‘Vermicelli, Tagliatelle’ (Florindo, Alcino &amp; Bellina)</td>
<td>C major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 399 (page 29)</td>
<td>Gavotte (instrumental)</td>
<td>E minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 425 (page 30)</td>
<td>Musette (instrumental)</td>
<td>E major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 458 (page 32)</td>
<td>Gavotte (instrumental, return of above Gavotte)</td>
<td>E minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 516 (page 36)</td>
<td>‘The felon in his lonely cell’ (Alcino)</td>
<td>G major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 643 (page 46)</td>
<td>‘A baggage like you’ (Olimpia, Fiammetta, Florindo &amp; Alcino)</td>
<td>G minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 874 (page 69)</td>
<td>Drinking Trio (Florindo, Alcino &amp; Count)</td>
<td>C major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 1050 (page 83)</td>
<td>‘Deserted on this savage strand’ (Olimpia, Fiammetta, Count, Florindo &amp; Alcino)</td>
<td>A minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 1070 (page 87)</td>
<td>‘Now sorrow melts to gladness’ (Olimpia, Fiammetta)</td>
<td>A major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 1294 (page 105)</td>
<td>‘A nightingale sat in a shady tree’ (Count &amp; Bellina)</td>
<td>G minor</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Both of Benjamin's early operas concentrate on delivering the words of the libretto as they are sung. The music, through elementary use of leitmotif, signposts the presence of certain characters or lines of the text and further enhances the words through sound painting or musical 'mimicking' of the action, as dictated by the text, on stage. This use of music and text served a sense of theatre that was immediate and entertaining on more of a moment to moment basis. The libretto's delivery is direct with very little repetition and musical interludes are kept short. This approach gives little opportunity for the music to comment on the line which has just been sung. His musical interpretation of the emotional and psychological state of his characters is one dimensional with Benjamin as yet too inexperienced in interpreting the more subtle issues of dramatic development, in particular the development of the psychological drama from a musical perspective that he was soon to learn from inspired directors such as Hitchcock.

7.3 Benjamin's treatment of libretto and musical response to drama in A Tale of Two Cities

A Tale of Two Cities was completed on February 17, 1950, three years before the opera received its first airing as a BBC broadcast in 1953. Benjamin made no secret of the fact that the libretto, written by Cedric Cliffe in close collaboration with the composer, was inspirational and "fantastically good". The twenty-seven intervening years between this opera and Prima Donna had been enriched by his experience as both a film composer during the 1930s in Britain and as a conductor of various orchestras in Canada during the 1940s, as explained in previous chapters. This study of A Tale of Two Cities analyses many noticeable changes in his approach to writing opera and investigates whether these changes in his technique were first recorded in his early film music.

911 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, August 2, 1949 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
The plot of the opera *A Tale of Two Cities* is an adaptation of Charles Dickens's novel. Six scenes condense the essence of the original story with an additional emphasis on the character of Madame Defarge who seeks vengeance on the Marquis of Saint Evremonde and his family. Scene one is set in the Defarge's squalid and poverty stricken wine shop in Paris of 1783 and establishes the miserable lot of the peasants and their hatred of the aristocracy. Lucie and Mr Lorry arrive from London to take Lucie's father, Dr Manette, back to England; he has just been released from fifteen years imprisonment in the Bastille. In scene two the audience is transported to the garden of Dr Manette's and Lucie's London home. Lucie announces her engagement to Charles Darnay, the estranged and exiled son of the Marquis of Saint Evremonde. Sydney Carton, whose looks are remarkably similar to Charles Darnay and who is also in love with Lucie, is bitterly disappointed by their engagement. Scene three returns to the Defarge's wine shop in Paris where the Revolution is now established and Madame Defarge sets a trap for Charles Darnay by offering Gabelle, a servant to the Marquis of Saint Evremonde, his life if Darnay returns to Paris to prove that both he and Gabelle are a 'friend of the people'. In scene four at the Revolutionary Tribunal, Madame Defarge works to ensure the conviction and subsequent execution of Charles Darnay but Sydney Carton manages to foil her by taking Charles Darnay's place in the prison cell in scene five. The last scene concentrates on Sydney Carton, his death by guillotine and the subsequent collapse of Madame Defarge's grand plan.

Both the realised and potential cross fertilization between opera and film has been discussed in chapter three and there is evidence on a few levels to suggest that Benjamin's work in film was influencing this opera. The following extract from his letter to Ralph Hawkes indicated the interest in filming existing operas at the time as well as the fact that, although he obviously felt it to be an attractive proposition, he was not consciously writing with this goal in mind.
I note what you say about opera and television. Will you get the New York office on to pushing both 'The Devil Take Her' and 'Prima Donna' (for television) as I think they really have the qualities necessary—ideal length, humour, and tons of stage action?...

Of course I may fail, but I hope that 'The Tale of Two Cities' will be an opera which will translate into any language with success. Incidentally even the Film public will know what it is about. Whether such a big scale work is suitable for television or not I don't know. Even if it is not at present I suppose it will be in the future.912

On a more conscious and straightforward level Benjamin explained one extract from the opera involving the blend of music and sound effects similar to the mix of recorded music and the natural sound of wind and waves in the storm scene for Turn of the Tide.

[O]nomatopoeic music, cinema-music if you like! For instance, when the coach of the wicked Marquis de St. Evremonde kills the child I use coconut shells for the imitation of horses hooves and harness chains to depict the approach of a furiously driven vehicle.913

With the easy transferral of ideas from film to opera and vice versa, one should not be surprised to see musical extracts from one being re-used in the other, especially when they share the same subject matter. On this purely practical level, music composed for The Scarlet Pimpernel (1934) and Return of the Scarlet Pimpernel (1937) does indeed resurface in A Tale of Two Cities. The chromatic ostinato accompaniment in The Scarlet Pimpernel's title music is identical with the one in the opera's introduction (example 7.18), with the brass chords that punctuate this filigree accompaniment differing slightly and the passage in a different key.

912 Letter from Arthur Benjamin to Ralph Hawkes, August 2, 1949 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
913 Arthur Benjamin. 'A Tale of Two Cities', radio script transmitted April 13, 1953 on BBC Third Programme (Benjamin Estate).
Example 7.18 Title music from the film *The Scarlet Pimpernel* is reused in the introduction to *A Tale of Two Cities*, act one, scene one, bars 1–11.

Other material transferred from his film scores includes the drum-rhythm which first appears in the guillotine scene in *Return of the Scarlet Pimpernel* and is used again in act two, scene three, bar 7 of the opera (example 7.19).

Example 7.19 Drum rhythm used in *Return of the Scarlet Pimpernel*.

Dubbing almost obscures the next example but very careful listening detects the famous French revolutionary song *Ah! ca ira* that is sung in the guillotine scene of *Return of the Scarlet Pimpernel* is the same
song sung by the chorus in scenes three, four and six of *A Tale of Two Cities* (example 7.20).  

Example 7.20 ‘Ah! ça ira’, *A Tale of Two Cities*, act two, scene three.

Ah, ça i - ra, ça i - ra, ça i - ra. Les ar - is - to - crais à la lan - ter - ne.

*A Tale of Two Cities* has numerous scenes whereby music sounds simultaneously with dialogue and sung speech, much like a film sound track. This technique is extended in the prison scene to include the juxtaposition of music of greatly contrasting temperament, that is, diegetic music of a gentle, courtly nature played on flute and guitar by the imprisoned aristocracy on stage, alongside impassioned chromatic music performed by orchestra, as shown in examples 7.21 and 7.22 respectively. The musical contrast of the latter example is akin to the film theories in aural and visual counterpoint expounded by Eisenstein and practised by Hitchcock in

Example 7.21 *A Tale of Two Cities*, act three, scene five, bar 211–6.

914 In Laura Mason’s opinion, Ça ira emerged as “the first truly revolution song” in July 1790 as the Parisians voluntarily worked together in levelling the grounds of the Champ de Mars for the first festival of Federation. *Singing the French Revolution*. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1996: 42.
Example 7.22 A Tale of Two Cities, act three, scene five, bars 381–401.

The locks clank, the music tails off, the dancers stop

(The locks clank, the music tails off, the dancers stop) (Guard enters through the door, all other movement is frozen)

Presto

(The locks clank, the music tails off, the dancers stop)

(The locks clank, the music tails off, the dancers stop) (Guard enters through the door, all other movement is frozen)

Presto

The closing ritenuto section of Storm Clouds Cantata. Benjamin, when comparing such contrasting music in this scene, actually used the word 'against' when he said: “These I have done in eighteenth century
pastiches, while against them, in the darker part of the cell, the orchestra conveys the drama of Charles Darnay's escape.\footnote{Arthur Benjamin. 'A Tale of Two Cities', radio script transmitted April 13, 1953 on BBC Third Programme (Benjamin Estate).}

Having observed the more obvious influences of Benjamin's film music on his opera score, the study now focuses on his interpretation of the text and of the drama. His BBC talk prior to the 1953 broadcast of \textit{A Tale of Two Cities} indicated a shift away from the 'text-driven' approach that functions in his two one-act operas when he said the following about the librettist for his next opera:

[\textit{Cedric Cliffe}] is prepared to admit that the poetry and drama should come more from the orchestra than from the words...a composer must have freedom when writing for the stage.\footnote{Arthur Benjamin. 'A Tale of Two Cities', radio script transmitted April 13, 1953 on BBC Third Programme (Benjamin Estate).}

His words suggest that the orchestral music for \textit{A Tale of Two Cities} explores and interprets the drama just as it does in his film music. Indeed, the dramatic power of the music attracted comment from many critics. Dyneley Hussey, writing for \textit{The Listener} said: "His music invariably goes straight to the point, illuminating character and reinforcing the dramatic action."\footnote{Dyneley Hussey. 'Critic on the Hearth: Broadcast Music', \textit{The Listener}, Vol. XLIX, No. 1260 (April 23, 1953): 697.} Eric Blom of \textit{The Observer} was equally enthusiastic and wrote: "musically always interesting, [the score] is above all a masterpiece of dramatic composition...Again and again his handling of a scene, his musical timing and placing of high-lights, is unfailingly right".\footnote{Eric Blom. Untitled, \textit{The Observer}, April 19, 1953.} Donald Mitchell was more critical of the opera but even so, managed to acknowledge that the form was always "dramatically apt".\footnote{Donald Mitchell. The Half Year's Film Music', \textit{Music Review}, Vol. XIV, No. 3 (August 1953): 210–11.} Drama had become an important factor to Benjamin, and Richard Stoker remembered him making the following comment about Ralph Vaughan Williams's operas: "I admire
him above all other living composers, but unfortunately his operas are not dramatic enough".920

Benjamin employs the techniques of word painting and music that parallels the action on stage to clarify and enhance the text being sung, but his approach reveals a more sophisticated and insightful interpretation of the text than shown in his earlier operas. For example, he may write luminescent ascending music in bars 315–6 of scene five for the Old Marquis as 'He raises the candle to look at Sydney' but in bars 500–3 he does not accompany Carton's downing of the wine with the customary downward flurry of music that we have seen in scores for The Devil Take Her and Prima Donna. Instead, there is a rising flurry of semiquavers marked crescendo and accelerando expressing the rising emotions welling up in the unhappy and grieving Sydney Carton who then sings 'I am not quite well. I am not quite well. Ah, God! Ah, God! I am, indeed, not well.' Another example is the use of a rhythmic motif that consistently accompanies Madame Defarge's death sentence on the Marquis de Saint Evremonde every time it appears in the score (example 7.23).

**Example 7.23 'Death sentence' rhythm, A Tale of Two Cities, act one, scene one, bars 300–2.**

The death sentence is a crucial line of text that explains much of the opera's plot and it is not surprising to see its last appearance coincide with the 'revenge' motif (soon to be discussed) as shown in example 7.29. Another line of text emphasised by Benjamin and perhaps the most hauntingly set to music, is first sung by Dr Manette in scene one and repeated by Madame Defarge in the Tribunal scene

---

that refers to the number of the doctor's prison cell in the Bastille (example 7.24).

**Example 7.24** 'A hundred and five North Tower', *A Tale of Two Cities*, act one, scene one, bars 458–60.

Benjamin’s choice and use of leitmotif delve into the emotional and psychological make-up of his main characters and he is credited with being “an able psychologist” by John W. Klein. As with *Turn of the Tide*, the different nature of the motifs express ‘good’ and ‘bad’ elements of the drama which nearly always involve some interpretation of a psychological state. Take for example, the disruptive elements of the story that propel the action along. The leitmotif for the Marquis de Saint Evremonde (example 7.25) has a foreboding quality and a vigorous and varied rhythm suggesting a man of great energy and ruthlessness.

**Example 7.25** Leitmotif for the Marquis de Saint Evremonde, *A Tale of Two Cities*, act one, scene one, bars 191–2.

A murderous tyrant, his negative presence is conjured up through his leitmotif in a number of situations even though he is not physically present or has, in fact, already been killed by the Revolutionaries. Examples of this appear in scene two when Charles Darnay sings of his hatred for his father, in scene three when Madame Defarge recognises his servant Gabelle and in scene four when she declares his name to the Revolutionary Tribunal. It is again referred to in

---

scene three in connection with the aristocracy as it accompanies the severed heads of two aristocrats paraded on the end of pikes by the French revolutionaries (example 7.26). Unlike the ‘dumb’ wife motif in *The Devil Take Her*, the use of this leitmotif, as well as the others about to be discussed, is consistent and clearly connected with its designated subject.

**Example 7.26 Variation on the Marquis de Saint Evremonde leitmotif, A Tale of Two Cities, act two, scene three, bar 103.**

Madame Defarge is the other ‘disharmonious’ element in the story and as with the Marquis, Benjamin consciously wrote music for these characters that was “far more contemporary harmony and a more angular vocal line”.922 The motif connected with Madame Defarge (example 7.27) appears in the chromatic accompaniment to the opera’s overture and represents a psychological aspect that drives her and the story onwards—her all-consuming need for revenge.

**Example 7.27 ‘Revenge’ motif, A Tale of Two Cities, act one, scene one, bar 1.**

The placing of this motif through the opera shows careful interpretation of the text and drama by Benjamin. As Madame Defarge plots the revolution in her wine shop in scene one, the motif, in quavers, accompanies her at bar 52 as she sings ‘Enough, our time will come. Before you pour the cup, the cup must be full. Believe me my friend, the cup will be well worth the drinking’. We learn later that they plan to drink ‘a redder wine’ from the cup in reference to the aristocratic blood that will soon be spilt. The ‘revenge’ motif introduces scene three where Madame Defarge and the revolutionary mob are celebrating their recent bloody victories and its

---

922 Arthur Benjamin. ‘A Tale of Two Cities’, (radio script) transmitted April 13, 1953 on BBC Third Programme (Benjamin Estate).
waspish nature returns six times in scene four during the Revolutionary Tribunal where Madame Defarge takes centre stage to argue her case against Charles Darnay (example 7.28).

**Example 7.28 'Revenge' motif, A Tale of Two Cities, act two, scene four, bars 342–4.**

As to be expected, the 'revenge' motif makes its final appearance in the last scene as Madame Defarge arrives to witness what she thinks is Charles Darnay's ascent to the guillotine (example 7.29).

**Example 7.29 'Revenge' motif, A Tale of Two Cities, act three, scene six, bars 314–20.**

But as Sydney Carton turns to face her and says 'Look well, Thérèse Defarge, look well. Are you sure?' she realises another man has taken Charles Darnay's place and the 'revenge' motif unravels along with her ultimate goal (example 7.30).
The use of leitmotif associated with the discordant elements of the drama is in many ways less complicated than the use of those representing the good or heroic characters. Sydney Carton is the most complex of these and Benjamin described him as “a mentally tortured character”. Throughout the opera, he is engaged in a psychological struggle which sees him emerge from an arrogant and unworthy man to a noble and self-sacrificing one. Lucie establishes these two sides of him by singing in the second scene: ‘He is clever and witty and kind, I think, at heart, But at times so strange and wild.’ As to be expected, such a complex character connects with more than one motif. The first motif (example 7.31) appears at bar 482 and is played while Carton describes his spent youth and his drinking, and could be described as having a swaggering or arrogant quality.

Example 7.31 ‘Carton’ motif, A Tale of Two Cities, scene two, bar 482.

A ‘self-judgement’ motif appears in the scene where Carton conducts a mock trial in which he appears as both judge and himself (example 7.32). Its qualities have similarities with the Marquis de Saint Evremonde’s motif and the logic of this becomes apparent when we realise that it is Charles Darnay, Lucie’s fiancée and son of the Marquis, that Carton accepts to save again. Thus the motifs served to

---

923 Ibid.
clarify the overall drama and which role—judge or himself—that he is
singing.

Example 7.32 ‘Self-judgment’ motif followed by Sydney Carton motif, A Tale of Two
Cities, act one, scene two, bars 582-90.

Other motifs interact with Sydney Carton as the story unfolds. Prior
to example 7.32, from bars 571-6, only the rhythm on a side drum
accompanies the announcement of his sentence delivered as
sprechstimme—Well then, here is your sentence—To stand and to
watch while a man not worth the half of you snatches a jewel from
under your eyes. To stand and to watch and to smile’. Reference to
the drum is an ominous prediction of his ultimate death by guillotine
(also accompanied only by drums) in place of Darnay at the close of
the opera.

An ‘anguish’ motif and its variations, as to be expected, appear
in more than one situation as it expresses the feelings of not only
Carton but Darnay, The Old Marquis (not to be confused with the
Marquis de Saint Evremonde), the young Comtesse and even of
Madame Defarge as she sings of her dying brother at the
Revolutionary Tribunal. Examples 7.33, and 7.34, show some of the variations on the ‘anguish’ motif in the prison cell scene.


Benjamin then chooses very different music of an ethereal and timeless quality to twice accompany a prayer-like passage sung by Carton before his imminent execution. As he sings the word ‘rest’, the music steadily descends the notes of a D major scale with a simplicity and openness that suggests that the tortured soul of Carton has at last found some kind of psychological resolve and peace of mind (example 7.35).

Example 7.35 *A Tale of Two Cities*, act three, scene six, bars 278–90.

As can be heard in the subtle developments of Jill’s motif in *Storm Clouds Cantata* or Gil de Berault’s motif in *Under the Red Robe*, variations in a leitmotif can represent the changing psychological
state of the character or subject they portray. A passage from the second part of scene one encompassing bars 529–81 shows the combined use of leitmotif and Benjamin’s choice of key and his control of chromaticism and diatonic music to define the drama. To refresh our memory, Dr Manette has recently been released from the Bastille with his mind under a ‘cloud’ and Lucy is determined to bring him ‘back to life’ and to a new home with her in London. The musical outline in example 7.36 shows the use of three important leitmotif in this passage—‘Lucie’ motif, ‘cloud’ motif and ‘Hundred and Five North Tower’ motif. Their presence is enhanced by the choice of key; for example, open diatonic music in the C flat major is reserved for moments when Dr Manette has successfully been called ‘back to life’ by Lucie, as first shown at bar 539. Minor keys and chromaticism are employed to express darker or less harmonious elements of the story such as the D minor chord which underpins the meandering, chromatically twisting ‘cloud’ motif played by the celeste that indicates Dr Manette’s confused state of mind at bar 543, and the key of A minor for the ‘Hundred and Five North Tower’ motif that is associated with his imprisonment at bar 562. The interval of the fourth that randomly features in the ‘cloud’ motif more-or-less rearranges itself into orderly descending consecutive fourths when Lucie calls her father ‘back to life’ to create what will now be referred to as ‘Lucie’s’ motif. As she sings her words of reassurance and of a wholesome life, her motif is set in major keys but the specific key of C flat major is reserved for the moments when her father has emerged from his ‘cloud’ and has been successfully called ‘back to life’. The similarities in the leitmotifs chosen to represent these two characters suggests that they are not only from the same family but that Lucie, like her father, has inherited the same delicate state of mind. Both ‘Lucie’s’ motif and the ‘cloud’ motif return later in the opera: at the very close of the Revolutionary Tribunal in scene four, the strain of the trial and Madame Defarge’s vengeance once more breaks down
Example 7.36 Musical outline showing use of leitmotifs, key, chromaticism and diatonicism, *A Tale of Two Cities*, act one, scene one, bars 529–81.

Lucie: If, after the dark oblivion of the friendless years, the agony is ended. Weep then and ease your heart and

Dr. Manette: So like, so like.

Weep then and ease your heart and
too young.

Chromatic music over pedal point on B

Lucie: There is a home for you, far, far away where we can live and laugh together again. Weep, dear father, if you will but come with

Dr. Manette: Back to life? What do you mean? I do not know. How should I know?

Lucie: There is a home for you, far, far away where we can live and laugh together again. Weep, dear father, if you will but come with

(But he breaks away and returns to his room.)

Lucie (despairing, thinking that the cloud has again come upon him. But the Doctor returns, carrying his cobbler's tools. He and Lucie go slowly out into the sunset, while Madame Defarge modestly watching them.)

the Doctor's mind into the celeste's unfocused wanderings of the 'cloud' motif, and in bars 259–65 of the opera's final scene, Sydney
Carton briefly refers to Lucie's motif as he sings: 'I see the lives for which I give my life, Happy and peaceful in that land which I shall see no more, no more. And no more shall I see an English spring.'

An outline of the music for the *Storm Clouds Cantata* and the storm scene in *Turn of the Tide*, showing the careful planning of musical elements such as leitmotifs, tempi and rhythms to sustain and build towards a designated climax, is shown in examples 4.6, 4.23 and 4.24. Such an approach was applied in the Revolutionary Tribunal of scene four; from bar 199, when Madame Defarge first announces Dr Manette is Charles Darnay's chief accuser, until the last bar of the scene, Benjamin draws a long, carefully paced dramatic line lasting 272 bars that reaches its most terrifying climax at bar 461 only seconds from the end.

As with *Storm Clouds Cantata*, these 272 bars can be viewed in three sections that are shaped by tempi and leitmotif, as identified in table 7.2. The changing tempi are complex but generally speaking, the tempo in section one through bars 199–254 is centred on *Lento*. Like a snake coiling for a strike, Madame Defarge's 'revenge' motif features at this slow tempo in bars 199–202 and again in bars 217–27. The only other leitmotif to appear in this section is that for 'One hundred and five North Tower' as Madame Defarge establishes throughout bars 235–45 that the evidence in the form of a letter written by the Doctor was found in cell number 105.

Section two spans bars 255–421 where Madame Defarge tells the story of how the Marquis de Saint Evremonde raped her sister and murdered the boy, her brother, who had raised his hand in defence of his sister; then in order to cover up the crime, the Marquis silenced the witness who was the Doctor who had attended to the dying boy, by imprisoning him in the Bastille. Although the tempi in this dramatic middle section fluctuates, they are focused around a basic *Allegro* and the leitmotifs that feature in this section fuel the rhythmic energy and drive.
Table 7.2 Three sections and use of leitmotif in *A Tale of Two Cities*, act three, scene four, bars 199-463.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section &amp; bar no.</th>
<th>Tempo &amp; time signature</th>
<th>Leitmotif</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Section one</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 199</td>
<td><em>Meno allegro</em>, 3/4 time</td>
<td>'revenge' motif</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>212</td>
<td>Allegro</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>217</td>
<td><em>Lento</em>, 12/8 time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>235</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>246</td>
<td><em>Molto più mosso, agitato</em>, vocal line in 4/4 time over 12/8 time accompaniment</td>
<td>'105 North Tower' motif</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>253</td>
<td><em>Meno mosso</em>, 4/4 time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Section two</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 255</td>
<td>Allegro, 4/8 time</td>
<td>'anguish' motif</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>270</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>273</td>
<td><em>subito Lento</em></td>
<td>'revenge' motif</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>276</td>
<td>Allegro</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>280</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>284</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>288</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>294</td>
<td>Lento</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>296</td>
<td><em>Lento ma un poco mosso</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>304</td>
<td><em>Subito allegro</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>307</td>
<td>Allegro</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>311</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>323</td>
<td>Lento</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>326</td>
<td>Allegro</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>333</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>342</td>
<td>Allegro non troppo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359</td>
<td>Allegro, 3/4 time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>367</td>
<td>Allegro molto</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>377</td>
<td><em>Più allegro</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>385</td>
<td><em>Subito meno mosso</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>391</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>399</td>
<td>Allegro</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>409</td>
<td><em>Meno mosso.</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>415</td>
<td>4/4 time.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Section three</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bar 422</td>
<td><em>Poco lento</em> (quaver = crotchet of foregoing Allegro).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>429</td>
<td><em>Di nuovo allegro</em> (crotchet = quaver of foregoing).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>450</td>
<td><em>Quasi marcia funebre</em></td>
<td>'death sentence' rhythm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>460</td>
<td><em>Largamente</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>462</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>'cloud' motif</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Madame Defarge’s ‘revenge’ motif continues as is dramatically apt to the story. Its appearance at bars 273 and 323 momentarily holds the tempo back at *Lento* but centres on *Allegro non troppo* for its last
entry from bar 342. As with *Storm Clouds Cantata*, other leitmotifs enter in the Allegro section that are particularly poignant to the unfolding story and contribute to the feelings of unrest and disharmony: the ‘anguish’ motif appears at bars 270 and 284–95 as Madame Defarge relates her own suffering; references to the ‘Marquis de Saint Evremonde’ motif can be heard at bars 280, 311, 337 and 348, and is heard in full from bar 359–70 when she identifies him as the criminal; a reference to the ‘death sentence’ rhythm accompanies Lucie’s words to Madame Defarge: ‘A word from you, you have the power. You can have no cause to hate him so’, its presence making a musical comment on the fact that Madame Defarge has the power to condemn Charles Darnay to death and proceeds to do so. Section two consciously builds towards two points of climax; the first is reached as Madame Defarge identifies the villain as the Marquis de Saint Evremonde, the father of Charles Darnay at bar 367 and the second when Jacques 1 suddenly silences the mounting unrest from the revolutionary mob as they demand Charles Darnay’s death by crying out ‘Enough!’ (bar 420). The restless rising energy of the middle section is furthered channelled towards these points of climax by marked *accelerandii* and systematically rising chromatic lines. For example, the first climax is preceded by a rising chromatic voice in bars 332–8, bars 347–55 and 358–66 with the latter two strengthened by a quickened tempo, and the same approach is applied in bars 399–408 to increase the tension before the second climax at bar 420.

The third and final section from bars 422–63, as in the final *ritenuto* section of *Storm Clouds Cantata*, takes a slower tempo with the quaver equal to the crotchet of the foregoing Allegro. The energy of the preceding Allegro middle section is sustained firstly by the intensity created by the controlled use of chromaticism as Jacques 1 in bars 422–8 sentences Charles Darnay to death by guillotine. This is followed by the livelier exuberant energy of the song sung by the revolutionary chorus that provides a contrast with the dark emotions
of the passage that follows. Here Madame Defarge delivers her, by
now, well known vow to kill the Marquis de Saint Evremonde and all
those associated with him. Her menacing words are delivered to the
sound of the ‘death sentence’ rhythm marked *quasi marcia funebre*
whose energy is coiled for the final release. This, the ultimate climax
of the scene, takes the form of an assault on Dr Manette as her
words, sung *Largamente* and *fortissimo* in bars 460–1, are practically
screamed ‘Now, Doctor save him now!’; the accompanying *fortissimo*
chord played on the horns at this point is quickly taken up by the
strings in the next bar at *pianissimo*, while the celeste plays the
‘cloud’ motif to indicate Dr Manette’s mind has broken, the effect
being not unlike the steam released from a red hot fire—such is the
build-up of emotional intensity over this 272 bar span of the opera
(see appendix A).

7.4 Conclusion
The music composed for Benjamin’s two early operas provides
imaginative and attractive accompaniments to the sung lines of text.
Opportunity for word painting and for the score to enhance and
emphasize certain lines of text or action on stage such as wine being
poured or a table being struck, are duly observed by the composer.
Elementary use of leitmotif further aided the audience’s identification
of a word, line of text or of a character but these, like the most
commonly used motif for the ‘dumb wife’ in *The Devil Take Her*, are
not consistently linked or always logically placed to make any
insightful or coherent comment on the drama. Nor does the
orchestral accompaniment take the opportunity to comment on the
unfolding drama or develop the psychological and emotional makeup
of the dumb wife or any other main characters, either through
thoughtful placing of leitmotif, choice of key or use of chromaticism
or diatonicism, in order to give them a more flesh and blood, real life,
three dimensional quality. Instead, the music’s emphasis and
dependence on delivering the words of a libretto as one might read
them in a play without a true dramatic concept or plan, resulted in a lack of overall dramatic vision for the work that naturally affected the structure and flow of the operas, as noticed by certain critics when the works were premièred.

Benjamin's involvement in film added a new dimension to his dramatic thinking. The dramatic basis of the majority of films dealt with harmonious elements disrupted by non-harmonious elements and the consequent attempt to resolve the ensuing conflict. As a composer, his musical skills were required to clarify this drama for audiences. Techniques developed to serve this purpose were leitmotifs that were easy to distinguish from one another and to remember so they could be detected in later variations. The nature of the leitmotif needed to define the character of the subject or person it represented and Benjamin learnt to reserve the use of key, rhythm, chromaticism, diatonicism, tempo and instrumentation for this purpose. Composing for film also gave Benjamin experience in scoring for a drama without being required to set words, a skill that demanded his development of the interpretive power of the orchestral accompaniment.

The fruits of his training as a film composer are evident in his score for A Tale of Two Cities. Perhaps through the process of osmosis as much as a purely conscious act, the score for A Tale of Two Cities absorbed certain aspects of a film soundtrack such as the layering of dialogue and diegetic music, as well as the use of onomatopoeic music and the ability to cut quickly from one mood to another and back without the need for musical transition. This approach served him well in his aim to create an opera of "verism" with the big choruses used "extremely realistically". In addition to this, his extensive use of leitmotif combined with sensitive use of key, rhythm, tempo, chromaticism and so on, served to define the drama on many levels. As a result, his characters are more human and appropriately more complex than those seen in the early operas. Instead, the

924 Arthur Benjamin. 'A Tale of Two Cities', radio script transmitted April 13, 1953 on BBC Third Programme (Benjamin Estate).
audience is now presented with characters whose psychological make-up is musically developed and defined, a drama whose qualities of harmony and disharmony are adequately portrayed through music as are the many moments where some kind of resolution requires acknowledgment. The orchestra which accompanies the sung and spoken lines of text is given freedom to comment on the drama and to condition the audience's response to key moments. It had, in effect, become a vehicle through which Benjamin could involve himself with the drama on a far more intimate level, where his own feelings could be expressed and his interpretation of important developments in the psychological drama could register.
Chapter 8

Conclusion
Conclusion

Benjamin’s experience as a film composer, in the time defined as the first film period (1934–7), exerted an immediate and considerable impact on his approach to composition because of two major factors: the unique timing of this work in his career and the unique nature of the work itself. As a composer whose mature voice was yet to be defined, scoring for films was not merely a sideline mode of employment to earn money; it was an area rich in opportunities and part of a vibrant, emerging art form. These opportunities included access to orchestras of skilled musicians, invaluable and direct feedback on performances of newly scored music as well as contact with some of the most stimulating and creative minds of the time.

On a purely practical level, issues concerning the process of dubbing and difficulties in producing good quality sound recordings for sound films in Britain, particularly with regard to the strings, influenced Benjamin’s decision to make noticeable adjustments in his use of orchestration and counterpoint (see chapter five). On a more elevated level, the feature films that Benjamin was primarily engaged to score for involved an element of drama. This required the introduction of disharmony, or something perceived as disruptive or ‘bad’ working against something ‘good’, whether it be people or a natural phenomenon such as a storm. The chief aim of the film thereafter was occupied with the need to resolve the conflict before its conclusion. Benjamin’s job as the film’s composer was to clarify this drama for the audience, and to heighten and condition their emotional response to events as they unfolded.

Work on his first feature film under Hitchcock’s directorship, introduced him to the music’s need to express the subtle states of a character’s psychological development as well as the art of pacing and the build-up of tension towards a clearly defined climax. This resulted in the creation of Storm Clouds Cantata for the climactic scene in The Man Who Knew Too Much where it was necessary for the music and visuals to communicate to viewers, with barely any
dialogue, the psychological struggle of the heroine and a crucial turning point in the film’s drama. Techniques which had served Benjamin well in his task to address this challenge included the use of clear, easy to identify leitmotif combined with their thoughtful placing and development through variation (refer to section 4.2). Manipulation of key, chromaticism, dissonance and rhythm also played an important part in serving to express as clearly as possible, the various degrees of suspense and resolution inherent in the drama. This musical approach to the shaping of drama was first clearly established in Benjamin’s early film music and was consolidated further by the close of the first film period.

Benjamin’s perception of drama altered through his work in film, and the compositional techniques that served to express his new mode of thinking were modified in response. These changes, indentified in chapter four, were immediately transferred to the genres of orchestra and opera, which suggested he had found his work as a film composer stimulating and beneficial. His developed sense of drama now shaped his choice of motifs, their setting, their development through variation and their careful placing in both the orchestral and opera genres. A similar trend was displayed with regard to his use of key, chromaticism, dissonance and rhythm. These elements, as discussed in chapters six and seven, served to express the varying degrees of tension or resolution in the musical drama and were first applied in his film scores before being absorbed into his orchestral and operatic scores. Structured use of related tonalities on a broader scale provided a secure tonal background or base for a composition and these, combined with the thoughtful placing of themes and motifs, created post-film scores that were more coherent and clear in architecture than those from the pre-film period. A score’s coherence and clarity of form were qualities Benjamin developed a greater awareness of when he created music for films as these were issues (as presented in chapter three) much debated by musicians and film music critics in the 1930s and 40s.
This discussion arose from the music's potential fragmentation when many British directors chose to exclude music from scenes dominated by dialogue and natural sound (see chapter three).

In many ways, Benjamin's intensive four year period of work in the British film industry was a composition lesson that appealed to his great love of the stage. As observed in chapter four, Hitchcock was an important teacher in matters concerning the psychological drama and in building suspense, and the very nature of film challenged Benjamin's ability to clearly convey crucial information to viewers that clarified elements of a drama or documentary. These skills, together with the ability to structure music clearly and coherently, were aspects that Benjamin regarded as equally applicable and desirable for his orchestral works and operas which he had come to regard as genres capable of similar dramatic expression.

The timing of Benjamin's involvement with the emerging art of film music for sound pictures, coinciding with his emerging voice as a mature composer, may well be unique. Many other British composers such as Bliss and Vaughan Williams also composed for film but their compositional style and stature as composers was already established. In Bliss's case, his involvement in Things to Come (1935) was, like Benjamin, early in the development of film music for talkies, but the work was not regarded by Bliss as art of any real intrinsic value. Vaughan Williams embraced the medium with more enthusiasm but at a considerably later date with his first film 49th Parallel, released in 1941. Even if these circumstances are not a match for Benjamin's, it would be unwise to think that no other composers of his generation were affected by the medium of film which was arguably the most exciting new art form to emerge in the twentieth century. Rebecca Leydon's doctoral thesis 'Narrative Strategies in Debussy's Late Style' (McGill University (Canada), 1997) drew the conclusion that the silent cinema provided Debussy with an alternative source of narrative suitable for shaping musical ideas. It
is therefore possible to conclude that despite the disregard in some quarters towards the value of film music, the medium of film, even from its early days, was providing a powerful catalyst for the creative minds of musicians.

This study focuses on a select number of compositions created just prior to Benjamin's first film music period from 1934–37 and, as much as possible, shortly afterwards these years. It has been proven that changes in his film music served a new dramatic impetus that was directly applied to consequent orchestral scores and opera. Matters concerning orchestration and counterpoint were again employed shortly afterwards in the orchestral compositions he was writing after the first intensive foray into film composition. His approach to orchestration and counterpoint was partly subject to the technical restrictions of the early microphones used in film production and like most equipment in our technological age, the forward motion of progress was fast. This accounts for why a perusal of Benjamin's later orchestral works, such as his Symphony, which he began composing in 1939 soon after he left England to reside in Canada, reveal a swing back to a more liberal use of the strings. They do not, however, return to their original level of dominance and non-integration as seen in the pre-film scores, and the use of the other sections of the orchestra—woodwind, brass and percussion—remain consistent with their use in the film scores.

The influence of Benjamin's film music on his orchestral and operatic works marks the beginning of a broader assessment of his compositions and of a re-evaluation of his place amongst other composers of his generation. Most of the interest so far in this reappraisal has been welcomed by individuals in England and in Australia, the land of his birth, where there has been minimal awareness of his achievements as a composer. A fast growing curiosity is awakening about an artist to whom Australia will soon give a rightful place in the pages of its musical history.
Bibliography

Published books and articles (including newspapers)


Affelder, Paul. Programme notes on Everest recording of Quasi una Fantasia and Concertino (SDBR-3020).


Bligh, Stanley. ‘Noted English Composer will Reside in Vancouver’, *Vancouver Sun,* July 19, 1939.
—‘Symphony, Led by Benjamin, Scores Big Hit’, *Vancouver Sun,* November 20, 1939.
—‘Symphony Orchestra Acclaimed’, *Vancouver Sun,* February 12, 1940 (Vancouver Symphony Archives).
—‘City Women’s Composition Makes Debut’, *Vancouver Sun,* March 9, 1943.
—‘Young Artists Score in Final ‘Nine o’Clock’, *Vancouver Sun,* December 13, 1943.
—‘Benjamin Influenced City Music’, *Vancouver Sun,* April 16, 1960.


Glanville-Hicks, Peggy. 'Larry Adler', *New York Herald Tribune*, December 9, 1953.


—Programme notes by Herbert Howells for the Lyrita CD (REAM.2109).


Hunter, Percy. ‘Yesterday’, *Turn of the Century*, date unknown (newspaper clippings from Jan and Colin Piper, descendants of the Benjamin family).


Lewis, Professor Anthony. ‘Mrs. Louise Hanson Dyer’ (obituary), *The Times*, November 17, 1962.


—‘Concert and Recital Reviews,’ *Australian Musical News and Digest*, October 2, 1950: 20.


—'Aspects of Film Music', Tempo, No. 9 (December 1944): 7–9.


Munro, Ian. Sleeve-notes for the Tall Poppies CD TP105.


Sloman, Dr. Albert. ‘Obituary: Mr Cedric Cliffe’, The Times, June, 27, 1969.


Talbot, John. CD notes to 'Songs of Springtime' issued by the British Music Society (BMS417CD).


Waterhouse, John C. G. (bibliography with Virgilio Bernardoni and James Streicher). ‘Franco Alfano’, *The New Grove Dictionary of


**Arthur Benjamin’s published articles, radio scripts and programme notes**


‘ABC Guest of Honour’ (radio script) transmitted on October 15, 1950 on 2FC (National Archive of Australia, series no. SP369/1).


Notes for ABC chamber music recital program on September 18, 1950 (National Archives of Australia, SP 1011/2. Item 208).


‘A Tale of Two Cities’, (radio script) transmitted April 13, 1953 on BBC Third Programme (Benjamin Estate).


‘Meet the Composer’, (radio script) transmitted November 12, 1956 on BBC Home Service (Schools) (BBC Written Archives).


BBC Interview by Denys Gueroult, September 21, 1959 (British Library Sound Archive, BBC reference LP24707).

Unknown authors of articles for dictionaries, newspapers, magazines and journals (listed alphabetically under publication)

‘Decline in Culture: Composer’s Charges’, The Argus (Melbourne), November 19, 1929.


‘Only the Creation of Music can make us a Musical Nation’, Australian Musical News, No. 41 (October 1950): 34.

‘Untitled’, Brisbane Courier, January 9, 1899.


'CBR Symphony to Premiere Benjamin Work', *CBC Programme Schedule*. Week of March 3, 1946.

'Arthur Benjamin Directs Farewell Concert', *CBC Program Schedule*. Week of March 31, 1946.


*The Home*, June 1922: 8.


'Composer Benjamin is Wary of Fame', *Sydney Morning Herald*, August 1, 1959.

'Ursula Howells' (obituary), *Telegraph*, November 1, 2005.


'Music: M. Ysaye’s Concert', *The Times*, October 18, 1909.

'A Scherzo from the Trenches', *The Times*, December 12, 1916.


'Kreisler’s Return: Triumph at Queen’s Hall', *The Times*, May 5, 1921.

'Two New Compositions', *The Times*, July 16, 1925.
'Concerts: Queen’s Hall', *The Times*, February 1, 1926.
'Week-end Concerts', *The Times*, October 18, 1926.
'Recitals of the Week', *The Times*, June 3, 1927.
'Music this Week: Operas and a New Symphony', *The Times*, December 6, 1927.
'Promenade Concerts', *The Times*, September 3, 1928.
'Music this Week', *The Times*, November 30, 1931.
'Jubilee of R.C.M.', *The Times*, May 11, 1933.
'Royal College of Music: Opera in the Jubilee Celebrations', *The Times*, June 5, 1933.
'Mr Herman Klein: Music Critic, Teacher and Writer' (obituary), *The Times*, March 12, 1934.
'Miss Nora Gruhn’s Song Recital', *The Times*, February 9, 1938.
'Recitals of the Week: Modern English Songs', *The Times*, February 11, 1938.
'Concerts: Miss Ruth Parker and Miss Georgette Petit', *The Times*, March 12, 1938.
'Festival Hall: Jamaica Relief Fund Concert', *The Times*, November 28, 1951.
'Mr. Arthur Benjamin’s ‘Manana’: Opera Commissioned for B.B.C.', *The Times*, January 18, 1956.
'Musicians for Peace', *The Times*, August 12, 1957.
'Andrée Howard: Choreographer and dancer' (obituary), *The Times*, April 20, 1968.
'Norman Lindsay: Painter and novelist' (obituary), *The Times*, November 22, 1969.


'Composer Sees Vancouver as Music Centre', *Vancouver Sun*, August 11, 1939.
Untitled. *Vancouver Sun*, November 1, 1940.
'Benjamin Work to be Given at next Symphony Concert', *Vancouver Sun*, November 7, 1942.
'Musical Club Rare Program', *Vancouver Sun*, November 7, 1942.
'Piano Recital at University', *Vancouver Sun*, July 31, 1943.
'Tilt at Symphony Here Creates Stir', *Vancouver Sun*, May 31, 1945.
'Benjamin in Final Symphony Concert', *Vancouver Sun*, March 30, 1946.
'Arthur Benjamin is Acclaimed in Britain', *Vancouver Sun*, April 2, 1949.
‘City’s Musical Status Lauded,’ *Vancouver Province*, January 26, 1942.

‘Sunday Concert for Armed Forces’, *Vancouver Province*, April 10, 1943.

‘School of Music for West Vision of Noted Pianist,’ *Victoria Colonist*, January 24, 1940.


**Letters**


Adler, Larry. Letter to Arthur Benjamin, June 12, 1953 (Benjamin Estate).
—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, November 4, 1957 (Benjamin Estate).


—Letter to Herbert Howells, September 10, 1917 (RCM Library, Herbert Howells papers).
—Letter to Herbert Howells, December 11, 1917 (RCM Library, Herbert Howells papers).
—Letter to Herbert Howells, April 15, 1918 (RCM Library, Herbert Howells papers).
—Letter to Herbert Howells, June 1, 1918 (RCM Library, Herbert Howells papers).
—Letter to Mr Strecker, March 27, 1928 (Schott Archive).
—Letter to Adrian Boult, March 1, 1931 (Benjamin Estate)
—Letter to Adrian Boult, March 1, 1931 (BBC Written Archives, Composer: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1927–39).
—Letter to Leslie Boosey, November 20, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
—Letter to Ralph Hawkes, February 6, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
—Letter to Ralph Hawkes, February 22, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
—Letter to Ralph Hawkes, April 11, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
—Letter to Leslie Boosey, October 6, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
—Letter to Leslie Boosey, July 21, 1941 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
—Letter to Leslie Boosey, November 4, 1942 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
—Letter to Leslie Boosey, March 24, 1943 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
—Letter to Leslie Boosey, August 30, 1944 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
—Letter to Reed College, October 12, 1944 (Reed College Archives).
—Letter to Herbert Howells, December 29, 1944 (RCM Library, Herbert Howells papers).
—Letter to Heinsheimer, November 17, 1946 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
—Letter to Boosey & Hawkes, December 3, 1946 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
—Letter to Ernest Chapman, March 8, 1947 (British Library, Add. 62948 f.95).
—Letter to Mr Heinsheimer, May 4, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
—Letter to Ralph & Clare Hawkes, August 27, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
—Letter to Ralph Hawkes, September 21, 1947 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).
—Letter to Ralph Hawkes, April 5, 1948 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
—Letter to Ralph Hawkes, June 12, 1948 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
—Letter to Jean Coulthard, August 17, 1948 (University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard File 1-3).
—Letter to Jean Coulthard, January 16, 1949 (University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard File 1-3).
—Letter to Jean Coulthard, April 25, 1949 (University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard file 1-3).
—Letter to Ralph Hawkes, August 2, 1949 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
—Letter to Don Adams, November 26, 1949 (University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard File 1-3).
—Letter to Ralph Hawkes, September 2, 1950 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
—Letter to Bob Holton, October 20, 1952 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
—Letter to Fred Blanks, July 1, 1953 (memorabilia of Fred Blanks).
—Aerogram to Donald Friend, August 20, 1957 (Australian National Library, MS 5959–38).
—Aerogram to Donald Friend, undated (Australian National Library, MS 5959–38).
—Letter to Frank Hutchens, November 25, 1957 (National Library of Australia, MS 2066 Series 1/28 (Folio)).
—Letter to Joseph Post, December 11, 1958 (National Archives of Australia, SP 827/2).
—Letter to Joseph Post, December 22, 1958 (National Archives of Australian, SP827/2).
—Letter to David Adams, April 23, 1959 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).


—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, December 5, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, October 25, 1944 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).

—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, July 6, 1950 (Benjamin Estate).


Dilworth, Ira. Letter to Arthur Benjamin, April 9, 1946 (Benjamin Estate).
—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, June 20, 1946 (Benjamin Estate).


Fleming, Robert. Letter to his parents, October 10, 1937 (memorabilia of Margaret Fleming).
—Letter to his parents, October 20, 1937 (memorabilia of Margaret Fleming).
—Letter to his parents, November 2, 1938 (memorabilia of Margaret Fleming).
—Letter to his parents, November 4, 1943 (memorabilia of Margaret Fleming).


—Letter to Kenneth Wright undated (BBC Written Archives, Composer: Arthur Benjamin File 1, 1927-39).

—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, February 1, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, February 8, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, February 19, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, April 16, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
—Letter to Ralph Hawkes, July 2, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, December 20, 1940 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, July 31, 1941 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, August 12, 1942 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).
—Letter to Leslie Boosey, November 4, 1942 (Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file).


Holton, Bob to Arthur Benjamin, October 7, 1958 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).
—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, October 9, 1959 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence file).


Primrose, William. Letter to Benjamin, August 4, 1942 (Benjamin Estate).


Salter, Lionel. Letter to Leon Lovett, August 13, 1958 (BBC Written Archives, T13/419/1 Opera: Tale of Two Cities).
—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, November 26, 1958 (BBC Written Archives, T13/419/1 Opera: Tale of Two Cities).


Wright, Basil. Letter to Arthur Benjamin, July 1, 1948 (Benjamin Estate).

—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, March 5, 1949 (Benjamin Estate).
—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, January 6, 1953 (Benjamin Estate).
—Letter to Head of Music Production (Lionel Salter), July 29, 1957 (BBC Written Archives, T13/419/1 Opera: Tale of Two Cities).
—Letter to Arthur Benjamin, July 29, 1957 (BBC Written Archives, T13/419/1 Opera: Tale of Two Cities).


**Interviews, e-mails & conversations sent to and given to the author**

Arlen, Nancy. Interview with the author April 9, 2001 and questionnaire given by Ken and Grace Fraser on the author’s behalf, September 22, 2003.

Boustead, Sylvia (Alan Boustead's wife). Telephone conversation with the author, April, 30, 2009.

Brownell, Andrew (Nellie Tholan's pupil). E-mail sent the author, June 15, 2009.


Duker, Vernon. Interview with the author, June 12, 2002.

Hall, Lloyd. Interview with the author, September 14, 2003.

Horovitz, Joseph. Interview with the author, January 28, 2002.

Howells, Ursula. Interview with the author, July 1, 2002.


Jutte, Carol. Interview with the author, November 22, 2002.


Piper, Jan. E-mail dated April 13, 2005 (wife of Colin Piper who is a descendant of the Benjamin family).

Poole, Antony. Interview with the author on January 7, 2003.


Wood, Mike. E-mail to the author, December 3, 2004.


Other sources

Scores and manuscripts from which music examples have been cited

—Concerto for violin and orchestra. OUP, 1932 for the violin and piano score. Boosey & Hawkes, 1932 for the full score.
— *The Devil Take Her* (one-act opera). Boosey & Hawkes, 1932.
— *Overture to an Italian Comedy*. Orchestra. Boosey & Hawkes, 1938.
— *Suite for Piano*. OUP, 1927.


Films referred to (listed alphabetically under title)

*As You Like it*. Paul Czinner. TCF/Inter-Allied. 1936
*Coal Face*. Alberto Cavalcanti. GPO Film Unit. 1935.
*Comradeship*. Maurice Elvey. Stoll Film Company. 1919
*Dangerous Moonlight*. Brian Desmond Hurst. RKO. 1941.
*Fire Down Below*. A Warwick Film Production/Columbia. 1957.
*49th Parallel*. Michael Powell. GFD/Ortus. 1941.
*Goodbye Mr Chips*. Victor Saville. MGM British. 1939.
King Kong. Merian C. Cooper and Ernest B. Schoedsack. RKO. 1933.
Night Mail. Basil Wright and Harry Watt. GPO Film Unit. 1936
Song of Ceylon. Basil Wright. Ceylon Tea Board. 1934.
Waltzes from Vienna. Alfred Hitchcock. Tom Arnold. 1933.

Archives and Library Collections

Boosey & Hawkes (London) catalogue cards.

Undated note of fees for ABC concert engagement on Benjamin’s 1950 tour by R. G. Gifford (Australian National Archives, SP 613/1/0).
Friend, Donald. Diary (Australian National Library, MS 5959–38).

London Film Productions Ltd. contract for *The Reign of King George V* January 7, 1935 (BFI Library, special collection).
London Film Productions Ltd. contract for *The Hunt* February 21, 1935 (BFI Library, special collection).

Viewing of BBC Television productions of *Mañana* and *A Tale of Two Cities*. Michael Paige, Senior Researcher, BBC Research Central, Room B116, Television Centre, Wood Lane, London W12 7RJ.

Programme Index-Composers 1945–54 (BBC Written Archives).

'notes for broadcasting news' at the BBC (BBC Written Archives, R27/395 Music General, Opera: A Tale of Two Cities 1952–3).
Publicity statement written October 2, 1958 by unknown person.
(BBC Written Archives, T13/419/1 Opera: Tale of Two Cities).

BBC infax report providing information about *Heritage: March* (Location LNA, 6259 1 R. Program no. SX 25413).


Arthur Benjamin's war record (National Archives, Kew, WO 339/41134).

War diary of the 32nd Battalion Royal Fusiliers (National Archives, Kew, WO 95/2644).

History of No. 99 Squadron RAF (National Archives, Kew, AIR 1/694/21/20/99).

Scholars Register No. 2, 1893–1913 (RCM Library).
Student register (RCM Library).


Sydney Conservatorium Archives, Concert scrapbook.


Interview with Jean Coulthard by William Bruneau, March 12, 1994 (University of British Columbia Archives, 'Coulthard Papers,' West Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada, 1994–8).
Concert programmes

Musica Viva Chamber Music Recital in Sydney on September 18, 1950 (Australian National Archives, SP 1011/2/208).

Orlando's Silver Wedding produced for the Festival of Britain, May 1951 (memorabilia of Joseph Horowitz).

Australia and New Zealand Royal Concert, October 19, 1953 (Benjamin Estate).

Tale of Two Cities performed by the New Opera Company in 1957 (memorabilia of Rev. Clive Cohen).

Concert programme and Benjamin’s cadenza for the first movement of Beethoven's Piano Concerto No. 3 in C minor, op. 37 composed in 1941 for Jack Henderson (British Library, MS MUS 260).

Programme from Fourth Annual Cheltenham Festival of British Contemporary Music Drama Opera Art 1948 (Benjamin Estate).

Programme of Wigmore Hall on June 6, 1925 (RCM Library).

RCM concert programmes for November 13, 1914; November 17, 1938.

Vancouver Symphony Archives, concert programmes for February 11, 1940; March 17, 1942.

Government certificates

Benjamin, Abraham. Death certificate issued by Registry of Births Deaths and Marriages (New South Wales).

Benjamin, Arthur. Birth certificate issued by the Deputy Registrar General of New South Wales, Australia (Benjamin Estate).


Benjamin, Lazarus. Marriage certificate issued by Registry of Births Deaths and Marriages (New South Wales) (memorabilia of Jan Piper).

Benjamin, Abraham and Millicent Menser. Marriage certificate issued by Registry of Births Deaths and Marriages (New South Wales).


Internet Sources


Private Collections

Arthur Benjamin promotional leaflet from the personal memorabilia of Reverend Clive Cohen, Cornwall dating 1925.

Appendix A

Reduction of the main musical events in *A Tale of Two Cities*, act three, scene four, bars 199–463 (Boosey & Hawkes vocal score, 1954)
(Dr. Manette, dazed, goes back to the English group. Madame Defarge enters the witness box.)

(Spoken) Stand down, Dr. Manette.

Mme. D.: When the thing was ended my husband went to a corner cell. Do you know the number? No, I do not guess. I think you can, I think you can, poco a poco cresc. God saw us all.

500 Hundred & Five motif continues. Orchestral accompaniment stays in 12-8 time until bar 253.
I will try to be brief. Twenty years ago and more there lived a honest, of great pride, strange man in a coach and begged him come straightway to a place where a boy lay. It is true, it is true. Doctor, is it true? They took him to reference to 'Marquis de St. Evremonde' motif. How the Lord of heaven? He heard the poor boy's tale: I will try to be brief. Twenty years ago and more there lived a honest, of great pride, strange man in a coach and begged him come straightway to a place where a boy lay. It is true, it is true. Doctor, is it true? They took him to reference to 'Marquis de St. Evremonde' motif. How the Lord of heaven? He heard the poor boy's tale: a peasant boy with a sword thrust through his side, half-mad with fear, at the point of 'Anguish' motif. A peasant boy with a sword thrust through his side, half-mad with fear, at the point of 'Anguish' motif.
4

Subito allegro

— O ad lib. r  303

hands on a peasant girl, boy.

ff f molto stentente

Allegro

how the boy, as armed had raised his hand against the Lord, how the Lord of the Debigon.

f f p p colla voce

Lento Allegro

It is true, it is true.

f f

'Vengence' motif

Lento

It is true, it is true.

ff 'Vengeance' motif
He would of the promise. That night he disappeared, because he knew the secret guilt of the Lord of the reference to 'Marquis de Senoio'.

For fifteen years he lay in the Bastille:

The story I have told.

It is true. Then told us what was the secret of the Lord of the reference to 'Marquis de St. Dennis' merit.
Chorus

336-38 Allegro (Allegro molto)

Mme. D.

Ritornello

360-38 Allegro molto

Mme. D.

Ah, you are a man.

Ah, if you have a heart,

Ah, if you love her,

Reference to 'Death Sentence' rhythm
Jacques converses with the assessors. Lucie gives a cry and collapses. Prosper and Sydney Carton go to her aid, and help her back to her place.

Aricora meno mosso

Has not, my story been told you of the cause?

Allegro

I am the sister of them both.

The sister of that resished girl, the sister of that

mer-dead boy!

Have I no heart? Have I no heart?

Ci - li-zem Pres-i-dent, I in - voice the jus - tice of the Re - pub - lic.
Accel. a tempo allegro

death to the prisoner Charles Dar

the court is gathered. in the name of the republic, the sentence of the court on Charles de Varville, duke of St. 

let us mourn.

let him a -

the crowd goes out jubilantly.

Ah, let us hang.

chorus: you must bow at our power.

poco a poco dim
Ah, let 'em hang, let 'em hang, let 'em hang. The Day has dawned, The Son of Liberty is bright.

Quasi Marcia Funèbre

Senza tempo, senza rítmo, quasi cadenza

(Now, Doc - let save him now! ‘Cloud motif

This chord is held during entire cadenza)
Appendix B

Arthur Benjamin’s scores

Information has been sourced from manuscripts and printed scores. Other sources have been duly acknowledged.

A Babe is Born
Instrumentation: Carol for SATB.
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: Dye-line of copyist’s manuscript at British Library, MS MUS 259.
Details: Dedicated to Burton L. Kurth and his Choir, Christmas 1940.

Arabesque (The Muted Pavane)
Instrumentation: Violin and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Stainer & Bell Ltd., 1925.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedicated to Sybil Eaton. On the last page of the printed score “Beare Green 1924”.

Ballade
Instrumentation: String orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1951.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Printed in the score “This work was written for and first performed by the Boyd Neel Orchestra in 1948”. The Ballade was premiered by the Boyd Neel String Orchestra on the BBC Third Programme on February 6, 1948.1 A letter from Benjamin to Ralph and Clare Hawkes on August 27, 1947, indicates the work was complete by this date: “I have written a ‘Ballade’ for Strings. Boyd Neel asked me for a work.”2

Before Dawn
Words by Walter de la Mare.
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: J. Curwen & Sons Ltd., 1924.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedicated to Dorothea SMWEBB. Poulton notes that Gerard Williams arranged this song for string orchestra.3

Brumas Tunes
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1950.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Illustrations by Yaholkovsky.

Callers
Words by Caryl Brahms from The Moon on My Left.
Instrumentation: Unison voices & piano.

2 Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files.
Captain Stratton's Fancy
Words by John Masefield.
Instrumentation: Baritone and orchestra.
Publisher: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Performed at RCM, November 13, 1914.4

Caribbean Dance
Instrumentation: Two pianos.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1949.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Dedicated to Joan and Valerie Trimble. On last page of manuscript is inked “Vancouver, June 1946”. Arrangement is based on two Jamaican folk-songs Linstead Market and Hold 'im Joe. First performed by Joan and Valerie Trimble in London on November 1947.5

Carnavalesque (Valse)
Instrumentation: Violin and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Stainer & Bell Ltd., 1925.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: On last page of printed score “Sydney 1921”.

Chinoiserie (Gavotte & Musette)
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1936 (Winthrop Rogers Edition).
No. 6 in the Concert Series for Piano.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: On the first page of the manuscript, the word Gavotte is scribbled out. Dedicated to Irene Kohler.

Clarinet Quintette in C minor
Instrumentation: Clarinet and string quartet.
Publisher: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 263.
Details: Written in ink on the first page of the first movement of the manuscript is “Nov. 28th '13” and at the end of the third movement “June 19th [1914]”.

Concertino for piano and orchestra
Publisher & year of publication: Schotts, 1928.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Concertino was composed in 1927 at Schott’s request and was premièred in Düsseldorf in early 1928.6

Concerto for Harmonica and Orchestra
Publisher: Boosey & Hawkes, 1957.
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 261.

4 Concert programme (RCM library).
6 Paul Affelder. Programme notes on Everest recording of Quasi una Fantasia and Concertino (SDBR-3020).
Details: On the first page of the printed score "Written for and dedicated to Larry Adler". Dates written on the manuscript indicate the final movement was completed in London, July 1, 1953.

Concerto for Oboe and Strings (Cimarosa)
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1942.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedicated to Evelyn Barbirolli. 'Free arrangements' by Arthur Benjamin of Domenico Cimarosa's keyboard sonatas. First performed by Léon Goossens (oboe) and Basil Cameron conducting the London Philharmonic Orchestra at a Promenade Concert on July 22, 1942 in the Royal Albert Hall, London.

Concerto quasi una fantasia for piano and orchestra
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1952.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Written in ink on final page of manuscript "Finale. London Summer 1949". The first performance was given by Arthur Benjamin (piano) with Sir Eugene Goossens conducting the Sydney Symphony Orchestra on September 5, 1950.

Concerto for violin and orchestra
Instrumentation: Violin and Orchestra.
Publisher: Oxford University Press, 1932 for the violin and piano score. Boosey & Hawkes, 1932 for the full score.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedicated to 'William Walton with great admiration'. On the last page of the printed violin and piano score are the words "London January 1931". First performance was given by Antonio Brosa with Benjamin conducting the BBC Symphony Orchestra in a BBC studio performance on January 29, 1933.

Cotillon
Instrumentation: Orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1939.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Written in ink on manuscript "Based on tunes found in 'The Dancing Master’ published by W. Pearson and John Young in London 1719". First performed by Clarence Raybould conducting the BBC Symphony Orchestra in a studio performance on February 3, 1939.

The Devil Take Her (one-act opera)
Words by Alan Collard and John B. Gordon with lyrics for the 'Blind Beggar’s Song' and the 'Drinking Song' by Cedric Cliffe.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1932.
Location of manuscript: British Library MS MUS 250–63.
Details: Dedicated to Sir Hugh Allen. The first performance was conducted by Sir Thomas Beecham at the RCM on December 1, 1931 under the auspices of the Ernest Palmer Opera Fund.

---

7 This is the wording used on the published score.
9 Ibid.: 211.
10 Ibid.: 208.
**Diaphenia**  
Words by Henry Constable.  
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.  
Publisher & year of publication: J. Curwen & Sons Ltd., 1924.  
Location of manuscript: —  
Details: Dedicated to John Coates.

**Dirge**  
Words by David MacCaughie.  
Instrumentation: SATB.  
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1942 (Boosey’s Modern Festival Series No. 481).  
Location of manuscript: —  
Details: Dedicated to Ira Dilworth. In a letter to Leslie Boosey dated October 6, 1940, Benjamin mentions work on this composition.\(^\text{11}\)

**Divertimento on Themes by Gluck**  
Instrumentation: Oboe and string orchestra.  
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1952.  
Location of manuscript: British Library MS MUS 260.  
Details: Dedicated to Mitchell Miller. Written in ink on last page of manuscript “At sea, between Bombay and Sydney 1950”. Freely adapted from various movements from Six Sonatas for two violins and figured bass by Gluck published in London in 1746.

**Divertimento for Wind Quintet**  
Publisher: Unpublished.  
Location of manuscript: —  
Details: *Divertimento for Wind Quintet* was premiered by the Melos Ensemble at Cheltenham Town Hall as part of the Cheltenham Festival on July 5, 1960.\(^\text{12}\)

**The Dreaming of the Day**  
Instrumentation: Voice, oboe and string quartet.  
Publisher: Unpublished.  
Location of manuscript: British Library MS MUS 259.  
Details: The following words written in ink on the manuscript suggests the music was composed for the film *Wings of the Morning* as it reads “(New World production) ‘Wings’ 11.10.36”.

**Elegaic Mazurka**  
Instrumentation: Piano solo.  
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1942.  
Location of manuscript: —  
Details: The words “Vancouver 1941” are printed on the last page of the printed score. This work appears as one of sixteen piano solos in a collection titled *Homage to Paderewski*. Other composers who contributed to the collection included Milhaud, Britten and Goossens.

**The Emigrant**  
Words by John Masefield.  
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.  
Publisher: Unpublished.  
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.

---

\(^{11}\) Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file.  
**Endeavour**
Words by Cedric Cliffe.
Instrumentation: Two-part voices and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1955 (Boosey’s Modern Festival Series No. 179).
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: On the first page of the printed score “Written for and dedicated to Trevor Harvey and the Hornchurch School’s 10th Music Festival”. Another manuscript at the Benjamin Estate with the lyrics omitted includes the date “20 November 1954”.

**Études-Improviséées**
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: Handwritten copy of manuscript by Lamar Crowson (Benjamin Estate).
Details: The *Études-Improviséées* were originally intended to be ten in number but only eight were recorded by Lamar Crowson for Lyrita in February 1960. This recording has recently been re-released by Lyrita (REAM.2109).

**Fanfare for a Festive Occasion**
Instrumentation: Brass.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1938–9.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Performed at the wedding of Princess Elizabeth and Prince Philip on November 20, 1947.

**Fanfare for a Brilliant Occasion No. 2**
Instrumentation: Brass.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1953.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Published in *Six Ceremonial Fanfares No. 2*.

**Fanfare for a Brilliant Occasion**
Instrumentation: Brass.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1953.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Published in *Six Ceremonial Fanfares No. 3*.

**Fanfare for a State Occasion**
Instrumentation: Brass.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1953.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Published in *Six Ceremonial Fanfares No. 1*.

**Fantasies** for piano solo. Book 1
1. ‘A Cloudlet—Like a Swan it Sailed’ 2. ‘A Song with a Sad Ending’ 3. ‘Soldiers in the Distance’.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes (Winthrop Rogers Edition), 1933.
Location of manuscript: —

**Fantasies** for piano solo. Book 2
1. ‘Waltz’ 2. ‘Silent and Soft and Slow Descends the Snow’ 3. ‘A Gay Study’.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes (Winthrop Rogers Edition), 1933.

---

13 Program notes by Herbert Howells for the Lyrita CD (REAM.2109): 9.
Location of manuscript: —

The Fire of your Love
Words by Frank Eyton.
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1947.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: This song was sung in the film Master of Bankdam by Maria Var. Poulton notes that this song is also available in an arrangement by G. Stacey for small orchestra.15

Five Negro Spirituals
1. 'I'm a-Trave'lin to the Grave' 2. 'March on' 3. 'Gwine to Ride up in the Chariot' 4. 'I'll Hear the Trumpet Sound' 5. 'Rise Mourners'.
Instrumentation: Cello and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: OUP, 1924 and taken over by Boosey & Hawkes, 1956.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: A transcription of these for violin and piano by William Primrose was published by OUP, 1929.

For Amusement Only
Instrumentation: Orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Premièred in Nottingham on October 7, 1958 (note by unknown author in Composer File 2: 1940–60. BBC Written Archives).

Forest Peace
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1945.
Location of manuscript: —

Four Pieces for Solo Piano
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 263.
Details: Written in ink on manuscript “November ’10”.

Haunted House
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1945.
Location of manuscript: —

Heritage (Ceremonial March)
Words by Arthur Lewis.
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1952.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: On the last page of the manuscript is written “London January 1935”. Also available as a Ceremonial March for orchestra or in a version for chorus and orchestra from Boosey & Hawkes. Composed to commemorate the Silver Jubilee of the reign of H. M. King George V in 1935.16

---

16 BBC infax report providing information about Heritage: March (Location LNA, 6259 1 R. Program no. SX 25413).
**Hey Nonny No!**
Words from Christchurch 16th century manuscript.
Instrumentation: Voice & piano.
Publisher & year of publication: J. Curwen & Sons Ltd., 1923.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedicated to John Coates.

**Humoresque**
Instrumentation: Violin and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Stainer & Bell Ltd., 1925.
Location of manuscript: —

**Jamaicalypso**
Instrumentation: Two pianos.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1957.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: First broadcast performance by Joan and Valerie Trimble on October 6, 1957. Arrangement for orchestra was first performed by the BBC Concert Orchestra conducted by Vilem Tausky in the Royal Festival Hall, London on May 31, 1958 as part of the BBC Light Music Festival.17

**Coco Calypso**
English words by Cedric Cliffe and French version by Mr. Sannier-Salabert.
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1957.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.

**Jamaicalypso**
Instrumentation: Small orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Written in ink on the last page of the manuscript are the words "Ceylon Feb 19" and there is an inter-departmental communication from Ralph Hawkes to Mr C. Rosen lodged in its pages which refers to the work and is dated April 16, 1958.

**Jamaican Rumba**
Instrumentation: Two pianos.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes (Winthrop Rogers Edition), 1938.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Dedicated to Joan and Valerie Trimble.

**Jamaican Rumba**
Instrumentation: Violin and piano arranged by William Primrose.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1944.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Dedicated to Jascha Heifetz.

**Jamaican Song**
Instrumentation: Orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1940.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: *Jamaican Song* is an orchestrated version of the two piano work *Mattie Rag* from *Two Jamaican Street Songs* that was later published in 1944.

---

Jan (A Creole melody)
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, voice and piano, and voice and orchestra, 1947.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: On the first page of the printed score "This Folk-song was taken down by me from the singing of Mr. Rudolf Camacho to whom the setting is dedicated. A. B." First performance of voice and orchestra version by Jenny Tourel (soprano) and the BBC Theatre Orchestra conducted by Walter Goehr in London, 1947.18

Kate Greenaway Songs
Words by Kate Greenaway from Under the Windows.
1. 'Bell Song' 2. 'Margery Brown' 3. 'Prince Finikin'.
Instrumentation: Two part children's chorus & piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1937.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Written in ink on the manuscript "Dedicated to Miss Kinley of Winnipeg".

Let's Go Hiking: Five Pieces for Youngsters
1. 'We Set Out' 2. 'The Quiet Countryside' 3. 'A Rest by the Brooklet' 4. 'Village Fair' 5. 'Home Again—in Bed'.
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1936.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.

Light Music. Suite for Orchestra
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1947.
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 250.
Details: A Boosey & Hawkes catalogue printed in 1986 acknowledges this work as having been composed between 1928-35).

Linstead Market
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1947.
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 250.
Details: Dedicated "For Miss Jennie Tourel". Poulton notes the first performance by Jennie Tourel (soprano) and the BBC Theatre Orchestra conducted by Walter Goehr in London, 1947.19 The work was received at Boosey & Hawkes on August 26, 1947.20

Love in E.C.3 (or Poultry)
Instrumentation: Ballet with orchestration marked in piano duet score.
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 250.
Details: Written in ink on the manuscript "A Farrago in the form of a ballet" and "London. November 1932". The ballet's première was conducted by Constant Lambert on May 9, 1933 as part of the RCM Jubilee in the presence of the College's President, the Prince of Wales.21

Manana (one-act opera for television).
Libretto by Caryl Brahms and George Foa adapted from a short story by Caryl Brahms The Juniper Tree.
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.

19 Ibid.: 211.
20 Information supplied by Boosey & Hawkes employee Colin Dunn.
21 'Jubilee of the R.C.M.', The Times, May 11, 1933.
Location of manuscript: A copy of the vocal score manuscript is in Fisher Library, Sydney University M782.1 B468 4.
Details: This was the first British television opera and the performance involving the Glyndebourne Festival Chorus and Edward Renton conducting the Royal Philharmonic Orchestra, was televised on February 1, 1956. A viewing of this production can be arranged through the Senior Researcher, BBC Research Central, Room B116, Television Centre, Wood Lane, London W12 7RJ. A letter from Benjamin to Michael Hurd indicates the first stage of composition was complete by August 17, 1954 with copying and scoring yet to be addressed.22

*Man and Woman*
Words by Peter Anthony Motteux.
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Elkin & Co. Ltd., 1924.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedicated to A. P. H. On the last page of the printed score "London, 1918".

*The Moon*
Words by Hugh McCrae.
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Elkin & Co. Ltd., 1924.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedicated to John Coates. On the last page of the printed score "Beare Green 1923".

*The Mouse*
Words by Hugh McCrae.
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: J. Curwen & Sons Ltd., 1923.
Location of manuscript: —

*Three Mystical Songs*
1. 'I See his Blood upon a Rose'. Words by Joseph Mary Plunkett 2. 'The Mystery'. Words by Ralph Hodgson 3. 'He is the Lonely Greatness'. Words by Madeleine Caron Rock.
Instrumentation: Unaccompanied chorus.
Publisher & year of publication: OUP, 1926 taken over by Boosey & Hawkes, 1956 and published in 1994.23
Location of manuscript: —
Details: The songs were composed in 1925 and the first and third are dedicated to Herbert Howells.24

*Nightingale Lane*
Words by William Sharp.
Instrumentation: SSA and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes (Winthrop Rogers Edition), 1939.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Dedicated to J. Frederic Staton.

*North American Square Dance*
1. Introduction and 'Miller's Reel' 2. The Old Plunk' 3. The Bundle of Straw' 4. 'He Piped so Sweet' 5. 'Fill the Bowl' 6. 'Pigeon on the Pier' 7. 'Calder Fair' 8. 'Salamanca' and Coda.
Instrumentation: Orchestra.

23 Information from Boosey & Hawkes employee Colin Dunn.
24 John Talbot. CD notes to 'Songs of Springtime' issued by the British Music Society (BMS417CD).
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1951.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Score states “Suite for orchestra on Old-time fiddle tunes from Canada and the U.S.A.” Written in ink on the manuscript are the words “London 1948”.

Novelette
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Ascherberg, Hopwood & Crew Ltd., 1913 (Ascherberg Pianoforte School, No. 14b, Series II, Elementary Division).
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Thomas Dunhill, as editor of this series, commissioned the work from Benjamin who was studying with him at the RCM.25

Odds and Ends for the Pianoforte, Book 1.
1. Etude-Prélude 2. ‘A Negro Sings a Glad Song’ (Jubilee Song of the American Negroes) 3. The Quiet Garden.
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Stainer & Bell, 1925.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: ‘Etude-Prélude’ is dedicated to Ursula Mary Lizbeth; ’A Negro Sings a Glad Song’ is dedicated to Shirley; ‘The Quiet Garden’ is dedicated to Mary Helen. The words ‘Beare Green. 1924’ appear on the last page of the printed score.

Odds and Ends for the Pianoforte, Book 2.
1. ‘Legend’ 2. ‘A Negro Sings a Sad Song’ (Jubilee Song of the American Negro) 3. The Hobgoblin.
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Stainer & Bell, 1925.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: ‘Legend’ is dedicated to Allan; ’A Negro Sings a Sad Song’ is dedicated to Pam; ’The Hobgoblin’ is dedicated to Ian. The words “Beare Green. 1924” appear on the last page of the printed score.

Orlando’s Silver Wedding.
Instrumentation: Orchestra (ballet).
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 253 of piano score.
Details: The ballet was premiered at the Festival of Britain in the Amphitheatre of the Pleasure Gardens, Battersea Park in May 1951.26

Our Mr. Toad.
Words by David McCord adapted from the author’s Far and Few.
Instrumentation: Unison voices and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes (Winthrop Rogers Festival Series), 1954.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Dedicated to Heather Sinclair of Concord, Mass.

Overture to an Italian Comedy
Instrumentation: Orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1938.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Written in ink on manuscript “London January 1937”. Dedicated “To my friend, Muir Mathieson”. First performed by Henry Wood conducting the Queen’s Hall Orchestra on March 2, 1937 in Queen’s Hall, London.27

26 Programme (Personal memorabilia of Joseph Horowitz).
**Pastorale, Arioso and Finale**

Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1948.
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 262.
Details: Written in ink on manuscript “This, the first manuscript of this work, is a present to Jack Henderson on his twenty-first birthday. The work was written especially for him by his friend and teacher, Arthur Benjamin, with every wish for a happy and brilliant career” and on the final page “Vancouver - Portland Summer 1943”.

**Pastorale and March**

Instrumentation: Two pianos.
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: A. L. Kelly mentions this work in a review for the *Sydney Opinion* in November 1929 where it was performed by Frank Hutchens and Lindley Evans.28

**To Phillis, Milking her Flock**

Words by William Drummond.
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Elkin & Co. Ltd., 1924.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedicated to Gertrude Johnson. The words “Beare Green 1924” appear on the last page of the printed score.

**The Piper**

Words by Seumas O’Sullivan.
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Elkin & Co. Ltd., 1924.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: The words "Beare Green, 1923" appear on the last page of the printed score. Poulton notes this was also available in an arrangement for flute, voice and piano.29 Dedicated to J. L.

**Piper's Music: The Dancing Schoole**

Instrumentation: Bamboo pipes.
Publisher & year of publication: L’Oiseau Lyre, 1934.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: From tunes taken from *The Dancing Master* London 1719.

**Prelude and Fugue, op. 7**

Transcription of two pieces by Mendelssohn, op. 7.
Instrumentation: Orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1946.
Location of manuscript: —

---

27 Alan Poulton. *Dictionary Catalogue of Modern British Composers*. Vol. I. Westport, Connecticut & London: Greenwood Press, 2000: 206. Poulton believes this was used as an overture to *Prima Donna* but there is no source material to suggest this is the case and the overture has always been performed by Benjamin and others as an orchestral work independent from the opera. David Ewen’s entry on Arthur Benjamin in *Composers Since 1900*. New York: The H. W. Wilson Co., 1969: 50-2 does not make any reference to the opera as he states on page 51 that “The composer had no specific Italian comedy in mind. He sought to depict the bustle and commotion and merriment of Italian life by introducing fragments of Neapolitan folk songs and dances, including a whirling tarantella”.

28 A. L. Kelly. 'About Music', *Sydney Opinion*, No. 2 [November 1929]: 42.

Praeludium in B minor, op. 35
Arrangement of Mendelssohn’s Prelude in B minor, op. 35.
Instrumentation: Orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1949.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: The work was received at Boosey & Hawkes on February 17, 1949.  

Prelude to ‘Holiday’
Instrumentation: Orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1940.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Premiered by Fabian Sevitsky conducting the Indianapolis Symphony Orchestra on January 17, 1941.  

Prima Donna (one-act opera)
Libretto by Cedric Cliffe.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, vocal score and full score, 1935.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Written in ink on manuscript’s cover “August 1933”. First performance given by the London Opera Club, conducted by Arthur Benjamin at the Fortune Theatre, London on February 23, 1949.  

Rainy Day
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1945.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: This work was later included in the collection Brumas Times.  

Rhapsody on Negro Folk Tunes
Instrumentation: Orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 260.
Details: Written in ink on cover of manuscript “To M. Henri Verbrugghen”, then on page one “Brisbane August 1919” and on last page “Finished Aug 20th 1919 Brisbane”.  

Rhapsody in D
Instrumentation: Piano trio.
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: According to Sydney Conservatorium concert scrapbook, Arthur Benjamin (piano), Cyril Monk (violin) and Gladstone Bell (cello) performed this work at the Conservatorium Hall on June 18, 1921 for the Director’s Eleventh Lecture Concert in conjunction with the British Music Society.  

Romantic Fantasy
Instrumentation: Violin and viola solo with small orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1956.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedicated to Arnold Bax. First performed at a Royal Philharmonic Society concert with Eda Kersey (violin), Bernard Shore (viola) and the London Philharmonic Orchestra conducted by Arthur Benjamin on March 24, 1938 in  

30 Information supplied by Boosey & Hawkes employee Colin Dunn.
31 ‘Benjamin Work to be Given at next Symphony Concert’, Vancouver Sun, November 7, 1942.
32 According to information supplied by Boosey & Hawkes employee Colin Dunn.
Queen's Hall, London. The work was ready for the advisory panel at the BBC to listen to as early as May 5, 1936. Boosey & Hawkes record the work as having been taken in 1939 but not published until 1956.

Romance-Impromptu
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Ascherberg, Hopwood & Crew Ltd., 1913 (Ascherberg Pianoforte School, No. 12c, Series II, Elementary Division).
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Thomas Dunhill, as editor of this series, commissioned the work from Benjamin who was studying with him at the RCM.

The Red River Jig
Instrumentation: Orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1947.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Written in ink on cover of manuscript 'To Clare—Christmas 1945'. Poulton notes a first performance by Michael Piastro in New York, 1946.

San Domingo
Instrumentation: Two pianos.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1946.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.

Saxophone-Blues
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Schott's, 1929.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedicated to Herbert Howells.

Scherzino
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1936 (Winthrop Rogers Edition).
No. 1 of part of a Concert series for piano.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Dedicated to Irene Kohler.

Scherzo in B minor
Instrumentation: Clarinet and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: There is mention of Benjamin having performed this work with René S. Caprara (clarinet) at the RCM on November 19, 1914.

Shepherd's Holiday
Words by Elinor Wylie from 'Collected Poems'.
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.

---

35 Information supplied by Boosey & Hawkes employee Colin Dunn.
Publisher & year of publication: Winthrop & Rogers Edition taken over by Boosey & Hawkes, 1936.
Location of manuscript: —

**Siciliana**
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1936 (Winthrop Rogers Edition).
No. 2 of part of a Concert series for piano.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Dedicated to Lance Dossor.

**Sir Christemas**
Words from anon. 15th–16th Century poem.
Instrumentation: Carol for baritone solo and SATB.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes (The Winthrop Rogers Edition of Choral Music for Festivals), 1943.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Dedicated to Burton Kurth.

Sonata for viola and piano (Elegy, Waltz and Toccata)
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1947.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedication reads “Written for and dedicated to William Primrose”. On the final page of the printed score “Vancouver Summer 1942”.

Sonata in E minor for violin and piano
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 263.
Details: Written in ink on manuscript cover “To Miss Marion Scott” and “Composed at Karlsruhe Sept. 1918”. The work was premièred at the RCM, London on March 20, 1919.

Sonatina for violin and piano
Publisher & year of publication: OUP, 1924 then taken over by Boosey & Hawkes, 1957.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedicated to Millicent. On final page of printed score “Beare Green 1924”.

Sonatina for cello and piano
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1939.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedication reads “For Lorne—aged 13”. Lorne Munroe (cello) and Joan Trimble (piano) premièred the work at the RCM on November 17, 1938.

Sonatina for Chamber Orchestra
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1940.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: This work is an orchestration of the Cello Sonatina.

**Song of the Banana Carriers**
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.

40 Concert programme (RCM Library, Concert Programmes).
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1957.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: The printed scores indicates the songs was “Taken down from the singing of Louise Bennett”.

Spring
Words by David MacCaughie.
Instrumentation: SATB.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1942 (Boosey's Modern Festival Series No. 480).
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedicated to Ira Dilworth. In a letter to Leslie Boosey dated October 6, 1940, Benjamin mentions work on this composition.41

Squirrels Parade
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1945.
Location of manuscript: —

String Quartet No.1, Pastoral Fantasy.
Instrumentation: String quartet.
Publisher & year of publication: Stainer & Bell, Ltd., 1924.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: This work received a Carnegie award and was published in the Carnegie Collection of British Music. The words “Beare Green 1923” appear on the last page of the printed score. Pastoral Fantasy received its first performance at the Wigmore Hall on June 6, 1925 as part of a series called the Moeran Chamber Concerts.42

String Quartet No. 2
Instrumentation: String quartet.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1959.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: On the last page of the printed score there are the words “1952 Revised 1956”.

Suite for Flute and Strings by Domenico Scarlatti
Instrumentation: Flute and string orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1946.
Location of manuscript: —

Suite for Piano
Publisher & year of publication: OUP, 1927.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Prelude is dedicated to Harriet Cohen; Air to Hubert J. Foss; Tambourin to Julie Lasdun; Toccata to Pedro Morales. On the last page of the printed score is written “London 1926”.

Symphony
Instrumentation: Orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1947.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: On front page of the manuscript is written “Vancouver B.C.—Portland, Oregon 1944–45”. Dedicated to Ralph Vaughan Williams. Benjamin mentions

41 Boosey & Hawkes, London correspondence file.
42 Concert programme (RCM Library).
having started the Symphony in a letter to Ralph Hawkes dated December 29, 1939 (Boosey & Hawkes, New York correspondence files).

*The Swing*
Words by D. S. Lothhouse.
Instrumentation: SA and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: —
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.43

*A Tale of Two Cities* (Three-act opera)
Libretto by Cedric Cliffe after Dickens's novel.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, full score, 1950–1; vocal score, 1954.
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 252.
Details: Romantic melodrama in six scenes. Dedicated to John Morris. Written in ink on last page of manuscript "London Feb 17 1950".

*A Tall Story*
Words by unknown author.
Instrumentation: Two part song and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes (Winthrop Rogers Edition, Festival Series of Choral Music), 1949.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.

*Tartuffe* (The Imposter)
Libretto adapted by Cedric Cliffe after Molière.
Instrumentation: Three-act opera.
Publisher & year of publication: —
Location of manuscript: Copies of manuscript lodged at British Library, MS MUS 257 and of Benjamin's orchestration of the overture MS MUS 255. A copy of the vocal score and orchestral parts can also be viewed in the RCM library.
Details: Written in pencil on the front page of British Library MS 257 are the words “completed and orchestrated by Alan Boustead” and at the bottom of the page “Produced by Peter Ebert, sets by Oliver Messel, at Sadlers Wells Theatre London 30 Nov. 1964. Conducted by Alan Boustead.”

Theme and Variation for String Quartet
Instrumentation: String Quartet.
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.
Details: Written in ink on last page of the manuscript “London Jan. 10th 1935”.

*Three Dance-Scherzos*
Instrumentation: Orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: —
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 260.
Details: Written in ink on manuscript of first scherzo “To my Mother & Father England 1915” and at the end “Arthur L. Benjamin November 14th 1915”. Written in ink at the start of the second scherzo “To Jeanne England—on furlough 1917 ("Watteau")”. Written in ink at the start of the third scherzo “To F.G.L. & H.N.H. in remembrance of the Russian seasons at Drury Lane, and of happy evenings spent there. Flanders 1916” and at the end “In the field July 4th '16”.

43 According to Boosey & Hawkes (London) catalogue cards.
Three Greek Poems
1. 'The Flower Girl' 2. 'On Deck' 3. 'A Wine Jug'
Words to no. 1 Dionysius 2nd century B.C., no. 2 Theognis 8th century B.C. and no. 3 author unknown. All texts rendered from the Greek by A. C. Benson.
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes (Winthrop Rogers Edition), 1934.
Location of manuscript: —

Three Impressions
1. 'Hedgerow' 2. 'Calm Sea and Mist' 3. 'The Wasp'.
Words by William Sharp.
Instrumentation: Voice and piano, and voice and string quartet version.
Publisher & year of publication: J. Curwen & Sons Ltd., 1925.
Location of manuscript: Voice and string quartet version is in the British Library, MS MUS 259.
Details: Titles in ink on the manuscript of the voice and string quartet version are 'The Wasp', 'The Sea Towards Evening' and 'Winter'. On the final page of the printed voice and piano score for 'The Wasp' and 'Calm Sea and Mist' are the words "Sydney 1920", and for 'Hedgerow"'Beare Green 1924".

Three Little Pieces
1. 'The Tired Dancer' 2. 'White Note Tune' 3. 'Buffoons March'.
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: OUP, 1929.
Location of manuscript: —

Three New Fantasies
1. 'Dance at Dawn' 2. 'March' 3. 'Drifting'
Instrumentation: Piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes (Winthrop Rogers Edition), 1938.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.

Tone Poem for baritone, piccolo, oboe, violin and bass
Publisher & year of publication: Unpublished.
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 259.

Le Tombeau de Ravel (Valse-Caprices)
Instrumentation: Clarinet or viola and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1958.
Location of manuscript: British Library, MS MUS 263.
Details: Written in ink on the inside cover of manuscript "N.B. So as to make the work characteristic of either the Clarinet or Viola, it will be noticed that there are many differences [in the passage work especially] between the two. Thus it cannot be said that either is a transcription of the other. AB." Poulton credits Thea King (clarinet) and Howard Ferguson (piano) as having given the first London performance of the work at Kensington Town Hall on April 29, 1959 as part of the Redcliffe Festival of British Music.44 Benjamin mentions his having finished a 'Waltz-Caprices' for the clarinettist Frederick Thurston in a letter to Jean Coulthard dated January 16, 1949.45

A Tune and Variations for Little People
1. Theme 2. 1st Variation 3. 2nd Variation 4. 3rd Variation 5. Coda.
Instrumentation: Violin and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1939.
Location of manuscript: Boosey & Hawkes.

45 University of British Columbia Library, Jean Coulthard File 1–3.
Two Jamaican Street Songs
1. 'Mattie Rag' 2. 'Cookie'.
Instrumentation: Two pianos.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1944.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedicated to Ethel Bartlett and Rae Robertson.

Waltz and Hyde Park Galop
Instrumentation: Orchestra.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes, 1947.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Taken from the film score for An Ideal Husband, 1947.

Wind’s Work
Instrumentation: Voice and piano.
Publisher & year of publication: Boosey & Hawkes (Winthrop Rogers Edition), 1935.
Location of manuscript: —
Details: Dedication reads “To my friend George Dodds”. 
Appendix C

Films for which Arthur Benjamin composed music

Information has been sourced from Halliwell publications, BFI catalogues and special collections, and from the films themselves.

*The Man Who Knew Too Much*
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Duration: 84 minutes.
Date of release: 1934.
Production company: Gaumont-British Picture Corporation.
Personnel: Alfred Hitchcock (director), Louis Levy (music director).
Major cast list: Leslie Banks, Edna Best, Peter Lorre.
Where to be obtained: Commercial DVD, GMVS Ltd.

*The Scarlet Pimpernel*
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Duration: 98 minutes.
Date of release: 1934.
Production company: London Films.
Personnel: Harold Young (director), Muir Mathieson (music director).
Major cast list: Leslie Howard, Merle Oberon, Raymond Massey, Nigel Bruce.
Where to be obtained: Commercial DVD distributed by DD Home Entertainment.

*Wharves and Strays*
Format: 35 mm., b/w.
Duration: 15 minutes.
Date of release: 1935.
Production company: London Films.
Personnel: Bernard Browne (photographer), Muir Mathieson (music director by arrangement with London Film Productions).
Major cast list: Bernard Browne, Clifford Gulliver, Sydney King, John Lidstone and Angus McPeters.
Where to be obtained: BFI National Archive awaiting restoration but has been viewed by Andrew Youdell of the BFI.

*Clairvoyant*
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Duration: 80 minutes.
Date of release: 1935.
Production company: Gainsborough.
Personnel: Maurice Elvey (director), Louis Levy (music director).
Major cast list: Claude Rains, Fay Wray, Jane Baxter, Ben Field.
Where to be obtained: BFI National Archive.

*Turn of the Tide*
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Duration: 80 minutes.
Date of release: 1935.
Production company: British National Films.
Personnel: Norman Walker (director), Arthur Benjamin (music director).
Where to be obtained: Connoisseur video or BFI Archive.

*The Guv'nor*
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Duration: 88 minutes.
Date of release: 1935.
Production company: Gaumont British.
Personnel: Milton Rosmer (director), Louis Levy (music director).
Major cast: George Arliss, Gene Gerrard, Viola Keats, Patric Knowles, Frank Cellier, Mary Clare, George Hayes.
Where to be obtained: BFI National Archive.

The Reign of King George V
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Date of release: 1935.
Production company: London Films.
Where to be obtained: Currently unavailable.

Lobsters
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Duration: 15 minutes.
Date of release: 1936.
Production company: Bury Productions.
Personnel: John Mathias and László Moholy-Nagy (directors), Muir Mathieson (music director).
Major cast list: Alan Howland (narrator).
Where to be obtained: BFI National Archive.

Wings of the Morning
Format: 35mm., Technicolor.
Duration: 89 minutes.
Date of release: 1937.
Production company: New World Pictures.
Personnel: Harold Schuster (director), Muir Mathieson (music director).
Where to be obtained: BFI National Archive.
Further comment: Poulton claims Lionel Salter orchestrated this score but when the author was not able to locate the source of this information she consulted Poulton. He confirmed the information was not from Salter directly but the possible sources he named did not make any reference to the matter either.

Under the Red Robe
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Duration: 82 minutes.
Date of release: 1937.
Production company: New World Pictures.
Personnel: Victor Sjöström (director), Muir Mathieson (music director).
Major cast list: Conrad Veidt, Annabella, Raymond Massey, Romney Brent, Sophie Stewart.
Where to be obtained: BFI National Archive.

Return of the Scarlet Pimpernel
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Duration: 94 minutes.
Date of release: 1937.
Production company: London Films.
Personnel: Hans Schwartz (director), Muir Mathieson (music director).
Major cast list: Barry K. Barnes, Sophie Stewart, Margaretta Scott, James Mason.
Where to be obtained: Commercial DVD distributed by DD Home Entertainment.

Master of Bankdam (originally titled The Crowthers of Bankdam)
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Duration: 105 minutes.
Date of release: 1947.
Production company: Holbein.
Personnel: Walter Forde (director), Muir Mathieson (music director).
Major cast list: Tom Walls, Anne Crawford, Dennis Price, Stephen Murray, Linden Travers,
Jimmy Hanley, Nancy Price.
Where to be obtained: BFI National Archive.

An Ideal Husband
Format: 35mm., Technicolor.
Duration: 96 minutes.
Date of release: 1947.
Production company: London Films.
Personnel: Alexander Korda (director), Muir Mathieson (music director).
Major cast list: Paulette Goddard, Michael Wilding, Diana Wynyard, Hugh Williams, C.
Aubrey Smith, Glynis Johns, Constance Collier, Michael Medwin.
Where to be obtained: BFI National Archive.

The Cumberland Story
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Duration: 35 minutes.
Date of release: 1947.
Production company: A Crown Film Unit Production.
Personnel: Humphrey Jennings (director), Muir Mathieson (music director).
Major cast list: Amateur actors.
Where to be obtained: BFI National Archive.

Jamaica Problem¹
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Duration: Documentary short.
Date of release: 1947.
Production company: Rank Production (part of This Modern Age Series No. 14).
Personnel: Sergei Nolbandov (producer), J. L. Hodson (associate producer), Muir Mathieson
(music director).
Where to be obtained: BFI National Archive.

Steps of the Ballet
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Duration: 25 minutes.
Date of release: 1948.
Production company: The Crown Film Unit.
Personnel: Muir Mathieson (director and music director).
Major cast list: Andree Howard (choreographer), Arthur Benjamin (composer), Gerd Larsen,
Alexander Grant (Covent Garden), Gordon Hamilton, Elaine Fifield, Michael Bolton (Sadlers
Wells), Robert Helpmann (narrator).
Where to be obtained: Commercial DVD, Beulah.

Conquest of Everest
Format: 35mm., Technicolor.
Duration: 75 minutes.
Date of release: 1953.
Production company: Countryman Films.
Personnel: Thomas Stobart (director), Muir Mathieson (music director).
Major cast list: Members of 1953 Expedition including John Hunt, Edmund Hillary and
Tenzing Norgay.
Where to be obtained: Commercial DVD, Canal.

Melba
Format: 35mm., Technicolor.

¹ Alan Wood in writing about Rank’s This Modern Age refers to a “film on Jamaica” which “was frankly
Duration: 113 minutes.
Date of release: 1953.
Production company: Horizon.
Personnel: Lewis Milestone (director), Muir Mathieson (music director), Arthur Benjamin co-wrote the music with Mischa Spoliansky.
Major cast list: Patrice Munsel, Robert Morley, Alec Clunes, Martita Hunt, Sybil Thorndike, John McCallum.
Where to be obtained: Commercial DVD distributed by DD Home Entertainment.

_Under the Caribbean_ (German title _Unternehmen Xarifa_)
Format: 35mm., Technicolor.
Duration: 87 minutes.
Date of release: 1954.
Personnel: Hans Haas (producer, director and writer), Muir Mathieson (music director).
Major cast: Hans and Lotte Haas.
Where to be obtained: Currently unavailable.

_Above Us the Waves_
Format: 35mm., b/w.
Duration: 99 minutes.
Date of release: 1955.
Production company: Rank Production. A William MacQuitty Production.
Personnel: Ralph Thomas (director), Muir Mathieson (music director).
Major cast list: John Mills, John Gregson, Donald Sinden, James Robertson Justice, Michael Medwin, O. E. Hasse.
Where to be obtained: Commercial DVD, Carlton.

_The Man Who Knew Too Much_ (remake)
Format: 35mm., Technicolor.
Duration: 120 minutes.
Date of release: 1956.
Production company: Paramount.
Personnel: Alfred Hitchcock (director), Bernard Herrmann (music director).
Major cast list: James Stewart, Doris Day, Bernard Miles, Brenda de Banzie, Daniel Gelin, Ralph Truman, Alan Mowbray.
Where to be obtained: Commercial DVD, Universal.

_Fire Down Below_
Format: 35mm., Technicolor.
Duration: 115 minutes.
Date of release: 1957.
Production company: A Warwick Film Production/ Columbia.
Personnel: Robert Parrish (director), Muir Mathieson (music director).
Major cast list: Rita Hayworth, Jack Lemmon, Robert Mitchum.
Where to be obtained: Commercial DVD, Columbia Tri-Star Home Entertainment.

_The Naked Earth_
Format: 35mm., CinemaScope.
Duration: 96 minutes.
Date of release: 1958.
Production company: Foray Films.
Personnel: Vincent Sherman (director), Muir Mathieson (music director).
Major cast list: Richard Todd, Juliette Greco, John Kitzmiller, Finlay Currie, Laurence Naismith, Christopher Rhodes, Orlando Martins.
Where to be obtained: Currently unavailable.
Appendix D

Glossary of names

Addinsell, Richard (1904–77) English composer best known for his film music such as Goodbye Mr Chips (Victor Saville. MGM British. 1939) and the Warsaw Concerto composed for Dangerous Moonlight (Brian Desmond Hurst. RKO. 1941).1

Adler, Larry (1914–2001) American harmonica player that many noted composers such as Vaughan Williams, Darius Milhaud and Malcolm Arnold composed music for and who scored the film Genevieve (Henry Cornelius. GFD/Sirius. 1953).2

Adorno, Theodor (1903–69) German composer, music theorist and critic.3

Alfano, Franco (1875–1954) Italian composer noted for his operas and for having completed Puccini’s Turandot.4

Alwyn, William (1905–85) English composer, flautist and teacher. He was professor of composition at the RAM and his catalogue of works includes over sixty film scores.5

Aprahamian, Felix (1914–2005) English critic, writer, broadcaster and concert organiser of Armenian parentage. Aprahamian was particularly interested in promoting French music in Britain.6

Arlen, Nancy (1909–2003) Australian musical comedy performer.7

Arnheim, Rudolph (1904–2007) Educator, psychologist, art and film theoretician.8

Arnold, Sir Malcolm (1921–2006) English composer whose career included principal trumpet of the LPO, the creation of nine symphonies and whose film score for The Bridge on the River Kwai (David Lean. Columbia. 1957) won him an Oscar. He was knighted in 1993.9

Arundell, Dennis (1898–1988) English opera producer, writer and composer.10

Ashton, Frederick (1904–88) English dancer and choreographer.11

---

Balázs, Béla (1884–1949) Hungarian film music theorist.12

Barbirolli, John Sir (1899–1970) English conductor and cellist of Italian descent. From 1936–42 he was principal conductor of the Philharmonic-Symphony Orchestra of New York then returned to wartime Britain to become principal conductor of the Hallé in Manchester.13

Bath, Hubert (1883–1945) English composer and conductor known for his programmes of popular choral and orchestral works and for his influence as music advisor to the London County Council.14

Bax, Arnold (1883–1953) Composer who studied at the RAM and whose early music reveals an Irish influence. He was knighted in 1937 and appointed Master of the King's Musick in 1942.15

Beecham, Sir Thomas (1879–1961) English conductor who founded the New Symphony orchestra (1906), the Beecham Symphony Orchestra (1908), the LPO (1932) and the RPO (1946). His work before World War I involved collaborating with the Ballets Russes and establishing himself as an operatic impresario.16

Benson, A. C. (1862–1925) English writer who published biographies and had a flair for writing public odes and verses.17

Blanks, Fred (1925–) German born scientist and music critic, journalist and lecturer who settled in Australia in 1938.18

Bligh, Stanley (1883–1975) English organist and music critic who moved to Vancouver in 1924 and worked for the Vancouver Sun newspaper from 1934.19

Bliss, Sir Arthur (1891–1975) English composer best known for works such as A Colour Symphony, the score for the film Things to Come (Alexander Korda. London Films. 1935), the opera The Olympians and the choral work Morning Heroes. Between the years 1942–4 he was Director of Music at the BBC.20

Boosey, Leslie (1887–1979) His music publishing company Boosey & Co. merged to form Boosey & Hawkes in 1930 with whom he remained until 1963.21

Boult, Sir Adrian (1889–1983) Principal conductor of the BBCSO (1930–50) and the LPO from 1950. Boult supported works by British composers and received a knighthood in 1937.22
Boustead, Alan (1931–2002) English conductor and composer.23

Brahms, Caryl (1901–82) English author and song writer whose real name was Doris Caroline Abrahams.24

Brain, Aubrey (1893–1955) Principal horn of the BBCSO and professor of horn at the RAM.25

Bridge, Sir Frederick (1844–1924) English organist, composer, writer and teacher at the RCM.26

Brosa, Antonio (1894–1979) Spanish violinist who formed the Brosa String Quartet, gave the première of Britten’s Violin Concerto in New York (1940) and performed on the ‘Vesuvius’ Stradivari (1727).27

Bush, Alan (1900–95) English pianist and composer who studied with Matthay and Schnabel, and whose operas received a measure of success in Eastern Europe.28

Cameron, Basil (1884–1975) English conductor who assisted Henry Wood in the Promenade Concerts and worked with the BBC SO, LSO, LPO and with orchestras in Europe.29

Caprara, René (1888–1977) Caprara was born in Mauritius and studied clarinet at the Conservatoire in Parma and at the RCM. He performed with the Cape Town Civic Orchestra (1921–7) before devoting the rest of his life to broadcasting interests where he was eventually employed as the first Director General of the South African Broadcasting Corporation (1936–49).30

Carmichael, John (1930–) Australian pianist, composer and music therapist who has long resided in Britain.31


Carr, Emily (1871–1945) Canadian artist and writer inspired by the landscape and the indigenous people. She was a member of the artistic set called the ‘Group of Seven’.33

23 Telephone conversation with Sylvia Boustead (Alan Boustead’s wife) on April, 30, 2009.
Cartier, Rudolph (1904–94) Credited as having been the ‘inventor of television drama’ who produced a range of one hundred and twenty productions for the BBC.34

Chapman, Ernest (1914–83) Employed at Boosey & Hawkes (1934–47) where he was involved as editor of Tempo.35

Cliffe, Cedric (1902–69) Civil servant and classical scholar with a keen interest in music. His wide range of activities included being Director of the BBC Latin American Services, opera librettist and author of the book *The Making of Music*.36

Clifford, Hubert (1904–59) Australian-born composer and conductor who found employment with the BBC (1941–4), the RAM and as Music Director for London Film Productions (1946–50).37

Cohen, Harriet (1895–1967) English pianist who taught at the Matthay School and championed the works of Arnold Bax.38

Collins, Anthony (1893–1963) English conductor, violist and composer. Collins was a notable interpreter of Sibelius and supported British composers’ music in concerts he conducted in Britain and the USA.39

Coulthard, Jean (1908–2000) Canadian composer who studied at the RCM (1928–30) and lectured in composition at the University of British Columbia. Benjamin is credited as having encouraged her to compose for orchestra in 1939.40

Covell, Roger (1931–) Australian critic, educationist and conductor.41

Crowson, Lamar (1926–98) American pianist who studied with Arthur Benjamin at the RCM (1948–50) and later taught as a professor at the RCM and University of Cape Town. Crowson’s career encompassed solo work but he was most celebrated for his abilities as a chamber musician, appearing with the Melos Ensemble and with performers such as Jacqueline du Pré and Itzhak Perlman.42

Davies, Walford (1869–1941) English organist, composer and educational who taught counterpoint at the RCM, was professor of music at the University of Wales, organist at St George’s Chapel in Windsor and adviser to the BBC.43

Dent, Edward (1976–57) Professor of Music at Cambridge (1926–41) with an interest in contemporary music.44

---

36 Dr Albert Sloman. ‘Obituary: Mr Cedric Cliffe’, *The Times*, June, 27, 1969: 12.
Depouilly, Serge (1931–2008) French ballet dancer then union representative of an electrical firm who was introduced to Benjamin through Bernard Sannier-Salabert.45

Dilworth, Ira (1894–1962) Canadian administrator, teacher, editor and conductor who worked most of his life for the CBC which he joined in 1938 and who was also literary executor of the writings of the painter Emily Carr.46

Dossor, Lance (1916–2005) English born pianist who studied at the RCM with Benjamin and after winning a number of European piano competitions in the 1930s, settled in Adelaide, Australia where he taught as professor of piano at the Elder Conservatorium.47

Duker, Vernon (living) Friend of Jack Henderson and Benjamin.

Dunhill, Thomas (1877–1946) English composer who worked as Assistant Music Master at Eton College (1899–1908), toured as examiner for the ABRSM and taught at the RCM.48

Douglas, Keith (1903–49) English conductor and concert impresario. Douglas's many accomplishments included conducting the Royal Carl Rosa Opera Company, being the Honorary Secretary of the Royal Philharmonic Society (1932–47) and Promoter of the Promenade Concerts.49

Dyer, Louise (1884–1962) Australian born patron of music and publisher who lived in France and founded the Lyrebird Press (Editions de l'Oiseau-Lyre) in 1932.50

Eisenstein, Sergei (1898–1948) Russian film director whose successes included the film Alexander Nevsky (Mosfilm. 1938).51

Eisler, Hans (1898–1962) German composer who studied with Schoenberg and whose activities included writing for film and a political commitment to communism.52

Elvey, Maurice (1887–1967) British film director.53


Fleming, Robert (1921–76) Canadian composer, pianist, organist, choirmaster and teacher whose vocal work The Confession Stone (1966) is one of his most popular works.55

50 Professor Anthony Lewis. 'Mrs. Louise Hanson Dyer' (obituary), The Times, November 17, 1962: 10.
54 Ibid.: 410.
Frankel, Benjamin (1906–73) English composer who distinguished himself writing for film and composed his eight symphonies between the year 1958–71.56

Friedman, Ignaz (1882–1948) Polish pianist and composer who toured extensively in Europe, South America and Australia, and appeared with artists such as the violinist Bronislaw Huberman and the cellist Pablo Casals. He settled in Australia in 1940.57

Freifeld, Eric (1919–84) Russian born Canadian artist. Freifeld specialized in drawing and watercolours of city scenes.58

Friend, Donald (1915–89) Australian artist, writer and diarist.59

Goddard, Scott (1895–1965) English music scholar and critic.60

Godfrey, Sir Dan (1868–1939) Principal conductor of the Bournemouth Municipal Orchestra until 1934 and supporter of many British composers. He is author of the book Memories and Music.61

Goldschmidt, Berthold (1903–96) German-born conductor and composer who emigrated to Britain in 1935.62

Goossens, Eugene (1893–1962) Composer, conductor and violinist from a well established musical family, he worked as Beecham's assistant before continuing his conducting career at Covent Garden, and in the USA and Australia.63

Goossens, Leon (1897–1988) English oboist who became principal oboe of the Queen’s Hall Orchestra at the age of seventeen. He was professor of oboe at the RCM and RAM, performed at Covent Garden and with the RPO and LPO, and worked with many of Britain’s major composers including Edward Elgar and Ralph Vaughan Williams.64

Grainger, Percy (1882–1961) Australian pianist and composer with a particular interest in folk-song.65

Grierson, John (1898–1972) British documentary film-maker. Grierson founded the Empire Marketing Board Film Unit in 1930 and worked for the noted GPO Film Unit from 1933.66

Gurney, Ivor (1890-1937) English poet and composer of songs who was admitted to Dartford Insane Asylum (1922-37) where he died. Marion Scott and Herbert Howells were amongst the most ardent supporters of his music.67

Hale, Kathleen (1898-2000) English writer and artist who was best known for her children's books about Orlando the Marmalade Cat.68

Hall, Ernest (1890-1984) English trumpeter who taught at the RCM and was principal trumpet in the LSO and BBC SO.69

Hall, Lloyd (1924-) Jamaican pianist and conductor who studied with Benjamin at the RCM and returned to Jamaica to teach at the Mico and Shortwood teacher's colleges and act as education officer for the Jamaican Ministry of Education.70

Harty, Sir Hamilton (1879-1941) Ulster-born composer, conductor and pianist. He was principal conductor of the Hallé Orchestra (1920-33) and was knighted in 1925.71

Hawkes, Ralph (1898-1950) Music publisher and yachtsman. In 1930 his family firm Hawkes & Sons Ltd., amalgamated with Boosey & Co. Ltd., to create Boosey & Hawkes Ltd., one of the most powerful international music publishing businesses of the 20th century.72

Heifetz, Jascha (1901-87) Virtuoso violinist of Russian birth who toured the world and taught at the University of Southern California, Los Angeles from 1962.73

Heinsheimer, Hans (1900-93) German born music publishing executive and writer on music. In 1938 he moved to America and in the course of his career worked for Universal Edition, Boosey & Hawkes and G. Schirmer.74

Heinze, Sir Bernard (1894-1982) Australian conductor, concert organiser and music educator who studied at the RCM. In Australia, he was involved with many of the Melbourne based orchestras, the ABC, and was director of the NSW Conservatorium (1956-66).75

Helpmann, Robert (1909-86) Australian born ballet dancer, actor and choreographer. Helpmann danced with the Vic Wells Ballet, the Sadler's Wells Ballet and at Covent Garden. Amongst his choreographic creations is the ballet for the film The Red Shoes (Michael Powell and Emeric Pressburger. The Archers. 1948).76

---

Hely-Hutchinson, Victor (1901–47) British composer who first worked for the BBC in 1926, then held the position of Professor of Music at Birmingham (1934–44) before becoming Director of music at the BBC (1944–7).77

Herrmann, Bernard (1911–75) American composer and conductor. Herrmann collaborated with Orson Welles and Alfred Hitchcock and championed the music of Charles Ives.78

Hitchcock, Alfred (1899–1980) British film director who worked in Hollywood from 1940 and became known for his suspense thrillers.79

Honegger, Arthur (1892–1955) Swiss composer associated with Les Six who toured widely in Europe and America in the 1930s, taught at the Ecole Normale de Musique and composed for most musical genres, including film.80

Horovitz, Joseph (1926–) British composer, conductor and pianist of Austrian birth. He was awarded The Gold Order of Merit by the city of Vienna in 1996.81

Howard, Andrée (1910–68) English choreographer who initially danced with the Ballet Rambert and Ballet Russe de Monte Carlo before a heart condition resulted in her focusing on choreography.82

Howells, Herbert (1892–1983) Professor of composition at the RCM who is best known for his church and organ music.83

Howells, Ursula (1922–2005) English actress initially involved in stage work in West End and Broadway productions then in film and television.84

Huntley, John (1921–2003) British film historian and writer who worked extensively as a music and sound assistant to Muir Mathieson on numerous films.85

Hussey, Dynelley (1893–1972) English music critic.86

Hutchens, Frank (1892–1965) New Zealand-born educationalist, composer and pianist who lived and worked in Australia and held the position of piano professor at the NSW State Conservatorium.87

Ireland, John (1879–1962) Professor of composition at the RCM between the war years as well as choirmaster and organist.88

---

78 Ibid.: 301.
82 ‘Andrée Howard: Choreographer and dancer’ (obituary), The Times, April 20, 1968: 9.
84 Unacknowledged author. 'Ursula Howells' (obituary), Telegraph, November 1, 2005.
Irving, Ernest (1878–1953) English conductor and composer, responsible, like Mathieson, for engaging some of Britain's most talented composers to write for the cinema when he was acting as music director of Ealing Film Studios (1935–53).89


Jones, Sidney (1861–1946) British composer, clarinettist and conductor chiefly known for his musical comedies of which The Geisha (1896) achieved enormous popularity.91

Joyce, Eileen (1912–91) Australian pianist who studied at the Leipzig Conservatory before setting in London where she enjoyed a successful career. She recorded soundtracks to many British films including Brief Encounter (dir. David Lean. Cineguild. 1945) while Wherever She Goes (dir. Michael Gordon. Associated British. 1950) is autobiographical.92

Kersey, Eda (1904–44) English violinist who gave the première of Bax's Concerto (1943) and Moeran's Sonata for two violins with Marjorie Hayward.93

Klein, Herman (1856–1934) English music critic and author. Klein taught singing at the Guildhall School of Music in London and for many years was a member of the Critic's Circle.94

Kohler, Irene (1912–96) Kohler studied piano at Trinity College and the RCM, and was known for her physical strength and powerful technique.95


Korngold, Erich Wolfgang (1897–1957) Austrian composer who settled in America in 1934. A prodigious talent in Europe that impressed composers such as Richard Strauss and Puccini, Korngold contributed some of Hollywood's finest film scores before focusing once again on music for the concert hall.97


Lambert, Constant (1905–51) Active as a composer, conductor and writer, Lambert was best known for his score The Rio Grande (1929), his notable contribution to the world of ballet and the book Music Ho! (1934).99

95 'Mr Herman Klein: Music Critic, Teacher and Writer' (obituary), The Times, March 12, 1934: 19.
Lang, Fritz (1890–1976) German film director who distinguished himself in the silent film era.100

Lasdun, Sir Denys (1914–2001) English architect known for his design of the Royal National Theatre in London’s South Bank and recipient of many awards including the Royal Institute of British Architects Royal Gold Medal in 1977.101

Leigh, Walter (1905–42) English composer who studied with Hindemith and is chiefly noted for his stage works.102

Levy, Louis (1893–1957) British music director and composer primarily for films.103

Lindsay, Norman (1879–1969) Australian painter and novelist. As an artist he worked in a variety of mediums such as cartoons, etchings, paintings and sculpture and his books include The Magic Pudding for children and Creative Effort.104

Lovett, Leon (1935–) English conductor. Lovett was the musical director of the New Opera Company and assistant conductor of the Scottish National Orchestra, Scottish Opera and Glasgow Choral Union. Lovett conducted many British and world premières of operas by composers such as Schoenberg, Prokofiev and Hindemith between the years 1957–85.105

Mackerras, Sir Charles (1925–) Australian conductor and oboist who studied with Václav Talich and developed a particular interest in Slavonic music and in incorporating authentic performance style in his interpretations.106

Masefield, John (1878–1967) English writer who created some fifty volumes of verse, more than twenty novels and eight plays.107

Mathieson, Muir (1911–75) Scottish composer and conductor who studied with Malcolm Sargent at the RCM and began work as Music Director for Alexander Korda’s London Films.108

Mayerl, Billy (1902–59) English pianist and composer celebrated for his syncopated style of music on which he later founded the Billy Mayerl School of Pianoforte Tuition. He is also credited with having given the British premiere of Gershwin’s Rhapsody in Blue.109

McCrae, Hugh (1876–1958) Australian writer who contributed a substantial body of verse as well as memoirs and prose.110

104 Unacknowledged author. ‘Norman Lindsay: Painter and Novelist’ (obituary), The Times, November 22, 1969: 8.
105 Information given to the author by Leon Lovett on January 18, 2009.
McGill String Quartet A string quartet originally formed in 1904 from teachers at McGill University, Canada.111

MacQueen, Kenneth (1897–1960) Australian farmer and artist inspired by the Queensland landscape. MacQueen specialized in watercolour painting, was awarded the Queen Elizabeth II coronation medal in 1953 and from 1959–60 was trustee of the Queensland Art Gallery.112

Menotti, Gian Carlo (1911–2007) Italian composer who settled in America and was acknowledged for his versatile dramatic skills which drew on his talents as director and librettist as well composer. His operas The Medium, The Consul and Amahl and the Night Visitors are amongst his best known works.113

Milhaud, Darius (1892–1974) French composer influenced by jazz, South American music and a member of Les Six.114

Miller, Mitchell (1911–) American oboist, conductor and record producer. He was employed by and recorded for Columbia Records and was highly influential in the field of American popular music in the 1950s and 60s.115

Mitchell, Donald (1925–) English writer and critic on music.116

Moeran, E. J. (1894–1950) English composer who studied with John Ireland and whose early music has been described as lyrical and inspired by nature.117

Munroe, Lome (1924–) Munroe was sponsored by Benjamin as a boy to study at the RCM with Ivor James on a scholarship in 1937–9. He became principal cello with the Philadelphia Orchestra (1951) and the New York Philharmonic (1964).118

Nevin, Ethelbert (1862–1901) American composer with a repertoire almost entirely focused on songs and short piano works of a graceful lyric nature. He is best remembered for the piano piece Narcissus (no. 4 from Water Scenes, op.13) composed in 1891.119

Newman, Alfred (1901–70) American composer and conductor who worked in musical comedy in Broadway and Hollywood before becoming head of the musical department for 20th Century Fox where he composed music for over two hundred films.120

Newman, Ernest (1868–1959) English music critic and writer.\textsuperscript{121}

Paderewski, Jan (1860–1941) Polish pianist, composer and statesman whose extensive touring schedule encompassed Europe, America, Canada, South America, Australia, New Zealand and Africa.\textsuperscript{122}

Palmer, Sir Ernest (1858–1948) Director of the firm Huntley & Palmers Ltd., and patron of music with a particular interest in opera.\textsuperscript{123}

Panufnik, Andrzej (1914–91) Polish composer, pianist and conductor who moved to England in 1954 where he briefly directed the City of Birmingham SO and increasingly devoted his energy to composition. Among his compositions is \textit{Universal Prayer} premiered by Stokowski and the Violin Concerto commissioned by Yehudi Menuhin.\textsuperscript{124}

Parry, Hubert (1848–1918) Composer and director of the RCM from 1894 who is best remembered for the works \textit{Blest Pair of Sirens} and \textit{Jerusalem}.\textsuperscript{125}

Peyer, Gervase de (1926–) English clarinettist who studied with Frederick Thurston at the RCM, was first clarinet of the LSO, a founder-member of the Melos Ensemble and director of the London Symphony Wind Ensemble.\textsuperscript{126}

Post, Joseph (1906–72) Australian conductor and administrator who conducted for the ABC where he became assistant director of music in 1965 as well as director of the NSW Conservatorium of Music.\textsuperscript{127}

Powell, Michael (1905–90) British film writer, producer and director. He collaborated with the writer Emeric Pressburger on a number of films and is remembered for such classics as \textit{49th Parallel} (Ortus. 1941), \textit{A Matter of Life and Death} (Archers. 1946) and \textit{The Red Shoes} (Archers. 1948).\textsuperscript{128}

Primrose, William (1904–82) Scottish violist who performed as a member of the London String Quartet and Primrose Quartet, as principal viola under Toscanini with the NBC Orchestra and as soloist.\textsuperscript{129}

Pudovkin, Vsevolod (1893–1953) Russian film director, theorist, writer and actor.\textsuperscript{130}

Rank, J. Arthur (1888–1972) Film entrepreneur who saw films as a medium to promote Christian teachings.\textsuperscript{131}


\textsuperscript{131} \textit{Ibid.}: 915.


Riddle, Frederick (1912–95) English violist who combined a solo career with the position of principal violist with the LSO then the RPO, and taught at the RCM and Royal Manchester College of Music.\footnote{Tully Potter. 'Frederick (Craig) Riddle', \textit{The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians}. Stanley Sadie (ed.). London: Macmillan Publishers Ltd., 2001, Vol. XXI: 351.}


Rimanoczy, Jean de (1904–58) Violinist trained at the Academy of Music, Budapest who then emigrated to Canada in 1925. Rimanoczy was engaged as concertmaster of the Vancouver Symphony Orchestra, as soloist on CBC radio and as concertmaster of the Seattle Symphony Orchestra on Sir Thomas Beecham's invitation in 1943.\footnote{Bryan N. S. Gooch. 'Jean de Rimanoczy', \textit{Encyclopedia of Music in Canada}. Helmut Kallmann, Gilles Potvin and Kenneth Winters (ed.). Toronto & London: Toronto Press, 1992: 357.}


Rotha, Paul (1903–84) British film theorist and director of documentaries who worked with the GPO Film Unit and independently.\footnote{Leslie Halliwell. \textit{Halliwell's Filmgoer's and Video Viewer's Companion}. London: Paladin, Grafton Books, 1988: 956.}


Sabaneev, Leonid (1881–1968) Russian composer and musicologist.\textsuperscript{142}

Salter, Lionel (1914–2000) English harpsichordist, pianist, conductor and writer. Salter studied piano with Benjamin at the RCM and later worked in a variety of positions for the BBC where he became head of opera in 1963 and assistant controller of music in 1967.\textsuperscript{143}

Sampson, George (1861–1949) English organist, conductor and composer. Sampson emigrated to Brisbane in 1898 to take up the post of organist at St. John's pro-cathedral. His influence on the musical life of this city was considerable.\textsuperscript{144}

Sargent, Sir Malcolm (1895–1967) English conductor who taught at the RCM and worked with the Hallé Orchestra, LPO, Liverpool PO, and BBC SO. He is credited as being an outstanding choral conductor and was knighted in 1947.\textsuperscript{145}

Schafer, Murray (1933–) Canadian born composer, writer and educationalist. Schafer was working as a freelance journalist and European BBC interviewer when he conducted this series of interviews of British composers.\textsuperscript{146}

Schuldt, Phyllis (1911–82) English pianist who settled in Vancouver, Canada. She studied at the RCM with Benjamin and became a prominent teacher and performer in Vancouver. In the years 1959–78 she taught at the University of British Columbia.\textsuperscript{147}

Scott, Marion (1877–1953) English musicologist who studied at the RCM and was noted for her research on Beethoven and Haydn, and for her support of British composer, especially Ivor Gurney's music.\textsuperscript{148}

Sevitsky, Fabien (1891–1967) Russian-born conductor and nephew of Serge Koussevitzky who emigrated to the USA in 1923 where he founded the Philadelphia Chamber String Sinfonietta (1925–37) and conducted the Indianapolis Symphony Orchestra 1937–55.\textsuperscript{149}

Shore, Bernard (1896–1985) English violist who was principal violist of the BBC SO, taught at the RCM, premiered a number of new works such as Gordon Jacob's Viola Concerto and was author of The Orchestra Speaks (1937) and Sixteen Symphonies (1947).\textsuperscript{150}

Smith, Muriel (1923–85) African-American mezzo-soprano who made a successful stage debut in Carmen Jones in 1943. She also played the title role in Bizet's Carmen at Covent Garden (1956) and appeared in the film Moulin Rouge (dir. John Huston. Romulus. 1952).\textsuperscript{151}


\textsuperscript{144} Christine Petch. 'George Sampson', www.stalbans-holborn.com Website last updated December 7, 2008 and viewed by the author January 19, 2009.


Sokoloff, Vladimir (1913–97) Pianist and teacher at the Curtis Institute of Music, Philadelphia. Sokoloff performed with the Curtis String Quartet and accompanied well-known artists such as William Primrose and Gregor Piatigorsky.152

Solomon, Izler (1910–87) American conductor known for his work with the Illinois Symphony Orchestra, Indianapolis Symphony Orchestra and as music director of the Columbus Philharmonic Orchestra.153

Spoliansky, Mischa (1898–1985) Russian composer who composed several operettas, revues and for sound films in Germany before settling in Britain in 1933 where he worked mainly as a film composer.154

Stanford, Sir Charles Villiers (1852–1924) Irish composer and professor of composition at the RCM whose many achievements, according to Lewis Foreman, include him having “revolutionized the music for the Anglican ceremony”.155

Steiner, Max (1888–1971) Austrian born composer of American nationality who worked on Broadway then Hollywood and created over three hundred film scores.156

Stobart, Thomas (1914–80) Camera-man who graduated from Cambridge with a degree in zoology and travelled widely with his film work. In 1953, he documented through film, the Conquest of Everest (Countryman Films. 1953), the British-led expedition that climbed the summit of Everest.157

Stock, Frederick (1872–1942) German-born conductor of American nationality and principal conductor of the Chicago SO.158

Stoker, Richard (1938–) Stoker was born in Yorkshire and on Benjamin’s advice studied with Berkeley at the RAM in 1958. Nadia Boulanger was a key influence on his composition and in 1963 he became professor of composition at the RAM.159

Stravinsky, Igor (1882–1971) Russian composer of French then American nationality whose international career was launched with the works The Firebird, Petrushka and The Rite of Spring.160

Tertis, Lionel (1876–1975) English viola player. Tertis did much to foster audience’s acceptance of the viola as a solo instrument. To further this cause, new repertoire was created by composers such as Bax, Benjamin Dale, Bowen and Bridge.161

Tholan, Nellie (1903–98) Pianist and teacher at Lewis and Clark College in Portland, Oregon.162

Thurston, Frederick (1901–53) English clarinettist and pupil of Charles Draper, he was the dedicatee of many works by British composers such as Bax, Bliss, Howells, Ireland and Rawsthorne.163

Truffaut, François (1932–84) French film critic and film director.164

Trimble, Joan (1915–2000) Irish composer and pianist. She studied with Benjamin, Herbert Howells and Ralph Vaughan Williams at the RCM and on Benjamin’s suggestion formed the celebrated piano duo with her sister Valerie Trimble.165

Valois, Ninette de (1898–2001) Irish ballet dancer and choreographer who studied with Diaghilev and formed the Vic-Wells Ballet which became the basis of the Royal Ballet at Covent Garden.166


Waddington, Sidney P. (1869–1953) Composer and professor of Harmony and Counterpoint, and Master of the opera class at the RCM.168

Walker, Norman (1892–1976) British film director.169

Walmsley, Leo (1892–1966) Yorkshire author of sea-related novels.170

Walton, William (1902–83) English composer whose career was launched by the work Façade (premiered 1923) and consolidated by works such as Belshazzar’s Feast (1931) and the First Symphony (1934–5).171

Warlock, Peter (1894–1930) English composer known best for his songs.172

Warrack, John (1928–) English music critic and writer.173

---

162 Information given to the author in an e-mail dated June 15, 2009 by Andrew Brownell (pupil of Nellie Tholan).


Wood, Sir Henry (1869–1944) British conductor. Wood was the first conductor of the Promenade Concerts in London launched by Robert Newman in 1895, and was a strong supporter of British music. He was knighted in 1911.176

Wright, Basil (1907–87) Film director particularly noted for his work in documentary films.177

Wright, Kenneth (1899–1975) Wright began work for the BBC in 1922 and after a series of promotions became Acting Director of Music in 1947.178

Wyndham-Lewis, Dominic Bevan (1894–1969) British writer known for his humorous newspaper articles and biographies.179

Youdell, Andrew (1947–) Film historian of the British Film Institute, London and lecturer on films and music.180

---

175 Ibid.: 1158.
176 Ibid.: 310.
180 Information given to the author by Andrew Youdell January 15, 2009.
Appendix E

One copy of the DVD of *The Man Who Knew Too Much* (1934 version) and the video of *Turn of the Tide* have been purchased for examiners to view. The other four films selected for analysis are not commercially available.