THE TRADITION OF REBELLION AND THE TRANSFORMATION OF
PEASANT CONCEPTUAL SCHEMES IN CENTRAL AND SOUTHERN LUZON

by

Phillip Anthony Dowton

Submitted for the degree of Master of Arts,
Australian National University,
January, 1981
This thesis is my own work and all sources used herein have been duly acknowledged.

Author's Signature
TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER ONE: RELIGIOUS CONTINUITY AND POLITICAL DISCONTINUITY IN LUZON PEASANT MOVEMENTS

CHAPTER TWO: STRUCTURES OF MEANING AND SOCIAL CHANGE

Hot and Cold Ideologies in Transitional Societies
On Time and Change
Universes of Discourse
The Framework

CHAPTER THREE: CATHOLICISM AND CHANGE IN CENTRAL AND SOUTHERN LUZON

CATHOLICISM AND CONTINUITY IN EARLY COLONIAL LUZON, 1565-1800
The Formation of a Cold Society in Early Colonial Luzon
The Catholic Idiom in the Early Colonial Period
Spanish and Pre-Spanish Religious Beliefs
Catholic and Pre-Hispanic Religious Worldviews: Interaction and Effects
The Political Implication of Catholicism in Early Colonial Luzon
THE EMERGENCE OF A HOT LUZON ECONOMY
Private Property, Patron-Clientelism and Economic Exploitation
Capital Accumulation and the Rise of Rural Proletariats
CLASS FORMATION AND THE CATHOLIC IDIOM: AN OVERVIEW
# TABLE OF CONTENTS Cont'd.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER FOUR: THE TRADITION OF REBELLION IN CENTRAL LUZON AND THE SOUTHERN TAGALOG REGION, 1840-1940</th>
<th>Page 116</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>THE TRADITION OF REBELLION: THE CONFRADIA DE SAN JOSE, GUARDIA DE HONOR AND SANTA IGLESIA</td>
<td>Page 124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Confradia de San Jose and the 1841 Rebellion</td>
<td>Page 126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Guardia de Honor</td>
<td>Page 129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Santa Iglesia</td>
<td>Page 134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Overview of Early Luzon Movements</td>
<td>Page 135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Kapisanan Makabola Makasinag</td>
<td>Page 151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Sociedad ti Mannalon and Sinarauag</td>
<td>Page 152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Kapatiran Tanggulan Malayang Mamamayan</td>
<td>Page 154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Twentieth Century Luzon Movements Reconsidered</td>
<td>Page 156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE TRADITION OF REBELLION: SAKDALS, UNIONS AND THE HUKS</td>
<td>Page 158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Sakdalista Movement and the 1935 Uprising</td>
<td>Page 159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peasant Unionization and Civil War in the 1930's and 1940's</td>
<td>Page 162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peasant Movements in the 1930's and 1940's Reconsidered</td>
<td>Page 164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE TRADITION OF REBELLION, 1840-1940: AN OVERVIEW</td>
<td>Page 170</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| CHAPTER FIVE: THE TRANSFORMATION OF PEASANT CONCEPTUAL SCHEMES | Page 174 |
TABLE OF CONTENTS Cont'd.

CHAPTER SIX: THE FRAMEWORK AND ARGUMENT RECONSIDERED 200
  Goody's Critique of Structuralist and Neo-Structuralist Approaches 202
  The Framework 207
  The Argument 212

BIBLIOGRAPHY: Books 218
  Articles, Papers and Unpublished Theses

MAPS AND DIAGRAMS
  Map One: The Philippines 65
  Map Two: Central Luzon and the Southern Tagalog Region 68
  Map Three: The Geographical Distribution of Cabero era Churches in Central Luzon and the Southern Tagalog Region in 1655 75
  Figure One: The Catholic Universe of Discourse in Central Luzon and the Southern Tagalog region 81
  Map Four: Peasant Movements in Central and Southern Luzon, 1840-1940 125
  Figure Two: Changes in the Luzon Discourse 176
  Figure Three: The Extension of the Luzon Discourse 185
  Figure Four: The Rising Sun and Japanese Intervention 189
INTRODUCTION

The study of native categories of thought is essential to any understanding of social reality. But in the end the anthropologist must translate the idiom of the culture he investigates into his own conceptual framework.


If one assesses the importance of a particular phenomena by the simple measure of the number of people that it has affected then peasant movements must be regarded as one of the most significant features of the twentieth century. In Mexico, Russia, China, Cuba, Algeria, Vietnam, Angola, Mozambique, Zimbabwe, and the list goes on, peasants have played a significant part in bringing down a particular social and political order; in other parts of the world, small wars continue to challenge the status quo. Some will be successful, as others have been in the past, but many will fail or obtain only minor concessions. Even more, perhaps, will go unnoticed by the outside world.

1. Authors and publications mentioned in the introduction are cited in full in the thesis and the bibliography. Where I have quoted from a specific author or referred to a particular aspect of an author's argument, as in the case of Hobsbawm, the full reference is contained in footnotes. The system of footnoting that I have used in this thesis is taken from Style Manual for Authors, Editors and Printers, Third ed., revised by J. Pitson, Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra, 1978. Basically I have attempted to avoid an over-formalized method in favour of a simple and efficient common-sense system. For example, where I have used a single piece of work by a particular author the initial reference contains full details of the publication but subsequent references mention only the author and appropriate page numbers. In the case of two pieces of work by the same author, later references mention the author, an abbreviation of the title of the work referred to, and the relevant page numbers.
The study of peasant movements is an inherently difficult one but it is a task which has been increasingly attracting the attention of social scientists in recent years. Several authors have made outstanding contributions; Eric Wolf and Barrington Moore Jr., for example, have done a great deal to dispel many of the over-simplified explanations of rural exploitation and peasant discontent in European and non-European history alike. However, in my opinion, very few studies have equalled Eric Hobsbawm's *Primitive Rebels*. His study is important for several reasons. Obviously, he has clarified our understanding of the early forms of social movements which he terms "archaic"; that is, banditry, mafia, and millenarianism. Hobsbawm has also brought an historical approach into a terrain which has traditionally been the preserve of anthropologists; the utility of this approach is clearly evident, for example in Anton Blok's, *The Mafia of a Sicilian Village, 1860-1960*. However, it is Hobsbawm's analytical framework and interpretative emphases that shaped the present study. Hobsbawm's perspective is relevant to us because, unlike many scholars, he locates "archaic" or "primitive" forms of rebellion in the mainstream of contemporary peasant politics. Primitive rebels, Hobsbawm argues, are

*prepolitical* people who have not yet found, or only begun to find, a specific language in which to express their aspirations about the world. Though their movements are thus in many respects blinds and groping, by the standards of modern ones, they are neither unimportant nor marginal ... (They) form the large majority in many, perhaps in most, countries even today, and their acquisition of political consciousness has made our century the most revolutionary in history. For this reason the study of their movements is not merely curious, or interesting, or moving for anyone who cares about, the fate of men, but also of practical importance."

The significance of Hobsbawm's observations was impressed upon me in a very practical way when, as part of a sociology honours programme in 1976, I began a close examination of the roots of peasant communism in the Mekong delta region of southern Vietnam. What I found bewildering about this particular case was the fact that a specific set of historical conditions arising from French colonial policy and the development of a capitalistic export economy between 1870 and 1930 produced a radical political movement, the Vietminh, and a pair of popular and militant "politico-religious" sects, the Cai Dai and Hoa Hoa. At that stage, I had no conceptual framework capable of showing how these diverse movements were related, and I subsequently excluded these modern millenarian movements from the analysis by focussing on the single issue of peasant communism. Informing my analysis, of course, was the untenable assumption that movements such as the Cai Dai and Hoa Hoa were mere anachronisms. That this assumption was untenable was revealed through a reading of Hobsbawm's material and southeast Asian history, and I soon became convinced that it is impossible to draw clear-cut distinctions between millenarian and radical political movements in all cases.

Though Hobsbawm's emphasis on the connections between "archaic" and "modern" movements remains somewhat latent in his analysis, rather than being explicitly teased out, the focus on continuities and connections is one which has influenced this enquiry. In particular, an illuminating aspect of Hobsbawm's approach is his concern with the shift from chiliastic ideologies to secular theories of history and revolution in millenarian and modern movements, respectively. The question of how and how far millenarian movements are modernized is a recurrent theme in his analysis. Hobsbawm identifies three principal

3. Hobsbawm, pp.6, 57, 59.
characteristics of millenarian movements: firstly, they are revolutionist, that is, they totally reject the present world; secondly, they possess a chiliastic ideology or an apocalyptic religious worldview; thirdly, they have no defined strategy to bring about a new society. When millenarian movements are transformed or absorbed into modern political movements, Hobsbawm argues that they retain their revolutionary orientation but chiliastic ideologies give way to secular theories of power and they develop a superstructure capable of implementing their chosen goals. I shall suggest, though, that the crucial process in the transformation of millenarian into secular movements is a prior shift in peasant ideologies and worldviews rather than the emergence of a rational form of political organisation. This is not a matter of underestimating the importance of clearly defined political strategies and organisational procedures; it is merely to state the obvious sequence of events. Rational forms of political organisation will fail to create popular movements unless the peasantry are predisposed in favour of secular action rather than relying on divine agencies.

The process that Hobsbawm describes is evident in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region, at least to a significant degree, in those events and cultural orientations that I will call the tradition of rebellion. Certainly movements there have shifted from an archaic form of political movement to the kind of modern political movements with which the reader is so familiar. One can gauge the magnitude of this shift by comparing, for example, the Confradia de San Jose in the 1840's, a movement which adopted a utopian catholic ideology and conformed quite closely to Hobsbawm's pure millenarian type, and the

5. Ibid., p.59.
Huk movement of the 1940's and 1950's, which expressed a revolutionary, secularized class ideology and developed an efficient political organisation for implementing its visions of a new society. However, Luzon peasant movements did not totally abandon the old catholic ideological forms; instead, they gave secular political meanings to its ideas and symbols. That is, peasant movements of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries used a common catholic idiom but the meanings that were attached to specific concepts and symbols were in a constant process of change. Contrary to what Hobsbawm suggests happened for European communities, the gradual shift from a millenarian to a secular ideology in Luzon peasant movements was a case of conversion rather than substitution. Accordingly, the old apocalyptical worldview accommodated the new concern of these movements with the destiny of their followers in this world.

It seems that in Luzon the process of reconciling old and new ideological forms was neither random nor unpatterned but followed a definite trend which unfolded through a succession of peasant movements and revolts during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Myths about the return of Christ and the religious symbol of light, for example, increasingly took on secular political meanings; twentieth century movements emphasised the return of Christlike popular revolutionary heroes who had been martyred by the Spanish and Americans, and light, once the catholic symbol of mystical knowledge and divine inspiration, became the symbol of nationalism and the struggle for an independent Philippines. Therefore, while Luzon peasant movements retained an archaic ideological form it is one which was constantly being transformed into a modern political ideology. This process of metamorphosis, of politicization and secularization, is the object of the present study.
My principal objective in this thesis is to outline a theoretical framework that can clarify and provoke discussion on the connections between what may be best described as idiomatic continuities and ideological discontinuities that are evident in the tradition of rebellion of central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region. Our emphasis is deliberately placed on the term 'outline' for, as the reader will appreciate, the task of describing and analyzing indigenous interpretations of change and exploitation is inherently difficult; certainly it encompasses far more than can be accommodated within a thesis. The reader of this thesis will soon discover the never-ending stream of difficulties that confronts any anthropologist who attempts to re-interpret indigenous interpretative models and explain how they change. Other problems though are a consequence of my theoretical approach and of the way in which I handle the data. These should be introduced to the reader here.

Firstly, I employ several concepts important in the works of Claude Levi-Strauss and Pierre Bourdieu, but for obvious reasons I shall not provide a comprehensive account of the contexts within which these authors have developed them. Levi-Strauss and Bourdieu have produced very complex frameworks and I have been forced in the limited space available to assume some familiarity with these concepts on the reader's part. This is a somewhat unfair presupposition. Bourdieu's ideas occupy pride of place in this thesis, although I wish to stress that his Outline of a Theory of Practice is still the subject of debate, reviews and commentaries. Furthermore, it should be noted that I am not attempting to apply Bourdieu's or Levi-Strauss' theories but selected aspects of them. These concepts are analyzed in detail in the text.

6. References to Bourdieu and Levi-Strauss are found in the text and bibliography. In the bibliography I have included an additional
Secondly, my approach to the data may seem at times to be abstract and overly selective. However, I should point out that the data included in this study was not obtained through my own fieldwork but during library research. Therefore, what I am attempting to do is to establish a new interpretation of existing material; in these circumstances, a degree of abstractness and selectivity is both unavoidable and justifiable. In other words, I am trying to demonstrate the relevance of my framework for Luzon society and peasant movements by judiciously selecting data from a broad historical period. I am well aware that any attempt to achieve a balanced presentation of theoretical analysis and historical and ethnographic material contains many uneasy compromises. But in generalizing and selectively using the data I hope to point up specific trends in the phenomena of rebellion. At no stage do I pretend to offer a definitive history of Luzon society and peasant movements in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

Finally, the thesis reflects the strengths and weaknesses that are evident in the literature on rural Luzon society and peasant movements in particular. For example, we possess an incomplete history of Spanish colonialism in the Philippines, consisting of scattered official documents relating to the pre-nineteenth century period and several general reports on Luzon society in the nineteenth century. This history was compiled by the Spanish themselves, especially missionaries, and curious travellers from other parts of Europe. While these accounts contain some useful information they fail to

F.n. 6 continued.
list of books and articles dealing with Bourdieu's writings that might be useful to the reader. The reason for including these references is simply to save the reader a great deal of time if he/she wishes to examine Bourdieu's writing in detail. They were provided by a Lockheed Computer Search conducted by Mr. Joe Bilski at the National Library; I thank him for his perseverance and assistance in tracing theoretical sources for this thesis.
provide us with a detailed picture of village life in central Luzon and the southern Taglog region and almost completely neglect the periodic uprisings that took place in the countryside. These reports should be regarded with suspicion, for they are frequently superficial and invariably are over-coloured by the political and religious biases of their authors. I have carefully selected the less arbitrary texts and, where possible, cross-checked data with other primary and secondary sources. Fortunately, our knowledge of agrarian Luzon since the mid-nineteenth century has been greatly increased by Philippine historiography and recent pioneering studies such as John Larkin's *The Pampangans*, Edgar Wickberg's *The Chinese in Philippine Life, 1850-1898*, and Akira Takahashi's *Land and Peasants in Central Luzon*. Studies such as these have clarified our understanding of village life in central and southern Luzon and how it has changed since the mid-1800's, but an adequate history of peasant society in Luzon will only emerge after a great deal of further research.

From our point of view the most important and exciting development in the recent literature is that Luzon peasant movements are finally becoming the object of serious investigation. Until about 1970, most research on agrarian unrest in the Philippines centred on modern political movements; in the case of central and southern Luzon, scholarship was virtually confined to the nationalist revolution against Spain and the civil war that followed American intervention in the conflict at the turn of the century. Recently, however, researchers have begun to consider a broader range of peasant movements that have been a persistent feature of Luzon history since the mid-1800's, including those which conform to Hobsbawm's millenarian type. These studies have partly redressed the imbalance between archaic and modern movements in the literature and provide us with sufficient
data to compare successive movements and examine the connections between them.

However, there is another bias in the data which should be acknowledged; namely, most studies emphasise the dissimilarities rather than the similarities between the early and later Luzon movements. The research which explicitly deals with continuities in peasant movements is largely confined to Reynaldo Ileto's doctoral thesis, *Pasion* and the Interpretation of Change in Tagalog Society (ca.1840-1912), Brian Fegan's paper, Continuities in Central Luzon Peasant Movements, and Dennis Shoesmith's article 'The Glorious Religion of Jose Rizal'. These studies have gradually pieced together a pattern of continuities which flows through peasant movements from the *Confradia de San Jose* and *Santa Iglesia* in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries (Ileto), to later twentieth century movements like the *Katipunan* and *Tanggulan* (Fegan) and modern *Rizalista* movements (Shoesmith), but the picture that has emerged is by no means complete. We have a very sparse knowledge, for example, of the symbols employed by the peasant unions and *Hukos* in the 1930's and 1940's. Nevertheless, these studies have had a profound influence on the orientation of this thesis and I am looking forward, in particular, to Ileto's forthcoming book, *Light and Darkness: A Study of Meaning in Tagalog Social Movements*.

Any attempt to theoretically analyze the connections between so-called archaic and modern social movements must be considered difficult; the difficulty is accentuated when one attempts to apply new and relatively unexplored concepts to an incomplete body of data. This (thesis) is therefore tentative and incomplete, and pretends to be no more. It is open to criticism by all those on whose preserves it poaches, not only for poaching but in some cases for clumsy poaching. It is also open to the criticism of all who think a single and thorough monograph better than a set of necessarily cursory sketches. There is only one answer to such objections. It is high time that movements of the kind discussed in this (thesis)
were seriously considered not simply as an unconnected series of individual curiosities, as footnotes to history, but as a phenomenon of general importance and considerable weight in modern history.7

Since Hobsbawm made these remarks over twenty years ago social scientists have increasingly sought explanations of archaic and modern peasant movements, but the tendency which he describes is still more than apparent in the literature. However, current research on Luzon peasant movements is beginning to adopt an historical perspective. In this respect, the analysis that I propose must be interpreted as part of an ongoing debate rather than a significant departure from existing perspectives. To the extent that I am attempting to establish a theoretical framework for analyzing the connections between early and later Luzon peasant movements my approach and objective differs from those currently available.

Many people have contributed to the researching and writing of this thesis and provided support and encouragement when it was most needed. I would like to thank Professor Anthony Forge for his support over the last two years, Dr. Alfred Gell for discussing some of my original theoretical ideas, Dr. Brian Fegan for availing me of his extensive knowledge on Luzon peasant movements and Philippine society, and Mr. Joe Bilski of the National Library for patiently conducting a Lockheed Computer Search of current indexes and unearthing theoretical sources held in Australian and American libraries that would have otherwise remained undiscovered. Most of all, I am deeply indebted to Dr. Caroline Ifeka who painstakingly supervised this thesis and was always willing to share her knowledge and friendship with me.

Chapter One

RELIGIOUS CONTINUITY AND POLITICAL DISCONTINUITY
IN LUZON PEASANT MOVEMENTS

One of the crucial problems facing current research on Luzon peasant movements involves the connections between religious continuities and political discontinuities. The central dilemma is focussed on the question: how can we reconcile the continued use of a common religious idiom with the changing and uneven process of politicization\(^1\) that has obviously taken place since the *Confradia de San Jose* movement\(^2\) in the 1840's? In the main, as we shall see, researchers have avoided asking this question, while a minority have raised it only tentatively and indirectly.\(^3\) It appears that most authors are satisfied to concentrate their efforts on either religious continuities or political discontinuities and to leave to one side any comment as to how they might be related. The principal reason for this imbalance, I believe, is the lack of an adequate theoretical framework; that is, a framework that could bring these diverse strands together and unite them in a single coherent scheme. My major objective, therefore, is to contribute to the development of such a framework. To do this we must first identify the nature of the theoretical task confronting us by briefly comparing the two types of

---


2. The *Confradia de San Jose* was a catholic peasant brotherhood which restricted membership to pure-blooded Tagalogs and rebelled against the Spanishmin southern Luzon. This movement will be dealt with more fully in Chapter Four.

3. Among this minority I would include the studies by Ileto, Shoesmith and Fegan cited above.
In a pioneering thesis, which deals with the impact of *Pasion* ideas on Tagalog interpretations of change in central and southern Luzon, Reynaldo Ileto advances a new approach to the explanation of religious and political interrelations in a changing society and their consequences for other domains of life. Ileto's thesis is basically descriptive and his principal aim is to identify the common "units of meaning" which Tagalog peasant movements between 1840 and 1912 mobilized in their attempts "to restructure the world in order to render it meaningful in terms of personal and collective experience." Ileto achieves this objective by showing quite clearly that the *Confradia de San Jose* in the southern Tagalog provinces and the *Santa Iglesia* in central Luzon, peasant brotherhoods that were separated by more than fifty years, shared a common religious symbolism based on the catholic *Pasion*. More recently, Brian Fegan has followed in Ileto's footsteps and demonstrated most credibly how *Pasion* ideas and symbolic themes evident in the *Vigil Service* of the Roman Catholic Church have influenced twentieth century peasant movements such as the *Tanggulan* and *Huk* in central Luzon. While Ileto draws on the *Pasion* generally and Fegan emphasises the *Vigil* in particular their studies are highly complementary. Both the *Pasion* and the *Vigil Service* are intimately connected in the Easter religious celebration of the crucifixion of Christ; the *Pasion* is "a verse account of the Crucifixion sung in many Tagalog-speaking communities on Good Friday" while the *Vigil* is the "central initiation ritual" held

5. Fegan, passim.
prior to the midnight mass on Easter Saturday for those awaiting
baptism and confirmation. The central symbol in both practices is
that of light (liwanag) and both Ileto and Fegan continually refer to
the matrix of symbols that are associated with light and its
connections with themes such as the return of a Saviour. As we shall
see in Chapters Four and Five, they show how they are manifested in
movements as diverse as the Confradia de San Jose, Santa Iglesia, and
the Tanggulan. In a recent article, Dennis Shoesmith has gone even
further and argued that the range of symbols that continually
reappears in Luzon peasant movements is also evident in Christian
minority sects in Mindanao; he concludes that "there is a clear line
of descent" which begins with the Confradia de San Jose in Luzon in
the 1840's and flows through Luzon colorums before and after the 1896
revolution, the colorums involved in the Surigao and Agusan uprisings
in Mindanao in the 1920's and contemporary Rizalist organisations
in the central and southern Philippines.

Together Ileto and Fegan have shown, to my satisfaction at least,
that there is a common idiom of rebellion in central Luzon and the
southern Tagalog region. Their exegeses of Tagalog religious and
political culture demonstrate in considerable detail that there is a

7. Fegan, pp.4-8.
8. Shoesmith, p.178, claims that "the origins of colorum are said to be
in the Latin phrase per omnia secular seculorum (World Without End)
used to end Latin prayers in the Roman Catholic Church." The use of
the term colorum has been traced by Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings,
p.94, to remnants of the defunct Confradia movement who adopted it
in the 1870's. Colorum and colorumism is commonly used to refer
to the millenarian-type sects that punctuated Philippine history
between the 1840's and 1930's. See also Milagros C. Guerrero, 'The
9. These are modern sects and churches that believe in the resurrection
of the nationalist, Jose Rizal, who was executed by the Spanish
during the Philippine Revolution.
10. Shoesmith, p.151.
strong connection between the Catholic symbolic universe and Philippine peasant ideologies. This connection can be traced way back to the Confradia de San Jose movement in the 1840's and it is a continuing and insistent theme in Tagalog popular movements throughout the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. However, Ileto's and Fegan's analyses leave some very important questions unanswered. Neither author attempts to explain the mechanisms that are involved in efforts to "restructure the world in order to render it meaningful", nor do they outline the processes that underlie the restructuring of the original meaning systems themselves. This latter point is particularly important for it leads them to assume that the common idiom remained virtually unchanged or that it was supplemented with concepts and symbols borrowed from groups outside the peasantry. However, Ileto's and Fegan's case material indicates, as do other studies of Philippine peasant movements, that the common religious idiom was being constantly re-ordered throughout this period. Ben Kerkvliet and David Sturtevant, for example, completely ignore the persistent religious theme that flows through Luzon peasant movements but they rightly agree that the peasant movements of the 1930's and 1940's were politically more articulate than their predecessors. Sturtevant, for instance, uses Anthony Wallace's concept of "revitalization" to classify pre-1930's movements in a religious framework, while reserving the term "political" movement

12. For example, Fegan acknowledges that early twentieth century peasant movements were becoming more political but he attributes this to the influence of outside groups and external factors, such as contact with urban unions and unionists, socialist, communist and anarchist groups and literature, and education. Fegan, pp.1-41.
13. Kerkvliet, Peasant Rebellion; Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings.
A lacuna common to both perspectives though, is that these writers avoid examining the question of how religious continuities and political discontinuities are connected in Luzon peasant movements. That is, they fail to systematically analyze the process by which peasant ideologies were constantly modernized; while peasant movements continued to employ a common religious idiom it is quite clear that the meanings attached to the idiom's concepts and symbols were changing over time. Moreover, these changes followed a definite pattern of politicization and secularization; for example, core representations such as those that focussed on the symbol of light (liwanag) signified different things in the Confradia de San Jose, Santa Iglesia, and the so-called colorums of the 1920's and 1930's. Politicization meant, firstly, that existing interconnections between light, mystical knowledge and divine intervention gradually dissolved to be subsequently replaced by an idea of light, which was now connected with the East and the Sun, that symbolized a mixture of nationalist and class sentiments. Secondly, myths concerning the return of the Saviour, Christ, underwent a process of metamorphosis and later movements, like those described by Fegan, increasingly invoked

---


15. Hobsbawm, pp.6, 57-59.

16. I am quite willing to accept Brian Fegan's claim that the connection between the symbol of light and the Sun and East was already present in the Vigil Service itself (p.2), and the making of such a connection might in any event appear inevitable, but I
beliefs involving the resurrection of a Saviour in the form of a martyred revolutionary leader. That is, the model was retained by its contents and, more importantly, its internal relationships changed. It is our task to analyze these contemporaneous and historical interconnections between specific patterns of continuities and discontinuities in Luzon peasant movements by considering three central questions: firstly, why were catholic ideas and symbols initially adopted by radical peasant movements in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region?; secondly, why and how did the religious idiom survive as the central unifying theme in these movements?; thirdly, how did this idiom eventually become interwoven into a secularized class ideology?

Any explanation of Luzon peasant movements which takes these questions into account must, in my opinion, be prefaced by an overarching theoretical perspective. Quite clearly, facts do not speak for themselves and there are no ready-made answers to the questions that I have posed; for instance, it is pointless to argue that peasant movements used catholic ideas and symbols because they were available. This line of reasoning, which has been put to me privately on several occasions, begs a very important problem concerning the transformation of meanings. One cannot escape the necessity of a theoretical perspective; for example, the failure to develop a theoretical outlook is most evident in Sturtevant's attempt to outline the history of

F.n. 16 continued.

am referring to their significations. As Rodell's analysis of revolutionary theatre at the turn of the century clearly demonstrates, and Fegan in fact confirms, the Sun and the East became explicit political symbols in the early twentieth century. See Paul A. Rodell, 'Philippine Seditious Plays', Asian Studies, XII, 1974, pp.88-118. These changes will be dealt with more fully in Chapter Five.

17. See Chapters Four and Five for a substantial analysis.
popular uprisings in the Philippines between 1840 and 1940. Sturtevant provides us with no coherent or convincing explanation for what he believes to be a shift from millenarian-type movements in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries to sophisticated secular political movements in the 1930's and 1940's. His basic argument is that peasant movements between 1840 and 1930 were revitalization movements which grew out of "cultural tensions" in Philippine society; they were not, Sturtevant argues, motivated by either economic or political factors. However, after 1930 the supernatural element that had characterized earlier movements evaporated and was replaced by "secularism" and "realistic objectives"; presumably, Sturtevant means that the 1930's gave rise to political movements dedicated to a more equitable economy. This argument is misleading because Sturtevant bases his conclusions on a description of the differences between the various movements while completely neglecting their shared features. Consequently, it is impossible for him to explain the complicated mixture of millenarian beliefs and class sentiments that Luzon peasant movements exhibit.

My initial starting point is Ileto's and Fegan's research which shows that Luzon peasant movements since the Confradia de San Jose have employed a common idiom or conceptual scheme that is derived from Christ's Pasion and the Roman Catholic Church's Vigil Service and at the centre of which is the symbol of light and beliefs about the return of a Saviour. However, unlike them I am concerned to show that this idiom undergoes certain changes and becomes increasingly politicized with the passage of time. Firstly, my aims are directed specifically towards demonstrating certain cognitive aspects of this common

conceptual scheme, especially its internal transformations and changing external relations with a newly-emerging set of economic conditions. It will become apparent that I disagree with Sturtevant’s basic hypothesis that pre-1930’s movements were “revitalistic” responses to “cultural tensions”, as opposed to popular reactions to economic and political change, and that they can subsequently be separated from supposedly rational political movements in the post-1930 era; instead, I follow a suggestion made by Hobsbawm and look at these movements in venues of how “archaic” peasant ideologies from the Confradia de San Jose onwards have become modernized. Secondly, I shall attempt to develop and apply an explanatory framework which uses concepts borrowed from French structuralist Marxist thought. By using these concepts I believe it is possible to construct a framework that is most helpful in illuminating the structural patterning that underlies the continuities and discontinuities in the tradition and practice of rebellion in Luzon. Therefore, the explanatory framework is designed to relate the patterned and the apparently unpatterned within one conceptual scheme.

Although it is generally accepted that popular movements are the product of social change or of societies in transition, we are limited in our efforts to develop a conceptual framework by an overall lack of knowledge of how societies move from one stage of existence to

another.\(^{22}\) Obviously, the task of developing an all-embracing theory of transition is beyond any single person and I do not countenance such an objective here. However, different people can still make small contributions to this search in the hope that eventually one or more frameworks will be formed that are illuminating and applicable to a range of cross-cultural situations. Accordingly, we intend to focus on the cognitive structuration of central Luzon and southern Tagalog movements and in this way contribute to an ongoing quest and debate. We shall primarily concern ourselves with the alternative sources of meaning that form and flow through cultural systems in transitional societies; and we have to ask ourselves how these meanings are manifested to peasants and in what ways do they subsequently interact in competing conceptual schemes. This is clearly an important problem in Reynaldo Ileto's work, to cite only one contributor to this debate; Ileto continually refers to the attempts of peasant movements in central and southern Luzon to reconcile a thematic contradiction between notions of "human time" and "Pasion time", the "everyday world" and the "Pasion world."\(^{23}\)

The literature on tribal and peasant societies frequently testifies to the existence of logically contradictory notions of time in indigenous worldviews\(^{24}\) and it is a theme that I try to accommodate

\(^{22}\) The theoretical and methodological problems arising from the study of the relationship between religion and social change are enormous and we are ill-equipped to deal with them. See, for example, Talmon, 'Pursuit of the Millennium'; Fanny Colonna, 'Cultural Resistance and Religious Legitimacy in Colonial Algeria', Economy and Society, III, 1974, pp.233-252; and Syed Hussein Alatas, 'Religion and Modernization in Southeast Asia', Archives Européennes de Sociologie, XI, 1970, pp.265-296.

\(^{23}\) Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change, pp.17, 18, 19, 23, 33, 42-43.

within the theoretical framework advanced here. In this respect, I believe the ideas of Pierre Bourdieu and Claude Levi-Strauss to be the most helpful. Levi-Strauss argues that the mythico-ritual system in tribal societies represents the dominance of an anti-historical attitude to time while Bourdieu argues that these mythico-ritual systems in peasant societies are based on the conceptual internalization of repetitive or circular patterns that are to be found in a relatively unchanging world. In traditional societies, repetitive time is commonly represented by the annual agrarian calendar, the passing of the seasons, and the rotation of day and night, sunrise and sunset. However, anti-historical worldviews in traditional societies have often been augmented by Judeo-Christian notions of the millennium; of course, these religious views differ from those found in tribal and peasant societies in some significant ways but they share a common characteristic, namely, the denial of concrete human history. On this basis, I believe the dominance of anti-historical attitudes to time, irrespective of whether this hegemony is achieved through western religious ideas, tribal mythico-

F.n. 24 continued.


27. In this sense, perhaps the most significant difference between non-western and western religions lies in their respective emphases on the past, for example, ancestor cults, and the future, such as ideas about a timeless utopia heralded by the return of a legendary Saviour. This difference can be overdrawn for there are obvious similarities between the two ideas. The point that I would like to stress is that both consider the present as a "liminal" period. See Victor Turner, The Forest of Symbols, Cornell University Press, Ithaca, 1977, pp.93-111.
religious systems or a combination of both, conforms to a social type that Levi-Strauss calls "cold societies". There are societies which have an institutional design that serves "to annul the possible effects of historical factors on their equilibrium and continuity in a quasi-automatic fashion." They differ, Levi Strauss suggests, from "hot societies", which internalize the process of change (or history) and make it "the moving power of their development."

I believe that societies undergoing radical changes of the type that were inflicted upon central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries display the features of both the "hot" and "cold" societal type; and in Chapter Two I try to rearrange Levi-Strauss' concepts to show how changes in the social and economic formation in hitherto cold societies bring different sources of knowledge and forms of meaning into conflict. Therefore, we attempt to theoretically analyze the disintegration of societies that are characterized by anti-historical conceptions of time as a preliminary step towards analyzing the changing role of catholic ideology in the Luzon peasants' worldview. Briefly, I suggest that in the unchanging world of cold societies the societal and conceptual universe consists of a series of mutually reinforcing principles; that is, the past and the present, superstructure and infrastructure, experience and reality, ideology and practice, reflect each other or are inseparable. The ideal and the actual are integrated. However, economic transformations destroy these mutually reinforcing connections and generate conflict, with the result that the links


between these pairs are weakened or destroyed beyond regeneration. Structures that are identified with the past may move into opposition to those denoting the present, those which constitute the prevailing ideology into opposition with those that represent current practice, and so forth. For the sake of convenience, we can refer to these conflicts in terms of a hot/cold dislocation in society.

By using the ideas of Pierre Bourdieu I believe we can analyze two distinct levels in the hot/cold dislocation in transitional societies and the conflicts to which they give rise. Firstly, the dislocation can be explained in terms of the breakdown of "habitus", a mechanism which Bourdieu defines as "the system of lasting, transposable dispositions which, integrating past experiences, functions at every moment as a matrix of perceptions, appreciations and actions." Bourdieu does not consider the stress that is placed on these schemes during periods of rapid social change, and hence he does not examine the possibility of this inherited system of dispositions breaking down, though he seems aware of it. But I believe that social change and its consequences cannot be easily interpreted in terms of past experiences. In central and southern Luzon, the anti-historical catholic ideology that dominated the early colonial period and which the peasants subsequently inherited was not able to rationalize or provide a suitable discourse for a society in which commodity production and market exchange were systematically replacing traditional modes of production in the first half of the nineteenth century. However, it would be naive to suggest that these pre-ordained interpretative frameworks simply disappear or remain unchanged with the passage of time. One is not, I suggest,

looking at a straightforward and uncomplicated mechanical relationship between the two influences. Therefore, I propose to develop an approach which concentrates on the tensions produced by an ongoing interaction between inherited conceptual schemes and ideas that represent to people a contrary experience of the world as it is presently constituted. In other words, we shall look at cultural practices in central and southern Luzon which constantly seek to reconcile a changing practical world with established worldviews in order to render that world meaningful, however, it should be emphasised that this strenuous cognitive process rests on, and is constrained by, a dynamic connection that links inherited conceptual schemes and contemporary experience.

Another strand in Bourdieu's thought links the conflicts evident in the breakdown and reconstitution of habitus, a concept closely akin to the Marxist notion of praxis, with a culture's "universe of discourse." The latter part of his analysis in *Outline of a Theory of Practice* focusses on the boundaries marking off the undiscussed (doxic), discussed (orthodoxic) and critical (heterodoxic) domains of indigenous conceptualization, and it is through these divisions that Bourdieu refers to quite distinct sets of relationships that relate to

31. My emphasis differs from Ileto's (p.8) in the sense that I am concerned with the interaction between meaning systems and how they change over time.


34. These domains are conceptual fields in the universe of discourse and are subsequently explained in detail in Chapter Two. See Bourdieu, *Outline of a Theory of Practice*, pp.164-171.
changing structures of meaning. What Bourdieu is referring to is the hidden factors that govern the way in which people organize their knowledge about the world and specific situations. Briefly, what he calls "doxa" or the "doxic mode" is the implied, undiscussed or taken-for-granted realm of discourses, which ensures adherence to the prevailing distribution of power by representing it as a self-evident and natural order of things. Doxa is that field of phenomenon that is defined negatively by excluding it from the explicit field of discussion; it cannot be articulated because of the lack of an explicit discourse. Orthodoxy, on the other hand, is the official language, the explicitly articulated discourse or cultural idiom, through which members of a society speak and think about their situation as a standardized phenomenon. Orthodoxy, therefore, is accepted and acceptable opinion or what is normally meant by the phrase, 'conventional wisdom'. Heterodoxy also belongs to the realm of explicit discourse but it pertains to ideational conflict, the field of competing and conflicting opinions, and is based on individual and group awareness of different interests in what is recognised as a heterogeneous social world. In this sense, heterodoxy juxtaposes orthodox and radical discourses in the field of the discussed.

I shall emphasise this second aspect of Bourdieu's theory by treating the common idiom of rebellion in central and southern Luzon as a specific discourse; I suggest that by analyzing the points of conjuncture and disjuncture in the Tagalog culture's discourse the basic cognitive structural form and conflicts outlined above will be most evident. Following Bourdieu's investigative procedures this study will identify and examine the network of relations in the Luzon discourse through which changes at the social and economic level precipitate conflicts in the cognitive domain. I believe these relations have played, and indeed continue to play, an important part
in casting Luzon peasant ideologies in a religious and/or political mould. More specifically, then, our task is to analyze the changing idiom of Luzon rebellions in the light of peasant attempts to redefine and reformulate their evolving position within an emerging class process. In doing this we hope to be able to provide a theoretical framework which can accommodate both the continuities and discontinuities that are evident in rebel ideologies in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region throughout the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

In Chapter Two I will attempt to expand Levi-Strauss' concepts of cold and hot societies by applying them to different conceptions of time that are often embedded in the socio-economic and cultural structures of transitional societies. However, I should point out that these terms are used simply as heuristic devices; they are convenient and useful but they have no intrinsic theoretical or analytical significance and are not indispensable. What we are concerned with is the relationship between ideologies and idioms that are inherited from the past, in this case, catholic ideas and symbols, and the conditions in which they are forced to operate, namely, in central and southern Luzon, an emerging class society. Ileto, for example, has referred to cultural tendencies in Luzon suggestive of a separation of "human time" and "Pasion time." This is an important insight, although Ileto is satisfied with merely introducing it into his descriptive analysis rather than exploring its implications. However, I shall try to develop an explanation which questions the idea that "time" and "change" signify discrete areas of Luzon experience; I suggest that the interaction between these two worlds has played a

35. Ileto, _Pasion_ and the Interpretation of Change, pp.17, 18, 19, 23, 33, 42-43.
significant part in shaping the character of Luzon's tradition of rebellion. If by using the hot/cold model mentioned above we can identify the existence of a disjuncture between anti-historical worldviews and a changing practical world I believe we have discovered a relationship of considerable importance to the study of change in Luzon society and possibly elsewhere. By structuring a culture's discourse, the mechanism through which people relate to their world in a meaningful way, this relationship seems to permeate social and conceptual relations and connects them to general historical processes.

Bourdieu's analysis of discourses is important, I believe, because it permits an investigation of the religious and political aspects of the common idiom in terms of a set of relationships between the cold and the hot and the discussed (orthodoxic and heterodoxic) and the undiscussed (doxic). That is, by treating the Luzon peasantry's common idiom of rebellion as a specific discourse we can analyze the connections between its religious and political components in terms of a relationship, or set of relationships, between a cold field of discussed (catholic ideas and symbols) and a hot field of undiscussed (undefined or un-conceptualized political phenomenon). The key relationship in this scheme centres on the question of how the social and cultural barriers separating the domains of orthodoxy (the discussed) and doxy (the undiscussed) are broken down by changes in the economic base and new signifying practices emerge. What I suggest happens is that economic change challenges the prevailing field of discussion (religious, cold) by introducing a range of new situations, categories and values (political, hot) into everyday life. For example, in central and southern Luzon the development of the institution of private property and the emergence of class structures in a society that was previously characterized by kinship-based social relations and subsistence modes of production not only challenged
specific beliefs about communal landownership and the distribution of wealth but the fundamental premise in traditional worldviews which holds that change and history, to the extent that it is subjectively experienced at all, occurs on a non-secular and non-political plane. Change could no longer be interpreted wholly in terms of the passage from life to death and the subsequent fate of the dead in catholicism's heaven and hell or the indigenous religion's ancestor cults. By looking at the relationships between the various domains within a specific discourse and the way in which they change over time I believe we can appreciate the significance of catholic ideology in Luzon society and the manner in which it was transformed with the emergence of a class structure in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

Chapter Three highlights two major strands in Philippine history which are intimately connected to the Roman Catholic Church and which have had a long-term impact on Philippine society. These features constitute what I believe to be the historically dominant forces that have shaped peasant ideologies of rebellion in Luzon society. Firstly, we should note the theocratic nature of the early Spanish colonial regime and that we shall have to pay particular attention to the role of the Catholic religious orders and the source of monastic power in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog regions. Prior to the nineteenth century, the small Spanish population in the islands took little interest in the rural economy but instead remained in Manila and participated in the galleon trade between China and Mexico. The countryside was effectively relinquished into the hands of the missionaries and they were the only Spaniards with whom the Filipinos had sustained contact. As the Spanish Crown's representatives in the provinces the friars had considerable secular power but their
principal objective was to convert the indigenous people to catholicism. It is surely no coincidence that the Tagalog regions became both the citadel of Spanish power and the stronghold of catholicism in the Philippines. I shall try to show in this chapter that the power of the friars was primarily ideological and that its ability to shape the peasants' worldview and underwrite their mode of thought has made a significant contribution to the resilience of catholic values in Luzon society and the common idiom of rebellion in particular. In this sense at least, the early colonial period has left an indelible mark on central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region.

Secondly, Chapter Three examines the transformation of the agrarian economy that began in the early nineteenth century. It should become clear, however, that this is not unrelated to our first concern. By necessity, my treatment of these changes in the agrarian economy will be rather brief. What I hope to accomplish is an overview which deals not so much with the interaction of an emerging mercantile sector with agrarian modes of production but with the general development of a class structure and the nature of the social divisions to which it gave rise. These include the emergence of private property in land, the initial ethnic character of class divisions, the formation of a united propertied class and a landless peasantry in the late nineteenth century, the rise of big landlordism, and a rural proletariat in the early twentieth century. These developments are sketched against the background of economic transformations which marked the shift from a small-scale subsistence economy to a large-scale commercial economy geared to a capitalistic world market.

Chapter Four examines the tradition of rebellion in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region between 1840 and 1940 and deals with some of the more notorious peasant movements and rebellions. I briefly examine twelve movements from different periods in Luzon history;
they range from the *Confradia de San Jose* movement in the 1840's, through the *Guardia de Honor* and *Santa Iglesia* at the turn of the century, to the so-called *Colorums* of the 1920's and, later, the *Sakdalistas*, peasant unions and *Hues*. However, the reader should be forewarned that my coverage of Luzon peasant movements is limited in three specific ways. Firstly, this chapter deals with movements in the post-1840 period simply because earlier movements are poorly documented; we have very little information on uprisings in the early colonial period and certainly there is insufficient data for a comparison of successive movements. Secondly, I have intentionally sacrificed a detailed analysis of specific movements that are not richly documented for an overall review of a tradition of rebellion which I see as a part of a continually unfolding history. Thirdly, I have omitted the Nationalist Revolution against Spain and the war against America because they have been duly covered by Filipino historians and, furthermore, a separate thesis would be required to do justice to these events. What I attempt to emphasis, therefore, is that peasant movements throughout the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries shared a common religious idiom and, at the same time, augmented this complex of religious concepts and symbols with political meanings.

Chapter Five is an attempt to apply the basic theoretical framework outlined in the second chapter to the evolution of peasant ideologies in the light of the historical materials and descriptions of peasant movements presented in Chapters Three and Four. This chapter describes and analyzes the reorganisation of the traditional discourse whereby the religious system of meanings was expanded and augmented with increasingly secular, political references. Our
central contention is that the existence of an idiom shared by peasant movements since the Confradia de San Jose masks a fundamental restructuring of the inherited system of catholic meanings. I believe that orthodox religious ideas, such as the resurrection of Christ, gradually acquired political significance as they were woven into myths embodying nationalistic and class themes. What we are witnessing, I suggest, is neither a radical departure from pre-established assemblies of symbols and denotata or their simple reproduction through time but a politicization of an idiom that was originally borrowed from the Pasion and Vigil Service of the Roman Catholic Church.

Chapter Six briefly assesses the limitations of the theoretical approach outlined in this thesis and I review some of the problems associated with the available data on Luzon peasant movements. Much of this chapter is taken up with a critique of Jack Goody's new book, The Domestication of the Savage Mind, which argues that structuralist categories such as Levi-Strauss' hot and cold societies cannot be employed in analyses of social change. Contrary to Goody's argument, I believe that concepts such as hot and cold can be located in a dynamic framework like Bourdieu's universe of discourse and that they are particularly useful in analyzing the cultural and cognitive dimensions of social change; they provide a rudimentary model for analyzing the types of changes that occurred in the common idiom of rebellion in central and southern Luzon in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Finally, I attempt to outline prospects for new research orientations on Luzon peasant movements and ideologies.

By necessity, this thesis must focus on a specific set of problems that is relevant to current research on Luzon peasant movements and in this way limit itself to a small and hopefully significant contribution to an ongoing debate. I believe we can make such a contribution by attempting to develop a theoretical framework of the kind outlined above. Certain ideas in the writings of Claude Levi-Strauss and Pierre Bourdieu are useful, I believe, in analyzing how the common religious idiom used by peasant movements in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region changed both in its internal structure and with respect to its relations with the newly-emerging class society of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. It goes without saying that our analysis must leave a range of issues unexplored, but we can relate a theoretical framework capable of grappling with a hard core of problems that relate to the connections between religious continuities and political discontinuities in Luzon peasant movements. This, indeed, is our task.
Chapter Two

STRUCTURES OF MEANING AND SOCIAL CHANGE

Worlds wreck havoc when they find a name
for what had up to then been lived namelessly.

Jean-Paul Sartre,

Anthropology is well-known for its reluctance to deal with the problems of history and social change. The reasons for this failure are too numerous and complicated to explain here but it can be reasonably argued that the spectre of functionalism, the legacy of the dominating influence of Durkheim, Malinowski and Radcliffe-Brown in the first half of this century, is still with us. Admittedly, critical sociology and the Frankfurt School, through their critique of Parsonian functionalism in the 1960's and 1970's, and the recent revival of Marxist approaches in anthropology, appear to have cleared the way for a better understanding of social change. This has indeed been the case, but as Talal Asad correctly points out, these critiques have contributed more towards the "disintegration of the Old

2. I am thinking, in particular, of the writings of C. Wright Mills, Alvin Gouldner, Norman Birnbaum, Irving Louis Horowitz and Ralf Dahrendorf, though of course there are many more critical sociologists.
3. The most prominent members of this school are Theodor Adorno and Max Horkheimer.
4. This revival has been led by French intellectuals like Emmanuel Terray, Maurice Godelier and Louis Althusser.
Anthropology ... (than)... a crystallization of the New."⁵ In this sense, anthropologists have been liberated from one anti-historical perspective, but they remain the victims of a discipline that has paid scant attention to social change in the past.

In the post-functionalist era, anthropologists have grappled with the problems of history and social change in various ways. Typically they have abandoned the tradition of "ethnographic holism"⁶ that was associated with functionalist explanations, that is, approaches in which "the different 'institutions' of a society are all described and linked to one another",⁷ in favour of micro-sociological analyses of specific aspects of small-scale communities.⁸ This has had two particular consequences; firstly, anthropologists have increasingly turned to other disciplines for their concepts - for example, economic anthropology, which is sometimes revealingly referred to as anthropological economics, has turned to economics, political anthropology to political science, and so forth; secondly, social change has been increasingly regarded as a purely empirical phenomenon - that is, something that can be quantified in terms of demographic trends, cost analyses, and the like. Less commonly, perhaps, anthropologists have attempted to construct formal theories that are applicable to narrowly-defined problem areas, for example, one can cite the rise of componential analyses of kinship-terminology in linguistic anthropology and the structural analyses of myth and kinship. These theories rarely concern themselves with social change, at least as an explicit problem, and it is fair to say that the

⁷. Ibid.
⁸. Ibid.
majority of these approaches have made insignificant contributions to our theoretical knowledge of this important subject. Levi-Strauss, for instance, tends to dismiss history and social change as patently obvious processes and he does not bother to discuss them in *The Savage Mind*. 9

Nevertheless, I believe that the diffusion of ideas between structuralism and Marxism, and the emergence of a dialogue between the two schools of thought in French sociology and anthropology, 10 is making certain important contributions to the study of social change. These contributions come from sources as diverse as Levi-Strauss' structuralism and Godelier's revised Marxist framework but, as will become clear below, I am referring, in particular, to Pierre Bourdieu's blend of Marxist and structuralist perspectives. Unlike structural-functionalist approaches, which rested on assumptions of continuity and equilibrium in societies, French structural Marxism 11 regards both cultural reproduction and social transformation in societies as problematical. This represents a radical departure from former anti-historical perspectives; the presupposition that societies remain the same has given way to a concern with how structures and practices are reproduced or change over time. Thus French anthropologists like Bourdieu are attempting to reconcile the orthodox Marxist preoccupation with the generation of contradictions in the economic structures of societies, and the processes that promote change and conflict, with a tenet in mainstream structuralism


10. See, for example, Claude Levi-Strauss, Maurice Godelier & Marc Auge, 'Anthropology, History and Ideology', *Critique of Anthropology*, II, 6, 1976, pp.44-55.

that emphasises those ideological and cultural practices which prevent or distort collective representations of relations of dependence and exploitation.

This emerging synthesis of Marxist and structuralist perspectives in French theoretical anthropology has obvious implications for our understanding of the connections between continuities and discontinuities in Luzon's idiom of rebellion. We are merely confronted in a concrete historical situation with the type of problem dealt with by Bourdieu in the theoretical sphere; namely, how can we explain why certain features of the religious idiom or discourse were reproduced in successive Luzon peasant movements while others were constantly changing? I believe that Levi-Strauss' notions of cold and hot societies and, more importantly, Bourdieu's analysis of the universe of discourse, can reveal how the catholic structures of meaning were later transformed by an emerging class process.

Levi-Strauss' cold and hot archetypes are useful in three senses: firstly, I believe that catholicism in early colonial Luzon, both in its internal structure and its role in the prevailing power structure, established what Levi-Strauss calls a cold society; secondly, I suggest that the role of catholicism as a cold ideology explains, in part, why peasant movements initially adopted Roman Catholic ideas and symbols; thirdly, I propose that the politicization and secularization of folk catholic themes can be understood in terms of a transition from cold to hot ideologies of rebellion. In my opinion, what we are witnessing in the post-1830 period in Luzon is the breaking down of a specific pattern of ideological domination that conforms to Levi-Strauss' definition of cold societies and the progressive warming of a common idiom of rebellion that is based on the principal themes of this ideological tradition.
Levi-Strauss' concepts of the cold and hot do not provide us with a mechanism for analyzing the interconnections between political and religious strands in Luzon peasant movements; however, as I will attempt to demonstrate below, the ideas of the cold and the hot are abstractions that can be revised and subsequently employed in a flexible theoretical framework. I believe that an appropriate theoretical perspective is provided in Bourdieu's universe of discourse. On the author's own admission, Bourdieu's conception of discourses is extremely difficult to define in concrete situations, and we can never possess a complete knowledge of any specific discourse; basically he is referring to the implicit logic and principles which govern social activity rather than explicitly formulated rules and modes of conduct. However, Bourdieu argues that these implicit discourses are always partly objectified in oral or written traditions, or symbolic support systems such as rites, emblems and myths. In Kabylia, for example, the basic opposition between the sexes which structures aspects of peasant life as diverse as the organisation of the Berber house and its relation to the outside world, the character of agricultural and domestic labour, and the seasonal preparation of food, finds representation in a range of proverbs, sayings, taboos, rituals and myths. Bourdieu, for instance, suggests that the simple "ploughman's gesture of breaking (felleq, to burst, split, deflower) a pomegranate or an egg on his ploughshare" is a highly significant ritual act which

15. Ibid., passim.
16. Ibid., p.139.
which parallels the rites associated with "the bride's arrival in her new house."\textsuperscript{17}

As acts of procreation, that is, of re-creation, marriage and ploughing are both conceived of as male acts of opening and sowing destined to produce a female action of swelling, and it is logical that ritual enactment should mobilize on the one hand everything that opens (keys, nails), everything that is opened (untied hair and girdles, trailing garments), everything that is sweet, soft, and white (sugar, honey, dates, milk), and on the other hand everything that swells and rises (pancakes, fritters, seeds which swell while cooking - \textit{ufthyen}), everything that is multiple and tightly packed (grains of \textit{sek\textsc{u}}, couscous, or \textit{berkukes}, coarse couscous, pomegranate seeds, fig seeds), everything that is full (eggs, nuts, almonds, pomegranate, figs), the most effective objects and actions being those which compound the various properties.\textsuperscript{18}

Our knowledge of any Luzon discourse is decidedly less complete than that which Bourdieu reveals for the Kabyle of Algeria; we do not even know whether the peasantry of central and southern Luzon possess what could be properly called an integrated discourse which covers all aspects of everyday life and I do not intend to assume or speculate about the general nature of its worldviews. However, recent research by Ileto and Fegan has begun to piece together a picture of a specific discourse which, on the one hand, reflects the principal themes in the Roman Catholic \textit{Pasion} and \textit{Vigil Service} and, on the other, consistently informs peasant attitudes to rebellion and the possibility of a new society. More importantly, what they have tentatively revealed and my investigations have further confirmed is that this common idiom of rebellion or discourse has been gradually but constantly changing since the middle of the nineteenth century; in this sense, our data differs from Bourdieu's because it is located on an historical continuum. Therefore, while our data might be

\textsuperscript{17} Bourdieu, \textit{Outline of a Theory of Practice}, p.139.
\textsuperscript{18} \textit{Ibid.}, p.138.
relatively sparse we do possess well-documented accounts of certain aspects of the Luzon idiom of rebellion over a period of time; namely, the symbolic theme that focusses on the idea of light (liwanag) and myths about the return of messiahs, and how they were manifested in quite distinct peasant movements.

The historical nature of the data on Luzon's idiom of rebellion allows us to explore new directions in Bourdieu's theoretical framework and to use this theoretical knowledge to examine the principal continuities and discontinuities in peasant rebel ideologies. In my opinion, our data can be analyzed in terms of a combination of Levi-Strauss' cold and hot societies and Bourdieu's theory of discourses; what I am suggesting is that the notions of cold and hot ideologies, which I shall discuss further below, can be linked to Bourdieu's division of the universe of discourse into the domains of the discussed and undiscussed. As I will attempt to demonstrate in Chapters Four and Five, I believe that the connections between the political and religious strands in Luzon peasant movements can be better understood in terms of a changing relationship between a cold field of discussed and a hot field of undiscussed (or a hot universe of practice, to use Bourdieu's alternative phrase) in the peasant dialogue. However, before we can apply Levi-Strauss' cold and hot categories and Bourdieu's analysis of the Kabyle discourse we must first clarify our usage of the concepts and how they relate to the idiom of rebellion in central and southern Luzon.

Hot and Cold Ideologies in Transitional Societies

Levi-Strauss first introduced the notions of cold and hot societies in his Inaugural Lecture to the College de France in 1960

but to the best of my knowledge he has never systematically explored
their implications and there is some confusion, in my mind at least,
as to exactly what he meant by the terms. This confusion stems in
part from the author's imprecision, but it also flows from Levi-
Strauss' different applications of the concepts in *The Scope of
Anthropology*, Charbonnier's *Conversations with Claude Levi-Strauss*,
and *The Savage Mind*. Initially, Levi-Strauss fails to provide a
formal definition of the notions of cold and hot societies but he
appeared to be developing a set of theoretical constructs that describe
different ideological relations and patterns of dominance within
societies; thus he identifies two ideal-type situations, one in which
culture dominates the economy (cold) and the other in which the
reverse holds true (hot). What Levi-Strauss is seemingly referring
to is the dominance in different societies of fundamentally opposed
attitudes to history; according to Levi-Strauss' schema, tribal
societies attempt to deny change while industrial societies promote
it as a virtue. However, in this version of the concepts Levi-
Strauss clearly implies that they are nothing more than polar
opposites or ideal-types and he recognises, for instance, that both
hot and cold factors are present in any particular society and that
it is possible to differentiate between the "internal temperatures of
the system." By this latter phrase I suspect that Levi-Strauss
means that it is not possible to speak of societal attitudes to history
but only of different attitudes, both implied and explicit, in social
groups and institutions.

20. This Inaugural Lecture was published as *The Scope of Anthropology*.
22. *Ibid*.
In *The Savage Mind* Levi-Strauss for the first time provides us with a general definition of hot and cold societies. Cold societies are those which seek "by the institutions they give themselves, to annul the possible effects of historical factors on their equilibrium and continuity in a quasi-automatic fashion."\(^{24}\) Levi-Strauss suggests that cold societies obey a procedure, "which consists not in denying the historical process but in admitting it as a form without content. There is indeed a before and an after, but their sole significance lies in reflecting each other."\(^{25}\) Hot societies, on the other hand, function by resolutely "internalizing the historical process and making it the moving power of their development."\(^{26}\) As the above excerpt indicates, Levi-Strauss is preoccupied with tribal societies and the cold, with the result that hot societies appear as a residual category. Nevertheless, in *The Savage Mind* the author's intentions are quite clear; Levi-Strauss attempts to complement Marx's theory of infrastructures by developing a theory of ideologies in 'primitive' and 'modern' societies.\(^{27}\) In an oft-quoted passage, Levi-Strauss argues that his analysis is concerned with "the shadows on the wall of the Cave" rather than with the historically determining potential of ideological transformations.\(^{28}\) He accepts Marx's theory of the "undoubted primacy of infrastructures"\(^{29}\) and then proceeds to use the hot/cold typology to classify societies in terms of their superstructural, and presumably cognitive, characteristics. Therefore, according to Levi-Strauss

---

cold societies have a specific form of primitive mentality and a
determinate ideological structure as mutually reinforcing poles
in the social order; the connecting theme between these poles is a
dominant cold, a-historical attitude to time.

The fundamental error in Levi-Strauss' approach in *The Savage
Mind* lies, I believe, in the Platonic analogy mentioned above, which
treats collective representations as mirror images of the underlying
economy. Thus Levi-Strauss incorrectly assumes that there is, at all
times, a necessary correspondence between classificatory schemes and
the phenomenon they are seeking to classify. On this point, Godelier
accuses Levi-Strauss of failing to seriously consider the Marxist
notion of economic causality; that is, the author is preoccupied
with the internal logic of formal systems rather than with their
articulation with other structures. In the same vein, Bourdieu
criticizes Levi-Strauss for promoting a form of idealism which
holds logical categories to be universal and eternal.

Criticisms of Levi-Strauss' writings can be made on a number of
levels and they are probably inevitable; certainly Levi-Strauss'
interpretation of the concepts of hot and cold in *The Savage Mind* is
based on a reflectionary relationship between social and economic
formations and ideologies. Nevertheless, the precise role of the
economy - that is, a system of productive forces and relations of
production - in societies is by no means settled. On the other

32. Emmanuel Terray, *Marxism and Primitive Societies*, Monthly
33. Even among Marxists themselves the determining role of the
economy in different types of societies (tribal, peasant, industrial) and the degree to which it determines other
relations is a matter of debate. Non-Marxists, of course, would
deny that the economy has a determining influence on other
domains in societies; they may, for example, attach greater
importance to kinship.
hand, the question of how we are to interpret indigenous schemes of classification remains a matter of debate. In such an atmosphere Levi-Strauss' rather cavalier approach to the relationship between infrastructures and indigenous classificatory schemes is a tenuous one. However, the aspect of Levi-Strauss' hot/cold model that interests me is the implication that the terms are being used to refer to various patterns of ideological dominance in societies. For instance, when Levi-Strauss elaborates on the definition of the cold society he states that

the object of cold societies is to make it the case that the order of temporal succession should have as little influence as possible on their content. No doubt they do not succeed perfectly; but this is the norm they set themselves ... The real question is not what genuine results they obtain but rather by what lasting purpose they are guided, for their image of themselves is an essential part of their reality.

For this study the degree to which myths, rituals and other symbolic support systems counteract change is a very real question, for it has a fundamental bearing on the correspondence that Levi-Strauss assumes to exist between structural levels, that is, the economy and the superstructure/ideology. By dismissing this question, Levi-Strauss leaves the assumption of correspondence unexamined, and so he fails to explore the possibility that there can be dislocation between classificatory schemes or collective representations and material processes in societies. Consequently, Levi-Strauss not only discredits the Marxist notion of economic structures generating change, despite his protestations in The Savage Mind to the contrary.

36. Ibid., pp.177, 130.
but he also implies that societal change is a uniform phenomenon. That is, he fails to differentiate between different rates and forms of change in societies.

One cannot help gaining the impression that Levi-Strauss regards the reproduction of dominant ideological principles in cognitive structures and their subsequent duplication in social practice as necessary and inevitable processes. For example, in *The Savage Mind* he refers to hot and cold societies rather than hot or cold ideologies, economies, and so forth. Godelier has castigated Levi-Strauss for looking at history from the vantage point of the primitive societies themselves, a criticism to which Levi-Strauss could legitimately reply with the view that "their image of themselves is an essential part of their reality." This is certainly true, but Levi-Strauss has done much more than this; he has taken these self-images as the reality itself. However, it is quite clear that social formations can and do change without simultaneous changes occurring at other levels in societies and that these self-images, rather than remaining stable and intractable, subsequently adapt to new situations.

In our view, Levi-Strauss' model explicitly acknowledges the existence of only the cold and hot types of societies. That is, societies may institutionalize social and economic change at the cognitive and ideological levels - through mechanisms such as the habitus and the social discourse - and conform to Levi-Strauss' hot archetype or, to the contrary, they may harness the past (for example, ancestor worship) and natural cycles (for example, the

39. These are Bourdieu's, not Levi-Strauss', concepts.
agrarian calendar) to effectively counteract change, in which case they will conform to Levi-Strauss' cold societal type. However, I believe that there exists a third possibility which Levi-Strauss does not explore; namely, that there are transitional periods in which societies conform to neither the hot nor cold type. We need not assume that change is effectively institutionalized or counteracted, nor need we assume that there is a necessary correspondence between social and economic change and its institutionalization in other domains.

My suggestion that economic formations may pass from cold to hot states without assuming a corresponding shift at the ideological and cognitive levels is put forward for two reasons. Firstly, the internal ones: a fundamental implication of mainstream Marxism is the notion of the ultimate causality of economic structure or, alternatively, the idea that the economy has the capacity to reproduce and transform itself independently of other systems of relations in society. In my view, this theory is acceptable if we include Godelier's qualifying phrase "in the final analysis"; as I pointed out earlier, the exact determining role of the economy with respect to other domains in societies is still a matter of debate but we can agree that the economy can change without assuming that simultaneous and identical processes are occurring in other aspects of social life.

The priority of the infrastructure in subsistence economies need not be discussed at length in this thesis because, as in other economic systems, non-correspondence between ideologies and economic structures may be provoked by outside intervention in domestic economic

40. See, for example, Godelier, Perspectives in Marxist Anthropology, pp.15-17; Terray, pp.97-8; Louis Althusser, For Marx, NLB, London, 1977, pp.111-127.

41. Godelier, Perspectives in Marxist Anthropology, p.4.
processes. This is our second reason for assuming that societies may have a hot base and a cold superstructure, and it is directly relevant to the experiences of many southeast Asian societies. In southeast Asia, as in many parts of the world, the imposition of colonial rule led to the growth of a monetary economy, the rapid commercialization of agriculture and the locking of indigenous economies into the world market. Typically colonialism brought with it the institution of private property, the growth of which precipitated a shift from mixed subsistence agriculture or limited market production to an economy based on a principal export crop. Often the expansion of the cash economy led to the destruction of small-scale village industries, such as textiles, by imported manufactured commodities. Certainly these trends were evident in central and southern Luzon throughout the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries; consequently, these processes and the conflicts to which they gave rise occupy much of our attention in this thesis.

On Time and Change

Economic change, I believe, often takes place against the cultural and ideological tradition of the cold society; these traditions are principally religious but, more interestingly for our purposes, these ideas represent the culturally privileged position of a particular attitude to time. However, these two characteristics are not unconnected. For example, Yonina Talmon has suggested that the anti-historical notion of time is the most important feature of millenarism, while Edmund Leach claims it as a function of


43. Talmon, 'Pursuit of the Millennium', p.130.
religion generally.44 Nor are these isolated observations; scholarship has frequently connected millenarianism with the spread of Judeo-Christian ideas,45 and as we mentioned earlier, Ileto explicitly refers to the existence of catholic and practical notions of time among the Tagalogos of central and southern Luzon.46

The dual nature of time and history in pre-industrial societies is generally recognised by anthropologists. Talmon, for instance, argues that religious protest movements counterpose a "static" and "processual" idea of time when they anticipate the advent of the millennium bringing an end to the historical process itself.47 Bourdieu and Levi-Strauss also recognize this double meaning of time and address themselves, in part, to the problem of how the static and processual interact.48 Bourdieu argues that mythology attempts to resist the submission of human society to the passage of time understood, in A.N. Whitehead's terms, as "the sheer succession of epochal durations."49 In a beautiful and rich passage in 'The Attitude of the Algerian Peasant Toward Time', Bourdieu states that

the Kabyle peasant lives his life at a rhythm determined by the divisions of the ritual calendar which exhibit a whole mythical system ... Natural phenomenon are not perceived only as such in a naturalistic descriptive vision. Everyday experience isolates certain particular significant aspects which are treated as the functional signs of a complex symbolism. The mythico-ritual system appears to be built about a cluster of contrasts between complementary principles. In opposition to ploughing and sowing there is harvest; to weaving, the seasonal

44. Leach, p.125.
45. Hobsbawm, p.57.
46. Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change, pp.17, 18, 19, 23, 33, 42-43.
47. Talmon, 'Pursuit of the Millennium', p.131.
49. Leach, p.125.
counterpart of ploughing, the firing of pottery is opposed. Spring is opposed to Autumn, Summer to Winter, all aspects of a larger and clear contrast between the dry season (Spring and Summer) and the wet season (Autumn and Winter).  

Bourdieu subsequently expands his analysis and claims that the system of symbols that structure agriculture and crafts manifest themselves, in whole or in part, in most domains of Kabyle life. Bourdieu examines Kabyle cosmology in greater detail in his *Outline of a Theory of Practice* but the above quotation demonstrates clearly enough that, in Pierre Bourdieu's view, Kabyle peasants have institutionalized a circulatory notion of time in a highly complex mythico-ritual system based on the agrarian calendar.

Levi-Strauss likewise appears to recognize a fundamental antipathy between history as processual time and indigenous schemes of classification in so-called primitive societies. Basically Levi-Strauss is referring to patterns of cultural resistance to history and change, which he maintains are inevitable processes in all societies; for example, in *The Savage Mind* Levi-Strauss asserts that "all societies are in history and change" and, in a later article, he declares that "history exists and we must bow before it." What Levi-Strauss concerns himself with is the different reactions of societies to history and change. More precisely, he restricts his analysis to the internal logics of anti-historical classificatory schemes and, in doing so, he fails to consider the range of problems that are associated with the question of how these classificatory schemes change over time. For example, Levi-Strauss claims that for

54. Levi-Strauss, Godelier and Auge, p.47.
cold societies to succeed "non-recurrent chains of events whose effects accumulate to produce economic and social upheavals should be broken as soon as they form, or ... the society should have an effective procedure to prevent their formation."\textsuperscript{55} However, Levi-Strauss does not examine the prospect of societies lacking such a procedure, nor does he consider the impact of social and economic upheavals, which he regards as inevitable, on indigenous classificatory schemes.

I do not intend to become involved in all the different strands of enquiry suggested in the above analyses. Quite clearly, Levi-Strauss' perspective is much too inward-looking, while Bourdieu's oscillations between an ethnography of Kabyle culture and an abstract theoretical analysis raises more issues than could possibly be dealt with in this thesis. Instead I will focus on the notion of opposed notions of time, or what Dorothy Lee calls "lineal" and "non-lineal codifications of reality",\textsuperscript{56} and attempt to explain further how these attitudes to time can be fitted into the hot/cold model outlined above and, later, Bourdieu's theory of discourses.

In his article 'Cronus and Chronos', Edmund Leach analyses the notions of "repetitive" and "non-repetitive" time, which he regards not only as logically distinct but contradictory. Repetitive time, Leach argues, is a religious time which, along the lines suggested by Levi-Strauss and Bourdieu, stands against time understood as an empirical reality. Leach claims that religions seek to deny the historical process, that is, non-repetitive or processual time, by subsuming and absorbing the notion into an a-historical conception

\textsuperscript{56} Dorothy Lee, pp.136-161.
of repetitive time. The argument put forward in 'Cronus and Chronos' is brief and somewhat superficial but it parallels the type of opposition between time and history that Levi-Strauss refers to in The Savage Mind; for example, Leach's view that history is an inherent feature of our objective experience of the world closely resembles Levi-Strauss' assertions that history and change are inevitable processes in all societies. Similarly, the idea that religions seek to deny what we normally mean by history has much in common with Levi-Strauss' analysis of the role of the mythico-ritual system in primitive or cold societies.

Little if anything will be achieved if we follow Leach's argument to its logical conclusions and launch a debate on its finer philosophical problems; in any case, such an exercise would be based on speculation. However, the idea of separate notions of time and history is important, as are the connections Leach draws between types of time and religions, and it is one that has been taken up and explored in greater depth by other authors. Maurice Bloch, for instance, has recently suggested that two conceptions of time operate simultaneously in any society. For Bloch the first could be called practical time, for it refers to a momentum which is contained in the economic base and it is the guiding principle underlying the organisation of practical activity and everyday communication. The second type could be called ritual time, a notion which Bloch equates with Radcliffe-Brown's idea of social structure. Ritual time differs from practical time because it is based on the mythico-ritual representation of a static, timeless past rather than on contemporary

57. Leach, p.125.
58. Ibid., p.125.
60. Ibid.
empirical experiences in the production process. Practical time is the present infrastructural "system by which we know the world" while ritual time is the retrospectively constructed ideological structure or "system by which we hide it."¹⁶¹ Practical economic activity and a past solidified in mythologies and rituals interact and provide the basis for actions as well as cognitive schemes embodying different conceptions of time.

The analyses mentioned above are significant because, if one accepts the Marxist notion that the economy in societies can change without assuming an immediate and identical pattern of changes in other systems of relations, then it is possible to see how cold ideologies - that is, repetitive, static, or non-lineal theories of history embedded in myths, rituals and religions - are brought into opposition to contrary experiences evident in the social and economic processes - that is non-repetitive, processual or lineal views of history that are perceived in the practical, everyday world. In fact, both Bourdieu and Bloch question Levi-Strauss' assumption of correspondence by raising the possibility of non-correspondence between superstructures and infrastructures manifesting itself in terms of a dislocation between cold ideologies and a hot economy.¹⁶² Both realize that in any society a hot/cold break may occur between ideological/cognitive structures that embody an a-historical, reflectionary connection between the past and the


present and the 'objective' economic and political processes which govern practice in the world as it is presently constituted.

The development of disjunctures between inherited ideologies and current representations of economic and political processes, which I have characterized in terms of Levi-Strauss' notions of the cold and the hot, respectively, is a crucial aspect of the argument put forward in this thesis. Such a break, I believe, occurred in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region in the mid-nineteenth century when a society previously characterized by subsistence modes of production and a dominant catholic ideology entered a period of transformation leading towards the formation of a capitalist economy and class structure. This process of separation is intimated by Ileto when he distinguishes "Pasion time" and "human time", the world of the Pasion and the world of everyday experience, and addresses himself to the attempts of Luzon peasant movements to reconcile the two themes in a coherent worldview. 63 We shall deal with this more fully in the next three chapters; that is, after we have shown how Bourdieu's universe of discourse can help us explore the articulation of the catholic ideological structure (cold) and the new economy (hot) in the nineteenth and twentieth century in Luzon. It is this articulation, I believe, which provides the key to understanding the politicization of the religious idiom in Luzon peasant movements between the Confradia de San Jose in the 1840's and the rise of the Huk's a century later.

Universes of Discourse

Bourdieu's universe of discourse enables us to explore the cognitive implications of the dislocation between historical (hot) and non-historical (cold) attitudes to time by examining how the

63. Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change, pp.17, 18, 19, 23, 33, 42-43.
boundaries which determine the explicit content of a particular discourse are effected by social and economic change. That is, Bourdieu's theory of discourses raises the very important problem of how the boundaries separating the fields of the discussed (orthodoxy/heterodoxy) and the undiscussed (doxy) are redrawn in transitional societies. In so doing, I believe we are better equipped to understand how the structures of meaning that were available to the Luzon peasantry in the early nineteenth century were constantly restructured by transformations in the economy; in short, we can explain more adequately how the religious idiom took on the additional functions of a class ideology as the economic base became hotter. However, to achieve this knowledge we must first understand how Bourdieu uses the concept of the universe of discourse and outline briefly the theoretical schema in which he locates it.

"Every established order", Bourdieu argues, "tends to produce (to very different degrees and with very different means) the naturalization of its own arbitrariness." That is, societies maintain and reproduce themselves through a systematic naturalization, legitimation and misrecognition of their power structure and exploitive nature. It is this system of "symbolic violence" which constitutes what Godelier calls the ideological "internal armature" of the social structure. In Bourdieu's theory, the perpetuation of any regime of symbolic violence rests on the structuring and re-structuring of the universe of discourse or modes of classification through which members of a society think and talk about their collective situation. Modes of thought and conceptual schemes or languages, which are inseparable aspects of the same reality in

64. Bourdieu, Outline of a Theory of Practice, p.64, my italics.
65. Levi-Strauss, Godelier and Auge, p.46.
Bourdieu's argument, are based on relationships between interdependent domains within the universe of discourse. As I will try to demonstrate in Chapter Five, I believe the dominant catholic idiom in Luzon society was a system of symbolic violence and that it can be analyzed in terms of Bourdieu's theory of discourses.

Bourdieu argues that the social order imposes a definition of reality by manipulating the boundaries separating the undiscussed, discussed and critical spheres in a culture's discourse. This is achieved, firstly, by limiting the realm of the discussed or increasing the extent of doxa and, secondly, by standardizing opinion or increasing the field of orthodox thought and restricting the heterodox field of ideational conflict and controversy. As I will attempt to show in Chapter Three, what happened in Luzon was that catholicism inculcated transcendental views of history and change - people were expected to endure suffering in this world and adopt modes of conduct modelled on the Trinity and the Saints so that they might be saved in the next world - and demanded that such views be accepted as an article of faith. In this way catholicism preempted the explicit formulation of notions of secular and political change and enforced strict interpretations of its teachings. Certainly catholicism's control of the meanings attached to particular religious themes gradually waned with the rising tide of nationalism and class conflict but, even then, peasant movements that were regarded as heretical by the Roman Catholic Church embraced the example of Biblical figures in their interpretations of change; for instance, many Luzon movements, such as the Confradia de San Jose and Guardia de Honor, were devoted to specific religious personages, and the majority of movements emphasised, in one form or another, the
return of a saviour. 66

Bourdieu makes two observations 67 which emphasise the importance he attaches to the manipulation of the boundaries within the universe of discourse and for this reason I cite them verbatim.

The boundaries between the universe of (orthodox or heterodox) discourse and the universe of doxa, in the twofold sense of what goes without saying and what cannot be said for lack of an available discourse, represents the dividing-line between the most radical form of misrecognition and the awakening of political consciousness.

Bourdieu clearly suggests in this passage that any change in the boundary dividing the domains of explicit discourse and the undiscussed is politically significant; however, Bourdieu raises another very important issue when he adds that

the relationship between language and experience never appears more clearly than in crisis situations in which the everyday order is challenged, and with it the language of order, situations which call for an extra-ordinary discourse capable of giving systematic expression to the gamut of extra-ordinary experiences that this, so to speak, objective epoch has provoked or made possible.

The author then quotes with approval, as I do here, Jean-Paul Sartre's poignant remark that "words wreck havoc when they find a name for what had up to then been lived namelessly."

Bourdieu's position on the relationship between language and experience and the domain of the "unthinkable" and "unnameable" is

66. The Confradia de San Jose was dedicated to the patron saint Joseph and the Guardia de Honor the Virgin Mary. Early movements, such as the Confradia, anticipated the return of Christ while later movements more commonly anticipated the return of Christ-like Filipeno martyrs like Rizal and Salvador. See Chapter Four of this thesis.

reasonably clear; basically he suggests that 'objective crises', such as the rise of class divisions, lead to an awakening of political consciousness by challenging the taken-for-granted character of common-sense knowledge. However, as I have indicated above, the boundaries that define what is discussed and how it will be discussed in a culture are not immutable. Both Bourdieu and Bloch are aware of the possibility of shifts occurring in these boundaries but neither address themselves to this problem. Bourdieu, for example, leaves us with the comment that

the critique that brings the undisputed into discussion, the unformulated into formulation, has as the condition of its possibility objective crisis, which, in breaking the immediate fit between subjective structures and objective structures, destroys self-evidence practically. 69

Bloch admits the same possibility but he also fails to explore its implications;

the infrastructure has ... its own cognitive system for the actors and its realization can be, and is, used occasionally to challenge that other consciousness of the invisible system created by ritual ... The timeless static past in the present is then challenged by the present. 70

Both Bourdieu and Bloch realize that economic change may produce "crises", such as the emergence of class divisions, which challenge the prevailing ideology but they leave us without exploring its long-term implications. However, Bourdieu suggests two particular avenues that are of interest to us here. Firstly, why and how do objective crises not only bring the formerly undisputed into discussion but into dispute? Secondly, how, despite objective crises, do cognitive schemes predating any transformation of the economy and the crises that accompany it survive into the

70. Bloch, p.287.
present? That is, how can we account for the transposeable nature of cognitive schemes? I believe these are crucial questions if we are to understand the role of the religious idiom in Luzon peasant movements. Moreover, I believe they can be answered by incorporating the hot and cold ideological types mentioned earlier and Bourdieu's theory of discourses in a single conceptual framework.

The Framework

Economic change, I propose, produces a series of crises or what Bourdieu calls "extra-ordinary experiences" which bring into open conflict the notions of cold/repetitive and hot/historical time; this conflict, I suggest, is reproduced in a culture's discourse and manifests itself as a conflict between the domains of the discussed (orthodoxy) and the undiscussed (doxy). In central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region in the nineteenth century, for example, the relationship between the discussed and the undiscussed may well have reflected a series of oppositions in the prevailing discourse between, respectively, the cold, religious domain and the hot, political domain. Insofar as the Luzon peasantry possessed a discourse on history and social change it was borrowed from catholicism; as I mentioned earlier, the Pasion and the Vigil ritual effectively established a transcendental view of history whose principal elements consisted of enduring the evils of this world and obeying prescribed holy laws so that one might be saved and enter a perfect world in the afterlife.

The cold elements of the nineteenth century Luzon discourse were explicit themes, such as the anticipated return of Christ and the idea of salvation, and concrete symbols, such as the cross and light, which

promoted the view that history and change belonged to the religious rather than the secular, political world. These elements constituted the prevailing domain of the discussed; that is, the peasants tended to represent change in terms of predominantly catholic models. At the same time, the Church proscribed interpretations of perceived change in the social order in terms of secular, political models. This situation could prevail while social and economic change was kept to a minimum but, as these changes became more obvious in the nineteenth century, it became increasingly difficult to reconcile catholic views of history with perceived changes in the everyday world. These perceptions of social and economic change are very difficult to document in their early stages because they are submerged in the prevailing religious framework and related to the observer in an indirect fashion. For example, the Confradia de San Jose shared much in common with the other catholic brotherhood organisations of the same period that were actively supported by the religious orders but it also contained hints of an emerging nationalist and class ideology; on the one hand, its antagonistic relationship with the Spanish friars must be seen as a double-edged resentment of the Spanish and the friars, while, on the other, its hostility towards the Chinese and Chinese mestizos was a bitterness engendered not by a blind racism but by the role of a specific ethnic group as money-lenders and landlords. However, if we trace Luzon peasant movements since the Confradia de San Jose we can see that changes in the social formation were increasingly reflected in the peasants' discourse. Nevertheless, as I will show in Chapter Five, it is difficult to draw precise distinctions between cold and hot elements

72. See Chapter Four in this thesis.
in the Luzon discourse because the peasants themselves did not
develop a new system of political concepts and symbols; instead, they
changed and augmented the meanings they attached to the catholic
idiom. For this reason I will leave the analysis of hot
representations of change and the question of how the cold and hot
are related in the Luzon discourse to Chapter Five.

From a theoretical standpoint, the crucial relation that we can
analyze is that between the discussed and the non-discussed domains.
Change and the crises it produces gradually destroy the barriers
separating these domains, firstly, by producing an antagonism
between the forces that shape the formation and reproduction of
cognitive schemes (habitus) and, secondly, by creating experiences
that are unclassifiable in terms of the prevailing structures of
meaning or discourse. On the one hand, the inherited schemes of
classification (cold) conflict with the experience of change in the
practical world (hot); on the other, the experience of change (hot)
cannot be explained through the established meaning systems (cold)
unless they are radically reorganized. What anthropologists must
attempt to understand, I believe, is how peasants armed with a cold
language develop an appropriate set of meanings when they are
confronted with a changing economy and new social relations. There­
fore, we must examine the factors that both limit and make possible
the leap from peasants living social change to their being able to
articulate it.

As Bourdieu points out, we must be careful in our approach to
avoid treating "practice as a mechanical reaction, directly determined
by antecedent conditions, and entirely reducible to the mechanical
functioning of pre-established assemblies."73 We should also be

aware of the pitfall which he refers to as the "occasionalist illusion which consists in directly relating practices to properties inscribed in the situation." The issue at stake, therefore, is not whether peasants (or anyone else) are imprisoned or constrained by pre-ordained schemes of classification or whether they are prisoners in a Pickwickian sense; rather the problem pertains to the interaction of pre-established categories with prevailing conditions of existence since this interaction shapes the construction of an appropriate discourse in a changing world. In short, our approach should take into account the dialectic between inherited conceptual schemes and the conditions in which they operate.

Groups and individuals are inculcated with a dominant belief system that reflects the cold nature of the society and these pre-established assemblies are structurally compatible with the functioning of the society in which they originated. That is, they have an anti-historical (or a-historical) form. This compatibility in cold societies of myths and economics is important, I believe, because it allows meaning systems to be passed down through time. That is, they are quite capable of explaining social and cultural practice during periods of societal stability and evolutionary change; the past and the present, myth and practice, are mutually reinforcing. In this schema, "pre-established assemblies" and the "properties inscribed in the situation" reflect one another. However, the

74. Bourdieu, Outline of a Theory of Practice, p.81.
75. Goody, The Domestication of the Savage Mind, p.33. Goody has vehemently criticised the type of approach that I am advocating, but I agree with several of his reviewers who argue that Goody has failed to provide a suitable alternative. See Chapter Six of this thesis.
77. Bourdieu, Outline of a Theory of Practice, pp.73, 81.
warming of the economy in cold societies practically destroys the principle on which the reproduction of inherited meaning systems is based. Accordingly, social change breaks the nexus between inherited structures of meaning (cold) and contemporary social and economic practice (hot); cold ideational schemes are confronted with history as a practical process and, because of their bias, they cannot render that process meaningful. For Sartre these changes form part of those things that are "lived namelessly." 

Confrontations between inherited conceptual schemes, such as those installed by catholicism in early colonial Luzon, and new experiences, such as those which flowed from social and economic change in rural Luzon in the nineteenth century, are most clearly manifested in a culture's discourse. Peasant formations must re-make the structures of meaning and re-organize the universe of discourse when faced with divisions and conflicts not found in kinship-based subsistence societies; for example, peasants are faced with the dilemma of how to interpret class structures based on private property in land and new patterns of landlord and tenant relations.

Thus traditional schemes are presented with a conceptual no-man's land, a sphere of practice that is alien and undefined and which belongs to neither the realm of orthodox discussion nor that of doxa. These experiences are lived in an officially meaningless vacuum, in the literal sense that they cannot be immediately formulated within existing conceptual schemes (positive, orthodox), nor can they be defined by exclusion and relegated to the realm of the undiscussed (negative, doxa). They are classified, both positively and negatively, and hence cannot be articulated in a systematic manner.

78. Sartre, p. 783.
79. This notion is too difficult to discuss here. In Chapter Four I deal with the emerging political discourse in central and southern Luzon.
However, the problem of how extra-ordinary experiences are manifested in a culture's discourse is further complicated by the fact that they are typically areas of inherent conflict; in southeast Asia, and in regions like the Mekong delta of southern Vietnam and central and southern Luzon in the Philippines in particular, the social and economic change that followed colonization invariably led to a maldistribution of wealth and the formation of a disadvantaged peasant class. We shall return to this later, but first let us consider the possibility of alternative conceptual schemes. Firstly, the prevailing structures of meaning or the language of orthodoxy can be transformed and the new experiences thereby encompassed by the traditional idiom; as I will show for the case of Luzon in Chapter Five, orthodox catholic ideas on the return of Christ, light and mystical knowledge were radically re-structured by successive peasant movements in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Thus, I suggest that new situations may become the object of explicit discussion within the traditional idiom or, in rare cases, the idiom might be adapted so that these situations can be defined from the field of discussion; the latter, I believe, is a logical possibility that is rarely if ever realized.

Secondly, an awareness generated by living in a changed, and changing, social and economic world may provoke an extra-ordinary discourse of a political nature. That is, peasants may abandon the traditional idiom and develop an entirely new language, such as an explicit class ideology, that is directly related to the conflicts and divisions evident and emerging in the social and economic formation. In this case, peasants may borrow terms from outsiders and adapt them to their specific situation and cultural heritage, a process which appears to have happened with the seemingly infinite variations of
anarchism and class theories that surface in rural movements; or, an emerging political consciousness might find representation in new sayings, such as the Tagalog expression 'Filipinos of heart and face' which heralded the awakening of nationalist and class sentiments in central and southern Luzon.

Of course, in reality, peasants frequently combine old and new concepts; that is, concepts and symbols from the traditional idiom are given additional meanings and augmented with new sayings and ideas borrowed from outside groups and political literature. For example, during the nineteenth century peasant movements in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region adapted the Catholic idiom, and while religious themes continued to be employed until the 1940's at least, they were increasingly supplemented with communist, socialist, and anarchist ideas that filtered down from radical urban organisations that were founded in the early twentieth century.

The interaction of pre-ordained schemes of classification with inarticulate forms of political awareness, I suggest, imposes definite limits to the adaptation of orthodox religious categories and the development of an explicit political discourse alike. Traditional worldviews that are structured according to the logic of the cold society, that is, a circular and anti-historical notion of time, are practically challenged by an awareness of change itself. That things are no longer as they were is revealed to the peasants in every aspect of their lives and it is patently obvious. However, the experience of contrast between the past and the present heightens both the perception of change itself and the fundamental nature of this change. Consider, for example, the alienation of communal lands in central and southern Luzon in the nineteenth century. In the absence of the institution of private property, access to land was taken-for-granted.
in the early Filipino community and it formed the cornerstone of both its culture and economy. It is likely that the local people perceived alienation of the land in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries through this network of doxic patterns. Obviously, they were losing their economic independence but they were also being denied that which was regarded as a cultural right.

The shattering of these doxic patterns does not in itself explain the emergence of religious images of revolt in central and southern Luzon but it does make it virtually impossible for traditional schemes to define emerging conflicts negatively. In short, changes in the social and economic formation can no longer be dismissed to the level of the undiscussed and natural. What was once taken-for-granted and self-evident, such as access to land and the protection of the patriarch, is destroyed in a practical way; the patriarch becomes a landlord who hires those he dispossessed to work land that was once theirs. However, social change also makes it difficult for pre-established meanings to explicitly or positively represent these new experiences. For example, there is no real fit, to use Bourdieu's terminology, between inherited religious categories and the transformed secular world in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region in the nineteenth century. The symbols and ideas of the Catholic Church appear irrelevant to the social and economic crises that confronted the peasant class at that time; that is, while catholicism stressed spiritual notions of change and history, the virtue of suffering in this world and the ultimate salvation of souls in the afterlife, the peasants increasingly took cognizance of the inequities and their particular burdens in everyday life. In short,

the cold discourse of catholicism simply did not address itself to the everyday problems of a society that was changing rapidly and changing against the interests of the peasants. Nevertheless, as we shall see, while Luzon peasant movements since the Confradia de San Jose have re-shaped the religious idiom and gradually woven it into a secularized class ideology they have retained a basic set of catholic concepts and symbols; in fact, there is a striking resemblance between the various idioms employed by peasant movements since the Confradia de San Jose. How and why this happened will be explained more fully in Chapters Four and Five, but I will outline below what I consider to be the principal reasons for the survival of catholic symbols and concepts in Luzon peasant movements.

We must be very careful in our analysis of the impact of social and economic transformations on catholic discourse in nineteenth century Luzon; in particular, as I will explain in Chapter Three, I believe we must distinguish between the ideological and idiomatic dimensions of the culture's discourse. In Luzon, I suggest that three separate factors - the culture's failure to prevent change, to conceptualize it adequately in terms of antecedent meaning systems, and to dismiss the social and economic conflicts it raised to the realm of the undiscussed - destroyed the cold ideological functions of the traditional catholic discourse. What social change destroyed was the ideological dominance of an anti-historical attitude to time which relegated secular change to the realm of the undiscussed. However, these events did not destroy the catholic cultural idiom, for the concepts and symbols that catholicism had inculcated in the Luzon peasants remained an integral part of their culture. One might expect change to destroy the concepts and symbols of the cold discourse as they are obviously out of place in a rapidly changing environment.
But this does not necessarily happen in all cases, for reasons which will be now apparent to the reader.

In an essay on the social and economic formations of the Inca Empire during the sixteenth century, Godelier speaks briefly of old ideological forms that correspond to former, more egalitarian relations of production in Indian communities. These, he argues, hide to all intents and purposes the exploitive nature of a newly-emerging Asiatic Mode of Production. However, I suggest that the reverse process can also hold true, for under certain conditions old ideological forms may come to challenge the perceived inequities of new modes of production. In the Philippines, the erosion of Spanish colonial authority, the decline of theocratic control and the rise of anti-clericalism in the nineteenth century by no means spelt the death of catholicism as an official institution in Luzon or as a potent force in peasant worldviews. Admittedly, the leading role of the monastic orders in the alienation of agricultural lands in central and southern Luzon may have created the specific historical conditions that enabled the peasants to use catholic symbols and concepts to formulate nationalist and class interests. However, the paradox remains that peasant movements which attacked monastic supremacy in Luzon utilized the format of the catholic brotherhood and the religious idiom as their central unifying theme.

The survival of the religious idiom in Luzon peasant movements was facilitated by certain obstacles to the development of an explicitly political discourse. Three general conditions appear to inhibit the construction of an alternative political language.

Firstly, the concepts and symbols of the traditional cultural idiom were the only means widely available to people for communicating with one another. While these concepts might not be entirely appropriate for all occasions they have a decided advantage over their alternatives in that they possess the readily accepted properties of any vernacular or cultural system.

Secondly, the cold ideological bias inherent in a surviving cultural idiom does not simply disappear but is gradually eroded and displaced by perceptions of change and their eventual articulation in a culture's discourse. For example, the symbol of light in Luzon peasant movement did not, I believe, lose its religious significance but it slowly acquired an additional set of political meanings in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries; as I will argue in Chapter Five, light changed from being a monosemic symbol in early movements such as the Confradia de San Jose to a polysemic one in twentieth century peasant movements.

Thirdly, and most importantly, is the fact that an adequate political language did not exist and cannot be spontaneously produced by social and economic conditions. On the contrary, it must be either imported, which assumes close and sustained contact with outside groups facing similar political conflicts; or else, a political language has to be constructed, which necessarily involves a gradual and long-term process of transforming collective experiences into new signifying practices. The problem of the availability of an explicitly political discourse, of a discourse geared to a new kind of economy, and of the differential access of various social groups to political ideas, is probably the main reason for the leading role of educated, urban, middle-class elements in the organisation of modern peasant-based
movements. However, the point that must be repeatedly emphasised is that discourses cannot be simply exchanged in a mechanical way when they are confronted with unfamiliar situations; moreover, as the catholic idiom employed by Luzon peasant movements indicates, concepts and symbols are flexible and they can, and do, change over periods of time.

Pierre Bourdieu's and Maurice Bloch's ideas on the practical critique that challenges inherited structures of meaning are important and I have made them a central theme in my conceptual framework. However, for us the problem remains, how we can discuss that range of phenomenon brought into discussion by social change. How will these new experiences be articulated? The identification of an opposition between hot and cold notions of history and an analysis of how it is manifested in cultural formations and cognitive mechanisms is a necessary but preliminary consideration. As Bourdieu himself is well aware, "crisis is a necessary condition for a questioning of doxa but it is not in itself a sufficient condition for the production of a critical discourse."

In Luzon the transformation of collective experiences into new signifying practices seems to have rested on an integration between pre-established assemblies and concrete situations. One strand of this interaction is Bourdieu's practical questioning of the undiscussed; that is, the extent to which social and economic change is inexplicable in terms of the prevailing system of meanings or cultural idiom. Quite clearly, one cannot logically reconcile perceptions of rapid change

with a cold discourse, and one would expect an entirely new discourse to emerge in these situations. For example, an a priori connection between Christ's *Pasion* and the struggle of the Luzon peasantry for a better life cannot be established. The two themes are not necessarily contradictory but they obviously relate to different planes of reality. However, the other strand of this interaction can be described in terms of Bourdieuan logic as the cultural questioning of practice; that is, the extent to which perceptions of change can be accommodated in and shaped by the prevailing cultural idiom. I believe that Bourdieu raises a valid point when he argues that "the would-be most radical critique always has the limits that are assigned to it by the objective conditions" but there is another set of factors which limit and shape the development of a radical discourse. That is, the formation of a radical critique is pre-constrained by the available ensemble of symbolic structures, in the same sense that Levi-Strauss' "bricoleur" (the art of "bricolage") is bound by the finite range of material at his disposal. What I am suggesting, therefore, is that the interaction I referred to above rests on attempts to reconcile an inherited body of concepts and symbols with constantly changing situations in the everyday world. For example, in the absence of a class ideology in the nineteenth century the Luzon peasants were forced to use the prevailing regime of concepts and symbols, or some part of it, to articulate the conflicts which arose from a changing economy and an emerging class structure.

Of course, there are various degrees of articulation and in cases where cold ideologies and hot social and economic relations

85. Leach, p.125.
are juxtaposed the use of the available symbols to represent current practices must be difficult. However, it should be emphasised that in Luzon the application of catholic schemes from the Pasion and Vigil to define a changing secular world led, firstly, to a redefinition of these schemes themselves and, secondly, to perceptions of change which bore the definite imprint of these schemes. On the one hand, the symbol of light and myths about the return of Christ increasingly reflected changes in the social and political world inasmuch as they became hotter; on the other, the use of catholic themes continued to give perceptions of change a definite religious bias. In the process, both the pre-established catholic assemblies and perceptions of change were constantly modified.

In this chapter I have attempted to provide a theoretical basis for examining political discontinuities and religious continuities in Luzon peasant movements between the Confradia de San Jose in the 1840's and the Hukas a century later. Quite clearly, I believe these features of Luzon movements must be considered in the broad context of an emerging peasant class trying to come to grips with its position in a social and economic order that was rapidly changing. Our problem is to understand why the Luzon peasants continued to employ catholic symbols and concepts to articulate discontent and how the meanings attached to these religious themes were altered by changing social and economic relations. To this end, I have used Levi-Strauss' concepts of the cold and the hot and Bourdieu's theory of discourses, along with supplementary theoretical insights, to define the constantly changing relationship between the catholic symbolic universe and Luzon's social and economic formations.

What we are really talking about is how the Luzon peasantry in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries articulated a disjuncture
between an inherited set of cold catholic symbols and concepts and an economy which was becoming progressively hotter. I am not simply referring to peasants using a given set of symbols to define an emerging pattern of economic conditions; such a perspective would miss the subtleties of the relationships involved. Both the cultural idiom and the concrete situations in which the peasants found themselves were manipulated, the one in terms of the other, and neither remained the same. The peasants of central and southern Luzon attempted to re-define their everyday world in terms of catholic models but, in the process, they also re-defined the concepts and symbols that they employed. While Luzon movements invariably failed to change the material world, and thereby alleviate the economic plight of the peasantry, they did manage to create a set of meanings or discourse capable of giving systematic expression to peasant perceptions of change and the place of the peasants in the social order.

Nevertheless, a theoretical analysis of the disjunction between cold worldviews and hot perceptions of change in Luzon in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries and of how the peasants struggled to provide themselves with an appropriate interpretation of history does not constitute a sufficient explanation of religious images of revolt. Certainly the Luzon experience closely resembled that of other southeast Asian countries; for example, the economic changes that swept through the central plains of Luzon in the last century closely paralleled those introduced into the Mekong delta of southern Vietnam by the French at the same time. However, in other respects the Luzon experience differed quite markedly from that of its near neighbours; the most significant of these difference, I believe,

88. This is Ileto's principal argument.
related to the impact of the colonial religion on the indigenous culture. Luzon was not only colonized much earlier than most parts of southeast Asia but from the arrival of the Spanish in 1565 to the early 1800's the principal domestic objective of the colonial power was to propagate catholicism among the Filipinos. Moreover, the friars were extremely successful in achieving these aims. What I shall argue in the next chapter is that the pattern of rebellion that began to emerge in the mid-1800's reflected the prior role of catholicism in the early colonial period and the radical break with pre-Hispanic forms of social and economic organisation that had prevailed until then. Thus to appreciate the nature of the disjuncture between a cold discourse and hot economic processes in central and southern Luzon we must attempt a concrete historical analysis of the Luzon experience.
Chapter Three

CATHOLICISM AND CHANGE IN CENTRAL AND SOUTHERN LUZON

How do the concepts of the cold and hot and the universe of discourse, as we have outlined them in the previous chapter, help us to explain the partial transformation of the religious idiom in Luzon peasant movements into a secularized, class ideology? I believe they do this by providing the conceptual apparatus which allows us to identify the principal cultural and economic forms in Luzon history and to subsequently analyze how the relationships between them were changing in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. That is, these concepts place us in a better position to understand the dominant role of catholicism and the processes leading towards the formation (or reformation) of a cold society in early colonial Luzon. Levi-Strauss' concepts of the cold and hot, for instance, clarify our understanding of the religious impact of Spanish colonialism in the pre-nineteenth century period and the way in which the pattern of ideological domination established by catholicism gradually disintegrated in the latter colonial period. However, it is Bourdieu's theory of discourses which provides the mechanism for analyzing these processes. By treating catholicism as a specific discourse, or as a crucial aspect of the Luzon peasants' discourse, I believe we can analyze three important questions which relate to the changing structure of Luzon peasant ideologies under Spanish and American domination. Firstly, we can examine the dominant role of catholicism in the pre-nineteenth century Luzon society in terms of a cold ideology; secondly, we can systematically analyze the disjuncture that appeared between the cold religious idiom and the emerging hot economy in the nineteenth century; thirdly, we can show how the articulation of this disjuncture between
religious worldviews and secular, political perceptions eventually led to the inclusion of secularized, class politics in a significantly revamped catholic framework in Luzon peasant movements.

In this chapter I will apply Bourdieu's theory of discourses in societies to two aspects of Luzon history. Firstly, I will attempt to show how catholic symbols and concepts functioned as a cold ideology in early colonial Luzon and led to the formation of what Levi-Strauss calls a cold society. That is, I will attempt to show how catholicism became a mode of domination based on a religious model of history and change firstly, by structuring collective representations or an explicit discourse - that is, Bourdieu's orthodox domain - on history and change in terms of the *Pasion* and *Vigil* and, secondly, by successfully defending this discourse against perceptions of history and change as secular, political phenomenon which it regarded as heresy. Catholicism was successful, I suggest, because change in the social and economic formation in the early colonial period was basically imperceptible; this meant that non-religious interpretations of social and political processes could be more easily relegated to the realm of doxa. That is, the religious view of history and change could become the dominant view because it was not contradicted in the everyday world of the peasants. Certainly the overall structure of Luzon society was changing, but many of these changes were not to bear fruit until the early nineteenth century; in the early colonial period, life in the fields continued to follow pre-Hispanic patterns.

However, the transformation of the Luzon economy in the early nineteenth century through to the mid-twentieth century produced perceptions of change which increasingly challenged the religious discourse's transcendental view of the historical process. The concepts and symbols of the traditional *Pasion/Vigil* discourse could not adequately represent the crises which the peasants increasingly
Map One: The Philippines
faced, such as their dispossession from landholdings and the depredations of moneylenders. Nor, however, could the religious discourse suppress the experiences and perceptions of an emerging Luzon lower class, although as I have explained in Chapter Two, it could impede the development of an alternative discourse that was more closely geared to the new economy. How this disjuncture between the cold catholic discourse and hot perceptions of social change came about is the subject of this chapter; how it was resolved by the Luzon peasantry must be left to Chapters Four and Five.

The transformation of the Luzon economy into a hot type was reflected in the shift towards class politics in the tradition of rebellion between 1840 and 1940. This trend manifested itself in the gradual demise of the mystical religious brotherhoods in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries and the rise of the politically more sophisticated unions and Huk movement by the 1920's and 1930's. One can quite easily commit the error of overdrawning the differences between early peasant brotherhoods like the Confradia de San Jose and Guardia de Honor and later movements like the Tanggulan, Sakdalista and Huk. Peasant movements up to the Hukes, at least, continued to use a common idiom based on catholic ideas and symbols. However, I suggest that this idiom was increasingly expanded into the realm of class and nationalist politics; that is, religious symbols were de-mystified and gradually acquired a set of political meanings. In terms of Bourdieu's framework, perceptions which had previously been confined to the domain of doxa were now continuously introduced into the realm of discussion as new social relations and exploitive practices manifested themselves in the economic process. For example, while the Confradia de San Jose and Guardia de Honor anticipated the return of Christ the brotherhoods
of the 1920's and 1930's embodied myths focussed on the rebirth of popular Christ-like folk heroes like the bandit leader, Felipe Salvador, the patriot, Jose Rizal and the Katipunan leader, Andres Bonifacio. A similar trend was evident in the use of the idea of light in peasant movements. Light (liwanag) originally symbolized a form of mystical religious knowledge but it became attached to what can be called light symbols, the Sun and the East, which signified secular political goals such as Philippine Independence and the liberty of the Tagalogs.¹

What I am concerned with in this thesis is the articulation of conflict as it unfolded through the tradition of rebellion rather than a definitive history of agrarian Luzon or the peasant movements themselves. Therefore, in this chapter my objective is to show how the tradition of rebellion was fostered by an emerging pattern of social, economic and cultural relations in central and southern Luzon in the nineteenth century, and to demonstrate that the articulation of conflict reflected the widening gulf between the inherited catholic view of history and perceptions of change as a secular, political phenomenon. That is, I hope to convince the reader through an analysis of certain aspects of Luzon history, that an interaction between distinct cold and hot traditions provided the basis for religious continuities and political discontinuities in the peasant tradition of rebellion.

CATHOLICISM AND CONTINUITY IN EARLY COLONIAL LUZON, 1565-1800

What were the definitive features of Spanish rule in central

¹. For an analysis of the idea of light and its connections with political symbols see Fegan's article and Ileto's thesis mentioned earlier. See also Reynaldo Ileto, 'Tagalog Poetry and Image of the Past During the War against Spain', in A. Reid and D. Marr (eds.), Perceptions of the Past in Southeast Asia, ASAA
Map Two: Central Luzon and the Southern Tagalog Region
Luzon and the southern Tagalog region in the early colonial period? Such a question is difficult to answer and it is open to a number of legitimate interpretations, but it should be realized from the start that the Spanish conquest and pacification had a highly selective impact on the colonized. The task of governing the Philippines fell to a small group of colonial administrators, who were interested in accumulating personal wealth, extracting revenue for the King, and keeping the colony within the Spanish Empire, and a band of friars, whose principal objective was to convert the indigenous population to catholicism. The continuation of this regime until the early nineteenth century was to have far-reaching implications for Luzon society, not only because it resulted in a basic re-structuring of the indigenous belief system but because it failed to significantly change the traditional social and economic formations. Consequently, early Luzon society was a mixture of Spanish and pre-Hispanic institutions and practices.

There was a significant degree of continuity between the pre-Hispanic and the early colonial social and economic formations. The Spanish conquest in the latter half of the sixteenth century led to

F.n. 1 continued.


the formation of a centralized, bureaucratic state\textsuperscript{4} which appropriated part of the existing agricultural surplus from the villages; these periodic depredations must have been regarded as extortion from above by a remote, alien class. However, this method of extracting a surplus left the pre-Hispanic modes of production virtually intact. The Spanish instituted a system of corvee labour (called \textit{polo}) and a scheme for collecting tribute (the \textit{encomienda}),\textsuperscript{5} but while these were draconian institutions the colonization of Luzon did not lead automatically to an expansion of the productive forces within the agrarian economy itself.\textsuperscript{6} It was not until the early nineteenth century that Spanish colonialism combined with foreign capital to begin transforming the agrarian economy of central and southern Luzon.\textsuperscript{7} Initially, however, the indigenous economic structure was charged with the burden of sustaining a parasitic state and an unproductive merchant class that was preoccupied with reaping profits from the galleon trade between China and Mexico. In this sense, Godelier's essay on the colonial manipulation of the Inca social formation and the manner in which the existing social relations took on additional functions is relevant to the Luzon experience.\textsuperscript{8}

The economic organisation of the village communities (\textit{barangays}) of central and southern Luzon in the early colonial period conformed to what Marshall Sahlins broadly labels the Domestic Mode of

\begin{enumerate}
\item The centralized, bureaucratic nature of the early Spanish administration is constantly referred to by Renato Constantino, \textit{A History of the Philippines: From the Spanish Colonization to the Second World War}, Monthly Review Press, New York, 1975, pp.27, 39, and so forth.
\item A good account of the \textit{polo} and \textit{encomienda} is found in Cushner, \textit{Spain in the Philippines}.
\item Godelier, \textit{Perspectives in Marxist Anthropology}, p.110.
\item This will be discussed later in this chapter.
\item Godelier, \textit{Perspectives in Marxist Anthropology}, pp.63-69.
\end{enumerate}
Production. Production was the prerogative of decentralized, relatively autonomous, familial units who exercised usufruct rights to specific parcels of land that were communally owned. Some land was held in common, for example, mountain ridges or tingues, and could be used by the entire community; the more fertile lowlands were owned by a particular clan and divided amongst its member families.

Production was oriented to use or "use-value" rather than "market-exchange". The pattern of domination in the social order rested not on the principle of private ownership of economic resources but on the control of labour through debt peonage and kinship structures. The mechanism underlying the reproduction of this mode of domination was a complicated system of rules governing inter-strata marriage, extra-marital sexual relations, and the hereditary status of children which cut across the social divisions separating the principal strata in the village.

There were four principal strata in the early Luzon social formation, consisting of the village headmen or chiefs (datos), nobles or warriors (Maharlicas), commoners or freemen (timagua), and an indebted class of sharecroppers (mamamahay and guiguilir).

13. This was established by an analysis of de Plasencia's data in 'Customs of the Tagalogs'.
14. The following analysis of the barangay is based on Phelan's,
However, the effective division was that between the free or creditor and the dependent or indebted classes. This dichotomy in the indigenous society creates an illusion of a class structure, though I believe the latter was absent from early Luzon society. The Domestic Mode of Production mitigated against the formation of classes but more importantly, I believe, the absence of private property in land and an interlocking network of kinship and creditor/debtor relations gave the social organisation a definite hierarchical form. For example, it appears from a close examination of de Plasencia's account of the early forms of clan organisation that preferential rules governed inter-strata marriage, extra-marital sexual liaisons, and the status of offspring within the creditor/debtor relationship.

I suggest that in two ways debt peonage and kinship structures maintained the prevailing power relations in Luzon villages, which were based, as I have mentioned above, on the direct control of labour. Firstly, bonds of consanguinity were used to extend the kinship domain and subsequently the volume of labour at the disposal of a particular patriarch. Because these ties cut across wealth differences, economic divisions were subsumed within extended kinship relations. Secondly, the practice of passing debts onto successive generations virtually guaranteed the reproduction of a dependent class of sharecroppers. That is, relations of blood and debt were manipulated to control labour through the expansion of the kinship domain itself and the reproduction of a class of dependent sharecroppers within that domain. Available sources indicate that the relationship between the free and dependent strata was based on an

F.n. 14 continued.

de Plasencia's and Constantino's data.
asymmetrical reciprocity which conjoined what Sahlins has called a "norm of reciprocity with a reality of exploitation."\textsuperscript{15}

The degree of continuity between the pre-Hispanic and the early colonial social and economic formations should be emphasised. Both the indigenous and post-conquest economies were geared to the reproduction of existing structures rather than change, with the control of labour through kinship networks and debt peonage coinciding with a low level of development of the productive forces. Private property, market exchange and capital accumulation did not provide the basis for a new pattern of domination until the nineteenth century and consequently, I suggest, we cannot speak of class formation in the early colonial period. In fact, one of the striking features of the colonization of central and southern Luzon was that it left the indigenous modes of production largely unchanged. The new regime was undoubtedly cruel, but village life continued to be dominated by the traditional rhythms of the rice cycle. As John Leddy Phelan and Renato Constantino acknowledge, rather than replacing pre-Spanish forms of dependence and exploitation, the colonial state institutionalized these modes of inequality.\textsuperscript{16}

This brings us to another important aspect of the colonial impact on the agrarian society in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region. One cannot equate the survival of the pre-Hispanic social and economic formation with the impotence of the Spanish regime at the village level or the absence of change in Luzon society. Spanish power, I maintain, rested on neither the economic control of Luzon's resources nor a military presence in the archipelago, but on the monastic orders and the introduction of catholic ideology.

\textsuperscript{15} Sahlins, \textit{Stone Age Economics}, p.134.

\textsuperscript{16} Phelan, \textit{The Hispanization of the Philippines}, pp.98, 105, 110, 113; Constantino, \textit{A History of the Philippines}, p.38.
The Spanish Church and catholicism appear to have led to a significant re-structuring of the indigenous belief system. The most influential orders, the Augustinians, Discalced Franciscans, Jesuits, Dominicans, and Augustinian Recollects arrived in Luzon between 1565 and 1606 and by the mid-seventeenth century the friars were entrenched in central and southern Luzon. As Rafael Bernal claims:

everything outside the city of Manila was relinquished into the hands of the missionaries. Spanish officials would venture out into the provinces only once a year to collect tribute ... The Filipinos living in the fields and in the provinces were left to their old ways of life.

I believe it is difficult to overestimate the role of the Church and the importance of catholicism in central and southern Luzon in the early colonial period. On the one hand, the religious orders played a very considerable part in the direct administration of Spanish rule. The official tax-collectors made annual forays into the countryside and periodically Filipinos were forcibly drafted into labour gangs, but this was the extent of the contact between the Spanish and Filipino communities. The priests, however, were in constant contact with the rural population and officialdom willingly conferred on them local administrative functions and the role of watchdog. It was through a monopolization of these local government functions that the friars provided an indispensable connection between the colonial state

17. See map of the geographical distribution of cabecera churches in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region (Figure 1). This map, which was taken from Phelan, The Hispanicization of the Philippines, p.176, marks the location of cabecera or the principal parish churches in 1655; it does not show the location of visita chapels, small outlying churches that fall within the jurisdiction of the cabecera and which were visited by the parish priests. Nor does the map show the growth in churches in the following centuries.

Map Three: The Geographical Distribution of *Cabeza* Churches in Central Luzon and the Southern Tagalog Region in 1655.
and the dispersed rural villages. Most observers acknowledge the importance of the friars to the continuation of Spanish sovereignty in the archipelago. However, it should be stressed that their power lay not in the secular domain, even though this was considerable, but in the cultural and ideological nature of catholicism and in their christianizing mission. As we shall see when we consider the idiom of rebellion and the systems of meaning utilized by peasant movements in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, catholic ideology was to have far-reaching implications for the structure of belief systems in central and southern Luzon.

Among the Spanish observers at the time, perhaps no-one perceived the strategic political role of the monastic orders more clearly than Tomas de Comyn. As offensive as his ideas might now be, de Comyn was nevertheless an astute and meticulous commentator. He saw the friars as "the mainspring of the whole of this political machine" and argued that Spanish power rested, above all, on "the powerful influence of religion."

Let us travel over the provinces, and we shall there see towns of five, ten, and twenty thousand Indians peacefully governed by one weak old man who, with his doors open at all hours, sleeps quietly and secure in his dwelling without any other magic, or any other guards, than the love and respect with which he has been known how to inspire his flock.


21. Ibid., p.108.

22. Ibid., p.109.

23. Ibid., pp.107-108.
de Comyn continues:

of little avail would have been the valour and constancy with which Legazpi and his worthy companions overcame the natives of these islands if the apostolic zeal of the missionaries had not seconded their exertions and aided to consolidate the enterprize. The latter were the real conquerors; they who, without any other arms than their virtues, gained over the goodwill of the islanders, caused the Spanish name to be beloved, and gave to the King, as it were by a miracle, two million more of submissive and christian subjects. These were the legislators of the barbarous hordes who inhabited the islands of this immense archipelago, realizing by their mild persuasion the allegorical prodigies of Amphion and Orpheus.24

Tomas de Comyn realized that while the colonial regime could not sustain a protracted military campaign against a potentially hostile population in central and southern Luzon, religion could incline the Filipinos "to bear our dominion without repugnance."25

It is not possible for any human institution to be so simple, and at the same time so firmly established, or from which so many advantages might be derived in favour of the state, as the one so justly admired in the spiritual ministry of these islands.26

Central and southern Luzon in the early colonial period fulfilled de Comyn's expectations and became, not coincidentally I believe, both the stronghold of catholicism and "the citadel of Spanish power"27 in the Philippines.

The Formation of a Cold Society in Early Colonial Luzon

In considering the impact of catholicism on the indigenous population in the early colonial period it is necessary to understand how catholicism re-structured the existing belief system and the overall significance of this re-structuring process for Luzon's agrarian society. This can be done, I believe, by identifying and analyzing two complementary but by no means identical functions

26. Ibid., p.105, my italics.
fulfilled by the catholic discourse. Firstly, it operated as a positively and explicitly constituted system of concepts and symbols or an identifiable religious language which drew heavily on the 
Pasion texts and Vigíl Service. That is, it was a cultural idiom or discourse, a way of knowing about the world and a means of expressing this knowledge. However, this is only a partial picture of the impact of catholicism. In its total operation, and this is our second point, catholicism contained positive and negative dimensions which embodied a hidden ideological structure that was biased in favour of the sacred (cold) and against the profane (hot). That is, catholicism was a transcendental worldview which suppressed secular and political modes of thought and expression; it was not only a way of knowing the world but, in a de facto sense, a way of knowing what the world was not. By extolling a particular view of history and change, catholicism simultaneously denied other views or, at least, it denied those views which ran contrary to its schemes. In this context, which is obviously influenced by Bourdieu's theory of discourses, I believe we can refer to catholicism as an ideology and because it became the cornerstone of Spanish domination and legitimated the prevailing distribution of power we can refer to it as a dominant ideology.

We shall discuss the idiomatic and ideological strands of catholicism more fully below. Before turning to this, however, I would like to clarify the notion that the catholic discourse consisted of an explicit idiom on the one hand and an implicit mode of domination on the other. This ideological domination operated through the catholic idiom itself; for example, the Pasion and Vigíl were centred on the explicit theme of the return of Christ and in so doing they espoused a notion of history and change that was firmly
located on the religious or supernatural plane rather than the secular, political plane. That is, by advocating a supernatural interpretation of life and societal processes it not only created a religious model of change but it also denied that change was a secular process that could be shaped without supernatural intervention. As I shall attempt to explain in a moment, this idiom was structured on the basis of an opposition between the cold, religious and discussed and the hot, political and undiscussed; that is, it was structured on the basis of an opposition between Bourdieu's orthodoxic and doxic domains in the Luzon discourse.

My contention that we should recognize and differentiate the idiomatic compared to the ideological implications of catholicism in Luzon society is one that is central to many anthropological exegeses on tribal and christian religions. For example, the notion that religious schemes unite the societally obligatory and the psychologically desirable is an important strand in Victor Turner's interpretation of Ndembu ritual. What I am suggesting, following on from Chapter Two, is that it is useful to consider the idiomatic and ideological poles of catholicism in Luzon separately because the hidden ideological functions of religion may be destroyed without assuming a corresponding destruction of its idiomatic forms. For example, perceptions of change in the secular world may successfully challenge the traditional premise that history and change are enacted on the religious plane without substituting an alternative idiom; as I have pointed out earlier, there are definite limits to the development of new concepts and symbols, and while the traditional discourse

28. This connection between the "ideological" and "sensory" is explicitly referred to by Lessa and Vogt in their preamble to Victor Turner, 'Planes of Classification in a Ritual of Life and Death', in William A. Lessa & Evon Z. Vogt (eds.), Reader
might not be entirely appropriate to newly-emerging conditions, established concepts and symbols can take on additional meanings. Perceptions of change may lead to the introduction of formerly undiscussed phenomenon into the field of discussion, and in this way existing concepts and symbols can acquire new meanings. This certainly appears to have happened with the changing role of the catholic discourse in central and southern Luzon. As I will attempt to demonstrate in Chapters Four and Five, the ideological mode of domination which de Comyn admired as one of the major virtues of catholicism collapsed in the nineteenth century; but peasant movements continued to employ the universe of symbols that it had installed to challenge the existing order of things. Moreover, they constantly expanded the meanings of catholic concepts and symbols into the realm of secular, political conflict as the tradition of rebellion and the new economy unfolded.

To understand how catholicism operated as a cultural idiom and a dominant ideology in the early colonial era we can apply Bourdieu's demarcation of the domains of critical discussion (heterodoxy), everyday discussion (orthodoxy), and the undiscussed (doxy) to the Luzon discourse. To clarify the nature of the relationships involved I have extended Bourdieu's definition of the universe of discourse to include the realm of doxa, the negative sphere of taken-for-granted or undiscussed phenomenon, thereby separating it from the idiom or discourse proper, or what Bourdieu calls the field of opinion. 29

F.n. 28 continued.


Figure One: The Catholic Universe of Discourse in Central Luzon and the Southern Tagalog Region

UNDISCUSED - SECULAR AND POLITICAL - perceptions of economic change, social divisions and conflict, inequalities and exploitation. HOT - history and change as process

DISCUSSED (ie., discourse or idiom)

RELIGIOUS - for example, Pasion and Vigil concepts and symbols, COLD - supernatural, sacred, return of Christ, spiritual afterlife, rebirth, salvation/redemption, etc.

OTHER-WORLDLY INTERPRETATIONS

THIS-WORLDLY PERCEPTIONS

30. Figure One is adapted from Bourdieu's diagram, Outline of a Theory of Practice, p.168.
The Catholic Idiom in the Early Colonial Period

What we have called the catholic cultural idiom is the discussed part of the universe of discourse; that is, the cultural idiom is the regime of explicit, articulated concepts and symbols or the everyday language which people employ to signify perceptions about their world or some part of it. In Bourdieu's framework, the cultural idiom is the positively constituted, visible, and coherent organisation of ideas and symbols which constitute the orthodoxic and heterodoxic domains. In Luzon society, we are not concerned with the total idiom or all of its manifestations in everyday life; what we are concerned with is a specific catholic idiom as it was projected onto Luzon society through recitals of the Pasion and enactments of the Vigil, and how this idiom related to perceptions of history and change in Luzon society. Ultimately, of course, we are interested in how this part of the field of discussion changed and how these changes were accommodated in the framework of the catholic idiom.

In Luzon society, catholicism took the form of a series of isolated mystical ideas conveyed through an elaborate and sometimes obscure religious symbolism rather than a complete theological education based on a reasoned intellectual discourse between the friars and the Filipinos. The friars realized that it was logistically and culturally impossible to transplant catholicism into Luzon in the form that it had been built up in Europe over the centuries. Moreover, the religious orders were faced with the task of reconciling the shortage of missionaries with the objective of converting the Filipinos to catholicism as quickly as possible. The latter took precedence, and the friars were forced to teach only the central tenets of christian

31. Cushner, Spain in the Philippines, p.91.
theology and orthodox religious practice to as many Filipinos as possible. By the early seventeenth century, the number of converts had reached an estimated half million, with the area of most intense proselytizing extending from La Union and Pangasinan in North-west Luzon, through Pampanga and Bulacan in central Luzon, to the provinces of Laguna de Bay and Batangas in the south. These areas, and in particular those closest to Manila, became the stronghold of catholicism in the Philippines. The Muslim population in the southern Philippines resisted the encroachments of the Spanish and were never catholicised, while in northern Luzon the mountainous terrain and the scattered tribesmen were beyond the reach of the friars and it yielded few converts.

In central and southern Luzon the friars conducted sermons that concentrated on four principal themes; the ideas of eternal damnation, immortality of the soul, the existence of God as the Supreme Deity, and the ultimate salvation of christians in the afterlife. Oral instruction was the most common method of teaching but, for the most part, the religious concepts communicated were isolated, abstract, and metaphysical. However, they were often represented in simple oppositions such as, for example, Christ and Devil, Heaven and Hell, Pagan and Christian, and very importantly, Salvation and Damnation. Equally importantly, the monastic orders employed a mode of teaching that relied on the use of sensual and perceptual devices to overcome any cognitive difficulties the indigenous culture may have associated with the inculcation of alien concepts. For example, the Vigil Service held on holy Saturday night during the celebration of Easter is a ritual display of the return of Christ from the dead, while the


Pasion is a verse account of Christ's crucifixion that is sung on Good Friday.\textsuperscript{34} Quite clearly, the Vigil and the Pasion are reinforcing the same themes, the notion of redemption being the most important.

Two features of this religious education were to have long-term significance for the indigenous society and Luzon peasant movements in particular. Firstly, abstract religious beliefs were firmly rooted in graphically illustrated settings. The Pasion and the Vigil re-told the story of Christ's trial in separate venues, but both were saturated with catholic symbols; the Church, itself an impressive symbol and meeting-place for symbols, and ritualized fiestas further enshrined religious practice in a mystical symbolism. What catholicism evidenced was an overlapping of symbolic planes; that is, networks of symbols played a prominent part in connecting ideas in the Pasion and Vigil. For example, the connecting themes of light, mystical knowledge and redemption were presented through a haze of forceful symbols; the Church (candles, icons depicting religious scenes), an array of concrete denotata (robes, crucifixes, rosaries), and festive celebrations (music, singing, dancing). These myths and symbols became a central feature of Luzon peasant movements and the cross, for example, has been taken up by movements occurring in the nineteenth century as well as contemporary religious movements that have established themselves independently of the Catholic Church.\textsuperscript{35}

Secondly, as Prospero Covar intimates, the friars insisted that the efficacy of worship depended on the faithful performance of rites and

\textsuperscript{34} Shoesmith, p.153, Fegan, pp.3-8, and Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change, passim.

\textsuperscript{35} P.R. Covar, 'General Characterization of Contemporary Religious Movements in the Philippines', Asian Studies, 13, 2, 1975, pp.79-92. For the role of catholic symbols in earlier movements see Chapter Four.
the solemn observance of holy occasions. This feature was not confined to catholicism, but the friars were perhaps more insistent than most.

The constant performance of highly ritualized practices created an intense religious atmosphere in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region in the early colonial period. Religious displays took on a public theatrical form; each religious act was projected into village life. The calendar was punctuated with holy days, but there was also the daily offering of prayers and the ringing of the bells. The frequently used phrase which describes villagers living 'under the bells' is an indication of the extent to which catholic ideas and symbols permeated everyday peasant life; a large wooden cross in the village plaza provided the focus for the daily renderings of the Rosary and the ringing of the bells at sunset drew the faithful to pray for the souls already condemned to Hell. No doubt, it also reminded them of the religious duty that the Church had prescribed for them and the consequences that could flow from forgetfulness. This seems to have been the principal objective of the friars; that is, they attempted to reiterate a few key religious ideas by dramatizing them. Phelan, for instance, describes one scene in terms of "candlelit processions of penitents dressed in hood and gown, large floats depicting scenes from the Pasión, the thick aroma of incense, and noisy music." Cushner claims that priests sometimes went so far as to preach of heresy and damnation against a backdrop of pitch fires.

38. Ibid., pp.74-5.
Spanish and Pre-Spanish Religious Beliefs

We know very little about the religious beliefs of the people of central and southern Luzon at the time of the conquest, but we can gain some knowledge of its broader features from Spanish accounts and the remnants of the indigenous culture that have survived into the modern era. Available sources indicate, for instance, that the pre-Hispanic religion was based in the preternatural (as opposed to supernatural) or lower mythological sphere; that is, the emphasis was on the semi-corporeal and naturalistic beings that were believed to populate the environment and intervene periodically in everyday human activity. Stephen Hislop argues that this level of belief was closely linked to the spirit world of the ancestors (anitos) but that it included spirits as a general category; for example, demons, witches, elves, merfolk and ghouls. Apparently, these part-human, part-animal creatures were believed to be the reincarnated form of the ancestor spirits but, more importantly I believe, they were regarded as being fundamentally hostile to humans. One of the central objectives of rituals, for example, was to placate the ancestral spirits; they watched over man's intervention in nature and were believed to punish violations of the world of nature. Rural folk, for instance, were often reluctant to fell large trees because it would disturb the dwelling place of spirits.

43. Ramos, p.4, has a comprehensive list of lower mythological beings.
44. Ramos, p.6.
45. Examples such as this are found throughout the literature. See note 41.
The Spanish did not introduce the supernatural notion of a Supreme God into central and southern Luzon. We do not know whether all the cultural and ethnic groups in central and southern Luzon had conceptions of a Supreme Deity but the majority of the population, the Tagalogs, had two deities. Again our knowledge of these Gods is limited, but they were referred to as Bathala, a term most probably of Malayan or possibly Muslim extraction, and Diwata (variations of which were Diwa, Divata, and Dwata), a term believed to be of Indian origin. According to Hislop, the Tagalogs regarded Diwata as the universal Supreme Being, the preeminent God of all peoples, while Bathala was revered as the God of the Tagalogs themselves.

The Spanish and pre-Spanish belief systems were formally compatible and this contributed, I believe, to the rapid spread of catholicism in central and southern Luzon; in contrast to, for example, northern Luzon which proved inaccessible to the friars and some of the southern Philippines that had come under the influence of Islam. The two belief systems were compatible in the sense that both possessed supernatural domains and because catholicism could elaborate on existing beliefs in upper mythological figures without jeopardizing these pre-Hispanic notions. However, while catholicism did not formally conflict with the pre-Spanish religious scheme it did fundamentally alter the roles of the supernatural and preternatural spheres in Luzon society. This was done, firstly, by establishing a religious disposition that was intrinsically otherworldly and, secondly, by making this otherworld accessible to mortals.

46. Hislop, pp.145-146.
47. Ibid., p.146.
Catholic and Pre-Hispanic Religious Worldviews: Interaction and its Effects

The monastic orders were not interested in the everyday world as such, but in the fate of the soul in the afterlife. In contrast to the pre-Spanish religion, which recognised the practical necessity of harmonious relations with the spirit world (for example, to obtain plentiful harvests and retain good health), catholicism shunned pragmatism and held that moral rewards and punishment came in the afterlife. One emphasised the destiny of individuals in the everyday world, the other the ultimate fate of souls in another world. Catholicism's utopia and purgatory were not for this life; ideally, life in this world meant following a strict moral code dictated by subservience to God and obedience to the universal truths that constantly revealed themselves through Biblical analogies. Catholicism was, as John Phelan argues, an "apocalyptic, messianic and prophetic mysticism."48

The missionary crusade shifted the focus of Luzon beliefs towards the supernatural sphere by emphasising the notion of God as an all-powerful spiritual force and the destiny of souls in the afterlife. As I have mentioned above, catholicism's appeal to the emotions was extremely forceful and it appears to have been deliberately orchestrated by the monastic orders. However, catholicism also made the supernatural domain accessible to humans in the afterlife. The Church not only provided rules and procedures that enabled communication with the Higher Divinity but it also permitted the faithful to exercise some control over their ultimate destiny. In fact, the catholic notion of controlling the destiny

of the soul must be used with considerable reservation because it is by no means clear whether the Filipinos of central and southern Luzon appreciated the distinction between spiritual and actual rebirth or whether the friars bothered to dispel indigenous ideas of being reborn in a literal sense.

These changes in the belief system were important in several ways, for the indigenous Tagalog deities, Bathala and Diwata, were inaccessible to human supplication and to spiritual force; that is, they were believed to exist but could not be influenced by either the living or the anitos. While there was constant interaction between human society and the lower mythological anitos, it appears that the upper mythological sphere maintained a separate and unrelated existence. This may account for the apparent lack of everyday importance attached to the supernatural domain in the pre-Spanish religious schema.

The inaccessibility of Bathala and Diwata, the beneficient deities in Tagalog religion, virtually condemned villagers to living in a world populated by spirits that were antagonistic to them. The pre-Hispanic religious scheme was based on a fatalistic dialogue between the world of the living and that of the dead, hence belief constructed a corpus of knowledge that was essentially retrospective and introverted. Mythical thinking and rituals focussed on the appeasement of the spirits which reincarnated the past. Death marked the passage into the dark, deformed, and evil world of the ancestors and stood in sharp contrast to the catholic notion of rebirth, spiritual or otherwise. Catholicism certainly threatened recalcitrants

F.n. 48 continued.
with eternal punishment in Hell, but it also held out the promise of salvation in a mystical utopian future. The catholic God could be favourably influenced by conduct obeying the christian code of morality, a series of truths to be accepted, events to be hoped for, and virtues to be practised. After the ritual initiation into the Church, Filipinos were required to attend Mass and offer prayers regularly, as well as participate in the multitude of holy occasions prescribed by the Church.

Catholicism superimposed a cultural idiom on pre-Spanish beliefs which undoubtedly failed to fulfil all the expectations of the clergy. Many of the indigenous rites survived the onslaught of the friars and continue in various forms until today. The religious orders must have privately questioned the extent to which the indigenous people understood the meanings of catholic beliefs. However, it is understandable if the villagers of central and southern Luzon found catholicism slightly bewildering; religious meanings were ambiguous and imprecise because their contextual significances were still obscure. For example, the dual notions of salvation and damnation were dramatized and reiterated through the use of symbols and images but at no stage were they rigorously defined. It is doubtful whether the neophyte's interpretations ever closely matched those of the friars. Nevertheless, despite these problems, catholicism was to have far-reaching implications for the peasants' worldview, albeit by synthesising catholic and indigenous beliefs. There was, for example, a marked shift away from the fatalistic concern with the dead and the reincarnated past that had been at the centre of the old belief system and towards new ideas of salvation and a mystical utopia. We

cannot be sure when this shift took place, though it was most probably a gradual process, but by the nineteenth century the centrality of the notions of salvation and a future utopia in the belief system is clearly evident in Luzon peasant movements. Therefore, I believe catholicism introduced a millenarian theme into Luzon religious, and later, political, beliefs by expanding the supernatural domain and making the higher mythological figures accessible to people.

Catholicism certainly established a new system of concepts and symbols in central Luzon and southern Tagalog society but it would be a mistake to see its implications in religious terms alone. Tomas de Comyn, as mentioned above, had a very astute appreciation of the political significance of the Church and its teachings for the continuation of Spanish power in the islands. As I will attempt to show, it was perhaps more important than even he realized; in an ironical twist in history, it was to bear an unexpected harvest in arming radical peasant movements. Catholicism always was both a religious and political force in Luzon society though, for reasons that will become clear in this thesis, its political role changed dramatically in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

How can we understand the changing role of catholic beliefs in Luzon politics? When I introduced the notion of the cultural idiom I used Bourdieu's outline of the universe of discourse to differentiate between the idiomatic and ideological dimensions of the new religion. I believe the relationship between these two spheres is most important. The ideological significance of the catholic belief system can only be understood, I suggest, in terms of the total functioning of the universe of discourse that it established. What we are interested in here is the relationship between the cultural idiom established by
catholicism, the manifest field of discussed, and the latent realm of doxa or undiscussed. This relationship, which is submerged in the universe of discourse, is an ideological one because it embraces hidden political discriminations that are realized in the interplay of positively and negatively constituted categories. For example, light symbolisms in the Catholic Church represented a theosophical theory of power which held that religious figures were the source of legitimate knowledge; that is, it dictated that if the laws of God were obeyed and suffering endured in this world then the individual would be rewarded in the afterlife. In this way, a range of mystical concepts, like salvation and redemption, and mythical models or parables, such as the examples of the Saints, the Virgin Mary and the return of Christ, institutionalized one particular discourse on history and change at the expense of others. By representing change on the religious plane and rigorously defending its stance, catholicism constantly tried to relegate perceptions of change as a secular, political phenomenon to the realm of the undiscussed. That is, it constructed domains of legitimate and illegitimate knowledge and sought to maintain the divisions between them.

I believe ideology functions in terms of the positive content of the field of discussed and the conceptual domain that it defines negatively by exclusion; that is, it functions by constructing an explicit corpus of knowledge and by condemning that which lies outside this body to the realm of doxa. In central and southern Luzon, catholicism not only defined how history and change were discussed, and defended itself against secular, political interpretations, but it also sought to maintain the status quo. That is, it attempted to maintain the boundaries it had established between the discussed and thinkable and the undiscussed and unthinkable. These boundaries in
the Luzon discourse are important because they moved quite noticeably from the early nineteenth century and resulted in significant changes in the field of discussion. As I will attempt to demonstrate in the following chapters, the emergence of secular, political interpretations of change and the parallel failure of catholicism to render them impotent coincided with the transformation of the Luzon economy in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

I suggest that the manifestation of religious continuity and political discontinuity in peasant movements can be interpreted in terms of the breakdown of the cold ideological domination of early Luzon society and a corresponding shift towards using the catholic idiom to frame secular and political perceptions of change. That is, the emergence of a hot economy destroyed the cold ideological bias of catholicism, but it left the peasants with the task of explaining social and economic change in terms of the available concepts and symbols. This task, as I have already intimated, was an extremely difficult one; there was no readily available alternative to the catholic idiom, yet catholic concepts and symbols were not geared to the new social order. Nevertheless, in their attempts to define their changing situation, the peasants of central and southern Luzon creatively transformed the religious idiom into a political discourse; as the rise of class divisions and conflicts between the indigenous population and foreigners became more pronounced, social and political observations gradually entered the field of discussion and the religious idiom was secularized and politicized. For example, as I will explain in Chapter Five, the religious symbol of light (liwanag) which was used to signify a form of mystical knowledge was increasingly associated with the symbols of the Sun and the East, symbols which signified nationalist and class sentiments.
The Political Implication of Catholicism in Early Colonial Luzon

Catholicism was a conceptually narrow and rigidly defined belief system. In referring to what he calls "religions of conversion", "the excluding religions", or "religions of the book", Jack Goody suggests that, "with their fixed point of reference, their special modes of supernatural communication, (they) are less tolerant of change."\textsuperscript{52}

it is learning the word of God (or his prophets) or the proper order of service that takes central place. The skill is subordinate to the content and that in turn subordinate to the demands of orthodoxy. The exclusive religions not only attempt to exclude the circulation of heretical thoughts but offer a set of relatively fixed answers to a range of important problems.\textsuperscript{53}

However, Goody suggests that while the "religions of conversion" are less flexible, "the myths they recount, the rites they perform, the rules they promote, need have no specific relationship with any particular social structure with which they are associated."\textsuperscript{54} The point that is relevant for us is that while the catholic idiom embodied a set of fixed ideas, such as, for example, salvation and the return of Christ, the other-worldly and general nature of these ideas enabled them to be applied in a range of contexts. This was the case in central and southern Luzon when peasant movements began using the concepts and symbols of the Catholic Church; their use of the catholic forms ranged from the wearing of crosses and robes to the adoption of millenarian christian themes and the brotherhood type of organisational structure.

By its very nature, catholicism in the early colonial period

\textsuperscript{53} Ibid., pp.14-15, my italics.
\textsuperscript{54} Ibid., p.2.
sustained an extensive field of doxa, and in doing so it established a clearly defined set of ideological parameters. It implanted conceptions of a future utopia in which believers would come to rest and championed a worldview that was in every respect mystical and other-worldly. In this way I believe catholicism constructed an ideological paradigm whose principal function consisted in relegating this-worldly perceptions to the realm of the undiscussed. The ideological mechanism downgraded secular experience and inhibited the realization of an articulate political discourse geared to the conflicts in the social and economic formation by giving this-worldly relations a set of other-worldly interpretations. For example, crises could be interpreted as signs of the return of Christ and as an indication that the millennium was at hand.

Catholicism denied the logic of human practice and the hot or historical notion of time by translating them into religious categories. In 'Two Essays Concerning the Symbolic Representation of Time', Edmund Leach explains by example how religion negates the empirical experience of reality:

Religions of course vary greatly in the manner by which they purport to repudiate the 'reality' of death; one of the most commonest devices is simply to assert that death and birth are the same thing - that birth follows death, just as death follows birth. This seems to amount to denying the second aspect of time by equating it with the first.55

Leach argues that,

if it were not for religion we should not attempt to embrace the two aspects of time under one category at all. Repetitive and non-repetitive events are not, after all, logically the same. We treat them both as aspects of one thing, time, not because it is rational to do so, but because of religious prejudice. The idea of Time, like the idea of God, is one of those categories which we find

55. Leach, p.12. Leach's first type of time is "that certain phenomenon of nature repeat themselves", while his second is "that life change is irreversible."
necessary because we are social animals rather than because of anything empirical in our objective experience of the world (Anee Sociologique, 5, 248, Hubert & Mauss, 1909).

Catholicism in central and southern Luzon achieved the same results by establishing a worldview that was anchored in a mystical conception of this world and the next.

Catholic ideology not only imposed severe restrictions on the construction of an explicitly political discourse because the religious idiom was available but, more importantly, I believe it impaired the perception of worldly events in secular and political terms. Politics, which I understand to be the embodiment of practical, non-repetitive and historically hot time, was suppressed in peasant conceptualizations of their world by being confined to the domain of doxa in early colonial Luzon. Catholicism's power as an ideology rested on the capacity of the monastic orders and the doctrine itself to install an all-encompassing definition of the social and political world by portraying this world in a religious framework. For example, as a transcendent worldview catholicism attached the highest priority to the process of becoming, while simultaneously nullifying the opposed state of being. Religion inculcated a mode of thinking and speaking in the Luzon peasantry that was based on the transmutation of profane, worldly events into sacred, other-worldly schemes; the here and now obviously continued to exist on the empirical plane and assert itself in everyday affairs, but concrete practical activity acquired meaning in the religious context. Unusual events, for instance, could be seen as a portent of the impending millennium. The advent of the millennium would transport the soul into a mythical utopia and bring an end to history in a

56. Leach, p.12.
timeless, unchanging world. Human history was submerged in a religious history and the passage of the spirit took precedence over the transformation of society; social and political perceptions were concealed in the mystical, apocalyptic and messianic themes of the catholic idiom. In the early colonial period, interpretations of the social and political order were derived from an external religious framework rather than, as might be expected, from the concrete historical processes themselves.

In central Luzon and the southern Tagalog provinces, catholicism could impose a negative definition of social reality until the early nineteenth century because, I believe, economic change failed to produce a practical questioning of the premises on which it was based. Everyday experience did not demand what Bourdieu calls an "extra-ordinary discourse." As I have indicated earlier in this chapter, the social and economic formations pre-dating the conquest remained largely intact until the beginning of the nineteenth century. Until this time, nothing arose in the village world that could not be explained in the religious idiom. The peasantry had not, as yet, at least in a practical and identifiable sense, become "alienated in analogy." There was an "immediate fit" between the prevailing social and economic structures and catholic interpretative structures or, to use Foucault's terminology, religion could establish "resemblances" between that which it ordained and that which the world presented.

61. Foucault, pp.28-29.
In the early colonial period, the unchanging nature of the peasant economy and the dominance of an other-worldly catholicism combined to bring to central and southern Luzon what Levi-Strauss has outlined as the principal features of the cold society. However, the fate of this cold society rested on the conjunction of an inherently other-worldly catholicism and the continued existence of an economy that was geared to reproduction and use-value rather than transformation and exchange-value. The observation that pre-capitalist economies are regulated by the subsistence ethic and seem resistant to internal change is a common one in the anthropological literature. Quite often, these societies deify the subsistence process in mythico-ritual representations of the natural cycles that govern everyday life; Bourdieu's ethnography of the agricultural calendar of the Kabyle of Algeria is itself a most valuable account. However, other authors working in southeast Asia have outlined the significance of the rice cycle in ordering the lives of lowland peasants. What I am suggesting is that the appearance of a cold ideological domination of the economic base is an illusion because it rests, in the final analysis, on the lack or weakness of any momentum for change in the economic structure itself. That is, the institutions of cold societies which Levi-Strauss claims are engaged in counteracting or annulling an active historical dynamic in the infrastructure are in

63. Scott, *The Moral Economy of the Peasant*, passim. Scott's analysis is centred on what he calls the "subsistence ethic", a term which defines in terms of economic, social and moral components. Scott's book is useful for pointing not just to exploitation but to the chronic insecurity that follows the development of market relations in peasant societies.
64. Bourdieu, 'The Attitude of the Algerian Peasant Toward Time' and *Outline of a Theory of Practice*.
fact merely reinforcing an existing quality in subsistence economic systems. This is not to deny the role of ideologies and institutions in the formation and maintenance of the cold society but to point out that the capacity of an ideology to negate historical change ultimately rests on the nature of the prevailing modes of production.

We need not enter into the protracted debate on the relationship between superstructure and base, culture and economy, or the host of epistemological problems that this debate raises. However, we should point out that our analysis is carefully trying to avoid two extreme views: firstly, the notion that ideologies merely reflect the material base or that they are nothing more than a set of mirror-images of the underlying economic relations; secondly, the notion that ideologies and people's conceptual schemes can be arbitrarily separated from that society's system of economic relations and treated as independent domains. What I am suggesting is simply that there can be non-correspondence between ideologies and economic practices in a society, and that the articulation of this non-correspondence is central to our understanding of the continuities and discontinuities evident in the peasant idiom in Luzon. As I will attempt to demonstrate below, I believe such a contradiction emerged in central and southern Luzon in the early nineteenth century when an established set of anti-historical catholic beliefs were increasingly challenged by the rapid transformation of the agrarian economy.

F.n. 65 continued.
THE EMERGENCE OF THE HOT LUZON ECONOMY

The catholic discourse that had been established in the early colonial period was increasingly challenged by the conflicts and divisions that began appearing in Luzon's social and economic formation in the early nineteenth century. It is not necessary for us to reconsider in detail the evolution of class structures in central and southern Luzon as they have been thoroughly documented in the literature. However, we should briefly outline the series of transformations that marked the transition from a subsistence economy to a monetized, export economy because they were reflected in the idiom of peasant rebellions. Nevertheless, while these social and economic transformations underlie the shift from a cold religious idiom to a hot secularized class ideology they are more important in the analysis of the causes of rebellion than the articulation of conflict which occupies our investigation. Once we go beyond the goal of trying to explain why they fail to occur, and attempt to determine how peasants frame their responses to exploitation, then cultural factors begin to play a more important part. For this reason I am not attempting to list the social and economic preconditions for rebellion in Luzon; instead, I will try to show how perceptions of change were framed in terms of the catholic discourse.


Private Property, Patron-Clientelism and Economic Exploitation

The Domestic Mode of Production that characterized the pre-Hispanic and early colonial economies began to disappear in the first decades of the nineteenth century in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region. This process was precipitated by events taking place both within the Spanish Empire and the wider international scene. At the beginning of the century Spain's American colonies gained their independence and with it came the end of the galleon trade; in 1830 the port of Manila was opened to foreign trade and after that English and American commercial houses began operating freely; and later in the nineteenth century the use of steamships and the construction of the Suez canal greatly facilitated the expansion of European seaborne trade. In short, there were a number of changes which facilitated the destruction of the subsistence economy and its attendant patterns of domination and the rise of a new and more efficient mode of domination based on the institution of private property and class relations. Nowhere were these changes to have a greater impact than in central and southern Luzon.

The dissolution of the subsistence mode of production and the rise of a capitalistic social and economic order fundamentally restructured grassroots society in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region, and in doing so it set the scene for an escalation of rebellion. In the early nineteenth century, the relative autonomy and isolation of village communities in central and southern Luzon was rapidly destroyed as landownership became the principal source of wealth. However, these newly emerging property relations, which we shall consider in a moment, must be interpreted in the context of the changing ethnic composition of the agrarian society. The plural character of the nineteenth century Luzon economy and the different
roles of the Spanish, monastic orders, Chinese mestizos, native aristocracy and peasantry obscured the basic exploitive relationships in the changing economy. Different methods of dispossessing the peasantry from their landholdings by different ethnic groups created distinctive patterns of landlord and tenant relations and led the peasantry to resent some ethnic groups more than others and to couch their resentments in racial terms. For example, peasant movements in the nineteenth century were specifically anti-mestizo landlords and anti-friar landownership rather than anti-landlordism in general; quite often, the peasantry formed political alliances with the Filipino landowning class against other landlord classes.

Statistical data on the actual proportion of land passing into private ownership in the nineteenth century and the distribution of private landholdings throughout central and southern Luzon is virtually non-existent. One reason for this stems from the fact that many claims to land were not legally registered or ratified by the courts until the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. However, the Spanish never became a major landowning class in central and southern Luzon; a small number of Spaniards operated estates granted to them by the Crown but they did not play a decisive role in the economic history of Luzon agriculture. On the other hand, the monastic orders utilized their vast resources and gradually built upon land grants through purchases and bequeathals to become the largest single landowning group in the islands by 1900. These estates were larger than those obtained by the Chinese mestizos, the second largest landowning class in central and southern Luzon by the turn of the century.

The different types of friar and Chinese mestizo landholdings reflected the different modes of acquisition used by the two groups.
As mentioned above, the monastic orders acquired land through grants from the Crown, bequeathals and purchase; in this way, they gradually amassed large estates of several thousands of hectares. Chinese mestizos were moneylenders who gradually gained ownership of small "scattered holdings" through a moneylending arrangement known as the contract of retrocession (pacto de retroventa); basically this agreement enabled moneylenders to foreclose on independent proprietors when they were unable to repay the initial sum borrowed or meet the exorbitant interest rates that were provided for in the original contract. These different modes of acquisition gave rise to quite separate types of land tenure; on the religious estates a three-tiered leasing system (inquilinato) developed, while a two-tiered sharecropping pattern (kasamajan) predominated on the considerably smaller "scattered holdings" of the mestizos and native aristocracy. The native aristocracy or principalia gradually accumulated holdings by assuming private ownership of the traditional communal lands and possibly some land held in usufruct by the lower classes as they sank deeper into debt and turned to the local gentry for assistance. The colonial regime finally sealed the fate of the peasantry in central and southern Luzon; by ratifying only legal titles to land it was the peasantry, the band of cultivators who comprised the bulk of the population of lowland Luzon, who were dispossessed of land to which they held only customary rights of use.

The formation of a landless peasantry in central and southern Luzon in the nineteenth century - that is, a class of peasants who had lost their customary rights to land and been denied legal possession -

was coupled with a low level of capitalization in rice and sugar production. This had the effect of placing land and tenant relations at the centre of the emerging agrarian economy. It is not necessary for us to provide a detailed discussion of the historical aspects of the *inquilinato* and *kasamahan* tenancy systems or the range of variations that occurred within each type. However, it should be noted in passing that the *kasamahan* or sharecropping was and remains by far the most prevalent. What should be emphasised is that the low level of capital development in the rural economy reinforced the existing small-scale decentralized character of agricultural production; production was still heavily dependent upon the supply of labour, a fact which I believe made a significant contribution to the rise of patron-clientelism. As I will show later in this chapter, the development of larger scale enterprises in the early twentieth century and the emergence of economic institutions that were less dependent on a retained labour force also marked the decline of patron-client bonds between landlords and tenants.

How the dependence of the nineteenth century Luzon economy on a constant supply of labour served to strengthen the existing village-based pattern of production will be mentioned only briefly because it is self-evident in the literature. For example, the labour intensive nature of lowland rice cultivation in early Luzon society and elsewhere in southeast Asia is well documented. 69 Although sugar production in central and southern Luzon was decidedly more capital intensive the limited capacity of the *muscovado* mills and the fragmented nature of cane cultivation still kept output at a low level.

and made it a village industry. Even with the introduction of steam mills, iron rollers and bayones (woven sacks which replaced the earthen pilones), sugar production and cane cultivation remained dispersed throughout the villages. Therefore, despite the fact that the muscovado mills were owned by outsiders and production was geared to the market, the entire production process was dependent upon the village. As I will explain below, this stands in sharp contrast to the early twentieth century sugar industry which saw the collapse of the village-based muscovado industry in the face of competition from the large centrales and plantations.

The localised pattern of cane cultivation and sugar production survived throughout the nineteenth century for two basic reasons. In the first instance, the harvesting and processing of cane must be closely correlated if a loss in sucrose content is to be avoided. That is, cane begins to deteriorate soon after it has been cut. Therefore, in the absence of a cheap and efficient transport network the harvesting and milling of sugar cane must be located together. Secondly, although steam-driven iron mills could process more cane than the old wooden presses, production was severely limited by the volume of cane available from nearby scattered holdings. Nor was there any real incentive for the remaining peasant proprietors or small landlords to convert wet-rice lands to sugar cane; such lands

F.n. 69 continued.


were not particularly suited to cane growing but more importantly rice itself was a valuable export commodity at this stage. It is hardly surprising then that sugar production was dispersed throughout the villages of central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region in the nineteenth century and interspersed with rice cultivation.

The emergence of a peasant economy in the nineteenth century based on privately owned landholdings, together with the dependence on labour which resulted from the lack of capital, created a certain type of exploitation between landlords and tenants in central and southern Luzon. In a very real sense, landlord and tenant relations reflected the balance that landlords needed to strike between maximizing their profits in the marketplace and retaining an adequate labour supply on their agricultural holdings. That is, landlord attempts to obtain the greatest possible returns from the exploitation of land and labour was tempered by their need to prevent tenants from seeking alternative sources of livelihood; for example, they tried to prevent tenants from taking up unexploited land in provinces such as Nueva Ecija in northern central Luzon and from finding more tolerant landlords. The form of exploitation which subsequently developed in central and southern Luzon was the *kasama* sharecropping system; basically, this tenancy arrangement involved the division of the harvest between the landlord, as a right derived from the ownership of the land, and the tenant, in return for labour. Under this arrangement, landlords could appropriate a significant proportion of the agricultural surplus while still catering for the subsistence needs of their tenants. The point that should be emphasised, I believe, is that while the nineteenth century *kasama* system was based on the exploitation of labour it also preserved the security of the
peasant household.\textsuperscript{72} This early form of \textit{kasama} landlordism was embedded in a network of social ties and moral obligations that resembled those between kinsmen. In fact, Rivera and McMillan's comparative study of rural barrios in the Philippines suggests that kinship bonds between landlords and tenants were quite common.\textsuperscript{73}

There is a vast literature on patron-client models in south-east Asia and elsewhere and it would serve no lasting purpose to recount them here.\textsuperscript{74} However, I would like to preempt a possible misunderstanding of the \textit{kasama} pattern. Certainly nineteenth century Luzon patron-client relations were permeated with a kinship idiom; kinship ties often existed between landlords and tenants and in general the principle of reciprocity played a significant part in the relationship between landlord and tenant. For example, it was taken-for-granted that the landlord/patron would provide temporary economic assistance to his tenants/clients and in return his tenants owed him loyalty or a debt of gratitude (\textit{utang na loob}).\textsuperscript{75} However, as I have pointed out above, one should not lose sight of the fact that the \textit{kasama} system in the nineteenth century was principally an economic relationship which reflected the landlord's difficulty in securing a

\textsuperscript{72} Scott, \textit{The Moral Economy of the Peasant}. This is the principal theme of Scott's latest book.


\textsuperscript{75} For a discussion of this relationship see C. Kaut, '\textit{Utang na loob}: a system of contractual obligations among Tagalog', \textit{Southwestern Journal of Anthropology}, 17, 1961, pp.256-272.
constant supply of labour in times when labour was in high demand and short supply. Once labour became more readily available, as it did in the early twentieth century, the network of reciprocal obligations that had been a prominent feature of nineteenth century landlord and tenant relations in central and southern Luzon began to disintegrate.\footnote{This is the central theme of Ben Kerkvliet's argument in Peasant Rebellion.}

For example, Rivera and McMillan found that kinship ties between landlords and tenants were far less common in the highly commercialized zone of central Luzon than elsewhere in the Philippines.\footnote{Rivera and McMillan, \textit{The Rural Philippines}, see note 73 above.}

By the turn of the century, the peasants of central and southern Luzon had passed or were still passing through a series of crises. The nineteenth century had witnessed a marked concentration of landownership in the hands of a minority of the population, but the process was to continue well into the twentieth century. Moreover, the division between landlords and tenants had gradually asserted itself in the Luzon social formation by the time of the outbreak of the nationalist revolution in 1896; the plural economy of early nineteenth century Luzon had given way to a dichotomous class structure consisting of a unified, educated, Hispanicized class of property owners and an increasingly insecure class of small proprietors and landless tenants. From the peasants' point of view, perhaps the only redeeming feature of the new order was that patron-clientelism masked and cushioned the exploitiveness of \textit{kasama} landlordism. However, another series of transformations occurred in the early twentieth century which served to magnify the existing class structure and accentuate the deteriorating position of the peasantry in the rural power structure. Most authors recognize this as the era of capital formation and the
proletarianization of the peasantry in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region.  

**Capital Accumulation and the Rise of Rural Proletariats**

Capital formation in the early twentieth century rested on two new developments in central and southern Luzon. Firstly, rapid population growth and the further dispossession of small peasant proprietors created a surplus labour force that could be exploited to yield a high level of capital accumulation. Census data for the period between 1903 and 1939 reveals an accelerating growth in the population of central Luzon; for example, in this period the population of the provinces of Nueva Eciga, Tarlac, Pampanga and Bulacan increased by between fifty and two hundred per cent. At the same time, it is quite clear that small landholders were still joining the ranks of the landless tenants. Akira Takahashi, for instance, concludes in his extensive study of Bulacan province that "the rapid disintegration of landholding by peasantry occurred in the 1920's, although a considerable number of rural proletariats had already existed in central Luzon at the beginning of this century."  

Secondly, high domestic prices for rice and a lucrative U.S. market for sugar promoted capital accumulation and the further expansion of the cash crop economy in central and southern Luzon.

---

80. Kerkvliet, Peasant Rebellion, pp.15, 73.  
81. Takahashi, pp.142-143.  
82. Kahn, p.145.
production, for instance, increased dramatically in Nueva Ecija, Bulacan, Tarlac and Pampanga from less than three million cavans in 1902 to over twelve million cavans in 1938.\(^8^3\) While the dispossession of the peasantry continued, there was also a definite tendency towards larger holdings in central and southern Luzon. For example, the number of farms in Bulacan, Pampanga and Tarlac decreased substantially between 1918 and 1939, but the total area of cultivated land rose significantly.\(^8^4\) Central Luzon also marketed the highest percentage of its agricultural production, despite the fact that the peasants were struggling to fulfil their basic subsistence requirements.\(^8^5\) This provides some indication of the extent to which market relations had become institutionalized in central and southern Luzon in the early twentieth century.

By appropriating an agricultural surplus that was increased both by expanding production and depressing the living standards of the tenants, the landlord class was able to capitalize the rice and sugar economy of central and southern Luzon. On the large rice haciendas the landlords began to introduce tractors and mechanical threshers (telyadoras) but, more importantly, they increasingly participated in the processing and marketing structure of rice. This was carried out through investments in modern mills (cono) and warehouses (bodegas).\(^8^6\) The impact of these changes on the peasantry is poorly documented and we cannot draw any firm conclusions; the substitution of capital for labour appeared to be relatively slow and the position of the tenants basically unchanged. However, the introduction of the cono mills apparently led to a steady decline in the small-scale village-based

---

83. Kerkvliet, Peasant Rebellion, pp.41, 81, 82, 83.  
84. Ibid., n.8, p.73.  
85. Ibid., pp.45, 58.  
86. Ibid., p.46; Takahashi, pp.90-92; Larkin, p.288.
111.

*kiskisan* mills. Robert Huke's later study, for instance, provides evidence of a much higher proportion of *cono* mills in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region than elsewhere in the Philippines and that they were gradually replacing the *kiskisan* type.\(^{87}\) Given the disproportionate ratio of *cono* to *kiskisan* mills in central and southern Luzon as compared to the rest of the Philippines, we can safely conclude that the decline of the small operations began in the inter-war period.

In contrast to the rice sector, capitalization in the sugar industry led to a revolution in the cultivation and processing of cane in Luzon, a revolution that followed the introduction of large-scale centrifugal mills or *centrales*. Large domestic and foreign investments in the new milling technology produced several consequences for the central Luzon economy. In the first place, sugar production and the total area under cane cultivation increased sharply between 1915 and 1934. During this period, total production in Pampanga and Tarlac rose from eighty thousand metric tons to three hundred and thirty-nine thousand metric tons, while the area devoted to cane jumped from thirty-seven thousand four hundred hectares to seventy-four thousand hectares.\(^{88}\) Secondly, the *centrales* destroyed the traditional *muscovado* mills and effectively revolutionized the patterns of landuse associated with cane cultivation. Unable to match either the volume of production or the quality of the product of the new *centrales*, the *muscovado* mills soon began to disappear from central and southern Luzon. With the demise of the small mills came a

---


reorganisation of sugar cane cultivation.

Before the rise of the *centrales*, cane fields were widely dispersed throughout central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region; in the villages, patches of cane were intermixed with rice growing. That is, there was a balance between the limited production capacity of the *muscovado* mills and the small quantities of cane that could be grown in the village locality. However, in contrast to these traditional practices, the *centrales* needed a "large capital investment, an abundant labour supply, an extensive land area, a well-developed managerial system, and specialization in one crop for the purposes of export." Above all, the *centrales* required a large and constant supply of cane to operate at maximum efficiency. This had two effects on the distribution of sugar cane in central and southern Luzon; on the one hand, large sugar haciendas sprang up around individual *centrales* and, on the other, old sugar fields outside the sphere of the *centrales* fell into ruin and disappeared. With the rise of the more efficient mills and the concentration of sugar growing in Pampanga and Tarlac, Bulacan's scattered *muscovado* mills and cane fields quickly declined. Takahashi, for instance, directly links the collapse of the village sugar industry in Balinag (Bulacan) with the emergence of the *centrales* and haciendas in Pampanga and Tarlac. He claims that the area devoted to cane in Bulacan as a whole decreased from three thousand nine hundred and twenty-eight hectares in 1918 to only one thousand five hundred and twenty-four hectares in 1938. 90

The transformations in the economy of central and southern Luzon in the 1920's and 1930's were important because they led to the

89. Schul, 'A Philippine Sugar Cane Plantation', p.159.  
90. Takahashi, n.9, p.25.
breakdown of the relations of dependence that had been established between landlords and tenants in the nineteenth century and eventually to the proletarianization of the peasant class. As Benedict Kerkvliet consistently argues in his examination of the pre-conditions of the Huk movement, the patron-client model collapsed. Landlords systematically refused to honour traditional obligations to their tenants; for example, landlords no longer provided emergency food rations (rasyons) or interest free loans to tide their tenants through hard times, and even the practice of gleaning the harvested fields (pulot) was prohibited. The reason for this unprecedented harshness was not that landlords in the twentieth century were more business-like than their predecessors. The former were merely operating in differing, and from their point of view more favourable, economic circumstances; landlords could quite easily replace recalcitrant tenants with more amenable ones from the large floating population of landless tenants. In some cases, itinerant labour and machinery could be employed for tasks previously performed by a retained workforce of sharefarmers. That is, both an excess supply of labour and a high rate of capital formation unmasked the patron-client model and enabled the landlords to fully exploit the lower classes of rural Luzon.

The disintegration of relations of dependence between landlords and tenants was part of a much wider process that served to unify the peasantry as a class in central and southern Luzon. As Takahashi suggests, the proletarianization of the peasantry that had

91. Kerkvliet, Peasant Rebellion. This point is made by the author at the beginning of his study (see p.1) and he constantly reminds the reader of its importance to the rise of the Huk.
begun in the nineteenth century was more rapid and clearly defined in the 1920's and 1930's. For example, the rise of the *centrales* and cane plantations produced a large number of factory workers and migrant labourers in the central Luzon provinces of Pampanga and Tarlac. The further concentration of landownership, the growth of large estates, and the existence of a surplus labour force throughout central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region similarly contributed to the emergence of a class of unattached peasants. Peasant proprietors, *centrales* workers, tenants and the landless alike either belonged to or faced the threat of joining the floating population of unemployed. However, not only did these groups share a common class position, but they increasingly communicated their common experiences. For example, I believe it is significant that many of the rebel leaders of the 1920's and 1930's came from outside the districts in which their movements took hold. In short, the economic change of the early twentieth century not only destroyed the parochial nature of village production, but in the process it created a class of rural proletariats which extended across central and southern Luzon. Within twenty years, there was a remarkable development of horizontal economic, social and political ties among the Luzon peasantry.

**CLASS FORMATION AND THE CATHOLIC IDiom: AN OVERVIEW**

The transformations of the Luzon economy after about 1830 practically destroyed the ideological basis of catholicism which rested on the dual notions of an unchanging secular world and spiritual rebirth in a perfect afterlife. In the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries it became patently obvious to the lower classes that the

__93. Takahashi, pp.141-143.__

__94. Kerkvliet, Peasant Rebellion, p.869.__
secular world was changing and that their position in the rural social and economic order was deteriorating. Since the early 1800's, the class of independent peasant farmers that had been a prominent feature of early Luzon society was constantly sliding into the ranks of a newly-emerging class of landless tenants; in the twentieth century, peasants not only faced the prospect of being dispossessed of their landholdings but the discomfort of enduring oppressive landlords or joining the throng of tenants without land.

Obviously, material deprivation was the major burden of the peasantry in central and southern Luzon in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. However, another principal problem facing the peasants was that of interpreting or giving meaning to the conflicts and divisions that increasingly appeared in the Luzon social formation. How could the peasants express their everyday experiences? The dilemma was not easily resolved; the peasants were armed with catholic concepts and symbols that were inappropriate to the constantly changing practical world in which they found themselves. However, in the next chapter, I will attempt to show how peasant movements reflected the antagonisms that were developing in central and southern Luzon and to demonstrate that they were becoming more political with the passage of time. While the religious idiom was retained, I shall show in Chapter Four how this idiom was gradually transformed into a secularized, class ideology as the class character of Luzon society unfolded. In Chapter Five I will explain how this transformation in the religious idiom was accomplished.
Chapter Four

THE TRADITION OF REBELLION

IN CENTRAL LUZON AND THE SOUTHERN TAGALOG REGION,

1840-1940

God will provide a weapon,
the idols will be shattered,
the tyranny will crumble
like a house of cards and liberty
will shine out like the first dawn.

Jose Rizal y Alonso, El
Filibusterismo, translated as
The Reign of Greed, C.E.
Derbyshire, Philippine Education

At the beginning of this thesis I suggested that we should attempt to develop an explanatory framework that is capable of reconciling a thematic dilemma facing current research on Luzon peasant movements; that is, how can we relate the commonalities and variations, the continuities and discontinuities, that are evident in the tradition and practice of rebellion? In this sense, I posed three related questions in the belief that they encompassed the hard core of issues that our theoretical framework needed to take into account. These were, firstly, why did peasant movements adopt the religious idiom, secondly, how did this idiom survive and, thirdly, how did it form the basis for a secularized class ideology? As regards the first question, it is reasonably clear at this stage why peasant movements adopted the catholic symbolic universe; it was not only available but it operated early on as a dominant cultural idiom which effectively
inhibited the development of an explicitly political discourse. Like Levi-Strauss' 'bricoler', peasants in central and southern Luzon in the early nineteenth century had a finite range of symbolic materials from which to construct a discourse on the conflicts and contradictions that were emerging in the social and economic formation. They were imbued with an otherworldly worldview which condemned secular interpretations of everyday life to the realm of the undiscussed or doxic and which regarded such interpretations as heretical. In this context, I believe the adoption of catholic symbols and concepts by peasants attempting to articulate conflict situations was pretty well inevitable.

Regarding the second and third questions, how the catholic idiom survived in Luzon peasant movements and was increasingly transformed into a class ideology are matters that are obviously linked. In fact, we have intimated in the preceding chapters the theoretical nature of the connection between these two strands. We suggested then that the religious ideology and disposition (cold) was constantly challenged by transitions in the economy (hot), and that the dislocations to which this process gave rise were reproduced in conflicts between the domains of the discussed (orthodoxic) and undiscussed (doxic) in the prevailing catholic discourse. Furthermore, we suggested that Bourdieu's theory of the universe of discourse could be re-modelled and used to analyze this scenario in terms of a dynamic connection between inherited conceptual schemes and contemporary practice. A more complete and direct discussion of this interaction between the common idiom and economic conditions is now required, and it is to this task that I turn.

In this chapter I will examine a series of individual case studies and provide an overview of the tradition of rebellion itself
that demonstrate that after about 1840 both religious continuities and political discontinuities were present in Luzon peasant movements. That there are major political discontinuities in Luzon's tradition of rebellion is now widely accepted; for example, this is a central theme in David Sturtevant's writings\(^1\) and Milagros Guererro even argues that it is not possible to draw a valid connection between the colorums of the 1920's and 1930's and earlier movements like the Confradía de San José.\(^2\) However, Reynaldo Ileto\(^3\) and Brian Fegan\(^4\) have clearly indicated that peasant movements in both the nineteenth and twentieth centuries share a common religious idiom based on concepts and symbols borrowed from the Roman Catholic Church. Both authors, for example, pay considerable attention to the centrality of the "light" symbol in both catholic rituals and peasant ideologies. But these authors do not explore the different uses to which "light" symbols were put. Indeed, a comparison of their respective analyses reveals that it was used quite differently by the Confradía de San José in the 1840's and the Katipunan and other movements from the turn of the century onwards. Ileto and Fegan also argue that the idea of the return of Christ is a recurring theme in Luzon peasant movements. However, it is again evident that successive movements constantly re-worked the return of the Saviour theme. As we shall see, certain movements transformed the myth of the return of Christ into a series of myths which featured the return of particular Christ-like figures; it was not uncommon, for instance, for popular movements to anticipate the rebirth of former rebel leaders like

\[\text{1. Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings, pp.7-8.}\]
\[\text{2. Guerrero, 'Colorum Uprisings', p.66.}\]
\[\text{3. Ileto, Passion and the Interpretation of Change, passim.}\]
\[\text{4. Fegan, passim.}\]
Apolinario de la Cruz (*Confradia de San Jose*), Julian Baltasar (*Guardia de Honor*), Felipe Salvador (*Santa Iglesia*), Andres Bonifacio (*Katipunan*), or Jose Rizal (*Propaganda Movement*), or for peasant leaders to claim legitimacy on the basis of communication with the spirits of martyred revolutionary figures.

While in my opinion changes in this idiom have been neglected, Ileto and Fegan have established as well as historically authenticated the existence of a common religious idiom that permeates Luzon peasant movements. Basically, what I am suggesting is that this ensemble of catholic myths, concepts and symbols was increasingly politicized with the passage of time and that this process of politicization reflects the emergence of a class economy and the conflicts and divisions that it carried with it. That is, key catholic ideas gradually lost their otherworldliness as they were constantly articulated and immersed in a changing secular world which brought nationalist and class conflicts to the forefront. For example, "light" was the symbol for a form of mystical religious knowledge in the Catholic Church but it gave rise to a set of light symbols, the "Sun" and the "East", which signified the struggle of Filipinos against colonial oppression. 5

I believe that there were two ways in which the common idiom reflected the contradictions that were emerging in the new social and economic formation. Firstly, after the *Confradia de San Jose* peasant movements gradually shifted the focus of their symbolic universe from a supernatural to a secular interpretative framework. How the themes of light and the return of Christ were constantly changing was mentioned above; at a more general level, as we shall

5. An analysis of light symbolism in the *Confradia de San Jose* and *Santa Iglesia* is found in Ileto, *Pasion* and the Interpretation of Change, while an analysis of the connection between light, the Sun and East is found in Fegan's paper.
see, there was a shift from a passive reliance on divine intervention to bring about a heavenly millennium towards class actions designed to re-structure the distribution of power in the everyday world. Once peasant rebels believed they would be saved because they were on God's side; later they believed they would win out against foreigners and landlords because God was on their side. Secondly, once the religious idiom had been located in a secular framework of meanings explicit political ideas could be accommodated. In this respect, it seems that there was a double-sided politicization of the religious idiom; religious concepts and symbols, such as light and the return of Christ, gradually accumulated political significance but, in addition, they increasingly borrowed explicitly political ideas from the world outside. Brian Fegan, for instance, has assured me that central Luzon peasants in the 1920's and 1930's were made aware of socialist, communist and anarchist ideas by their leaders and the literature of various peasant organisations. The point that I would like to emphasise is merely that the Luzon peasantry was receptive to explicitly political ideas at this stage whereas in the nineteenth century they would have been less receptive because of their religious disposition.

The apparent divergence between the religious and political strands in Luzon peasant movements that I am attempting to reconcile in this thesis will be discussed more fully in Chapter Five. At the moment I shall consider the movements themselves; in the first section I will treat each movement as an individual case study and turn in the final section to an analysis of the trends evinced in the tradition of rebellion. The movements that I have considered here cover the period between 1840 and 1940, and they include the Confradia de San

6. I gratefully acknowledge the assistance given to me by Dr. Fegan in October, 1980.
Jose, Guardia de Honor, Santa Iglesia, the Colorums, Sakdalistas, peasant unions (AMT/KPMP), and the various Huk organisations. These movements were selected because sufficient data was available and because they adequately illustrate the mixture of religious and political themes I have referred to above. Unfortunately, I have not been able to consider the earlier movements due to a lack of historical material. Central Luzon and the southern Tagalog districts certainly produced peasant uprisings soon after the Spanish conquest of the Philippines\(^7\) but it appears that peasant movements only became a prominent and enduring phenomenon in the mid-nineteenth century.

The description and analysis that follows should be read with caution, and it is important that certain qualifications be kept in mind if the case studies are to be placed in a proper historical perspective. The data on Luzon peasant movements is biased towards those which have culminated in violent uprisings at some stage in their history. This is a defect in Sturtevant's history of popular uprisings in Luzon between 1840 and 1940;\(^8\) despite his emphasis it is obvious that not all peasant movements have ended in open rebellion and we do not even know whether a majority of them assumed a violent form. This has produced a very real problem for Philippine historiography. While scholars have concentrated on the Confradia de San Jose for the early nineteenth century, we have little knowledge of two important associated areas. In the first instance, we know very little about the other brotherhoods that existed at the same time in the southern Tagalog region; Ileto, for example, mentions a brotherhood of women, the Guardia de Honor de Maria, which was

---

7. Cushner, 'Meysapan', pp.46-7, for example, gives evidence of an uprising in 1745 on friar estates to the south of Manila.
8. The full implication of this bias in Sturtevant's analysis was impressed upon me by Brian Fegan.
operating in Lucban in Tayabas province in the 1840's, as was the *Confradia de San Jose*. In the second instance, we have only brief references to the non-violent descendants of the *Confradia de San Jose*; Guerrero, for example, claims that an organisation founded in the 1870's, the *Katipunan of San Cristobal*, was a direct descendant of the 1840's movement. To some extent this bias is inevitable because Spanish chroniclers were drawn to those movements which threatened colonial institutions, but it has meant that many significant peasant movements that could provide a firm basis for comparison have gone unchartered.

Furthermore, we should beware of considering peasant movements in central and southern Luzon in isolation from each other. Typically peasants belonged to, or were in contact with, several movements at the same time or hastened to join another similar movement when the one to which they belonged collapsed. Many *Huka*, for instance, were formerly members of the peasant unions, the *Sakdalistas*, the *Tanggulans*, or their forerunners. Brian Fegan has told me that former *Huka* that he interviewed during fieldwork often bore the initiation marks of several brotherhoods. Moreover, not only did memberships overlap between different movements but apparently the various leaders frequently contacted one another. Peasant movements, therefore, should be viewed as interconnecting elements in an unfolding tradition of rebellion in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region.

Fegan has characterized the tradition of rebellion in central Luzon in terms of movements that are linked in "a series that shared a common idiom ... (and which) ... appear ... (as) ... variations on

---

11. Discussion with Dr. Fegan, October 1980.
a single theme.\textsuperscript{12} I agree wholeheartedly with these comments but suggest, in addition, that these variations were neither random nor unpredictable. Fegan does not explore the patterning of these variations; however, I believe they followed a definite trend which reflected an emerging class orientation among the peasantry. In the \textit{Confradia de San Jose}, for example, anti-Chinese and anti-Spanish sentiments, and the corresponding emphasis on racial purity, appear to have represented a nascent political response to an emerging class situation in which the Chinese mestizos and Spanish friars were increasingly alienating agricultural land in the southern Tagalog region. However, by the turn of the century when members developed greater class awareness, the \textit{Santa Iglesia} and the \textit{Guardia de Honor} were attacking large landlords and haciendas. Later, in the 1930's and 1940's, peasant organisations seem to have evolved a definite class character. They challenged the political power of the landed class in quite unequivocal terms; property was attacked, strikes were initiated, and municipal, provincial and national elections were contested by peasant candidates. When these efforts failed to dislodge the landlords, the \textit{Huk}s, former peasant unionists who had been seasoned by the resistance against the Japanese and newly-embittered rural proletariats, came together and fought a clearly defined class war against the landlords in central and southern Luzon.

What I wish to impress upon the reader in this chapter is that, in addition to the cultural continuities so convincingly demonstrated by Ileto and Fegan, there were very important political changes taking place in Luzon peasant movements in the nineteenth and twentieth

\textsuperscript{12} Fegan, p.1.
centuries. These changes were not just "variations on a single theme", as Fegan has suggested, but evidence of a concerted attempt by the Luzon peasantry to develop an appropriate political stance in an emerging class society. While the Luzon peasantry continued to voice its discontent with the prevailing social order in terms of a catholic idiom, it is important to note that catholic concepts and symbols were not just used differently as time progressed but that they were increasingly employed as part of a political discourse. As we shall see, the departure from the religious framework was never complete, nor can it be pinpointed to have happened at any single instance in Luzon history. To the contrary, the politicization and secularization of the religious idiom followed the gradual evolution of a class structure in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

**THE TRADITION OF REBELLION: THE **CONFRADIA DE SAN JOSE, GUARDIA DE HONOR AND SANTA IGLESIA

Of all the early peasant movements in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries the best documented are the *Confradia de San Jose*, *Guardia de Honor* and *Santa Iglesia*. Despite the fact that they arose in separate areas of Luzon, and at different times, these movements evinced the basic continuities and discontinuities alluded to earlier in this thesis. As we shall see, the *Confradia*, *Guardia* and *Santa Iglesia* used the catholic idiom but each responded quite differently to economic exploitation and political oppression.

---


14. I will argue throughout this chapter that Sturtevant's claim that there was a shift from millenarianism to secularism in the 1930's is too simplistic.

15. See Map Four, p.125, in this thesis.
Map Four: Peasant Movements in Central and Southern Luzon, 1840-1940

*This map shows the approximate centre of activity for the different movements.*
The Confradia de San Jose and the 1841 Rebellion

The history of the Confradia de San Jose and the biography of its leading prophet, Apolinario de la Cruz, are inseparable. Known as 'Hermano Pule', and later, 'King of the Tagalogs', Apolinario de la Cruz came from a devout catholic peasant background in the southern Tagalog province of Tayabas. Although he was trained in christian theology, Apolinario's ambition to enter the priesthood was thwarted. Nevertheless, he worked as a lay brother (donado) at the Hospital of San Juan de Dios, where he acquired further religious instruction and helped organise an inoffensive brotherhood called the Hermandad de la Archi-Confradia del Glorioso Senor San Jose y la Virgen del Rosario or The Brotherhood of the Great Sodality of the Glorious Lord Saint Joseph and of the Virgin of the Rosary. 16

Apolinario founded the Confradia de San Jose in June 1840; this is the generally accepted date, although Ileto suggests that it was founded slightly earlier 17 and Guerrero claims that it was organised slightly later. 18 Apparently the brotherhood which commemorated the patron saint San Jose was extremely popular; recruitment in the southern Tagalog provinces of Tayabas, Batangas and Laguna brought many thousands of followers in 1840 and 1841. Although it was not the only brotherhood in existence at the time, 19 its exceptional popularity drew a hostile response from the clergy and

16. My data on the Confradia de San Jose is drawn mainly from Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings and Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change.
17. Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change, p.33, indicates that it is difficult to be precise about the beginnings of the Confradia.
18. Guerrero, 'Colorum Uprisings', p.65, suggests that the Confradia was founded in 1943.
19. See pp.121-2 of this thesis.
the suspicion of the colonial authorities.

It seems that the Confradia de San Jose was harassed by the local friars and the colonial militia from the beginning, and a decisive confrontation with the authorities seemed inevitable. When such a confrontation was impending in late 1841, an armed force of four thousand adherents withdrew to the foothills of Mount San Cristobal to establish a permanent refuge. The Alitao plateau's natural fortifications undoubtedly influenced the choice of this site, but the principal reason for the retreat was to establish an "impromptu theocracy" where believers could participate in prayer sessions and acts of religious purification with which to fortify themselves against the coming onslaught. Ileto confirms that the purpose of the retreat was to hold a novena - nine days of prayer and purification - but adds that it was provoked by visions signifying the advent of the millennium.

The final assault on the mountain retreat came on November 1, 1841. One thousand colonial soldiers attacked the community and although, according to all accounts, the confrades fought bravely as many as one thousand of the eleven thousand believers present were killed. Apolinario temporarily eluded the Spanish force, but he was captured several days later and summarily executed with many of his followers.

20. Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings, p.89.
21. Ibid.
Clearly the *Confradia de San Jose* was a religious movement. Ileto, for example, clearly demonstrates that ideas from the catholic *Pasion* formed the basis of the movement's philosophy. Lee makes a similar observation:

The *Confradia* was certainly rooted in the religious tradition of the Catholic Church: its leader had been raised in the faith, studied theology, and even aspired to the priesthood; the *Confradia's* institutional legitimacy - the Cofraternity or Sodality - was not only acknowledged, but fostered by the Catholic Church; the use of the catholic liturgical style and order was evident in the *Confradia's* worship; and in its attempt to secure blessing from the Church, it revealed a respect for the religious authority.

Perhaps nowhere was the overt religiousity of the *Confradia de San Jose* more obvious than in the mountain communities of San Christobal. At the centre of these settlements was a shrine called 'Santo Camarin' which Ileto describes as

a large palm-thatched chapel of bamboo, the inside walls of which were hung with colorful hangings and religious paintings, where Mauong Pule presided over the 'mysterious prayer sessions and ceremonies' of the novenario.

The chapel served as the focus for continuous prayer meetings dedicated to the patron saint and the source of prophecies that predicted divine intervention on the side of the believers against their enemies.

The twin mountains, Mount San Cristobal and Mount Banahao (or Banahaw) in the southern Tagalog region, themselves carried great religious significance. Apparently the mountains were the setting for

29. See, for example, Sturtevant, *Popular Uprisings*, p.89.
pre-Hispanic religious rites but, as Sturtevant points out, they also acquired importance for Christian Filipinos.

Draped with brooks and waterfalls, honeycombed with caves, and covered with lush vegetation, the mountains became a 'Holy Land' for devotees of San Jose ... Caverns were named in honor of the 'Trinity' and the 'Saints'. A crystalline creek was classified the 'River Jordan', a vermillion-tinged spring was designated the 'Blood of Christ', and an opaque pool was labelled 'Milk of the Virgin'.

There is a close resemblance between the Confradia de San Jose and the Guardia de Honor, despite the fact that the Guardia arose in west-central Luzon towards the end of the nineteenth century. Both movements adopted the concepts, symbols, and ritualized style of the Roman Catholic Church and placed them at the centre of their ideologies. Both movements were saturated with the symbolisms of the Catholic Church; the prophets and their followers alike adorned themselves with the paraphernalia of the priest and the church and each movement stressed certain millennial themes central to some Christian European traditions. As we shall see, despite these striking similarities, there were also important differences between the two movements.

The Guardia de Honor

The original Guardia de Honor was founded in west-central Luzon by the Dominican friars in 1872; apparently the various chapters subscribed to the full title of Guardia de Honor de Maria (Mary's Honor Guards) or Guardias de Honor de Nuestra Senora del Rosario (Honor Guards of Our Lady of the Rosary). The Guardia was a lay organisation which set out to popularize Catholic moral virtues such as Chastity and to foster devotion for the Virgin Mary. Candidates accepted by

30. Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings, pp.94.
31. Ibid., pp.96-97. Most of my data comes from this source and Guerrero, Luzon at War.
the monastic authority were required to recite the Rosary daily and to accompany the Virgin's image during processions. However, within ten years of its formation, the movement had developed a momentum of its own; self-professed Guardias flaunted official rules and constantly introduced indigenous rites into the brotherhood's religious practice. When the movement was subsequently ostracized by the Catholic Church in 1882 and declared illegal by the colonial administration, the official membership of sixteen thousand had apparently been exceeded. In the following years, the Guardia was to attract thousands of additional supporters from western and central Luzon. 32

In the mid-1880's, an animist and faithhealer by the name of Julian Baltasar, who was known as 'Apo Laqui', 'Apo Lakay', 'Mister Grandfather', or the 'Patriarch' and his blind wife, who was known simply as the 'Goddess', were leading the Honor Guards. They predicted that a "second deluge" would destroy the corrupt society of non-believers and that the "chosen ones" would survive by migrating to a small island called Santa Ana in the Agno River near Asingan. 33 Thousands responded to the prophets' vision but they were quickly dispersed by suspicious provincial authorities. Baltasar returned to Urdaneta, and although he was constantly visited by supporters it appears that the Guardia de Honor remained effectively inactive until the death of the "Goddess" in 1896.

After Baltasar's wife died there were several reports that the deceased woman's spirit had appeared over watering places; rumours inculcated the belief that the "Goddess" had conferred magical

32. Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings, p.100.
33. Ibid., pp.98-99, and Guerrero, Luzon at War, p.204.
medicinal properties on local wells and fountains. 34 Apparently, this event sparked a revival of the Guardia de Honor; soon after, Baltasar was prompted by a premonition of death to gather a following of believers and start a pilgrimage to the village of Montiel. The community was renamed Cabaruin, which, according to Guerrero, is an Ilocano term meaning "newly-cleared place" or "new land." 35 (Sturtevant claims that the term properly translated means "renewal"). 36 Here the prophet undertook the task of reorganizing the Guardia de Honor. Baltasar named his successor as Antonio Valdes but, more importantly, he authorized the formation of guerrilla units to protect the Guardia against Spaniards and Katipuneros.

Baltasar died in 1897 and Valdes assumed command of the Guardia de Honor. He quickly formed the 'los agraviados', 'oppressed', 'agrabiados' or 'Sons and Defenders of Santo Domingo', a guerrilla army of peasants that subsequently raided lowland towns and haciendas. Its principal targets were the landed gentry and Spanish officials, the opposing factions in the nationalist revolution that was raging at the time. As the balance of power shifted against the Spanish, the Guardia increasingly turned its attention to the landed gentry and the revolutionary forces they were leading. An interesting feature of this conflict lies in the fact that the Guardia championed catholicism against the anti-clericalism of the revolutionary forces recruited in the south. This has led some observers, such as James LeRoy, to incorrectly assume that the movement was strongly pro-Spanish. 37 This is a distortion which fails to acknowledge the two-
sided nature of the Guardia's depredations. Certainly the Guardia de Honor did not share the anti-monastic sentiments of their central and southern Luzon counterparts, but I will argue later in this chapter that the movement contained both nationalistic (anti-Spanish) and class (anti-landlord) elements. Unlike other Luzon movements of the time, the Guardia clearly distinguished between its attitudes towards catholicism and the church, on the one hand, and those which it held about Philippine independence and landlord power, on the other.

The Guardia de Honor attacked prominent families and administrative centres, ransacked government buildings and destroyed land records throughout the early years of the revolution. However, the arrival of American troops discouraged the movement's military exploits and the Guardia returned to the religious crusade. According to Guerrero, this led to a proliferation of utopian village communities, although only a few such as those of Cabaraun and Santa Ana are very well known in the literature. In 1900 foreign troops discovered and occupied Cabaraun, then a thriving community of ten thousand inhabitants; within a year the population of the town had doubled.

To outsiders, Cabaraun was a mixture of paradoxes. The community was a well-organised, efficient and thoroughly authoritarian theocracy: Baltasar was hailed as a 'living deity' while Valdes, Clavaria and Maria de la Cruz, the tripartite leadership of the Honor Guards, were worshipped as 'Jesus Christ', the 'Holy Ghost', and the

38. Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings, pp.103-104.
40. Guerrero, Luzon at War, p.206.
41. Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings, pp.111-112.
'Virgin Mary', respectively. Twelve lieutenants, known as the 'Saviour's Apostles', assisted the leaders and even landmarks were named after Biblical personages. Everyday life was based on a rigid egalitarian ethic that was constantly reinforced in marathon prayer sessions. But although Cabaraun was unusually prosperous and orderly, it lacked any visible means of subsistence. However, the religious communities continued to grow and by 1901 Cabaraun and Santa Ana reached a collective population of thirty-five thousand. Obviously, raids on nearly landowners were incapable of sustaining them for any period of time. Eventually the newly imposed American regime discovered the economic basis of Cabaraun and Santa Ana: as Sturtevant notes,

when the harvest was gathered, farm couples packed up children, belongings, and poultry; seized the landlord's palay, livestock, and carabao; joined like-minded neighbours; and began the liberating trek to the promised land. On arrival they deposited confiscated rice and animals in communal granaries and pens.

With this discovery the Guardia de Honor was quickly suppressed. On March 3, 1901, military rule was imposed on Cabaraun and Santa Ana; Valdes and Clavaria were hanged, lesser officials were imprisoned, and the followers of the movement dispersed.

The Confradia de San Jose and the Guardia de Honor were part of a rising tide of peasant rebellion in Luzon and elsewhere in the Philippines which increasingly challenged landlord power and foreign domination. A range of less notorious movements rose and fell without ever being documented by official chroniclers or historians. Sturtevant, for example, mentions a series of lesser movements which, in their names alone, evince strong similarities with the Confradia

---

42. Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings, p.112.
43. Ibid., pp.110-111.
44. Ibid., pp.112-113.
and Guardia; these include the Pulajanes and Colorados (Reds), Casadores (Hunters), Babaitanes (Priests), Santos Ninos (Holy Children), Hermanos del Tercero Orden (Brothers of the Third Order), and the Soldados Militantes de la Iglesia (Militant Soldiers of the Church). We know nothing of significance about these organisations but the Santa Iglesia in central Luzon is better documented.

The Santa Iglesia

Felipe Salvador founded the Santa Iglesia in Pampanga in 1894 by bringing together the remnants of the Gabinista society that had disbanded in the 1880's after its leader, Gavino Cortes, had been executed for banditry. Like the Confradia de San Jose and the Guardia de Honor, the Santa Iglesia was a brotherhood; its adherents wore the crosses and rosaries of the Catholic Church and everyone participated in the religious rituals held each day. Renato Constantino, for instance, clearly demonstrates that the Santa Iglesia was shrouded in the symbolism of the Catholic Church and that Salvador was a prophetic religious figure in the millenarian christian tradition. He writes that,

Salvador gave away or sold crucifixes and rosaries to his followers and officiated at religious rites similar to those of the Catholic Church. He affected the long hair and clothes associated with Biblical figures and was reverently regarded by his followers as a prophet. He warned that a second 'great flood' would occur which would destroy all non-believers. After the flood, there would be a rein of gold and jewels for his followers. He also told them that if they fought bravely and were faithful to the Santa Iglesia, God would turn their bolos into rifles.

45. Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings, p.119.
46. Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change, pp.257-313; Guerrero, Luzon at War, p.176; Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings, pp.131-132.
Salvador, known as 'Apo Ipe',

would enter a town with a group of his long-haired and long-robed followers and plant a bamboo cross in the middle of the plaza. He would then launch an eloquent exhortation which invariably moved many to contribute and others to join his movement.⁴⁸

Like the Guardia de Honor, it appears that the Santa Iglesia fought a double-sided guerrilla campaign against the Spanish and, later, the landlord-led nationalist forces. According to Guerrero and Ileto,⁴⁹ the brotherhood's army under the leadership of Salvador and a Guerrilla soldier called Manual Garcia was initially committed to the Katipunan struggle against Spain but it turned hostile to the gentry after they had accommodated themselves with the new American regime. The early allegiances of the Santa Iglesia appear unclear, but after 1903 its guerrilla units constantly harassed constabulary patrols and wealthy landowners in central Luzon.

Available records do not indicate precisely the size of the Santa Iglesia's military force or the peasant support it had attracted since its beginnings in the 1890's, but it drew members from many communities throughout the central Luzon provinces of Tarlac, Nueva Ecija, Pampanga, Bulacan and Pangasinan.⁵⁰ Despite this widespread support, the death of the Santa Iglesia's leadership led to the disbanding of the movement as a whole. After 1910, the Santa Iglesia disintegrated and its followers melted back into village life in central Luzon.

An Overview of Early Luzon Movements

As religious movements, the Confradia de San Jose, Guardia de Honor and Santa Iglesia were remarkably similar. They were firmly

---

⁴⁹. Guerrero, Luzon at War, p.176, and Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change, p.263.
rooted in the religious tradition of catholicism and clearly reflected the catholic influence in their ideologies and organisational structures. The brotherhoods borrowed from the Roman Catholic Church in many ways and integrated pre-Hispanic rites in the process of forming a radical utopian peasant ideology. Both Ileto and Fegan, for example, deal extensively with the idea of light (liwanag) as a dominant symbol in Luzon peasant movements.\(^51\)

Ileto argues that the use of the symbol of light to focus thought and connect ideas in folk movements derives from the catholic Pasion or Account of the Sacred Passion of Jesus Christ Our Lord. In a comment that bears directly on our interpretation of patron saints and Christ-like figures in peasant movements, he argues that "the gaze of a religious figure is a source of both light and compassion"\(^52\) in Philippine religious imagery and shows how the ideas of light, knowledge, and unity are linked together and then contrasted to those of darkness, ignorance and disunity.\(^53\) Ileto then illustrates how the notion of light found in the Pasion is reflected in the ideology of the Confradia de San Jose. For example, he analyzes a forty-three stanza poem found in the movements' prayer books:

Essentially it describes a vision, a more penetrating glimpse of the beginning and the end of the Pasion story; that is, the state of perfection that reigned in Eden and that will be recovered in the millennium.\(^54\)

Ileto suggests that

the hymn is easily dominated by the image of liwanag. This can be explained by the fact that the theme of darkness/light and intensity of light can be used to describe the world as well as the individual self.

\(^{51}\) Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change, passim, and Fegan, passim.

\(^{52}\) Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change, p.31.

\(^{53}\) Ibid., pp.35-38.

\(^{54}\) Ibid., p.33.
Liwanag is the horizon of being in terms of which everything can be explained; there is presence or absence, degrees of intensity, purity, permanence, and concentration, of liwanag. In the hymn, heaven is the state of pure and permanent liwanag; it contrasts with the union of men on earth, which Apolinario says is also a state of liwanag. For the union of men which the Confradia sought to cultivate is a fragile entity, which means that its liwanag is impermanent. Perhaps that is why Apolinario states elsewhere that liwanag's source is beyond the earth, and that union is liwanag because it receives its energy from this ultimate source - heaven.55

Fegan also recognises the centrality of liwanag in the matrix of symbols which connect peasant ideas, but he claims that the source of light and mystical knowledge, and the symbols that are associated with them, is not the Pasion itself but the Vigil service.56 Fegan argues that they "are present and connected in the liturgy of the Vigil service, held on Holy Saturday night, where they are symbols of the risen Christ."57 Fegan provides a detailed account of the Vigil baptismal rite58 before linking the preoccupation with the idea of light that is demonstrated in Ileto's thesis with the striking of new flame on Easter Saturday.

This can be explained by the central place in the Vigil given to the striking of new fire from flint in the darkened church, as the symbol of Christ's resurrection and victory over sin, death, and tyranny, and by the repeated statement that Christ is the 'light of the world'.59

I have raised Ileto's and Fegan's research here merely to demonstrate the centrality of catholic ideas and symbols to nineteenth and early twentieth century peasant movements. Their analyses, however, have obvious implications for the theoretical framework that

55. Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change, pp.34-35.
56. Fegan, passim.
57. Fegan, p.3.
58. Ibid., pp.6-8.
59. Ibid., p.6.
I outlined in the preceding chapters. Ultimately what is important to my interpretation is how these ideas and symbols became politicized and secularized in successive movements. This requires an extended discussion of the changing relationship between the doxic and orthodoxic domains in the Luzon peasantry's discourse, and an analysis of how symbols such as these are connected to the realm of heterodox opinion. Therefore, to do their analyses and my framework justice, these questions will be left until Chapter Five.

Nineteenth and early twentieth century peasant movements clearly emphasised millenarian themes based on principles borrowed from the Catholic Church. An intense commitment to the ideas of redemption and the return of Christ, and to the Redeemer who would show the way, would ensure divine intervention on behalf of the believers. This commitment was usually expressed by the wearing of powerful catholic symbols, such as robes, crucifixes and rosaries, and participation in marathon prayer sessions. The most important objective of this constant religious celebration was eloquently described by Ileto:

the reading, singing and dramatization of the Pasion, together with the complete cessation of work, the performance of acts of penitence such as traversing the way of the Cross, the participation in processions where innumerable images of Christ in various stages of the Pasion were carried about, all served to narrow the gap between the Pasion and the events of daily life. For a brief moment, at least, human and Pasion time were one.60

The Confradia de San Jose, Guardia de Honor, and the Santa Iglesia sought, in Ileto's terms, to narrow the gap between the Pasion and everyday life. They did this by emanating religious figures or by becoming Christ-like; that is, by conforming as closely as possible to Biblical models. Ileto, for example, shows how the Confradia de San Jose, and Apolinario de la Cruz in particular, modelled themselves

60. Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change, p.17.
on Saint Joseph's self-sacrifice for Mary and Jesus in the hope that they might be rewarded, like the Saint, in Heaven.\textsuperscript{61}

The millennium could only be brought about by the Divinity, but it was believed that divine intervention would only be forthcoming if the faithful withdrew physically and spiritually from the corrupt world in order to establish a separate existence. For example, the \textit{Confradia de San Jose}, \textit{Guardia de Honor} and \textit{Santa Iglesia} all anticipated a second catastrophe to herald a millennium shaped according to catholic ideals; the chosen survivors would then live in a state of perfection. These movements connected the ideas of religious purity, closeness to God, and divine intervention with a belief in the necessity for an existence outside the mainstream of peasant society. The religious communities at Santa Ana, Cabaraun and Mount San Cristobal appear to owe their existence to this belief, as do the armed bands of followers that the three movements formed. To some extent at least, armed units were set up by all three movements to defend themselves against non-believing outsiders.

The failure of the \textit{Santa Iglesia} to establish a clearly defined 'promised land', in a geographical sense, appears to differentiate it from the \textit{Confradia de San Jose} and the \textit{Guardia de Honor}. However, we cannot be too definite on this point; certainly the \textit{Santa Iglesia}, like the earlier movements, drew a rigid distinction between believers and non-believers and it was reported to have frequented the remote regions of central Luzon, the Candaba Swamp and Mount Arayat.\textsuperscript{62} We do not know whether these sites held any special significance for members of the \textit{Santa Iglesia} or whether they were merely convenient refuges.

\textsuperscript{61} Ileto, \textit{Pasion} and the Interpretation of Change, p.31.
from the authorities. In any event, as I mentioned above, all three movements awaited divine intervention in the form of a 'second great flood'. However, there seem to be differences in the degree to which each movement emphasised the role of God. The Confradia de San Jose, for instance, was more dependent on the intervention of Heaven, hence the movement's posture that violence should only be used for self-defence. For the Confradia did not initiate the armed clashes that eventually destroyed it. But the Guardia de Honor and Santa Iglesia did form guerrilla bands which served to defend their members and actively sought out large landowners and Spanish administrators as targets to attack.

Moreover, the Guardia de Honor and the Santa Iglesia seemed to emphasise the indigenous folk tradition more than did the Confradia de San Jose; Baltasar, Cortes and Salvador belonged to the tradition of prophets, faithhealers and bandits. On the other hand, Apolinario de la Cruz was nurtured in the imported Catholic Church. This appears to have given rise to a discrepancy between the immediate or effective sources of legitimacy (or divinity) in the brotherhoods. In the Confradia de San Jose the Biblical figure of Joseph was the source of light whereas Baltasar and Salvador were regarded as the source of mystical knowledge in the Guardia de Honor and Santa Iglesia. This point is important because it suggests that the process of secularization to which I referred earlier was evident in Luzon peasant movements in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Apolinario de la Cruz, the high priest of the Confradia de San Jose, interpreted the Pasion story and sought to emanate San Jose, but Baltasar and Salvador assumed the mantle of the returned Christ. That is, the leaders of the Guardia de Honor and the Santa Iglesia were reverently regarded by their followers as living saints. There is not
enough evidence to pursue this latter point, although we shall return
to it in a moment, but it may be instructive to note that, after the
final debacle, the leader of the *Confradía de San José* was betrayed
by his followers. Whether Apolinario de la Cruz fell from grace amongst
the *Confradía* is uncertain, but his betrayal and subsequent capture
resulted in his execution. What I am suggesting is that there is a
possibility that the *Confrades* saw this act as the betrayal of a priest
rather than a saint. However, despite the offer of rewards, Felipe
Salvador travelled throughout central Luzon for many years without his
whereabouts being revealed to the authorities.

While the *Confradía de San José, Guardia de Honor* and *Santa
Iglesia* constructed their ideologies from catholic ideas and symbols
they were not a-political. In one sense, at least, they shared an
important feature in common; all the brotherhoods became lower class
movements. The *Confradía de San José* drew its members from "the
disillusioned, disappointed, and disenfranchised of the exploited
peasants" 63 or from the "illiterate and semi-literate peasant classes
and tradesmen." 64 David Sweet further suggests that married couples
and single women comprised the bulk of the *Confradia* 's membership and
that women were probably responsible for recruiting their husbands. 65
There is no way we can verify or disclaim these observations, or fully
explore their implications. However, it is possible that a differential
socialization of men and women in the Catholic Church was relevant; for
example, there seemed to be an emphasis on moral virtues that were in
practice applicable mainly to women and a proliferation of lay
organisations devoted to the Virgin Mary. We have only brief references
to the composition of the memberships of the *Guardia de Honor* and

63. David Lee, p.140.
64. Sweet, p.102.
Santa Iglesia but we do note that, like the Confradia de San Jose, they were based in the peasantry. Whether these movements recruited from the ranks of any specific groups within the peasantry - small proprietors, landless tenants or certain types of tenants, or the floating population of landless peasants - is not known. However, the political similarities between these early brotherhoods ended at the level of common class support.

Leaving aside the peasant nature of the movement, the most distinctive political feature of the Confradia de San Jose was its emphasis on Filipinos "of heart and face." Most authors, in fact, regard the movement as a racist one; Usha Mahajani, for instance, describes it as "a secret confraternity of pure-blooded Filipino men and women." The Confradia de San Jose certainly emphasised "Tagalog exclusiveness" by restricting admission into its ranks to "pure-blooded indios." Moreover, it was openly hostile towards Chinese and Chinese mestizos. However, I believe this dual emphasis on peasant and Filipino identity can be traced to the ethnic composition of the emerging class system of Tagalog society after 1800. We have outlined the general dimensions of the transition to a cash economy in Chapter Three, but several additional comments are in order.

David Sweet argues that the Tayabas region in 1841 had neither an oppressed landless peasantry nor a pagan or muslim population resisting the inroads of Christianity.

66. Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings, p.84.
68. Sweet, p.102.
69. David Lee, p.133.
70. Leandro Tormo Sanz, Lucban (A Town the Franciscans Built), Historical Conservation Society, XX, Manila, 1971, p.97.
and modernization - (and it was) a region which has at no other time in history been distinguished as a focus of popular resistance.71

Sweet further claims that the Tagalog-speaking inhabitants were for the most part hard-working peasant proprietors, growing dry rice on tiny hill farms and reasonably prosperous. There was a rich tradition of cooperative activity and communal recreation through _turumuhan_ spontaneous work groups, the tightly-knit extended family and _compadraigo_ networks. The region was relatively underpopulated, and free from the exploitive systems of absentee landlordism and debt-bondage to caciques ... (and there were) ... no extensive friar lands.72

In conclusion, Sweet states that "the breakdown of communal land-rights and incursion of private property" were either non-existent or in their infancy.73

Sweet's argument appears to be inaccurate on several important details and it is generally misleading. Wickberg claims that Tayabas province was in fact one of the centres of the nineteenth century coffee industry in the Philippines and that Chinese and Chinese mestizo traders constantly visited the area.74 By the 1840's, the extension of market relations and the commercialization of agriculture was certainly underway in Tayabas, Laguna and Batangas. This is indicated by the presence of large numbers of Chinese mestizos in the provinces.75 Cushner also notes that the institution of private property had been introduced into the area to the east and south-east of Manila well before the 1800's.76 Mestizos were probably not the major landowners at this stage though the alienation

71. Sweet, p.96.
72. Ibid., p.97. 73. Ibid.
of communal lands by the native gentry \((\text{principia})\) was well advanced. However, the disproportionate number of Chinese mestizos resident in Laguna and Batangas would suggest that their rise as a landowning class had already begun in these provinces by the 1830's and 1840's. On this basis I find Sweet's conclusions that communal land rights prevailed in the absence of private property to be untenable.

I find it equally difficult to accept Sweet's claim that debt-peonage was unimportant in Tayabas, Laguna and Batangas. Certainly Sweet is referring to Tayabas specifically, and the exploitive mechanisms to which he refers may have been less developed there, but the \textit{Confradia de San Jose} drew its followers from the three southern Tagalog provinces mentioned above. There is thus no reason to suppose that their development in the preceding century was at variance with trends elsewhere in central and southern Luzon. There is no evidence that points to them being exceptional, and some, such as Nicolas P. Cushner's early history of the Meysapan estate closer to Manila,\(^77\) which indicates that the process of 'modernization' began in the southern Tagalog provices prior to the nineteenth century.

Whether an "oppressed landless peasantry" existed in Tayabas, Laguna and Batangas in the early 1800's is debatable. Cushner provides clear evidence that the outright dispossession of small proprietors was well advanced slightly nearer Manila before 1840.\(^78\) The threat of dispossession was certainly present and this may have been more important.\(^79\) Eric Wolf, for instance, claims that the sense of insecurity arising from the presence of landlessness may be

\(^77\). Cushner, 'Meysapan', pp.30-53.
\(^78\). \textit{Ibid}.
\(^79\). This is an important theme in Wolf, \textit{Peasant Wars}, and Scott, \textit{The Moral Economy of the Peasant}. 
more acute among the "middle peasantry"; that is, amongst small landholders and part-time tenants. That such fears were present in Tayabas itself is beyond doubt. In his history of Lucban, the capital of Tayabas province and Apolinario de la Cruz's birthplace, Leandro Tormo Sanz quotes a seventeenth century source which claims that the entire area was being rapidly depopulated; some of the large townships and villages lost more than half of their adult population as a result of the Spanish regime's forced labour and tribute policies. Sweet's reading of the underpopulation of the Tayabas region as a sign of an undisturbed prosperity is amiss.

The attempt by the Confradia de San Jose to establish and maintain an exclusively Tagalog religious community outside the mainstream of southern Luzon society should be understood as a response to the intervention of 'outsiders' in the peasant economy. However, that the peasantry rebelled against the intrusion of Spaniards and Chinese mestizos and the threat that it posed to traditional ways of life is not problematical; nor is the fact that the peasant classes used a religious discourse to formulate the sense of powerlessness they increasingly felt in dealing with the material world. A synthesis of catholic and indigenous beliefs constituted the most accessible, and perhaps the only popularly available, mode of expression. Members of the Confradia de San Jose, the Guardia de Honor, and the Santa Iglesia had been thoroughly inculcated with the central ideas of christian millenarianism through the Pasion and rituals like the Vigil service. Central Luzon and the southern Tagalog provinces, it should be remembered, had been subjected to the most intense missionary activity

81. Sanz, pp.82-85.
in Philippine history; for over two hundred years before the rise of the radical peasant brotherhoods, the various monastic orders had reiterated themes such as redemption and the Second Coming of Christ.

More importantly, no political language or idiom outside catholicism was available to the Filipino masses. As I mentioned earlier, the nature of catholic belief, especially its emphasis on the supernatural and the idea of spiritual regeneration, inhibited the development of ideologies directed towards change in the secular world. The dominance of catholicism and the relegation of politics to the realm of the undiscussed was facilitated by the infrequency of political conflict and social cleavage in the past. Reciprocity, utang na loob, patron-clientalism and hierarchical kinship structures masked unequal exchange and the exploitation of labour in a network of moral obligations and formed a naturalized, taken-for-granted model of landlord and tenant relations. These structures were unquestioned and hence required no distinctive and unique discourse. Peasant life was part of a unified cosmology in which religious interpretations could prevail in the secular world precisely because the latter had not achieved a secular character. When the old social forms changed and lost their taken-for-granted character and conflicts began to emerge in the new social formation, the peasants were without an explicitly political discourse. However, the catholic idiom was available.

Nevertheless, the Confradia de San Jose, Guardia de Honor and Santa Iglesia, as successive movements, contain evidence that the barriers which had so long condemned politics to the realm of doxa in the Luzon discourse were breaking down. The total withdrawal of the brotherhoods from a world dominated by outsiders, the willingness
of the movements to engage in subversion and employ armed force, and attempts to invoke divine intervention in secular causes, themselves represent incipient political responses. In the case of the Confradia de San Jose, the emphasis on Tagalog ethnicity and an hostility towards Spaniards as well as mestizos signalled the beginnings of a political awareness of the emerging class structure. Sweet suggests that the brotherhood was "an escape from deprivation in separateness and religious purification rather than in political action." This is true in a sense, but there is a correlation between the themes of separateness, ethnic identity and the penetration of the countryside by foreigners. Therefore, I believe that the Confradia reacted against non-Tagalog involvement in the agrarian economy, and the disadvantages that flowed to the peasantry as a result of this involvement, rather than against specific ethnic groups for racist reasons. The Guardia de Honor and the Santa Iglesia clearly adopted a more overt political stance; both movements were frankly nationalist in their response to the Spanish and the Americans, and both waged fierce guerrilla wars against the dominant landowning class.

The Confradia de San Jose, and the Guardia de Honor when it was still under the guidance of the prophet Baltasar, displayed faint but recognisable signs of a peasantry becoming aware of its deteriorating position in the rural power structure. In the light of the corporate nature of the traditional village communities, the lower class basis and appeal of the brotherhoods indicates a significant degree of social differentiation. In a political sense, the movements' response to the situation in which they found themselves was essentially negative; but I believe it was a political reaction all the same.

82. Sweet, p.114.
Signs of politicization and secularization became more obvious in later movements but an examination of the Confradia de San Jose, Guardia de Honor and Santa Iglesia reveals what I believe are the first signs of an evolution towards a political discourse. Of course the transition from acts of religious purification in the Confradia to the use of armed violence against landlords by the Guardia and Santa Iglesia is highly significant, but there are further underlying trends which are of greater general importance. While I acknowledge that this development took place within a religious conceptual framework, I suggest that two themes can be identified which bear witness to this ongoing process. Firstly, there was a general shift in emphasis from religion, divine intervention and defensive action to various combinations of religion and offensive action. That is, there was a decreasing reliance on divine intervention. The Confradia de San Jose and the early Guardia de Honor devoted themselves to Biblical figures, the patron saint Joseph and the Virgin Mary, respectively, and they were committed to a religious way of life. Both showed a near absolute faith in divine intervention; for example, the earth would open and swallow their enemies or non-believers would be swept away in a second great flood. The later Guardia de Honor under the leadership of Valdes and the Santa Iglesia did not abandon the notion of divine intervention but they appeared to rely less on the will of God. Both brotherhoods, for example, anticipated a second flood but formed guerrilla armies of peasants to hasten the advent of the millennium. They also had a clearer perception of their enemies in this world; while the brotherhoods may have condemned them in religious
terms, they became the familiar enemies of the peasant class. They did not randomly attack villagers, but landlords, officials and the constabulary.83

Secondly, there was a switch from the invocation of supernatural forces to the deification of prophets, folk heroes and bandits. That is, there was a gradual but pronounced shift towards secular sources of legitimacy. As I mentioned earlier, Apolinario de la Cruz was a high priest, an interpreter of God's will, who sought to emanate Saint Joseph; Julian Baltasar and Felipe Salvador were oracles or sages, the sources of wisdom and inspiration, and religious prophets. Baltasar was worshipped as a deity after his death, while Valdes, Claveria and Maria de la Cruz became, in the eyes of their followers, Jesus Christ, the Holy Ghost and the Virgin Mary, respectively. In this sense, early peasant leaders joined Biblical figures on a religious pedestal.

As we shall see later in this chapter, the trends that I have outlined above became more pronounced with the passage of time. Peasant movements continued to use the catholic idiom, but it was increasingly employed in respect to secular processes, and peasants became more politically militant. The colorums of the 1920's and 1930's adhered to the pre-established religious model, but their use of religious themes like the return of Christ differed from that of earlier movements and they effectively abandoned the notion of divine intervention.

83. Guerrero, Luzon at War, pp.178, 204, has even suggested that members of the Guardia de Honor and Santa Iglesia saw the millennium bringing a redistribution of land but I have not been able to confirm this observation. If it is true, then it would strengthen the argument that I am putting forward in this thesis. The point that I am making, however, is that the politicization of the peasantry was a process which extended over a long period.
THE TRADITION OF REBELLION: THE COLORUMS OF THE 1920's AND 1930's

The Guardia de Honor and the Santa Iglesia movements testify to the failure of the gentry-led nationalist revolution to put an end to peasant unrest in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region. However, in the decade immediately after the suppression of the Santa Iglesia unrest appeared to subside or, at least, sink beneath the surface of village life once again. The apparent calm was short-lived. The 1920's witnessed the first attempt to unionize the peasantry with the formation of the Confederacion de Aparcero de Pilipinas and the emergence of a succession of movements called Colorums. 84

Dennis Shoesmith claims that "the origins of colorum are said to be in the Latin phrase per omnia secular secularum (World Without End) used to end Latin prayers in the Roman Catholic Church." 85 Guerrero confirms these observations. 86 Apparently the term colorum was first used by remnants of the defunct Confradia de San Jose movement in the 1870's, 87 but it is generally used to refer to the millenarian-type movements which punctuate Luzon history. In particular, the term has become associated with the host of short-lived movements that were formed in central and southern Luzon in the 1920's and early 1930's. Some of these colorum movements, about which we know remarkably little, will be discussed below. My exegesis of these movements will be brief, partly because they are poorly documented in the literature, but also because our purposes are better

---

84. Information on early attempts to unionize the peasantry was provided by Brian Fegan, October, 1980.
85. Shoesmith, p.178, n.4.
87. Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings, p.94.
served by drawing the connections and divergences between these movements and their predecessors, the *Confradia de San Jose*, *Guardia de Honor* and *Santa Iglesia*. Our objective, therefore, is to show how they fit into the tradition of rebellion as I have interpreted it in this thesis rather than attempt to write a detailed history of each movement.

The *Kapisanan Makabola Makasinag*

In 1923, a landless farm labourer by the name of Pedro Kabola formed the *Kapisanan Makabola Makasinag* or Brotherhood of the Shining Kabola. Like the other peasant leaders before him, Kabola bore the mantle of the prophet and claimed that he could communicate with the spirits of the Propaganda Movement's Jose Rizal and the *Santa Iglesia*'s Felipe Salvador, both of whom had been martyred by successive colonial states. Kabola was inspired by the tradition of rebellion and undertook to organise a secret people's army to oppose government and wealthy landowning interests, believing that the cause he championed was supported by the Emperor of Japan and that the Imperial Fleet would intervene on the peasants' behalf.

The Brotherhood of the Shining Kabola came to an abrupt and premature end in March 1925 when a planned assault on San Jose in Nueva Ecija was discovered by the authorities and Kabola was subsequently killed in an armed clash with the constabulary. However, despite its brief existence, the movement apparently touched a responsive chord in central Luzon. Within a year of its beginnings, Sturtevant estimates that it had recruited fifteen hundred members and

---

88. This translation is found in Fegan, p.8. Sturtevant, *Popular Uprisings*, p.176, translates the titles as Association of the Worthy Kabola.

89. Fegan's paper deals extensively with the idea of Japanese intervention.
attracted another fifteen thousand covert supporters across four provinces.\textsuperscript{90} Very little is known about the ideology of the brotherhood, or the composition of its following, but with the limited data that we do possess it is possible to identify several significant features. Like the \textit{Confradia de San Jose, Guardia de Honor} and \textit{Santa Iglesia}, it adopted an aggressive attitude towards landlordism. Like the earlier movements, the members of the Brotherhood wore crosses and rosaries and participated in initiation rites modelled on those found in the Catholic Church. The Brotherhood of the Shining Kabola also anticipated the return of a Saviour and outside intervention on its behalf; however, the movement did not anticipate the return of Christ but rather of martyred rebel leaders and it hoped for the intervention of Japan rather than the Divinity in its struggle against landlords. The \textit{Kapisanan Makabola Makasinag} possibly expected the return of Christ and legendary heroes, the intervention of the Divinity and the Japanese, but even so this represents quite a departure from the religious orientation of previous movements. The significance of these changing symbols of authority and power will be analyzed later in this chapter but it should be pointed out that these symbols recur in several peasant movements during the 1920's and 1930's.

\textbf{The Sociedad ti Mannalon and Sinarauag}

In 1927, a Filipino labourer called Pedro Calosa returned to Luzon after being deported from Hawaii for organizing sugar and pineapple workers into agricultural unions. Soon after, he began

\textsuperscript{90} Sturtevant, \textit{Popular Uprisings}, p. 178.
organizing the Philippine National Association. Again we have very limited data, but it appears that the PNA served as an over-arching front organisation or umbrella for two smaller tenant societies; Guerrero claims that Calosa was involved with the *Sodiedad ti Mannalon* (Society of Land Tenants) and the *Sinaruag* in eastern Pangasinan. According to Guerrero, the former was "an association of mutual help, particularly for raising stock and herds", while the latter was "a mutual cooperation society for the improvement of barrio conditions." It cannot be ascertained whether Calosa presented himself as a religious prophet as did, for example, the *Guardia* 's Julian Baltasar and the *Santa Iglesia* 's Felipe Salvador, but claims that he saw himself as a titular leader appointed by legendary heroes like Rizal, Ricarte, and Bonifacio. In this respect, as in many others, the Philippine National Association closely resembled the Brotherhood of the Shining Kabola and like its predecessor it found an immediate following among the peasantry of central Luzon. By 1930, the movement was believed to have attracted one thousand members.

The growing popularity of the movement led to an increasingly confident leadership and the planning of an attack on the township of Tayug in Pangasinan on January 11, 1931. Its immediate objectives were to inflict a defeat on the local constabulary, to destroy land records, and to rout notables and prominent families. In so doing, the association hoped to dramatize the plight of the tenant farmers in the region and to spark a general uprising against the landlords. During the capture and seige of Tayug, it successfully destroyed the

constabulary barracks, municipal building containing treasury records of land registrations and taxation, and thirty-eight houses belonging to officials and wealthy families. However, the seizure of Tayug failed to provoke a general uprising in central Luzon and the movement was quickly suppressed. The leaders of the abortive uprising were imprisoned and the members of the organisation were placed under constant surveillance; and, in a now familiar pattern, the association disappeared as an active force in peasant politics in Luzon.

When the leadership of peasant movements like the Brotherhood of the Shining Kabola was removed their followers drifted back into the villages. However, many soon joined other leaders and similar movements that arose in their place. In fact, one of the striking features of this period of peasant discontent was the continuity between the different movements. These movements shared a common view of the world and held similar aspirations about the future, and peasants freely transferred from one to the other. As successive movements were put down and uprisings aborted in the 1920's, a combination of former rebels and new recruits came together in the notorious Tanggulan movement of the late 1920's and early 1930's.

The Kapatiran Tanggulan Malayan Mamamayan

Patricio Dionisio, a journalist, founded the Katipunan ng Bayan in 1927, an organisation committed to revolutionary patriotic and revolutionary social and economic objectives. Initially, however, the

organisation failed to attract any significant peasant support. This prompted Dionisio to form an alliance with Vicente Almazar, the leader of another movement called the Kapitiran Magsasaka or Peasant Brotherhood in late 1927. The amalgamation apparently reversed the fortunes of these organisations, for by late 1927 they claimed a membership of thirty thousand from central and southern Luzon. By the end of 1926 membership had climbed to forty thousand, but it rocketed in the next twelve months to ninety-seven thousand. 99

Early in 1930 the two organisations formally united under the title Kapatiran Tanggalan Malayang Mamamayan or Brotherhood for the Defence of Free Citizens, 100 and soon afterwards it began planning a general uprising to begin on Christmas Eve, 1931. The choice of the day before the celebration of the birth of Christ has obvious significance, but the intentions of the Tanggalan are somewhat clouded. In any event, the uprising never eventuated. Forewarned of the Tanggalan plans, the authorities arrested Dionisio in December 1931 and, once again, with the removal of the leadership the organisational structure of the movement disintegrated and its members returned to the villages. However, as we shall see later in this chapter, peasant unrest in central and southern Luzon was not dissipated. In the southern Tagalog provinces, a movement similar to the Tanggalan in many respects, the Sakdalista, flourished in the mid-1930's. The Tanggalan themselves, like former rebels, drifted into other organisations; they were to provide a key element in the formation of the large agrarian unions of the mid-1930's and the various Huk movements in the 1940's.

100. Fegan, p.23.
Early Twentieth Century Luzon Movements Reconsidered

Brian Fegan has suggested that class and patriotic themes began to replace negative political sentiments in a "modified Pasión/Vigil idiom" in Luzon peasant movements around 1900. What appears to have occurred is that peasant movements began to construe religious symbols and ideas in a secular framework rather than attempt, like the Confradía de San José for example, to interpret everyday life itself in terms of the Pasión world. Therefore, while the movements of the 1920's and 1930's closely resembled those of the nineteenth and earlier twentieth centuries in many respects, there were also significant changes in the symbols of authority and power. Both sets of movements conformed to the brotherhood mode of organisation and employed symbols borrowed from the Roman Catholic Church; both envisaged the return of a Saviour and anticipated outside intervention on their behalf. However, the latter movements increasingly invoked their rebellious heritage and made it the source of their legitimacy. Therefore, unlike the earlier movements which were based on religious legitimacy, in the sense of being devoted to Biblical figures (for example, the Confradía de San José and early Guardia de Honor) or deifying their own leadership (for example, the later Guardia and the Santa Iglesia), the later movements drew their legitimacy from the tradition of rebellion itself. By executing, imprisoning and exiling popular peasant leaders, the Spanish and American regimes added an entourage of martyrs to the tradition of rebellion, and it was to this tradition that leaders like Kabola and Calosa made their appeal. The leaders of these movements in the

101. Fegan, p.10.
1920's and 1930's claimed to communicate not with God but with the spirits of Rizal, Bonifacio, Salvador, Ricarte, and other folk heroes; it was not the return of Christ they anticipated but rather that of folk heroes. Similarly, it was not to the Divinity that they turned for assistance but to Japan; Japan had already demonstrated its power by defeating the Russians at the turn of the century and the Luzon peasantry hoped that it might supply arms and encouragement for their struggle against foreign domination.

The Kapisanan, National Association and Tanggulan shared the millenarian worldview of previous peasant movements in central and southern Luzon. Like the Guardia de Honor and the Santa Iglesia, the attacks on San Jose and Tayug were attempts to spark a spontaneous general uprising and were designed to bring down the old order of landlords and foreigners and usher in a reign of peace and equality. However, unlike earlier movements, a major theme in the ideologies of these later brotherhoods was the redistribution of land and wealth. 102 Benito Allas, one of the rebels who attacked the township of Tayug in 1931, echoed the feelings of many dissidents during this period when he declared that,

Many of us, including myself, were formerly owners of big pieces of land in Tayug and Santa Maria. We have been driven from our lands by the hacenderos, from the lands which our fathers and grandfathers cleared (or) have occupied since time immemorial. Because of this grievance we have long planned ... to drive away the hacenderos and get our lands back. 103

The redistribution of land became increasingly important to Luzon peasant movements in the 1930's and 1940's, but it should be realized

102. Sturtevant, *Popular Uprisings*, pp.179, 189, 205-206, 223 and Guerrero, 'Colorum Uprisings', p.66. This theme may have been present in the Santa Iglesia and Guardia de Honor, as Guerrero suggests (Luzon at War, pp.178, 211), but they were certainly more pronounced in the peasant movements of the 1920's and 1930's.

that it was part of a much wider process of politicization and secularization that was occurring in Luzon at the time. The peasants were gaining a clearer picture of their enemies in the rural class structure and the sources of their misery. However, one must be careful not to misrepresent this continuous process of politicization by losing sight of the common religious idiom that they shared with their predecessors. But the common idiom was not unaffected by this trend towards secular interpretative frameworks. What appears to have happened is that the catholic idiom itself, or some parts of it, became politicized and secularized; the return of Christ became the return of martyred peasant leaders, divine intervention was translated into beliefs about intervention by Japan, and the source of legitimacy was no longer Biblical figures or living Christs but a series of Filipino martyrs. And, as we shall see when we analyze the symbol in greater detail in Chapter Five, the notion of light and the meanings that were connected to it were increasingly used to express aspirations about an independent Philippines in which the power of landlords would be broken and land redistributed to the lower classes.

These trends towards political interpretative frameworks become clearer when viewed in the light of the escalation of agrarian unrest in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region during the 1930's and 1940's. This period saw the rapid unionization of the peasantry, the development of a fully-fledged resistance movement during the Japanese occupation, and finally, the outbreak of a civil war in which a revolutionary peasant army, the Huk, sought to overthrow the dominant landlord class and its political supporters.

THE TRADITION OF REBELLION: SAKDALS, UNIONS AND THE HUKS

The rising tide of rebellion that characterized the 1920's continued into the 1930's and 1940's. With the disintegration of the
Tanggulan movement after the unsuccessful attempt to provoke a general uprising in 1931, many peasants in the central Luzon provinces drifted into the recently formed unions, the Aguman ding Malding Talapagobra (AMT or General Workers's Union) and the Kalipunan Pambansa ng mga Magsasaka sa Pilipinas (KPMP or National Society of Peasants in the Philippines). In an unpublished document made available to me by Brian Fegan, Jesus Lava claims that the General Worker's Union was a socialist organisation established in 1932, whereas the National Society of Peasants in the Philippines was a communist-led union founded in 1919 as the Confederacion de Aparceros de Filipinas. The Confederacion subsequently changed its name to the KPMP in 1924. However, as we shall see when we consider these organisations later in this chapter, neither the AMT nor the KPMP became mass peasant movements until the late 1930's.

The Tanggulan had attracted some members from the southern Tagalog provinces but it seems to have recruited most of its following in central Luzon. However, peasants in the southern areas had better access to another movement, the Sakdalista. The Sakdalista movement, to which we now turn, shared much in common with the Tanggulan and other peasant movements in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, but it also differed from them in some very important ways.

The Sakdalista Movement and the 1935 Uprising

The Sakdalista movement gained its name and its initial impetus from a critical newspaper called Sakdal, meaning "to accuse" or "to strike", founded by Benigno Ramos in 1930. Ramos was not a peasant but an educated urban professional, and Sakdalism was at

104. Information provided by Brian Fegan, October, 1980.
first focussed on Manila rather than the provinces. The *Sakdal*
newspaper constantly attacked the central government by providing
a forum for public discontent, and amongst its contributors were
former members of peasant movements such as the *Tanggulan*. Peasant
leaders constantly drew attention to the inequality and exploitation
in the Luzon countryside, and the tabloid increasingly addressed
itself to these agrarian problems. Almost inevitably, the focus of
the newspaper shifted from Manila to the densely populated Tagalog
provinces of Bulacan, Rizal, Laguna and Cavite in the Manila hinter­
land. Apparently *Sakdal* echoed sentiment held by many rural folk,
for its circulation jumped from five thousand copies weekly in 1931
to forty thousand copies four years later.

The *Sakdalista* had become a movement and Ramos, encouraged by
the support that his newspaper was attracting in the Manila area and
the southern Tagalog districts, formed the *Sakdalista Party* in 1933.
The primary objective of the newly-formed party was to contest the
1934 General Elections on the basis of a three-pronged policy; the
abolition of taxes, common ownership of land, and the confiscation
of the large Church estates. The attempt to abolish taxes was
hardly surprising; the Filipinos had endured a long history of
excessive taxation, and like peasants elsewhere, they had
developed a special hatred for tax-collectors and government officials.
More specific to the Philippines and Luzon in particular, the peasants
had since the early nineteenth century attacked the usurpation of land

109. This is a recurring theme in Barrington Moore’s *Dictatorship
and Democracy* and Eric Wolf’s *Peasant Wars.*
by the monastic orders; by the 1930's, central and southern Luzon had a fierce anti-clerical tradition. However, common ownership of land, at least as a clearly defined objective, was something that had only recently come to the fore in Luzon peasant movements. Pedro Kabola, Pedro Calosa and Patricio Dionisio had led movements in the 1920's and early 1930's which openly advocated the redistribution of land and wealth, but before then, ideas of a future society were expressed in millenarian terms. One cannot be sure of the symbolic significance of this new vision, but it clearly demonstrated a shift towards more secular, political goals in Luzon movements.

Within the region they contested, the Sakdala had moderate success in the 1934 elections. In the House of Representatives they had two candidates elected in Laguna and one in Tayabas; at the municipal level, Sakdala were elected in Laguna, Bulacan, Nueva Ecija, Rizal and Cavite. However, after the elections the Sakdalista Party modified its objectives in an attempt to overcome an emerging split in its ranks. On the one hand, the Sakdala had insufficient parliamentary members to command authority in the legislature; on the other, the blatant impotence of the leadership fuelled the tendency of local rural chapters to adopt independent and more radical courses of action. Efforts to prevent open rebellion in the rural areas failed and the growing disenchantment with the electoral system culminated in a widespread, though ill-organised, peasant uprising on May 2 and 3, 1935. In southern Luzon an estimated sixty-five thousand partially-armed peasants rebelled, but like other movements before them, the Sakdala were quickly suppressed.

One might have expected the disappointment surrounding the failure of the Tanggulan and Sakdalista movements to achieve significant reforms in the agrarian power structure to temporarily dampen peasant hopes for a new and more equitable social order. Although the sight of tens of thousands of angry peasants armed with bolos, antique shotguns and other rudimentary weapons caused a good deal of panic in the government and amongst the landlords, arms from Japan were not forthcoming and the series of uncoordinated attacks on government outposts and large estates did not lead to any redistribution of land or the abolition of taxes. Moreover, it failed to bring about the dream of an independent Philippines. The peasants, however, were hardly more quiet in the post-Sakdalista period; to the contrary, they turned to the newly-formed agrarian unions to voice their discontent.

Peasant Unionization and Civil War in the 1830's and 1940's

The late 1930's was a period of rapid unionization of the peasantry in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region. A major contributing factor to the growing popularity of unions was the suppression of the Tanggulan and Sakdalista organisations; almost inevitably it seems, peasants simply transferred to another organisation when the one to which they belonged disintegrated. Another, more important, factor lay in the development of a social basis for unionization in the new economy. The parochiality of the village had been broken down by the development of large sugar haciendas and centrales and the emergence of large landholdings in the rice economy; the concentration of workers and tenants made the task of organising unions much easier. Moreover, as I suggested in Chapter Three, it should be pointed out in this connection that peasant unionism and unrest was most pronounced on large landholdings and in factories. This probably accounts for the rapid unionization of Pampanga.

114. It should be pointed out in this connection that peasant unionism and unrest was most pronounced on large landholdings and in factories. This probably accounts for the rapid unionization of Pampanga.
the disintegration of patron-clientalism led to a more cohesive lower class.

Although founded earlier, it was not until the mid-1930's that the Kalipunan ng mga Magsasaka (KPMP) and Aguman ding Malding Talapagobra (AMT) became the focus of peasant activities. The rise of the unions differed from that of earlier movements in three important ways. Firstly, the overall process of unionization was rapid and mass organisation emerged in a relatively short period of time. When the General Worker's Union and the National Society of Peasants in the Philippines formed an alliance in 1939, they could claim a combined membership of one hundred and thirty thousand peasants and sugar central workers and, of course, the covert support of the majority of the population in central Luzon. Secondly, peasant unions were most successful in the central Luzon provinces of Pampanga, Bulacan and Nueva Ecija and, to a lesser extent, Tarlac and Laguna. That is, the regions that became union strongholds were those that were dominated by commercial sugar production and/or large-scale rice haciendas. For example, Pampanga, the centre of the Luzon sugar industry, had the fastest growth rate of unions in Luzon. Thirdly, and perhaps more importantly, unions used new forms and methods of peasant protest. For the first time, political objectives were clearly formulated and the peasants were systematically organised into taking action against the landlords so that these objectives might be realized. That is, the peasant unions had a basis in class relations of production, property ownership, and exclusion from control of the means of production; they evinced a definite class character.

115. Kerkvliet, Peasant Rebellion, p.167. Most of my data on the peasant unions and the various Huk organisations comes from this pioneering thesis.
164.

The anti-Japanese resistance movement or Hukbalahap, formed in March 1942, arose directly out of pre-occupation peasant unions; the Huk stronghold too was located in central Luzon. By September 1944, the Huks were a resistance army of twenty thousand armed and/or experienced soldiers operating in guerrilla bands throughout the central plains. When the Japanese occupation ended the resistance army was disbanded and the majority of the peasants disarmed, but apparently the organisational structure of the Hukbalahap was not completely dismantled. However, the peasants reverted to union activity, the most important union in the immediate post-war era being the Pambansang Kaisahan ng mga Magbubukid or National Peasants' Union formed in mid-1945. Once again, the centre of peasant activity was in Pampanga, Nueva Ecija and Bulacan. By 1948, the movement claimed half a million members; in Nueva Ecija alone, Kerkvliet claims that the organisation already had ninety-six thousand members by 1945-6. The National Peasants' Union and its immediate predecessors, the pre-war unions and the Hukbalahap, provided the basis for the Hukbong Mapagpalaya ng Bayan. This movement, which has been thoroughly documented by Benedict Kerkvliet, will not be considered in this thesis. However, I would like to remind the reader that the Hukbong Mapagpalaya ng Bayan engaged the landlords and the central government in an all-out civil war that extended into the 1950's.

Peasant Movements in the 1930's and 1940's Reconsidered

It is difficult to know precisely how the Sakdalistas, unionists, 

117. Ibid., pp.447, 688.
118. This author has written a number of authoritative articles and books on Luzon peasant movements in the 1930's, 1940's and 1950's. See the bibliography attached to this thesis.
and Hucks in the late 1930's and 1940's belonged to and departed from the traditional pattern of peasant movements in central and southern Luzon. Part of this difficulty stems from the fact that we cannot form any definite opinions about the feelings and aspirations of the peasant followers of these movements. However, the high degree of continuity between memberships in movements like the Tanggulan, Sakdalista, peasant unions and Hucks would suggest that there were continuities and discontinuities in the pattern of rebellion in the 1930's and 1940's. Indeed, the evidence available in the literature tends to confirm this observation. The Sakdals, for instance, shared several important features in common with the movements of the 1920's and 1930's. For example, like the Brotherhood of the Shining Kabola, Philippine National Association and Brotherhood for Defence of Free Citizens, the Sakdalistas desired a redistribution of wealth and property and anticipated an almost quasi-divine intervention of Japan on their behalf. Fegan claims, however, that the Sakdals, as well as peasant unionists and Hucks, continued to use the Pasion/Vigil idiom that is traceable to the Confradia de San Jose in the 1840's. Certainly the religious utopianism that had been a prominent feature of peasant movements in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries was still evident in the 1930's. This showed up in the nature of the Sakdal movement and the uprising in 1935; Luis Taruc claimed that Sakdals saw independence coming "magically like the burst of a sunrise." Similarly, Ramos' claim that Sakdalism was "based on peace, on the free development and moral perfection of the individual", reflects the notion of spiritual regeneration that

119. Fegan, pp.2-3.
is associated with the belief in the return of Christ. Even Sturtevant, who lists the *Sakdalista* as a "secular" movement, admits that it had a "millennial" character.\textsuperscript{122}

I am willing to accept Fegan's argument that *Sakdals*, unionists and *Huk* all shared a "modified *Pasion/Vigil* idiom" for two basic reasons.\textsuperscript{123} Firstly, in the absence of evidence that would suggest the contrary, I find there is no reason to assume that a basic catholic idiom which had survived in peasant movements from the *Confradia de San Jose* to the *colorums* of the 1920's simply disappeared in the 1930's and 1940's. Fegan has convincingly demonstrated that there was a great deal of overlapping between memberships in these later organisations, and it is confirmed by the observation that rebels frequently bore the initiation marks of several different brotherhoods.\textsuperscript{124} Secondly, the catholic symbolism referred to by Ileto and Fegan is still evident in contemporary Philippine organisations like the *Iglesia ni Cristo* and *Lapiang Malaya*.\textsuperscript{125} However, the question which remains to be answered, and I will turn to this in Chapter Five, is how the rebels of the 1930's and 1940's managed to reconcile the *Pasion/Vigil* idiom with secular, political objectives and strategies.

While Luzon peasant movements in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries believed in the millennium, those of the 1930's and 1940's increasingly saw the new order in secular and religious terms and as a state of affairs brought about by political struggle rather than divine intervention. In the *Sakdals* philosophy, moral perfection and

\textsuperscript{122.} Sturtevant, *Popular Uprisings*, p.228.
\textsuperscript{123.} Fegan, pp.2-3, 10.
\textsuperscript{124.} Information supplied to me by Brian Fegan, October, 1980.
\textsuperscript{125.} See, for example, E. Aldaba-lim, *et al.*, 'A Cursory Study of the *Lapiang Malaya* - Its Membership, Organisation and Implications to
spiritual regeneration were things that would naturally follow Philippine independence, the abolition of taxes and the redistribution of land. This was also a feature of the colorums, but the rural economy was becoming a more important issue in the peasant's vision of a new and prosperous society. By the late 1930's the unions had clearly refined their objectives; no longer were they asking for the redistribution of land, but the reform of the kasama tenancy system that prevailed throughout central and southern Luzon. More specifically, they asked for changes in the provision of loans to tenants, rates of interest, the division of the harvest between the landlord and tenant, and for landlords to provide supplementary benefits such as medical and educational facilities. The other major issue was political; the peasants demanded the right to belong to agricultural unions.126

In attempting to bring about this new order, the peasant unions used the legitimate and illegitimate political channels that were open to them. The political methods they employed ranged from filing court suits against landlords and petitioning politicians to burning a hacendero's sugar fields and assaulting estate overseers. However, the most significant development was to be found in the growing use of collective political action by centrales workers and tenants against landlords. Sometimes this took the form of peacefully organized demonstrations; for example, the General Worker's Union and Socialists held a thirty thousand strong Labour Day march in San

F.n. 125 continued.

Fernando, Pampanga, in 1939. Often, however, collective action meant large-scale strikes. On January 21, 1939, for example, the AMT organized a general strike by five hundred workers at the Mount Arayat Sugar Company, thirteen hundred workers at the Pampanga Sugar Development Company (PASUDECO), workers at the Pampanga Sugar Mills (PASUMIL), and twenty thousand tenants employed in rice and sugar production. This may have been an unusually popular strike, but action against landlords in the rice and sugar sectors was not uncommon. Kerkvliet, for instance, demonstrates the increase in anti-landlord activity between 1935 and 1940 by analyzing the number of agrarian "incidents" that took place each year; that is, the number of assaults on overseers, crops burnt, petitions filed, strikes and the like. In this period, such incidents increased by nearly four hundred percent in Pampanga, Bulacan and Nueva Ecija. However, the peasants' objective remained the reform rather than the destruction of the rural economic structure.

During the war-time occupation, peasant organisations formed the hard core of the resistance to the Japanese and those that collaborated with them. The collaboration of landlords and the Philippine Constabulary with the occupying forces, or their dubious loyalty to an independent Philippines, merely served to reinforce and intensify the class divisions that had existed in pre-war Luzon. However, the resistance era was politically important for several reasons. Firstly, the peasantry linked up with other groups and were exposed to issues that they might not otherwise have encountered through their involvement with the United Front against the Japanese. Secondly,

---

127. Kerkvliet, Peasant Rebellion, p.130.
128. Ibid., p.131.
129. Ibid., p.101.
130. Ibid., p.130.
the retreat of the landlords to the major urban centres enabled peasant organisations to establish de facto governments in central Luzon.\(^131\) Thirdly, the arming of the peasantry and their systematic training in guerrilla war permitted more militant action and it may have influenced the transition to open conflict with the landlords in the late 1940's.

In the immediate post-war era the National Peasants' Union assumed the role of the pre-war AMT/KPMP alliance and like its predecessors its primary objectives were to reform the tenancy system, achieve more equitable moneylending practices, and obtain a source of guaranteed loans. For example, in cases where farm expenses were divided equally between the landlord and tenant, the peasants demanded a shift from the prevailing fifty/fifty sharing of the harvest to a sixty/forty division in their favour. If the tenant paid all the farm costs, they demanded seventy percent of the harvest.\(^132\) However, peasants were also dissatisfied with the *kasama* system itself and sought the introduction of the *buwisann* or fixed rent agreement in its place.\(^133\)

Unlike the earlier peasant unions, the National Peasants' Union was not strictly reformist. Reforms were part of a long-term plan designed to achieve the redistribution of landholdings and the abolition of the tenancy system itself. These objectives echoed those of the *Tanggulan, Sakdalista* and earlier movements. As a first step, the National Peasants' Union made a concerted effort to gain reforms through the electoral process, something which had happened for the first time in the *Sakdalista* movement, by supporting the newly-founded Democratic Alliance. In the 1946 elections they won six congressional seats. The result was insignificant at the national

---

level but it clearly demonstrated the Party's popular basis in central Luzon; the elected officials came from Pampanga (two), Nueva Ecija (two), Bulacan (one), and Tarlac (one). In the Vice-Presidential contest, the Democratic Alliance failed to have the Nationalista candidate, Rodriguez, elected but he won Bulacan, Pampanga, Tarlac and Nueva Ecija. Similarly, the Nationalista candidate that the Democratic Alliance supported for President, Osmena, was defeated despite substantial majorities in Nueva Ecija, Tarlac and Pampanga and a narrow loss in Bulacan. Once again, Pampanga returned the strongest support; candidates backed by the Democratic Alliance polled over eighty percent of the vote.

The civil war that raged throughout central and southern Luzon in the late 1940's and early 1950's is too important to dismiss in a few paragraphs here. However, I generally accept the argument put forward in Kerkvliet's pioneering thesis from which much of my material in this chapter is drawn. He argues that a combination of factors, including the return of the landlords or their Cawalning Capayapan (armed guards) to central Luzon, the frustration of the Democratic Alliance's elected officials, and the worsening situation of the peasantry in a deteriorating economy, led to the formation of the Huk's and the outbreak of war. At least, these were the immediate cause of the rebellion; others, as I have attempted to show, were deeply rooted in Luzon's tradition of rebellion which extended way back into the nineteenth century.

THE TRADITION OF REBELLION, 1840-1940: AN OVERVIEW

Kerkvliet and Sturtevant demonstrate quite clearly that

138. Kerkvliet, Peasant Rebellion, and Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings
the peasant movements of the mid-1930's and 1940's were more political and secular than the earlier secret societies, and that they were moving away from the traditional pattern of rebellion in this respect. After 1920 various peasant movements fought against the ruling landlord class in an attempt to gain an independent Philippines and either a redistribution of land or significant reforms in the tenancy system. To achieve these ends, peasant organisations took action through both the recognised and illegal channels that were open to them; almost invariably it seems, the failure of electoral politics and negotiation led peasants to resort to violent uprisings. The issue, therefore, is not whether these later peasant movements departed from the traditional pattern of rebellion, but that of how far they represented a new phenomenon in central and southern Luzon. For against the contention that the Sakdalistas, unions and Huke constituted a radical departure from pre-established models, we must set interpretations which posit major continuities in the idiom of rebellion; that is, Ileto's examination of the centrality of the Pasion to Tagalog movements between 1840 and 1912, Fegan's paper on the influence of Pasion and Vigil ideas on peasant movements between 1900 and 1940, and other studies. These interpretations also

F.n. 138 continued. nevertheless have different approaches. Kerkvliet studies post-1930 movements without looking at their historical roots, and consequently he tends to assume that previous movements are not relevant because they are apparently different. Sturtevant, however, takes an historical perspective, but he clearly regards movements after 1930 as secular, while pre-1930 movements are religious or revitalistic.

139. That is, Sturtevant's and Kerkvliet's position.

140. There are a number of writings which, especially when considered together, serve to qualify the differences one can draw between Luzon peasant movements since the Confradia de San Jose. For example, the continuities referred to by Ileto and Fegan are evident in Paul A. Rodell's analysis of revolutionary literature. See P.A. Rodell, 'Philippine Seditious Plays', Asian Studies, XII, 1, 1974, pp.88-118.
I, acknowledge that politicization occurred but they argue that movements like the Sakdalista and Huk retained a common idiom that can be traced back to the Confradia de San Jose. However, neither school answers the question of how peasant movements in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region developed a secularized, class ideology. They either describe the process of politicization in terms of a departure from previous movements141 or as a constant expansion of an inherited system of religious symbols and themes into the political world;142 but neither explain why this process occurred or suggest any mechanism for these changes.

I have argued that the process of politicization and secularization took place within the framework of a common religious idiom but we still have to explain how this idiom persisted and why there are continuities and discontinuities in the tradition of rebellion. The problem for us is not whether there are continuities on the religious/symbolic plane or discontinuities manifested in the practice of rebellion. Both have been demonstrated in the literature. What we are interested in is the question of how these apparently divergent strands are linked in Luzon peasant movements and the problem of how these different perspectives can be reconciled in a single theoretical framework. That is, how can we analyze the connections between the world of symbols and the world of practice? I believe the two spheres meet in a culture's discourse; by examining the Luzon discourse, or some part of it, over a period of history we are then better able to understand the changing relationship between religious

141. Sturtevant, Popular Uprisings, is the most explicit advocate of this position, though it is often assumed by other authors.

142. This position is found in Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change, and Fegan's paper. My criticism of these authors is not that their respective analyses are incorrect, but that they do not explain the processes that are indicated in their data.
symbols and political practice in peasant movements. It is to this that we now turn.
THE TRANSFORMATION OF PEASANT CONCEPTUAL SCHEMES

How does the theoretical scheme that I outlined earlier explain the persistence and politicization of a common idiom of rebellion in central and southern Luzon throughout the nineteenth and twentieth centuries? Let me reiterate that the principal aim of this thesis is to suggest an approach which can illuminate the continuities and discontinuities evident in what I have called the 'tradition of rebellion', The conclusions reached below are, of course, untested as yet by fieldwork. The contemporary state of research on Philippine peasant movements, especially from the point of view of a comparative historical analysis of ideological structures, is such that definite conclusions are difficult to sustain. What I am suggesting, therefore, is a series of hypotheses and a number of tentative conclusions that appear to be confirmed by the available data.

It will be clear from the foregoing discussion that the pivot on which the theoretical analysis ultimately rests is the demarcation of the realms of doxa, orthodoxy and heterodoxy in a culture's discourse. For example, I have integrated Levi-Strauss' concepts of cold and hot into my analysis of the evolution of the Luzon discourses and it is in this context that the efficacy of the terms must be judged. The universe of discourse is an important analytical tool, I believe, because it enables us to understand the connection between perceptions of change or change experienced as a practical phenomenon (hot) and the non-representation of change in conceptual schemes. What I am suggesting is that a particular people may inherit a discourse which inhibits their conceptualizing social change in
secular, political terms and that the way in which these people come to grips with a rapidly changing world can be better understood through an analysis of the changes that subsequently take place in this discourse. In my view, therefore, the universe of discourse is the locus of the relationship between social change as an objective process and anti- or a-historical dispositions embedded in the peasants' worldview.¹

The central question with which we are concerned is how these boundaries separating the unthinkable and undiscussed and the thinkable and discussed are redrawn in societies in transition. That is, how peasants reformulate their perceptions and experiences of a changed practical world. The problem, therefore, is not to explain why new phenomena are brought into discussion, as Bourdieu deals with this in his analysis of "objective crises", but to determine how they will be discussed. It is this question of how peasants in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region developed a discourse of rebellion that we are interested in here.²

In the early period of Spanish colonialism, I have argued that the monastic domination of central and southern Luzon society established a catholic discourse in which the orthodoxic domain was opposed to the doxic domain as an opposition between cold, religious and hot, political fields, respectively. In Chapter Two, furthermore, I suggested that objective crises, such as the conflicts and divisions associated with the development of a market economy, not only brought

¹. See Chapter Two.
². I stress this point in this thesis because not only have peasantries and their movements been neglected by social scientists (see Harry Benda, 'Peasant Movements in Colonial Southeast Asia', Asian Studies, III, 3, 1965) but there often appears to be an arbitrary separation of 'pre-political' and 'political' peasant movements in the literature.
Figure Two: Changes in the Luzon Discourse

Old Universe of Discussed (orthodox, cold, religious)

| Old Universe of Undiscussed (doxa, hot, political) |

New Universe of Discussed

Progressive movement of the boundary separating orthodoxic and doxic domains. That is, the extensions of the idiom into the hot, political domain.

New Universe of Undiscussed

Field of conflict or dispute (warm, heterodoxic, religious and political, extended idiom/domain of new phenomenon.

*With the available data, we can tentatively suggest that the Old universe of discourse applied to the pre-1840 era while the New universe of discourse applied to the post-1840 period.*
the undiscussed into discussion but into dispute, and that this
transformation occurred within the confines of a common idiom. That
is, the religious idiom was itself extended to include political
phenomena that had previously been indiscussed; *Pasion* and *Vigil*
ideas which formed part of an overall catholicized worldview were
progressively extended into the formerly undiscussed (or less discussed)
hot, political domain of phenomenon. Alternatively, orthodox concepts
and symbols were subsequently applied to a range of heterodoxic
situations (see Figure Two). The selective use of aspects of
catholicism by peasant movements to represent sectional interests
itself marks a break with the universality of orthodox catholic
practice.

It is generally recognised that Tagalog movements as early
as the *Confradía de San José* contained political and secular themes.³
The *Confradía* itself displayed certain class characteristics and
elements of nationalism in its lower class membership of pure-blooded
Tagalogs, a political orientation which I believe was provoked by the
rise of the Spaniards and Chinese mestizos as a landed class in the
peasant economy. Nevertheless, there seems to be a reasonably clear
progression in rebel ideologies from the religious idea of the 'moral
renewal of man' to the political idea of the 'regeneration of society'.⁴
Guerrero, for example, argues that the peasantry became more political
and radical towards the end of the nineteenth century and cites as
evidence the transformation of the *Guardia de Honor* from a lay
organisation into a revolutionary movement and the *Santa Iglesia,*

³. Sweet, in the title of his article, refers to the *Confradía* as a
"proto-political" movement, but he, like others, clearly
demonstrates that it contained class and nationalistic themes.
⁴. These two ideas were suggested by Fegan, October, 1980.
"which taught that the teachings of Jesus Christ were in fact the provenance of patriotism and revolution."  

The preoccupation of the early movements with the moral renewal of man was based on an intense communion with God. Believers prostrated themselves before the Divinity in the hope that they might have the light revealed to them and come to share the mystical knowledge of the Pasion. Through prayer and subservience they might become Christlike or Saintly and thereby live the life of the disciple. Later movements did not, it appears, abandon the notion of moral renewal but combined it with that of social regeneration. Cesar Majul has expressed this change in terms of "the empirical conclusion that the society they were living in was fraught with injustice and therefore immoral." That is, the power structure of society rather than the moral fibre of man was increasingly regarded as the source of injustice and this injustice was interpreted in a religious framework as evil and immoral. Political consciousness was being articulated in economic and religious terms. On one side, it was based on the recognition of injustice in society and gave rise to explicit nationalistic and class ideas; on the other, it was articulated by contrasting behaviour in this world with an ideal model of behaviour inspired by Pasion figures such as Christ, St. Joseph and the Virgin Mary.  

The mix of religious and social interpretations was especially characteristic of peasant brotherhoods up to the end of the 1920's. But the mixture of millenarian religious themes and secular political

5. Guerrero, Luzon at War, pp.167, 168, 188.
7. This latter point is the main thrust of Ileto's argument in Pasion and the Interpretation of Change.
ideas was constantly changing. Guerrero, for instance, claims that the Santa Iglesia contained religious, socialist and anarchist ideas and that Felipe Salvador was regarded by his followers as a "Robin Hood and a Saviour."8 The same could be said of other peasant leaders up to the late 1920's. However, by the 1940's, conceptions of exploitation and injustice, although they were still filtered through the gauze of catholic mysticism, were clearly nationalistic and class oriented. For example, the redistribution of land owned by big landlords, the friars, and those that had collaborated with the Japanese became the central objective of radical peasants. Land redistribution had emerged much earlier, but it became increasingly important with the passage of time.9

The combining of the notions of the moral renewal of the self and the spiritual cleansing of the inner person with the regeneration of society and the reordering of the external environment, trends which underly the shift away from religious purification to collective secular action, is evidence of the extension of a religious discourse into the political world. What the tradition of rebellion confronts us with, therefore, is not an unchanging common idiom per se, or a radical break between religious movements and political movements, but an interlocking conglomeration of continuities and discontinuities. What needs to be explained is how an orthodox religious language or the prevailing cultural idiom was extended into the previously undiscussed realm of politics and converted, at least in part, into a language of rebellion. That is, how an idiom that was cold and religious became hotter and political. We have

8. Guerrero, Luzon at War, pp.178-183.
9. See Chapter Four.
already indicated that the pervasiveness of catholic ideas in the Luzon discourse inhibited the development of an explicitly political language. What we need to show here is how these ideas increasingly came to serve the same purposes as an explicitly political language or functioned as a surrogate political discourse.

We can expand on our analysis of the manner in which religious concepts took on political meanings by comparing, as an example, Ileto's analysis of the idea of light (liwanag) in Tagalog peasant movements between 1840 and 1912 and Fegan's outline of its changed role in post-Katipunan organisations.¹⁰ Both authors attach great significance to conceptions of light in the radical peasants' worldview and regard it as a dominant symbol¹¹ which permeates religious and political attitudes. In Ileto's study of the Confradia de San Jose and Santa Iglesia, heaven is the source of a mystical knowledge that is revealed to believers by light emanating from the eyes of religious figures.¹² In the former movement, for instance, "heaven is the state of pure and perfect liwanag",¹³ of spiritual perfection and perfect knowledge, that is revealed to the Confrades through Joseph's example of "enduring of suffering and trials out of love for Mary and Jesus."¹⁴ Joseph is rewarded in heaven and so he becomes the bearer of light in the sense that his example shows the spiritual path to the utopia that once prevailed in Eden and that will be regained in the millennium.¹⁵ In the early peasant movements, Pasion characters or their proxies in this world, contemporary

¹⁰. Ileto, Pasion and the Interpretation of Change, passim; Fegan, passim.
¹¹. Turner, The Forest of Symbols, p.45, defines "dominant symbols".
¹³. Ibid., p.34.
¹⁴. Ibid., p.31.
¹⁵. Ibid., p.33.
prophets, transmitted light or mystical knowledge to their followers and served to connect the supernatural (heaven) and natural (earth/man) spheres. Ileto's analysis clearly demonstrates that light was a monosemic or univocal symbol; that is, it referred to a single set of religious meanings.16

Ileto makes two crucial related observations on the use of the light symbol in nineteenth century rebel ideologies. Firstly, in reference to Apolinario de la Cruz's letters to Confrades, he states that through the process of communicating ideas through images, a point which is significant in itself, "phenomena occurring in the Confradia, or in the world for that matter, are not allowed to remain situated in the context of everyday life but are charged with meaning through juxtaposition with transcendental ideas."17 The dominant idea to which he is referring is that of light and mystical knowledge. "At times", Ileto adds, "the continuous stream of images that he brings up to emphasise a point leads to a blurring of distinctions between the everyday world and the Pasión world."18

Secondly, and closely related to this observation, Ileto points out that the mediating role of Pasión and contemporary religious figures and the pervasive nature of light together provide the "link between two dimensions of time." They provide the "connection between the dimension of human time in which daily existence is situated, and divine or Pasión time which proceeds in an abrupt and perpendicular manner and into which human time is suspended."19

The message which Ileto conveys is that phenomena in everyday

---

17. Ileto, Pasión and the Interpretation of Change, p.42.
18. Ibid., pp.42-43.
19. Ibid., p.83.
life are moulded semantically in the image of the *Pasion* world. That is, they are absorbed into, and subordinated to, a system of religious meanings that emphasise moral renewal or the progress of the spirit. This Ileto describes as a "consciousness that constantly seeks to define the world in its own terms." Light was connected to a series of beliefs emphasising God, mystical knowledge, salvation and the purification of the inner self and clearly belonged to the religious field. The positive or explicit content of this symbolic universe was religious, cold and orthodox. Heaven, and the beings that populated it, were regarded as the source of legitimate knowledge which dictated that the path to salvation lay in the moral perfection of the inner self. That is, salvation on the extra-terrestrial plane was substituted for change or progress in this world. This life was suffered in prayer so that redemption might be had in the afterlife. In its negative content, the symbolic universe of light/mystical knowledge/God/inner purification revealed the everyday world or the world of human time as the realm of doxic, hot and political phenomena. Everyday life had an empirical existence that was semantically denied. In this sense, light was a cold, orthodox and religious symbol.

At the beginning of his study of post-*Katipunan* movements, Brian Fegan notes that the symbol of light is connected to a number of other light symbols, such as the 'East' and the 'Sun', and that these are used to represent both the moral renewal of man and the regeneration of society. The 'East' and the 'Sun', as the source of light, become the symbols of the "Tagalog race", the "Philippine flag", the "people", "nation", "reason", "freedom" and "liberty". In this

---

context, light is clearly a polysemic or multivocal symbol; that is, it relates to separate religious and political sets of meaning.\(^\text{23}\) Fegan suggests that only some of these references can be traced back to the *Confradia de San Jose* while others appear to be of quite recent origin.\(^\text{24}\) More importantly, it appears that the dominant symbol of light has been replaced by the light symbols, the 'Sun' and the 'East'.

We shall return to this point below, but the author himself quotes, for example, the *Katipunan* leader, Bonifacio, referring to "the Sun of Reason that shines in the East", "the Sun of anger of the Tagalogs", "mother in the East", and the later folk expression, "the Sun of anger of our Rizal."\(^\text{25}\)

The substitution of natural light symbols for the abstract symbol of light provides a basis on which we can compare Ileto's and Fegan's descriptions of Luzon peasant thought in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, respectively. While light is the common denominator in both analyses, Ileto and Fegan show that there are several crucial differences between the symbolisms of earlier and later peasant movements. In the former, God and Christlike figures are the source of mystical knowledge - the light which radiates from their gaze bears divine inspiration - whereas in the latter, popular heroes, like Rizal and Salvador, carry the light of the 'East', the 'Sun'. In one, the source of mystical knowledge is marked by an abstract symbol and knowledge is transmitted by charismatic religious characters; in the other, the source of knowledge is denoted by natural symbols and the bearers of knowledge are Tagalog martyrs. The 'East' and the 'Sun' have displaced 'God' as the symbol of knowledge, and popular folk heroes have become its bearers rather than *Pasion* personages.

\(^{23}\) Turner, in Lessa and Vogt (eds.), p.166.  
\(^{24}\) Fegan, p.3.  
\(^{25}\) Ibid., pp.10-11.
The importance of the 'Sun' symbol is practically realized in its embodiment as the central emblem in the Katipunan flag.26

The principal consequence of this partial demystification of the religious version of the light/knowledge symbolism, to rephrase Ileto's terminology, is that phenomena situated in the context of everyday life are no longer charged with meaning only when elevated into the transcendental world of Pasion time. That is, the 'Sun' and the 'East' no longer relate to divine inspiration and mystical knowledge alone but symbolize the "flag", "nation", and the struggle of lower class Filipinos against oppression by landlords and foreigners. They carry meanings that cannot be deduced from the Pasion but which are directly attached to the crises and conflicts that confront the peasants in everyday life. Human time and Pasion time still merge but it appears that the former has begun to assert its priority. The secular world is becoming meaningful in itself and religious ideas that have been passed down through time are being constantly located in the context of practical experience. No longer are religious symbols wholly suspended in the mystical world of the Pasion but relate, at least in some significant way, to human experience as a social rather than a spiritual reality. Consciousness, to invert Ileto's phrase, is not constantly defined in its own terms but according to the logic of everyday experience.

Milagros Guerrero suggests that the development of ideas such as patriotism and nationhood and the radicalization of the peasantry might not have meant abandoning inherited conceptual schemes.27 I believe that we can go further and contend that what we are witnessing is the extension of a religious idiom into the political sphere and the

26. Information made available to me by Brian Fegan, October, 1980.
27. Guerrero, Luzon at War, p.167.
emergence of two structurally distinct sets of symbols within this common idiom: that is, a two-tiered or bifurcated discourse which includes orthodox religious and heterodox political ideas (see Figure Three).

Figure Three: The Extension of the Luzon Discourse

New Discourse

Old Discourse

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LIGHT (connecting or polysemic symbol)</th>
<th>&quot;</th>
<th>&quot;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Heaven/God/Christ/Saints/prophets</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>religious knowledge</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>divine intervention</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>return of Christ</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>moral renewal/inner purification</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun/East</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>peasant leaders</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>social/political knowledge</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>secular intervention</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>return of folk heroes</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>social regeneration</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This tendency appears to be confirmed by Rodell's analysis of the popular zarzuela theatre or "seditious plays" at the turn of the century. In several dramas conventional religious themes are present, such as those of resurrection and light. Aurelio Tolentino's 'Kahapon, Ngayon at Bukas' (Yesterday, Today and Tomorrow) and Juan Cruz Matapang's 'Hindi Ako Patay' (I am not Dead), for example, make explicit use of the idea of resurrection, while Juan Abad's 'Tanikalang Guinto' (The Golden Chain) makes Liwanag its central character and heroine. These themes, however, are woven into plots which clearly stress patriotism and nationalism. In Juan Abad's play, for instance, Liwanag is the daughter of Maimbot, a character who represents the American government and tries unsuccessfully to murder

her daughter. Liwanag eventually dies, after her lover, the loyal Filipino, Kaulayao, is betrayed and slain by his traitorous brother, Nag-tapon, but she promises to return when the traitor is dead.

In these plays, which Rodell claims use a technique of "double entendres" or "double meaning" to communicate nationalist ideology, political symbols are most prominent. In Tolentino's 'Kahapon, Ngayon at Bukas', the climax of the story occurs against a backdrop of "a rising sun" and the magical appearance of a Filipino flag. Juan Cruz Matapang's 'Hindi Ako Patay' likewise uses the symbols of "the radiant sun" and "the red flag of Philippine liberty", and it culminates with the waving of the "flag of Philippine Independence ... to salute the sun which has shone upon the Filipinos to regenerate them and cast away their bondage." Rodell makes the highly significant observation that politically-oriented and non-political drama shared common story plots but the former employed "non-verbal symbolisms", the rising sun and/or the Katipunan flag, in stage-sets and costumes to enunciate patriotic sentiments. Actors in Tolentino's plays, for instance, wore the rising sun flag of the Katipunan on their costumes throughout the performances. In these plays orthodox religious themes were submerged in a political milieu where "double meanings, revolutionary symbols, and allegorical situations rendered the real purpose of the play explicit to only the native audience." They show that the former discourse in which a

31. Ibid.
32. Ibid., pp.98, 104, 105, 110.
33. Ibid., p.108.
34. Ibid., p.109.
35. Ibid., p.111.
36. Ibid.
37. Ibid., pp.110-111.
cold, orthodox and religious conceptual scheme was opposed to a hot, doxic and political domain of phenomena had given way to a field of discussion in which hot and political phenomena were included as a source of heterodox opinion.

While religion and politics in this scheme (Figure Three) belong to structurally distinct orthodox and heterodox domains, in practice a process of attrition between them tends to produce a warming of the idiom itself. As part of the same universe of discourse, the cold and religious and the hot and political are logically connected and some level of interaction is inevitable. It may well be, however, that the religious meanings of specific concepts and symbols were increasingly taken-for-granted in the Luzon discourse and the focus of discussion shifted to the political field. This would admit the possibility of symbols retaining orthodox religious meanings while at the same time accumulating political meanings. For example, followers of peasant movements in the early twentieth century could have legitimately believed in the resurrection of Rizal, Salvador, Bonifacio and Christ. Likewise, as I mentioned earlier, the notion of societal regeneration need not preclude beliefs about spiritual redemption in an afterlife. As can be seen below, this seems to have happened with the idea of light; that is, it developed an additional set of meanings and subsequently became a polysemic rather than a monosemic symbol. I have no data which can confirm or refute this suggestion, but it is likely that the connection between religious and political symbols that share the same source is unknown to the peasants themselves.

One of the consequences of the politicization of religious symbols is that explicit political ideas are more readily admitted

38. See Chapter Two.
into indigenous conceptual schemes. That is, the principal antagonism between otherworldly and worldly interpretations has already been overcome. Brian Fegan presents us with a specific example in the form of the anticipated intervention of Japan, the 'land of the rising sun', on behalf of peasant movements in the early twentieth century.39 The example is especially interesting in the light of Rodell's account of Aurelio Tolentino's play where a similar theme arises. While there is no explicit reference to Japan, Malaya\n\nin (the American government) dreams that the Filipino patriot, Tagailog, "organises some airships, cannons and guns with electric bullets, trenches and movable fortifications" to liberate the Philippines - a liberation which is symbolized by the 'Sun' and 'flag'.40 The direct conceptual rationalization of the belief that Japan would supply firearms and dispatch a naval force to liberate the Philippines was provided, I believe, by the 'Sun'/'flag' symbols rather than by direct analogies with the return of Christ. If an immediate connection can be established between the return of Christ and the decisive role of Japanese military force, it appears to be subordinate to the connection provided by the 'Sun' as a symbol of Japanese military power, on the one hand, and as a symbol of Philippine liberty and freedom on the other. The link, I suggest, can be represented in the form of Figure Four below. The connection could be easily drawn between the Sun as a symbol of power (Japan) and the Sun as the symbol of the struggle of Filipinos for independence.

The process of augmenting politicized religious ideas with explicit political references is evident in Rodell's explanation of "seditious plays" by Filipino writers in the early American period. In Aurelio Tolentino's 'Kahapon, Ngayon at Bukas' and Juan Cruz Matapang's 'Hindi Ako Patay', the "flag", "red flag", "rising sun", and "radiant sun" are the focal symbols which connect the recurrent themes of resurrection to ideas of independence, freedom, liberty, reason, right and justice. The link between the religious themes and political sentiments is not direct; rather, it is mediated by other symbols. As Rodell points out, there are two distinct sets of meaning - one rooted in the religious context (for example, resurrection), the other in the political arena (for example, independence). These are linked through the use of light symbols, the Sun/East and the flag, not light itself. We are not, I suggest, looking at a case of straightforward analogical transfer of meaning between the religious and political domains. By the turn of the century, the political and religious significances that had been attached to a particular symbol, such as light, were no longer inter-changeable. Light had come to mean two distinct things; it was still connected with religious ritual as a symbol of the risen Christ but the

symbols of the Sun and East, which grew out of this ritual, stood for nationalist and class objectives.

The dual process of locating religious symbols in the mainstream of "human" rather than "Pasion" time and augmenting them with explicit political concepts is important because it underlies the rapid politicization of rebel ideologies in the early twentieth century. What I propose is that the politicization of the peasantry rested on a switch from the interpretation of everyday life in terms of Pasion meaning systems to an idea that the secular world was really meaningful in itself. Now the continued use of a common idiom masks what I believe to be a fundamental discontinuity in peasant conceptual schemes. Guerrero, Ileto, Kerkvliet, Sturtevant and Fegan agree that the Luzon peasantry became more political and radical in the decades after the war against Spain. Guerrero, for instance, argues that the Santa Iglesia and Guardia de Honor seized upon radical ideas of patriotism and nationhood and promoted revolutionary social and economic goals focused, in particular, on the redistribution of land. These ideals may not have been as clearly articulated in the early movement as Guerrero's analysis suggests but themes such as the redistribution of land became increasingly important in later Luzon movements.

Throughout the literature on peasant movements in central and southern Luzon, descriptions of inchoate forms of communism, socialism, anarchism, Robin Hoodism, and social banditry, as well as visions of liberty, equality and unity, are common. These ideas need not

42. In these movements, however, the redistribution of land was interwoven into a millenarian dream of plenty; that is, it was part of a heavenly state of existence that was expected after a second great catastrophe. In later movements, the redistribution of land became a more important issue in the political struggle against landlordism; that is, it became part of a secular, political conflict over the distribution of wealth.
contradict the corpus of beliefs which hold that the road to heavenly salvation lies in the moral perfection of the inner self, but they do presuppose either an alternative or supplementary set of non-spiritual beliefs. That is, a worldview which embraces some concrete or practical notion of change. The killing of a landlord or overseer, or the destruction of land and tax records, for example, cannot be explained in terms of orthodox conceptions of redemption. Such acts are prefaced on the recognition of social division and conflicts of interest in the social and economic order. Likewise, there is no inherent link between the resurrection of Christ and the drive for Philippine Independence - yet, that such a connection was made through the use of analogy and symbols is clearly demonstrated in, for example, Tolentino's 'Kahapon, Ngayon at Bukas'. The connection between the religious and political spheres was constructed, and it was constructed on the realization that everyday experience required a separate or supplementary discourse; that is, one that was geared to the emerging inequities in the Luzon economy.

How can this bifurcation of the (new) universe of discussed be explained? Why does the extension of the boundaries of discussion introduce a field of heterodox as opposed to orthodox opinion? As we have seen in Chapter Two, Bourdieu and Bloch have suggested that "objective crises" provoke discussion of that which formerly belonged to the realm of doxa by destroying the taken-for-granted nature of things. That is, they juxtapose the past and present, expectations and experience, the world as it is thought and the world as it is lived, and challenge the natural order in a practical way. In Chapter Three we sketched some of the principal crises and conflicts that social and economic change brought to central and southern Luzon.

43. Rodall, pp.105-108.
Bourdieu points out, however, that 'crises' do not in themselves explain the nature of the critical discourses to which they give rise. Unfortunately, neither Bourdieu nor Bloch expand on their observations. They do not tell us how phenomena introduced into the field of discussion will be discussed.

The key factor which determines whether new phenomena form part of an orthodox or heterodox discourse lies in the observation that orthodoxy is an imposed or constructed ideological order, and not a state of opinion that is automatically produced or natural.\(^44\) It takes, among other things, time to standardize opinion or establish a societal consensus. More importantly, however, the process of imposing a particular conceptual order is a political struggle. That is, it reflects the underlying power relations in society and the conflicts of interest that emerge between classes and other groups in periods of economic change and social division. At stake is the legitimacy (or illegitimacy) of the new order of things - or, as Bourdieu formulates it, the definition of social reality.\(^45\) In the sphere of political power, therefore, the conflict between groups in society is expressed not simply in terms of the manipulation of material rewards, overt coercion and physical violence but in terms of what Bourdieu has called "symbolic violence". Thus it consists, in part, of what has been known euphemistically as the 'struggle for hearts and minds'.

In trying to identify precisely those sets of factors that enabled the peasants of central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region to use inherited conceptual schemes as a basis for challenging the

\(^{44}\) See Chapter Two, 'Universe of Discourse'.  
\(^{45}\) See Chapter Two.
status quo, it should be remembered that the struggle to define
the socially and politically 'real' articulates with social
divisions and conflicts of interest in society proper. Bourdieu
argues that only when "social classifications become the object and
instrument of class struggle", then doxa and orthodoxy appear as
arbitrary and the process of formulating a critique becomes possible;
thenceforth the dominated possess the "material and symbolic means
of rejecting the definition of the real that is imposed on them
through logical structures" which reproduce "the state of power
relations." 46

In central and southern Luzon, the mobilization of an ongoing
idiom and the rejection of the prevailing state of power relations by
the peasantry rested on three sets of factors. Firstly, the peasantry
refuses to recognise the legitimacy of the newly-formed dominant
class. Increasingly, rural society was divided between those who
owned land and those who had insufficient or no land; this basic
economic conflict was further aggravated by racial and cultural
differences between the upper and lower classes. As a dominant land-
lord class, the culturally Hispanicized elite and the Spanish priests
disentangled themselves from everyday village and peasant life and in
doing so introduced nationalistic and class sentiments into economic
relations that were becoming increasingly antagonistic. The changed
role of the friars, I believe, was crucial. The image of the priest
as someone preoccupied with spirituality collapsed in the nineteenth
century when they became the largest landholders in the Tagalog
provinces. As landlords they betrayed those very ideals of humility,
egalitarianism and moral renewal which they had propagated among the
common people. It was this sense of hypocrisy, as much as their role

as exploiters in an economic sense, which provoked the "moral outrage" of the peasantry and the reassertion of principles abandoned by the Spaniards and native landlords. The emergence of the monastic orders as large landowners enabled the peasantry to seize upon the contradiction between the former lifestyle and teachings of the priests on the one hand and their contemporary role in the rural economy on the other; in so doing they turned the Pasion against those who had popularized it.

The extension of this moral critique to cover the landlord class generally was natural and logical. Nevertheless, the centrality of the antagonism between Tagalog/peasants and Spanish/landlord/priests appears to have lent a distinctively nationalist colour to early popular movements. Objectively speaking it is virtually impossible to separate nationalistic and class themes in central and southern Luzon, but while both were incorporated in peasant conceptual schemes the former seemed to have taken precedence in pre-1900 organisations. We have already mentioned the restriction of membership in the Confradia de San Jose to 'pure-blooded' Tagalogs but it should also be pointed out that the peasants were initially willing to cooperate with ilustrados in the war against Spain and turned against them only when the landed class reconciled itself with the new American regime. Nationalist sentiments often acted as the catalyst in the emerging class conflict, with peasants fighting a dominant class of mestizos and Spaniards who happened to be the principal landlord class. Acts of rebellion with explicit class connotations became more common after 1900, but the intervention of foreigners still heightened the peoples' bitterness towards landlords. I certainly do not wish to imply that class was unimportant in the

47. The term 'moral outrage' was suggested by Fegan, October, 1980.
earlier movements but that it was often manifested in an inchoate form of nationalism. After 1900, the collaboration of the landlords with the Americans, and then the Japanese, served to reinforce what had already become an explicitly class conflict. That is, the relative importance of nationalism and class in peasant thought seemed to be reversed or brought closer together.

Secondly, while the religious orders inadvertently armed the peasants with ideas and symbols that provided the basis for a nationalist and class critique, the unification of the peasantry as a class provided the social conditions necessary for sustaining this critique. In Chapter Three, we outlined two successive trends in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries which could be described respectively as the peasantization of the villages and the proletarianization of the peasantry. These descriptions were basically self-explanatory and were dealt with in sufficient detail earlier but we should recap briefly. We argued that the concentration of landownership and the introduction of rudimentary technology in the nineteenth century served to strengthen the peasant nature of the villages whereas, in the early twentieth century, the concentration of landholdings and the importing of large-scale industrial technology created a proletarianized peasantry in central Luzon. The overall consequences of these changes was a widening of the gulf between landlord and peasant and a tightening of the social organisation within each. Rivera and McMillan's study, for instance, indicates that marriages in central Luzon increasingly took place within classes rather than between them. The sharing of a common set of experiences, in an objective and subjective sense, was increasingly

48. I have dealt with Rivera and McMillan's study in Chapter Three and refer the reader to the section on the transformation of the Luzon economy in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.
reflected in the peasantry's ability to sustain a succession of movements which were fundamentally similar. The Confradia de San Jose, Guardia de Honor and the Santa Iglesia heralded the emergence of a tradition of rebellion throughout central Luzon and the southern Tagalog provinces; after the mid-1880's, in central Luzon in particular, a more or less continuous state of rebellion prevailed.

Thirdly, the emergence of a tradition of rebellion in central and southern Luzon was a factor which fuelled the peasant critique of emerging power structures. I believe that for two reasons it is difficult to overestimate the impact of this tradition of revolt. In the first instance, popular movements and the individuals that comprised them, could legitimize and conceptualize rebellion on the basis of an independent peasant history, a folklore full of Robin Hoods, bandits, saviours, Christs, and prophets. While the Confradia de San Jose modelled itself in the image of the patron saint and sought divine intervention, later movements, such as the Brotherhood of the Shining Kabola, invoked a series of Filipino martyrs - Salvador, Bonifacio, Rizal - and recognised the nationalist and class nature of their plight. As the tradition of rebellion unfolded, successive movements were conceptually better equipped to formulate a response to the crises confronting peasant society. They had a history on which to build in the same sense that Levi-Strauss' 'bricoler' re-orders and re-uses the remains of past events and experiences. While the early movements utilized symbols and ideas from the available catholic discourse, later organisations had, in addition, the experience of rebellion on which to draw. As we have seen, once religious symbols had been located in concrete human time they were augmented with political symbols and references: that is, popular movements effectively mobilized symbols. Experience had taught the
peasantry that rebellion was a secular conflict - *bolos* were no match for modern rifles in an armed clash and prayer did not guarantee immunity to bullets. This trend manifested itself in the re-focussing of the symbolic universe on nationalism and class.

The importance of the tradition of rebellion in sustaining the peasant critique was not confined to its role as a source of legitimacy or a basis for conceptualizing contemporary experiences. Equally importantly, it represented a continuous forum which served to focus and clarify peasant discontent. In this sense, popular movements were a key mechanism in mobilizing and integrating the material and symbolic resources of the lower classes. In terms of the former, they developed organisational structures, usually in the form of brotherhoods and unions, which brought peasants, rural workers and some urban groups and individuals together and through which different viewpoints were exchanged and ideas more widely disseminated among the peasantry.49 Through the socio-political networks they established, recruitment campaigns, the publication of underground newspapers and periodicals, and verbal communication, peasant organisations played a positive role in the political education of the lower classes. On the one hand, the introduction of rational organisational techniques institutionalized peasant protest; on the other, these techniques created structures which helped diffuse ideas of communism, socialism and anarchism into the mainstream of peasant thought. It would be a mistake, however, to over-emphasise the role of formal organisational structures in

49. Fegan, pp.20-26, places a great deal of importance on the development of efficient mass organisations. It should be pointed out, however, that in all likelihood these organisational networks harnessed peasant discontent, rather than created it, and that they made the peasantry a much tougher political opponent of the landlords.
shaping the peasants' discourse. Both the mobilization of peasant support and that of symbols grew out of the tradition of rebellion - one as an attempt to formulate an appropriate course of action, the other as an attempt to conceptualize experience - and both interacted to determine the nature of peasant rebellions.

By the 1930's, the peasants of central and southern Luzon had developed a class disposition that integrated a tradition of rebellion into a worldview which sought to explain and articulate the political and economic divisions in the social formation. They no longer sought to define the world in terms of the Pasion but focussed explicitly on class conflict and nationalism. In this sense, the period between the Confradia de San Jose in the 1840's and the rise of the peasant unions and Huk's in the late 1930's and 1940's marked the passage from a cold to a hot ideology. That is, peasant conceptual schemes which excluded historical notions of social and economic change were displaced by a discourse geared to the practical realities of the everyday world. The development of a political discourse, however, occurred within the tradition of rebellion and the wider historical context of a society dominated by catholicism. In central and southern Luzon, the politicization of the peasantry did not manifest itself in a radical break with the past. To the contrary, popular lower class movements from the mid-nineteenth century have utilized a common idiom based on ideas and symbols borrowed from orthodox catholicism. That they should appropriate tenets of the religious discourse and seek to define the world through them is logical. What is less clear is the process by which the cold, religious discourse that peasants inherited was transformed into a hot, political discourse which emphasised nationhood or class. That is, the process underlying the politicization of the common idiom.
In exploring the transformation of a Luzon discourse I have attempted to reconcile the continuities and discontinuities in the tradition of rebellion. Our principal objective has been to explain how the peasantry re-organised an inherited system of religious ideas and symbols and applied them to the emerging crises in the agrarian society. The universe of discourse, I contend, was constantly expanded into the political realm of the undiscussed and transcendental schemes of perception were increasingly located in the mainstream of concrete human experience. Religious symbols took on secular meanings and were augmented with explicitly political ideas. The peasantry sought to locate catholicism in this-world and define the world in terms of everyday human experience rather than define life experiences in terms of an other-world. While peasant movements retained a common idiom, the system of meanings which it encompassed went beyond the 
*Pasion* and became infused with notions of class and nationalism. Religious and symbolic continuities in the tradition of rebellion were combined with the processes of politicization and secularization; that is, catholic symbols and concepts were increasingly employed in successive peasant movements to denote peasant experiences of the everyday world.
Chapter Six

THE FRAMEWORK AND ARGUMENT RE-CONSIDERED

In this chapter I will confine myself, firstly, to defending the framework I have developed in this thesis against the type of criticism raised by Jack Goody in his recent book *The Domestication of the Savage Mind* and, secondly, to clarifying and reiterating some of the central aspects of the argument we presented in the preceding chapters. The theoretical framework we outlined and its application to peasant conceptualizations of change in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog provinces is too complicated to summarize briefly. Therefore, rather than attempting to detail our approach and findings in a set of abbreviated conclusions, we will instead remind the reader of the nature of our investigations and their relevance to current research efforts on Luzon peasant movements.

A possible objection to the line of inquiry adopted in this thesis, though I believe it is only a minor one, concerns the use of an historical approach. There is a traditional antagonism between anthropology and history, and probably there are anthropologists who still regard historical perspectives as an unacceptable way of looking at so-called simpler societies. However, this being the case, the anti-historical bias of anthropology should not be over-emphasised; in the past few years it has been broken down and one is no longer obliged to vigorously defend an historical perspective. Anthropologists and historians alike now generally recognize that there are areas of study where an interdisciplinary approach can produce very fruitful results. I believe the study of peasant societies is one such area that is gaining a great deal from the pooling of the anthropologist's and historian's resources.
However, more serious criticisms can be levelled at my choice of analytical tools. It is quite clear from the argument initially put forward in Chapter Two and subsequently reiterated in the following chapters that I believe the concepts we have borrowed from Levi-Strauss and Bourdieu can be used to analyze social and cognitive change. But structuralism, and analytical frameworks that have been influenced by it, have recently come under attack for failing to take history and social change into account. The criticisms have been wide-ranging; for example, although Sahlins has been influenced by structuralist and Marxist perspectives, the analytical scheme outlined in Culture and Practical Reason has been identified with Levi-Strauss' The Savage Mind and subjected to the same criticism as mainstream structuralism. This is not to claim that Sahlins is beyond criticism; Bridget O'Laughlin, for instance, has legitimately pointed out that the framework in Culture and Practical Reason disregards cultural variation and change. However, O'Laughlin's critique merely touches the surface of a larger controversy that has been brought to the forefront by Jack Goody's The Domestication of the Savage Mind. This book has important implications for my analytical framework, not only because Goody attacks Levi-Straussian concepts such as the cold and the hot but because he attacks a range of theoretical approaches that have been influenced by Levi-Strauss' writing. Although Bourdieu is not mentioned specifically, his works clearly fall within the ambit of Goody's critique.

Goody's Critique of Structuralist and Neo-Structuralist Approaches

Goody's central argument is that analytical dichotomies or 'binary oppositions' used by structuralist anthropologists prevent any serious investigation of the mechanisms underlying social and cognitive change. Although he focuses on Levi-Straussian archetypes, Goody merely uses *The Savage Mind* as an instrument for attacking a range of authors from Levy-Bruhl and Cassirer to Wilson, Horton and Sahlins. The author's objections to binary oppositions stem in part from his belief that they reflect an ethnocentric bias against non-western cultures. However, Goody's principal objection is that the hot/cold archetype is a "static" or "non-developmental" device. In this respect, I believe the author has seized upon a genuine weakness in structuralist perspectives. Structuralists do indeed tend to use binary oppositions as classificatory descriptions of societies without acknowledging the passage from one societal stage to another and the state of flux that exists during transitional periods. Levi-Strauss, for instance, tends to dismiss history and change as patently obvious processes, but he then proceeds to classify societies as hot or cold without taking either into account. He does not discuss societies that are becoming hotter or colder, though, quite clearly, I believe there are situations where cold institutions and ideologies fail to prevent historical change. Of course, there is a range of similar possibilities which Levi-Strauss leaves unexamined.

It seems that Goody validly criticizes prevailing theories of cognitive processes for failing to satisfactorily explain how societies pass through transitional phases. For structuralist

---

categories tend to be predisposed towards the traditional anthropological problems of order, classification and synchrony, and there is an underlying assumption of social and cultural continuity in their neo-functionalist bias. Unless a concept of movement is developed it seems that an application of these categories to problems of history, diachrony, and social and cultural discontinuity is extremely difficult. Even Bourdieu's analysis, which I regard as far less susceptible to this criticism than most structuralist Marxist approaches, has been justifiably accused of overstating the long-term durability of schemes of perception or habitus. 7

However, while I agree with many of Goody's criticisms of the "non-developmental" features of existing structuralist categories, I disagree for two reasons with the author's conclusion that we should abandon structuralist perspectives in the analysis of social change. 8 Firstly, though this is not a sufficient reason for retaining a model, Goody has not provided a viable alternative to the models he examines and criticizes in The Domestication of the Savage Mind. The literate/non-literate (or proto-literate) scheme that he proposes as an alternative to existing frameworks is not a solution; ironically, it is problematical precisely because the author's departure from traditional dichotomies is not as radical as he would have us believe. Goody merely adds another pair of concepts to the list he so fervently attacks. This detracts in no way from Goody's contribution to the


study of literacy in societies without writing. But as Joseph Glick states in his review of Goody's latest work, "instead of an irreducible gap between the primitive and the advanced, we are left with as large a gap between the non-literate and the literate." There are several obvious theoretical problems with Goody's alternative model which I shall not pursue here, but, in my opinion, the point that should be emphasised is that the author has not extricated himself from the very lacunae he criticizes.

Secondly, I am somewhat puzzled by Goody's conclusion that structuralist categories are necessarily biased against problems of history and social change, and that they should therefore be abandoned. In this respect, his conclusions seem to fly in the face of thinking in French intellectual circles at least, which indicates that much may still be gained from an exchange of ideas between structuralism and Marxism; in any event, Goody's objection to structuralism on the basis of its anti-historical tendencies is a criticism that has been repeatedly made of anthropology itself. However, there is another important objection to Goody's conclusions. Goody's criticism of Levi-Strauss and others is directed at the use of certain terms as binary oppositions; this is the crux of his critique, not the terms themselves. The question then arises as to whether concepts such as Levi-Strauss' cold and hot need necessarily be employed as binary opposites. O'Laughlin makes this very point in her critique of Sahlin's model. Quite clearly, I believe that they


11. O'Laughlin, pp.97-100.
need not be used in this way and that these terms can serve as useful analytical tools provided they are located in a more dynamic framework.

Goody is apparently unaware of Bourdieu's writings on social and cultural reproduction in the sociology of education and, in particular, his recent book *Outline of a Theory of Practice*. Bourdieu has been deeply influenced by Levi-Straussian structuralism, though like Goody he is critical of Levi-Strauss' "idealism". However, his analysis implies an even stronger rejection of the type of intellectualism proposed in *The Domestication of the Savage Mind*. More importantly for our purposes, Bourdieu's investigation of the Kabyle discourse provides us with a theoretical device for overcoming the non-developmental aspects of Levi-Strauss' concepts of the cold and the hot.

We choose Bourdieu's theory of discourse as our principal analytical tool in this thesis on account of its flexibility. We have seen that Bourdieu theoretically analyzes a system of relationships which structure collective representations in all societies without pre-judging the content of the discourse or the specific nature of the relationships involved in any particular culture. That is, a specific discourse may take the form of mythico-ritual representations of the agrarian calendar (Kabylia) or it may be based


on millenarian Christian themes such as those found in the *Pasion* (Luzon). Nor does Bourdieu stipulate any specific content for the relationships between the domains of the discussed and the undiscussed; these relationships will vary between cultures. Bourdieu's framework, therefore, is applicable to a wide range of cross-cultural situations. It is, however, flexible in another sense. The boundaries separating the domains of the discussed and the undiscussed in a culture's discourse are subject to change. How these relationships within the Luzon discourse changed over time and were articulated with social and economic processes is something I discussed at length earlier in this thesis: but the question of whether Bourdieu's theory of discourse can be used to analyze social and cognitive change is no longer an issue.

For several reasons, the universe of discourse is an especially useful device for analyzing the idiom of rebellion in central and southern Luzon. Firstly, by examining the field of discussion or the explicit discourses of successive peasant movements we can identify and describe the transformation of indigenous interpretations of change. Secondly, we can analyze and explain this process of transformation in terms of a connection between perceptions of social and economic change, the practical questioning of the undiscussed (doxy), and the subsequent expansion of the field of discourse. That is, we can show how discourses are articulated with social and economic processes. Thirdly, by examining these changes within the context of a particular discourse we avoid the problems associated with linear progressions in indigenous interpretations of change. That is, we can account for continuities and discontinuities in the idiom of rebellion within the framework of a single discourse. For these reasons Bourdieu's scheme is preferable to others as an analytical tool. However, we still have to ask: does the framework
that we have developed from Bourdieu's and Levi-Strauss' concepts specifically clarify our understanding of religious continuities and political discontinuities in Luzon's tradition of rebellion since the 1840's? Does our framework explain the data?

The Framework

At the beginning of this thesis I argued that the lack of a theoretical framework capable of reconciling religious continuities and political discontinuities in Luzon peasant movements was a major problem confronting current research efforts. My reason for selecting this problem area was simply that I believed the literature had left many important questions unanswered when it merely demonstrated the existence of religious continuities and political discontinuities in what I have called Luzon's tradition of rebellion. Thus, in the Introduction I approvingly quoted Anton Blok's premise and accepted it as the guiding principle of our investigations: "The study of native categories of thought is essential for any understanding of social reality. But in the end the anthropologist must translate the idiom of the culture he investigates into his own conceptual framework." 15 With this in mind, our analytical framework was designed in relation to three questions: firstly, why were catholic ideas and symbols initially adopted by radical peasant movements in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region?; secondly, why and how did the religious idiom survive in successive movements as their central and unifying theme?; thirdly, how did this idiom eventually become interwoven in a secularized, class ideology?

Before we could begin to answer these questions I suggested that we must first understand the character of pre-nineteenth century

Luzon social formation, especially the impact of Spanish catholicism on the subsistence society, and the nature of the changes that afflicted the rural lower classes in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries (Chapter Three). That is, we needed a clearer picture of where Luzon society had come from and where it was going to - the trajectories of change - before we could analyze indigenous interpretations of change. In attempting to define the salient features of the early colonial social formation we used Levi-Strauss' notion of cold societies; we argued that the rise of catholicism to a position of dominance in a society based on reproduction rather than change produced a number of reflectionary relationships between the past and present, myth and practice, superstructure and infrastructure, experience and reality, ideology and practice, religion and politics, supernatural and secular, and culture and society. Furthermore, we argued that the archetypal opposition, or the common theme running through these oppositions, was that of two distinctive notions of time. More correctly, they reflected the domination of one particular notion of time over another; this is variously referred to in anthropological literature as the domination of the cold over the hot (Levi-Strauss), myth over practice (Bourdieu), non-lineal codifications of reality over lineal codifications (Lee), religion over empirical experience (Leach), ritual time over practical time (Bloch), and of static time over processual time (Talmon) (Chapter Two). This relationship manifested itself in the catholicized regions of central and southern Luzon in terms of indigenous interpretations which constantly sought, as Ileto claims, to define the everyday world in terms of the Pasion
world, and human time in terms of *Pasion* time. 16

Demonstrating that early colonial Luzon was dominated by catholicism and that peasant interpretations of change reflected other-worldly religious models was merely a preliminary step in our analysis. What we were particularly interested in was showing how this cold discourse was subsequently broken down and new signifying practices emerged as a result of transformations in the agrarian economy and the formation of class structures (Chapter Four). My objective, therefore, has been to trace religious and political strands in indigenous interpretations of change by showing how the peasants themselves reconciled an inherited set of concepts and symbols, that represented change in millennial terms, with their cognizance of change as a social and economic or secular process (Chapters Two, Three and Four). Moreover, I have attempted to show how the peasantry's struggle to give meaning to their emerging class position extended from the 1840's, at least, into the twentieth century.

In explaining how these diverse strands were linked in Luzon peasant movements we were faced with a difficult analytical task. On the one hand, we needed to develop a framework that could illuminate the broader connections between an historical accumulation of religious meanings in Luzon peasant culture and the contemporary perception of change in the agrarian society. That is, we needed to show how the reflectionary relationships mentioned above were gradually weakened beyond regeneration by social change. This breaking down of mutually reinforcing links between the past and present, superstructures and infrastructures, ideology and action,

and of the domination of non-historical notions of time over historical notions, we characterized in terms of a disjuncture between cold and hot structures or systems of relationships. However, while Levi-Strauss' concepts were retained, our usage of them clearly reflected the idea that social and economic change can practically challenge and erode institutional and ideological designs which represent change in anti-historical or a-historical postures. These modifications, which were suggested by Bourdieu's and Bloch's analyses, merely carry the orthodox Marxist notion of the causality of economic structures in the final analysis to its logical conclusion; namely, a changing economy triggers events of consequence for a culture's discourse and therefore modifies leading collective representations and people's images of their society.

What I have suggested is that adapting Levi-Strauss' schema to the Luzon situation, there are various transitional stages where societies pass from the cold to the hot state during which times hot and cold elements combine. However, we hope our framework does more analytically than demonstrate how an inherited set of concepts and symbols (cold) was initially articulated with conflicts and divisions in the new social and economic formation (hot). Hopefully, our schema demonstrated not just how symbolic and social/economic trends came together in Luzon peasant interpretations of change but also how successive peasant movements continually realized these tendencies in various ways. And so our framework needed a concept of movement to explain the evolution of new signifying practices, a mechanism that could show how cold and religious symbols gradually became hotter as they took on additional meanings of a secular and political nature.
As I mentioned earlier, Bourdieu's universe of discourse seemed the most appropriate device for analyzing the changing internal structure of indigenous worldviews and the way in which they reflected an emerging awareness by the peasantry of exploitation and conflicts of interest in Luzon society. For by examining various discourses on rebellion in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries it appeared possible, firstly, to trace the transformation of indigenous interpretations and, secondly, to locate this process in the context of perceptions of change in the Luzon social order. The principal relationship we considered was that between the domains of the discussed (orthodoxy) and the undisputed (doxy); we carefully examined the changing content of each of these spheres in the Luzon discourse and the changing relationship between them in successive movements.

In a broad sense, we showed how the religious (cold) and the secular and political (hot) were represented, respectively, in the domains of the discussed and the undisputed in early colonial Luzon. For our purposes, the practical ramifications of this pattern of domination of religion over politics in the discourse, of the discussed over the undisputed, entailed an explicit conceptualization of change in terms of catholic models which once relegated perceptions of change as a secular and political phenomenon to the realm of the undisputed. We then proceeded to analyze how social change in central and southern Luzon gradually dissolved anti-historical worldviews by eroding the traditional boundaries separating the domains of the discussed and the undisputed. That is, we explored some of the ways by which politics was increasingly brought into the realm of discussion. It is to these changes in the universe of discourse, and the subsequent extension of the religious idiom into the field of politics, that we have traced religious continuities and political
discontinuities in Luzon's tradition of rebellion.

In developing our analytical framework, which I have outlined only briefly here, we have shown one way of approaching religious continuities and political discontinuities as related strands in Luzon peasant movements. Ultimately, however, the test of any theoretical paradigm is whether it helps to clarify the data to which it ostensibly refers. In this case, does our framework indicate why the religious idiom was initially adopted by peasant movements, and why and how this idiom survived and was subsequently transformed in successive movements?

The Argument

Our central argument in this thesis has been that the Luzon peasantry managed to form interpretations of social change which were culturally meaningful, or meaningful in terms of its past, and politically relevant to its emerging class position in the social order. That is, the peasants creatively moulded the reservoir of catholic symbols and concepts they had at their disposal into a discourse on Philippine independence and class action. In this respect, our objective is similar to that pursued by Ileto in his thesis on the role of Pasion ideas in the Confradia de San Jose and the Santa Iglesia. Unlike Ileto, however, we have gone to some lengths to show that religious interpretations of change gradually gave way to more secular and political ones. While I accept Ileto's proposition that early Tagalog movements attempted to define the everyday world in religious terms, I have argued that later Luzon movements increasingly used catholic concepts and symbols to define nationalistic and class objectives. This position seems closer to that suggested by Fegan in his recent paper, although I believe he tends to neglect the discontinuities in the idiom of rebellion.
Fegan does not show us how religious and political elements were combined in Luzon peasant movements between 1900 and 1940; nor does he appear to realize that processes of politicization originated within the peasantry itself. I agree with many of Fegan's conclusions but suggest that the processes he describes had their source in a changing peasant culture and the emergence of the peasantry as an identifiable class in the Luzon social formation.

Ileto's and Fegan's position on the secularization and politicization of the religious idiom itself is unclear, although their data certainly tends to confirm the argument that I advanced earlier. However, I have tried to go beyond these writers' identification of continuities and discontinuities and explain how these religious and political strands were connected in Luzon peasant movements. If the reader has gained the impression that my argument suggests there are two discourses in Luzon's tradition of rebellion, in the sense that a religious discourse in the Confradia de San Jose had given way to a political discourse in the unions and Huk, then my intentions have not been made sufficiently clear and my conclusions have subsequently been misinterpreted. By using the notion of the universe of discourse and analyzing transformations within this particular discourse I have taken considerable pains to avoid a linear interpretation of peasant movements; that is, the view that there is a necessary sequential development from religious to political stages in these movements. Such a perspective cannot be justified in an a priori sense. In terms of our argument, it would not only fail to take seriously the three key questions that I raised at the beginning of this thesis and reiterated above, but it would make it impossible to explain the persistence of religious themes in Luzon peasant movements.
What I have suggested is that rather than there being two distinct discourses, a religious and a political one, the original catholic discourse was progressively extended into the field of nationalist and class politics after the Confradia de San Jose. In my opinion, the tradition of rebellion in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region contained an identifiable pattern of religious continuities and political discontinuities that can be analyzed in terms of a transformation of the catholic discourse and the extension of religious concepts and symbols into the everyday world of politics. Therefore, rather than a political discourse replacing a religious one, catholic symbols and concepts acquired an additional set of political significations. For example, the observation that ideas about the return of a Saviour were a re-worked version of 'the return of Christ' theme, and that they were construed in secular and political terms in later peasant movements, does not mean that the peasants believed any less in the return of Christ himself. Christ was the archetypal martyr to which Filipino martyrs like Bonifacio, Rizal and Salvador were likened.

A major theme in my argument has been that earlier Luzon movements employed a monosemic discourse which was transformed into a polysemic discourse or idiom in later movements. That is, while the religious idiom was reproduced in successive movements the range of meanings attached to its concepts and symbols was gradually expanded. The symbol of light, for example, did not lose its religious significance but it took on political meanings through the symbols of the Sun and the East, which were used to signify the struggle of the peasantry against landlords and foreigners. This is what is meant by the term 'bifurcated discourse'; that is, the discourse of later
movements contained religious meanings of the kind contained in earlier discourses but it also incorporated new political significations. The structural distinction between a bifurcated discourse and separate discourses is an important one. For in arguing that the religious idiom accumulated political meanings I have clearly intended to show that peasant movements in the early twentieth century possessed a much deeper reservoir of meanings upon which to draw and formulate a discourse than did their predecessors. Of course, it is not possible to pre-determine the set of meanings any particular movement will utilize or whether a specific movement will use a part of or the whole range of meanings available to it. Some movements, as I have indicated, increasingly used religious terms in a political struggle against landlords and colonizers. That is, they emphasised the political aspect of the discourse. Other movements, which I have not dealt with, appear to have emphasised the religious meanings that have been a feature of indigenous interpretations of change since the Confradia de San Jose. Although we cannot draw any definite conclusions, phenomena like the Lapiang Malaya and the Iglesia ni Cristo seem to have had more in common with the pre-1930's movements than with the later unions or Huk. This oscillation between political and religious schemes, whether in the same or different movements, cannot be explained if one accepts that a political discourse had superseded a religious one.

In this thesis I have used Bourdieu's universe of discourse to analyze and explain the transformation of a basic religious idiom in a series of peasant movements since the Confradia de San Jose. We have examined the internal transformation of the catholic discourse and shown how symbols such as light and Christian millenarian themes focussed on redemption/salvation and the return of Christ became part of an extended religious and political discourse. However, I have also
indicated that this process of politicization and secularization was articulated in and through emerging divisions in the social and economic formation. The peasants of central and southern Luzon struggled during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries to develop a discourse which was culturally meaningful and politically relevant to their deteriorating class position in the Luzon social order. According to our theoretical framework, peasants were attempting to reconcile a disjuncture between a cold and religious discourse inherited from the early colonial period and a growing awareness of change as a political and secular or hot process. That is, peasants were faced with the task of reconciling beliefs in the Christian millennium with perceptions of change in the secular world. Ileto rightfully points out that the Confradia de San Jose and Santa Iglesia sought to define the everyday world in Pasion terms. However, movements since the Confradia de San Jose have found this task increasingly difficult, and in attempting to define the world in religious terms they inevitably re-defined the terms themselves.

Current research has clearly indicated that there are religious continuities and political discontinuities flowing through the tradition of rebellion in central Luzon and the southern Tagalog region. However, as I pointed out at the beginning of this thesis, no-one has systematically examined the connections between these two strands in indigenous interpretations of change. Our principal task, therefore, has been to develop an analytical framework capable of explaining these continuities and discontinuities and of showing how they are connected in peasant conceptual schemes. Certainly the exercise has been a difficult one, for the reader will appreciate that relationships of the type dealt with in this investigation are not easily accommodated within a single framework. Whether we have
been successful or not in our efforts is a matter which must be judged by others. However, I believe that our exegesis has clarified some important aspects of Luzon peasant movements and contributed an analytical framework to the study of indigenous interpretations of change. If I have satisfied the reader of the need for theoretically informed approaches to peasant movements then this thesis has, in my opinion, achieved a significant measure of success.
ACHUTEGUI, P.S. de S.J. and M.A. BERNAZ, S.J.

ALTHUSSER, L.

ALTHUSSER, L. and E. BALIBAR

ANDERSON, P.

AGONCILLO, T.A.

-- The Writings and Trial of Andres Bonifacio, Manila Bonifacio Centennial Commission/University of the Philippines, Manila, 1963.

ASAD, T. (ed.)

BAUMAN, Z.

BENITEZ, C.

BLOCH, M. (ed.)

BLOK, A.
BOURDIEU, P.

BOURDIEU, P. and J-C PASSERON

BURRIDGE, K.

BOWRING, J.

CATER, S.D.

CHARBONNIER, G. (ed.)

COHN, N.

COMYN, T. de

CONSTANTINO, R.
The Philippines: A Past Revisited, Tala Publishing Services, Quezon City, 1975.


COSTA, H. de la
CRICK, M.


CUSHNER, N.P. S.J.


ESPIRITU, S.C. and C.L. HUNT (eds.)


EVANS-PRITCHARD, E.E.


FEI, H-T


FOUCAULT, M.


GEERTZ, C.


---


GODELIER, M.


GOODY, J. (ed.)


---


GUERRERO, A.

HARTENDORP, A.V.H.


HICKEY, G.C.


HOBSBAWM, E.J.


---


HOBSBAWM, E.J. (ed.)


HUKE, R.E. (ed.)


JACOBY, E.H.


JAGOR, F.


JOCANO, F.L.

*The Traditional World of Malitbog,* Bookmark, Quezon City, 1969.

KERKVLIET, B.J.


KRADER, L.


LACHICA, E.

LANDA, C.  

LANTERNARI, V.  

LARKIN, J.A.  

LEACH, E.R.  

LEFEBVRE, H.  

LeROY, J.  

LEVI-STRAUSS, C.  

LEWIS, H.T.  

LYONS, J.  

MacMICKING, R.  
MAHAIJANI, U.


MAJUL, C.A.

*The Political and Constitutional Ideas of the Philippine Revolution*, University of the Philippines Press, Quezon City, 1967.

MARR, D.G.


MIGDAL, J.S.


MOORE, B. Jr.


MORGÁ, A. de


MUELLER, C.


NYDEGGER, W.F. and C. NYDEGGER


PELZER, K.J.

RAMOS, M.D.

Creatures of Philippine Lower Mythology, University of the Philippines Press, Manila, 1971.

ROBLES, E.G.


ROSEN, G.


ROTH, D.M.

The Friar Estates of the Philippines, University of New Mexico Press, Alburquerque, 1977.

SAHLINS, M.


SANZ, L.T.

Lucban (A Town the Franciscans Built), Historical Conservation Society, XX, Manila, 1971.

SCOTT, J.C.


STURTEVANT, D.R.

Agrarian Unrest in the Philippines: Guardia de Honor - Revitalisation within the Revolution and Rizalistas - Contemporary Revitalisation Movements in the Philippines, Papers in International Studies, Southeast Asia Series, No. 8, Ohio University Center for International Studies, Athens, Ohio, 1969

TAKAHASHI, A.

TERRAY, E.

THRUPP, S.L. (ed.)

TURNER, V.

WILSON, B.
Magic and the Millennium, Paladin, St. Albans, 1975.

WOLF, E.R.

YOUNG, M.F.D. (ed.)

ZAIDE, G.
Philippine History: Development of our Nation, Bookmark, Manila, 1961.

ZUNIGA, J.M. de

ARTICLES, PAPERS AND THESSES

ALATAS, S.H.
ALATAS, S.H.
'Religion and Modernization in Southeast Asia', Archives

ALDABA-LIM, E., E. JAMAI, A. PERLAS and R.R. SUKGANG
'A Cursory Study of the Lapiang Malaya: Its Membership,
Organisation, and Implications to Present Philippine Society',

ALLEN, J.A.
'Agrarian Tendencies in the Philippines', Pacific Affairs,
XI, 1938, pp.52-65.

ANDO, H.
'A Study of the Iglesia ni Cristo: A Politico-Religious Sect in

BALANDIER, G.
'Political Myths of Colonization and De-Colonization in Africa',
in R. Bendix (ed.), State and Society, University of California

BASTIDE, R.
'Memoire Collective de Sociologie du Bricolage', Année

BENDA, H.
'Peasant Movement in Colonial Southeast Asia', Asian Studies,

BENDA, H.J. and L. CASTLES
'The Samin Movement', Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en

BLOCH, M.
'The Past and the Present in the Present', Man (ns), XII,

BOLLE, K.W.
'Secularization as a Problem for the History of Religions',
Comparative Studies in Society and History, XII, 1970,
pp.242-259.
BOLTANSKI, L.

BOURDIEU, P.


CHAMBERS, P.

COLOonna, F.

COVER, P.R.


Cunningham, C.
CUSHNER, N.P. S.J.

CRIPPEN, H.R.

DiMAGGIO, P.

--

DOEPPERS, D.F.

DOUGLAS, D.E.

DUIKER, W.J.

EMMET, D.

ERBEN, M.
FALL, B.B.

FEGAN, B.
Continuities in Central Luzon Peasant Movements, manuscript, 1980.

FOSTER, G.M.

FRANK, A.W.

FRIEND, T.

GADAMER, H-G

THE SIAUW GIAP

GIDDENS, A.

GLICK, J.A.

GODELIER, M.
GODELIER, M.

GOODFRIEND, D.E.

GUERRERO, M.C.

HINTZ, R.A.

HISLOP, S.K.

HOBSBAWM, E.J.


ILETO, R.
-- 'Tagalog Poetry and Image of the Past During the War Against Spain', in A. Reid and D. Marr (eds.), Perceptions of the Past in Southeast Asia, ASAA Southeast Asia Publication Series, Heinemann Educational Books, Kuala Lumpur, 1979, pp.379-400.
INGLIS, F.

JOCANO, F.L.


KAHN, J.S.


KAUT, C.

KENNET, J.

KERKVLIET, B.J.


KEYDER, C.
KIKUCHI, M. and Y. HAYAMI

KING, V.T.

KOBBEN, A.J.F.

LEE, D.C.


LEVI-STRAUSS, C., M. GODELIER AND M. AUGE

LIENARD, G.
'Le Sens Pratique', Revue Francaise de Sociologie, XV, 3, 1974, pp.413-421.

LITTLETON, C.S.

MAIR, L.P.
MANAHAN, F.
'Bario Medicine', University of Manila Journal of East Asiatic Studies, IV, 2, 1955, p.278.

McLANE, J.R.

McLENNAN, M.S.
'Land and Tenancy in the Central Luzon Plain', Philippine Studies, XVII, 4, 1969, pp.651-682.


MILLER, D.B.

MINTZ, S.W. and E.R. WOLF

JUIJZENBERG, O.D. van den

OADES, R.

O'LAUGHLIN, B.
OOSTERWAL, G.

PETERSON, R.A.

PHELAN, J.L.


PLASENCIA, J. de, OSF

RESNICK, S.A.

RICH, J.A.

RODELL, P.A.
'Philippine Seditious Plays', Asian Studies, XII, 1, 1974, pp.88-118.

ROMANA, J.R. Sta.

ROSEBERRY, W.
ROSEN, L.

SALAMANCA, B.S.

SANDE, F. de
'Relation of the Filipinas Islands, June 7, 1576', in E.H. Blair and J.A. Robertson, The Philippine Islands, 1493-1803, A.H. Clark Co., Cleveland, 1903-1909, IV.

SCHEFFLER, H.

SCHUL, N.W.


SCHUMACHER, J.N.


SCOTT, J.C.
'The Erosion of Patron-Client Bonds and Social Change in Rural Southeast Asia', Journal of Asian Studies, XXXII, 1, 1972, pp.5-37.

SHANIN, T.
SILVERSTONE, R.

SMART, J.E.

STURTEVANT, D.R.

SWARTZ, D.

SWEET, D.

TALMON, Y.

TALMON, Y.
'Millenarian Movements', Archives Europeennes de Sociologie, VII, 2, 1966, pp.159-200.

THORNER, D.

WARREN, J.
Peasantization and Rebellion in Central Luzon, 1565-1665, PSG Paper, 24/7/75.
WERTHEIM, W.F.
'Religious Reform Movements in South and Southeast Asia',
*Archives de Sociologie des Religions*, XII, 1961, pp.53-62.

-- 'From Aliran to Class Struggle in the Countryside of Java',

WICKBERG, E.

-- 'Early Chinese Economic Influence in the Philippines, 1850-1898',

WOLF, E.R.

WORSLEY, P.M.