## **Technocracy and the Market**

# World Bank Group Technical Assistance and the Rise of Neoliberalism

Adrian Robert Bazbauers

September 2013

A Thesis Submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy of The Australian National University.

#### **Declaration**

This thesis in its entirety is my own original work. While members of academic staff and fellow PhD candidates gave feedback, the materials included, the argument constructed, and the ideas presented are my own.

Adrian Robert Bazbauers 24 September 2013

#### **Acknowledgements**

To John Minns,

For supervising and guiding the construction of my thesis.

To April Biccum, Sean Burges, and Jim George, For reading and commenting on my ideas.

To Alastair Greig and Kate Lee-Koo,

For revealing the joys of an academic life.

To Tom Chodor, Guy Emerson, and Brendan McCaffrie, For inspiring me and for being there to look up to.

To Mum, Dad, and Inga,

For encouraging my every step and for loving my every fault.

To Angela Spence,

For sharing this tumultuous adventure.

To Natalie Peters-Jones,
For being awesome.

#### **Abstract**

This thesis analyses the provision of technical assistance by the World Bank Group (the Group) from 1946 to 2010. Technical assistance concerns the transmission of knowledge and practices to encourage economic growth. Starting from the ontological position that "development" is merely a series of normative positions that change over time and that are dependent upon the worldview of the observer, it argues that Group technical assistance has helped to construct, project, and legitimise particular development "truths".

Drawing upon literature from within the discipline of International Political Economy, this analysis regards technical assistance as a form of power whereby exercising actors are able to persuade others and define structures in such a way as to make particular understandings appear as common sense. The use of "soft" technical assistance to build institutional and human resource capacity during the neoliberal era – built through policy reform, management selection, and personnel training – became a means to persuade recipients of the alleged legitimacy of market-led development.

An institutional study, this work contextualises the growth and evolution of Group technical assistance in terms of crises in the world economy, shifting intellectual movements in academic and policy circles, and changes in the mission, organisational structure, and leadership of the Group. The Group is thus a shaper of and is shaped by the mainstream development discourse – the orthodox conceptualisation of the economic, political, social, and environmental "improvement" of developing countries. The thesis concludes that Group technical assistance has been able to reinforce particular "truths" through its allegedly scientific, objective, and value-neutral nature dissuading challenges to the prevailing orthodoxy. This thesis contributes to academic discussion by analysing the persuasive ability of Group technical assistance to convince recipients of the necessity of accepting and adopting particular development "truths" that are far from objective or value-neutral.

### **Contents**

Acronyms	I
Chapter One – The Technical Side of Development Truths	
Research Focus and Research Question	7
Technical Assistance	11
Theoretical Framework	15
Literature Review	27
Methodology	32
Conclusion	36
Chapter Two – Origins and History	37
The World Bank Group	38
The Subsidiaries of the World Bank Group	41
Membership, Representation, and Accountability	44
The Bretton Woods Era	46
The Neoliberal Era	56
Conclusion	67
Chapter Three – The Age of Hardware, 1946 to 1973	69
The Presidencies of Eugene Meyer and John Jay McCloy	71
The Presidency of Eugene Robert Black	76
The Presidency of George David Woods	87
The Presidency of Robert Strange McNamara	93
Conclusion	101
Chapter Four – Poverty and Adjustment, 1973 to 1982	103
Poverty	105
Crisis in the World Economy, Part I: The 1973 Oil Shock	110
An International Development Institution	114
Crisis in the World Economy, Part II: The 1979 Oil Shock	126
Neoliberalism	133
Conclusion	135
Chapter Five – The Neoliberal Age, 1982 to 1991	136
The Lost Decade for Development	137
The Presidency of Alden Winship Clausen	
Adjusting the World Bank	
Softening the World Bank	144
The Presidency of Barber Conable	154

Technical Assistance under Conable	159
Conclusion	167
Chapter Six – Transition and Governance, 1991 to 1999	169
The Presidency of Lewis Thompson Preston	170
Economies in Transition	172
Technical Assistance under Preston	179
The Presidency of James Wolfensohn	185
The Cancer of Corruption and the Knowledge Bank	188
The 1997 Asian Financial Crisis	197
Conclusion	202
Chapter Seven – The Knowledge Bank 2.0, 1999 to 2010	204
The Comprehensive Development Framework	207
The World Bank Group and Its Virtual World	212
Technical Assistance under Wolfensohn	218
The Presidency of Paul Wolfowitz	224
Technical Assistance under Wolfowitz	228
The Presidency of Robert Zoellick	234
Technical Assistance under Zoellick	239
The 2008 Global Financial Crisis	244
Conclusion	250
Chapter Eight – Hardware, Software, Knowledgeware	252
References	261
World Bank Group Operations	340

#### **Acronyms**

ADB Asian Development Bank
AfDB African Development Bank

CDF Comprehensive Development Framework

CGIAR Consultative Group for International Agricultural Research

DPL Development Policy Loan

EBRD European Bank for Reconstruction and Development

EDI Economic Development Institute

ESW Economic and Sector Work

FDI Foreign Direct Investment

FIAS Foreign Investment Advisory Service

GDN Global Development Network

GDLN Global Development Learning Network

GFC Global Financial Crisis

IADB Inter-American Development Bank

IBRD International Bank for Reconstruction and Development

ICSID International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes

ICT Information and Communication Technology

IDA International Development Association

IDF Institutional Development Fund<br/>
IFC International Finance Corporation

IMF International Monetary Fund

IPAnet Investment Promotion Agency Network

IPE International Political Economy

KBE Knowledge-Based Economy

MIGA Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency

NLTA Non-Lending Technical Assistance

OED Operations Evaluation Department

OPEC Organisation of Petroleum Exporting Countries

PAS Policy and Advisory Services Department
PPI Private Sector Provision of Infrastructure

PPF Project Preparation Facility

PPIAF Public-Private Infrastructure Advisory Facility

PRSP Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper

RIPE Review of International Political Economy

SAL Structural Adjustment Loan

SDR Special Drawing Right

SECAL Sectoral Adjustment Loan

SPPF Special Project Preparation Facility

TAL Technical Assistance Loan

TATF Technical Assistance Trust Fund

UNDP United Nations Development Program

UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund

UNSF United Nations Special Fund

WBI World Bank Institute