USE OF THESES

This copy is supplied for purposes of private study and research only. Passages from the thesis may not be copied or closely paraphrased without the written consent of the author.
Cars and Car Crashes in the City of Angels: Bangkok’s Unhealthy Collision with Cultural Capitalism

Matthew Williams

October 2009

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy of The Australian National University
Declaration of Originality

I hereby declare that this submission is my work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person, and no material which to a substantial extent has been accepted for the award of any degree or diploma of a university or other institute of higher learning, except where due acknowledgement is made in the text.

Matthew Williams
# Table of Contents

Declaration of Originality ................................................................. ii  
Acknowledgements .............................................................................. viii  
Acronyms and Abbreviations ............................................................... ix  
List of Tables ........................................................................................ xi  
List of Figures ....................................................................................... xiii  
List of Examples ................................................................................... xiv  
List of Pictures ..................................................................................... xv  
Abstract ................................................................................................. xvi  

Chapter One: Cars and Car Crashes in The City of Angels ................. 1  
1.1 Angels on Wheels: Is This Really Heaven? .................................. 1  
1.2 Automobility ...................................................................................... 6  
1.3 The Path to Motorisation in Thailand: Understandings of its  
  Stubborn Persistence ........................................................................... 11  
1.4 Lacunae in Current Understandings of Bangkok’s Path to  
  Motorisation .......................................................................................... 21  
1.5 Research Questions ........................................................................... 27  
1.6 Methodology and Data Collection .................................................. 27  
  1.6.1 Research Approach ................................................................. 27  
  1.6.2 Data Collection ............................................................................. 30  
  1.6.3 Data Analysis ................................................................................. 36  
  1.6.4 Strengthening the Research ......................................................... 38  
Appendix: Chapter One .......................................................................... 40  

Chapter Two: Automobility and its Public Health Consequences ......... 56  
2.1 Automobility and Public Health: A Global Perspective ............... 56  
2.2 Automobility and Public Health in Thailand ................................. 60
Chapter Six: The Paradox of Car Consumption in Bangkok

6.1 Preamble ........................................................................................................ 181
6.2 The Utilitarianism of the Car in Bangkok ............................................. 182
6.3 The Consuming Paradox ........................................................................... 194
6.4 The Consuming Paradox of Car Consumption ..................................... 199
   6.4.1 Transport and Social Exclusion .......................................................... 200
   6.4.1.1 Well-being and Social Connectedness ........................................... 202
   6.4.1.2 Safety .............................................................................................. 202
   6.4.1.3 Access to Employment and Health Care ........................................ 200
6.5 The Paradox of Car Consumption in Bangkok .................................... 204
   6.5.1 The Experience of Poor Mass Transit by Non-Car Owners ............ 205
   6.5.2 Safety Fears ....................................................................................... 207
   6.5.3 Social Status ....................................................................................... 208
   6.5.4 Health .................................................................................................. 209
   6.5.5 Mobility and Freedom ........................................................................ 210
6.6 Conclusion ..................................................................................................... 211

Chapter Seven: Emerging Resistance to Car Ownership in Bangkok:
An Opportunity to De-market the Car ............................................................... 213
7.1 Preamble ........................................................................................................ 213
7.2 Emerging Resistance to Car Ownership and/or Usage in Bangkok ......... 213
7.3 De-marketing the Car in Bangkok ............................................................... 222
7.4 Conclusion ..................................................................................................... 226

Chapter Eight: Policy Options and Conclusions .......................................... 228
8.1 Preamble ........................................................................................................ 228
8.2 Can the Consolidation of Auto-Centrism be Stopped? ......................... 228
8.3 Global Policy Responses and Initiatives to Control Car Usage and Encourage Usage of Mass Transit ................................................................. 231
Acknowledgements

The person who deserves my warmest thanks is Dr Jane Dixon, the Chair of my Panel. The start of my PhD was not smooth, but Jane’s encouragement, patience (she once said she felt like my secretary, rather than my supervisor), and genuine kindness guided me throughout that first difficult year, and over the entire 4.5 years of my candidature. I was truly lucky to have had such a wonderful supervisor.

Secondly, I appreciate the financial support, in terms of both a stipend and travel costs, from the Thai Cohort Study and the National Centre for Epidemiology and Population Health at The Australian National University.

The College of Public Health at Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok, generously provided me with a base during my fieldwork in Bangkok in 2006, and assisted in recruiting interviewees and subsequently translating during interviews.

Thanks to Dr Barbara Leigh, Adjunct Professor at the University of Technology, Sydney, for initially inspiring my interest in South-East Asia and encouraging me to undertake a PhD.

Other people who have provided valuable feedback and advice along the way include Professor Tord Kjellstrom and Dr Cathy Banwell.

This PhD opened up a new world to me and allowed me to meet some interesting, warm and intelligent people. Thanks to my dear friend Buu. I wish we had met earlier in my fieldwork in Bangkok. Thanks also to that meeting, I have had a chance to become involved with Thai orphans after a fortuitous meeting with Andy Rothenberg from Mt Sinai Hospital in New York. Please visit our website http://www.thaideklek.org
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PM</td>
<td>particulate matter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PM$_{10}$</td>
<td>particulate matter less than 10 microns in diameter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PM$_{2.5}$</td>
<td>particulate matter less than 2.5 microns in diameter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td>socio-economic status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPM</td>
<td>suspended particulate matter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAI</td>
<td>Thai Automotive Industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TDM</td>
<td>Traffic Demand Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TFP</td>
<td>travel feedback programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDI</td>
<td>Urban Development Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNFCCC</td>
<td>United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

Table 1: Forecast Vehicle Ownership Levels for Selected Future Years ............ 3
Table 2: Passenger-Kilometre Travelled and Vehicle-Kilometre Travelled per Year for Various Transport Modes in Bangkok in 2005 ....................... 4
Table 3: Key Informant Interview Questions ............................................. 40
Table 4: List of Key Informant Interviewees ............................................. 41
Table 5: List of Transport User Interviewees ......................................... 45
Table 6: Transport Users Interview Questions ........................................ 50
Table 7: Years of Lost Life of 10 Leading Causes of Mortality, All Ages, 2000 ............................................................................................................ 63
Table 8: National Economic Losses Due to Road Crashes in Thailand, 2002 ............................................................................................................ 64
Table 9: Economic Losses due to Road Crashes During Two Holidays ........ 65
Table 10: Estimates of Health Impacts and Costs by PM10 in Bangkok for 2000 ............................................................................................................ 69
Table 11: Total Number of “New” Vehicle Registrations Under the Motor Vehicle Act 1979 (Unit: Thousand Vehicles) .............................................. 73
Table 12: The Adjusted Odds Ratio with 95% Confidence Interval (CI) of a Series of Daily Reported Symptoms was Estimated for Roadside and Residential Areas ................................................................. 76
Table 13: Greenhouse Gas Emissions by Sector, 1998 .................................. 78
Table 14: Vehicle Sales in Thailand ............................................................. 80
Table 15: The World’s Leading Exporters of Automotive Products .......... 146
Table 16: Automobile Production and Sales 2005 ....................................... 147
Table 17: The symbolic Value of the car for car drivers ............................. 156
Table 18: The Symbolic Value of the Car for Motorcyclists ......................... 161
### List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1</td>
<td>The Transport Transition in Thailand</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2</td>
<td>Thesis Overview: Conceptual Framework of the Relationship Between Global Capitalism, Automobile Consumption, and Urban Health and Social Equity in Bangkok</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3</td>
<td>Social Position and Health Outcomes</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4</td>
<td>The 24-hour Average of Noise Level at Roadsides in Bangkok and Vicinity 1997–2004</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5</td>
<td>Health Costs of PM&lt;sub&gt;10&lt;/sub&gt; for Bangkok, 2001–2020</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6</td>
<td>World Vehicle Production 2000</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7</td>
<td>World Vehicle Production by Region 1950–2000</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 8</td>
<td>Thai Auto Production, Sales and Exports 1981–2001</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 9</td>
<td>Overall Production Target for New Vehicles in Thailand by 2010</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10</td>
<td>The Circuit of Culture</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 11</td>
<td>De-Marketing the Car in Bangkok</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Examples

Example 1: This Advertisement Offers Special Credit Card Membership to Prospective or Actual Owners of a Mercedes car .................................... 143

Example 2: This Advertisement Projects The Luxury of a Volvo as an Escape from Bangkok’s Traffic, Heat and Pollution ................................. 144
List of Pictures

Picture 1: Mini-Billboard Advertisement for Toyota Yaris ........................................ 124

Picture 2: Large Plasma Screens Overhanging Escalators in Siam Paragon Shopping Centre, Bangkok, Run Rolling Advertisements for Toyota .................................................. 128

Picture 3: Further Rolling Advertisements for Toyota, Siam Paragon Shopping Centre, Bangkok .......................................................................................... 129

Picture 4: MTV Asia Awards 2006 Promotional Event for Toyota Yaris in a Space Linking Siam Square and Siam Paragon Shopping Centres in Central Bangkok ........................................... 130

Picture 5: A Further Image from the MTV Asia Awards 2006 Promotional Event for Toyota Yaris ........................................................................................................ 131

Picture 6: A Mini Cooper, Painted by a Thai Designer, and Apparently Strategically Positioned Outside the Hugo Boss Store, Showing a Photo also of the Thai Designer Responsible for Painting it .......................... 132

Picture 7: “The Style by Toyota Café” in the Siam shopping Enclave, Central Bangkok .................................................................................................................. 133

Picture 8: “The Style by Toyota Café” Members Become Familiar with Toyota Products Through Computer Games on Terminals Outside the Café Entrance, and on Terminals Inside ......................................................... 134

Picture 9: A “Style by Toyota Café” Member Plays a Computer Game Involving Cars Inside the Café ............................................................................................................. 135

Picture 10: Teaching Photography Skills To Young Members of “The Style By Toyota Café”. The “Hybrid Creative Arts Studio” Month of Events, Such as this One, was Simultaneously Promoting the Toyota Hybrid Car ........................................................................................................ 137

Picture 11: Advertisement for Mercedes Benz ................................................................. 140
Abstract

The depletion of oil resources, global warming, 1.2 million road fatalities globally per year, and the rush by the citizens of newly industrialising nations in Asia and Latin America to consume automobiles is a pressing problem acknowledged by the United Nations, numerous governments, and global non-government organisations. In 2007, for the first time in the history of the world, the proportion of the population living in urban centres exceeded 50 per cent. The trend towards urbanisation is greatest in the densely populated nations of Asia and poses urgent questions about how to manage this transition in order to build humane, environmentally friendly cities in which public health and social equity are paramount. One of the key predictors of success for burgeoning cities will be the kinds of transport systems they provide.

The twentieth century’s answer to mobility was the automobile. The experience of automobility over time has demonstrated that this path to motorisation was a significant public policy failure. The physical infrastructure of automobiles divides cities and neighbourhoods and blights landscape. Their emissions contribute to global warming, respiratory illness, heart disease and cancer, and car accidents are a leading cause of death and injury. Bangkok infamously followed the Western path to motorisation, with egregious consequences for public health and transport injustice. Road accidents were the second leading cause of mortality in Thailand in 2000, and in 2002 they cost the Thai economy 2.5 per cent of Gross Domestic Product. Ignoring mass transit, the Thai Government invested heavily in the automobile industry as a pillar of economic growth. Transport economists and planners have consistently framed the problem as a technocratic one, isolating the issue to “road users, traffic systems, and road capacity”. These investigations have yielded very relevant insights and data, yet have neglected the driver at the wheel.

This research aims to provide policymakers in Thailand and in other modernising nations with ideas for preventing the further escalation in negative public health impacts of “car addiction” and traffic injuries. Specifically, the research repositions the automobility crisis in Bangkok as socio-material
phenomenon arising from Thailand’s entrenchment within the global economy. As Thailand’s society transitioned from an agricultural to an industrial capitalist economy, the urbanisation of Bangkok propelled Thais to purchase cars for social and material reasons. Consumerism became an anchor upon which Thais projected something of their identity, and within the hierarchy of Thai culture much esteem was accorded to those who owned cars, especially expensive cars. Beyond their utilitarian functions, cars hold much symbolic value for Thais, expressing upward socio-economic mobility and success. As such, a culture of automobility grew in Bangkok.

This car culture is complex. Thais embrace the car as an identity referent and marker of status, yet they simultaneously recognise the inherent paradoxes in car consumption: air pollution and poor public health; restricted mobility and transport injustice. The contradictory promise of the automobile has, then, spawned resistance to the car among Bangkokians, who imagine a much-enhanced quality of life and urban environment in a future Bangkok in which car usage is restricted.

This thesis concludes by critically reviewing policy efforts to control automobility in Singapore and Bogota, and draws on traffic management literature to argue that all of these attempts provide a useful template for Bangkok to draw on in order to address its own transport problems. However, I stress that Bangkok and other nations that are currently replicating its path to motorisation will have limited success unless they acknowledge the socio-cultural reasons encouraging drivers to take to the wheel. Finally, I suggest that the car needs to be de-marketed in Bangkok in conjunction with the timely expansion and marketing of quality mass transit. As long as the transport discourse of policymakers in Thailand and other nations experiencing rapid motorisation fails to see drivers as social actors, making choices to purchase cars for both material (practical) and social reasons, it will be difficult to get them out of the car.